

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

April 23, 2024

Online Only via Teams

CONVENE: 9:13 a.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Chair
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Vice-Chair (Out 12:21 p.m.)
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member
Councilmember Gabe Johnson, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member (Out 4:30 p.m.)
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Member (In 9:14 a.m.)
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Nohelani U'u-Hodgins, Member

STAFF: James Krueger, Senior Committee Analyst
Kasie Apo Takayama, Senior Committee Analyst
Jarret Pascual, Legislative Analyst
Clarissa MacDonald, Legislative Analyst
Carla Nakata, Legislative Attorney
Megan Moniz, Legislative Attorney
Yvette Bouthillier, Senior Committee Secretary
Jean Pokipala, Council Services Assistant Clerk
Lenora Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk

Additional staff

Executive Assistant for Councilmember Tom Cook:
Stacy Takahashi

Executive Assistant for Councilmember Gabe Johnson:
Kate Griffiths

Executive Assistants for Councilmember Tasha Kama:
Davideane Kama-Sickels
Nayleen Kamai
Evan Dust

Executive Assistant for Councilmember Alice L. Lee:
Michele McLean

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

Executive Assistant for Councilmember Tamara Paltin:
Angela Lucero

Executive Assistant for Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez:
Haunani Madela

Executive Assistants for Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci:
Dawn Lono
Gina Young

Executive Assistants for Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura:
Michele Yoshimura
Jordan Helle
Jennifer Matsumoto

Executive Assistants for Councilmember Nohelani U‘u-Hodgins:
Susan Clements
Laura McDowell

Residency Area Office (RAO):
Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lāna‘i Residency Area Office
Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokai Residency Area Office
Christian Balagso, West Maui Council Aide
Jade Rojas-Letisi, Council Aide, Makawao-Ha‘ikū-Pā‘ia Residency Area Office
Jared Agtunong, Executive Assistant for Councilmember Tom Cook, South Maui Residency Area Office

ADMIN.: Lesley Milner, Acting Budget Director, Office of the Mayor
Kristina Toshikiyo, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

OTHERS: Lisa Labrecque, Maui Humane Society
Michaellyn Burke, Lahaina Community Land Trust
Gary Saldana, Realtors Association of Maui
Robert Kanuha, Jr.
Jasee Law
Others (15)

PRESS: *Akakū:* Maui Community Television, Inc.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

ITEM 1: PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2025 BUDGET FOR THE COUNTY OF MAUI ((BILL 60 (2024), BILL 61 (2024), BILL 62 (2024), BILL 63 (2024), BILL 64 (2024), BILL 65 (2024), BILL 70 (2024), BILL 73 (2024), BILL 74 (2024), RESOLUTION 24-66, RESOLUTION 24-67, RESOLUTION 24-68, and RESOLUTION 24-77)

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Good morning, everybody, welcome. Today is April 23rd, it's 9:13 a.m., and we are in the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. And thank you very much. Last night we ended like close to 9:00, like 8:59, and working through Decisions Week. Very important. My name is Yuki Lei Sugimura, and as you know, this meeting is being conducted in accordance to the Sunshine Law. And as a reminder, Councilmembers, when your name is called, if you are not in the Council Chambers, please identify by name who, if anyone, is a room...in the room, vehicle, or workspace with you today. Minors do not need to be identified. Good morning, Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Good morning, Chair, and aloha kakahiaka to everyone.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: 'Ello. 'Ello, from Jamaica. Everything's gonna be all right. I'm home alone in my office and looking forward to a productive meeting.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. And our goal will be not to end at 9:00, right. Because we have your public hearing tonight, so we'll end by 4:00.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, by the way, can I say one thing, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Everybody let Mona know if you're coming to dinner, okay? Because I'm making shrimp curry, and I want to make sure I make enough. Okay. Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Have enough pieces of shrimp? That's expensive. Good morning, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha kakahiaka kākou.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aloha. Member Johnson.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Good morning, Chair, Councilmembers, community members. There's no testifiers that the Lānaʻi District Office. Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka, mai Oʻahu ke kuhiahewa. I'm at the Capitol on Oʻahu this morning, alone, and there are currently no testifiers at the Molokai District Office.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Member Cook, virtually you're joining us.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yes. Good morning, Chair. Aloha all. I am in the South Maui Residency Office. I'm alone, with Jared in the adjacent room, and there are currently no testifiers here today. And I'm looking forward to today's meeting.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And Member Uʻu-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER UʻU-HODGINS: 'Ello, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Hello.

COUNCILMEMBER UʻU-HODGINS: Hello, everyone.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much for being with us last night. And all your kids were with you. Yeah, that's so special. Member Sinenci, good to see you here.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Hey, aloha kakahiaka, and 'ello, Chair. No testifiers in Hāna.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. All right, Members. We have Acting Budget Director Lesley Milner, and she's actually doing the meeting from her office, and I'm sure she has her Directors standing with her. There you are, very good, nice to see you, Budget Director...Acting Budget Directing...Director Milner. From Corporation Counsel, we have Kristina Toshikiyo. From...we have Committee Staff Yvette Bouthillier, thank you very much for working tirelessly and endlessly. James Krueger, Kasie Apo Takayama, our Senior Legislative Analysts, thank you very much. Jarret Pascual and Clarissa MacDonald, Legislative Analysts; Carla Nakata and Megan Moniz, our Legislative Attorney; and Council Services Assistant Clerk Jean Pokipala. I think I saw Lei out there, too. Please see the last page of the agenda for information on meeting connectivity. Thank you, Members, for attending today's BFED meeting. We have one item on the agenda, which is BFED-1, Proposed Fiscal Year 2025 Budget for the County of Maui. Members, today, we'll continue with deliberations on Fiscal Year 2025. We will start our discussions with the Department of Fire and Public Safety, and then

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

continue with the Department of Housing, Human Concerns...Department of Housing, Department of Human Concerns, Department of Liquor Control, and then end with Department of Management. As a reminder, we will be taking up your priorities by departments, and it will be the last thing that we discuss for each agency. In order to keep on track with our proposed schedule, we will be implementing the following timeline. Maybe that will help us get through our day faster. We're going to be implementing a one-minute to propose amendments, and 30 seconds for each Councilmember to ask questions. Before we speak...before we start our discussion, we will begin by taking public testimony. And let's see. Okay. So, after the testimony, Members, I've asked Staff to present to you what work we did yesterday. And...and then we can talk about it further. But...so at this time, then, we...I can see we have testifiers. So, testifiers wanting to provide testimony should sign up on the...on the lob...in the lobby, for the online meeting via Teams link, or call in to the phone number posted on today's agenda. Written testimony is encouraged, and we can...and can be submitted via the eComment link at maucounty.us/agendas as well. Under the Sunshine Law, the Chair will receive oral testimony for agenda items as the item is called up. For individuals wishing to identify via Teams, please raise your hands to...or clicking on raise-your-hand button, or if you're calling in, follow the prompts via phone, star-5 to raise your hand and lower, and star-6 to mute and unmute. Staff will add names to the testifier list in the order testifiers sign up and raise their hands. For those on Teams, Staff will lower your hand once your name is added. Staff will then call the name you logged in under the last four...or in the last four digits of your phone number when it's your time to testify. At this time, Staff will also enable your microphones and videos. If you wish to testify anonymously, please notify Staff. Otherwise, please state your name, first...for the record, as well as the organization, and...and begin your testimony. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes per item, and I will give you another 30 seconds to wrap up if you need it, and to...to finish your testimony. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes per item...and again, the additional 30. Once you're done testifying, or if you do not wish to testify, you can also view the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, or maucounty.us/agendas. We will do our best to take each person up in an orderly fashion. We will now call testifiers wishing to testify. Thank you, Staff.

MR. PASCUAL: Thank you, Chair. The first testifier is Lisa Labrecque, followed by Michaellyn Burke.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning.

MS. LABRECQUE: Aloha, Chair and Councilmembers. I'm Lisa Labrecque, CEO of Maui Humane Society, back again to present additional testimony regarding the

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

\$150,000 that was reportedly taken from HARF and given to Maui Humane Society. You may remember when I was here two weeks ago, I was asked about this. I didn't know anything about it, so I went back and looked into it, and I learned that it's absolutely not true. In fact, the Mayor's budget...proposed budget does not even meet our requested funding for Fiscal Year '25. Now, there is a request from this Council to reduce our funding by 150,000 and give that money to HARF for animal sheltering. First off, HARF is not an animal shelter, they are a small rescue organization. Maui Humane Society is the only open-admission animal shelter in Maui County. This means we are required to take in any animal in need, whether lost, strayed, injured, neglected, abused, or a danger to the community. HARF can pick and choose the animals they admit. HARF took in 151 animals in 2023. We took in 4,746. That's 31 animals for every one that HARF took in. If we were to receive a comparable amount of money for the number of animals we take in, our budget from the County would be \$4.76 million just for animal sheltering. We receive less than half of that. Maui Humane Society is under contract with Maui County to take in, house, shelter, feed, care for, and provide veterinary services to the animals of Maui County. The funding we asked for, for Fiscal '25, only covers 66 percent of what this costs. The Mayor's budget offered us less than that, about 63 percent of our actual costs. It's on us to raise the difference. If an additional 150,000 is taken out, then the County is only paying us 55 percent of what it costs us to do this work. The impact of this would be devastating. 150,000 pays the salary of three full-time animal care positions, and we only have nine. This would drastically impact our ability to care for the animals that need us. Another way to look at this is that to maintain the same quality of care our team currently provides, we would have to reduce our annual intake from more than 4,700 down to 3,000. Would HARF take on those 1,700 animals that we wouldn't be able to care for? Now, I'm not saying HARF shouldn't receive any funding. They're a small, good organization, doing good work. Just don't take it from us. Remember, Maui Humane Society is under contract with the County to provide mandated services. It costs money to do this work, and the County should pay appropriately. . . .(timer sounds)... Covering only 55 percent of the costs to do County-mandated work is just not acceptable. I respectfully request that this \$150,000 not be taken from our budget. Thank you very much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any questions, Members? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Labrecque, for your testimony. So, your shortfall, was it 200,000 on that, and 81 on the enforcement?

MS. LABRECQUE: That's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And you have 9.4 million that can only be used for the burn-zone animals?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. LABRECQUE: For our...our fire response programs. That's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so, I just was wondering. If Lānaʻi is asking for 285,000 and the Mayor would give it to him, would it be better to give 281,000 to you folks, and then you can give the burn-zone cats that you paid less for than if you were to ship to Utah, them...pay them 285,000 for those 200 burn-zone cats that Lānaʻi took on discount? Would that be a okay switch-a-roo?

MS. LABRECQUE: I don't think I understand the question. Lānaʻi is asking for 283,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 285,000.

MS. LABRECQUE: 285,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: From the Mayor.

MS. LABRECQUE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And if we reallocated that to Maui Humane Society to fulfill your contractual obligations, could you give them an extra 285,000 for the burn-zone cats?

MS. LABRECQUE: So, you're asking if, instead of giving it to them, you give it to us, and then we give it to them?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You give them the...the fire money because they took in 220 burn-zone cats, and they need more money that they're asking the Mayor for.

MS. LABRECQUE: I apologize. I'm still not understanding what you're asking me.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because the 9.4 million you have is only for burn-zone wildfire response.

MS. LABRECQUE: Ah. So, you're asking if instead of the...the Mayor's budget giving Lānaʻi 283,000 [sic], if we will give it to Lānaʻi from our budget?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For the burn-zone cats they --

MS. LABRECQUE: To take care of the cats, in addition to the 450,000 we've already given them? That is a proposal that I would consider. I don't see how it relates to...to what I'm asking for here.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, that was a proposal by one Member. They need to get, like, nine...five votes to pass that proposal. I wouldn't vote for it.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. LABRECQUE: Got it. So, that...so, I think what you're saying is then you could give us the 150,000 because you're not...then you wouldn't take --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 281,000.

MS. LABRECQUE: -- the 150 'cause --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, the 150,000, I'm not going to vote for that. I don't know who would. But in this way, we could give you your contract amount, and you could give the Lāna'i Cat Sanctuary for the burn-zone cats their amount, and then it could work out. I don't know, HARF is a different story.

MS. LABRECQUE: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If that's some other Member's priority to just give them the money straight, but...

MS. LABRECQUE: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's one way it could work out. Because you're paying for the burn-zone cats, which you said they took in as a discount, and we don't want to give them extra money if burn-zone money can pay for it, you know?

MS. LABRECQUE: Absolutely. Yeah. I would entertain that. I would, of course, need to talk with my board because, you know, any fiduciary decisions like this have to be run through them.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. The only other thing I can see is cutting that whole 285,000 and not raising our taxpayers' money, and just, you know, putting it back to the...the people that don't want to pay more taxes. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Did I see another hand? None? Okay. Thank you very much --

MS. LABRECQUE: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Dr. Labrecque. Thank you. Next testifier?

MR. PASCUAL: Thank you, Chair. The next testifier is Michaellyn Burke, to be followed by Gary.

MS. BURKE: Good morning, Chair. Am I able to share screen?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. BURKE: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's not part of what we do. Sorry.

MS. BURKE: That's okay. Okay, no problem.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair?

MS. BURKE: My name is --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Before she starts, my...my camera's not abled [sic].

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, can we get Ms. Paltin on the...Member Paltin on the meeting? Okay, they're working on it. Okay...okay, go ahead. Please proceed with your testimony.

MS. BURKE: All right. Good morning, Councilmembers. Thank you for this opportunity to come in front of you again. I was actually testifying in front of you at the Lahaina budget meeting, but I got so off track, I came to testify as a member of the Lahaina Community Land Trust, and the short-term rental thing just kind of derailed what I was there for. So, I wanted to come again because I feel like this is very important. I think a lot of the...we get a lot of support in the community and on Maui about our Land Trust, and...but one of the criticisms, or one of the hesitations that we receive is that the Trust is such a brand-new organization. Yes, the 501(c)(3) is a brand-new organization, but the organizers within the Trust is not new. You know, we've been advocating in this community and in this County for decades, and we realized that the Trust aspect of what we do is brand new to all of us. So, we had surrounded ourselves for the...you know, the past months we've been going in and really diving into all of the people who are the experts in the Land Trusts arena around the country. And we've been able to meet with so many different Trusts, and so many different legal partners that can help us to really navigate this...this kind of new territory that we're in. And what we're finding is that land Trusts, especially post-disaster, is not a new thing. It's actually one of the most successful solutions that we're seeing across the country. And so, we've been able to be mentored by actually one of the...the most successful land Trusts that have come out, Houston Community Land Trust. And we've been able to be supported by other Trusts, like the Conservation Fund, the Trust for Public Lands, you know, Kamehameha Schools, the largest Land Trust that we're all used to. They're...they've been an early supporter, and they've been really right by our side this whole time. And we've been smart enough to surround ourselves with the best legal team that we could put together. You know, Mateo Caballero, we have Lance Collins on our team, and Linda Nye. So, if there is any hesitation about how new we are compared to other Trusts around in this County, I hope that you can understand that we're not dummies.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

You know . . . *(laughing)*. . . we...we know...we know that we...we need to do the work with the best and brightest people, and so we've surrounded ourselves with these people. And they've been so supportive, and they've...they've been really...from a distance, and from right here in Hawai'i, they've been really good about giving us all the advice and all the, if I could do it again, I would do it this way, you know, talks, and it's really important to us in Lahaina, and it's really important. And it's led by Lahaina . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . because this is the village that raised us. And if you can think back to your village that raised you, you know, it really comes down to the people, right? It's the people that you've been surrounded with all your life. And for us in Lahaina, we want to make sure that we protect those people. And the way that we protect those people is by keeping them on the 'āina here in Lahaina. So, mahalo for your time. I hope that that was a better explanation than I gave you during the budget meeting in Lahaina, and I'm here for any questions, if you have any.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you for explaining more. Very...appreciate that. Chair Lee has a question for you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, I'm sorry. I didn't hear all of the beginning of your testimony. Did you say there's more than one Lahaina Land Trust?

MS. BURKE: No. No, I didn't say that.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. And so --

MS. BURKE: What I did say, is that Lahaina Land Trust is brand new as a 501(c)(3), but the organizers that create, and are right now fueling Lahaina Land Trust, we're not new...we're not brand new.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, you...you can handle a substantial amount of money with regard to the Land Trust with...especially with people wanting to sell their properties --

MS. BURKE: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- you know, for whatever reason, they...they have? Because...have...so, have you done this before at all?

MS. BURKE: We...as a Land Trust, we have not. We have not secured our first parcel. But we've surrounded ourselves with the best legal team that we can for real estate, you know, for...to the extent that we can use Federal funding, or very specific funding. We've made sure that we have the legal team there that can guide us to do so. And on top of that, Kamehameha Schools has offered to help us with our first land acquisition, to kind of take us through what it's going to be like, and so, that we can...we can do it with people who've already done it before.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. One of my proposals is to condition the Managed Retreat Fund \$5 million for the Lahaina Trust organization. So, that is your organization, then?

MS. BURKE: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: All right. So, you would be able to handle those kinds of substantial funds?

MS. BURKE: We can do that.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You can do that?

MS. BURKE: We can absolutely do that. Yeah. We've surrounded...we've...we've received commitments from a lot of technical assistance to guide us through the process. So, we have no concern that we can do it, and we can do it correctly, and we can do it legally.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. And are there any other Lahaina Trusts? Land Trusts?

MS. BURKE: No.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. All right. Thank you, thank you.

MS. BURKE: Thank you very much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Any other questions? Ms. Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to clarify your role with the Lahaina Land Trust?

MS. BURKE: Yeah. Sorry, I'm all over the place. So, Mikey Burke, current president of Lahaina Community Land Trust, and I'm also a fire survivor.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Sorry about that. Okay, any other questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for testifying. Next testifier, please?

MS. BURKE: Mahalo.

MR. PASCUAL: Thank you, Chair. The last testifier currently signed up is Gary.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Gary?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MR. SALDANA: Good morning --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Saldana.

MR. SALDANA: -- Chair Yuki and Committee Members. My name is Gary Saldana. I'm commenting today on behalf of the Realtors Association of Maui in support of the bifurcation of the Department of Housing and Human Concerns. I had the good fortune of assisting Councilmember Molina with the first draft of the Department of Housing and Human Concerns bifurcation Charter amendment. At the time, it was the Councilmember's hope that the Department of Housing would be responsible for actual creation of affordable housing units, implementing the County's community...or the Comprehensive Housing Plan, and promoting new housing opportunities for homeless families. Further, he felt by separating the departments, it would allow each program to better serve their areas of concern, as each program currently had broad and vitally important responsibilities. Accordingly, at the time, the Administration was against this initiative. However, in a moment of compassion, the then DHHC Director Lori Tshako stated that ultimately, separating Housing from Human Concerns may allow the departments to focus more effectively on their respective areas of jurisdiction. As previously noted, it is still our hope that the bifurcation will, in fact, result in the production of affordable and safe housing. We can say that for sure...we can't say that for sure because it all depends on the new leadership in the Department. The initial hope for bifurcation was that the new department would take a greater role as potentially a developer or co-developer, and that's where a housing coordinator could be effective. Hiring a department head or a coordinator that has development, construction, and permitting experience would be a strong step forward in actually moving ground and erecting timbers. Therefore, we believe that it's time to get it done. So, let's start building housing. Accordingly, we respectfully request and encourage the Council to move the bifurcation forward in an effort to implement another tool in our affordable housing tool chest. I also want to comment on...on...on comments made by Councilmember Johnson regarding the Homeowners' Program Revolving Fund [sic], specifically the First-Time Homebuyers program, which is another program that is kind of near and dear to my heart. The current program allows \$30,000 grants for first-time homebuyers. This won't even come close to a first-time home...first-time down payment, or may not even cover closing costs. There are programs out there that allow lower down payments, such as VA loans, which is zero down. FHA offers a 3.5 percent down. There are certain lenders that...that provide 10 percent down, but then they have mortgage insurance as well, which adds to the...to the monthly payment. . . .(timer sounds). . . Therefore, we respectfully request your consideration to provide funding that would allow First-Time Homebuyers Program sufficient funds for grants that are more in line and realistic for a home purchase. Thank you for this opportunity to testify.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Mr. Saldana. Boy, you've done a lot of housing things. You're kind of sitting at the perfect seat right now with RAM.

MR. SALDANA: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, what is your recommendation, just for clarification, for the 30,000 for first-time homebuyers? If you're questioning that amount, what...are you making a recommendation? That's a clarifying question.

MR. SALDANA: No, I'm going to...I'm going to leave that up to you guys. But if...it's going to be impossible to create a fund that would allow \$260,000 for down payments because...or 200...yeah, \$260,000 for down payments. And to a certain extent, the homebuyer has to come up with some of their own money as well. There are a number of different lenders out there that have their own programs that are less than 20 percent down, so I'm thinking that --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. SALDANA: -- if you can get program...a program that is...provides closer to a 10 percent down, I think you could probably get a lot more...more first-time homebuyers to actually be able to secure a home. So that's something I think you should consider, is getting it closer to that 10 percent down.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Mr. Saldana. Any other questions for the testifier? Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, thank you for being here, Mr. Saldana. So, if you're saying...looking at something like 10 percent, and let's say someone wants to buy a home for \$900,000, so the subsidy that...that...or...or the homeowner, if had...if they had to come up with the 10 percent would be \$90,000, right? But you said the homeowner themselves should actually have some...some skin in the game too, right? So, the subsidy...I mean, so that if you...if I was looking at the 90,000 for that 10 percent, but the homeowner themselves would have to put in something too, right? So, what would the homeowner --

MR. SALDANA: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- what...what percentage would they put in?

MR. SALDANA: It was interesting because when we...when we developed the First-Time Homebuyers Program, obviously the...the median price of a home was significantly lower. This was back in 2000, around 2008. And that's when there was a dip in...in real estate values. And...and so, it made life a little bit easier to...to put 15...to give them 15, 20 percent down...or 15, \$20,000, and...and they

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

could come up with about the same amount, 15 to \$20,000. Because at the time, I think home purchase...a home...home values were closer to 600...400 to 600,000. So, we were looking at it, that if we give them 15 to 20,000 down, they should be able to come up with 15 to 20,000 of their own. But it's...I mean, asking them to come up with 45,000 now is maybe...may be a bit of a challenge. But that's something that...that we need to try to...to figure out.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Mr. Saldana. Chair Lee has a quick question...clarifying question for you, and then Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hi, Gary. I believe, just to clarify, that ordinance has to do with affordable homes, not market homes. That program is not for market homes, right?

MR. SALDANA: Yes, it is for market. It's always...I mean, we established it...I don't know if you guys have changed it, but when we established it, it would be for market homes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. I...I have a different...I have a different recollection, but we'll check on it. Thank you.

MR. SALDANA: Yeah. You could...you could have changed it, but when we established it, there wasn't a delineation between this program being for market home versus affordable homes. There was...we didn't make that distinction.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Because usually, our policies focus on helping those of the moderate or below-moderate, yeah, not the market homes necessarily.

MR. SALDANA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you. Thank you.

MR. SALDANA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Johnson has a clarifying question for you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair.

MR. SALDANA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Good morning, Gary. Thank you for your testimony, really appreciate your knowledge. I'm sure you're aware of the ADU program that we're doing now to help people build little 'ohanas on their...on their parcels of land. Did we give...that program offers \$100,000. Is that more in line with what we would support as a RAM, and just...is \$100,000...because we already do that with the ADU, is that more of a number that would be more realistic?

MR. SALDANA: I think that would be a good...good solid number. Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. That's my clarifying question. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Anybody else have any questions for Mr. Saldana? Seeing none. All right. Next testifier, please?

MR. SALDANA: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. PASCUAL: Thank you, Chair. The last testifier signed up is Robert Kanuha, Jr.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning.

MR. KANUHA: Good morning, everyone.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning.

MR. KANUHA: Well, first of all, that ADU, ho, lot of problems. Was the ADU...well, I'm here in behalf of trying to use all the money in the most useful and productive way. And lot of it...and not only that is oversighting all the money. Because right now we should be in emergency mode right now from COVID-19. So, you know what I'm saying? Every day is emergency, that's the way I look at it. You know, everybody look at different things the way, and this is about the land. And the ADU is causing a lot of havoc. It puts a density on a street. Not only that, it puts a density on the wastewater. Now it's just like 'ohana, you put three more on the 'ohana lot. Now, no parking, they parking on the streets. Then they walk down the street, they get one attitude like, hey, I'm a survivor. I'm good with that. But come with your heart, okay? No come with something else. This ADU, and now all this building, real estate, they're going crazy. They're calling everybody up for your property. I dealing with this in Paukukalo. I live 5th Lane, you (*audio interference*) know what I'm saying? So, you already know what I'm talking about. So, this ADU putting one real density in that whole section. So, the thing we got to do is, we got to eradicate all the hazard...all the hazard, that's what I'm saying. Look around the city, look any city, how it burns, okay? And what it is, is the

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

ADU, and also, now you get 4Leaf, LLC. This thing come out of Pasadena, California. This new...I don't know if you know the 4L [sic], these guys going issue the permits, and they come out of Pasadena. And Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory is more east. That's where they do our country. Department of Energy, that's how we do all our approving ground, all our experiment...satellite, atomic bomb. So, what I'm saying is when I look...coming out of Pasadena now, why is this entity coming from California? I mean...so, I'm just talking about how we spending the money. And all this without me knowing, that's why we got to be in emergency mode. My family come from Kaupō, and that's why I wear this shirt because the land is in jeopardy right now. We got to get rid of all the hazard, meaning we got to get rid of all our grass, all the trees. Bring the trees down to how you cut your nails. We got to keep them down. Over here in Wailuku, everything...all Paukukalo, all the mountains, everything. That's why Lahaina when burn. Because the wind was so strong, came down the highway, Prison Street, all the side streets, went vacuum, and everything, the fire . . .(inaudible). . . street narrow roads. It creates . . .(timer sounds). . . a vacuum. So, all I'm saying is to spend our money wisely. And not only that, I want to be responsible for Kaho'olawe. We got to watch the KIR, the committees [sic], because they not doing enough for Kaho'olawe. I know that whole island, so I also want to declare that maybe I want to be responsible for. Get rid of Dawson and Base Camp. Get rid of Dawson. Zappala (*phonetic*) was running Base Camp.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 30 seconds.

MR. KANUHA: So anyway, please, all I want to do is work for this Council and do oversight for where the money going because you guys get the right to follow the money. As far, can go all the way up to the Police of Chief, all over. So, what I'm saying is to grandfather me as being autonomous, but I work for you folks. I don't work for nobody else, I work for this body right here.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. KANUHA: And let me be the one to follow the money. Thank you. Do the right thing because we've seen so much trouble. We in so much trouble. Thank you very much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Stand by for questions. Anybody has clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for being with us this morning.

MR. KANUHA: Thank you very much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Any more testifiers?

MR. PASCUAL: Chair, that was currently all the individuals signed up to testify. If there's anyone out there in the Chamber or on Teams that would like to testify,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

please come up to the mic and begin your testimony, or use the raise-your-hand function. Oh, I see one individual.

MR. LAW: Jasee Law, Kula Uka, Waiakoa ahupua'a.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is that mic on?

MR. LAW: Good morning, Chair. Konnichiwa, Chair Sugimura. I came to report this morning I checked out the churches, the luakinis, this morning up in Kula in our neighborhood, and both the King Cathedral guys, they don't even do the morning prayer anymore until 6 o'clock, I guess not. They was...they were not there this morning. I can't check every day. And the Holy Ghost church up there, there's nobody there, it's vacant too. So, I'm wondering, it's...kind of has to go along with what the previous testifier said about the corporations. They're giving us rules from Honolulu and down here, Kahului, when I think we should just...we need to have people on the ground up there in our neighborhood and taking care of the people in our community. And let me insert the standard disclaimer. Nine out of ten people that goes there on Sunday is good. They got a sign on the Holy Ghost church there on the...on the fence --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is this budget related?

MR. LAW: Yeah, it's got to do with the tax. They're not paying taxes, they're getting a subsidy from the rest of the taxpayers on their land, and I think there should be more oversight. So, since we're there, we need to watch them. And the sign on the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any questions for the testifier?

MR. LAW: -- the fence says "Kekahi I Kekahi." That means love one another. And that's a good thing to tell the rest of the world, especially Israel and Palestine.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any questions for this testifier? Seeing none. Next testifier, if any?

MR. PASCUAL: Chair, that's currently all the individuals signed up to testify. Would you like to...would you like me to do a last call for oral testimony?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, please. Yes, please.

MR. PASCUAL: Okay. This is the last call for oral testimony. Please come up to the podium or raise your hand on Teams if you would like to provide testimony. And the countdown is three, two, one. Seeing none. Chair, no one has indicated that they wish to testify.

. . .CLOSE PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. So, appreciate everyone who's taking the time to share their thoughts with us. And at this time, I want to know if Staff could go over Exhibit A because we have...Exhibit 1. Thank you. Yeah. Oh, you can...you can present it any way that you want. So, I wanted the Staff to be able to share the up...the goal is to look at Exhibit 1, and basically look at the cuts and adds that we did yesterday to verify it. And then the total is...because it is cumulative for the whole County, we don't have a...a total just for yesterday, yeah? Oh, we do? Okay. Oh, okay, you're going to share that? Thank you.

MR. KRUEGER: So, Chair, we'll start with the Exhibit 1 first --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: -- and then, we'll do the...the larger overall picture.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Hard copies were just given out to the Members.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And...and emailed to us?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, we emailed out the Exhibit 1 to the Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Did you get it, Chair Lee and Member Cook? Oh, and Member Rawlins-Fernandez at the Capitol. Did you all get it? Okay. Here we go.

MR. KRUEGER: So, Chair, what I'm trying right now is *(pause)* so, Chair, what we're screensharing right now is the...is the Exhibit 1, but just for the departments that the...that the Committee discussed yesterday. So, as you can see, we have no recorded changes on the Leg Branch side. And so, the changes begin starting with Department of Agriculture. We sent the Exhibit 1 for yesterday's meeting to...to the Members this morning after the gavel. So, Members...Members online, you can follow along with that...that copy. So, the Members can review, and if they see any issues or anything, you know, to please let us know if we didn't capture anything correctly. I will note that for this copy of Exhibit 1 that we have here right now, we...we don't include a CIP sheet because the only CIP change the Members made yesterday was for the Spreckelsville Force Main replacement, and then also for the...and we also don't include an updated Appendix A, Part I, because the Members only made one change to that SHSG grant under MEMA. But...but we do have those changes recorded. Oh, Chair, I see that Councilmember Paltin has her hand raised.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member Paltin.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. Just wanted to clarify your legend. Red is decrease, blue is transfer, and green is add?

MR. KRUEGER: Yeah. Well, red is...red is decrease, green right now is...it's like conditions or condition-neutral, and blue would be transfers or adds.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, what is green in column A and B...is add, right?

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, apologies. I might not have updated all of the...all of the colors. If it's green or blue in A and B, that's an add.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: If it's red, it's a decrease. I can say that for sure.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Line 287 in B is green, 214 and 215 is green. So that would be meant to be blue?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes. We can update that to blue. I...I think I might have also left that as green as a reminder to move over some of the grants...the grants that came with that motion for Councilmember Johnson's priority.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The...the grants that I see moved over are in blue, but the additional money added to the budget looks like green to me.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, apologies.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, green is meant to be conditions mostly, like not...nonmoney amendments? And blue is meant to be added?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Blue is added and red is a decrease.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes. So, for sure, reds will be decreases. And then in this current version, green or blue are adds.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: And then maybe, moving forward what we'll do is instead of trying to color code by grant...by like conditions, or things like that, we'll try and color code by priority instead. So, like removal priorities will be red and then...you know. So, we can adjust to that, and we don't have this confusion moving forward.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, increases will all be the same color is what you're saying?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, got it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So blue will be adds, red will be decreases, and green...greens are conditions. Is that what you just said?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, we'll take a look at the color coding --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: -- and we'll clarify it moving forward.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, maybe you can work on that, and then give it to us later? An updated version, right? Anybody else have any questions on your particular conditions, adds, or any changes that you made? Okay. So, thank you very much. And again, everybody, thank you for...oh, yes, Departmental. Sorry, go ahead. Thank you. The most exciting part, yeah?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Okay. So, the first thing I'll note is we only got up to Finance yesterday, and so you can ignore everything from Fire and Public Safety down. The only reason why I did include them is because we moved the grants for Mayor's office, and then also, we...I made the adjustments for Countywide for fringe and those types of things. So, again, no change to Leg Branch. There was a decrease in Agriculture, decrease in Corporation Counsel, increase in East Maui Water Authority, no change in MEMA, increase in DEM, decrease in Finance, increase in Countywide, and then...yeah, Mayor's Office. So, this is the original total operating and CIP number, and...and this doesn't take into account the RPT certification. So, I'll just note that 1.1 about extra is not reflected here. Then there's the current Councilmember...Committee amended number, and then this is the difference. So, you're about 1.7 over. Again, not taking into account certification, and then the overhead reimbursement that you'll adjust later this week.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I see hands. Member Rawlins-Fernandez, Member Johnson, then Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Thank you so much, Staff, for working so hard on this as quickly as you did. We finished at 9:00 last night, and you had this ready for us at 9:00 this morning, so I just wanted to first, thank you so much. So, my question is regarding the difference. I think for most, except DEM, is General Fund. We did make like Member Paltin's amendment,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

which was to Solid Waste, like...I think, like...I can't remember if it was like a total of 100,000 or so that removed the supplemental transfer from General Fund so that it wasn't going to the Special Revolve...oh, Special Fund for the self-funded divisions. So, when showing the difference, is...is that General Fund only?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: This is all...all the changes made yesterday. So, this is the entire operating and CIP with all the funds.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. Because I...I know that for some Councilmembers it matters what the...you know, the total bottom line looks like. And there are...some Councilmembers' goal is to have, you know, a budget that's less than the Mayor's. But for the public...so, General Fund is property taxes, TAT, and...and a few other things. But if we're reducing like the Special Funds, like Solid...Solid Waste, then it's not going to reduce property taxes, which I assume is more of the Councilmembers' bigger concern, unless we reduce the rates for those Special Funds as well. So, maybe I can talk story with you more offline about how to present on the difference. Not to give you more work, but just so that it's clear.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Maybe we can have a talk about it, and then I can talk to Staff. Thank you. Any other questions? Member Rawlins-Fernandez, are you done? Next we have --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . mahalo, Ms. Apo Takayama.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Member Johnson...Member Johnson, then Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Correct me if I'm wrong. I remember we got \$19 million from the Homeland Security we didn't receive, and I don't see that reflected under the Emergency Management Agency. And I don't know if that's going to...if we want to be, like what Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez says, is a little bit less than the Mayor's budget, wouldn't we want to mention that there's \$19 million that we didn't receive from Homeland Security, and the \$54 million from the Bridge Grant that was supposed to be given by HFC? So those...those are big numbers, right? Shouldn't that be somewhere on here to...or...or is --

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: The --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Bridge Grant is not --

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: -- yeah, this doesn't include grant funded. We...we don't take into account the grant funding here.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: All right. Thanks for that clarification. So...well, that's...that's what I was wondering. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And we haven't come to that yet, the Bridge Grant by the Department. So, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I'm confused about the Environmental Management difference. Even with the CIP, I think that we only added 3.6 million roughly, and then we cutted some, but it's showing an increase of 6.9 million?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: It's because it also includes the interfund transfer for the Mayor's office into EP&S, the grants.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. Okay. Oh, the...okay, I got it. And that's why you have the minus four million at the Mayor's one?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What about the additional revenue for the Highway Fund by changing the fees, or even...I mean, I guess you don't reflect the FOG tipping fee, but it...wasn't that supposed to generate like an additional amount?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Yeah. So, we're not reflecting additional revenues here either. This is just expenditures.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any other questions? Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Just a clarification. So, the difference at the bottom is just for the departments that we went through?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Yes, that's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: And Mayor is reflected because you moved it into EP&S, but otherwise, none of the other ones were touched...sorry, and Countywide for fringe.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, thank you. Good question. We're starting with Fire, yeah, today, so...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But Countywide is not complete? It's going to be running thing --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, that's Friday. We'll take up Countywide Friday. That's going to be cumulative, so...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, right now, we're over 1.7?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Correct. Not taking into account the RPT certification.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Hmm. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I already got my question answered.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is that...you're fine? Okay. Thank you. All right. So, maybe then...are you...could you work on getting the color, or whatever you want to do with the Exhibit 1, and then share with us at the appropriate time? Yeah? Can? Thank you. Okay. So, today we're going to do...we're going to do Fire. Ms. Milner, are you...you're there, right? Upstairs in your office? Okay. So, the Budget Bill, which is Bill 60, look at pages 7 and 8, and these are the...if anybody has proposed amendments for Fire and Public Safety, we will receive it. And again, I'm trying to put us on a timer so that we can go through this expeditiously to get ready for ending at 4, and starting our public hearing tonight at 5 regarding Real Property Tax. So, anybody have any amendments or changes to Fire? No? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I just had a question. I know last...last night--maybe you're spoiling us--we had the...just all the different departments?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you want to know --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- what departments we're doing today? Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Last...last night, you had one. I was just curious if we had one today.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay, so we had, like, a spreadsheet. I mean, you had a handout so that you can see what departments we're taking up today?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Did we prepare something similar?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, that's what's being passed out now? Okay. Thank you, Yvette. Okay. Okay. Very good. Okay. Okay. So, what was just passed out for today is the department order...Fire, Public Safety, and Department of Housing, Department of Human Concerns, Department of Liquor, and then ending with Department of Management. On this summary sheet, it'll show you all the different aspects of what will be impacted. And...(clears throat) excuse me. So, we'll talk about it in that order, and ending with the Members' Priorities. Again, I'm going to implement the one minute, your proposal, and 30 seconds for questions. So, anything else you need, Member Sinenci? Yeah. Perfect. Okay. Member Paltin had her hand up, and I think Member U'u-Hodgins also. Go ahead.

DEPARTMENT OF FIRE AND PUBLIC SAFETY

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move, on number 7 of the Budget Bill, Department of Fire and Public Safety, small a.(1), A - Salaries, decrease 100,000 plus fringe \$83,240.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Did you have a summary that you passed out --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, thank you. Yeah? A summary that you passed out like yesterday?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I emailed it to Staff last night when I got home at, like, 10:30.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah? You'll distribute? Okay. I heard motion made by Chair Lee [sic], second by...I'm sorry, motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee. Thank you very much. Discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, this is --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: One minute.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- for the pending positions for the Pu'u Keka'a contract. We're still waiting on the contract, and so, decreasing about three months of

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

funding because they'll need time to get a list together, and do the testing, and the recruit, and all that, so...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, have anybody --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If the contract gets signed.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members have any questions regarding that? Member...Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Sorry to interrupt. I just want to clarify. Is this Admin program that we're cutting from?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Ocean Safety. e., small e.

MS. MILNER: Oh, Ocean Safety. Okay. Sorry, I heard A. Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Paltin.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We got to get used to you not being here, so wave your hand a lot. Okay, Members, any questions? Seeing none, let's vote. All in favor, raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Aye. Those opposed? Okay. Looks like we have nine "ayes." Member Sinenci is on, yeah? He voted yes? Okay, nine "ayes," [sic] motion carries.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember Cook.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move, in small a.(1), B, Equipment, decrease 35,000, subject-object index code 911088C-7039 [sic], Priority Number 56, Page 9-9 in the Budget Details. If I get a second, I can explain.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: This equipment was purchased in Fiscal Year '24.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. BOUTHILLIER: Chair, who made the second?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do you need a second?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Tasha?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yeah, Tasha. So, motion made by Member Paltin, second by Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Page 9-9, subject-object code 911008C-7039. It's the...the Radio Tester thing.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Got that? Okay, Members. I just got a correction that Tom Cook was not at the last vote. I...I just assumed he was on screen. So, correct that. So that would be eight “ayes” and one excused for that last vote. The first one with Fire. Okay. Go back to this. Sorry about that. Any questions? Seeing none. Okay. So, can you repeat your motion again?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: In small a.(1), Category B, decrease 35,000, subject-object index code 911008C-7039, Priority Number 56, Page 9-9 of the Budget Details. This piece of equipment was purchased this fiscal year.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, it’s done.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I think it was already motioned and second with Member Kama, but...so at this time, if there’s no more discussion, then we can vote. All in favor, say “aye.” Raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aye. Thank you. So, there’s eight “ayes,” one excused, which is Member Cook, right? Everybody else is on screen, correct? Okay. Thank you.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U’u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember Cook.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Then --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I think so.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I would do a transfer in small letter d.(1), Category B - Equipment, decrease by 200,000 for the four Firefighter III vehicles, page 9-69, and transfer it to Appendix 2, Category H. (3), disbursement for four vehicles, 200,000, subject-object code 101075C-7040, page 44, or Budget Details 9-81.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion be...made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee. So, these are the vehicles for the firefighters.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Move it from Category B to the Revolving Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And I think that was my priority, so thanks for doing that...my condition. Great. Very good.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then...oh, we didn't vote yet.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Are you done?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Vote.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Eight "ayes," one excused, Member Cook.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember Cook.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, this was what Chair...Chief said when he came before us, where he wanted to use this in Revolving Fund, that permitting category. I forget the alphabet that's in the Revolving Fund. But thank you, Chair...I mean Member Paltin, for taking care of that. Next.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Small c.(1), A...or Category A, increase by 5,280, moving three EP from Firefighter I to Firefighter III on page 9-20, and move nine Firefighter IIs to Firefighter Is on pages 9-23 through -25.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee. And I think that also was on this April 12th letter, but...go ahead, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. Three of the Firefighter Is, they're making Firefighter IIIs, which they would backfill the Firefighter I position, and I think six of the Firefighter IIs are moving to Firefighter Is.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I have a question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: If you don't mind, Member Paltin, you know, after your...during your discussion, could you give us the net change in dollars? I mean, if you have it.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. It's --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thanks.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- for this item, it's \$5,280, I believe, is the net change.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. That we're saving?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Adding.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We're spending.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, we're spending. Oh, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And sorry, it was actually nine Firefighter IIs back to Firefighter Is. So, nine Firefighter IIs are going to Firefighter Is, and three Firefighter Is are going to Firefighter IIIs.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Any more questions? Seeing none, okay, let's vote. All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aye. Okay, I think Member Cook is still not here. Okay, eight "ayes," one excused, Member Cook.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember Cook.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Again, that was one of the things that was on the request from Fire. All right, anything else?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm done.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You're done? Okay. So...okay. So, what I passed out to everyone is to look at the total number of vacancies and expansion positions from the Department, and...with a 10 percent cut, 30 percent...25 percent cut, 50 percent cut, with 25 being transferred to Countywide. And so, the impact is, if it...if it's the total number of vacancies, it is listed on the bottom. Admin has 45,216; Training Program, none; Fire Rescue Operations Program, \$270,061; Fire Prevention Program is 107,000; Safe...Ocean Safety program is 451,000. That's the vacancies. Expansions are \$80,440, 205 for Training; Fire Rescue Operations Program is 1.1 million; Fire Prevention Program is 273; and the last column has a total. So this question to you is, would you like to do a cut based on these numbers, either 10 percent, 25 percent cut of the vacant and expansion positions, or a 50 percent cut, with 25 being transferred to Countywide, which means if they do fund some of the positions that we're cutting, that there will be funds in the Countywide for them to reach out to and use it...versus going position by position. Yes, Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just a question, Chair. So, this is up to the...to the departments to decide what to cut under each of these categories?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, yeah, actually they can. Yeah. But it's just looking at their total number of vacancies and expansion positions. So, this is the list that I've been passing out for the departments. I'm going to do this for every department.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

As we were listening to you and going through each department, we could hear, you know, these questions coming out. So, we decided to look at it cumulatively. And looking at what Member U'u-Hodgins did last budget, which was agreeable to this Council and agreeable to the...to the departments. The difference is this, is if we do a 50 percent cut of vacant and expansion positions in that category, 25 percent would be sent...25 percent would be given to Countywide. So that if they were to fill a position, Member Sinenci, your question, they could go to the Countywide and pull funds from that to fill a position that, you know, is right now vacant. And...and as you know, because of the challenges of filling positions, there's all these, you know, vacant positions out there that everybody wishes it could happen. Of course, Fire is very special. Their vacancy is so low, but...and we all value the work that they do, but just discussion. Members?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. So, when you did these calculations on this spreadsheet, you...I see that they provided us their vacancy list.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Um-hum.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: But...so, there's a recruit class out for Ocean Safety Officers, and then the promotion pending, effective, I guess last week, you took those into consideration when you did this? Because Fire promotes within, so their...their ability to get more firemen is super quick, usually, for Firefighters III because they usually go from a Fire I to a Fire III, unless Fire II is HazMat. So, it's quite quick. You took that into consideration when doing your --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we looked at the...the data that they provided us.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we didn't look at how they operate.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Oh.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Well, it says on their...on their paper, that's why. Effective 4/16, promotion pending 4/16, recruit class begins 4/1, and that's for Ocean Safety, pending recruitment via DPS is probably going to take a little while for Firefighter II, but unless they're creating a new language, typically Fire II is HazMat, which they already have, so maybe they're having a different description.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: But I was just...I was just wondering because like I said, they fill their...they fill their people kind of quick.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, thank you. Yes? Yeah, we took it into account. We took into account. Okay. We took into account what they shared with us. So, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, my concern is automatically, after cutting somebody, the excess would go to Countywide. Because I think it's too soon to...to put any extras in Countywide, simply because we need to go through the entire budget and make sure each Councilmember is taken care of...because things have changed, and maybe additional money is needed to put somebody's priority. So, if we can keep that money on the side until the very end?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And then whatever is extra, then we put in Countywide. Okay?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, this formula that you're looking at that we developed, it only takes...if you look at the three different categories, it is for 50 percent only. So, if we were to say...if you all decided it would be a 50 percent cut based upon the vacancies and expansion positions that they expressed, and taking into consideration, as the Staff did, of what they...what they shared with us in their letters of what's coming up as far as filling the vacancies was taken into consideration. But only for the 50 percent cut are we going to leave money, then move money, 25 percent, actually, into Countywide. So, you know, Chair Lee, it's not going to happen unless if we all decide to do that formula basically, and we are not doing Countywide. We're not going to look at it until Friday, the impact of Countywide.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, that's the reason why I was hoping we would have a running total of excess, so we know how much money we have, or how much money we need to find. But if we keep putting stuff into Countywide now, then we won't have a running total is my concern.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: That's all.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. I...I...I'm not supportive of reducing any of the emergency services, so I won't be supportive of reducing salaries for Fire...or for Police, if there's a future proposal for that. And then, Chair, are you also putting yourself on a timer? Because after everyone speaks, you also speak. And --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- so that's not really a fair process.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we are. Thirty seconds. I mean, presentation is a minute.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: After every Councilmember speaks, you speak?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, I'm answering the question. Okay, does anybody else have a question?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, it didn't sound like Chair Lee had a question. She just made a comment, and then you started speaking after her.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I took it as a question. Anybody else have any questions regarding this? No? Okay. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: You know, I...I read the newspaper, and everybody's saying that these folks were the heroes. And Police and Fire have...have been the heroes in...in this post, you know, during the fire and everything. So, I just can't see us cutting the folks who...the departments that are performed so well. I understand some departments are...you know, they're in over their head, they're...they...they can't do the jobs at hand. I understand some of those cuts.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: But for these guys, I...I...I can't see it, so --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you, Member Johnson. All right. So, Members, I'm seeing that nobody's going to propose...or support this 10 percent, 25 percent, or 50 percent proposal, so we'll move on. Okay. Also, for...okay. So, CIP Bill, go to page 24. Anybody have any CIP changes? Sorry. Okay. So, Fire on page...the

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

top of page 24, there's your Ha'ikū Fire Station, Countywide, which is a Government facilities and...anybody have any proposals for that? For CIP? Okay, seeing none. And I think the facilities that they're talking about is talking about a need. So, in my CIP presentation, it just shows in case we wanted to cut 5 percent, 10 percent, 15 or 20, so we're not going to do that. Next. Do we have anybody for Appendix A on page 43? Special Revenues. Seeing none. Okay, we're going to move forward. Plan Review Processing. I think this is the one that puts in the four vehicles. So, look at page 44 on the Revolving Fund, and this is where Chief asked us to put his four vehicles in, which Tamara Paltin already did it, so this is done...right, Members? Okay. And the Fireworks Revolving Fund, which is on page 48, any changes to that? Page 48, Fireworks. It is letter R. No changes? It has \$128,500. No changes? Thank you. Departmental Requests, Granicus 137, page 1. Okay. So, this one, what they're talking about is something that we already took into consideration, which is the miscalculation, or the mistake of the overhead reimbursement. So, we discussed that the day we opened talking about our budget. So, we did that. Additional rent for One Main Plaza for office of...I'm sorry, wrong...Fire...that's...that's Finance. What did you say? Yeah, we did that. We did the Fire positions and...Budget Details moved. Anything else from that April 12th letter, Members? Okay. Seeing none. Okay. So, we're done with that. Anybody had priorities for Fire? My priority for Fire was already done by what Member Paltin did with her motion, and you approved with the four vehicles from the Revolving Fund. Sorry, got to find Fire on this matrix. Anybody? Okay...okay. All right. So, we are done with Fire. Any...do we have a consensus? Yeah? Okay?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Very good. Done.

DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Department of Housing. Look in your Bill 60 and page 8. Any amendments? (*silence*) Okay. When we get there, we have conditions from Gabe Johnson for Housing. Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair, when you say any amendments, you mean --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any changes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- from the Department?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, from you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: From the Department first?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: From the Members. From the Members.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we're doing Member's first, and then anybody...and then we're doing...we'll go down the Budget Bill, as we have yesterday, and the last thing we're doing is the April 12th letter from Administration to add anything that was forgotten. And then last is going to be your priorities. So, that's the order that we're going...we're doing today. Okay. So, any changes for Housing? Seeing none. Okay. Member Paltin, you have no changes? All right. For CIPs, this Department doesn't have any CIPs. Appendix A, Grants, Bill 38, does any...I'm sorry, page 38 in the Bill. Does anybody have any changes? Housing? Okay. So, I guess we're going to talk about Special Revenue, and we'll probably have some discussions there. So, go into Special Purpose Revenues, and this is where the Affordable Housing Fund is. Homeowner Program is on page 49, Affordable Housing on page 46, and also in there, of Chair Lee's interest, it would be 'Ohana Assistance Program, First-Time Homebuyers, also page 49. So, this is Special Revenues. Anybody have any amendments? Member Paltin. Page 46.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to delete, on page 46, number...under Category L.(2), (3), (4), and (5).

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, you said (2)? That's Kuikahi Village?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yep. (2), (3), (4), and (5).

CHAIR SUGIMURA: (3) is Catholic Charities, Hale Pilina, and (4) is Aikanaha, which is the 7 million. And did you say (5) also?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Aikanaha. So, those are (2), (3), (4), and (5). Member Paltin, we need a second. Anybody --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Pau.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- second?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Maybe you should take it separately?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You want to take it separately?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Just saying.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well...it might be better for her.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to delete (3), (4), and (5).

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just for...second for discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, motion made by Member Paltin, second by Member Sinenci. Any discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: These were appropriated in Fiscal Year '24.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member...Ms. Milner has a comment. Anybody else have any comments regarding this? Ms. Milner has a comment. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Number (2), Kuikahi Village Workforce Housing Project, we actually deleted that from the FY '24 budget, with the understanding it would be in the FY '25 budget.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's not a part of this motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah --

MS. MILNER: Oh, I'm sorry, I thought you said (2), (3), (4), and (5).

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're splitting it.

MS. MILNER: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So --

MS. MILNER: Okay, apologies.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do you have any comments regarding (3), (4), and (5)? Aikanaha or Hale Pilina?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Department of Housing and Human Concerns, those should be encumbered by the end of Fiscal Year '24. So, there are no concerns with removing those. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Very good. Very good. Okay. Any other comments, Members?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Lesley, you talk so fast. Did you say all three are going to be funded in the current budget?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Chair Lee. Yes. Both Hale Pilina and both phases of Aikanaha, they anticipate having encumbered by the end of Fiscal Year '24. So, there are no concerns with removing them from the Fiscal Year '25 budget.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And Kuikahi? What did you say about Kuikahi?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, we...that's not part of the motion. We split it off.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we're just only talking about --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Well, then, I second the motion. I second the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Member Sinenci already seconded it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Sinenci seconded it. Okay. So, Members --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. Sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else have any comments or concerns, discussion? Seeing none, let's vote. All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, is this is a...okay. So, it looks like eight "ayes," one excused, Member Cook.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **Councilmember Cook.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to delete number (2).

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Number (2) is Kuikahi Village Workforce Housing for 6 million. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second. Okay. Member Paltin, please?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I know this hasn't been encumbered in the Fiscal Year '24, but we have projects shovel-ready in West Maui that can take the entirety of the Affordable Housing funds. We spent all this money last year for housing in Central Maui when we have 12,000 people displaced in West Maui that want to live in West Maui. This project came to us as a for-sale project. We amended the CIZ, CPA, all the things. Then they brought in another developer, which told us that it's not possible to build affordable housing in this...for sale in this market with these interest rates, then told us to take the money from the Haggai Institute to fund this project. Then, when the Haggai Institute went through, the developer left this project...and all of a sudden, now it's possible. It's not as shovel-ready as our Lahaina projects, where the true need is. And so, I'd like to dedicate all the rest of the Affordable Housing Funds for projects in West Maui.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? Ms. Milner, did you have something? You were...you were talking about Kuikahi Village, but it's now on the floor for discussion.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yes, we were just saying that this was deleted from the Fiscal Year '24 budget, with the understanding that it would be placed into the Fiscal Year '25 budget. The developer does feel they can move forward with this project, but obviously, it is the body's discretion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you very much. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'd like to ask Ms. Milner, how much is available when Member Paltin says the rest to be used for West Maui. What would the rest be? What amount are we talking about, exactly?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. The removal of the three projects already has freed up \$24 million. So, I believe the balance...I need to do the full calculation, but . . .(timer sounds). . . is approximately 40 million.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: 40 million?

MS. MILNER: Yes, 40 million available, with...that's before this vote.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Chair?

MS. MILNER: But I'll do that calculation too.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Can we get clarification on that number? Our understanding was that because they were expended in FY '24, or will be, that would come off the total.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It'll come off of the estimated balance as of 6/30/2024, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Ms. Milner, did you hear?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

MS. MILNER: Yes. So, these projects were already taken into account when we provided the updated estimated balance of approximately 700,000 for this fund. So, that would leave approximately 47 million. And then taking into account the two projects...or the two line items of 6 million and 70,000, respectively, and the 1.5 million for the Lahaina Community Land Trust, that would leave approximately 40 million. As I said, I can get you an exact number in just a moment.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Wait, wait. Well, who attached 5 million for the Community Land Trust?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 1.5.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 1.5.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, 1.5.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's in the...yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I see. And then...I can support this.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, the...the motion on the floor is only about the Kuikahi Village Workforce Housing project to be deleted from this Fiscal Year '25. Any other discussion, Members? Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. I...I would agree with this, if we don't abandon this project this year, or--so, maybe in FY 2026 is what I mean--is that as we...as time goes on, we should revisit this and look at it. I think it was a...a...worthwhile project, but right now, our needs are in West Maui. So, I understand the need, but I also think that the work was done on Kuikahi shouldn't be abandoned, and maybe in FY 2026 when the skies are brighter, we can help . . .(timer sounds). . . those folks. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other comments? Seeing none. Oh, Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I don't disagree with Member Johnson. If Pā'ia Town or Makawao Town ever lit ablaze--which right now is a very real possibility for Pā'ia--and we don't have affordable housing projects, I would love to see this Council prioritize them too. So, I don't disagree with Member Johnson that the work has been done, so I hope we don't abandon it. Because we will need more rentals everywhere, but we've...we've allocated a lot of money to Central Maui, and Lahaina does need some funding right now. So, I can support this too.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member Sinenci, you looked up. Did you want to say something?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Supportive, Chair.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

budget ordinance. Conditional language was not included, so no...no amendment.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Did you want me to make the motion for the \$780?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I move in small a.(1), Category B, to increase by \$780, subject-object code 924002B-6120, page 10-7, for a 5 percent electricity increase.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right, motion made by Member Paltin, second by Member Kama. All in favor, raise your...any discussion? All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye."
Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez. Is it a roll call vote?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: She said "aye."

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I heard that. Eight "ayes," one excused, Member Cook.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **Councilmember Cook.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anything else? No? Okay. Now, then, we'll go to Members Priorities, pages 11 --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Can we take a morning break before we get into that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sure. Sorry. I didn't realize the time. We'll come back at 11:00. Thanks. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 10:44 a.m.

RECONVENE: 11:13 a.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It is now 11:13. Oh, hi, Tom Cook. Nice to see you, Member Cook. And...okay. So, there's Member Sinenci in the Chambers, Member U'u-Hodgins, Member Johnson, Member Paltin, Member Kama, and Member Cook. So, we have quorum to continue. So Housing, Members' Priorities. Shall we take up on page 11 in order, which is Member Johnson? So, what we...where we ended with Housing...Affordable Housing Fund, was that we deleted the Kuikahi Village, we deleted Hale Pilina, Aikanaha, all of that, from the Affordable Housing Fund, and that was a Member Paltin motion, and agreed by the...by the Members. Any other deletions? Okay. Member Johnson, you want one of the spreadsheets? I have an extra one. You have?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

Members' Priorities

DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. So, this is to add a new line item entitled Housing Policy Implementation in the amount of \$2 million, add the following condition: funds must be used for grants or professional services to implement Ordinance 5315 and Ordinance 5441. That is also known as Bill 111, the Residential Workforce Housing Policy Selection Priority. And then Bill 107, which is the Affordable Housing Sales Price Guidelines. If you...if some Members recall, we...we had...we wrote bills, and it passed, that gives a residential preference, and this...and this money is going to help the Department create a portal, a website, that, you know, you...you're interested in affordable housing, you click on it, and as you're waiting to get into affordable housing, we have the nonprofits reach out to you and get you house-ready, get you financially literate, get you...get all your ducks in a row, so when it comes time . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . to purchase, then you're ready.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second for discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second for discussion. So, motion made by Member Johnson, second by Member Sinenci, and you discussed. Anything else Member...Members want to say? Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, I remember having this discussion with the Department when they were here. And what they said is that there wasn't enough money, right? That when they put it out, it wasn't enough.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And I can't remember how much was put out the first time around, right? And then that's what they told us. But...and you're putting in 2 million --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- to ensure that there is enough, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's correct.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else have any questions? Seeing none. I do. So, how would this 2 million...it's developing the portal, and then if anybody signs

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

up...explain again? Because I thought that the Department presented to us, of course, before budget, and they showed us the portals that they found. I think it was Linda Munsell?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right? And that the Department was working on it. So, they didn't...they didn't do it?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, during that time--I'm glad you brought that up, Committee Chair Sugimura--we took \$2 million out of their budget at that budget time, and that's why the reason they said we...we couldn't do it because we, the Council, cut it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...so what is your bill [sic] trying to do then?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, we're putting that money back in, so that they can create the portal, so that people will be able to sign up for this list, so that when housing units become available, you're...you're on the list. And you're...while you're waiting for the housing to become available, we'll...they'll...all the nonprofits will be reaching out to you--because we'll have your information, right?--and then, they'll be getting those people who are on the list ready to be house-ready when...when the house comes up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Because quite often we see this, right? You...you want to get affordable housing, and a project comes up, and then oh, you're not ready. And then, we bypass people who aren't...don't have their ducks in a row for being a house buyer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, I'm just thinking about, you know, the...the bifurcation, right, of the Department. So...and I can't remember what positions we were asking for in that...in that new Housing Division, right. And then...so, this particular portal, whoever would be responsible to...to go look for it, would also have to be akamai on IT because it's...because that's what they're going to need . . . (timer sounds). . . to be able to understand how to do the portal, right, and how to...how to use it. And if they...we don't have anybody to...to...to learn how to do it, or to teach others, then...then it's like having a piece of equipment that you don't know how to use.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, the...can I respond, Chair?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: The funds must be used for a grant or professional services to implement it. So, we're going to contract that out. So, that's way...they'll...they'll, you know, with that contract and professional services, they'll be able to handle it, and the folks in the Housing Division will be...they'll...they'll talk their language, as they say. We'll...they'll...they'll meet them at...where they're at. They're not asking them to manage servers and stuff, you know, like that's IT stuff. But for administrating the program, they'll have a portal. And in fact, San Francisco has a really good administrating program for this portal. That's where a lot of the model comes from. And that was from Linda Munsell's presentation at that time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: One last --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So...oh, I'm sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead, go ahead.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So...so the...the Department, the Housing Department would...would have to contract this out to companies that actually do this type of work, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, that's correct.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay, I get that. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Member Johnson. I was wondering if you had followed up with Mr. Nishita when he had said that the cost came in over bid, what the actual cost was?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I don't know the actual cost. The number, \$2 million, is from the original proposal from the DHHC last year. So, I assume that that's the number where that came from...I mean, that's where the number came from. So, has it changed? Not to my knowledge.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Would it be possible to follow up with . . .(timer sounds). . . Mr. Nishita what the bid was actually?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Sure. Would you...how would you like to do it? You want to table it at the end of the day, or come back to this?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you know what we can do? Because I have questions also, like on the cost, right?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Um-hum.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, let's put this on the side, and we can do a revisit.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And maybe you can reach out to...is it...is it Managing Director, or from the Housing Department? Also...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We put the 300,000 in the Managing Director's money. He had people go into it, and then when it came in over bid, they just, I guess, dealt with the fire instead, instead of coming in for a budget amendment. Or we could have had that already --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: In real numbers.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- in this budget --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- session.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean, last...this fiscal year.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Johnson, right? We'll do that.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Because of the questions.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's fine.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You go check with the Department?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Sure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I also have another question, Chair.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry. Go ahead. You have a question?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: James, did you --

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, Chair. If...if the intent is to revisit this item, perhaps the body could consider withdrawing the motion at this time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: All right. I'll withdraw my motion, and --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- Councilmember Sinenci --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- was our second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, thank you. Thank you for that. Okay. So that's a revisit. Next, I have...well, there's just one Housing. Anything else for Housing, for conditions? There's none. Okay. This completes the Department. Member --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: There's all the Revolving Fund stuff.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Paltin. Oh, I thought we did the Revolving Funds already.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We only did cuts, not Member Priorities.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. *(pause)* What page is it?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Page 41 on the matrix.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Forty-one. Okay. Getting there.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: The last two. Below Open Space.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Special Purpose. Okay. Appendix A --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I have a question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead, Chair Lee.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You said we're on Housing, but is it really Housing, or Housing and Human Concerns?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, only Housing.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Housing.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're only Housing. We'll take --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Only Housing, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, but now we're going to move --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Human Concerns later.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Revolving Funds, which is...look on your Priorities list on page 40 and 41 in anything regarding Housing. Okay. Who has one? Is it...is it Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. Because I have two...two priorities in the Affordable Housing Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Up to \$6 million must be for a grant to Homestead Community Development Corporation, HCDC, for the Permanently Affordable Rental Unit Strategy, or PARUS. And that is the...the gal that came to talk to us about purchasing homes on the open market and getting matching finances...financing to be able to purchase it outright on the market, and then turning it into rental...affordable rentals at, I think, they said 80 percent and below.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, I'm wanting her to buy more properties that go on the market, so that we can take them and turn them into low-income rentals.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is there a second? Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I have a...no, I have a question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Is there a...is there a second for this? No. Okay. You have a question for Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I have a...I thought we used the Affordable Housing Fund for all of Lahaina projects.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, we haven't gotten there, but...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I didn't --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We haven't...we haven't got to there?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Not all --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, I thought --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Not that phrase. Okay. So --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We just verbalized the intent.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: The intent.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, I see.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- there's no...there's no second for this? Maybe another time, I guess?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I guess so, if I don't get a second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I see Tom Cook with his hand up.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'll second --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- for discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Second for discussion. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to amend the motion to have all of the PARUS strategy-acquired homes in West Maui.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is there a second?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Moved...the amendment is from Member Paltin, second by Member Sinenci. Okay. To add West Maui --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Only.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- only.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Discussion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yeah. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I watched the presentation. It...it was a pretty good presentation. We desperately need housing in West Maui. So, if they can do this, what they showed that they did, and do it in West Maui for...oh, if I can friendly amendment that for specifically those displaced by the wildfire. So, to acquire homes for your Permanent Affordable Rental Unit Strategy in West Maui for those displaced . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . by the wildfire.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I think that's a great idea. I think it's a great amendment. And if this does pass, then we can actually have that conversation with Robin, and then, she can go ahead and do some searching on that end. So, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Was this for rentals after the acquisition, or actually selling it?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It would be for permanently affordable rentals in the 80 percent --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And below.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- and below category. So, not low-income. I mean, it could include low-income because low-income is 60 percent and below.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Any other discussion, Members? Seeing none. Okay. All in...all in favor, raise your hand, say "aye." Aye. Okay. This looks like we're...we're back at...Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, nine "ayes," motion carries.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE amendment to main motion

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next is Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Main motion as amended.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, main motion as amended. Main motion as amended. Okay. Main motion as...nine "ayes." Member Rawlins-Fernandez...aye? Main motion as amended?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion carries, nine...nine "ayes."

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE main motion as amended

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next, Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, again, from the Affordable Housing Fund, up to 18 million for the Ho‘onani Project for the provision of at least 800 workforce residential housing units. This project is a new project coming up. It is 165 acres behind the Lowe [sic] and Target area in Kahului. And basically, they just need the money to start to build wells...drill wells.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Drill wells?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: How much?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: 18 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Did you say drill wells?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: They’re finding water? They’re not building houses?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: They are, but 800 units is what they’re...is what they’re looking at. But the first 18 million is for wells.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Uh...so, is this supposed to be in the Water, or --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Well --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, can I --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Well, Pro Tem Kama, would you consider trying to get that money from GET instead?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I don't have a problem with it, but is our Council okay with that? I mean --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait, this is Housing though. With...looking for water.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, but we're talking infrastructure. Water, infrastructure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I mean, we...there's...obviously the Affordable Housing Fund cannot fund all of these projects. So, let's start thinking of how, if...if you really want a project, let's think of how we can find other sources, right, of funding?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right. I agree. I agree. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That's your thought. I...okay, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Um...Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: They...they don't have County water?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I think...I think the idea was, you might...according to--oh, sorry, okay, here I am--that they would...wanted to develop seven wells, along with the treatments, and storage, and transmission, and then to integrate into the County system. And the goal was to have access...excess...excess capacity to be used . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . for the County's three acres that is right next door.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. This is not about Housing, then. This is about wells.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Well...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It says in Housing, but...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Well --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- in Housing, but...oh, sorry, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- I...I...I would...I would advocate--if I may, Chair? I would advocate to have this within the Water Department and Infrastructure, and not in the Affordable Housing Fund. I think that the Department of Water Supply is very aggressive in...in wanting to develop wells, and could work with the...possibly work with the developer. But I'm also concerned that the Affordable Housing Fund is going to be overly taxed if we placed this in there, is my comment.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Good.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anybody else have any questions for Member Kama? So, I...I'm...my question is, who are the developers, and...and where is --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Howie Kihune.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Huh?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Howie Kihune.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, this is their big project they...they just did a presentation to us?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ah, yeah. Are they ready? Oh, go ahead.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That was Member Sinenci's question.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No. This is beginning. I mean, what they shared with us was like their dream, their vision. But now, coming down to this is what...the first steps.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, they're looking for water, right? They're not looking for 800 workforce residential...residential housing?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Well, if they get the water, then they can build the houses, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, I'm not...I mean, to me, it sounded like a housing development.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: But if the idea is to...what Member Cook said, to go to the Water Department and have them work together, or collaborate on that, and then what Member...Chair Lee said was to look at GET, we could do that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I mean, I'm not averse to that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Would they own the wells, or would we own the wells?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I think -- I don't know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- we don't have an answer. You know what?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I'm not sure. But I can ask.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, I...there is a motion on the floor, so we can take the vote. There is no motion? Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No, there's no motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, there's no motion. We didn't get a second. Okay. *(Audio interference)* All right. So --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Revisit? Revisit?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: We can revisit.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, we can revisit. Okay. Letter R, revisit. I think that's --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And that's it for me, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. 18 million is a lot of money for an idea yet, but sounds like Water is probably right. Next, we have Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I don't have anything.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you don't have anything here? Or my pages are not --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Go to Number 43...page 43.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, Tamara next. Okay. Okay, so you did that, right?
. . .(inaudible). . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, I just deleted the 6 million for Kuikahi.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: With this one, I would move...well, I guess because Member Kama did the PARUS for 6 million, I would...I would decrease this to 3 million, maybe, for the first year, to create affordable housing projects within the Lahaina wildfire disaster area. When members of the community...the way it would work would be, this money would be available as gap financing direct to homeowners looking to rebuild in exchange for a 60-year affordable deed restriction. When members of the community heard that we may be helping out Kupuohi, they wanted the same kind of relief. And, you know, Kupuohi is a low-income housing project that's going to be affordable for 60 years. The intent is not to have homeowners be able to rebuild and then flip and sell the house, it's basically to give them the same kind of assistance that we possibly might give Kupuohi, with the same kind of restriction, which is a 60-year deed restriction on Kupuohi, 60-year deed restriction for gap financing. A lot of our community members are just learning now about the fees for permitting, whether it's temporary or permanent. And, you know, they're also going to have to close-caption TV their own water, sewer lines from the meter to their house. And . . .(timer sounds). . . all of these expenses are adding up. And nobody's insurance, if they had insurance is...everybody is in the same boat as Kupuohi, severely underinsured. So, it would be --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- 3 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 3 million. So, you're going to decrease Kuikahi Village, which you already did already, but it's a \$6 million project?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm taking into effect [sic] that we need choke affordable housing funds, and we already put 6 million into that permanent affordable rental unit strategy. \$3 million for gap funding in exchange for either they wouldn't sell for 60 years, or they'd sell for an affordable price.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this motion is for insert up to now it's 3 million, must be used for affordable housing projects within the Lahaina wildfire disaster area. And number one under that is gap financing direct to rebuild in exchange for 60-year affordable deed restriction.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. And it's for the owner-occupant units, not investment units, second homes, or short-term rentals. Just owner-occupied, planning to rebuild, planning to stay within our community for 60-years, or sell it for an affordable price --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- if they choose to sell.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, by this, which you originally deleted 6 million from Kuikahi, right, so that's basically done. But this, you're saying that what we're doing is insert...or...is 3 million period--because we already have the 6 million affordable housing--but 3 million must be in affordable housing, blah, blah, blah, right?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. Fund direct to those owner-occupants who are rebuilding their homes, and need some gap financing between what their insurance will cover, and what they need to actually rebuild --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- in exchange for a deed restriction.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members...Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. So, Member Paltin, they would apply with the Department of Housing, and because it's affordable, I'm just asking, they would have to, like, share their AMI where they are. And would that determine how much gap financing they would have? Or how would people qualify for "X" amount of financing?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Good question. Um...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: While you're thinking about that, can I ask something?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think maybe we would cap it at maybe 2 or 300,000 per applicant.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Go ahead. I mean --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. No, because I'm thinking you might...what you're proposing might fall into the category I fell into last...last time around, which was, we're trying to create the 'Ohana Assistance Program, which I thought was very...fairly simple, and we could just attach it to the Revolving Fund. But according to Corp. Counsel, I couldn't do that. I would have to create that program, I would have to create an ordinance. So, before you go too far, maybe that's what . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . we need to do in order to achieve what you're trying to do, okay?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is Ms. Toshikiyo on? We can ask. Can we ask Ms. Toshikiyo?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Ms. Toshikiyo?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is this a similar thing as Chair Lee's one from last year?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Thank you. I think the issue last year is that it was an appropriation from a fund where the use didn't currently exist. In this scenario, I'm looking at Chapter 3.35 right now, and it does look like if you're...it would be an appropriate use of the Affordable Housing Fund to increase the supply of affordable rental and owner-occupied. So, I think that's the difference, is that the fund that the 'Ohana Assistance Program eventually evolved to didn't exist before Chair Lee amended the Code to create the program.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh. So, we're okay then, for this...what I proposed?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Well, it . . .*(audio interference)*. . . it does meet the use of the fund, but it does sound like there are questions as to the details of the program and how you would like it to be administered. And, you know, one thing is to condition the fund in this appropriation with those limitations. The other option is, I suppose, granting the fund to an organization that would manage it, and they would come up with the proposals. I also see Director Milner just popped up, she might have more to add.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: But I did want to ask one thing. Because one of the appropriate uses of the funds does have the restrictions for residents whose income is between very low-income and gap income, so just to make sure that the intention is that the recipients of this fund would also fall between, you know, those...within those categories.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. If that's the restriction, I'll abide by it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, Ms. Milner.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Lesley?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Just...the Department will most likely need to RFP this to someone to manage it. So, another option, rather than conditioning the Affordable Housing Fund, would be to put funds under the Housing...the Department of Housing in Professional Services to...or Professional Services or County Grant Funds to solicit a company or an organization to administer these funds. So, include enough for that contract, as well as the grants to the individuals. I think that could all be under B as well, as an alternative way of putting this into the budget.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And not the Revolving Fund, you're saying, correct?

MS. MILNER: Yes, Chair. Yeah, that would be another...moving it from the Revolving Fund into just under the Department of Housing B account --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MILNER: -- as an alternative option.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Good to see the affordable housing money. So, Ms. Toshikiyo, then you're basically saying that the project needs to be...oh, she left. Ms. Toshikiyo left. So, the --

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I'm sorry. Yeah, sorry, there's a delay when I click the button to mute and unmute.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, basically you're saying that just as what Chair Lee ran into, that this project needs to be thought through, and then RFP'd out?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Oh, no, no. I'm sorry if I wasn't clear. It's very different scenarios because for the 'Ohana Assistance Fund, it was very specific...they had very specific uses under Chapter 3.34, and the use of the fund that Chair Lee . . . (timer sounds). . . was proposing didn't exist at the time. So, by amending the Code, it became an allowable use. Under this scenario, under the very broad use category of to increase the supply of affordable rental and owner-occupied housing, it is currently a use of the fund. But we would need to have kind of the details of the program, like...so for instance, if Member Paltin has very specific requirements, we would need to have that in the budget so that when the Department is working on the grant agreements and with the grantees that, you know, all of those requirements are met. But under the broad use, it's an appropriate use of the fund, it's just making sure that the Department meets...you know, follows the intentions of what Member Paltin is trying to achieve.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: And that might need to be fleshed out a little bit more.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Paltin, I'm going to ask this question regarding that because...because basically it's revenue neutral-ish, because it's 6 million --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Three.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- I mean three...well, we...we got rid of, or deleted the 6 million from Affordable Housing Fund, of which 3 million would...she wants to use it from the Affordable Housing Fund to develop this program, but Corp. Counsel says...or Ms. Milner says probably better in the...the Professional Services. So, how do we do all that?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: I guess our question would be whether you would leave the \$3 million condition in the Affordable Housing Fund, and then set up that program additionally in Professional Services under Housing Program, or if your intent is to move the entire item, which then, you know, would be a larger add.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If it's possible, I guess I would move to increase Professional Services by 3 million to create this program, to give assistance direct to owner-occupants in the burn-zone to meet their gap financing up to \$300,000 per household, with a deed restriction of 60 years.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is that...good, Ms. Apo Takayama? Okay. All right. Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just for clarification. And then, the other 3 million would be for the PARUS?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, we already --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We did that already.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- approved PARUS for 6 million.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: For six?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, right now then, what this does is the Affordable Housing Fund has an extra 3 million in it for...that 3 million still stays in the...right? Is...or is it the whole six?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: The six was already removed when you removed Kuikahi, but...so there's just an additional six, you know, sitting there that can be conditioned. But there's not additional money, so it just freed up conditioned money.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Yeah, not taking into account any other priority proposals that did, or may, pass.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Okay. Yeah. . . .*(laughing)*. . . So, that's what we're supposed to be doing, right, with budget? You add, you cut. Very good. Okay, Members, any questions? Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, are you saying that the body would consider additional proposals at this point?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No. Is that what we just did? So, I'm trying not to do that. I really am trying not to do that because everybody had a...had rules that we followed and...to be consistent. Because I already got asked that by three Members, and I said no. . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, I'm assuming all proposals that have been discussed were submitted prior to today?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Prior...prior to...I mean, when the deadline, whenever that deadline was --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, the 17th.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- a week or two ago.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah? Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. What do we do with this? It's kind of a good one, but I guess we can't consider it then?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Then, I would --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Do it...do --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- change it to Affordable Housing Fund.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, doesn't the body decide? I mean, can't we all come together? I mean, if it's common sense?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: But you know what --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I know it's bullfrogs in a barrel, it's hard to keep everybody on pace, I understand it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And it's kind of like what was fair, right? You all submitted by the 17th, and that was the deadline, and that...oh, okay. We don't have to talk about it. You want it from the Affordable Housing Fund?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'll take it from the Affordable Housing Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay, Members. So, this will be the 3 million from--as she proposed--from the Affordable Housing Fund. Yeah, okay.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Insert up to 3 million, must be --

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Can we just clarify whether the seconder is amenable to that...that change? Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Go ahead, Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. This question is for Corp. Counsel. So, can we use some of the money in the Affordable Housing Fund to do an RFP if they...the Housing Department can't facilitate this grant right now? Is that an allowable use?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ms. Toshikiyo?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Because originally...to go with what you said, Chair, originally, she added up to six. So, her changing it to three is still changing it, and it's less than. So, if we were going with her original amount, we could still

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

say 6, and then she could use some of that delta between three and six for RFP funds. Or she could do something like 3,500,000 . . .(timer sounds). . . or whatever to accommodate an RFP. But is that an allowable use?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes. Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Thank you for the question. It would be an allowable use because you're not also designating who is going to be receiving the funding, so they can RFP it out. If it were a grant, then they could make it, you know, a competitive grant. But the condition is that that's going to be what is the use of the...that pot of money.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you. Only because...so, if you do a max of 300,000, that's ten grantees, and you would need some money for Professional...well, to...for the cost of the RFP. So, you might want to accommodate that in your...in your price structure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have one more question for Ms. Toshikiyo, if can?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If I don't...if I just put the 3 million in the Affordable Housing Fund, and I were to check with the Lahaina-based entity--Lahaina Community Land Trust, or maybe Nā Hale 'O Maui, or something--if they would be willing to run the program, would that be okay? Like Lahaina Community Land Trust, I know they're bringing in other side donation, and maybe they wouldn't charge anything to facilitate the program if...if they could help some...some families. But I haven't checked with them or anything, but would that be a possibility if we just put, like, 3.5 mil in there, and up to 500,000 could be for facilitation? Or if it's not used for facilitation, then it can be thrown in as another grant to another family. Would that be a possibility?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo. . . (timer sounds). . .

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes. If you're going to put in the conditional language that, you know, up to a certain amount can be used for the administrative costs for the program, that would be fine.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I...I'd like to amend and add 500,000...up to 500,000 for administrative costs, and, you know, a Maui-based entity can apply

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

to run the program, whether it's Nā Hale, or Lahaina Community Land Trust, or whomever.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Second...motion made by Member Paltin, second by Member Kama. Is that...oh, here's Ms. Milner.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, and...and just to clarify, that'll be 3.5. From six, to three, to 3.5.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ms. Milner has a thought.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, I just wanted to chime in briefly. So, right now, no entity is named, so the Department would go out to RFP to find someone to do it. If someone would be willing to do it for free, and you wanted to name them in the ordinance, that is also an option, but I know you have to have some conversations before that can happen. But just wanted to clarify that at this time, because there's no named entity, it would need to go out for the procurement process. Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Maybe we can...I can make some calls, and we can revisit it when we revisit Member Johnson's one later on today?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, a question to you before we vote is, why don't you take the whole 6 million? Is there a big need for this?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: There's a big need. There's 570 owner-occupied units, and all of them...at least majority of them have a big gap. I...I know that not every single homeowner-occupied wants to return because of how they got out, but a lot of them do want to return. The cafeteria this past Saturday at Lahainaluna High School was packed, every table full of people that you couldn't hear conversations. All of these people wanted to go home. They wanted...they thought they were going to get help with their permitting instead of asked their opinions, but there's also need for like the big projects, you know, like Kupuohi, Pulelehua, whatever kind of big projects they have, so...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So that's your answer, three --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's my answer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- 3.5. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. So, for Member Paltin, this is obviously going to be in Fiscal '25. It takes a long time for a building permit, it takes a long

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

time to get construction materials. I think this would probably be good to also have a similar amount of money in next year's budget because it's going to take a while for people to rebuild.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It...it would be kind of like a pilot --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- I guess, this year.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah. And again, permits do take a long time, even if they're expedited. And then the construction of will take a long time. And the construction of the house, as well as the infrastructure, will take a little while. So, I understand her point in having some . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . .*(inaudible)*. . . and then going from there.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more discussion? Seeing none. Okay. This is going to be Affordable Housing Fund, 3.5 million, as owner...owner-occupied is...with the exchange for --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I don't have --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- a 60-year affordable deed...60...60-year affordable deed restriction, and the 500,000 is for administrative fees. And 30,000...I'm sorry, 300,000 per authorized applicant?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, all of those would be up to's...up to 500,000 for administrative fees, up to 300,000 --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- per household.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: We...are we revisiting this as well?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. Oh, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I wanted to be able to ask around if anyone would be --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- willing to implement this. Then we can name them when we vote.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And can we...even if...if it's...we have to RFP it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If it's named --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- then we don't have to. If it's not named, she said then we have to RFP --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. So, we'll revisit this then, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Uh-huh.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I think it'll be faster that way, yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, withdraw the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'll withdraw the motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And is it Member Sinenci? Member Kama second? Okay. Okay. So, we'll go to the next one. Tamara Paltin again, Housing...Affordable Housing Fund. Any remaining Housing... Affordable Housing Fund must be used for affordable housing projects in West Maui. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. It's just the motion to do it...to some extent, I didn't want to name any project or amount because I know that the State is still discussing, and I know Josiah is working with the Legislature about the possibility of some funds for Kupuohi. And so, you know, for me, I didn't want to say oh, we're going to fund Kupuohi, and they're like oh, Maui got it, like, how...for the fire. And so, there's more than one project in West Maui. If we give more money to the PARUS, or if we give more money to the Land Trust, or if we give more money to Pulelehua, or Kupuohi, whatever it is, the need is greatest in West Maui, and it's definitely more than 1.5 mil. And there's...there's shovel-ready projects, there's multiple projects there. So, whether we dump it into Pulelehua, Kupuohi, whatever it is, individual houses, there's more...there's more need than money basically.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, basically you're saying when we come to the end, whatever is available, that would go to West Maui...Affordable Housing Fund.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's what I'm saying. Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Huh? Yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, that's what I'm saying.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is there a second? Second. Okay. Any...anymore discussion? Here's Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(laughing)*. . . I...I didn't hear the whole motion, but I...I just wanted to ask. I have two conditions on Revolving Funds, you know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Coming up.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And so, I was wondering, are we going...are we moving down that road --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- to eventually cover all of our --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- Revolving Fund priorities?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Because...because I also have one on the Affordable Housing Fund, so just checking.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yep. Okay. So, that would actually...yours would actually be next, right, Chair?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Mine?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, after we take this vote. Yes, Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So, basically what we're saying with this statement here is, once all of our priorities in terms of the Affordable Housing Fund are done, and

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 23, 2024

either agreed-upon, or voted, or whatever, then whatever might be left in the fund is going to go to affordable housing projects in West Maui; is that right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Just wanted to be clear about that. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ready for vote?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, ready to vote?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor, raise your hand, say “aye,” or is there not...no need for --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Okay. So, it looks like we have eight “ayes,” one excused, is Member Rawlins-Fernandez. Okay.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next, we have, for the Department of Housing, Alice Lee, and it is...you’re up next for Pulelehua?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Yeah, okay. That’s my Revolving Fund thing. So, I move to...to apply \$31 million from the Affordable Housing Fund to the--to grant,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

I should say grant \$31 million from the Affordable Housing Fund to the Pulelehua project in West Maui.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: As you have already heard from everyone, that our focus is on helping...our priority is helping West Maui, and what better way to help them with one of the largest projects that is available, and is in the process of being built...Pulelehua. I would appreciate your support, everybody.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, anybody else? Member...yes, Member U'u-Hodgins has a question.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you, Chair. So, we did just condition all the rest of the affordable housing money for Lahaina, so this is just prioritizing Pulelehua. But do we know the status on whether or not they'll get water? And this would be in addition to the 18 million that they already received?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes. The 18 million was for the subsidy of the...the first phase of the 60 homes, so it has nothing to do with this. This is to...to finish the rest of the project. And as far as I know, they are working on getting the water, and...I don't know, maybe...maybe Member Paltin may have more information on [sic] me...more recent information on [sic] me, but...than me --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- regarding the water.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I'm happy to have anybody who can answer, answer. Is this the existing project that they currently have approvals for, or is this an added density that they need to go back to the LUC for? And see? (*phonetic*)

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: To my knowledge, it...oh, go ahead, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I believe it's for the first phase, 240 units, 60 of which is affordable for-sale, and 180 multi-family affordable rentals. The 60 affordable for-sale purchase price will be brought down with that other 18 million to match Member Johnson's Bill...107?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: 107.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 107, prices decreased by percentage. This would be...help with their infrastructure. So, I mean, I guess you could use GET monies if you want, but...or Affordable Housing Fund, but help with the...the ground and site work, I believe.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. I support giving money to the Affordable Housing Fund for the projects in West Maui, but I don't think I would want to just condition only for Pulelehua. I know that I've been going back and forth with the Housing Department, and the developer has been unwilling to pay prevailing wages, and they're having difficulties collecting their certified payroll. And it's been quite a fight. And that's a State law, Chapter 104. So, at this time I can support housing in Pule...I mean in West Maui, as we just voted on, but probably not 31 million for just this project. So, when we do vote, I would like a roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other questions, Members? Okay. So, I have a comment. Oh, Member Cook. Sorry, I didn't see your hand. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Is the money for water and infrastructure, or is it for affordable housing...payments for the...the actual buildings and...and people's purchasing the units?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: My understanding is that...is that it is for infrastructure, but it is a part of the whole project, yeah. Part of the whole project. And my...my...my understanding too, the . . .(timer sounds). . . developer has every intention to pay prevailing wages once he uses Government funds, which he hasn't yet.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: That's not how the law works. So, anytime you take any money, you have to pay prevailing wages from the get-go. We just got clarification from the State on how to apply that.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, really?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah. Hundred percent.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I didn't think he received any Government funds at this point.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: He did. Once the money was allocated to him and he got some. That's how that State law works.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I know in FY '23, they got 18 million. How much...was that money used? Where is the rest of it? Is it...last I heard, it wasn't being used, right?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: They used some of it.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Sorry, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: That was for subsidies. That was for subsidies.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Okay, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. To follow your...the bill that you had --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- proposed.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I understand now, that's what that's for. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Kama, did you have a question?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I was just going to say that when Housing was here and the question was asked about how much of the 18 mil has been spent, she said about a...\$400,000 has been spent. That's it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And...okay, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Can we ask Director Milner? I don't see it in the County Budget anywhere. Maybe you can explain?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yes, the 18 million was added under the Affordable Housing Fund a few fiscal years ago. I have to go back and check exactly when it was. It has been encumbered, and I believe as the Department said, they've only expended approximately 400,000 to date. I will need to go back and check that discussion, the purpose of those funds, but they...yes . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . there's still over 17 million remaining unencumbered.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, it's sitting in the Department of Housing and Human Concerns right now, waiting for Pulelehua to be compliant, or answer the questions that they had, and then they'll issue that money out; is that correct?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. All they've billed the County for so far is the 400,000. We haven't received any additional invoices against that encumbrance.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, so...go ahead, Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Question for Ms. Milner. So, Ms. Milner, when...when we make these kinds of allotments, or whatever you want to call them, and then the...the grantee is...what...what is the grantee supposed...are they supposed to do some work, turn in invoices, and then get more money drawn? I mean, how does that process work?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Kama. Yes, . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . once they are line-itemed in the annual budget, there's an application process that they still need to go through with the Department of Housing and Human Concerns to make sure they meet the appropriate requirements. Once that's done, we do enter into an agreement with them, which will encumber the funds. And then, yes, as they expend the money, they invoice us to receive funding from us.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, I am going to be...oh, Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I'm sorry. Just one last follow-up for Acting Director Milner. Where is the money in the budget? Is there a page number for that 18 million? Can we --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's couple --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- is it anywhere here? It's in --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think it was previous.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The...you gave us a sheet, right, with all prior year encumbrances?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Johnson, Councilmember Kama...Paltin, excuse me. Yes. So, as we've discussed, the affordable housing conditions do not carry over year to year, so we don't reflect the encumbrances. But we did provide, attached to BD-8, a listing of current encumbrances versus appropriations. I believe this is the Mahinahina Hills line item there. And as we discussed earlier, you know, if you have questions about previous projects and

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

their current status, we're happy to work with the Department of Housing to provide any updates . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . prior to today.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Director.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Okay. Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So...so, Chair...so, there's this \$18 million that was given a couple of years ago. The grantee hasn't drawn down on it except for...for less than half a million dollars on it. And now, Chair Lee wants to give them another 31 million, and he hasn't even spent the first 18. Will...I mean, irregardless [*sic*] of how much you give him, he will still have to file the last report for the first 18 million, and then he can get the second draw down of the 31? Is that how that works?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner? . . .*(timer sounds)*. . .Did you hear the question? Would he get --

MS. MILNER: Uh...thank you...I believe they would be separate grant agreements, so they wouldn't need to fully draw down the 18 million before they could access the 31, but they would need to go through a new application process for this 31 because it would be a separate agreement.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Miss...Ms. Paltin...wait. Before...so, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, I know, is here, and you're at the capitol. Are you...are you in a room by yourself, or is there anybody else there?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I am in a room alone.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, very good. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I got a question for Ms. Toshikiyo.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Hi.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: My question is, you know, the 18 million was to buy down the price on the affordable housing. I guess once he goes vertical--I'm not sure if he already spent 400,000 of it--but if we...would it be possible to amend that so that that 18 million, instead of buying down the price of the for-sale units, we can put it towards the construction of the rental units, so that we have 18 million right now to begin construction of the rental units? Can we...if the developer agrees to it, can we reassign the purpose of that money?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Thank you for the question. Well, this one, I actually...I just finally found the...the budget amendment from 2022. So, I...what I guess was like around September and October 2022. So, we're not able to amend a prior year's budget. I...and plus, their grant agreement has already been executed, and...and all the terms and conditions have already been agreed to.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you've never see a grant agreement canceled? It doesn't happen?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: It would have to be an agreement between the parties. And, you know, similarly, if there was a change in the scope of work, we would have to come to an agreement with the developer on that. I can read to you, what the condition was when we amended the Affordable Housing Fund. It says up to 18 million must be for Maui Oceanview, LP for the Pulelehua affordable housing project for 40 for-sale units at or below 100 percent AMI, and 20 for-sale units at or below 120 percent AMI. I would have to look at the...the scope in the grant agreement to let you know what exactly the proposal, and the agreed-upon scope for the project, and the use of the funds . . .*(inaudible)*. . . So, I'm going to pull that up next.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because just at this point, it would be great to build stuff. We already put 18 million to making it be affordable. It's not really affordable right now, but if we can get the 180 rentals moving, then people can live there at least. And...and the 60 for-sale, we can cross that bridge, I guess, when we come to it. Even with unaffordable prices, people have managed to purchase units, so then we just are not taking Bill 107 into account here because we're not supplementing it. And at least we have 180 affordable rental units coming online in West Maui with the 18 million from a previous year.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Ms. Toshikiyo, were you going to say something? Or is Ms. Milner still on? No? Okay. Ms. Milner.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It sounded like Ms. Toshikiyo said as long as the developer is amenable to canceling that contract and entering into a different kind of contract?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: For the 18 million?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. Then...then the delta would be like--what?--13 million more...and if...if they just work on the 180 instead of the 60 for-sale first?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I...I guess my question then would be, you know, are we talking about canceling the entire grant agreement, which would free up the remainder of the...the funds, or if we're talking about amending the grant agreement to --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Amending.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: -- amend the amount? Okay. And then also, amending the scope. You know, in terms of that...it's definitely a possibility, legally it is, but I would also defer to the Department on what those terms would look like, as well as any kind of discussions with the developer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Was...was Ms. Milner going to say something? She was up earlier. Okay. Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. So, after hearing what every...everything's been said--that the 18 million we gave him in 2022, he hasn't spent it, he didn't build anything--and I'm trying to figure out, if he hasn't done anything with the 18 mil, and we want to give him a new contract to do something else for another 31 mil, how does that equate to getting something done? I mean, I just can't wrap my head around that, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. . . *(timer sounds)*. . . Okay. So, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. I think repurposing the money for the same project for something that's going to be done now makes sense. I'm just saying, as far as having...having affordable housing funds tied up for a prolonged period of time doesn't necessarily serve anyone, and that's for any project. So, there has to be some...at some at some point in time, it has to be shifted gears so that it's being used. And I don't know what the situation is, but . . . *(inaudible)*. . . reallocating it, if it worked for the developer, and if it worked for the County, if it worked for everybody, it seems like the \$18 million could be put to use in infrastructure now, instead . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . of subsidizing units that are going to be built who knows when?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, anybody else have any comments? All right. I will be voting against this bill *[sic]* because there is no water...haven't heard if there's water, and that was shared with us. There's also a question about prevailing wages, which the Department came to us and said they're still waiting to hear back from the developer about--must be the 400,000 that he did use. And then, Member U'u-Hodgins clarified prevailing wages whenever...I guess, what she got from the State, I don't know if it's Labor Department, or who it is, Labor Department, that if you receive Government funds, you have to use prevailing wages, and he's waiting for...they're waiting for a report on that. And Ms. Toshikiyo, you can speak after this. So, the 18 million that was given to him, it was during Victorino's time, that's still not done. And the concern is about pulling permits. I think work was done without pulling adequate permits, that we did hear from Administration about that. So, I'm going to be just voting

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

against this and...but at the appropriate time, we'll do roll call. . . .(*timer sounds*). . . Ms. Toshikiyo.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Sorry. Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to point out...kind of make a clarification for what I said just now, that the...the purpose that's listed within that fiscal year--I guess it would be '23 budget appropriation--would still be the...kind of the parameters that we would have to follow. So, I just wanted to make that clear when...if there's, like, an amendment to the...the scope of the project.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you're talking about the 18 million?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, it would still have --

MS. TOSHIKIYO: That's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- to be for buying down the affordability of the for-sale housing, you mean?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Well, the...it was not very clear, I guess, when just read it. And you said 18 million, and it was listed...it kind of disappeared from my screen here, sorry. Where did I put it?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Oh.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Sorry, I don't have it up on my screen anymore. But then whatever was within that description of the appropriation would have to fall. It didn't say that it was for buy-down. Like I said, that could be within the grant agreement. So, as long as it's within that scope that was in the original appropriation from the fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay? Any other...Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. I have a question for Chair Lee. We know that we can put money in the budget, but if the Administration doesn't agree, they won't spend it, and that's what I'm afraid that might happen. So, Chair Lee, have you spoken with the Mayor on this? What's his stance?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, Mr. Johnson, I think that the Mayor will have to pay attention. If we voted to support this, he will have to pay attention because there's a lot of strain on him right now because . . .(*timer sounds*). . . I don't believe he has been prioritizing West Maui. If...if he were, he wouldn't be putting the people in a situation that in a year, many of them are going to be homeless. No matter how you slice it, they're going to be homeless because there are no homes coming up. That's the problem. So, this is...here, right here is a project. We all

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

have to get behind it, and he has to get behind it. And, you know, you talk about permits. It's rarely the applicant that's the problem, it's usually the Government that's the problem. So, we have to make an...an additional effort, an extra effort, to ask him--him, the Administration, everybody who's involved--to start working together to solve these problems. It's two things, water and permits. Water and permits. And we...and we are asked to...to fund more and more positions...for what? That's not the problem. The problem is water and permits. It's that simple. And I believe we have to take a stand because the people in Lahaina are counting on us. And that's what I have to say.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well...well said, Chair Lee. I...and we're about ready for a lunch break. Could...could we...maybe if you call the Mayor before...and then, we come back from lunch and we can hear what he had to say, and...and I'd be willing to hear that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We can do that. Members, do you mind if we just go to lunch? I see a thumbs up from Member Sinenci. Okay. So, we'll do...it's 12:21, you want to come back at 1:30, Members, and then we can take this up? Is that good? Okay. We'll come back at 1:30. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 12:21 p.m.
RECONVENE: 1:43 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Everybody, welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. We took a little lunch break, and we're back to work. We are only going to 4:00 because of the public hearing tonight. We can go to 4:30 or 5:00, depends on how much work. I am hoping that we go all the way to Management. It'll be a stretch, based upon all that we've been doing this morning. Where we left off is, we had a motion on the floor with Chair Lee. Who made the second? Yvette knows. Huh? Gabe made the second? Okay. Chair Lee. Cannot hear you, you know. You're muted. There.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. I'd like to defer that...that...that vote until tomorrow. I need to double check on certain things, get little bit more information...and then because some of the Members has questions, and I'm still waiting for some answers. So, if you don't mind holding up on that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, so we'll put that --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: But, you know, it makes sense to hold up on most of the votes on all Housing having to do with affordable housing.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, can you withdraw? Chair Lee, can you withdraw?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. So, as long as you take it up again tomorrow afternoon, I withdraw.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And I withdraw my second, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You withdraw your second. Okay. And then let me see if there's any more Department of Housing. There's one, Gabe Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I have Lahaina...I have the information for mine. I'm not sure if you wanted to defer it until tomorrow, or do it now, but...I don't know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You have the insert? Okay. Of who's going to take over the...I mean, who will manage that 3.5 million? Is that what you're saying?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes, that one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm happy to wait until tomorrow, or do it now.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'll defer to your best judgment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Why don't...why don't we wait until tomorrow? Then we can take up the rest of the Housing --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Department of Housing. Okay. Just to make it clean.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Pick up everything tomorrow.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Is there anything else? Department of Housing. Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm prepared if you want to start out...swap it out with Parks, or Personnel, or something. I'm...I'm cool with that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Gabe, we're going to take yours up tomorrow too, then.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, for the...oh, okay, sure.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: If that's what you prefer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Kupuohi. So, we'll just take up all the --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No, this was --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Housing. The remaining --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- the proposed...the...the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Conditions.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- money for the portal for the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- Bill 111?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, no, no, no.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: You want to do that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm...I'm looking at, um...on the Revolving Fund, the Department of Housing, Affordable Housing Fund, up to 36 million must be for Kaiāulu o Kupuohi.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I will withdraw my...well, okay. We'll just wait until tomorrow.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah? Okay. We'll just take up all the Housing.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we'll take this up...James and Kasie, yeah? Take this up tomorrow, and take up the Pulelehua tomorrow, and Kupuohi, as well as...that's it, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Still have my portal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, and --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: All the rest of the Housing we'll do it tomorrow.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, we'll just take it all up tomorrow, the ones that are incomplete.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The ones that are incomplete.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Any...anybody have any comments before we close out Housing, those that...that which we have completed; is there consensus?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I can --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're basically done.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- I can make a comment too, though.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, you can make a comment.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, I guess my comment is, I did check with the developer on the prevailing wage question. And basically he said he's going off of the advice of both his former attorney, State Senator Gil Keith-Agaran, and his current attorney, which he sent the...the letter that his current attorney advised him of that's why he did it that way. And he said that if he did receive bad legal advice, he's more than happy to comply. And I said, you know, we all know what it's like to get bad legal advice, so thank you for complying, if...if it works out that way. And then Ms. Toshikiyo sent me her PDF opinion, and I forwarded it on to the developer. So, I...I hope that gets all sorted out. I hate getting bad legal advice myself, so I can commiserate, but I mean, I guess he thought a State Senator would know the law.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, he's blaming his attorneys? Okay. Anybody else?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Hey, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: The...my proposal for the \$2 million for the Housing Policy Implementation is not from the Affordable Housing Fund, and I did reach out to Josiah Nishita and got the answer. I could tell the answer, and we could vote on it and be done and move on?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, comes from the afford...I thought yours was Affordable Housing Fund.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Huh? Was the 2 million from the Affordable Housing Fund? 11; is that right?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, page 11 in the rubric, if you look...look at that. So, I spoke with Josiah Nishita, and the answer...question...question...the question that the body had from Councilmember Paltin was, how...how many...or how much was the proposals for this...this bid? And it was 11 proposals, ranging from \$1 million to \$2 million. So, having that Housing Policy Implementation up to \$2 million would be, I think, is a smart way to go. And that comes from the Professional Services, Chair.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Pardon me? Two...oh, yeah, from Bill...for Bill 107 and Bill 111, yes. Basically, we want to get the...the portal up so that when our residents are interested in housing, they're connected to the nonprofits that are going to help them get financial literacy classes, teach them about all the programs we offer, the State program, everything. Just get them ready when the house comes up. So, that's...that way they...they have preference, and they actually get the houses when...when the houses are available. So, that's...I think that was a really game changer for our community, to have...you know, with...the question we get--I'm sorry, I'm probably on a rant, so time me if I have...if you have to--but two questions are always for affordable housing. What do you mean by affordable, and who is it really for? Bill 107 addresses the prices, Bill 111 addresses who is it for...we give residents preferences. So, I think now that we have those bills in the books, we need to just fund it for the portal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this is \$2 million to the...so, this would be Housing program, and it's new money. Ooh, okay. New and condition. Okay. So, did we vote on this already? We didn't, it was withdrawn. Okay, so we need to start again then.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, I move to add a new line entitled...line item entitled, Housing Policy Implementation in the amount of \$2 million, and add the following condition: funds must be used for a grant for Professional Services to implement Ordinance 5315 and ordinance 5441.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay, any more discussion? Seeing none, okay. All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye." Who is...Member Cook, can you hear us? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, good. So, who is missing? Tasha Kama, Chair Lee is there, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, Tom Cook. Okay, so it's eight "ayes," one excused, Member Kama.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion carries. Anything else before we move on? Okay. So, tomorrow we'll take up the Housing Revolving Fund, right? Anything else for this before we...no? Okay. Consensus for the rest of the work we did, Members...do we have consensus?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Good. And then, let's go to the Department of Human Concerns.

DEPARTMENT OF HUMAN CONCERNS

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, look at page...in your...in budget...sorry. Bill 60, look 8 to 12, there's Human Concerns, broken up. Anybody have any amendments? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I move, in, um...in Number 9 on the Budget Bill, Department of Housing [sic] Concerns...I mean, sorry, Department

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

of Human Concerns, small b.(1)(i), Category A, decrease salaries by 150,000 plus fringe of \$124,860.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, there's a second by Chair Lee. Motion made by Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, sorry, thanks. Decreases are based on historical differences in adopted and actual amounts, as well as current vacancies, and the length of time that those positions have been vacant.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. Members, any discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: *(Coughing)*

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, are you okay, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm fine. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Members, from this program, which you were just passed out, for vacancies under...this is Admin, 103,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's...it's under the b., so I believe that would be not Admin, but Human Concerns --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Human Concerns and equipment.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, small b., not Category B.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Small b.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, not the Admin program, but the Human Concerns program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Very good. So, as far as vacancies, there are almost 800,000. Is 8...\$798,528, and then...that's it. Okay. So, you're deleting that 150,000 from that category?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: My proposal was 150,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait. And then fringes. Okay, Members, any discussion? Okay. Then all in favor, raise your hand. Okay, thank you. So that's eight "ayes," and one excused, which is Member Kama.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook,
Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez,
Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, anybody else have any more changes or amendments on this? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: This would be same Budget Bill, Number 9, small b.(1)(i), Category B, decrease of one...or sorry, decrease of 10,000 [sic].

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Early...the Early Childhood Program?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, no. Under...under Human Concerns, in the Operations and Equipment category, 10,000 [sic] off the top, decrease.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do we have a second?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin, and second by Member Sinenci. Discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just that I...I looked at the actuals and the adopted in Fiscal Year '22-'23, I don't think that this will hurt it too much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I'm sorry, it says 100,000 decrease. I read that wrong.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, 100,000 decrease. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't know who seconded me. Are they okay with that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, Shane Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Discussion, Members? Seeing none. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye." Aye. Eight "ayes," and one excused.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I'd like to do a roll call?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You want a roll call? Okay, roll call.

MS. MONIZ: Chair, proceeding with the roll call. Council Chair Alice Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MONIZ: Councilmember Tamara Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

MS. MONIZ: Councilmember Gabe Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No.

MS. MONIZ: Councilmember Keani Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MONIZ: Councilmember Tom Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MONIZ: Councilmember Nohelani U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MONIZ: Councilmember Shane Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. MONIZ: Committee Vice-Chair Tasha Kama.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Excused.

MS. MONIZ: Committee Chair Yuki Lei Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aye.

MS. MONIZ: Chair, that's seven "ayes," one "no," one excused. Motion passes.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook,
Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci,
and U'u-Hodgins.**

NOES: Councilmember Johnson.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. Any other...any other deductions?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm finished.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You finished? Okay. Okay. This Department does not have any CIPs. Grants in...on Budget Bill 39 to 40, any changes? And these are grants that they're adding, so I haven't heard of any requests for changes, so that remains, unless if there's somebody else? Okay, so that remains. Next, we have Special Purpose Revenues, Animal Management Revolving Fund, page 44, as well as a Revolving Fund, Kaunoha Senior Services Leisure Program Activities Revolving Fund, page 47. So, 44 and 47. Okay. Animal Management Revolving Fund, no change, unless...I don't see anything from anybody. And then also the Kaunoha Program, page 47, no changes. They have 121,738. No changes, right? 200,000 must be for leisure program activities disbursement. Leisure program instructors limited to 11 LTAs. Okay, that remains, right? No changes. Next, we have Rates and Fees, Appendix B, 18 to 19...I'm looking on the Ramseyer

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

version, 18 and 19, Ramseyer version. Appendix B, Rates and Fees. Nope, no changes? They just changed their name. Okay, are we all good? Yeah? Okay. Next, we have Departmental Requests, which are none. Member Priorities, 12 and 18 of matrix. Okay, get out your matrix.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I thought there was a request...or no? There is no request?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: April 12th letter, you're talking about?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, sorry, I'm...my bad, it was on the Mayor's one. But I don't know if...if folks are open to that swap out that I mentioned earlier when Ms. Labrecque was testifying.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because if you look under the Office of the Mayor, if we take...or move that funding from Budget Details 903021B-6132...if we move 281,000 to Maui Humane Society to fill their...fulfill their contractual obligations, and rely on them to fulfill the burn-zone cats in Lānaʻi's needs, in addition to the 450,000 they received, that would...I would not change anything money-wise, but hopefully make everyone happy?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, say that again?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: This is...this is a brand new, right? This is not changing anything from the Mayor, right?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's taking the Mayor's proposal. Because the Mayor's proposal money can be used for whatever, I guess, whereas the 9.4 million that the Humane Society received can only be used for wildfire response. So, what we heard was Humane Society gave 200, 220 burn-zone cats to Lānaʻi, gave them 450,000 to take care of those 200, 220 cats, which they did say is a discount compared to like places like Utah, where they charge \$6,000 per cat to take it in. And then they came to us in Lānaʻi saying they took in 200, 220 burn-zone cats and they didn't get any money, which is not true, apparently. But if there's money available for wildfire response, which those 200 cats from the burn zone is, my suggestion is they take that out of the 9.4 million the Humane Society used that they cannot use to fulfill their contractual obligations, which this money that the Mayor's proposing could be used to fulfill their contractual obligations with us.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If we don't do that, my proposal is just to cut that amount and not raise our taxpayers' taxes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Yeah, I think so.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, either way, I mean, I'll...I'll leave it in you guys' hands.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this is not anything in Rates and Fees, you're just talking about in general, the Animal Management? (silence) Okay. Go ahead, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I...you know, I appreciate the intent, I really do. When we see the prices that are being thrown around to take care of cats, it's...it's astronomical. You know, I know the Cat Sanctuary well, and I...and we were all at the District Committees [sic] where we heard Lānaʻi come out strong.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Um-hum.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And yeah, maybe you're correct, Councilmember, that they should have mentioned that they were getting those subsidies for taking on the burn cats, but it still doesn't change the fact that since the fire, no one goes to Lānaʻi for the Cat Sanctuary because the ferry does...runs 12 hours a day, or 12 hours between runs, and you can't sit in Lānaʻi City at the Cat Sanctuary for 12 hours in between. So, they...the numbers are down, and . . .(timer sounds). . . the cats need food, the cats need the vet, the cats need fencing--and these are besides just the regular cats that they have there. So, the cost to run that show is a lot, and they rely on tourist dollars, and there hasn't been tourists. I know my time is up, but the taxi that takes you up there, Rabaca's Limo, goes...was going 100...100 people a day when they was up and running before the fire, and now they're really low. The one...the lowest number they told me was five fares in one day to the Cat Sanctuary. So, significant drop in numbers, significant drop in revenue. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Do we have a motion on the floor? We don't, right? We're just having talk story. So, okay, I'm going to move on. Go ahead. I'm sorry, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, thank you, Chair. It doesn't seem...I mean, I would be supportive of this...this move, only because I don't see, in either the budget...the Mayor's budget or any of the Councilmembers that are addressing --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Priority.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: -- the Humane Society. And I know they...they wanted I think 200, and then 81,000 for enforcement. Unless it's...Member Kama has a

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

grant to Maui Humane Society for animal sheltering, but other than that, I don't see, . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . I mean, it would be kind of, you know, prudent for them to accept that offer because I don't see what they were asking for in the...in the Budget.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I don't think we have anything from the Members. Go ahead, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I'll move to move \$281,000 from the Office of the Mayor, page 15-9 of the Budget Details, subject-object index code 900...oh, 903021B-6132, 200,000 to page 11 of Bill 60, small c.(1)(i), 200,000 for Category B, and for (2)(i) 81,000 for category B.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait. We're in Human Concerns.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, that's what I'm on. Human Concerns. Page 11 is still Human Concerns, right, of the Budget Bill?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Number 9, yeah. Page 11 of the Budget Bill.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Staff, can you...is Mayor into Human Concerns? Could you clarify what program it's going to go into?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Into the Grant to Humane Society for Animal Sheltering Program, 200,000, and 81,000 into the Animal Enforcement program. And that's based on page 2 of the Mayor's April 12th letter, second item under Office of the Mayor, with the intent that Humane Society will care for the burn-zone cats in Lānaʻi.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Was it...what...what letter again from the Mayor?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The April 12th letter from the Mayor, page 2, under the second...the second item, under Office of the Mayor, page 2. That's the best I can do.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Okay. . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Member Paltin, does...does this take care of the Cat Sanctuary and then, at the same time, the shortage at the Humane Society?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, the intent is to take care of the contractual obligation shortage of the Humane Society. They said that they have 9.4 million in donations specifically for wildfire response. They also said that they transferred 200--or I don't know, some people said 200, some people said 220--burn-zone cats to Lāna'i Cat Sanctuary at a discount. So, then I'm asking them to take some of their 9.4 million, and realize that they need more money to pay for the burn-zone cats than they originally anticipated, and not take that discount, considering they have 9.4 million. And then we can make them whole with this other money because otherwise, they can't use the burn-zone donations for their contractual obligations with the County of Maui.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. And so the Humane Society director was okay with that suggestion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: She was generally okay, but needed to check with her board.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. Sounds good.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: We need a little more research before we do this, right? I mean, we haven't heard back from the Maui Humane Society. I don't know, has anybody reached out to the Cat Sanctuary? They came into my office just the other day and...and asked about it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I won't be supporting the money from the Mayor to the Cat Sanctuary. This is the best you're going to get out of me. Because first of all, they lied to us, and second of all, all the things that you're saying about cats, the humans in West Maui are dealing with much worse.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Do not disagree with that statement at all, Councilmember Paltin, but we're acting like there's a sense of scarcity when there isn't. The...the...the burn money is very specific on what you can use it for.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: *(Audio interference, open mic)*

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: The...the cost of running the Cat Sanctuary hasn't gone away. It's still very expensive. We still have to bring vets over there. And all the things that I mentioned before, we...usually, we...we take a little time on this kind of thing, and we're just going sight unseen. We didn't hear back from the Humane Society, and I don't think we heard anything from the Cat Sanctuary except for

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

when they came and testified. And I . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . usually...that kind of discussion we...we try to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- get to the bottom of some of these questions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You guys want to put this on hold, then, Member Johnson? To revisit? This is a revisit? Okay. Okay. Member Paltin, hold your motions, right, we're going to revisit.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'll withdraw.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, withdraw. Withdraw? Okay, great. All right. So, that's Human Concerns, and we might then see Dr. Labrecque one more time, I guess. Oh, no. Maybe Cat Sanctuary. So, we are done with Human Concerns. Okay. Any other...any other comments, Members? Okay. We are done, good...except that one revisit. Department of Liquor Control. Oh, Priorities, sorry, of course. Priorities are 12...page 12 to 18.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, page 12. All right. Okay, Tamara Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I just wanted to...is this a good time to bring up...it looks like I had a couple of duplicates with some other ones. I know that you had made a statement that if we were all...or if we made different requests, that they weren't duplications. So, I was just wanting to get a...because it looks like I have for...under Human Concerns, I had two other people that had the same.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah. Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. What is it? It is the Number 11?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: We had Women Helping Women, Maui AIDS Foundation, and HARF.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Women Helping Women --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And it sounds like from all the testimony we received at the District, we just kind of followed some of the testimony requests.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Women Helping Women is Tamara Paltin, right? Is that what you're talking about? And you have one too?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, can I speak to what he's...well, what Councilmember Sinenci's speaking on?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, um-hum.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Basically, one of proposals was just increasing the Human Concerns program by \$3 million, and that would, across the board, lift all those nonprofits that asked for money that the Administration did not give them. Just for example, Maui Family Support Services asked for 1.4 million, they only got 875. To speak to your...the Women Helping Women, they asked for 250,000, they received 228,000 from the Administration. So, this \$3 million does all of the Human Services grants, and brings them up in...all in one sweep. That's...that kind of...what I'd like to kind of just speak to you guys, maybe this would be a better way because we do have a lot of people who have overlap.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: What page number are you, sorry?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Page 18 on your rubric.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And Chair, for the Women Helping Women, we received testimony from the Prosecuting Attorney that since the wildfires, they've received double the calls to their agencies, as far as domestic.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So basically, if I understand Member Johnson correctly, you're saying that with your priority, which is on page number--what is this, 18?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah. And I'd be willing...because I kind of get the mood of the Council, I would be willing to go down to 2 million instead of 3, but that would be my proposal. Just because there's so many of these human resources that got cut, that 2 million might be more amenable to the body. Just saying.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you're kind of making whole, the Mayor's cuts of 5...5 percent, you're putting them back to wherever --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right. And if...if...we've heard from the nonprofits how much of a more burden they have since the fire to address some of the concerns

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

of our...our folks who are concerned about these nonprofits not getting their help. The Maui Farm is...is in this list, Aloha House is in this list, Maui Family Services, Partners in Development, Feed my Sheep, Project Vision, Ka Hale A Ke Ola, Mental Health Kōkua, The Salvation Army. These are all servicing our West Maui brothers and sisters that need it in this time. And just like what Councilmember Sinenci said, that the...the need has gotten only bigger. So, I don't want to nickel and dime, as they say, and go, this group gets it, and this group doesn't. Let's just do all of the Human Services grants, give them \$2 million across the board, so that the Department can...can...can work on that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, your motion is that \$2 million. Is there a second? Oh, Chair Lee, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I didn't second, I just wanted to say something.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I was wondering if we could be more conservative in our first pass, and...and if there's more money, we can add it at the end? Or we can make...create a...a situation where, instead of that...that the Department of Housing and Human Concerns and all grant givers would have a...a second round for those who still need money after the...after the first round. My concern is that we don't know all of our expenses yet, so we have to be really careful about . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . front-ending our money. We need to be more cautious and hold back a little bit. And then...and then, if we hold back, and we don't...we don't have the expenses we're expecting, then we can give more. But it's hard to give more, and then we don't know all of our liabilities. That's my concern.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I understand.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Because...yeah. Because honestly, Member Johnson, this is where I came from, nonprofits.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, I know exactly what they're going through. But I also have the...you know, we all have that responsibility for the entire County. So, we just have to be more careful and...and who knows, maybe at the very end we can give more, but for now, let's hold back a little, yeah? Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, if I may?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I understand that mentality, that's why I went from 3 million down to 2 million. And the \$19 million that we didn't get from the Homeland Security and the \$54 million of Bridge Grant donated by HHFC, those are monies that ballooned our budget. And so, we're well beneath our budget right now, right? So, the 19, then?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we didn't receive that.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, I...I guess...my point being is that Feed My Sheep asked for 125. We...they...right? They asked for 150 and they got 125. Project Vision asked for 309, they got 108...188,000. You know, it just...the social services . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . have been cut, and we got to give them what they asked for. Aloha House asked for 323, and they got 306,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Last one, the...let's see here, the Maui --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Mr. Johnson...Mr. Johnson, Ms. Milner appeared.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So that means something.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, go ahead. I was going to call on you after he went through his list. Go ahead.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. I did just want to point out, if you just add the two million straight across, while that will give the Department flexibility, it will most likely go to existing grantees. So, if there are organizations that aren't named in the budget, which I see there are a few here that the Council specifically wants to name, we would recommend adding them as a specific line item, rather than just adding a flat \$2 million. And that was all. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, taking into account what Chair Lee just said, if I can understand, Chair Lee, basically what you're saying is that I think we're going to hear a lot tonight, when the Senate and House Conference Bill is going...communication's going to be done, or the committee is going to be done, and we're going to hear the impacts that the Legislature is going to have on us, right, in general, not only the CIP, but...do you know if they are giving programs...like this Human Concerns programs also? Does anybody know? I don't know what the answer is. Does Jarret? Who's been monitoring that? Did he...oh, we haven't had...well, we haven't had decisions yet. Okay. Is that why

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

you said that, Chair Lee...because of the conference committee with the Legislature?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm just saying that, you know, if we give people what we can afford right now, and then at the end of the...at the end, we have extra money, then we give them, as opposed to trying to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do it now.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- add on right now, without knowing the whole picture. Because we don't know our...all of our liabilities. We have over 600 people suing us. We have no idea how much we're going to have to pay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, we...a lot of raises been given out around on the 8th, 9th floor, just saying. Maui Family Support Services was supposed to get \$300,000 in CBDG [*sic*] money, and they didn't get any. That's the guys that are helping the people with depression. And this island is blue, if you know what I'm saying. So, I can't...I'm trying my darnedest to make sure that they get their funding. I hear what Chair Lee is saying, but at this time of crisis, we shouldn't be acting from a sense of scarcity.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I think Chair is trying to act cautiously, right, Chair Lee? So, okay, let's have this discussion. Then if you're saying that--all these proposals that are in our conditions and priorities, are you saying to lay it on the side until we go through our budget, and we can revisit these...those are in the conditions?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm not...I'm not saying to re...start all over.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, no, no.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm not saying that at all.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Just the things that are in our priorities and conditions. So, in the pages of our Priorities and Conditions that are the Human Concerns, you're saying to wait. Is that what you're...you're...you're --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, I'm...I'm...what I'm saying is that we all committed to doing just Priorities, so let's go through all the priorities, let's go through all of, you know, everybody's proposals, and not try and add over and above that...at this time.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Let's find out what...what happens at the end, and if...if we can afford everybody's priorities, if we have extra money, and then go back...go back and revisit certain things that we could possibly increase, okay?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: This was my priority, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I know. That's what we're talking about. Yeah, Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. And...oh, sorry, I did see Member Rawlins-Fernandez. But real quick, you know, the point...the point is...of my bringing it up is several of us had the same ones, so it will be less because we all put in...three of us put in for HARF, two of us put in for Women Helping Women, two of us put in for Maui AIDS Foundation. So, what I'm saying is, we all put in...you know, several of us just picked one or two of these grants to fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, so we can discuss it. Okay. So, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Member Rawlins.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: But here is the...we have a motion for his priority, and then is there a second? Oh, sorry about that.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez, yes?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. I'm going to turn my video off because I don't think I have a very strong connection. I...I hear what Chair Lee is saying, that additional information before making substantial additions to our budget may be the more prudent way forward. And so, I...I have...I mean I have an idea, a suggestion, for us to consider, that if...if...if a proposal is less than 50,000 or something, then maybe we can consider it now. If not, we'll set it aside until tomorrow after we get a little more information. You know, for example, I...I have one that proposes to add 320,000, and I...I'd be willing to set that proposal on the side for a revisit on...until such time that we have that information that we're hoping to get from the Legislature.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, Members, what if we take the Human Concerns discussion, right, and we'll take it up all one time instead of piecemealing it, and

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

we'll just move to the next department, yeah? That means we just finish Human Concerns...huh? Well, Human Concerns, right? Because of this discussion, if there are going to be priorities that we can revisit, let's revisit all one time instead of doing it piecemeal. Chair Lee. Yeah? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I think that's a good idea.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And I encourage everybody to keep your scissors sharp. You know, for a while, we were cutting pretty good, but now, you know, it's less.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, let's...let's keep on the lookout for what can be deferred...what expenses can be deferred.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, the ones that we're going to talk about tomorrow then...and the Conditions and Priorities page is page 12. Tamara Paltin has one for Women Helping Women. Tamara Paltin has one for Maui AIDS. Tasha Kama, Member U'u-Hodgins...and this is all Maui Humane Society things. I don't know, we resolved one. Anyway, for...this was...this is on page 13. So, 12, 13...page 14 has Member Sinenci, Member Sinenci, Member Sinenci, Member Sinenci. Okay, up to page 15. Oh, to next page. Human Concerns, Member Sinenci, and...well, here's the one that Member Rawlins-Fernandez was talking about, so she's also on page number 16 and 17...okay, 17, and up to...we go up to page 18. Yeah. So, tomorrow we'll take up these. Is that all right? Okay. Okay, Members, you heard that? Okay. We're going to take up all of the things in priorities--I think it was page 12 through 18--that is regarding Human Concerns, yep. And then, we'll take it up tomorrow...tomorrow. Yeah, take it up tomorrow. So, moving on. So, Department of Liquor. Oh, do we have consensus on the rest, Members? That's the only one, yeah. Consensus on the rest, yes? We're just going to take up the priorities tomorrow. Okay, great.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

DEPARTMENT OF LIQUOR CONTROL

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Department of Liquor, which is Bill 60, page 12. Any amendments to Liquor? None? Okay. They don't have any CIPs. Consensus. So that was fast, yeah, Liquor? Okay. The pages are out of order. Try wait. Hang on. Okay. Okay. Liquor. Page 12, there's no changes, no CIPs, no grants. Special Revenue. They have Liquor Education, which is on page 44. All of us know that's 22,000, right? There's probably...we can't change it anyway. Yeah. Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I was going to reduce the MEO underage drinking by 22,000, but that's also counted as part of their program, so I'm withdrawing that off of my printed sheet.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yeah. God, they do such a good job. What...what did...what do you mean? What do you mean?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If you didn't read my printed sheet, then don't worry about it because I'm not going to propose it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, good. Because I don't...I don't have your printed sheet. Appendix B, Rates and Fees, 21 to 23...oh, God, right? Their Rates and Fees, they probably never charge enough for liquor. . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Any changes? Okay, they have no changes. Okay. We're all good, right, with Liquor? Okay. Consensus. We're done.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

DEPARTMENT OF MANAGEMENT

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, now, Department of Management, page 12. Are there any...any proposed amendments to Department of Management? Okay, thank you. Okay. Before Tamara charges in with yours, so what you're receiving is salary calculations. And this is where Staff looked at all of the vacancies, expansions, within all the departments. And in this case, Management Program has, in vacancies, about \$500,000, \$495,180. Wow. ITS, which is Technology, has 1.3 million. And Office of Recovery has \$462,000. And it's all in vacancies, it's not in expansions. And what my proposal is, is to cut 10 percent, 25, or 50 percent, with a 50-percent transfer then of 25 percent would go to Countywide. Any interest in doing that, or you want to go one by one? *(silence)* Okay. Okay, Tamara.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. In Bill 60, Line 11, Department of Management, small a.(1), Category A, Salaries, I move to decrease by 50,000 plus fringe \$41,620.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Under Management.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Small a.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. What was the amount again?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Security Division. What was the first number?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: First number, salaries decreased 250,000, fringe 208,100, and Category B, 11,000. If I get a second, I'll tell you a funny story.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We like the funny story. Second for the funny story.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Second...second for the funny story.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Every year, it seems they budget 1,500 in ITSD for diesel, or 1,500 for diesel, and it's never used. That's my funny story. . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Everybody, laugh. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't know why ITSD needs diesel, and apparently, neither do they because they don't use that \$1,500.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, maybe --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: In case of emergency?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Maybe. But then, I don't know if they have the diesel on hand. And so, then, are they, like, replenishing the diesel? Are they switching it out? Like, they had 1,500 worth of diesel, and then they bought the diesel, and they don't want it to get stagnant, so they...I don't know. But they never used it in the last...since Fiscal Year '22.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Maybe they need a director, right? They lost their director.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Duarte?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Duarte, who was here. I met him at NACo. Wasn't here very long. Okay, Members. All in favor, say "aye." Eight "ayes," one excused, Member Kama.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anymore?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Feel free to join the party, folks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(laughing)*. . . Okay. Okay. So, for Management, I have...thanks for doing that. For new equipment calculations, the sheet that you received shows new equipment calculations. I will read this. It's...it shows cuts for 5, 10, 15, 20 percent cuts, and it's basically on ITS. ITS...oh, Office of Recovery and complete. So, it is small UPS for remote locations to protect network, 30,000; fiber optic tools, 15,000; UPS extension to network rack to County of Maui at KOM. Where is KOM? Desktop...huh? Kalana O Maui? Okay. Desktop computers and software for a proposed expansion position, 60,000; eight computers and three laptops or tablets, 50,000, Office of Recovery; and office furniture and fixtures for West Maui and Trask Office spaces. So, these are Office of Recovery and for all of the people that we're hiring to do our...outside consultants to work to help us. So, this proposal is to do...I mean, to just leave it, or doing cuts based upon 5 percent, 10 percent, 15, 20 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess I'd be willing to cut half of the desktop and software for proposed expansion positions. Because is that --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 60,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean, I've never seen ITSD fully staffed.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 60,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, half of that.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, 30?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't know, I'm just going off of your sheet. So, it's Budget Details, page 14 --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 18.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- dash 18.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Ms. Milner, Ms. Milner.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Go ahead.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Just wanted to quickly clarify that those are not just computers for the expansion positions in ITSD, we put the computers for all of the expansion positions--except for I may have missed one or two. But all of the expansion position computers should be under ITSD, so that's that dollar amount, not just the ITSD positions. We only have one expansion position in ITSD this year. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you're saying that --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But all the vacant ITSD positions already have desks, and software, and stuff?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. No, I don't believe those have been purchased, but we did not budget for those at the moment. The 60,000 you're referring to is for expansion positions across the County, not just in ITSD.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: But ITSD pays for it across the County?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. For the new computers, yes, those charges usually come out of ITSD.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, because they set it up?

MS. MILNER: For replacement computers are generally in the departments.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is that because they set it up with the network security and all of that for the County of Maui system?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yes, I believe that's part of it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I'll withdraw my request.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Interesting. So, from now on, if ITSD worked on any department computers, they take the cost and the inventory, and it's not with the department. So, we should pay attention to that when we see costs come up for computers within the departments, it shouldn't be there then; is that correct?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah, so IT --

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, when I went through the budget, I did try and move any computers that had been added for expansion positions into ITSD. But I do know, as we've been going through, I've noticed that I missed a few. So, my apologies for that. It's okay that they're under the departments, we're just trying to centralize as much as we can.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay, Members, you're...you're fine with all the rest? Okay. Okay. So, we are done, then, with...okay. Twelve CIPs...oh...oh, wait, the biggie, right? Budget Bill...page 24 is the Budget Bill, which has all the CIPs, so we'll...I'm sorry, page 24. Yeah, this is...this is the biggie that tonight we're going to find out what the Legislature is going to do with the 130 million. I think I hear a couple numbers, but there's going to be the Conference Committee, which I think Chair Lee was talking about, that we should hear more.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, was it after 5 o'clock tomorrow? Oh, today.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think it's today.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 5 o'clock today.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I think we're hearing that...well, yeah, but they're going to hear by tonight, right. They're going to...oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 150...150 million. Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, I got a text that said the Leg just rolled over the budget to tomorrow at...until 2:00 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. It...which includes ours, yeah? Okay. Okay. So, on this CIP because, as you know, the huge CIP ask is...well, this is Bill 20...I'm sorry, page 24, but it is that entire list of...it says \$14,550,000. What did you say we asked for, 130? 150 million? Yeah. Ms. Milner, why is it different than what's in our CIP?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Before I answer that, my apologies. I did want to clarify one thing I said about ITSD. We tried to move all the general-funded computers under ITSD. So, if it's a special-funded expansion position, Highway Fund, things like that, it would not be under ITSD. So, just wanted to clarify that really quickly on the record.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MILNER: For your second question about the CIP, we've included 139,950...130,950,000 for the State funding for the CIP. The other 20 million is included under MEMA for security costs. So that's the \$150,950,000 ask that we're making from the State that we're waiting to hear on.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, on page 24 in the Budget, under Department of Management, it says Countywide, other projects, General Fund, Maui wildfire disaster relief, and it's 14 million. So, where's the rest? (silence) Page 24. I saw it in CIP.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's listed.

MS. MILNER: -- yeah, that may be...I think that's a typo. My apologies.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We'll be seeing a zero next to the 140? It should be 140 instead of 14 million?

MS. MILNER: Yes, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is it a grant under Appendix A, Part I?

MS. MILNER: Sorry, Chair, yes. The 14.55 million--I apologize, I was thinking of a different part of the budget--the 14.55 million is the County's General Fund share. We are proposing that the State pay 90 percent, and that the County pay 10 percent. So, the 14.55 is the County's 10 percent share, the remainder is under grant funding. My apologies for my confusion.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, let's find it. Under Management...it should be there, right? There's Mayor, yeah. Do you see it? I see page 40, Parks, Mayor...oh, here's Management, it's right above it. Okay. It's 130...here it is. Okay. So, we're going to...what do we do on this then? Because we have to wait for the Legislature to decide what they're going to do then, and how does this impact? Okay. So, the bigger problem is, how do we find the rest of the money--right?--if they don't give us the whole 140...139,950,000 [sic]...oh, 150. Okay. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, you're talking about the CIP, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I am.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm looking at page 910 on the Program Budget, and it says Maui Wildfire Disaster Recovery. I don't understand why it would have Kahului Wastewater Treatment Plant fourth aeration basin. That has nothing to do with wildfire disaster recovery, yeah?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait, what did you say? 19? Under Management.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Page 910.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, 910.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think that's a mistake. Is that a mistake? Because it doesn't fall under Maui Wildfire Disaster Recovery, does it? Unless...was the Kahului Wastewater Treatment Plant destroyed in the fires?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think it's all part of the reconstruction of the Central Maui Wastewater. Here's Ms. Milner. I'm going to pull up my CIP.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can Ms. Milner explain?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: She looks like she's getting information. Management --

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, this was intended to support development of additional housing to help those who were survivors of the wildfire. And they can't proceed with the housing development without that infrastructure in place. So, that's why it was included as part of the CIP.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ah, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's kind of interesting because they want the housing to be in West Maui, but we're not helping with that infrastructure. So, interesting. I mean, I don't mind doing it, but it's kind of getting old, pinning everything on

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

the wildfire that is benefiting other areas. Like just be honest and say it's for Kahului.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, actually, Member Paltin, if you look at CIP page 910, yeah, and if you look at all the projects. So, in this case, the list of projects is not explained like a regular CIP...you know how we're used to seeing the actual...more details, right? But it's just a list of the projects, and this is what the...this is what the Mayor has asked the Legislature for. So, that's this list. So, there's Honokōwai and Wahikuli water line extension, fire flow improvements to water system, storm drain, flood control. Anyway, there's...this is all what they asked for. Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. And just to further clarify, the housing that would be supported by that wastewater facility would be FEMA housing. So, that is the other reason it's tied in here. But what I did want to say, if you look in Granicus at the transmittal you got from Department of Management--I believe it's either 173 or 174 in Granicus--you will see project sheets similar to what you're used to seeing in the CIP book for each of these line items.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, FEMA has committed to building housing at this point?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner, did you hear the question? Has FEMA committed to building the housing?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. We've made a request for 1,000 units. They have not committed to doing it to date, and they say the reason they won't commit is because of the lack of infrastructure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Okay. So, Members, I think this is...just as Chair Lee requested for us to hold off on doing the affordable housing, I think on this particular case for CIP for Management, we need to hear what the Legislature is going to do, and then we can see the overall impact. So, if you don't mind, I'm going to ask that we lay this on its...on the to-do list in the future until we can get more information, okay? Okay, Members? Okay. Okay, so that is Grants? Page 40. Page 40 in Bill 60 are Grants for Management. Let's see what they wrote. Oh, it's just what we talked about. So, it is the State of Hawai'i Maui Wildfire Disaster Recovery funds at \$130,000,950 [sic]. So, I mean...so, Staff, that is a number that they're giving us. It'll get changed once we know the real numbers, but this just remains, right, so it doesn't...yeah, okay. It just is. Okay, Members, we're going to leave that there. And Special Purpose Revenues, Employee Parking Fee Fund on page 49, Managed Retreat Revolving Fund on page 50, and General Excise Tax on page 50. So, Special Revenue, page 49 and page 50. Okay. Employee Parking, this is the...okay. Any changes on that, Members, Employee Parking Fee Fund? That's where our parking fees, our

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

employees parking fees go. I don't see any changes. And Managed Retreat Revolving Fund, page 50, and that is...well, we know it's 12 and 12, so 24. Okay. General Excise Tax Fund, which is CC, there's 36,000 [sic] in there. When I did speak with Ms. Zielinski when she was Director...Acting Finance Director Zielinski when she was here, she said on Monday that she would be willing to take this up to 55 million. Okay. So, any motion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can you repeat, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, if you look at page 50, and you look at CC, the General Excise Tax --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: On page 50 in which?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, in the Budget Bill.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, and under the Revolving Fund...so, the Special Revenue Funds.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, look at page 50, and there is \$36,000 [sic]. And Ms. Milner, I guess, since we're talking through her --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 36 million you mean?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm sorry, 36 million. And she said she would be willing to take that up to 55 million.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I totally agree with that. Because if you just average the first three months, and then times it by 12, that's 55 mil.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Ms. Milner's here.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Just as a reminder, and this would not take the GET Fund to 55 million, it would take the GET to 44 million, and it would take the GET DHHL Fund to 11 million. We need to do that 80/20 split. I have been talking to Director Zielinski, and she does say if the body would like, she is comfortable going as high as 60 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wow. Okay, Members, is there a motion to change this? Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Can I make a motion?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Go ahead.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second by Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I make a motion --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We...we hear you. So, it's...it's 60 million for General Excise Tax Fund, and CC...and do we have to change DD also? We do have to change DD, okay. So, what does that go to? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So that'd be 48 million, plus 12 million for the DHHL. They get 20 percent of the 60 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Do I see a motion? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I made a motion --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- and --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is there a --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- Member Paltin seconded it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I totally agree with 55 million, and I don't have a problem with 60 million. I don't know why January reflected so lowly...low, but I understand a decrease in tourism, but there's an increase in all sorts of other things...construction, and hauling, and all the things. I mean, they just built a \$58 million school in three months. So, there's a lot of stuff going on that wouldn't otherwise have gone on that takes the place of tourism.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Ms. Milner?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Ms. Milner.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Actually, Acting Director Zielinski did reach out to the State about that. We had the same question. So, the January receipts were unusually low because the due date for GET is the 20th of the month. So, by the time the January receipts were received and processed in Feb...they weren't processed until February, so it was a delay thing. So, that's why it was so much lower for January.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Very good.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just to follow up on that, are we expecting to recoup that maybe in like December or June, that it'll catch up, then?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. My understanding is because the tax did not go into place until January, we...you know, the December stuff that wasn't recognized until later, they aren't going to acknowledge that for us. So, we're just kind of on that delay. But we think the large dip is a one-time thing for January.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And we don't expect to...we don't expect to catch up in June or December? Okay.

MS. MILNER: No, due to the delay in receipts.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you. Thanks for clarifying that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more discussion? If not, all in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, there's Chair Lee. So, I can't see everybody. Do we have eight "ayes," and Member Kama? Oh, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, are you there? I see her picture. Okay. So that would be seven...seven "ayes," and two excused, Member Rawlins-Fernandez and Kama.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you for that motion, Member Cook. Okay. So, Rates and Fees are on 23 to 24. Do we have even a change here on 23? Department of Management, Liquor Control, Management. Okay, there's the parking fees for the Department of Management, and that's it. Oh, yeah...oh --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- parking. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I wouldn't mind to do something to our parking fee similar to what they're doing at the parking garage. Like Member Johnson said, plenty people that work for the County don't make that much, the regular people. And at the parking garage, they have a low-income category for your parking. So, if...if we, the County, are not paying our employees a livable wage, I think they should get a discount on their parking fee to \$8.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, where would that be? Monthly employee parking shall be uncovered stalls...oh, what are all these Lot A-B, B-D, C, Lot E, Miyahira Building, which is next door.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I would move to add another category here at the bottom that says if any County employee makes 60 percent and below AMI, their parking fee shall not be more than \$8.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, it is page 23 on Rates and Fees, the Granicus version.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. I would add on maybe to the...to the end of that, on page 24.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. How is that administered? Does that mean you have to show your income to pick up --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Second for discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- a pass? Second for...what did you say? Second for discussion. Okay. Miss --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, my discussion would be like, you know, it's not much, but Member Johnson did point out that there's a big disparity in, you know, especially like clerks, Unit-3 employees, and the 9th Floor, or even this floor. I mean, our salary alone is...probably we'd qualify for affordable housing, but I'm not trying to get us a discount. I'm saying if you're making less than 60 percent for the County, and you have to pay \$25, or 45, that's kind of a regressive parking fee, and...and it's...I believe that's what was proposed for the Wailuku Parking Garage, so why should we hold us to a higher standard than the Wailuku Parking Garage? If we have people in the County that are making less than 60 percent AMI, I don't think they should pay the same as someone like us that is making like 70,000, you know...80,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, what is not listed here is the Wailuku Parking Garage. If you look at...Lot A is L-shaped, situated Kaohu Street; B is Well Street side of the Kaohu Street, Kalana O Maui Building; Lot C is covered parking beneath Kalana O Maui; Lot D is north side of Kaohu Street intersection; Lot E is situated at the Old Wailuku Post Office and then --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I'm...I'm not saying that it's listed here. It's listed wherever it's listed. It's listed somewhere.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think it should be listed here.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, you think Wailuku Parking Garage should be listed here?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we're talking about here, right?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You got to take that up with Ms. Milner.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Actually...okay. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I'm wondering if we could ask Ms. Milner. On the bottom paragraph here, after it lists all the different parking

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

areas that the County operates in facilities that are not owned by the County, but are leased, in situations where private parking facilities may be available for employees, the rate paid by employees for parking in those facilities shall not be the same rate...shall be the same rate charged to the County by the landlord. So, I'm not against making parking cheaper, but if...we would have to then subsidize the parking if we are leasing it. I can...it'd be easier to do it for us, but it would be good to know what parking structures or lots we own, and what ones we lease, and then we can adjust as necessary.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I agree. Friendly amendment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner. So, do you know what the Administration, what you're planning on doing for the Wailuku Parking Garage because it's not listed here, and we're having a discussion on it. It's up . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

MS. MILNER: Yes, Chair. The Wailuku Parking Garage is on page 49 of Rates and Fees. It's under Department of Transportation because that is not solely employee parking, that's the Park Maui program. So, that's why that's located in a different place.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MILNER: For Councilmember U'u-Hodgins' question, the listed lots here, A through E and the Miyahira Building, those are County-owned. So, those, we would...that's why we're setting the parking rates for those, so those, we could maybe control a little more. But you're correct. If we wanted to drop the rate in buildings that we lease where we are paying a set rate per stall, we would need to subsidize the cost.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Then to clarify, we don't currently lease any employee parking lots?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Councilmember U'u-Hodgins. We do have buildings where we lease spaces, where we're renting, but they...as it says, those are all covered by that last paragraph. They're not the ones that are listed specifically with letters here.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Good to know. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, what is your proposal, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: My proposal would be to add a line...my motion is that in parking lots that the County operates in facilities that are owned by the County,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

that we would have a low-income parking fee of \$8, instead of all the ones listed. If somebody is making 60 percent and below, that their parking fee would be \$8 in a County-owned lot.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, it's not only the Wailuku Parking Garage, it's anything, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, the Wailuku Parking Garage says low-income neighborhood parking permit, \$15. But if we can't raise Collective Bargaining, we can give perks to our employees that are making less than 60 percent.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, you heard the discussion. I wonder how...I wonder how you implement this. This is Department of Transportation.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, this is Management.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I know, but that's...who's going to be doing Wailuku Parking Garage. Okay. Any discussion? Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. So, a lot of our County employees also are in One Main Plaza, of which we don't own the building. I wonder if Acting Budget Director Milner can tell us what that parking structure is like. And I don't think we can do anything about that, but out of curiosity, so we can ensure that...for those people who work in that building who don't...can't afford parking either, what...what we can do?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ms. Milner.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Just out of curiosity. Thank you.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. We're checking on the rate right now, and I'll get back to you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay, Members, so we'll wait to hear back from Ms. Milner. I just want you to know, after this, I'm going to finish Management, take a recess, and then I want to take up Police. I want to try see if we can proceed...because look what time it is. We're doing so good, it's 3:00.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Um...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Well, we skipped two.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- I'm not ready for Police, but I am ready for Parks.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, whatever alpha. Okay. We hope we can get to Police. Okay. Ms. Milner, shall we just take a recess? Let's just take a recess. So, we'll come back at 3:20. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 3:08 p.m.
RECONVENE: 3:35 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee, it is now 3:35. Members, we're going to finish Department of Management. We're now talking about Rates and Fees for parking, and we can go back to that. And before we do, we do have Member Priorities on pages 42 to 44 in the matrix, and...yeah, okay. The motion on the floor is to do the parking fees for the...for this building basically, employees to \$8. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'd like to amend the motion and just make it free across the board.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. What about Management? Like, people who park and have reserved parking at certain places?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I can read you the text I received from Josiah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I was saying low-income, and he said to administer that is probably going to cost more than what the employees are saving. I've been advocating to make everyone free, but I'll support making low-income workers free, it would just be harder to administer to differentiate. We only collect 35,000 a year in parking fees, and only employees in Wailuku get charged. No other County employee--Kahului, Molokai, et cetera--gets charged to park in County-owned facilities. Seems like we are nickel and diming our employees when we have a hard enough time to attract and retain people. Few facilities we lease are short on stalls, like One Main Plaza, et cetera, and in those cases, the employees have covered their own, or parked on the street, et cetera.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. What happens at the new Service Center building? Does anybody know?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Apparently, it's free.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Okay. So, motion is free, except if you're in Management or a Director, those that have reserved parking stalls.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I didn't say that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . Okay. Okay. Members, did I see a...hear a second, or do we have a second? You seconded it, Shane Sinenci? All right. Any more discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I can't...I can't support that the way it is, the motion. You know, many of us have been on the waitlist for years, waiting for a parking space, so that's why we don't mind paying for it. So, I think there needs to be some kind of reservation, or at least giving those who have been waiting and do have a parking space reserved should continue that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I never thought about that part. You're right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I didn't mean that we would take away people's reserved parking. I just meant that it would not cost money.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. Then I can agree to that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it's administered in priority the way that you're waiting now, but just that there would be no fees, correct?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. When your name comes up, you get that parking stall.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you have to still register with whoever for that wait...waitlist. And we're saying for Directors, or those that have, you know, prime parking, I guess --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Councilmembers.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Councilmembers...okay. Okay. And what is...what is that? I don't even know if --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm just saying --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, everybody who --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- free, free parking.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, I support this for many reasons, but according to the Code that we actually...that is our Code, 10.77.020, Determination of Rates, it says it is the intent of paid parking to achieve the target occupancy rate of 85 percent. In our questions to the Department on April 10th, 2024, the...the response from the Department was "The Wailuku Parking Garage has been at around 35 percent capacity, and it peaks from noon to 2:00 p.m. at around 50 percent capacity." So, making it free is another incentive, and I think that's our goal, to make it about 85 percent, and we're not even there yet. And I know it's new, but this is a big bait on that hook. So, I full support. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Ready to vote?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yep.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think Tom Cook is not here, so excused would be --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, there's Tom.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, there you are.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it's eight...eight "ayes" and one excused, which is Member Kama.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Whoo. That’s good. Okay. Any other Rates and Fees? None.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, Ms. Milner has her hand up.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Milner.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Ms. Milner. Go ahead.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Now that you’ve approved that amendment, I would recommend you also amend Appendix A, Part II, Employee Parking Fees, to reduce the anticipated revenue to \$0.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second--motion made by Member Paltin, second by Member Sinenci. You got that? Yeah? Okay. All in favor, “aye.”

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 23, 2024

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook,
Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez,
Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, motion carries. Very good.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'd also move to repeal the fund establishment and deposit all remaining fees to the General Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, they can...we can fix the lights, and trim the coconut tree, and do those things. Okay. Member Paltin, and second by Member Sinenci. All in favor to repeal, right, what's in the fund and put it towards General Fund to be used for...in general. Okay. All in favor, say "aye." Oh --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Ms. Milner.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Ms. Milner wants to say something again? Yes.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. I would defer to Ms. Toshikiyo, but I think to repeal the fund would require a Code amendment, not just amending the Budget Ordinance.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ms. Toshikiyo?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez...Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Can we ask Member Paltin--or I can ask Member Paltin--if by repeal, you just mean to move the funding, or are you saying to repeal the fund itself?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We can do it in two steps. Take all the money and deposit it in the General Fund, and then have a Code to repeal that...have a Code amendment to repeal that fund. And so, just in...during this budget cycle, I would move to take that money and transfer it to the General Fund account.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ms. Toshikiyo.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Thank you, Chair. I'm sorry, I just wanted to double check because I missed part of it. So, the...we're looking at T., correct? The Employee Parking Fees Fund, that \$50,000 appropriation? I'm sorry, is that what you're moving --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: -- as a General Fund appropriation?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: As well as removing, you know, all the amounts...the balance --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: -- the fund to the General Fund?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Okay. But do the Code repeal later?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we got to put that on as one of the to-dos after Budget, yeah? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I guess I would be moving to \$249,837 to the General Fund, and I'll put in a PAF to repeal the Employee Parking Fees Fund, Chapter 3.26.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or I'll...I'll do that at a later time.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, that's going to be on our to-do list for after Budget.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Uh-oh, Ms. Milner.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Sorry to keep interrupting. I guess my question is if we're removing the conditional language for the 50,000 for the parking lot improvements, lighting, and security measures, and moving all of these funds to the General Fund, will we...does the body intend to increase Management's budget by approximately \$50,000 and add conditional language for parking lot improvements, lighting, and security measures there?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, I was just going to throw it into the General Fund and cannibalize it at a later date.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MILNER: Okay. So, there will be no funds in the FY '25 budget for parking lot improvements.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Correct.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MILNER: Okay. Thank you for clarifying.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And then, clarifying --

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yeah, sorry, Chair. If I could jump in? . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead, Ms. Toshikiyo.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Thanks. So, I'm looking back, 3.26--and then maybe the Acting Budget Director and I will have to discuss--because the Fund...the deposits that are currently in the Fund are still tied to the requirements for the use. So, it can only be used for providing funding for the maintenance, repair, security, safety improvements. So, I think that while this fund still exists, these deposits that are currently within the balance has to remain there until we take some kind of action to...you know, by doing the Code change. So, I think that...yeah. If we move the 50,000 would be appropriate, but sorry if I...I was not clear earlier or misspoke, but I think the remainder has to stay there because it's tied to the specific purpose of this fund.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, so I'll put that in the PAF then. When we repeal the fund at that point, then we can move it to the Management Department like Ms. Milner suggested. Is that what you're saying?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes. But I will talk to the Acting Budget Director, and then we can come up with a plan moving forward, knowing what your intention is.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: If you can give me just a second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So --

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I'll call her on the phone.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Can we get together with Ms. Toshikiyo then, to make sure that we take this the right process? Thank you. I see Member Cook's hand is up.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yes, Chair. I'm curious, what does this do to Park Maui program, if anything?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, this is not for that.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: For the Wailuku...for the Wailuku Parking Garage.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. It's only...this is only for the employee parking fees, and we're talking about at this building here only.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay, excellent. Thank you. I just wanted...to go on record and clarify that. Thank you all very much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Very good. Okay. Did we vote? Yeah. We got to vote, yeah? Okay. We voted on something. All in favor? Members say "aye."

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: So, to...to clarify, the motion on the floor, is that still Councilmember Paltin's motion to reduce the employee parking fees fund by \$0...to \$0?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: To \$0.

MR. KRUEGER: Delete the condition and move the funds to the General Fund?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think that motion was a little premature, because we have to actually repeal the fund first, and I'm going to have to do a --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: A PAF.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- Code amendment. So, then I'll withdraw that motion and...and take it up during the regular year, not during Budget.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. But we are going to repeal the fee and take it to zero, right, for this building?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We're going to repeal the anticipated revenues for Fiscal Year 2025, and I do see Member Rawlins-Fernandez's hand up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. So, what Ms. Toshikiyo explained, is the estimated balance as of June 30th, 2024 is \$242,756, which was generated under 3.26, under the County Code, and there's a restriction on how that funds can be used. As Member Paltin stated, the \$35,353 can be removed because that's anticipated revenue. So, we would...because we removed the fees, then we wouldn't generate that...that revenues for the anticipated FY '25. And then, I wanted to check with Staff because I...I thought we voted on...on removing the funding. And if so, we would need to do a reconsideration vote and then amend it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Did we vote?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

MR. KRUEGER: Currently the votes that we have noted right now, was one vote, 8 to 0, to make all the fees zero. And then, we also have a vote, 8 to 0, one excused, to reduce the revenue to the fund to zero.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, and that's what we can't do. So that would have to be reconsidered.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, just --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- the FY '25. Mr. Krueger, you mean the anticipated revenue for FY '25? The \$35,353?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

MR. KRUEGER: Yes. Apologies if I wasn't clear.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, we're good then.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so the balance remains though.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, that's our understanding.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then, that wouldn't be put into General Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I withdrew that motion.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The \$242,756 wouldn't be put into General Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It would remain in the Parking Fees Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. She withdrew that, so we're all good, right? We can move on? Thank you very much, Member Paltin, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, for clarification. Is there anything else?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Free parking for all.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Members' Priorities, 42 to 44 in the matrix. Where is this? Page 42. Okay. So, Member Cook. So, this is your priority for Department of Management, it's on page 42, General Excise Tax Fund.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. Do you want me to read it?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Make the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: \$20 million must be for funding for the acquisition of private water systems and wells to align with the Department of Water Supply's vision to integrate public and private water systems and develop a municipal water system. This --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, that's your --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- out of the General Excise Tax.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, that's a motion. I need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second, I hear Member U'u-Hodgins. So, motion made by Member Cook, second by Member U'u-Hodgins. And you want to say more, or have you explained it?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Pretty much explained it. It's open for discussion with the...with the body.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member...Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Here's a body. . . .*(laughing)*. . . So, do you have any kind of breakdown for the 20 million?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, I don't. It's just conversationally with the Department of Water Supply, I just...it's a budget for them. The wells that they're looking at, basically West Maui, there's Maui...Maui Pine wells...well...water system --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Excuse me. Excuse me, Tom.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Whenever Lesley appears, yeah, that means she has something to say that will --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- probably change our conversation, okay. And probably she's going to say that the Water Department is self-supporting. So, Ms. Milner? . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Chair Lee. No, actually, what I was going to ask if the body would consider it...if they would be willing to postpone discussion of any of their priorities for the GET Fund. Because we're still waiting to see what the State Legislature is doing, and the GET Fund may come into play with some of those projects. If the body would consider it, the Administration would really appreciate if we could hold off on discussion until we have more information from the State.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I...I have no opposition to that, and I think that it's prudent.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, you have no objections? So, we'll put this along with Affordable Housing on a wait.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do we withdraw?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yeah, withdraw. So --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I withdraw the first. How about my second?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Second was --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second was Member U'u-Hodgins.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I withdraw. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. So, we're not going to take that up, as well as 42 and 43.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I have one more.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Uh...okay. Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. This is the Budget Bill, this is Department of Fire and Public Safety. It'd be in Plan Review, Processing and Inspection, Revolving Fund, distribution for equipment is limited to 200,000 funding for the four vehicles. This is basically giving the Fire Department the four vehicles that we took out of the other budget per Department request, Number 137 in Granicus, move funding from index code 911412C, sub-object Code 7040, page 9 --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, Member Cook --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- dash 69 --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- I did this one already under Fire. I...I --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, that's already --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I already did it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: She...we did this one.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Oh, okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it's done. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So then, that's done. And then, other one we're going to wait. Okay. And mine was a GET one, so I'll wait on that too. So --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair Lee had one, I think.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Chair Lee was a Managed Retreat one. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. We're on Management, right? So, I have the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Page 43.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- the one...are we at the one that's a Professional Services Contract? Is that the one?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Index --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I don't think this is the Managed Retreat one. Did it...did you guys move it?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you have...you have...you have under...on page 43, Budget Bill, Department of Management, Managed Retreat Revolving Fund, up to 5 million must be for the Lahaina Community Land Trust.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, that's the one? All right. I move that we condition the Managed Retreat Fund \$5 million for the Lahaina Land Trust.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, Member...and second by Gabe Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I...I think all of you have heard all the reasons why we...we should do this because we need to ensure that the Lahaina lands stay with us to

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

the extent possible, and those...those lands would have had to be moved anyway further mauka. So, why not have it with a Land Trust that is looking after our interests?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more discussion? Seeing none. All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye." Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, I can't really see --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- everybody, but it looks like the only person who's not here is Member Kama. Here's Ms. Toshikiyo. Do you have any comments?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yeah. Sorry, Chair. I tried to raise my hand before you took the vote. I just wanted to refer you all again to Chapter 3.97. So, it...that...there's a requirement in there that the revenues in the fund must not be used for the purchase, acquisition, or rehabilitation of privately-owned property (*audio interference*) by affirmative vote of two-thirds of the Members of the Council by resolution. So, if the purpose of these funds are to acquire privately-owned property, I'm not quite sure how the program is going to work. But just to remind you that that's part of...one of the requirements in the fund, in addition to meeting all the...there's a list of purposes. So, as long as the...the appropriation meets those purposes, and...and if it does include acquisition of privately-owned property, then it would need to be approved by reso.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Miss --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: But we need to what by reso?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: When you were talking --

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yeah, there's a requirement --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- there was a portion where you went (*imitating audio interference*), so we didn't hear what you said.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Sorry. Yeah. So, I apologize. There is a...it's 3.97.020, subsection C., that says that the revenues in the fund must not be used for purchase, acquisition, or rehabilitation of privately-owned property unless it's been approved by an affirmative vote of two-thirds of the Members of the Council by resolution.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: *(Audio interference)*

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, you're going to get that assignment tomorrow, okay?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, actually we --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We can put that aside if you want, Chair, until we get that reso?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Let's take that --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Up to you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, let's...let's do this right. Okay, anybody else?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair Lee...and you had on page 19 some priority proposals. I...I didn't...I'm not aware if you wanted to postpone it or not, I'm not sure.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I think...okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's a little confusing. I don't mean add \$14 million. We're just going to use that fund to...to pay for Professional Services for a contract with a Maui-based architectural firm to design and register building plans for each of the six sizes of accessory dwelling units, per Maui County Code 19.35. So, it's not asking for 14 million, it's...it's conditioning that fund for the purpose of coming up with pre-designed plans that match the Code 19.35. That's what it's for. So, can I make that a motion? Move to approve? If you don't want it, that's fine.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You're going to move the 14,225,000, is that what you just said? Sorry, I was talking to Staff.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, we're going to use that fund to pay for the Professional Services...so, I...I'm not sure how much it would cost, maybe \$100,000, something like that.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You want me to pick a number? I can...I can do that, but I...it's not based on something that has been verified.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, what --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: But Lesley, she'll...well, Lesley's there, so she has probably a problem with that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead, Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Sorry, I just wanted to clarify because in looking at the priorities, it looks like the condition would be for the entire 14.225. So, are you saying you just want to add a condition that 100,000, let's say, must be used for a contract with an architectural firm?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes. Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

MS. MILNER: Okay. Thank you for clarifying.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Looks like you want to do 14 million. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, no. I could move it to the Affordable Housing Fund.
.. *(laughing)* ..

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ... *(laughing)* ... Okay. So, actually, your motion is to use 100,000 from the Professional Services --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- for contract with a Maui-based architectural firm to design and register building plans for each...each of the six sizes of accessory dwelling units; is that right?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Was there a second?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I don't know. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'll second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, second.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'll second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second, Member Cook. Okay. Any more discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I don't have any more discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Looks like we have eight "ayes," one excused, Member Kama.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook,
Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez,
Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Okay. Pass. And for mine, because I'm on the same page, page 19, under a condition for Department of Management, Office of Recovery, increase by 2 million, and add a condition for up to 2 million...2 million to be used for small business support for those affected by the wildfire. And I think that says the intent, small businesses who were impacted by the wildfire

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

can apply for grants through the Office of Recovery. Any...any questions, any discussions?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What would be the parameters of this type of program?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, for this, I was...I was trying to focus on the businesses that we heard that closed that were having fund...problems, you know, because of the challenges of no customers, or no buildings, or that their building, you know, burned down. So those...those would be the...the focus, the small businesses to apply for grants.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, like, I've had constituents call me that they've taken out COVID SBA loans, like maybe \$500,000 because during COVID, they sold off their inventory, like surfboard rental and beach chair shack. So, they...they sold off their inventory during COVID to local people. And then as they were making a comeback, they took out a \$500,000 SBA loan, with no insurance, and all that new inventory, and their store burnt down. So, now they have like a \$550,000 SBA loan, and no store, no inventory, no house, no way to pay back the SBA loan. So, would we be giving this individual \$550,000? And then he couldn't move forward with his business, he'd just be paying off his SBA loan, which my understanding is the only way to get out of that is either pay it back or die.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay, so I've heard those kinds of situations, which is very sad. I've have friends, right, who lost everything on Front Street, including some lives. Very, very sad.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: But what I was thinking of is, this fund would not be to pay off COVID loans, that...what you just described because that's immense. It's not really enough for that. But I was thinking at looking at \$25,000, \$30,000 grant range, which MEO has...has helped with during COVID, as well as MEDB, or even the beginning of this with the wildfire, which is what DBEDT and MEO has, you know...not MEO, OED reached out to those to...you know, to provide for some small kind, I guess, bridge grants. So, that's more of what I'm thinking. The...those COVID SBA grants of that magnitude is something that I tried to get the Federal Government to...you know, but that won't work.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, what would be the parameters? Like how much would be the max they could get to, what is the criteria? Like all that kind of things?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, I was thinking of a smaller amount of 25, \$30,000 grants for people that were impacted by the wildfire and their businesses were impacted, so...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't know if that would make a difference for the folks in my community, but...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you think it's too small? We had...when we...when OED offered this as well to OED, and DBEDT offered it to...with MEO and is...MEDB was the other administering nonprofit that did this, they had a lot of people interest. You know what? Put this aside. Let me get those parameters so that it can be better explained. Okay. So, I'm going to put this aside.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Member Cook...I'm sorry, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. You know, we were going so fast on...on Councilmember...or Chair Lee's proposal, I...I didn't write down the numbers. Can we go back and revisit that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I...but she's not here. But can you tell me? I'm writing it down here. What...what was the...the number?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 100,000 for Professional Services.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: The...is that a...where did we get that number from, Chair Lee? Where did the 100,000 come from?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee, did you get the question? Oh, it was for your --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I did, I did. I was just trying to unmute myself. I actually left it blank on purpose because I wasn't sure how much that it would cost, but it caused so much confusion, it was like, I'm asking for \$14 million.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, we...I picked the number of 100,000.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: If...if...there's only 50,000 left in the...in there for Professional Services, if I'm doing that correctly.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Uh...well, that's good information. Because that's why I keep saying at the very end, we can make adjustments.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. I don't mind making an adjustment at the very end, just maybe a point of information that there's only 50,000 left in there, if I'm correct. So maybe when we --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- we revisit that, we'll have that in our heads.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do you want to revisit?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And, um...I'm not sure if there's an architect out there that would kind of give us some feedback on that. Is 50,000...you know, what can we do with 50,000, so...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Well, we can check on it because this is pretty important.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You know, this will speed up the process of getting a permit.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's something...plans that are pre-approved can go through...just fly through.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair Lee, maybe you can talk with the Kasprzycki Designs. I know that they're working with households and making free plans for them. Maybe a few of those plans, they wouldn't mind to design register it for 50 grand?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: How do you spell that?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: K-A --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, how do you say that, then?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: [Kuh-spri-skee]. I know there's a Z.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: [Kaz-pri-skee], [Kas-per-skee]. Is it C-U?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: K-A...K-A-Z-Y-P-R-S-K-I [sic]? Kasprzycki?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. These are architects?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. They've been...they've been working with some of the families, and...and making plans for them. I think possibly somebody Kasprzycki grandfather passed away in the fire too.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh. Okay, thanks for this lead. I'll follow up tomorrow. Or maybe Member Cook knows who that is?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I know the name. I'm thinking these are not complicated homes. I mean, \$50,000 for five plans would probably be fine, but \$100,000 would be prudent. You're going to need to have the architectural drawings and the engineer drawings the first time they're all done, then in the future, they're only going to have to have them be updated. Nohe...Nohe has a lot of experience in this, so I'd like her to kind of weigh in.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Hi. Chair, I just emailed you some correspondence I had with Adam Kasprzycki, and we went back and forth. What they did was, at least for them specifically, they gathered people into groups for people who lost their homes in the fire, and then created a home based on the group's needs with similar needs. So, if you had a bigger family or a smaller family...and so they went from there. But typically, what you would do in a case where you're trying to get cheaper plans is go with just like a...a...a nonlicensed architect to draw the plans, and you have somebody kind of draw them up for you, and then you'd work with a licensed architect just to stamp the plans, and it's typically cheaper. So, they have like...like a design person--I forget what they're called right now--draftsman, thank you so much. So, you have a draftsman do it. You can work with them, it's a lot cheaper, and then have an architect stamp the plans, and provide you all the required building permit documents that they would need. And that's a lot cheaper.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. I'll try that.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Chair. And if we can just clarify that that condition. We didn't see it as a problem because under the B, C Account, the Department has the ability to shuffle their funding around. And so, the condition was that \$100,000 must be used for a contract. We didn't add any money to Professional Services or anything like that, so they just would be signaled to know they need to use \$100,000 of their operations for this contract.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thanks for the clarification.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Great. So, we'll need to revisit that then. Yeah, okay. So, Chair Lee is done, right? You got that?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm done. But I'm going to check the Kasprzyckis anyway.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, thank you. Okay. So that is all for Conditions and Priorities. And then, we need to revisit the...the Department of Requests' [sic] April 12th letter. Okay. So, in here under Management, page 14-12 of Budget Details, decrease 904051B-6317 by \$54,550, reduced due to removal of other revenue source, see estimated revenues. 54 million. Okay, 50 more million...54 million. Good. Then, page 14-21 of Budget Details, decrease 904051-...oh, 51B-6317 by 500,000, and move 500,000 funding to Office of the Mayor for the one-year commemorative...commemoration, right? That's where that money is coming from. And page 14(C) of Budget Details, increase 904011B-6132, increase by 100,000 because that is needed with the...the Department of Public Works. Additional funding will be needed to conduct the audit. So, those were the three requests from Management.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay, great. Any discussion? Seeing none, okay. Very good.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: My only discussion was we got to keep Josiah happy.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We really do. He's so awesome. Okay, anything else regarding Management? None. Oh, who's second? Shane? Okay, you need anything else? Okay. Okay, Members, are you all good with Management? As you know, there's things we're going to revisit. Oh, we didn't vote on that. Okay, all in favor, say "aye" on this last item.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, so we have eight "ayes," and one excused, which is Member Paltin [sic]...Member Kama. Done.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anymore? We have consensus? Do we have consensus on the Department? Except we're going to revisit the CIP, and we're waiting to hear, of course, for this meeting with Legislature, okay, as we heard from Josiah Nishita. Okay. Now, if you would allow, I would like us to try to take up Personnel and Prosecuting Attorney. We have...it's 4:14.

DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL SERVICES

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If you want to do Parks, I got...I got it on down for the wages, and we can go fast.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I think...let's do Parks tomorrow.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think that's going to be a deeper discussion because Personnel, which...oops...important...it's important. They don't have CIPs, they don't have Grants, they don't have Special Revenue purpose, as well as there's no Rates and Fees.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do you have a vacancy sheet for them?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I do not.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, wait, wait, wait, I do. Sorry, sorry, sorry. I do.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because I didn't get to Personnel yet.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Personnel has 10 percent, 25, or 50, right? So, their vacancy is...oh, is 215,000...I'm sorry...it is 18,326, for a 25 percent cut is 45,816. And 50 percent is 91,632. And with that one then, you would move half of 25 percent to Countywide, which would be 45,816. So, it's either a 10 percent cut, 25 percent cut, and/or a 50 percent cut.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess I'll move for the 10 percent cut plus fringe benefits.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That's 18,326.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, Member Sinenci seconds. Any discussion? All in favor, say "aye." Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That's eight "ayes," one excused.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is that correct? You see...who do you see on the screen? Is it eight "ayes"? Okay. Oh, Gabe is not here. Seven "ayes," and two excused.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook,
Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci,
and U'u-Hodgins.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

**EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmember
Johnson.**

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we are basically done because Prosecuting...I will say that Prosecuting Attorney has some equipment requests, but that is because of the mold and the problem that they're having. So, I'm quite sure we're going to want to leave it as is, right? Yeah. Anything else? Oh, they...okay. So, they have...let me get Prosecuting Attorney. Prosecuting Attorney. Oh, okay. These are page 21-9, Budget Details, 906156B-6124, increase by \$32,400, and this is for janitorial services for three rental offices per lease agreement. Page 21-9 of Budget Details, 916156B, as in boy, -6129, increase by 23,210 for electricity costs for rental offices, continuity...oh, continuing electricity costs for the Old Wailuku Courthouse. Page 21-9 of Budget Details, 906156B-6137, increase by 10,000, anticipated repair and mainten...repair and maintenance contract of the AC system at 115 Market Street per lease agreement. As well as page 21-10 of the Budget Details, 906156B-6235, increase by \$23,873, and this is additional costs for lease payment.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, thank you. Member Paltin moved, and second by Member Sinenci. All in favor? Member...oh, any more discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just giving them back the money we took away, pretty much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We have eight "ayes" and one excused, which is Member Kama.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Do we have anything else we need to do for Prosecuting Attorney? No? I hear ya. Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You want me to share my Parks cuts?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It'll make us end on a happy note if people are counting how much money we're saving.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you want to do Parks and just do A?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, ready? Okay. Let me take us to the page. So, we're going to finish Parks tomorrow when we pick up. Public Safety, Management, Management, the Mayor...okay, here's Parks. So, it is under Item 14 on page...Functions and Programs, page 17. Okay, here you go.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. On Bill 60, Number 14, Department of Parks and Recreation. Small a.(1)(i), Category A, Salaries, I move to decrease by 500,000, plus fringe \$416,200.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You want to...you have more, or you want to take it one by one?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'll...I'll go program by program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, Members, you heard the motion, right? Member Paltin, second by Member Sinenci --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- 500,000 plus fringe.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And I have discussion. Decrease in Administration program salaries is based on historical differences in adopted and actual amounts. Actual vacancy cost in the Administration program is 955,224, plus the expansion \$47,344 for the expansion positions, with the average length of vacancy for the 19 vacant positions being 444 days.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I hear voices. Okay. Anybody else want to add to the discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Main thing everybody else hears the voices, you're good.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(laughing)*. . . Getting late in the day. Okay. So, Members, just in my spreadsheet, that calculation is like a 50 percent cut, and...close to...mine is \$449,000, and yours is 500,000. Okay, Members.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And that corresponded to my half percent of their total budget.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: So, I'm supportive.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aye. Is this...okay, eight [sic] “ayes” and one...oh, Chair Lee’s not here, so two excused, Chair Lee and Member Kama.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook,
Johnson, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez,
Sinenci, and U’u-Hodgins.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmember Lee.

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, next.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Next, in small b.(1), Category A, Salaries, I move to decrease by 300,000, plus fringe \$249,720.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, motion --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For my discussion --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- motion by Member Paltin, second by Member Sinenci. Please proceed.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Decrease in Parks program based on historical information and the actual vacancy cost in Parks program is \$853,402, with multiple positions vacant for over a year.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. It’s 300,000, plus fringe.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: How much does that leave them as a cushion for hiring?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: There's 5.3 --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Let me do the math real quick.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- there's 5.3 million in there, Member Cook...the total.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, I...I understand. I'm just...I don't know how much their...what their actual payroll is, and the...I'm just...I'm supportive, I'm just curious how deep the...because we just cut the other one a lot...different program.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So that leaves them, in that category, \$553,402 for salaries for vacant positions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you for that information.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And for me, if...so, my understanding is if they want to transfer money from B to A, or from program to program A, they would just come before us as a resolution. And for me, I realize we're doing some deep cuts here, so I would gladly entertain that resolution right away to be able to have them hire people. I just don't have good confidence, after looking at this for the last five years, that we're going to fill all the positions. And in the vacancies, I didn't...for me, I didn't include any of the seasonal or summer hire positions' numbers. I just looked at the full-time year-round or half-time year-round positions. So, you know, for me, and I hope for all of us, if they come and asking for a transfer of salaries from one program to another, or from Operations and Equipment to the salaries, we just grant it to them because we know that we did do these deep cuts this year.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah, thank you for that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Thank you, Member Cook. Member Sinenci.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just for clarification, Member Paltin is not deleting the actual vacancy, but...and leaving the...the remaining money up to the Director to decide.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes, just cutting it off the top so, you know, whichever position comes up to be filled first, they can take money from that \$553,402. I just don't have good faith that they'll fill all the positions on July 1st, 100 percent.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, the E/Ps are still there, right? That's your question? Yeah, it is. Okay, you have one more?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, did we vote on that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry. Okay, all in favor, say "aye." Aye, Chair Lee? Okay, I guess she's excused. Chair Lee. Okay. That's seven "ayes"...oh.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair Lee, raise your hand.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee, you're voting. Okay. All right.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Member Kama is not here, so that's eight "ayes" and one excused.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **Vice-Chair Kama.**

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's hard to say she's not here, because we can see her. Okay. One more?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. For small c.(1), in Category A, I'm proposing a 900...or I...I move to decrease Category A by 950,000 plus fringe, which would be \$790,780, and in Category B, \$250,000. That's my motion.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Category B is 50,000...250?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 250,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, you got that? Okay. So, Member Sinenci did the second. So...all right. Members, we are on...Recreation Sports Services program is 950,000 deduct, with also the fringes. And then in Category B, 250,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You want my discussion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. Okay. Thank you. Decrease in Recreation and Support Services program is based on historical difference in adopted and actual vacancy costs for this program. The total is 1,899,398, so I'm just cutting roughly half of that. And the average length of vacancy for the 45 nonseasonal positions is 234 days. The decrease in Operations Equipment category is based on historical adopted versus actual, for both Fiscal Year '22 and '23 being in excess of \$1 million.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more discussion? Seeing none, all in favor, say “aye.”
I guess not, Chair Lee. Chair Lee? She is not there, so...and Keani’s not there.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, so we have, what, six? Oh, there...seven, and two excused,
which is Keani Rawlins...oh, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, and Member Kama.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook,
Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Sinenci, and
U’u-Hodgins.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

**EXC.: Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmember
Rawlins-Fernandez.**

MOTION CARRIED

ACTION: APPROVE

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, I included her. She’s talking to somebody. Okay. We got her
vote. So, this motion carries this. This motion passes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, there’s Keani.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: There’s Keani. Okay, great.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I have to leave. Do you need my vote?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, we just included you in a vote.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, no. I voted right now, but I have to take the food to the building.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, we want you to do that. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: See you shortly.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. All right.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's pretty good. She was voting, and working, and cooking her curry. Okay, are you done with Parks?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm done with Parks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, tomorrow we'll continue with Parks and do all the different categories on that. And then we'll see where we are with that...the Legislature and the Bill, and it'll tell us what we can do with the Affordable Housing Fund and, you know, the other programs that we moved aside until we heard more information. And including all the social services, the Human Concerns side too, we'll see the impact of the State Bill on that. Anything else that we need to do today? Okay. So, I'm going to adjourn this meeting. We have the public hearing tonight at 6:00 regarding Real Property Tax, which . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . we'll probably hear from a lot of people. And we'll see you tomorrow morning. Wait now. Well, yeah. Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, do you have a breakdown of what you want to cover tomorrow? Because I went through all my preps, and so I...I got to prepare something else, I guess, for tomorrow.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, I see that Keani...while we're looking for that, Keani...I don't know if Keani's still on, but she's at the Legislature, so I wonder if she has any updates for us?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, you didn't see her picture with Governor Green --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, no, I didn't.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- on his social medial website?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: In the meantime, you currently have slated Mayor through Police, and then, revisits to Housing, Human Concerns, and Management.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mayor to Police and revisit Housing, and Human Concerns, and Management. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Housing, Human Concerns, and Management. And we already did Personnel and Prosecutor, so we should probably just go ahead as we can?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, so the idea --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And partial Parks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- our goal is to see if we can finish by Friday.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Finish by Friday.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Finish by Friday.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, so just move along.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we got to move along.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And thank you very much, everyone. And this meeting is now adjourned. . . .(gavel). .

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

ADJOURN: 4:32 p.m.

APPROVED:



YUKI LEI K. SUGIMURA, Chair
Budget, Finance, and Economic
Development Committee

bfed:min:240423:kr

Transcribed by: Kaliko Reed

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 23, 2024

CERTIFICATION

I, Kaliko Reed, hereby certify that pages 1 through 151 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 3rd day of October 2024, in Wailuku, Hawai'i



Kaliko Reed