

**MAUI COUNTY COUNCIL
PUBLIC HEARING
MINUTES**

**APRIL 23, 2024
6:00 PM**

Pursuant to §92-3.7, Hawaii Revised Statutes, the meeting was conducted as a remote meeting by interactive conference technology, via Microsoft Teams, <http://tinyurl.com/2p9zhjr2>.

In person testimony and viewing: Council Chamber, Kalana O Maui Building, 8th Floor, 200 S. High Street, Wailuku, Hawaii.

Video recording of meeting available at: www.mauicounty.legistar.com

TIME MEETING CALLED TO ORDER: 6:02 p.m.

ROLL CALL

| Councilmember | Pres. | Abs. | Exc. | Time(s) In/Out (during meeting) |
|------------------------------|--------------|-------------|-------------|--|
| CM Pro Tempore Tasha Kama | √ | | | |
| Vice Chair Yuki Lei Sugimura | | | √ | |
| CM Tamara Paltin | √ | | | |
| CM Gabe Johnson | | | √ | |
| CM Keani Rawlins-Fernandez | | | √ | Arr. 6:19 p.m. |
| CM Tom Cook | √ | | | |
| CM Nohelani U‘u-Hodgins | √ | | | |
| CM Shane Sinenci | √ | | | |
| Chair Alice L. Lee | √ | | | |
| TOTAL PRESENT | 6 | | 3 | |

Resolution No. 24-78 "ADOPTING THE REAL PROPERTY TAX RATES FOR THE COUNTY OF MAUI, EFFECTIVE JULY 1, 2024"

No legislative action was taken.

TIME MEETING RECESSED: 6:48 p.m.

(Meeting recessed until May 13, 2024 at 11:00 a.m.)

TRANSCRIPTION

Council of the County of Maui on 2024-04-23 6:00 PM - Public Hearing

[GAVEL] >> THE PUBLIC HEARING ON THE PROPOSED REAL PROPERTY TAX RATES, THE COUNTY OF MAUI EFFECTIVE JULY 1, 2024 WILL NOW COME TO ORDER. MS. CLERK, PLEASE PROCEED WITH ROLL CALL. >> CHAIR, PROCEEDING WITH ROLL CALL, FOR THOSE MEMBERS WHO ARE PARTICIPATING FROM REMOTE LOCATIONS, PLEASE STATE, WHO IF ANYONE, EXCEPT MINORS, IS PRESENT WITH YOU AS PART OF ROLL CALL. COUNCIL MEMBER PRO TEMPORE TASHA KAMA. >> ALOHA AHI AHI CHAIR AND ALOHA TO EVERYONE HERE. >> ALOHA.\r\n\r\n>> VICE-CHAIR YUKI LEI SUGIMURA. >> EXCUSED FOR NOW. >> COUNCIL MEMBER TAMARA PALTIN >> ALOHA AHI AHI, AND YODANA. >> COUNCIL MEMBER GABE JOHNSON. >> EXCUSED. >> COUNCIL MEMBER KEANI RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ. >> EXCUSED.\r\n\r\n>> COUNCIL MEMBER TOM COOK? >> ALOHA, I AM IN MY KIHEI RESIDENCY OFFICE ALONE AND THERE'S CURRENTLY NO TESTIFIERS WITH ME. THERE IS MY AIDE IN THE ADJACENT ROOM. >> THANK YOU. >> COUNCIL MEMBER NOHELANI UU-HODGINS. >> HELLO EVERYONE. >> HI.\r\n\r\n>> COUNCIL MEMBER SHANE SINENCI. >> ALOHA AHI AHI ALOHA. >> AND CHAIR ALICE LEE. >> PRESENT. >> CHAIR, YOU HAVE SIX MEMBERS PRESENT, THREE EXCUSED. A QUORUM IS PRESENT FOR THE COUNTY TO CONDUCT ITS BUSINESS. ALSO PRESENT FROM -- TODAY I'M THE COUNTY CLERK, MOANA LUTEY AND PRESENT IS THE DEPUTY COUNTY CLERK RICHELLE THOMSON AND LEGISLATIVE DIVISION STAFF, LAUREN SALDANA, DELL YOSHIDA AND JOYCE MURASHIGE.\r\n\r\nJOINING THE MEETING FROM THE OFFICE OF COUNCIL SERVICES IS DIRECTOR DAVID RAATZ AND DEPUTY DIRECTOR RICHELLE KAWASAKI AND DEPUTY CORPORATION COUNSEL KRISTINA TOSHIKIYO. >> BEFORE WE PROCEED WITH TODAY'S PUBLIC HEARING, MAY I REQUEST THAT EVERYONE KEEP THEIR MICROPHONES MUTED UNLESS IT'S YOUR TURN TO SPEAK. OKAY. WE HAVE IDENTICAL LINES. AS A REMINDER, TESTIMONY MUST PERTAIN TO ITEMS ON THE AGENDA. WHEN TESTIFYING, PLEASE DIRECT YOUR REMARKS TO THE COUNCIL AND NOT TO ANY INDIVIDUAL COUNCIL MEMBER, OR MEMBER OF THE PUBLIC. EACH TESTIFIER WILL BE ALLOWED TO SPEAK UP FOR THREE MINUTES FOR INDIVIDUALS WISHING TO TESTIFY ON TEAMS, PLEASE CLICK THE RAISE YOUR HAND BUTTON TO BE ADDED TO THE TESTIFIER LOG.\r\n\r\nIF YOU ARE CALLING IN, PLEASE FOLLOW THE PHONE PROMPTS TO BE ADDED TO THE TESTIFIER LOG. DECORUM SHALL BE MAINTAINED AT ALL TIMES, ANY PERSON WHO BEHAVES IN A MANNER THAT DISRUPTS, DISTURBS OR IMPEDES THE ORDERLY CONDUCT OF ANY COUNCIL MEETING CAN AT THE DISCRETION OF THE PRESIDING OFFICER OR MAJORITY OF PRESENT COUNCIL MEMBERS BE EJECTED OR BANNED FROM COUNCIL MEETINGS, OR IF PARTICIPATING REMOTELY, CAN BE MUTED OR DROPPED FROM THE MEETING. EXAMPLES OF DISRUPTIVE BEHAVIOR INCLUDE, BUT NOT LIMITED TO HECKLING SHOUTING, USE OF PROFANITY, THREATENING OR SLANDEROUS REMARKS MADE TO ANY MEMBER OF THE COUNCIL, STAFF OR GENERAL PUBLIC. MS. CLERK, PLEASE PROCEED. >> CHAIR, PROCEEDING WITH PRESENTATION OF WRITTEN OR ORAL TESTIMONY, CURRENTLY WE HAVE TWO PEOPLE SIGNED UP. THE FIRST IS CLAIRE GEBO, IN CHAMBERS, FOLLOWED BY GARY.\r\n\r\n>> GOOD EVENING. IT'S AN HONOR TO BE HERE. THANK YOU VERY MUCH FOR ALLOWING ME TO BE HERE. GOOD EVENING, MEMBERS, AS WELL. >> COULD YOU MOVE THE MICROPHONE CLOSER TO YOU. THANK YOU. >> IS THAT GOOD? \r\n\r\n>> YES. >> OKAY. IT'S AN HONOR TO BE HERE AND APPRECIATE THE OPPORTUNITY. I'M A REALTOR, AND I TALK WITH A LOT OF PEOPLE DO PROPERTY MANAGEMENT AS WELL. DO REAL PROPERTY TAX HAS BEEN A REAL CONCERN FOR PEOPLE. I SEE IT ON THIS AGENDA THAT THE TIERS ARE 6024.5. I KNOW LAST YEAR, THE TIERS WENT THE FIRST TIER WAS UP TO A MILLION AND A MILLION TWO, 4.5 ON THE OWNER OCCUPIED. THIS HAS BEEN A CONCERN ON THE TIERS, BECAUSE WE KNOW OUR MEDIAN PRICE IS 1.3. SO A LOT OF LOCAL OWNERS ARE BEING BUMPED INTO A HIGHER CATEGORY.\r\n\r\nSO NOT ONLY AS THE RATE GOING UP, BUT THE CATEGORY THAT THEY ARE GOING IS ALSO GOING UP. SO SOMEBODY WHO IS PROPERTY IS VALUED AT \$ A LITTLE OVER A MILLION, LAST YEAR IS 1.9, WE WERE LOOKING AT THIS CARD. AND THE -- THERE WAS A PROPOSED OF \$2.50. SO IT'S NOT JUST THE INCREASE FROM \$1.90 TO \$2 IN THE FIRST TIER, BUT IT'S GOING FROM \$1.90 TO \$2.50, BECAUSE THEY ARE ALSO MOVING UP INTO A DIFFERENT TIER. SO THAT WAS A CONCERN OF THE PROPERTY TAXES. AND IT AFFECTS NOT ONLY OWNER-OCCUPIED

WHICH IS A LOT OF LOCAL RESIDENTS, PEOPLE ON FIXED INCOME, BUT IT ALSO IS WITH THE LONG-TERM RENTAL. SO ON THE LONG-TERM RENTAL, YOU KNOW, I'M VERY FORTUNATE TO KNOW A LOT OF PEOPLE, NONE OF THEM WENT INTO PRICE GOUGING OR MAXIMIZING WITH THE INCREASE OF SAME SITUATION BEING BUMPED INTO A DIFFERENT TIER, AS WELL AS AN INCREASE, THEY ARE BEING FORCED TO INCREASE THEIR RENTS. AND A LOT OF MY OWNERS ARE - - HAVE VERY REASONABLE, VERY, VERY REASONABLE RENTS, YOU KNOW? BUT YOU KNOW, WE'RE GOING TO BE -- YOU KNOW, PUSHED UP TO INCREASES OF \$200 OR \$300 A MONTH, YOU KNOW? WE KNOW THAT FOR TENANTS, THAT IS A LOT. YOU KNOW, IT'S NOT LIKE EVERYBODY GOT A RAISE, OR THERE'S ALL OF THIS EXTRA MONEY, BECAUSE JUST COST OF LIVING ALREADY HAS INCREASED FOR EVERYBODY. SO THE TIERS IS A REAL CONCERN AND OF COURSE, I NOTICED ON THE AGENDA THAT THERE'S MORE CATEGORIES THAT IS BEING TIERED, LIKE SHORT-TERM RENTALS, AND AG. BUT YOU KNOW, LIKE SHORT-TERM RENTALS, I'M GLAD YOU FOLKS ARE DOING THAT, BECAUSE IT WASN'T TIERED. >> THREE MINUTES. >> BUT THEY CAN GENERATE MORE INCOME. SO BETTER PROPERTY, BETTER INCOME. THANK YOU. >> CAN YOU TELL US HOW MANY CLIENTS DO YOU HAVE? >> IN OUR OFFICE, WE HAVE ABOUT 75 RENTAL UNITS. >> IN ALL OF THESE UNITS ARE LONG-TERM RENTALS? >> YES, WE DO ONLY LONG-TERM RENTALS. >> OH,, >> YEAH. WE ACTUALLY, LIKE I SAID, REASONABLY PRICED. WE DO HAVE SOME TWO-BEDROOMS AT \$1600, INCLUDING UTILITIES. YOU KNOW, WE HAVE HOUSES AT \$1850, YOU KNOW, ON SINGLE LOT. >> ARE THEY IN CENTRAL MAUI OR KAPUA? >> CENTRAL MAUI AND UP COUNTRY. >> OKAY. >> SO EVERYBODY HAS TRIED TO KEEP THE RENTS DOWN, KNOWING THAT THERE'S ALL OF THESE OTHER THINGS, BUT WHEN PROPERTY TAXES GOING UP, NOBODY HAS A CHOICE. THEIR COSTS ARE GOING UP. >> ANY OTHER QUESTIONS? MEMBER PALTIN. >> THANK YOU, CHAIR. THANK YOU, MS. GEBO FOR YOUR TESTIMONY. IT SOUNDED AS THOUGH THAT YOU GUYS THOUGHT THAT IF YOU MAKE, LIKE, \$1.4 MILLION ASSESSED VALUE THAT THE WHOLE \$1.4 MILLION WOULD BE IN TIER 2, IS THAT HOW YOU GUYS THINK IT IS? THE RATE APPLICABLE RATE WOULD BE BASED ON THE TIERED VALUE OF THE PROPERTY, IS THAT NOT CORRECT? >> NOT CORRECT. >> OKAY. >> EVERYBODY'S FIRST TIER GETS THAT RATE. SO LIKE, IF YOU HAVE, IF THE TIERS ARE 0-1 MILLION, ET CETERA EVERYBODY IN THE FIRST MILLION OF VALUE GETS THE TIER 1 RATE. IF YOUR HOUSE IS \$1.3 MILLION, YOU GET THE HOMEOWNER EXEMPTION \$300,000 OFF THE TOP AND IF IT'S 1.4 MILLION, YOU GET \$300,000 OFF THE TOP HOMEOWNER EXEMPTION AND FIRST MILLION AT TIER 1 AND THAT EXTRA \$100,000 IS ONLY AT TIER 2. IS THAT NOT HOW YOU WERE CALCULATING IT? >> NO. WE LOOKED AT THE ASSESSED VALUE. >> IT'S STILL BAD, BUT IT'S NOT AS BAD. >> THAT IS TRUE. THAT IS NOT AS BAD. >> WE'RE TRYING -- THE VALUES REALLY WENT UP, SOME OF THEM WE DID CALL THE REAL PROPERTY TAX OFFICE, YOU KNOW, TO TRY -- >> APPEAL OR SOMETHING? >> GET THE COMPS OR SAY HOW DID YOU GET THIS VALUE? BECAUSE SOME OF THEM WERE REALLY HIGH. >> I THINK IT'S NOT AS BAD, BUT IT'S BAD. SO WE CAN TRY TO WORK ON THAT, IF WE DON'T ADD TOO MUCH TO THE BUDGET, WE STILL HAVE A FEW DAYS. BUT I GUESS I WILL TRY TO MAKE MORE CUTS. >> THAT IS NOT AS BAD. YES. THAT REALLY DOES MAKE A DIFFERENCE. YOU KNOW, BECAUSE WE DEAL WITH ALL THE LOCAL PEOPLE, YOU KNOW, WORKING PEOPLE IN THE RENTALS, YOU KNOW, AS LONG AS WE CAN AND KEEP IT REASONABLE, KEEP EVERYBODY STABLE >> IT'S MEANT TO BE LIKE ONE PROGRESSIVE THING. SO EVERYBODY GETS THE SAME TIER 1 TAX FOR THEIR FIRST MILLION DOLLARS OF VALUE. ONLY THOSE WITH THAT ABOVE AND BEYOND FROM TIER 2 TO TIER 3 GETS TAXED AT THAT VALUE. SO IF IT'S 1-3 MILLION, THAT WILL BE THE EXCESS OVER 1 MILLION WOULD BE TAXED AT TIER 2, AND WHATEVER EXCESS YOU HAVE OVER THAT \$3 MILLION WOULD BE TAXED AT TIER 3. SO EVERYBODY PAYS THE SAME RATES REGARDLESS OF THE TIER, BUT NOT EVERYBODY'S ASSESSED VALUE HITS TIER 2 OR 3. IT'S NOT AS BAD, BUT IT'S STILL BAD AND WE'LL WORK ON IT. >> LONG-TERM EXEMPTIONS, IT PRETTY MUCH TRIPLES THEIR PROPERTY TAX WITHOUT THE LONG-TERM EXEMPTION. >> I HEARD MS. MARTIN IS WORKING ON SOMETHING, BECAUSE THEY KNOW OF 60 THAT MISSED THE DEADLINE AND TRYING TO WORK ON SOME SORT OF EXTENSION AND IT WON'T BE THAT BAD AN IMPACT OF IF IT'S 60 OR SO PEOPLE. I GUESS NEXT YEAR BEFORE DECEMBER 31ST ROLLS AROUND, WE BETTER DO A LOT OF SOCIAL MEDIA OR SOMETHING. >> SO IS THERE A PLACE TO GO? BECAUSE I WENT INTO THE PROPERTY TAX OFFICE AND I DON'T THINK THEY TOOK THE NAME OR ANYTHING. >> I THINK WHAT SHE WAS

SAYING JUST TO FILL OUT A FORM, SO THAT THEY CAN COLLECT THE DATA OF HOW MANY MISSED THE DEADLINE, AND THEN HAVE A GOOD ESTIMATE WHEN THEY PROPOSE A CHANGE IN -- OR PROPOSE AN EXTENSION IN LEGISLATION. >> OKAY. >> SO THEY CAN FILL IT OUT, EVEN IF THEY MISSED THE DEADLINE AND FOR DATA PURPOSES, IF WE'RE ABLE TO CHANGE THE LEGISLATION, THEN THEY WILL CONTACT THOSE PEOPLE I IMAGINE. >> I ONLY HAVE A COUPLE. SO NOT TOO BAD.

THANK YOU. I APPRECIATE THAT EXPLANATION. >> ANY MORE QUESTIONS? IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >> FOR HER LENIENCY, BECAUSE USUALLY WE DON'T DO THAT. >> NEXT TESTIFIER IS GARY, FOLLOW BY LAURENCE CHAPMAN AND CURRENTLY MR. CHAPMAN IS OUR LAST TESTIFIER.

>> HELLO GARY. >> ALOHA, CHAIR LEE, AND COUNCIL MEMBERS. MY NAME IS GARY SALDANA AND I AM PROVIDING COMMENTS ON BEHALF OF THE REALTORS ASSOCIATION REGARDING THE MAYOR'S PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR BUDGET, AND HIS PROPOSED REAL PROPERTY TAX ADJUSTMENTS. THE MAYOR IS PROPOSING TO INCREASE OWNER-OCCUPIED, NON-OWNER OCCUPIED TVR, AND STR RATES TO GENERATE AN ADDITIONAL \$51 IN REVENUE AND THESE THREE CLASSIFICATIONS ARE HIT WHAT I REFER TO AS A DOUBLE WHAMMY, AN INCREASE IN ASSESSED VALUE AND INCREASE IN REAL PROPERTY TAX RATES. I WANT TO GIVE YOU AN EXAMPLE THAT HITS CLOSE TO HOME WITH REGARDS TO THIS DOUBLE WHAMMY. IT INCREASED \$101,000. DURING THE SAME PERIOD OF TIME LAST YEAR THE MEDIAN SALES PRICE OF A HOME IN MAUI ONLY ROSE 8.6%, WITH THE ASSESSMENT INCREASE, AND THE PROPOSED INCREASE IN TAX RATES, OUR REAL PROPERTY TAX BILL IS GOING TO INCREASE SOME 28%. NOW I ASK HOW MANY MORE OF YOUR CONSTITUENTS WILL BE PAYING 28 PLUS PERCENT IN THIS -- IN THEIR TAXES AS A RESULT OF THIS DOUBLE WHAMMY? ADDITIONALLY, I WANT IT TALK ABOUT TVR STR CLASSIFICATION, OVER THE LAST FOUR YEARS, IT HAS CONSISTENTLY BEEN 30 TO 40% PLUS OF OUR REAL PROPERTY TAX REVENUE.

THERE ARE NINE CLASSIFICATIONS THAT ARE NOT EXPERIENCING PROPERTY TAX INCREASES THIS YEAR. IS IT FAIR TO PLACE THE BURDEN ON ONE PROPERTY TAX CLASSIFICATION WHILE HOTELS APPEAR TO BE GETTING FAT DURING THE RECOVERY? I REALIZE THE SHORT-TERM RENTALS ARE NOT GOING TO WIN A POPULARITY CONTEST WITH OUR RESIDENTS. OUR CONCERN IS IF WE CONTINUE TO RAISE SHORT-TERM PROPERTY TAX RATES IT COULD DRIVE OPERATIONS UNDERGROUND. WHY WOULD SOMEBODY CLASSIFY THEIR PROPERTY AS A SHORT-TERM RENTAL, WHEN THEY WILL BE PAYING HIGH PROPERTY TAX RATES? ADDITIONALLY, IF YOU ARE ASKING US TAXPAYERS TO BITE THE BULLET, YOU SHOULD BE ASKING STAFF AND EACH OF THE DEPARTMENTS TO DO THE SAME. I WANT TO SAY KUDOS TO THE MAYOR'S OFFICE FOR KEEPING SALARIES IN CHECK AT 1.8%. HOWEVER, THE SALARY COMMISSION IS RECOMMENDING INCREASES FOR DEPARTMENT DIRECTORS AND THEIR DEPUTIES THIS IS SOMETHING YOU GUYS DISCUSSED YESTERDAY.

NOW IS NOW THE TIME TO INCREASE SALARIES WHEN YOU DON'T KNOW IF THE STATE IS GOING TO COME THROUGH WITH FINANCIAL ASSISTANCE THAT WAS REQUESTED? >> THREE MINUTES SALARIES MAY BE A SMALL PORTION OF THE BUDGET, BUT IT'S THE PRINCIPLE OF THE MATTER. IT'S THE PERCEPTION THAT STAFF IS GAINING THESE INCREASES, WHILE WEST MAUI RESIDENTS ARE STRUGGLING TO GET BY. FURTHERMORE, I WANT TO EXTEND PROPS TO THE COUNCIL FOR TAKING THE INITIATIVE TO MAKE CUTS IN EXPENDITURES. THANK YOU GUYS FOR TAKING THESE BOLD STEPS TO FOCUS ON OBTAINING REVENUE FOR RECOVERY. IN CLOSING I WANT TO SAY YES, TAXPAYERS NEED TO PAY OUR SHARE TO HELP WITH RECOVERY AND HELP WITH OPERATIONS. HOWEVER, WE ASK IS 28% FAIR?

ALSO, WE ASK COULD YOU CONTINUE TO SCRUTINIZE THE BUDGET TO DETERMINE IF MORE EXPENDITURES CAN BE CUT, REDUCED OR DELAYED AS TO PREVENT FURTHER INCREASES IN REAL PROPERTY TAX AND LESSEN THE BURDEN ON TAXPAYERS AND YOUR CONSTITUENTS? THANKS FOR THIS OPPORTUNITY AND HAVE A GOOD NIGHT. >> THANK YOU. BEFORE I ASK IF ANYBODY HAS QUESTIONS, LET THE RECORD SHOW THAT COUNCIL MEMBER KEANI RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ IS HERE PRESENT. GOOD EVENING. >> GOOD EVENING CHAIR, ALOHA KAKOU, I'M IN A PUBLIC SPACE AT MOK LELE AIRLINES. >> DO WE HAVE ANY QUESTIONS FOR MR.

SALDANA? IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MAY WE HAVE THE NEXT TESTIFIER. >> THANK YOU. >> >> CHAIR, THE NEXT TESTIFIER IS LAURENCE CHAPMAN, FOLLOWED BY DAVE JORGENSEN. LAURENCE CHAPMAN. >> YOU NEED TO UNMUTE YOURSELF.

WE CAN'T HEAR YOU. MEMBER PALTIN, CAN YOU PLEASE EXPLAIN TO HIM? >> YOU ARE GOING TO HAVE TO UNMUTE YOUR MICROPHONE. IT'S IN THE UPPER RIGHT CORNER, AND IT LOOKS LIKE A POPSICLE WITH A LINE

THROUGH IT. >> HE IS UNMUTED. HIS AUDIO ISN'T WORKING. HE MIGHT NEED TO RESTART.\r\n\r\n>> I DID READ YOUR EMAIL. IF THAT MAKES A DIFFERENCE? YOU ARE GOING TO COME BACK ON? OKAY. >> COME BACK ON. YES. ALL RIGHT, MAY WE HAVE THE NEXT TESTIFIER.\r\n\r\n>> CHAIR, CURRENTLY THE LAST PERSON SIGNED UP TO TESTIFY IS DAVE JORGENSEN. >> ALOHA, CHAIR LEE, AND MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL AND STAFF. MY NAME IS DAVE JORGENSEN. I APOLOGIZE, I'M ON GRANDDAUGHTER DUTY AND I'M HAVING A HECK OF A TIE WITH MY LAPTOP. SO I'M ON MY IPHONE AND WE'LL SEE HOW THIS GOES. FIRST, I WANT -- I HAVE HAD THE PLEASURE OF MONITORING A COUPLE OF THE BUDGET HEARINGS, AND I GIVE YOU GUYS CREDIT. THERE'S SO MUCH INFORMATION, AND SO MANY -- SO MANY THINGS TO DEAL WITH.\r\n\r\nMY NAME IS DAVE JORGENSEN, AN ATTORNEY IN WAILUKU AND APPEARING ON BEHALF OF THE AMERICAN DEVELOPMENT ASSOCIATION OF HAWAII, WHICH IS THE TIME SHARE INDUSTRY GROUP. WE THANK YOU FOR THE OPPORTUNITY TO PRESENT TESTIMONY. THE MAYOR'S PROPOSAL KEPT THE RATES FOR TIME SHARES THE SAME, WHICH ARE, AS WE ALL KNOW, THE HIGHEST IN THE COUNTY. THE RANGE OF RATES THAT YOU ALL ARE CONSIDERING HAS A TOP CEILING OF \$24. SO WE WANT TO MAKE SURE WE TESTIFY. ARDA HAWAII FULLY UNDERSTANDS THE ECONOMIC CHALLENGES FOR MAUI COUNTY AND MAINTAIN ITS SUPPORT FOR THE PEOPLE OF MAUI AND WILDFIRE RECOVERY EFFORTS. THE INDUSTRY HAS STRONGLY SUPPORTED RECOVERY EFFORTS, HAVING COLLECTIVELY CONTRIBUTED OVER \$2 MILLION TO SUPPORT RELIEF EFFORTS AND BY TEMPORARILY HOUSING DISPLACED MEMBERS AND THEIR FAMILIES AND OTHER DISPLACED RESIDENTS AND FIRST-RESPONDERS. SEVERAL ARDA MEMBERS HAVE PROVIDED FOOD SUPPLIES, ON-SITE COUNSELING AND FISCAL BENEFITS, LIKE DISASTER PAY THROUGH SEPTEMBER 2023, AND COMMITTED A MINIMUM OF \$250,000 IN DIRECT EMERGENCY GRANTS TO IMPACTED TEAM MEMBERS.\r\n\r\nTIME SHARE OWNERS HAVE A LONG-TERM COMMITMENT TO MAUI BY PURCHASING AND OWNING REAL PROPERTY IN THE COUNTY AND SIGNIFICANTLY SUPPORTING MAUI'S BUDGET. THESE OWNERS ARE CONSISTENT AND DEPENDABLE VISITORS WHO BRING SUBSTANTIAL TAX DOLLARS TO THE COUNTY. MOREOVER TIME SHARE OWNERS CONTRIBUTE TO PUBLIC FACILITIES AND GOVERNMENT SERVICE THROUGH THE PAYMENT OF STATE AND LOCAL TAXES, FOR EXAMPLE, TIME SHARE OWNERS PAY APPROXIMATELY 200% OF THE COST ATTRIBUTABLE TO THEM FOR GOVERNMENT SERVICES, COMPARED TO ABOUT 33% FOR OTHER RESIDENTS. THESE HEAVY CONTRIBUTIONS WHEN COMPARED TO THE LIMITED USE OF PUBLIC FACILITIES BENEFIT THE COMMUNITY SUBSTANTIALY. ON THE OTHER HAND, HAWAII TIME SHARE OWNERS FACE INCREASINGLY RISING COSTS AS WE ALL DO, WHICH ARE AMONG THE HIGHEST IN THE NATION AND HAVE SEEN THEIR MAINTENANCE FEES GO UP SIGNIFICANTLY OVER THE LAST COUPLE OF YEARS. >> THREE MINUTES. >> FOR THE FOREGOING REASONS ARDA HAWAII RESPECTFULLY PROVIDES THIS TESTIMONY, AND ASKS THAT MAYOR BISSEN'S INITIAL PROPOSED BUDGET IS SUPPORTED BY THE COUNCIL, ESPECIALLY RELATED TO TIME SHARE PROPERTY RATES.\r\n\r\nTHANK YOU. >> THANK YOU. ANY QUESTIONS FOR MR. JORGENSEN? MEMBER PALTIN. >> THANK YOU, CHAIR. THANK YOU, MR.\r\n\r\nJORGENSEN FOR YOUR TESTIMONY. I WAS WONDERING IS THE LAWSUIT PAU? >> WHICH LAWSUIT ARE YOU TALKING ABOUT? >> OH, THE ONE WHERE ARDA WAS SUING US OR SOMETHING -- FOR THE CLASSIFICATION OF TIME SHARES? >> THERE WAS -- >> TIME SHARE -- >> TIME SHARE OWNERS IN KA'ANAPALI, THERE'S A LAWSUIT THAT I BELIEVE IS STILL IN THE COURTS, BUT ARDA IS NOT A PARTY TO THAT. >> OH, OKAY. THANKS FOR THE CLARIFICATION.\r\n\r\n>> I HOPE I CLARIFIED. I HOPE I'M NOT SPEAKING OUT OF TURN, BUT THE KA'ANAPALI LAWSUIT WAS GOING ON FOR A LONG TIME, AND HAS GONE UP-AND-DOWN IN THE SYSTEM. >> ANY MORE QUESTIONS? IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. MAY WE HAVE THE NEXT TESTIFIER, PLEASE. >> THANK YOU. ALOHA.\r\n\r\n>> CHAIR, MR. CHAPMAN, LAWRENCE CHAPMAN IS BACK ON. >> MR. CHAPMAN. I DON'T SEE HIM. >> DO YOU SEE ME NOW? >> OH, YES, AND HEAR YOU, TOO >> GOOD, THANK YOU.\r\n\r\nI'M TESTIFYING ON BEHALF OF THE TVR STR H OWNERS, THE SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS HAVE HAD A TERRIBLE TIME SINCE AUGUST 8TH. FIRST THE GOVERNMENT CLOSED WEST MAUI TO TOURISTS, THEN DISCOURAGED TOURISTS FROM VISITING AND REPEATEDLY THREATENED MORATORIUM ON SHORT-TERM RENTAL. MANY SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS STRIDE ASSIST THE COMMUNITY BY PARTICIPATING IN THE AMERICAN RED CROSS PROGRAM FOR HOUSING DISPLACED PERSONS. THE RED CROSS REFUSED TO DEAL WITH SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS OR MANAGERS, WHO HAD

LESS THAN 50 UNITS. IN MY CASE, MY PROPERTY MANAGER MANAGES EIGHT UNITS, WE TRIED TO JOIN THE RED CROSS PROGRAM, AND RED CROSS REFUSED TO DEAL WITH US. SO WHAT I DID WAS OFFER MY UNIT FOR FREE. ALONG WITH MANY OTHER SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS.

SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS HAVE MORTGAGES, HOA DUES, PROPERTY TAXES, AND OTHER EXPENSES FOR WHICH THEY HAD TO GO OUT OF POCKET DURING THIS LAST SIX MONTHS. ALMOST HALF OF THE SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS ARE MAUI CITIZENS OR RESIDENTS, AND MOST OF THE NON-RESIDENTS VISIT, AS MUCH AS THEY CAN. WE ALL LOVE MAUI'S PEOPLE AND THE CULTURE. DURING THIS SAME PERIOD, HOTELS RECEIVED THE BOUNTY OF GOVERNMENT FUNDING, AT A TIME WHEN THEY WOULD OTHERWISE HAVE SUFFERED THE SAME FATE AS SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS. IT'S BEEN WIDELY REPORTED THAT THE RED CROSS PAID HOTELS OVER A MILLION DOLLARS A DAY. AMOUNTING TO SOMETHING NORTH OF \$200 MILLION TO-DATE. I HEARD AT LEAST ONE HOTEL BOOSTING THAT THEY BEAT THEIR RENTAL OBJECTIVES IN THE 3RD QUARTER, BECAUSE THE GOVERNMENT WAS PAYING A HIGHER RATE THAN THEY WOULD HAVE RECEIVED FROM TOURISTS.

IN THE FACE OF THIS DISPARITY, I DON'T UNDERSTAND WHY SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS ARE CARRYING ALL OF THE BURDEN OF INCREASED TAXATION IN THE MAYOR'S BUDGET, AND HOTELS ARE UNTOUCHED. BUT MY CALCULATIONS, HOTELS HAVE RECEIVED MORE THAN \$100 MILLION OF EXCESS PROFIT BASED ON THE RATES THEY CHARGED. PLEASE CONSIDER INCREASING THE PROPERTY TAX ON HOTELS, AND NOT THE RATES FOR INDIVIDUALS, MANY OF WHOM ARE MAUI RESIDENTS. IF I HAVE A MINUTE, THE OTHER ITEM I HAVE ALWAYS OBJECTED TO ARE TIERS ON SHORT-TERM RENTAL PROPERTIES, BECAUSE 22% OF STR OWNERS HAVE MORE THAN ONE PROPERTY. SO AN OWNER THAT HAS A PROPERTY ASSESSED AT \$3 MILLION IS PAYING MORE THAN AN OWNER THAT HAS THREE PROPERTIES OF \$1 MILLION. AND DON'T QUITE SEE THE LOGIC OF THAT? TYPICALLY THE OWNER OF THREE ONE-MILLION DOLLAR PROPERTIES IS BRINGING IN MORE TOURISTS, PLACING A GREATER BURDEN ON THE COUNTY OF MAUI.

>> THREE MINUTES. >> OKAY. I UNDERSTAND MY THREE MINUTES ARE UP. THANK YOU, COUNCIL MEMBERS. >> MEMBERS, DO YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS? MEMBER PALTIN. >> THANK YOU, CHAIR.

THANK YOU, MR. CHAPMAN FOR YOUR TESTIMONY. I WAS WONDERING IF YOU CAN SEND ME WHERE YOU GOT THAT STATISTIC, IF YOU CAN CITE THE -- CLARIFY WHERE YOU GOT THAT OVER HALF OF THE SHORT-TERM RENTAL OWNERS LIVE ON MAUI? IF YOU COULD SEND THAT INFORMATION? >> YES, I WILL CERTAINLY TRY AND FIND IT. I WAS REALLY DOING THE INVERSE OF THE GOVERNOR HAS SAID, I THINK, THAT NON-RESIDENTS OWN ABOUT 58% OF SHORT-TERM RENTALS ON MAUI. AND SO IF NON-RESIDENTS HAVE 58%, RESIDENTS MUST OWN 42%. I WILL TRY AND FIND THE BACKGROUND.

>> THAT WOULD BE GREAT, BECAUSE THE GOVERNOR SAYS A LOT OF THINGS. [LAUGHTER] >> YES. >> ANY MORE QUESTIONS, MEMBERS? IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >> THANK YOU. >> CHAIR, THERE'S NO ONE ELSE CURRENTLY SIGNED UP TO TESTIFY, BUT IT LOOKS LIKE MR. CROLY IS HERE TO TESTIFY.

HE WILL BE OUR LAST TESTIFIER CURRENTLY. >> ALOHA, CHAIR, ALOHA COUNCIL MEMBERS. THIS IS A SPACE THAT I OCCUPIED FOR MANY, MANY A TIME PRIOR TO COVID AND I WAS REMINDING DRIVING HERE TODAY IT WAS EXACTLY FOUR YEARS AGO, WHEN I WAS GIVING TESTIMONY VIA BLUEJEANS FROM MY HOME. AND I WANTED THE COUNCIL TO SEE MY EMPTY BED & BREAKFAST ROOMS AND I THOUGHT THAT MIGHT MAKE AN IMPACT ON THE COUNCIL, SEEING MY EMPTY ROOMS AND COULDN'T HAVE DREAMED THAT I HAD A YEAR WITH NO INCOME, BUT I DID. I SURVIVED, BUT MY PLEA FOR LOWER TAX RATES WAS LOST. AND EVERY YEAR FOR THE LAST FIVE YEARS THAT I HAVE COME HERE AND POINTED OUT THAT WE, BED & BREAKFAST OWNERS ARE HOMEOWNERS, FIRST AND FOREMOST. WE ARE THE ONLY HOMEOWNERS ON MAUI, WOULD ARE REQUIRED TO LIVE IN OUR HOME.

WE HAVE TO LIVE THERE, FULL-TIME AND WE MAY NOT OPERATOR ANY TIME WE ARE NOT THERE. SO OTHER HOMEOWNERS CAN LEAVE AND GO ON VACATION AND SPEND MONTHS OFF-ISLAND AND THEY STILL GET THE HOMEOWNER RATE. OTHER HOMEOWNERS HAVE ALL KINDS OF BUSINESSES AT THEIR HOMES AND THEY DON'T LOSE THEIR HOMEOWNER RATES. THE ONLY PEOPLE THAT DO HAVE THE ONES THAT HAVE A FEW BEDROOMS THAT THEY RENT OUT TO VISITORS AND WE LOSE OUR HOMEOWNER EXEMPTION AND WE GET CHARGED A HIGHER RATE. NOW I'M VERY FAMILIAR WITH THIS, BECAUSE I WAS INVOLVED WITH CREATING THE COMMERCIALIZED RESIDENTIAL RATE WHETHER IT CAME ALONG. WHEN IT CAME ALONG WE WERE CHARGED \$1.50 MORE PER

THOUSAND THAN THE HOMEOWNER RATE. AND THAT TIME, THE HOMEOWNERS HAD A \$300,000 EXEMPTION.\r\n\r\nTHROUGH THE YEARS, THE HOMEOWNER RATE HAS GONE DOWN, BUT THE BED & BREAKFAST RATE HASN'T. SO THAT DIFFERENTIAL HAS BECOME LARGER. AND THAT IS THE PROBLEM THAT I'M COMPLAINING ABOUT. IF THE HOMEOWNER RATE WAS \$3.50, THEN THE RATE THAT WAS SUGGESTED BY THE MAYOR AT \$5 MORE MINE, I WOULD BE GOOD WITH. I WOULD BE OKAY WITH, PAYING \$1.50 MORE THAN HOMEOWNERS THAT WOULD BE IN LINE WITH WHAT IT SHOULD BE. BUT IT'S NOT. WHAT HAS BEEN SUGGESTED BY THE MAYOR IS \$2 FOR HOMEOWNERS, AND \$5 FOR ME. THAT \$3 RATE, THAT ADDITIONAL \$3 RATE, COMBINED WITH THE LOSS OF MY EXEMPTION TRIPLES MY PROPERTY TAXES.\r\n\r\nI HEARD GARY SALDANA COMPLAINING ABOUT 28% INCREASE AND MY PERSONALLY WILL GO UP 51% THIS YEAR, IF IT'S LEFT THE WAY IT WAS PROPOSED BY THE MAYOR. SO I'M LOOKING FOR A HERO HERE. WHO WILL STEP FORWARD ON FRIDAY NIGHT AND SAY, HEY, THE BED & BREAKFAST GUYS DESERVE A LITTLE CONSIDERATION? I SUGGESTED THE TIERS BE PUT IN AND MAYBE THE SAME RATES THAT ARE PROPOSE FOR THE LONG-TERM RENTALS BE GIVEN TO THE BED & BREAKFAST GUYS? BECAUSE IT IS A SPLIT. >> THREE MINUTES. >> HOMEOWNERS LIVING IN OUR HOMES AND WE HAVE ANOTHER PORSCHE OF OUR HOME WE'RE USING TO OUR B&B. KEEP IN MIND, YOUR LONG-TERM RENTAL GUYS, THEY MIGHT HAVE ONE LONG-TERM RENTAL ON THE PROPERTY, AND THEN REST OF THE PROPERTY IS USED AS A SECOND HOME.\r\n\r\nOKAY? NOT ALL OF THEM, BUT SOME OF THEM ARE SET UP THAT WAY. SO AND OTHER HOMEOWNERS HAVE ALL KINDS OF OTHER BUSINESSES ON THEIR HOMES, BUT THEY ARE NOT BED & BREAKFAST AND THEY DON'T LOSE THE RATE. SO I'M JUST LOOKING FOR THAT CONSIDERATION FOR US. AND I HAVE BEEN HERE EVERY YEAR AND I SEPTEMBER SUSPECT I WILL BE BACK NEXT YEAR. IT'S SO NICE TO SEE YOU ALL IN PERSON AND I TRULY MISSED THE OPPORTUNITY TO ADDRESS YOU IN-PERSON AND THANK YOU FOR THE WORK THAT YOU ARE DOING HERE. I WATCH YOU ON TV AND I RECOGNIZE JUST HOW HARD EVERYBODY IN THIS ROOM IS WORKING.\r\n\r\n>> THANK YOU, TOM. ANY QUESTIONS FOR MR. CROLY, IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >> IP CAME TO SEE TOM IN PERSON. >> TOM COOK, GO AHEAD. >> I MISSED YOU MR. CROLY, UNFORTUNATELY THE ONE DAY YOU DID COME, I'M IN KIHAI.\r\n\r\nI WOULD HAVE LIKED TO HAVE BEEN THERE. I DO HEAR YOU ABOUT THE BED & BREAKFAST DIFFERENCE. MANY YEARS AGO, WHEN THE DISCUSSION ABOUT BED & BREAKFASTS, AND MY CLARIFYING QUESTION IS THIS, IF YOU COULD WRITE DOWN YOUR PROPOSAL TO DIFFERENTIATE THE BED & BREAKFAST THE WAY THAT YOU DESCRIBED IT, I WOULD LIKE TO HEAR IT. BECAUSE I DO BELIEVE THAT THE -- I HAVE HEARD YOU. I HAVE RECOGNIZED THE DIFFERENCE OF WHAT THE BED & BREAKFAST HOMEOWNERSHIP IS COMPLETELY DIFFERENT THAN THE TVRS. SO IF YOU COULD DO THAT AND WRITE IT DOWN AND GET IT TO MY OFFICE OR GET IT TO THE COUNCIL, I WOULD APPRECIATE IT. >> I WILL ABSOLUTELY DO THAT FOR YOU, SIR, AND IF YOU COULD BE MY HERO, THANK YOU.\r\n\r\n>> THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >> THANK YOU FOR COMING. >> ALL RIGHT, ANY MORE TESTIFIERS? >> CHAIR, THERE'S CURRENTLY NO ONE ELSE SIGNED TO TESTIFY AND TO NOTE THAT VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA HAS JOINED US. THIS WILL BE LAST CALL. >> LET THE RECORD SHOW THAT VICE-CHAIR SUGIMURA IS HERE, AND WE DO SEEM TO HAVE ONE MORE TESTIFIER. PLEASE LET US KNOW YOUR NAME.\r\n\r\n>> GOOD EVENING. MY NAME IS EDWARD CORDELLIA AND I CAME HERE TO EXPRESS MY STRONG SUPPORT FOR INCREASING REAL PROPERTY TAX RATE IN CERTAIN PROPERTY CLASSIFICATIONS IN MAUI COUNTY. AS WE NAVIGATE ONE THE MOST CRITICAL POINTS IN MAUI COUNTY'S HISTORY TO RECOGNIZE THE NEED TO INCREASED REVENUE STREAMS AND DEVASTATING WILDFIRES RESULTED IN THE LOSS OF THE ZIP CODE, BUT SEVERELY IMPACTED COUNTY'S REVENUE AND RESOURCES. REVENUE GENERATED FROM INCREASED RED-HOT REAL PROPERTY TAX RATES ON HOTEL AND COMMERCIAL AND INDUSTRIAL PROPERTIES IS ESSENTIAL FOR FUNDING CRITICAL INITIATIVES LIKE REBUILDING LAHAINA, REPAIRING THE INFRASTRUCTURE, AND BOLSTERING AND FUND POG OUR POLICE AND FIRE DEPARTMENTS OF IT'S IMPORTANT TO UNDERSTAND THESE TAX INCREASES ARE NOT MEANT TO BURDEN PROPERTY OWNERS, BUT TO PASS ON GUESTS THROUGH ROOM RATES ENSURING THAT THE BURDEN IS DISTRIBUTED BARELY. LOOKING AT THE CURRENT OCCUPANCY RATES AND AVERAGE DAILY RATES IN MAUI COUNTY IT'S EVENT EVIDENCE THAT THE INDUSTRY ARE THRIVING GENERATING SUBSTANTIAL REVENUE AND FILLING ROOMS, DESPITE THE CHALLENGES POSED BY THE WILDFIRES AND LOSS OF LAHAINA TIME, TOURISM REMAINS ROBUST AND ACTIVELY PROMOTED

THROUGH VARIOUS MEDIA OUTLETS LOCALLY AND GLOBALLY. GIVEN THESE CIRCUMSTANCES RAISING REAL PROPERTY TAXES IS NOT ONLY JUSTIFIED, BUT NECESSARY AND IT'S TIME FOR MAUI COUNTY RECENT DATA INDICATES WHY HOTELS STATEWIDE EXPERIENCED SLIGHT DECLINE IN OCCUPANCY DAILY RATES IN MARCH OF 2024, COMPARED TO MARCH 2023 FIGURED WERE HIGHER THAN PRE-PANDEMIC. DESPITE THESE CHALLENGES AND COUNTY HOTELS HAVE DEMONSTRATED RESILIENCE AND LEADERSHIP IN MARCH OF 2024 BY ACHIEVING THE RENT PER ROOM WITH ANNUAL DAILY RATE OF \$581 AND OCCUPANCY RATE OF 69.1%. NOTE ABLY, THEY ARE COMPARATIVE HIGHER AVERAGE DAILY RATES.

HOWEVER, IT'S IMPORTANT TO ACKNOWLEDGE WHILE THERE'S GROWTH COMPARED TO 2019 THERE'S BEEN A DECREASE COMPARED TO 2023. SPECIFIC HOTELS EXPERIENCED VARYING LEVELS OF PERFORMANCE, FOR INSTANCE, REPORTING REVENUE PER ROOM OF \$544, AND AVERAGE DAILY RATE OF \$811. AND OCCUPANCY RATE OF 67%. >> THREE MINUTES. >> IN APRIL, APRIL IS THE SLOW TIME OF THE YEAR FOR MAUI COUNTY, AS FAR AS TOURISM GOES AND WE'RE OPERATING CLOSE TO 70% OCCUPANCY. THAT IS A GOOD OCCUPANCY RATE, THAT IS FAIRLY NORMAL OCCUPANCY RATE. AND SPECIFIC REGIONS OF MAUI COUNTY, HOTELS ARE -- GIVEN THE CHALLENGES FACED BY THE HOSPITALITY SECTOR AND NEEDS FOR RECOVERY AND REVITALIZATION, I URGE THE COUNCIL FOR INCREASES IN REAL PROPERTY TAX AGAINST THESE PROPERTIES. BY DOING SO WE CAN ENSURE THAT THE BURDEN OF CONTRIBUTING TO THE COUNTY'S RECOVERY EFFORTS, SHARED EQUITABLY AND PROPERTY OWNERS. IN CON CLUES, IT'S CLEAR THAT ALSO RELYING SOLELY ON THE STATE LEGISLATURE FOR FUNDS IS NOT A SUSTAINABLE SOLUTION FOR MAUI COUNTY AND TO ADVOCATE FOR RELEASE OF ALL FAIR SHARES OF DONATED FUNDS AND TAX REVENUES AND ADDITIONAL RESCUES OWED TO MAUI COUNTY. YOU MIGHT CONSIDER -- ASKING THE STATE TO WAIVE ITS SHARE OF TAXES AND REVENUES THAT WE COLLECT OVER NEXT FIVE YEARS, TO HELP RELIEVE SOME OF THE BURDEN, THE FINANCIAL BURDEN THAT WE'RE ABOUT TO EXPERIENCE.

THANK YOU. >> THANK YOU. MEMBERS, DO YOU HAVE ANY QUESTIONS? MEMBER PALTIN AND MEMBER SINENCI. >> THANK YOU; CHAIR. DO YOU HAVE THOSE REV PARS COMPILED? >> THEY WERE JUST RELEASED BY THE HAWAII TOURISM AUTHORITY TODAY OR IN THE LAST FIVE DAYS AND JUST MADE PUBLIC.

AWESOME. THANK YOU. >> MEMBER SINENCI. >> MAHALO, MR. CORDELIA FOR YOUR TESTIMONY THIS EVENING. YOU MENTIONED HOTELS, COMPARED TO SOME OF THE OTHER COUNTIES, THE MAYOR IS PROPOSING \$11.75 PER THOUSAND ON HAWAII ISLAND IT'S \$11.55. ON KAUA'I, IT'S \$10.85 AND O'AHU IS \$13.90 DO YOU HAVE RECOMMENDATIONS. >> I RECOMMEND THE MAXIMUM AMOUNT. IF IT'S \$20, IT'S \$20. THE ONLY REASON I'M RECOMMENDING IT TO BE THIS HIGH, AS HIGH AS YOU CAN GET WHERE WE'RE AT AND WHAT IS AHEAD. I HEARD THE BUDGET DISCUSSION, YOU ARE LOOKING FOR MONEY AND CUTTING AND TRIMMING AND WE SHOULD BE PUTTING MONEY IN AND PUTTING MONEY OUT WHERE WE'RE SUPPOSED TO AND IT DOESN'T SEEM WE HAVE ENOUGH. AND SO THIS IS THE WAY YOU COLLECT -- I MEAN, I DON'T MEAN TO BE DISRESPECTFUL, BUT WE TEND TO DO THINGS EASY HERE AND PUMP TOURISM AND IT'S TIME TO COLLECT FROM TOURISM TO -- IN OUR COUNTY, AND I'M NOT JUST TALKING ABOUT HERE. THERE ARE TWO OTHER ISLANDS THAT WE HAVE TO TAKE CARE OF. SO WE HAVE THREE ISLANDS THAT WE NEED TO DEAL WITH AND WE NEED AS MUCH MONEY AS WE CAN KEEP FOR THE PEOPLE THAT ARE HERE RIGHT NOW. GOING TO THE STATE AND ASKING THEM FOR MONEY IS BURDENSOME. IT'S TIME-CONSUMING AND SEEMS TO BE DIFFICULT. I KNOW THEY LIKE TO MAKE RESOLUTIONS OVER THERE TO HAVE YOU FOLKS ANSWER CERTAIN QUESTIONS AND DO CERTAIN THINGS. I THINK YOU CAN MAKE RESOLUTIONS AND HAVE THE GOVERNOR ANSWER TO YOU AND FIND OUT WHERE YOUR MONEY IS WHEN YOU CAN GET IT? YOU JUST NEED TO GET PROACTIVE. THAT IS THE JUST THE WAY I SEE IT AT THIS POINT. >> TAXATION IS WITHIN OUR PURVIEW. MAHALO. >> ANY MORE QUESTIONS? IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >> CHAIR, THE LAST TESTIFIER CURRENTLY SIGNED UP TO TESTIFY IS STEVE ALLEN. STEVE ALLEN, IT'S YOUR OPPORTUNITY TO TESTIFY. >> GOOD EVENING, COUNCIL. LIVING ON AGRICULTURAL LAND, MY 10TH YEAR OCCUPYING THE PROPERTY. I STARTED OUT AT A AGRICULTURAL RATE. IT'S SIX ACRES, UP COUNTRY. WITH THE INCREASE IN TAX RATES, JUST THE AGRICULTURAL PROPERTY, IT'S STILL BEARABLE. BUT THERE'S NO WATER TO GROW PRODUCT WITH, INVASIVE SPECIES OF DEER DO NOT ALLOW ME TO BEGIN CONTEMPLATING DOING ANY AGRICULTURAL PRODUCT. AND AGAIN, THE SHORTAGE OF WATER

IN THE LAST TWO YEARS PLUS OF DROUGHT LIMIT THE POSSIBILITY IN ITS ENTIRETY. I CAN'T SUBDIVIDE. I CAN'T GET WATER METERS. MY PROPERTY TAXES ARE SIX TIMES HIGHER NOW BECAUSE IT'S NOT BEING USED AS AG LAND, AND I DIDN'T BUY IT THIS WAY. IT'S BECOME THIS WAY.\r\n\r\nAND I'M JUST WONDERING HOW THIS PERSPECTIVE IS LOOKED AT IN RELATIONSHIP TO THE BURDEN ON THE HOMEOWNER? THAT IS ALL I REALLY HAD TO SAY ABOUT THIS. THANK YOU.

>> THANK YOU, STEVE. YOU ARE THE STEVE WITH THE PLUMBING BUSINESS; RIGHT? >> YES, IT'S ME. >> STILL GOLFING.\r\n\r\nANY QUESTIONS FOR MR. ALLEN? IF NOT, THANK YOU VERY MUCH. >> CHAIR, THE LAST TESTIFIER CURRENTLY SIGNED UP IS JAMES LANGFORD. >> ALOHA EVERYONE. I JUST WANTED TO CHECK IN AND SEE IF YOU WANTED ANY HELP OTHER THAN SENDING MESSAGES AND I LOOK FORWARD TO TALKING TO YOU ALL SOON. ANY QUESTIONS?\r\n\r\n>> ANY QUESTIONS, MEMBERS? IF NOT. >> WE LIVE IN ALOHA. I LOVE YOU GUYS. >> THANK YOU. >> PEACE. >> NEXT TESTIFIER.\r\n\r\n>> CHAIR, THERE'S NO ONE ELSE CURRENTLY SIGNED UP TO TESTIFY. SO THIS WILL BE LAST CALL. IF YOU WOULD LIKE TO TESTIFY, THIS IS NOW YOUR OPPORTUNITY. AGAIN, THIS IS LAST CALL. AND THE COUNT DOWN IS 3, 2, 1. >> MEMBERS, ANY OBJECTIONS TO CLOSING PUBLIC TESTIMONY AND ACCEPTING WRITTEN TESTIMONY FOR THE RECORD? >> NO OBJECTIONS. >> WE HAVE NO FURTHER TESTIFIERS, MEMBERS.\r\n\r\nSO THIS MEETING IS, THIS PUBLIC HEARING IS NOW ADJOURNED. [GAVEL] I'M SORRY -- I TAKE THAT BACK. I TAKE THAT BACK. THANK GOODNESS YOU ARE SITTING THERE, JOYCE. IT SAYS ADJOURN ON MY NOTES. OKAY. >> ARE YOU SUPPOSED TO RECESS?\r\n\r\n>> RECESS UNTIL MAY 13TH. OKAY. EVERYBODY GOT THAT? >> YES, RECESSED. >> SAME PLACE. SAME STATION. >> WHAT TIME? \r\n\r\n>> KRISTINA HAS A QUESTION? >> WHAT TIME? >> WHERE IS KRISTINA? >> HI CHAIR. THAT WAS GOING TO BE MY REMINDER THAT YOU WOULD HAVE TO STATE THE DATE, TIME AND PLACE OF THE MEETING AT THIS PUBLIC HEARING. SO I THINK YOU SAID IT MAY 19TH -- . 13TH. SORRY, MAY 13TH.\r\n\r\nAT 11:00 A.M. ARE YOU COMING? >> JUST WANTED TO REMIND YOU OF THAT LANGUAGE. >> BRING A GUEST. OKAY. ANYBODY ELSE? EVERYBODY GOT THE MEETING IS RECESSED. [GAVEL] THANK YOU EVERYBODY.