

# **BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE**

**Council of the County of Maui**

## **MINUTES**

**April 21, 2025**

**Online Only via Teams**

**CONVENE: 9:10 a.m.**

**PRESENT:** Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Chair  
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Vice-Chair (left at 3:16 p.m.)  
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member  
Councilmember Gabe Johnson, Member  
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member (left at 5:50 p.m.)  
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Member  
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Member  
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member  
Councilmember Nohelani U'u-Hodgins, Member

**STAFF:** Kirsten Szabo, Legislative Analyst  
Pauline Martins, Senior Committee Secretary  
James Krueger, Senior Legislative Analyst  
Peter Hanano, Legislative Attorney  
Carla Nakata, Legislative Attorney  
Yvette Bouthillier, Senior Committee Secretary  
Jarret Pascual, Legislative Analyst  
Clarissa MacDonald, Legislative Analyst  
Lenora Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk  
Ryan Martins, Council Ambassador

Residency Area Office (RAO):

Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros, Council Aide, East Maui Residency Area Office  
Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lānaʻi Residency Area Office  
Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokaʻi Residency Area Office  
Bill Snipes, Council Aide, South Maui Residency Area Office  
Clyde “Buddy” Almeida, Council Aide, Makawao-Haʻikū-Pāʻia Residency Area Office

**ADMIN.:** Lesley Milner, Budget Director, Office of the Mayor  
Tiare Horner, Budget Specialist, Office of the Mayor  
Marcy Martin, Director, Department of Finance  
Kari Stockwell, Administrator, Real Property Tax Division, Department of Finance  
Kristina Toshikiyo, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel  
Kristie Wrigglesworth, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

Yukari Murakami, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel  
Cynthia Lallo, Chief of Staff, Department of Management

**OTHERS:** Makale'a Ane  
Tom Croly  
The Royal House of Hawai'i  
Jasee Law  
Others (19)

**PRESS:** *Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

-----

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ...*(gavel)*... Good morning. Welcome back to Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. Today is April the 21st, and it is now 9:10. Welcome, everybody. We are at a very important part of our whole budget process, so everybody get ready to work hard and long hours. And thank you for all the work that you did, and thank you, OCS Staff, for bringing us here. At some point, if OCS could let us know what responses we have not heard back from, what departments, as I will tell you that if we don't have it here when we come to your department, the Members will make decisions with what they think they understand if we haven't received any responses, but we will hear. Okay. So, today...welcome. Okay. This meeting is being conducted in accordance with the Sunshine Law. And as a reminder, when your name is called, if you are not in the Council Chambers, please identify by name who, if anyone, is with you in the room, vehicle, or workspace today, and minors do not need to be identified. So, Member...Vice-Chair Kama, good morning.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Good morning, Chair. And aloha kakahiaka to my fellow colleagues.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Chair Lee, welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. So, the morning greeting is easy because it's from my grandmother's birthplace, Granada, Spain. Hola, que tal? No lo dinero. No more money. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You so funny. Hola. I guess we can...we can cut it short, right? Hola. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or hola. Aloha kakahiaka kākou.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Good morning Chair, Councilmembers, community members. There's no testifiers at the Lāna'i District Office, and I'm here and ready to work. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka kākou mai Molokaʻi nui a Hina. I am at my private residence alone here, and there are currently no testifiers at the Molokaʻi District Office.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aloha, Chair. And good morning all. And there's no testifiers at the Kihei District Office, and let's get on it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Member Uʻu-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER UʻU-HODGINS: Hola, everyone. Good morning.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Hey, aloha kakahiaka, and hola que tal. Here at the Hāna District Office. I'm here at the Mavis Medeiros, and there are no testifiers, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. From the Office of the Mayor, Lesley Milner, Budget Director. I think...are you doing these meetings online? I don't see you here in your corner. Director Milner? Is she online? She is? Yeah. Okay. Good. Director of Finance...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I see her video.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I see you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, she's there.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Good morning. We have Director Marcy Martin and Kari Stockwell with us today from Department of Finance; Department of Corporation Counsel, Kristina Toshikiyo, as well as Kristie Wigglesworth, and...from Corp. Counsel. Committee Secretary, Pauline Martins; Kirsten Szabo, Legislative Analyst; James Krueger, Senior Legislative Analyst; Jarret Pascual and Clarissa MacDonnell, also Legislative Analysts; Peter Martin [sic], Legislative Attorney--I'm sorry, wrong, wrong, wrong--Peter Hanano, sorry about that; Richelle Kawasaki is not here; we have Carla Nakata; and Lei Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk. Please see the last page of the agenda for information on meeting connectivity. And Members, thank you very much for attending this BFED Committee meeting today.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**ITEM 1:            PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2026 BUDGET FOR THE COUNTY  
                     OF MAUI** (BILL 41 (2025), BILL 42 (2025), BILL 43 (2025), BILL 44 (2025),  
BILL 45 (2025), BILL 46 (2025), BILL 48 (2025), BILL 49 (2025), BILL 50 (2025),  
Bill 54 (2025), RESOLUTION 25-83, RESOLUTION 25-89, and  
RESOLUTION 25-90)

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We have only one item on the agenda, which is BFED-1, Proposed Fiscal Year '26 Budget for the County of Maui. We will begin our discussion...decision process for Fiscal Year '26 Budget. Before that, we do have Department of Finance Director Marcy Martin here to give us a presentation on the RPT certification. We received the booklets last week, Thursday. Thank you very much. I think that's the first time I've ever had a book early. After her presentation, we will have public testimony, and proceed with questions and answers about RPT certification. For the public, we have it...we have it online on Granicus, it is 196 on Granicus. Once discussion is complete, I would like to have a discussion on the following, which are other revenues...revenues, including GET, TAT, and Fuel Tax, general budget provisions, and we can begin decisions to start. I'd like to discuss the following: OED residency area grants amounts...and amounts, Members' priorities, conditions, and general cuts. Then, I intend to take up the departments by the order they appear in the Bill 41, starting with the Office of County Clerk, and proceeding on as it is in Bill 41. We will discuss each aspect of the department at that time, starting with operations, then CIP, including Appendix C, then grants, revolving funds, rates and fees, any additional legislation pertaining to the department, and Members' priorities, if any. Once we are finished with Bill 51 [sic], we will review the additional legislation. Remember, my goal for today is to compile...is to complete all departments up to Environmental Management. We'll see if we can get there. At this time, I would like to invite Director Martin to provide her presentation on the Real Property Tax Certification...and again, it is on number 196 on Granicus. Thank you. Thanks for being here.

**DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE**  
**Real Property Tax**

MS. MARTIN: Thank you, Chair. So, on Thursday, the Real Property Assessment Division certified the valuation for tax rate purposes. Net taxable values were up 14 percent, and using the Mayor's rates and tiers, which included a rate reduction for the Owner-Occupied class and more favorable tiers in the Long-Term rental and Owner-Occupied class, the certified revenue was \$642,471,173, which is 10 percent higher than last year's certified revenue for the budget, and 1 percent lower than the levy in the projections in the Fiscal '25-'26 Budget. So, today, I have Kari Stockwell here, who will give you the presentation, and all of the real property materials have been loaded on the County website under Assessed Values. So, I will hand it over to Kari.

MS. STOCKWELL: So, the Real Property Tax Certification is available for download on the County of Maui website, mauicounty.gov, under Assessed Values. This presentation will be referring to pages from the 2025 RPA Certification Handout for Council and the 2025 Selected Statistics for Budget Consideration Handout.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin, do you have a clarifying question?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. I...I just wanted to clarify what we just got right now and what we have in the book are the same information --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Director?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- just excerpts.

MS. STOCKWELL: Yes, that is correct. It's excerpts from the book you received.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MS. STOCKWELL: Okay. So the...in page 1, the certified value for 2025 is \$83,728,058,230. The certified value represents gross assessed values, less exemptions, and less 50 percent of the values in dispute from appeals filed by April 9th for the 2025 assessment year. The certified values, multiplied by the Mayor's proposed rate and tiers, less estimated circuit breaker tax relief credits, and an adjustment for wildfire long-term rental exemptions, together with the minimum tax, produces real property tax revenue equal to \$643,580,411. This figure is \$6,808,212 less than the projected real property tax revenue in the Mayor's proposed budget of \$650,388,623. The difference between the budgeted real property tax revenue and the certified real property tax revenue is largely due to appeals and corrections made during the appeal period, which is from March 15th through April 9th. Pages 2 to 14 is the certification summary by land class. Page 17 shows net...shows net taxable values for the past ten years. These figures do not include adjustment for appeals. January 1st, 2025 values were derived using market data up to June 30 of 2024. Assessed values have been on an increasing trend since 2013, the exception being 2021, which included considerations for COVID. In addition to increasing values, new construction and subdivisions increased the net taxable value total. This year, the total net taxable value increased 14-1/2 percent. This increase considers wildfire losses, which exempted properties negatively impacted by the wildfires. And this page is page 18 in the certification handout. The total certified value is up 14.3 percent as well. These figures account for the 50 percent of value on appeal adjustment. Also, these are the figures used for budgeted purposes. So, the next slides are from the 2025 selected real property statistics for budget consideration handout. Page 3 from the budget is a summary by land class. The worksheet compares this year's certification to last year's budgeted real property taxes. Values increased in all classification for the year, the biggest being the increase in long-term rental properties. In this classification, parcel count increased by 940 parcels. This is due to Ordinance 5727. Page 4 of the handout shows the revenue source graph. This shows that despite the additions of TAT and GE taxes, real property taxes are still a significant portion of the County's income. The certified revenue graph, page 5 of the handout, shows that like assessed values, certified revenues have been in an upward trend over the past ten years.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Page...page 5 of the handout is...is different, but that was page 21 in the book. Oh, different book.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MR. HANANO: I think the --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I have it...

MR. HANANO: -- the page numbers are kind of mixed up.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I'm...I'm not following the page numbers that you are seeing.

MS. MARTIN: The page numbers are from the second handout online titled Selected Real Property Statistics for Budget Consideration. So, in your booklet, there's a hard plastic cover in the middle, and that starts the second handout.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. The...we only got one handout, but the second section in the book you're talking about. Okay. Got it.

MS. STOCKWELL: Okay. So page 8 is a GIS map of Council districts. For each district, the parcel's County...the parcel's estimated revenue, certified value, and an average revenue per parcel is shown. And page 19 of the handout is the current minimum tax. The current minimum tax is \$300, and a little over 7,500 parcels pay the minimum tax. Taxpayers are charged the minimum tax when their taxable assessed value multiplied by the tax rate is less than the minimum tax. Page 21 in the budget statistics handout shows that most parcels charged the minimum tax are low-valued, vacant land, which includes remnant parcels and parcels that are 100 percent farmed and are receiving an agriculture use assessment. Page 22 shows taxes under appeal using the proposed tax rates. As you can see by the graph, almost 50 percent of taxes under appeal come from the Hotel Resort class. As I mentioned earlier, the difference between net taxable value and certified value is an adjustment for 50 percent value on appeal. Page 25 shows some circuit breaker statistics. The number of applicants remains stable in relationship to last year. Ordinance 5681 was passed in June 2024, raising the thresholds for building value after a decrease in qualified applicants through the past years. Page 28 shows Owner-Occupied value bands. The net taxable value includes the \$300,000 home exemption deduction. 86 percent of Owner-Occupied properties are not subject to the Tier 2 and 3 tax rates, so they all fall in the Tier 1. Page 29 shows tax relief estimates. The home exemption is very generous. Page 31 gives long-term rental exemption statistics. This program has grown. Taxpayers appear to still need reminders to apply...reapply. The division has implemented its online application process, and it is live. The new process will send reminders to taxpayers who are in this program. Page 33 shows the impact of Ordinance 5727, Bill 147, which extended tax relief for properties that had improvements destroyed by the August 8th wildfires, or who are located in the yellow and red reentry zones. These value decreases were offset by market value and new construction increases to produce a certified value increase for the year. And then page 39 through 42 in the handout, a breakdown of assessments by value range for each of the different classifications. These charts can be used when deliberating on tiers. Thank you.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Are you done with your presentation? We must have testifiers, right? Yeah. All right. So, Members...thank you very much for the presentation. We all got the books early. It was a little bit hard to follow, but I think we got it. So, at this time, I'd like to provide wanting...oh, testifiers wanting to provide testimony should sign up with Staff, join the meeting online via Teams link, or call in to the phone number provided...noted in the agenda. Testimony on the budget is not limited to the department who presented today. And written testimony is encouraged and can be submitted via the eComment link at [mauicounty.us/agendas](http://mauicounty.us/agendas) as well. Under the Sunshine Law, the Chair will receive oral...oral testimony for agenda items at the beginning of the meeting and as it...as the item is called up. For individuals wishing to testify via Teams, please raise your hands by clicking on the raise-your-hand button, or if calling in, please follow the prompt via phone; star-5 to raise your hand and lower your hand, star-6 to mute and unmute. Staff will add names to the testifier's list in the order testifiers sign up or raise their hands. For those in Teams, Staff will lower your hands once your name is added. Staff will then call your name you're logged in under or the last four digits of your phone number when it's your time to testify. At this time, Staff will also enable your microphone and videos. Please ensure your name appears in Microsoft Teams as a name you would prefer to be referred to, or if anonymous...if you wish to testify anonymously, if you're in person, please notify Staff that you would like to testify anonymously. Otherwise, please state your name for the record at the beginning of your testimony. If you wish to testify anonymously, please notify Staff. Otherwise, state your name for the record at the beginning of your testimony. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes per item, and if you need to complete, you'll be given another 30 seconds. Once you're done testifying, or if you do not wish to testify, you can also view the meetings on *Akakū* 53, Facebook Live, or [mauicounty.us/agendas](http://mauicounty.us/agendas). We will do our best to take each person up in an orderly fashion. Staff, please call up the first testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the first testifier is Makale'a Ane, to be followed by Tom Croly.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning, Makale'a.

**. . . OPEN PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .**

MS. ANE: Aloha, good morning. Wau o Chana Makale'a Dudoit Ane, Executive Director of the Living Pono Project. I would like to testify in support of the local food purchasing incentive proposed by Councilmember Gabe Johnson, and also support funding for resilience hubs across Maui County. We...the Living Pono Project has been farming in Maui County for around ten years. We specialize in and promote hiring people with disabilities and disadvantaged populations, including Native Hawaiians, to participate in sustainable agriculture, as well as conservation in Maui County. And since the fires, we've...we set up a hub in Kahului to support individuals and families that have moved out of Lāhainā and have...and other individuals and families that have been impacted by the fires. And our main purpose is to give poi and culturally-appropriate nutritious food to people affected by the fires and other disadvantaged populations, so that we're not continually giving people Spam and saimin and canned foods, but really treating

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

people with respect and humanity and giving them nutritious food that's culturally-appropriate. And so, I'm really...and we've been hosting resilience hub meetings for every other week since the fires, and really want to make sure that all the communities are connected, and ready and able to respond, and stand up in the way that all of our entire community did after the fires, but do it in an organized and networked way. And so, I think Councilmember Johnson's proposal is right on point to make sure that we prioritize sustainable agriculture in Hawai'i, and also provide those foods to people that are most impacted. My only comments for the...I had some questions about the purchasing program. How do you balance reimbursements or incentives given to for-profit companies? Are...how do we regulate who is a local food purchaser or food producer? That was the biggest questions that we've had to...like mostly like certify if it's actually grown in Maui. I know when we do the Made in Maui Festival, a lot of work gets done to actually certify who's actually producing goods in Hawai'i, so that would translate over to this program as well. I think there would be a lot of oversight to just make sure that the food is grown here. And then also, how do you monetize the incentive? Are you reimbursing the entire price for the goods, or are you just doing 50 percent if they're selling it, or if it's being given away for free, are you incentivizing the entire purchase of it? So, those are just questions that I hadn't really seen or looked into for the purchasing program, but I think it's a very good first step to . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . prioritizing local foods here. And the last one--if I can get the 30 seconds?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thirty seconds.

MS. ANE: I know we...we did put in funding for resilience hubs in Kīhei, and I think Lāhainā, but if we really want to stand up a really great network, I think there should be hubs supported by the County in other geographic locations as well. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members have questions for you, and before I turn it over, can you tell me the amount that you're talking about?

MS. ANE: The...I would agree with the \$2 million for the food incentive program, and then match the same amounts for the resilience hubs for every geographic community so it'd be the same across the board.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. I see hands with Member Johnson, then Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Good morning, Ms. Ane. Thank you for your testimony. I really appreciate your support. I...I just want to ask you some clarifying questions in regards to your program. So, the Kahului hub, do you know like how many people you serve? Do you have an estimate of how many folks you are serving?

MS. ANE: Yep. We have...each family can walk in at least once a week. So, for the whole month, we service 500 families. So, they sometimes come every single week, sometimes come only once a month, but 500 families actually walk into our hub, and this translates to almost 3,200 individuals that we feed.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you so much for that clarification. We're going to put...you know, if everything goes out right, it'll be...this program will be administered by the Department of Ag, so just to clarify that. And then the food that you're serving is...is all from your farm, or do you guys work with others, or can you clarify a little bit of that?

MS. ANE: Yeah. So, a lot of the food comes from our farm. We have local eggs that we produce and other...bananas, and uala, and kalo, but we also purchase a lot of food from other...other local farmers. So, some of the grants that we receive and support through the Maui Food Bank, we're able to go through distributors that collect all the food, or we go...if...when we were funded by the Hawai'i Community Foundation, we bought it directly from the farmers. So, we can personally certify that these are local farmers...we know, we see that they're growing it onsite. It's just when the program gets bigger and you have a lot of people --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Sure.

MS. ANE: -- it might be hard to certify that. But the Maui Food Bank does a really good job at certifying who they're purchasing from.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's right. And I'm sure they'll be part of this program as well. Thank you so much, Ms. Ane. Thank you for your statements.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Paltin.

MS. ANE: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Ane. I was in communication with Baja (*phonetic*) about the moving of the hub funds from the Office of the Mayor to MEMA, and I just wanted to clarify. When you were saying about the locations and the geographic distributions, if you could confirm, she said that seven communities were promised to be supported by the County as the first phase resilience hubs for Maui in January and February of this year. And those include Nā Moku in Ke'anae, Living Pono Project two sites, Hāna Resilience Hub and Community Kitchen, Kaupō Resilience Hub, Leiali'i Resilience Center, Lāhainā Resilience Hub number two, and on Moloka'i, Kualapu'u Hub. And then there's others in Phase II. Is that your recollection as well? And so, is that why you were surprised when it said West Maui and South Maui?

MS. ANE: So, those are the hubs that we had discussed in partnership with the Office of the Mayor to identify different tiers of resilience hubs. Those that you labeled were the ones that are ready, were like on it, were already have locations, and were ready to move, so shovel-ready. And then there were second-tier sites that I...I think she provided to you as well, and we had discussed in our resilience hub meetings. So, but in regards to the...the surprise, I wasn't really surprised. I...and those are very key locations that are primed and ready to go. But there...those other sites that you listed are also right at the cusp of like being successful. If we can get a little bit of support from the County,

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

then I think it would be a better network that's established instead of just the...selecting the two locations. But any help and support with resilience hub and establishing them in Hawai'i before a disaster hits is...is very much appreciated, and I think moving it to MEMA is a very strategic move and really aligns it with being better prepared. And I think we have a great director there and great support. So, yeah, if...I think just for everybody's community, it would just be a level playing field across the board if all of your communities had funding for resilience hubs equally.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I...I did put an explanation in when I wanted to move it of what Baja kind of recapped, but it's--it's not necessarily a condition, but, you know, hopefully that MEMA continues to work with the Mayor's Office, the Resiliency Hub Hui, and the Resilience Hub Collaborative is...is the intention. Because MEMA is not tied to a political cycle, so not like everybody's going to leave at the next election...not that I'm saying that, but, you know, whenever there's a change in leadership or stuff.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Thank you very much. Any other questions? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Aloha, Ms. Ane. Mahalo for your testimony, and for your continued good work in the community. Okay. So, I have two questions. One regarding verification of local food sources. So, you said The Food Bank does a good job at verifying locally-grown food, produce?

MS. ANE: Yes. So, they're...they do go offsite and visit farms specifically to be able to confirm that they grow food onsite, and then intake them, and can put them in their vendor system, which is amazing and great. But they're also not supported at...they're very stretched thin, and so the amount of farmers that they can certify is...is not enough. So, they would, I think, need support to be able to do that. But at least they have the system in place, and they have the documentation that they can go out and visit sites. And so, I think helping them to bolster their operations would be a great, you know, one foot ahead, and already had started the system, and they already have that down. The other thing with food-purchasing programs for the distributors, like Kula Produce, whatever the other distributors that we work with, they have said that they need a DOH placard for each farmer that they buy from. So, the bigger farmers, okay, that's fine, they...they do it already, but it's really hard for the smaller farmers to have all of the necessary steps to go through the DOH process. And so, that's just another thing to keep in...in mind when we're talking about certification, and...and the impact it would have to small farmers if we...if we set certain standards.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that caution. I appreciate those details. And then my last question. So, we don't...as Councilmembers, we don't get to see each other's proposals until it's been submitted. So, I'm not super familiar with what Member Johnson has proposed. One of my proposals is to provide grants for farmers cultivating canoe crops, nui, ulu, and kalo. I support, you know, sustainable production, but...and specifically canoe crops for a healthier diet, which is what you testified to. And so, I guess in...in providing grants specifically to those crops, do you see that having a benefit to your program and other programs?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MS. ANE: Oh, absolutely. I think starting off with our...our main staple crops that we have in Hawai'i that are really the basis of our culture and our identity is key to cultural survival, as well as feeding people's spirit, and mind, and body. If we have...you know, we need people to start eating poi again because that's literally our connection to 'āina, and our connection to the stars. And so, it's...you know, you have triple benefits, quadruple benefits, than just, you know, providing funding for...for local food, but also culturally-important food that has many benefits beyond just growing it here in Hawai'i.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Absolutely. And...and poi has gotten so expensive, and so it's become almost out of reach for a lot of our people. So, mahalo for that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Any other...any other questions? Seeing none. Nice to see you. Take care. Next testifier.

MS. ANE: You, too. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Next testifier.

MS. ANE: Aloha.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Tom Croly, to be followed by the Royal House of Hawai'i.

MR. CROLY: Aloha, Council. Tom Croly, testifying on my own behalf, as always. I hope that you each got the testimony that I sent in last week and had a chance to review it because in my three minutes here, I have no...no chance in...of getting through that...that testimony. But if you did get that testimony, I...and have questions for me about it, I would appreciate that. I want to start by...by complimenting the Real Property Tax Department on this report that they have prepared for you. There is no document, absolutely no document, that you get within Maui County that is more informative than the report that they give you here. I refer to it multiple times a year, and the presentation that you just got from Kari didn't do it justice in any way, shape, or form of all of the really great statistics and information that you can get out of this...this report. So, I...I urge you to dig into it deeply and...and answer all the questions that...that you might have. The...the County Council has used real property tax rates to support policy that...that they want to try to support for years now. And this report helps you kind of figure out is...is that...that...those rates working? Are they supporting the policies that you want? Of course, the first policy that the Council has long supported has been low property tax rates for our residents, okay? And with respect to most of that, you've done a great job. There's 149 residents--and you know who they are--who you are not doing a good job with respect to that, okay? You're discriminating very badly against

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

those...that 149 residents who live full-time in their homes, but we won't go...go any deeper into that. I do want to point out that 8.3 percent of total real property tax comes from resident housing, and 83.5 percent comes from visitor-accommodation housing. The other 9 percent comes from all other type businesses that are on the island, but that is most significant, the...the amount that's coming from visitor-accommodation housing. Another policy that you've tried to initiate in the past few years with respect to the tiers is progressive taxation, that is, taxing more to the people who can afford it, more higher-priced homes we're going to tax in...in a more severe way. And that certainly has been successful in the Non-Owner-Occupied class and in the Short-Term Rental class, where I calculated that in the third tier alone, you...you generated an additional \$26-1/2 million more with the progressive taxation that you...you had there. However, let's be honest about it. We are not using that policy in the Owner-Occupied class. Raising the top tier to \$3.20 or whatever is nowhere near using that policy in place. And...and you're only generating \$1.5 million of additional taxation in the Owner-Occupied class and the . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . Long-Term Rental class. Oh boy, I have so much more to say. That was...I got 30 seconds, right? So, the...the one really, really egregious thing I wanted to point out here was, the Long-Term Rental classification allows someone who has a very high-value house to get a huge tax reduction by saying, hey, I have someone staying in this house long-term. And if that house is, let's say, a \$40 million house, okay, and they have someone staying in an 'ohana on there, the difference can be huge. And there...I found one property, and it's not alone. There's...there's about . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . 53 properties who get this kind of reduction, who's getting \$148,000 tax reduction because they have a long-term resident on there. So, I ask you to try to...try to address that. I have more to say. I hope you have questions for me. I...I...I did conclude my testimony with five recommendations that I...I hope you'll take into account for...for taxation this year. And thank you for the opportunity to give testimony.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Mr. Croly. We knew we would hear you...from you today. So, just...can you expound on your...that last item? So, the long-term, and the opportunities, and what would you recommend?

MR. CROLY: Sure. Thank you. So, with respect to the Long-Term Rental exemption and classification, I think that it's fine to give that in the first tier, and to some degree in the second tier, giving you a break. In the third tier, where you have to decide where your break is going to be, I don't think that there should be any kind of reduction in that tier if you are really following your goal to have progressive taxation. Okay. So...so, I would remove that, and that might address these really egregious abuses of it. And...and don't get me wrong, the taxpayers are not breaking the law in any way, shape or form. They're...they're taking advantage of the tax policy that you put forward. But to give someone a \$149,000 reduction in their taxes because they have one person, you know, or one...one unit being used for long-term rental, doesn't make any sense. So, my recommendations, in general, are that the tiers should be consistent among all categories. I...I think that it was...it was horrible for the Mayor to recommend the tier in...in Owner-Occupied and Long-Term Rental, the first tier, to go up to 1.3 million, but then leave it at 1 million for the other categories that are tiered. They should all kind of follow the same...at least for that first...that first classification. So, I would raise all the

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

tiers to 1.3 million for the first tier. The second tier, I would make a bit broader than...than what we currently have, and I would have it go from 1.3 to \$5 million. Now, for the properties in Tier 3, over \$5 million, I think that the rate, whatever rate you choose, should be consistent across all categories, whether...whether that property may be used for short-term rental, whether that property be used as an owner-occupied, whether that property be used for a long-term rental, because that would be consistent with your...with your goals of...of progressive taxation. And let's recognize that the folks in Owner-Occupied still have the circuit breaker to...to protect them against excessive taxation. So, again, I would...I would recommend raising the...the rates in the third category, but only having it apply to values over \$5 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. CROLY: And...and then finally, the...there is a problem with apartment taxation. Across the way from me is Wailea, and there is a lot of apartment...unimproved apartment land over there. And I know that nobody's going to like it when they decide to build on it, and those are luxury homes that they're building on it. But the way we're taxing right now, that vacant apartment land is being taxed at one of our lowest rates, \$3.50 per thousand. So, you got to break out the...the land values...the...the vacant land values in Apartment from the lower rate you're giving to people who live in apartments that are...you know, apartment complexes already built. That's...I don't think there's anything you can do about it right now in rates --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. CROLY: -- but it's a policy. Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, thank you. I saw other hands go up. Was it Member Paltin? Did you have your hand up? Or did your question get answered?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It was Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. It was my hand, but Mr. Croly ended up answering my question, but I can ask it again. Well, I can ask it, and then see if there's a different answer. Aloha, Mr. Croly. Mahalo for your testimony. So, circuit breaker, I don't know if it would protect those in Tier 3 because it says if you qualify for a homeowner exemption, and real property taxes exceed 2 percent of your gross income, you may be eligible for circuit breaker tax credit. And so, those that are in Tier 3 wouldn't necessarily qualify, is my understanding. My question--and you can comment on that comment as well. My question is regarding Tier 3 in Owner-Occupied. I agree, and that it should be higher as the progressive . . . *(inaudible)* . . . structure that it was set up. And what I heard you say is that it should be the same rate across the board unless you were meaning the same threshold across the board? My question was regarding the Tier 3 rate of Owner-Occupied. If...I looked in...I looked at your email, and it didn't have like a recommended amount, so I was just curious.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MR. CROLY: Thank you for the question. The circuit breaker is actually very complicated as to who...who gets it and who doesn't. And it doesn't matter how expensive the value or how high the assessment is as far as who gets it. What...what does come into play is what the person's income is. And I believe that a cap was put on the...on the amount that the circuit breaker can give. So, if you got too severe with the rates, there would be a situation where someone with a low income would qualify for circuit breaker, but the amount that they would get, the amount of credit they would get, would probably not cover the increase in taxation. So, there could be some people who...who would be hurt there. But most of the folks that would be in Tier 3, I would expect that...that...that many or most of them are going to be high-income individuals who can afford the higher taxation. But...but...but the whole point of circuit breaker is to protect low-income owners whose value has gone up because basically the land has gone up in value. And they could be hurt by...by a higher taxation. A deeper dive needs to go into that to see just who that might be, and how severe they would be hurt. But my recommendation for Tier 3 was to keep the rate that you choose, whatever rate you choose for Tier 3, the same in all categories. It would be the same for Short-Term Rental as it would be for Long-Term Rental, as it would be for Owner-Occupied, as it would be for...I forget what's the other category in there. Anyway, point being that...that once you get to that level, once you get over \$5 million, the use kind of doesn't matter if...if progressive taxation is important to you. You...you...you want that...that taxation to be that. I recognize that's pretty severe, and you're probably not going to choose that, but...but it's...it's almost a joke what's happening today, where the...the rate...the third rate in Owner-Occupied is only \$3.10. That's...that's not consistent with what your...with what your policy is.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Croly. And I found it. It's 3.48.810, and the household income cannot exceed \$126,000.

MR. CROLY: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Mr. Croly. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. CROLY: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any other questions? Seeing none. All right.

MR. CROLY: All right, guys. I'll be back tomorrow with more. Aloha. Have a great day.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is the Royal House of Hawai'i.

ROYAL HOUSE OF HAWAII: Aloha. I'm here to testify, and I think the only people that should be getting these exemptions...or actually, the only people that should be getting these exemptions by right by law is...I don't know what real property is, but I'm pretty sure

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

it's the royal patent properties, the allodial land tenants, because it shows you the number with the Land Commission Award already. Because America and the illegal state manipulated our tūtū guys' royal patents and went go turn them into tax map key, yeah. It says them in every single house paperwork. They got to call the beneficiaries by right by law to find out who are the descendants of that land, and it's called a title search, as all of you guys should know. And it's easy to do, and you guys need to call up all the beneficiaries of every single ahupua'a, 'ili and moku, of those decisions that are being made on those areas about development, whatever. Or if there's no person connected to that parcel, you got to connect all the beneficiaries of that ahupua'a and the moku, no matter. And everybody has to follow Kamehameha III's constitution and all his laws, and...and if not, that's...I don't know because...yeah. Yeah, the only people that should be getting these exemptions again is the royal patent heirs and descendants, and round them all up, got to, got to already. And we already supposed to be doing that right...by right by law already, but we not. There's no discussion with any of the heirs, descendants, whatever. And all Hawaiians stand up because we are the walking royals, literally. And they teach us in school that they have end the royals for the land ownership, but we the walking royals.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Are you done? We lost you.

ROYAL HOUSE OF HAWAII: Oh, e kala mai. Yeah, I...I don't know what else to say because frigging, we got to round up all the beneficiaries, period, point blank, got to. And it's the allodial land tenants that should be having these exemptions, and got to get them back on the line. Because us Hawaiians, we know...and we know all the problems...we know all the solutions to the problems that is happening over here. That's why with ahupua'a, everything, they trying to put us in one neighborhood and we no can even take care of the rest of the ahupua'a, no more water in the gulch over there, all dry. But thank you so much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

ROYAL HOUSE OF HAWAII: God bless you guys. [*Spoke in Hawaiian*]

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. Any questions for the testifier? Seeing none. Thank you very much. Next testifier, please.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, there's currently no one else who has signed up to testify. Oh, I see someone approaching the podium.

MR. LAW: Thank you. Is that Clarissa? I recognize that voice from somewhere. Aloha Pō'akahi. That's the Hawaiian word of the day, that means Monday. [*Spoke in Hawaiian*] o Maui o wau Jasee Law. Mahalo, Finance Department, for the presentation. That was worth coming in this morning. And yeah, thank you, Mr. Croly. I'll try to dig up that previous report that you were talking about. I didn't want to come into work this morning. And even councilor (*phonetic*) from Lāna'i had second thoughts after last Thursday. So, thank you, everyone, for working for the County. I knew...I knew you'd be here one way or another, Mr. Johnson. So, thank you also for the AO for

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

the Food Incentive Program. I'm not sure if you're going to get to Solid Waste Management today, Chair. But then something else came to my mind with the previous testifier about the...the...they say Kingdom of Hawai'i...I forget, Royal House of Hawai'i. And then that got my mind to turning to the churches. I don't know how many people here yesterday knew that it was Easter, Jesus is alive, he rose after three days, all that good stuff. And Easter is probably, with Christmas, one of the best days for the churches to get money. And...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Testifier, please stick to budget.

MR. LAW: Money?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: What's in our budget.

MR. LAW: Right. So, there's a...in the Taxation Department, that's what we're talking about today, right? Taxes? There's something in there about the religious exemption. It's really hard to get information from the County because there's...all the departments are separated, and if you don't have a car running back and forth, it takes up a lot of time. So, I like to get a lot of...my information here in the Chamber. And...yeah, I'm still...I just wanted to put it out there that all the churches are...well, see, it's hard to put them all in one lump together because there's some good churches, some bad churches, and it's hard to put them in tiers. But I would just like y'all to pay attention after you get done up with all this money stuff once again, put it on your schedule to see if there's some way we can get...the way I see it, they're draining away the taxpayers' money, and then they complain that they don't have any money to pay the County taxes. So, there's got to be some way we can all work together and figure out . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . some way to make the churches pay their fair share.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any questions for the testifier? Seeing none. Thank you. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, there's currently no one else who signed up to testify. Would you like me to do a last call?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, please.

MS. MACDONALD: If somebody would like to testify in the Chamber, please let Staff know, or on Microsoft Teams, please raise your hand. This is final call...three, two, one. Chair, it appears that nobody wishes to testify.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Members, seeing that there are no more testifiers, I would like to ask your permission to close public testimony and receive written testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

**. . . CLOSE PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .**

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE**  
**Real Property Tax**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. All right. So, now we're in deliberations for RPT. So, I'd like to begin discussion, and please use this opportunity to request any necessary information from Finance on their tax tier proposals. And we'll do first round of questions with three minutes, and second round of two minutes, if appropriate. Member Kama, Lee, Paltin, Johnson, Rawlins-Fernandez, Cook, U'u-Hodgins, Sinenci, Sugimura. Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, I'm...let me see. I'm trying to find the page that I'm on. It doesn't seem to have a page number here. But it's the page with all the classifications on it. It's a green page. It follows right after the...the page with all the...the chart, with all the tall charts and all the different colors. Sorry, I don't have a page number.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is it page 1?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And so, this is...this is the...I'm sorry. I'm trying to find a page number --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, is it...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- to...to refer to, but I can't seem to find it. I was trying to describe it. But anyway, there's a green page, and then there's an orange page. They follow each other.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And it has...looks like the same information on it. So, I just wanted to know what the difference was between these two pages, the all-green and the all-orange. It looks like maybe it's the fifth or sixth page in from the Real Property Assessment Division.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Department, do you...do you see it? And can you direct us to the...is it page 17 and 18?

MS. MARTIN: Tasha, are you referring to the rate...the tax rate comparison by County?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes. No, not that green one. It's actually our tax rate sheet. It looks like our tax rate sheet.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Does it have a title, Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: It just says class...classification FY '21, '22, '23, '24, '25, '26. Then it has the Time Share, and all the \$14.60 going across, the Non-Owner, all the tiers. And that's in green. And then just...the next page under that is orange. And I wanted to know what the difference between...

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think it's page 7.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah, it would be somewhere around there.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is it this one? And then the next page has an orange...orange --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- graph, yeah?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes, the orange graph. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, that one...that one says Maui, Honolulu, Hawai'i, Kaua'i. So, is that what yours says, Keani? It's a tax rate --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The orange?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- comparison by county.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. The orange has the Maui, Honolulu --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- Hawai'i, Kaua'i.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. That's page...that's page 2 and page 1. Sorry, I said 7. It looked like a 7 for a second.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. That's pretty much where I'm at.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, it's the tax rate sheet. So, it's the second part of the book, page --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- 1, and then page 2.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Now, ask your question.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You're welcome.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thanks, Keani. This is page 1 and 2 of the second part of the certification booklet. Department, did you get the question, or find the page and where we are? Yeah.

MS. STOCKWELL: We have found the page, and I think I understand the question. So, the differences between the charts --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. STOCKWELL: -- one and two. So, page --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MS. STOCKWELL: -- 1 is a tax rate history starting from Fiscal Year '21, just a breakdown of all the tax rates that have --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MS. STOCKWELL: -- been in the past. And then page 2, we also give a comparison of all the different counties. So, Honolulu, Hawai'i, Kaua'i, and Maui, and how we kind of compare by each county.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, when we compared it by county, what did we find out?

MS. STOCKWELL: In certain classifications, such as Apartment, we are lower than Honolulu. In Commercial, we're a little lower. We just like to illustrate where we stack up compared to the different islands. It is a little harder because some of our classifications are different on all the different islands. For example, they...Honolulu has the Residential A, Hawai'i has the...you know, they...they do have --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

MS. STOCKWELL: -- different tiers and different classifications. So, it's just a --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

MS. STOCKWELL: -- comparison by county, so...to illustrate what they do versus what we do.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, our...are our tax rates, when you look at this graph, lower than the counties, as we've been told?

MS. STOCKWELL: So, the graph is just the tax rate over time that...for only Maui County from 2021 to --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MS. STOCKWELL: -- 2025 to 2026.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. So, what's the purpose in putting the graph here? The orange graph, just for us to take a look-see, and see how our tax rates differ?

MS. STOCKWELL: Correct.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, there's some use to this. Okay. I get that. Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. Those are good questions because obviously, if you look at Maui, the tax rate is so low, \$1.88 per thousand. And even Kauai is \$2.59. O'ahu is \$4. Big Island is 5.95; is that correct?

MS. STOCKWELL: Correct, yes. You're looking at the chart correctly.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: There's kind of a big imbalance here. That's one note. The other question is...by the way, there's so much information over here. I don't know how anybody can remember what page, what color, what...you know, whatever. But when you talked about the \$7 million as a result of the certification, in...in deficit in a way, I don't know what you call it, deficit, but anyway, what page is that one on? Because I saw a page. And then after we get to that page...unless you already know it. So, how many property owners were successful with their appeals, and how many were not? So, how many people appealed?

MS. MARTIN: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. MARTIN: So, the appeals for this fiscal year were lodged by April 9th. And then beginning in June, we'll start hearing appeals. But if you look at...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, the appeals are for the last...last fiscal year?

MS. MARTIN: Okay. For the appeals for the last...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, no, the 7 million is for when? 3/15 to 4...4/9.

MS. MARTIN: So, those will be heard in...starting in June, those appeals. So, they haven't been heard yet. They've just been lodged.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I see. And how many appeals are there?

MS. MARTIN: Okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, could...

MS. MARTIN: The number of appeals was...you can see that on page 24. It's 1,009. And then we also have our appeal results from the prior year is on page 30 under Board of Review hearings.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: How many is that?

MS. MARTIN: So, we...we had 851 appeals last year, and we were lucky enough to prevail in most of those, which resulted in 5.1 million in additional revenue. That was for the prior . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . fiscal year. However, the hotels then escalated their appeals into Tax Appeal Court. So, then we would have to re-hear those.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. I'll come back to that because I ran out of time. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you, Chair Lee. Member Paltin, then Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Finance. You know, in comparison to other counties, you don't...you only compare the rates and not, like, what the properties are actually assessed at because...I mean, properties on Hawai'i Island are assessed a lot lower, and I think even some of the hotels on Honolulu. So, in raising the rates, they pay kind of comparable. Would that be a true statement?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

MS. MARTIN: Yes. The taxes are a combination of assessed value and rate, and then also the exemptions. So, if you wanted to compare taxes paid, this chart wouldn't be a good chart to look at. That's just purely the rates.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And...and it's kind of reflected that we have the highest exemptions amongst the counties. Is that like our assessed values are, generally speaking, higher amongst the counties?

MS. MARTIN: I can't speak to that off the top of my head, but the...if you go to the City and County of Honolulu real property tax page, and you go to reports, they give the certification for all four counties, and I think it goes back to the '80s. So, you can...if you wanted to dig in and look at what the average assessed values in taxes were, you could do that quite easily.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Cool, let's dig in. And then the last one I had, the statement that was made, the different in...difference in what was projected and the certification was largely due to appeals and corrections made. But you said we won't be taking up appeals until in the future. So, can you clarify how the corrections were made that affect the certification on the proposed budget? I...I wasn't clear on how that sausage gets made.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sausage was made. Go ahead.

MS. MARTIN: Chair? Thank you. Okay. So, the period...so we mail out assessment notices on March 15th. And until about April 1st, we have what's called an informal appeal period. And that's why we highly suggest that people call our office if they have questions. At that time, if we discover that we have made a mistake, we can fix that mistake, and then we re-notice the taxpayer. So, those are generally...they made a mistake on the high side, so that will reduce the net taxable value. Then for appeals, the certification takes your gross assessment, it reduces it by the exemption . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . so it comes up with a net taxable value. Then it considers appeals lodged. So, it reduces the certified for tax rate purposes value by 50 percent of the valuation on appeal. So, that's where that reduction comes from. So, if there are more appeals or larger appeals, it's going to reduce --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The revenue.

MS. MARTIN: -- the...the certified --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or projected revenue.

MS. MARTIN: -- valuation for tax rate purposes. So, it assumes that we would lose or win 50 percent of the appeals.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, like if we were to just bump it up to \$100 in the third tier, you could bet everyone would appeal, and then we'd have to hold back 50 percent...and we really wouldn't be generating the revenue that we thought we would?

MS. MARTIN: Well, the...the appeals are just value. You cannot appeal your rate. So...and the appeals are done. So, they might appeal the following year, but they wouldn't be able to appeal their rate for this fiscal year.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So, appeals are assessed value, not rate. But it would affect it in the future. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. Member Johnson, followed by Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you...thank you, Chair. One of the things this year, as you know, Director, is I'm going to be pushing for ag tiers, tiering our ag...ag rates. I'll give you some numbers of what my thinking is, and I'd like to hear some feedback, but I also have some questions if you're okay with that, so... We...we're certainly considering three tiers of agriculture, right? Tier 1 would be from...up to 3.3 million at the rate of 5.74, which is presently exactly what it's at. Tier 2 would be from 3.3 million to 8.5 million, and we would use the number from Conservation, which is \$6.43, the same as Conservation. And the top tier, Tier 3, which is less than 10--I'll give you the number of actual parcels--but that is \$8.35 at Tier 3 from 8.5 million and...more than 8.5 million, at \$8.35. And the reason why is that's \$1 less than the Big Island ag rate. So,

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

we considered...some of the data you gave was very useful comparing to other counties, and the Big...where you'd be \$1 under Big Island ag rates. So, those are kind of the...the ballpark numbers. You know, of course, we're going to discuss this with the Members, but I'd like to hear the Department's opinion on using this kind of...what say you, Director?

MS. MARTIN: Thank you, Chair. Well, first of all, once you've decided on your tier ranges, you will need to request for the Real Property Assessment Division to do the calculation for you because it's...because of that adjustment for the 50 percent on appeal, it has to be done at the parcel level, and then everything summed up. So, that is going to be my advice to everyone, is that...double-check your calculations with us.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Yeah, we got to be correct. So, the Tier 3, just FYI for everybody, it's only six parcels we're discussing. You know, that's the very large landowner, very well...well...well off. And I...you know, they...we're talking about off-island folks that don't, you know, live here. And the simply amount...the one thing that's really interesting is the total ag use and dedicate. There's so much of this land that isn't dedicated to ag, and they're not use...they're not farming it. So, we give them this very low rate, and they don't dedicate the land. So, that's something that I'm certainly considering when I'm looking at the...the rates. And the last question I have for you, Director, is why are cultural reserves being charged at Ag rate? That's something that I found in the research. Is that true? Can you . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . explain on that?

MS. STOCKWELL: Do you have any specific examples that we can see?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: In my research, I found some. Maybe I'll have to do it in writing and get back to you, but...

MS. STOCKWELL: Yes. Please do it in writing, and then we can get back to you and give you better details.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MS. STOCKWELL: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you. My time's up. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Great. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Aloha, Director and Ms. Stockwell. Mahalo for your presentation, and mahalo for joining us at the Maui budget hearing. I know that the residents really appreciated you being there, and speaking to the RPT assessments, and answering any questions they had. And I look forward to welcoming you to Moloka'i soon so that our Moloka'i residents have the same opportunity to meet with you too. Okay. I wanted to ask a question about the assessment...or not assessment, the...oh, what is it called? Okay. So, the...our rates for Owner-Occupied,

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

for example, a property assessed at \$500,000 pays \$360 in RPT, which comes out to .07 percent. An Owner-Occupied property valued at \$20 million would pay \$60,335 at FY '25 rate. And so, that comes out to .3 percent. Non-Owner-Occupied, \$500,000 assessed value would pay \$2,935, and that's .59 percent. The Legislature...or some legislators will often criticize the counties for charging such low property tax rates, which has become attractive to those wanting to just buy up properties and leave it vacant. Will you please speak to how other places kind of aim for like 1 percent of the assessed value to generate their revenue?

MS. MARTIN: Chair? Thank you. So, if you...if you Google, you know, the national tax rates...and when we survey, the...the tax rate kind of in the middle is about 1 percent of assessed value. That's the effective tax rate across the country. And we don't have the calculation here, but I think overall, we're at about...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. MARTIN: Of the assessed value, we're at about .7 or .8 percent. So, we're a little under the 1 percent for our overall tax rate. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . And I think when the State looks at our rates, they just look at the Owner-Occupied, they don't look at all of the taxes. So, I think when we compare to the other counties, I think we're quite high in terms of our average tax per parcel. It's just that because we have the classifications, and the tiers, and the tax relief, you know, there is a low side, but then there's also a high side. Does that answer your question?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Kind of. I...I broke it up by property value to...to highlight not just...like the overall property tax revenue that the County brings in, but specific values, such as the \$20 million property that pays .3 percent of an effective tax rate after doing the calculations of our tiers. And so, I heard the bell, so I'll...I'll stop there, and I'll come back around on my second round and then I can ask a follow-up question. Mahalo, Chair. Mahalo, Director. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Thank you. Next we have Member Cook, followed by Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Thank you both for being here with your expertise and helping us through this process. If you refer to page 1, tax rate history, and then it'll...we'll...afterwards, we'll refer to page 2, tax comparison by County. Commercial and Industrial have both been constant since FY '21 to FY '26 with no increase. And then cross-referencing to the other counties, ours appears to be the lowest. I understand from your previous statement that it depends on the value of the property and the rate, so it isn't...this tax rate comparison isn't exactly accurate. But could you give me some feedback on why those two categories are that rate, and that they haven't changed over the last several years?

MS. STOCKWELL: So, that would be a policy decision based upon, you know...

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. So, thanks. So, if I could ask for clarity...so like Costco, Walmart, Home Depot, those shopping centers, those would all be Commercial?

MS. STOCKWELL: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And...

MS. STOCKWELL: Or Industrial. Some of them are Industrial as well.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Some of them are Industrial. But they would sort of straddle either one of those?

MS. STOCKWELL: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Do...offhand, would you know what like the Costco parcel's appraised at? It doesn't matter how much money they're making, the gross volume, does it? It matters basically the valuation of their property.

MS. STOCKWELL: Correct, it's based upon assessed value.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah.

MS. STOCKWELL: I can look if you want me to and --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...

MS. STOCKWELL: -- find out the assessed value. Yeah, I can look it up on the website if you'd like us to.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Well...okay. Do you have any comments on consequences of...or opinions of increasing those?

MS. STOCKWELL: So, actually, through the last...from Fiscal Year '21 to '26, some of the rates, actually, for Commercial and Industrial have come down from 6.29 to 6.05, and 7.20 to 7.05. So, we have...it has been lowered from Fiscal Year '21 to '26.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. I do see that. So, actually, they've been lowered.

MS. STOCKWELL: That is correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And so, possibly because...

MS. STOCKWELL: Again, it's a policy --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And there again, it's a policy...policy decision.

MS. STOCKWELL: -- decision.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. That...that's all my questions right now. Thank you.  
...*(timer sounds)*...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Perfect timing. Thank you. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. Real quick, the...for...thank you for being with us. This book was amazing. It's so much information. I don't know how you guys are able to have this all in your brains just floating. I would...I always like look at people and assume how they file all the information in their heads, and what kind of like file storage people have literally in their brains, and how they recall information. This is impressive, if you can recall it the way you do. For the City and County of Honolulu, can you please describe where I can find that information that you were kind of talking about, where we can compare everybody else's information? I'm curious. Because they don't like have Apartment. Only us and Hawai'i County has Apartment, and ours is taxed completely differently as what Mr. Croly was saying. But that's an aside. That's more out of my curiosity. My question really is, what's the home exemptions for the other counties? And...let me see, where is...on page...on page 19, where we look at the exemption amount, for quite some time, it was at 200,000. And then for the last few years, it's been at 300,000. But our assessed values have, in my opinion, gone up exponentially, but our...our exemption hasn't. And I know that we have the most generous exemption. However, when you consider our assessed values, it maybe doesn't always line up. So, what do you think about having some sort of incremental exemption as we have these increasing assessed values?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Department?

MS. STOCKWELL: Okay. So, on page 27 of the handout, the budget consideration portion, so the second half --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

MS. STOCKWELL: -- we do have a breakdown of the --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you.

MS. STOCKWELL: -- amounts for the home exemptions.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, I didn't see this. This is what I mean about how do you store all this data. Okay. Okay. We do have the most generous. I do see that. But I think that goes back to why I wanted to see the assessed values. Can you tell me how I can find it on the Honolulu City and County website? It's not that easy to find.

MS. MARTIN: Okay. So, I think if you go to...is it Real Property Tax?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MS. MARTIN: And then...

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: State Reports?

MS. MARTIN: It's State Reports, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you. And I know right now we're talking about real property tax, but I think we must remember that those of us living in Hawai'i, obviously, we have all sorts of taxes. This is just one. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . And this one might be considerably low, but nonetheless, it's just one. Like we had to do our State taxes, right? That was six days ago. That's when we all had to do our taxes. Our rates for sewers went up. Our rates for waters went up. We have GE taxes. We have GET taxes. We have...we are a very high-taxed state. And while this is something that is quite low, it's not a bank account we haven't tapped into just yet. Obviously, we are and we have been, but I think we need to look at it cumulatively. I just listened to this whole podcast on Freakonomics and how people drip pricing, and --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .*(phone rings)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- and it's cumulative. It adds up, and it adds up really quickly. But I'm done on my little rant. Thank you, Chair. That was great timing.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Was that Tamara's alarm?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sorry, George. George was calling.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. So you might have more time, Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: No, I heard the bell.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you did?

MS. MARTIN: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. You have something?

MS. MARTIN: Yes. Tax incidence is extremely important to consider for your policy.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. MARTIN: Tax incidence is very important to consider for your policy, and that is a reason why we try to preserve the filing of the State of Hawai'i income tax prior to receiving the home exemption, so that everyone is on an equal playing field for their tax incident. I know that comes up every year, and...you know, people who just move here are mad because they can't file for the home exemption. But when you look at it, the program as a whole, what people are paying, you know, in all areas of State of Hawai'i taxation,

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

that's an important aspect. And it's also another important aspect to bring up to the State legislators, that we are the only County that makes sure that they are paying their State of Hawai'i income taxes prior to giving them tax relief.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you so much for that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. And mahalo for the presentation. I guess my question was to Mr. Croly's point, Director. Do you know how many short-term rentals are in the...in the different tiers of the Non-Owner-Occupied?

MS. STOCKWELL: There should be zero properties in short-term rental in the Non-Owner-Occupied class. They should all be in the --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, because they would...

MS. STOCKWELL: -- TVR/STRH classification.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Got it. So, they would fall under that one. Okay. Because to his point, I was wondering how...majority of those, are they valued above a million dollars, Director, for those short-term rentals in the Tier 1?

MS. STOCKWELL: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Do you see that a majority...majority of them are below or above the million dollars?

MS. STOCKWELL: So, if you look on page 40 of the budget considerations, we did do value bands. So, up to a million dollars, there's about 5,300 parcels, and there's about 12,500 parcels in the TVR/STRH class.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Would...so, lowering it, would it capture...okay. Page...I'll...I'll take a look at page 40. Okay. And then, Director, do we assess the different tiers using either the median or the average of the values?

MS. STOCKWELL: Again, that would be a policy decision where you want to place your tiers. We haven't...in the past, it's about 85 to 90 percent are in Tier 1, 7 to 8 percent are in the next tier, and about 2 percent are in Tier 3. But again, that is a policy decision.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. And then we could...I'm just trying to see if we could be...like the different tiers could either be at the median versus the average values. Yeah?

MS. STOCKWELL: They could be.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you for that. Thank you, Chair.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. So, I have a question, again, Mr. Croly brought up. It's kind of interesting, right? He's talking about property owners who have multimillion dollar homes, they have a long-term rental, and they're able to then lower their taxes. So, do you have a comment regarding...it's going to be a policy decision, but he's talking about the range. Do you have a thought on it?

MS. STOCKWELL: Again, I think that would be a policy decision. You know, we do have the value band starting from page 39 to 4...where is that?...about 42 that can help guide you in decision-making policies.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Page 39 through 40 [sic], on that second...second section, correct?

MS. STOCKWELL: That is correct.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I will look at it. We...oh, I'm getting can we have a timeout? Can we have recess? Is that what you want? Are you guys fine? I still have more rounds of questions, so perfect timing. Okay. I'm going to call us back at...what do you need, like, 10:45? Is that good for you guys? . . .(gavel). . .

**RECESS: 10:37 a.m.**  
**RECONVENE: 10:55 a.m.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .(gavel). . . Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It is now 10:55, and we are on round two of questions for RPT. It is almost 11:00, and I'm trying to break for lunch at a, you know, reasonable time. Well, one Member has to leave by noon for important...no need? No need. Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No, noon-ish. Noon-ish.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Noon-ish. Noon-ish. Okay. That's important stuff. I know. Okay. So, this is two minutes. Member Kama, Lee, Paltin, Johnson, Rawlins-Fernandez, Cook, U'u-Hodgins, Sinenci. Go ahead. Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you, Chair. Thank you. So, this is for Finance, and what would it take to give the total assessed value by tiers for the tiers that was suggested by Tom Croly?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Got that?

MS. STOCKWELL: Thank you. If you can put that request in writing to us, we can get that to you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Kama, you...you...

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You're done. All right.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Lee? Member Lee is coming back. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...I kind of was discussing a little bit during the break, but I did want to get it on record about, you know, this stack of papers in response to Member Johnson's question. There's ag use and nonag use, but it would all be taxed under Ag class, is what you're saying, whether it's in ag use or not ag use?

MS. STOCKWELL: Yes, correct. They would all be taxed at the Ag classification. Right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then if there was a house on the ag land, and say somebody wasn't living in it, the whole property would be taxed at Non-Owner-Occupied?

MS. STOCKWELL: That is correct. They would be...go...go into that Non-Owner-Occupied tax classification rate.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And if they were living in it, then the whole entire property, whether there was farming going on it or not, would be taxed at Owner-Occupied?

MS. STOCKWELL: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I guess previously, I thought it was just the house that would be taxed at Owner-Occupied or Non-Owner-Occupied. But then if it's ag land with a house on it, is it still assessed as an ag property, or is it assessed as a Owner-Occupied, like a residential property, like the assessing of it?

MS. STOCKWELL: It would be assessed among comps similar to it. So, with a residential property on top of it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because I mean, like, if I had a residential property on ten acres, I imagine the assessed value would be quite higher than a residential property on 3,000 square feet. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . .

MS. STOCKWELL: I guess location...would...it would depend upon location and what type of property. So, we would have to do some research if you wanted to compare the two.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, is it okay to ask that question in writing?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Yeah. Can...you got that question in writing? Okay. They got it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Johnson? We're doing two minutes, yeah? The second round. Thanks.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Chair, I'll be quick because my question has been answered. I want to thank the Department for joining us today. You know, when we decide...like a lot of the responses are going to be it's a policy question, policy's responsibility. One thing this body should consider, Members, is that Governor Josh Green's tax cuts are now going to be starting in effect this year, right? Largest tax cuts, income tax cuts in...in our State's history from 2024 to 2031. So, State taxes will be cut pretty, pretty heavy, as well as the Federal tax cuts that we know are going to be coming down the pike, right? I know rich are going to get a lot of tax breaks this year from Trump...the Trump tax cuts. So, in that context, that's the water we swim in, Members. And I just want to add that. Thank you. No more questions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Rawlins-Fernandez, followed by Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay. So, I want to get this question out of the way. For appeals, our process is to set aside half the value of the appeal...of the value of the appeals that come in until it's resolved. After it's resolved, for any money that's not spent on, you know, paying a property owner that may have won the appeal, does that money get recognized as Carryover/Savings for the next fiscal year?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Department?

MS. MARTIN: Thank you, Chair. So, if the County prevailed above what was budgeted, that would be unbudgeted revenue for that fiscal year. And if it wasn't spent, yes, it would be Carryover/Savings in the following year.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for saying it much more concise than I did. Okay. So, I wanted to go back to my questions in the first round. And I know not everywhere, you know, in America does property taxes the way that we do. And every...you know, and I think after going to IAAO with you folks, one of the really striking things that I learned was that only Hawai'i and Delaware or somewhere has home rule regarding assessments. The . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . American states have the state central assessments, and...and so we're unique in that way. In Chicago and the surrounding suburbs, their property taxes, their effective tax rate, ranges between 9 to 13 percent. And the surrounding suburbs is like 5 to 9 percent effective rate. And that has served as a deterrence for offshore out-of-state buying up of properties. And just to clarify, I'm not proposing increasing the rates on anything below like to \$5 million. But those with like \$20 million properties really need to be paying more. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you very much. Followed by Member Cook, U'u-Hodgins, Sinenci, and then Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Thank you to whoever wants to answer. The TVR short-term class count by value and Council district, in South Maui District --

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What page is it?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- there are...oh, I'm sorry, page 40. Thank you. Greater than 15 million, there's 25. Are those, like the hotels, that have CPR'd? I'm curious how many, or if you're familiar off the top of your head with the types of properties that are over \$15 million that are CPRs, are those more like hotel-type things, or are they houses? Should I put it in writing?

MS. MARTIN: No. So, per Maui County Code 3.48.305, hotels are defined. So, there could be some smaller operations. I think it's less than...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I guess maybe I'm confused.

MS. MARTIN: Could be, but...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I was thinking that one of the challenges with putting tiers in hotels was that it was inspiring them to CPR.

MS. MARTIN: So, they wouldn't be...those properties wouldn't be in the TVR class. Those properties...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: They're still hotels?

MS. MARTIN: Yeah, they would still be --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

MS. MARTIN: -- in the Hotel class.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, we just have...

MS. MARTIN: But there could be some smaller hotel-type operations in the TVR class. Hotels have eight or more lodging or dwelling units, and employ more than 20 full-time persons. So, if someone only had six units, and only employed two people, they would be in the TVR class.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. I guess because I was just...there's, I don't know . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . maybe 40 units that are over \$12 million. So, I just wanted to know if we targeted those more higher units with a tier, or with a rate, who would it be affecting? I can put it in writing. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Department, do you --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: My time's up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- have an answer?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MS. MARTIN: Well, there's no need to put that in writing. They're just going to be property owners who own these very expensive properties, you know, probably oceanfront.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, they could just be oceanfront properties that are transient vacation rentals?

MS. MARTIN: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member U'u-Hodgins, followed by Member Sinenci, then Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I feel like I have so many questions that are more curiosity, like, oh, this is interesting, than like real budget questions, but to keep it strictly budget-related, majority of the claims for appeals, they argue their classification; is that right? What...they argue their value?

MS. STOCKWELL: No, they're mostly arguing value.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: And how does that...like, what is their main issue? And then how do we...what is our argument to defend against it? Because you said we won, like, 50 percent, and what do we do? How can we, like, I don't know, cut down on some of the appeals, if possible --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- without just giving away classifications?

MS. MARTIN: Well, we don't really look at it as a goal of cutting down appeals, because it is people's right to appeal.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Sure.

MS. MARTIN: And we want to be correct. And appeals serve as important oversight, if they're not frivolous.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

MS. MARTIN: So, first, like I said, between March 15th and April 9th, you call us, we talk --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

MS. MARTIN: -- we give you all of our data, you give us your data...and at that point--if we agree to disagree, at that point, you can file your appeal. Then you make your presentation to the Board of Review, and then we make our presentation. We say we

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

use these sales to value your property, and then that independent board then makes the decision. Then if the taxpayer or the County doesn't agree with that decision, then we can escalate to Tax Appeal Court. But it's a very...well, it's not fun, it's a very important process, and it's a due process --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Sure.

MS. MARTIN: -- for the taxpayers.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: And their main issue is just the valuation of their property . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . which they're being taxed at?

MS. MARTIN: Chair? Well, you can also appeal denial of an exemption, and you can appeal classification. So, you can appeal the different aspects of your assessment, and some of those items are...are law, you know, it's a yes or a no, but then when it comes to valuation, you know, it's appraisal.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Okay. Thank you. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member Sinenci, followed by Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. And I...and I think I heard you say that the majority of the appeals were from the Hotel class, and I do see on pages 43 and 44, you have the...the different hotels. Are you...and it looks...can you explain the percent of levy, and are you comparing that to other hotels similar to our municipality?

MS. STOCKWELL: So, page 43 and page 44, we're referencing the top ten real property taxpayers and their assessed values. So, as you can see, ocean resorts, villas, vacations, the timeshare, they pay the most in property taxes, and that would be just their assessed value divided by the taxes would get their percentage of levy. And again, you can see that their assessed value, they're the highest in the assessed value as well.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you. And then are you comparing some of these hotels to, say for instance, in City and County of Honolulu, as far as rates and stuff?

MS. STOCKWELL: We could, but not currently, no.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Is there anything I should be taking out of...there's a lot of information here, so I'm just kind of wanting to see what kind of readable information we could get out of...out of these two pages, if there are any.

MS. MARTIN: Thank you, Chair. So, this is just general information. . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . It's just letting you know who our principal taxpayers are, and as you can see, almost all of them, except for number ten, is more than one parcel.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Got it. Okay. Thank you for that. Thank you, Chair.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Chair Lee, two minutes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. You mentioned some of the reasons for the successes with the appeals, what are the reasons for our losses to the appeals? And don't tell me it's a policy decision.

MS. MARTIN: If...if value is reduced on an appeal, that means that the taxpayer prevailed, and it's not an all-or-nothing. The final value is decided by the Board of Review. So, yeah, just the taxpayer was able to provide evidence that convinced the Board of Review that they were over-assessed.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Is that the 1,009 cases, or was it the 851?

MS. STOCKWELL: So, the 1,009 is the amount of appeals that are for this...the next fiscal year, '25 to '26, and then the 800, that was how many...how many we prevailed in for the last fiscal year.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, so there were 1,600 appeals, and then 851, we were successful? You said 50 percent, so if there were 851 for this current...I mean, '24/'25 --

MS. MARTIN: Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- you only gave us 5,000 numbers --

MS. MARTIN: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- I was just checking on one of them.

MS. MARTIN: Okay. So, those are appeals that resulted in unbudgeted revenue that we won. That's where that 851 came from, and the, was it \$5 million. But some of those appeals are now in Tax Appeal Court.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. No, but...no, my question was, 851 appeals represents 50 percent or 100 percent of the appeals filed? . . .*(timer sounds)*. . .

MS. MARTIN: So, the 851 are just the appeals where we won unbudgeted revenue for. In all, we had much more appeals.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Because you said we were running at 50 percent, right, of wins and...wins?

MS. MARTIN: Chair. So, the Code provides that we make adjustments for 50 percent of the value on appeal. So, in other words, it reserves the revenue based upon us winning 50 percent of the appeals.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you very much.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MS. MARTIN: So, we would net zero . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I didn't understand a word you said, but...but I'll tell you what, I'll check with you privately. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Great. All right. So, that was our second round, and I'm going to assume that we got our questions answered. And Members, by 4:00 today, any of you may have any recommendations for what the real property discussion's going to be, can you submit it in writing to OCS Staff so they can compile it? And any other questions you might have? I'm going to defer this. We can always come back to it --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- maybe. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I don't understand what your request is for us to bring back to the Committee.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, any...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: What are you asking us for?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: If any of you have--like Member Johnson's talking about, he wants to have different tiers for his RPT--to submit it in writing so that the Staff will get it and compile it. It'll be then transparent for everybody to have, and we will trans...transmit it to Real Property Tax so they could, you know, have any thoughts. They can...we can discuss it. We are going to probably discuss this on Friday when...after we go through all of Bill 41, and whatever bills, and we start talking about, you know, what the impact of the taxes are going to be to our budget that we're trying to pass. So, today by 4:00, if any of you have RPT rates...oh, I'm sorry, tiers that you would like to suggest. The rates will happen once we get our...done with our budget. So, please do submit it to our OCS Staff, and then they will compile it and submit it to Finance for further discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, to clarify, you're just asking if we have different ranges, to submit that to the Committee after we return from our lunch break...just the...the ranges, not the rates?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we won't know rates. So...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And we're not going to discuss it, we're just going to submit it in writing, and then transmit it to RPT for them to prepare?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that clarification.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. So, no other questions. So, Members...thank you very much, RPT...oh, Member Paltin has a question.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If somebody CPR'd ag land, and they built a house on each of the CPR'd ag lands, and the...so one is a one-bedroom, one-bathroom, whatever; and the other one is a five-bedroom, five-bathroom, whatever--and it says on here that the building value on the five-bedroom, five-bathroom is zero, and it's included in the ag things, is that...something is wrong?

MS. STOCKWELL: So, it could be new construction that hasn't started yet.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: From 2020?

MS. STOCKWELL: Oh. We would need to look at that then if we don't have that building on our...accounted for.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean, it's...it's in MAPPS that it was built, but under the building value, it says zero. And then it says the one-bedroom, one-bathroom is Owner-Occupied, but the overall parcel has an Occidental, California address.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You probably want her to submit that individually.

MS. STOCKWELL: Yes, please submit that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I'll...I'll...

MS. MARTIN: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

MS. MARTIN: It doesn't need to be submitted in writing. If you have a question on a parcel, you can just email our office, and we'll look at it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I...I think I emailed you the first portion of it, but as I dug deeper, there's like some more additional concerns.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Are you...any more questions, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's it. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. All right. Thank you very much, Real Property Tax, you...you're amazing. This booklet is amazing, lots of information. So, thank you very much again. The community, it is on Granicus, and you can find it online. And if you

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

have questions, you know, call RPT. What is your phone number? You're very accessible.

MS. STOCKWELL: (808) 270-7291.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. And yeah, I also appreciate that you made yourself available to come to our residency area meetings, and you even helped us clean up, so thanks a lot, Kari. Appreciate it. Thank you very much, Marcy. All right. So, thank you very much, RPT, Finance. Awesome job. So, Members, I wanted to know if you had anything to discuss regarding Trans Accommodation Tax...TAT, GET, or Fuel Tax. No? Okay. I did want to...okay. Member Cook first, and I just want to bring up TAT/GET.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, could you clarify that, if we had questions about the GET, those taxes?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, if you want to discuss it. If you...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. Well, I was curious...like it's estimated, and is that going to change at all? Do...are we going to get any other information to work with that? It seems like it's been, last year, kind of --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Carryover/Savings.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- I won't say lowballed, but the estimate was low. It came in quite higher, and that seems to be funds that could be incorporated into our ask.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So Dr. Seth Colby, who came to talk to us on March 31st, our first day of meetings, and he...he sent to us a letter...we sent him a letter asking him about the GET/TAT estimates that the Administration gave, and he sent a reply on March 12th...I'm sorry, March 12th, Council of Revenues forecast, and he was saying that Maui's TAT collection, to be estimated, I guess, 75 million, as well as GE collections to be \$86 million for Fiscal Year '26. And currently, the proposed budget has TAT revenues of 65 million, which is 10 percent...\$10 million less than what Dr. Colby said, and the GET revenues was...is 70 million versus, you know, what the estimate would be, which is 86 million for Fiscal Year '26. So, that's Doctor, you know, Colby, who spoke to us on March 31st, and this was his response to our question. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: My apology, could you repeat that? I mean, I can look at the letter, but you said 75 million versus --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- 65, and then it was 86 million versus 70?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. You are right.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, the Administration, in this budget, has for TAT revenues 65,000 [sic], and GT is 70. And Dr. Colby was saying that probably the collection's going to be higher.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 75 and 86, substantially higher.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Uh-huh. Uh-huh.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, Chair, how does that fit in with our determinations?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Attorneys, can you tell us about that? I mean, I had a question about that too, right, because the estimates are off. Is it Mr. Hanano, or is it Ms. Kawasaki? I mean, I can think of what to do with it, but...

MR. HANANO: Yeah, I'm not...I'm not sure about that question, Chair, to be honest.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

MR. HANANO: I mean, basically, we're trying to consider something that's not in the proposed FY '25 Budget by the Mayor based on estimates from Dr. Colby. I'm not...I'm not sure how that would fit in into the Council's --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. HANANO: -- determination.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You want us to come back and ask after lunch, maybe?

MR. HANANO: Yes, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Can do that.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: . . .(inaudible). . .

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I would just like to caution us that these are all estimates, and the real...RPT certification showed that we're \$7 million --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Short.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- under...yeah, we're short \$7 million. So, I just want us to...you know, that everyone has opinions on what the projections will be, and I support a more conservative estimate, and then if we get more than we estimate, then that's wonderful. And then...but if we...we overestimate, and then we end up short, like it's...it's really hard for the Administration to make up for a shortfall mid-fiscal year. So, I just needed to add that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. And then Member Kama was asking...I think Member Kama had her hand up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Kama --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Actually, I was trying to get --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- then Member...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- Chair to recognize you to answer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. And the tax guy's response also said that it doesn't take into effect the fire situation, right, too. And...and then also, in the projection, we don't know what could happen. Like if we projected in 2023, whatever we projected, we didn't predict that fire, and so then the revenues were down. So, I also am supportive of a conservative estimate because --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- nobody can tell the future, you know...I mean, especially with tariffs and whatnot, and the administration in charge --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- like it's even more difficult to project the future than it normally is.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we have a lot of interesting challenges. All right, Members. So, I just wanted that discussion out because we did have Dr. Colby here, and he did respond, so I wanted the community to know this discussion. Because as you know, as we go along, we always have these budget amendments...I mean, this...this Carryover/Savings, right? It keeps on flowing and flowing, and the budget amendments, and this is the source. All right. So, anything else you want to say regarding this?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Who is it? Oh, Member Paltin, was that you?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. We...we did receive a handout just recently.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I will...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- did you want to...did you want to...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. I'll do that before we do the general budget provisions, which is part of Bill 41. I'm trying to proceed with that. So, all of you got this calendar, which basically talks about decisions week and kind of estimate, you know, what departments we could possibly take out per day...take up per day, and so this is the schedule. It says subject to change, right? So, it depends on how fast we get done with each day. And then the survey that was done by the OCS Staff, and we did everything online. Last year and years past, we actually mailed out postcards to households for responses, and the postcards came back, and then OCS did the calculation. So, this is...the...the...this other document that you received talks about the 393 responses that we received, and the deadline was April 18, 2025 at 3:00. And it talks about what the...the community has to say about what the priorities would be for the budget, for our budget, and it also breaks it down by our residency area. So, this is, you know, interesting information, and I guess the top of the list, from what I see, is water resources, you know, is at 4.3 percent [sic]. Affordable housing and...is at 3.9 percent [sic]. Public safety, 3.9 percent [sic]. Roads, bridges, and drainage, 3.9 percent [sic]. Social and healthcare services is 3.8 percent [sic]. Open Space, restoration of the natural environmental...of the natural environment, 3.7 percent [sic]. Refuse and wastewater, 3.7. Parks and recreation, 3.5. Preservation of land, culture, and traditions, 3.4. Audit of County departments and programs, 3.3. Public transport...station, I guess that should be...is 3.3. And nonprofit funding is 3.2. And economic development, small business promotion is 3.2. Culture and Arts Program is 3.0. So, this is for your information, and if...if you turn...the back pages, it'll have more information on comments, as well as the tallies that were per district. Kind of interesting. Member Paltin?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The percentages that you're reading, is that out of 100 or is it out of a five-point scale?

MS. SZABO: Member Paltin, there's no percentages. It's an average score, with someone who chooses not to respond not being included in the overall average.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And...and what is the range that they can give? Is it one to five?

MS. SZABO: Yes. The survey offered options from one to five or no response.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, it...it's not 4.3 percent, it's 4.3 out of 5 is the average?

MS. SZABO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Just checking.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And if you look on the back pages, it's kind of interesting because it has comments also. So, thank you very much for putting this together. I do like that we got away from doing mailers and having to tally the cards when it came back. And just information, Members, we did get a lot more responses from this. Thank you. So, thank you, the crew that worked on this and watched it. I also want to thank Jen from my office also who helped with this. Okay. So, I'm going to put that away. And so, we're going to...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Chair? Question --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Is that on Granicus, or did you all send it out in our emails?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you didn't get it.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: The revised calendar.

MS. SZABO: Member Kama, the revised calendar is item number 197, and the budget priorities --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Got it.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MS. SZABO: -- survey report is 198.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I'll go get it. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Yeah, that's what's hard about when you're not here, right, when we pass out papers. So, you got it. Thank you very much for asking the question. All right. So, I'm going to go...continue on with Bill 41, General Budget Provisions, and I'm going to ask our Legislative Attorney, Peter Hanano, to take recommendations of possible revisions to the document. So, if you look in your Budget Bill 41 book, you will find the General Budget Provisions, and these are the provisions that will guide us through budget and the Administration once we pass this. Okay. So, Mr. Hanano, you want to...

MR. HANANO: Yes. Thank you, Chair. So, we took a look at the General Budget Provisions for this budget, FY '26, and we basically looked at all the provisions. And, you know, part of the analysis was comparing it to last year's one to see if there are any amendments or changes. We also looked at possibly maybe amending or adding some to this year's General Budget Provisions. So, I'll just go over a couple of noteworthy sections, or items that, you know, you guys can consider in determining what you want to have as your, you know, final budget provisions. So, the first one is on page 35, and that is Section 18, and that's basically...you know, part of the provision in that section is dealing with the...the limit for the transfers and loans. And I think we've considered a bill before...recently, I think it was Bill 17, to raise this amount to 150...150 million, I believe. So, here, normally there's just one provision, but here there's two, so the first one is aggregate amount of transfers and loans that must...that are unreimbursed must not exceed 175 million until August 31st, 2025, and then beginning the next month, September 1st, 2025, the aggregate amount of transfers and loans that are unreimbursed must not exceed 100 million. So, it initially, you know, is 175, and then it adjusts down to 100 million. My understanding is, is because they're going to float the bond later on this year, and so after they float it, then it's going to come back down to 100 million. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. HANANO: So, that's that one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, anybody have questions regarding that? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I had a budget provision that...to add, but they were saying that that is kind of the way they interpreted it. And so, I just wanted to get it on the record just in case, you know, because if it's in writing, but what I turned in in writing was, if I line-itemed anything with...or provisoed anything, or conditioned anything with a statement of up to so much to so-and-so, it wouldn't prevent them from applying for a competitive...applying and receiving competitive grants in any other category. And they said that's how they operate it unless we specify, oh, I'm line-iteming this, and so they shouldn't apply for any other. And so, I just wanted to get that on the record, that that's the assumption I'm going on without adding it in in writing because

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

that's what they said. And so, if anybody I line-itemed goes for a competitive pot, applies and receives it, there is nothing wrong with that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Very good. So, you got that on record.

MR. HANANO: Okay. So yeah, along...along...oh, I'm sorry. Did --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

MR. HANANO: -- Chair Lee have a question?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Go ahead, but I was just going to say we should still have that specific language for clarity anyway, even...even if it's understood, but...you know, people change.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. I think...

MR. HANANO: Yes, and...and that's for the, you know, Council's decision whether they want to include that or not, and...and, you know, we...we have a provision that we want to propose, if that's the case.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For that?

MR. HANANO: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For that?

MR. HANANO: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Next.

MR. HANANO: Okay. So, the other one was on page 38, Section 21, and that...my understanding is that--I mean, I don't like the language of it because there's assumptions or presumptions in there that whatever is submitted, even though it's not finally passed, is going to presume that it's....it's passed. My understanding is that this provision was in there to basically help, you know, when you're...they're submitting budget amendments, and, you know, sometimes there's a whole bunch of them, and then the numbers might get a little off depending on the timing of when each bill is passed, so this was kind of put in there to kind of account for that. I don't...you know, the language could be revised, but, you know, I would...I mean, that's all...in this section, this is already required. You know, I mean, the bills that are submitted are supposed to reflect the actual balances, and my understanding is that, you know, if, let's say, a bill passes first reading, from the time it passes first reading to second reading, you know, the numbers will be adjusted to reflect the actual numbers based on the prior order of the bill's passing. So, that's what 21 is.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you're suggesting to delete it?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MR. HANANO: That would be my --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. HANANO: -- suggestion on this.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anybody have...oh, sorry.

MR. HANANO: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anybody have questions? Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Did you not say you would change the language, or --

MR. HANANO: I would just...

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- what would you rather it say, or delete it?

MR. HANANO: I would just recommend deleting it because really, it doesn't provide anything that's not already required by the process to be done.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Does it hurt if we leave it in? Or is it just...

MR. HANANO: It does in a sense that it's...it's ambiguous because it presumes that the bill is already passed when it's not.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Oh.

MR. HANANO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

MR. HANANO: And so, you know, based on that, I would not recommend having that provision in.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. HANANO: Okay. And then...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anybody else have questions regarding that? Okay. So, that would be on page 38, Section 21, to delete.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MR. HANANO: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next, can you talk about --

MR. HANANO: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- page 37?

MR. HANANO: And then the...page 37?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Section to the CIP report.

MR. HANANO: Is that under...what subsection is that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Within 45 days after the end of each year, the Managing Director must submit the...to the County Council a report of all CIP projects, for which an appropriation has been made, that includes a brief description of the status of each project and the estimated start and completion date. That...I think that this is where Members can add in what they want in the report, and I think OCS had some comments regarding that. James, you were working on this? What to be in the CIP report?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair, that's correct. So, just for the Members' attention, we receive quarterly CIP reports from the Administration, but between departments, the reporting can be...it's not all similar. Some departments report things a little differently. So, for the body's consideration, they might want to...they could amend this section to specify what information needs to be included in the reports, and that way, maybe we could achieve a bit more uniformity with those reports. Anyway, just for the body's consideration. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, James, so the body will have something to consider, can you put that list together, what is recommended? I know you were working on it, and then we can have the Members look at it. And...and the way that the reports come in, DEM was cited as, you know, probably the most comprehensive and easy to understand, and other departments were kind of...kind of more vague, and not as structured. So, James, could you provide that to us when we come to decisions when we vote on the bill? Okay. All right. Is there anything else?

MR. HANANO: Just one last one, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. HANANO: Thank you. So, the final one is to basically track or account for the \$1.6 billion CDBG-DR grant funding from the Federal Government. And so, we drafted a provision, probably going to have to add it on as...as a new section, but basically, it's to require the Mayor's Office, or Administration, to provide reports on the grant. So, what we did was, we included things like proposed uses of the funds, actual encumbrances and expenditures of the fund. And also, I think under the grant, they're required to provide

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

a quarterly report to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development. So, we're going to include that as part of the requirement in this subsection, that they would have to include that on a quarterly basis.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Do we add our comments now?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, please.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, Peter, could you add something that requires them to provide any additional funds that they'll be using along with the DR funds? I...I just want to make sure there's no duplication with General Funds, or other funds that we thought was going to be used elsewhere. So, if they can let us know that if they're going to use other funds besides DR funds, or...or addition to, that that be noted, okay? Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair. We'll include that in the proposed provision. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We also, just kind of connected to this. We did ask the Administration, by letter, to send us a copy of the action plan once it's completed so that we'll have that, so we know, you know, what kind of projects they're looking at, or what the funds are going to be used for.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: That's a good idea, that part of the requirement be how does that relate to the action plan? Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. And just kind of along that line, in...in...I know that most of the projects are...I mean, it's...the action plan is under the Office of Recovery, but, you know, a lot of the answers that we had heard during this past budget session was, you know, because of the fire--and I'm not saying it's an excuse, it's a reason, it's a legit reason--but we weren't able to get to the communities facilities district study. We weren't able to do these things. And then we have an action plan with all these projects, which I know is under the Office of Recovery, which is under the Office of Management. But I imagine that the various departments are going to assist within their scope...like for example, the permanent debris storage, or whatnot. And so, I think that needs to be taken into account when we see the volume of CIP. If we're going to come back next year and say, oh, well, we had this fire, and we had these action plan items, and we only have so much capacity, and we have so many vacancies in like the level Vs of all the categories, which would have been beneficial to accomplish all the projects that we want and need to do, but money is not the only limiting capacity to take into account. And if...if we don't...if we're not aware of the entirety of the scope of the action plan actions

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

that this County is going to be taking, even with the assistance of consultants, where...where it...it could be that we're throwing money at projects and things that we don't have the capacity, workforce, to accomplish, as we heard in this past budget cycle when we were asking questions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Thank you. All right. Mr. Hanano, do you have anything else?

MR. HANANO: Back...thank you, Chair. Just going back to that original question about whether or not Dr. Colby's projections, you know, how that would affect the budget. So, basically, because in order for the Council to...Council has to submit a balanced budget. And in order for the Council to adjust, let's say, in this case, the revenues that the Mayor projected, it would have to have a rational basis in order to do that. And of course, like the Chair mentioned, Dr. Colby's projections are higher than what the Mayor projected. So, the question becomes, you know, can the Council consider Dr. Colby's projections? Do we have to go with the Mayor's projections? Somewhere in between? I think, you know, because Dr. Colby is a Tax and Research Planning Officer for the State, who, you know, I'm assuming relies on very reliable information in his projections, that that would be a rational basis for the Council to...to recognize or consider, you know, his projections into the...into the deliberations of the FY '26 Budget. So, it's up to the Council, you know, how much they want to either adjust the Mayor's projections based on Dr. Colby's projections, you know, or just base it on what the Mayor proposed. So, essentially, it's up to the...the Council to decide. But you are free to consider it because it comes from a reliable source, and it's based on, you know, a rational basis for the consideration of it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you very much. So, we can take it up at the appropriate time. So, Members --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- does that...yes, who was that?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I would just say that...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. In his response, he did say these estimates do not take into account the sluggish performance of Maui relative to the rest of the islands since the 2023 wildfires, which would lower the collection forecast. So, I...I do feel that, in terms of the effects of the wildfire on the forecast, the Mayor is more of an expert on that than Mr. Colby is.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you very much. All right. So, I'm going to move forward on this, and we will vote on this at the appropriate time. Member Johnson, you have something?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Councilmember Kama's hand's up.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry. Sorry. Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Member Johnson. So, you know, when...when the time...the appropriate time comes, somebody's going to have to implement the plan, right? I don't think Office of Recovery...I think they might have to hire consultants to do that. And will...will we be able to know who those consultants are, and when they put out the RFP, and those kinds of things?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, this is a question on how would the action plan be implemented? Is that what you're --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- talking about?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, I think that's a question for Management that we can send forward, but I believe those would go out for RFP, and I don't know if --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- they did it already. They did?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I don't know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We'll jot that question down and...oh, I'm sorry, what? You want me to take some time?

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, Chair. Could Staff confer with you about that real quickly, just like one-minute recess?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies about that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 11:49...11:50. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

**RECESS:           11:48 a.m.**  
**RECONVENE:       11:54 a.m.**

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Okay. We are almost ready to go to lunch, but I wanted to just make some few announcements. 12:00 today, your district conditions are due, right, regarding the residency areas, and so...I call it the \$140,000 pot, right? So, that's due today. Please submit it to Staff. And your discussion that I know you want to have, or expanding it, is not part of this because we're at the 140 that we were assigned from the beginning when the budget was released.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, that wouldn't be part of budget provisions?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We...we...we wouldn't have that amount because we haven't decided if it's going to change. But right now, it's 140,000 per residency area, so please send forward what your request would be by noon today. And, Member...Member Kama, sorry, we're not going to send any more follow-up questions to the department, but we are looking for a response for you on the action plan and, you know, the process. I think it was one of the questions forward, so we'll get that to you, or you can call the Managing Director's Office directly if you want. So, your...if you have any Real Property Tax questions, or if...you know, that discussion that we had this morning, that's due by 4:30 this afternoon or at 4:00? Does it matter to you guys?

MR. KRUEGER: 4:30's fine, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 4:30's fine? Okay. For Real Property Tax. And we are...we...Staff passed out...did you already pass it out? Oh, can you pass it out? Okay. So, this is what you submitted last week, and these are the conditions for...that you wanted, you know, for the different areas, and it's a consolidated list. Thank you, OCS Staff, for working on it. So, it's your priorities, your personal priorities, and they have compiled it so that you can see what everybody requested. So, the matrix that you worked from, you provided the information about where you are going to be conditioning or adding funding, and it's residency area, Countywide, grant conditions, and Appendix A, which is conditions for that. So, the list that you have that was just given to you is a consolidated with all the Members, so you can spend lunch and look at this so you can become familiar about where there may...may be some duplications as we go forward. And what I am planning on doing is, when I take up the departments, when I call up a particular department, like Ag, we'll go through all the standard, you know, things that are in the budget, and if any of you have a condition related to--oh, this is not the sheet--but if you have a condition related to add, I'll call on you so that you can explain it, and the Members can hear, you know, what you want to do. So, that's how we will move forward. Staff, did I miss anything?

MR. KRUEGER: No. Nothing further to add, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, Member Kama and I have questions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member --

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Rawlins-Fernandez...oh.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, where do I...so where do we get a copy of what you just spoke about, all of our budget priorities?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Consolidated. Did we email it to them?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, yes. We're proceeding to email it out as well.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. They're going to --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- email it to you. Okay. Sorry, so hard when you're not here. Member Sinenci and Rawlins-Fernandez and Kama, everybody else is in the Chambers. All right. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay. I just wanted to clarify what you said. We're going to go over the entire consolidated matrix of priorities after we get back from lunch?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, if you can look at it to become familiar with what you wrote versus what the other Members are.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And when I do take up...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I got that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, one thing is that if...if there are duplications, so if I had whatever --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Got it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- on --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. That's fine.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Queen Ka'ahumanu, I think, is one of them.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, you just mean the duplications?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, the duplications, we can then decide --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- what we want to do. Now, Members, in the past, what we did is--and if you can think about this--if there's a duplication...I think Member Sinenci and I may have a duplication. And if he wants to change his, then, you know, we can talk about it on the floor. But just for us to be transparent, we'll talk about it on the floor. And...okay. Anybody else have questions?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. But we're not going to go over the entire spreadsheet, only duplications --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Only duplications.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- and how we want to proceed --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- with any potential duplications.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: But we will take up each single one when we take up the department. And that...at that time, then, you can, you know, talk about why you did it and what you want to do. And the Members can, you know, confer, concur, or not --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- and have a discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That was the clarification I was seeking.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it is now 11:59, and we will come back at 1:30, Members? Okay. We'll take a recess and come back for [sic] lunch at 1:30. . . .(gavel). . .

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**RECESS: 11:59 a.m.**  
**RECONVENE: 1:39 p.m.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It's 1:39. Thank you, Members. I hope you had a chance to look at the documents that were passed out, your OED grant amounts. Let's see. Members, welcome back. Thank you for submitting your residency area conditions on time to allow Staff to compile and verify the information in the conditions. Staff will verify with DCCA, Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs, listed names for organizations, and ensure that appropriate fiscal sponsors are included in the conditional language. At this time, let's discuss the OED residency area grants for Economic Development, Environmental, and Cultural Programs. Does anyone have any proposed adjustments to the grant amount? None? Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: This is the 140?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, this is the 140.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, the 140.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we're talking about 140. So...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You can put your mic on.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Any changes to what was submitted?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's what we're asking. If...because casually, this came up, right? And so, at this time, talk about it. If not, it stays at the 140 amount for your residency area.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, casually this time. Casually. And if...if the amount is revised, any conditions due tomorrow...you want it by 4:30?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 8:00.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 8:00 still? You want it by 8:00?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, sorry. . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wrong one. 4:30? If we do change it. Okay. We can talk about it if it does change. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Well, I propose that we increase it by 110,000. So, 250.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 250, oh, interesting. Okay. Anybody else have any suggestions? So, this would be in OED, and just that pot would increase by the 110. Is that what you're saying? So, it would be 250 total.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Actually, no. Does it all have to be in OED? I mean, what...what makes it so that it has to be in OED?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So based upon--and I want the Members to chime in because I think we heard from all the departments--that departments were very clear that if we start adding more grants or, you know, their workload, that they want Staff. And I'm opposed to that. So, we spread all this around wherever we want because I'm sure we all have, you know, great ideas, that...then start sharpening your pencil for how many E/Ps we're going to have to add. So, that's my...that's my concern. So, no, I would not like to see it. That's my opinion. It's up to you guys. So, keep it in OED, and increase the pot is what you're saying from 140 to 250, and...but keep it in OED is my...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, if that happens, then, you know, I'm not opposed to adding a couple more positions in OED then. If that's the case.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I think...I think OED asked us to add a position to do these grants, I guess.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I don't know. It's up to you guys. We're talking about more money. So, Member Paltin, any comments? You're fine?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm...I'm fine working within the proposed structure from the Mayor because of how much we're already down. And...I mean...and...and I have other big-ticket priorities to find money for that I feel like are a little bit more pressing.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I mean, I think it's a nice proposal, but in the big picture of things...personally, my resident area pot has a little extra that I'm going to be open for a competitive award with information to me. Like they'll let me know what...what it is. But I...I just...I'm not going...I'm not going to look for a lot of...a lot-a lot of cuts, so... And...and I have other big-ticket priorities.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. So, you're saying leave it, correct? All right. Member Johnson? Oh, you have a thought?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Sure, we'll go down the line. That's fine. We should all have a say on...on our districts. I appreciate other Members adding. I would support Chair Lee's proposal. I was going to just round it up with 60K to make it 200K, but

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

certainly, I would go up to what she proposed. And those are my two cents. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez. Then Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. So, I...I think it's also important to note that when we had OED Director/Chief of Staff --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Everything.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- Cynthia Lallo before us --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- the...the comment she gave us is that if it's going to be lots of little grants, then that's a lot more work. If it's going to be the same amount of grants, but bigger, then it's the same amount of work because it's the same amount of organizations that they would have to manage. It's just the same amount of grants. So, if we increase the amount, but not increase the number of organizations by much, then it...it's not more work. More money doesn't necessarily equate more work. More organizations equate to more work. So, I just...I just wanted to remind this body of that comment that we received. I support Chair Lee's proposal for 250, and would support more.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Cook?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: She didn't finish.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you didn't finish?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: She got cut off.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member Rawlins-Fernandez...oh, is she frozen? Oh, no, did you...are you done?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I would support 300,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I would support leaving it where it is, in my district funds. We've worked diligently to support things, and they haven't...they've been challenged to meet the criteria at times. I think our leaving it where it is, is sort of setting the tone for the...for the Council on this budget, no...not increasing unless necessary. There is a lot of big-ask forthcoming. So, I would vote for leaving it the way it is.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member U'u-Hodgins, then Member Sinenci.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: I, too, would support leaving it where it is. If we were to raise it, I like kind of even numbers. So, for me, raising it would maybe even be 10 grand to 150. But other than that, that’s kind of where --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: -- I’m comfortable with. But I do recognize that everybody has all the things they would like to see done. I think every district has some really great priorities and they like to see their...their district be supported by us. So, I understand the raises. But for me, it would either be at 140, or maybe even 150, but that’s about it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. I can support any increases only because I’ve had some additional asks, and we keep it small. We follow the...what previous Member Carroll did for some of the nonprofits. And also, just in light of, you know, some of these nonprofits have matching or Federal funding that may have been cut in light of the Federal cuts due to diversity, inclusion...which hits directly our small communities. They might...you know, they wouldn’t have some of those Federal fundings that they apply for. So, I mean, having that extra would kind of give our small communities some leverage to...to survive without the Federal cuts. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Kama, I think I did not call on you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes. Thank you, Chair. I would be in support of raising the...the district funds only...only because I think that year after year, the same people come all the time and we don’t get opportunities to hear from the new people who start coming. Like this year, we heard a lot of new orgs that came through during our budget. And if they’re not ready, and they’re not a 501, it takes them time to prepare for things like that. And I’d like to be able to see more than just the usuals that come to...to us and ask for money for support. So, I’m supporting increasing. And thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Question is then how much? Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, I’m curious. So, you know, I know, you know, there’s a history to this pot of money, but why does it have to be universal? Some districts are requiring more, have higher needs. If Chair Lee needs 250K, and Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins only needs 150K, then let’s do it that way. Why is it we have this number that we all must be...fairness is not that everybody’s number is the same, is that the needs are met, and everybody [sic] community has different needs. I mean, is it...and as far as like the Administration, I would think they would love that idea because it’s not straight across the board, right? I mean, if it’s a workload balance, maybe some...I’m curious of why we do it that way. Does anybody know? I don’t know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, there’s a history for this pot.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It was first nothing, of course. And then it was only for Lānaʻi, Molokaʻi, and Hāna, those areas. And then I think Makawao was added on. And I think it started like at 60,000, and then it grew, and it kind of has been here. For as long as I've been here, it's been 140. And they added on...you know, the other councils because...maybe...maybe Chair Lee was on the Council, I'm not sure, but...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, we had zero at that time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Yeah. So, it grew over time with the...you know, the different bodies. But I think that, you know, we, as responsible members of our community, right, we have different projects that we hear about that maybe this small pot can help. And the bigger stuff that come up is...is like what Member Paltin said. You know, we have--which is what we're going to take up next, the conditions that we all put in, that are of larger amounts. And this is just to maybe handle the ones that came up at the residency area meetings, and they said I could use this, or whatever. You know, I think that's where the residency area meetings were quite kind of interesting because we heard from a lot of people that, you know, didn't have to come here to testify. But they had different kind of projects that we were able to fulfill by this little pot in comparison to a \$1.5 billion budget, you know. So, it's not like we can kind of decide, oh, today we're going to do this, then tomorrow we're going to do that...because this is our budget now, and I would like to see us then solve this. You know, I...I'm...I'm leaning towards keeping it 140,000 because in this next thing that we're going to take up, there are a lot of conditions that I added, or you added, that is way bigger than this...way, way bigger than this. So, to me, I think initially, maybe this was an added little good thing to happen over time. But as time has gone on, and all of you have been, you know, very experienced in figuring out how to help your community, I think you have, but with the bigger pots. You know, so...excuse me, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, there's two ways to look at it. As Member Johnson suggested, it could be separate, you know. Every...our needs are different. But when you're faced with a \$1.6 billion budget, and we're Councilmembers who are equally responsible for that budget, and what we get to show for it is \$140,000 to our community, I don't think that's fair. I just don't. And secondly, when the Mayor put his budget together, that was last year. He started from last year, and then finished this year. We have the most recent information. We have the most relevant information. And I think...which is different from what he received months ago. So, I believe that each Member...especially now. Because some of our...some of our communities have been neglected, you have to admit that, you know. Other priorities, and rightfully so, took precedence. But other communities need our attention, and our focus, and our support. So, I...I really would hope that all of you support the...the 250,000. But if you can't, then you don't have to raise yours. You can keep it the same, or not take any. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yes, Member U'u-Hodgins?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you. I want to just make a few statements. If you ask my husband, I’m really good at spending at least his money. So, it’s not that I wouldn’t have a problem allocating money, it’s just that I don’t necessarily think it’s fiscally responsible all the time. We do have \$140,000 to spend just in OED. But we do have all these priorities that we just got. I don’t know how many pages of priorities, 27-something pages of priorities that do reflect our...obviously our priorities, as it’s called, that we want in the budget. So, it’s not necessarily only, in my head, the Mayor’s budget, but ours as well, especially when it comes to us. So, if we wanted to raise it, I wouldn’t necessarily have an issue with spending it. For me, it’s not that. It’s not that these neighborhoods have been neglected, which I don’t disagree that some have been, but I could spend it. That’s not a problem. I’m really good at that, if you ask my husband. But I just think there are times when we should be fiscally conservative and fiscally responsible. I’m not saying that anybody else is not responsible, but this is just what responsibility looks like to me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Well, you know, I looked at my...my...the...you know, my pot of money, for example. I was going to put in \$40,000 for a part-time grant writer to assist on Lāna‘i. And because they...it’s...Councilmember Cook mentioned the other day, it’s like giving a thirsty person a little straw, because the process to get the grants is so hard. So, to have that baked in there, I think would really help my community. But that would mean I would have to cut somebody on that little 140 pot. And to cut somebody, to Chair Lee’s point, in a 1.X amount of billion dollar budget, that doesn’t make sense to me. You know, let’s raise it a little bit, because the cost of everything is going up. If...if the...if I’m reading the vibe of the room, and it sounds like the 250K to Chair Lee sounds a little bit high. So, can we...can we move up? Can...can...I’d like to hear some proposals. Because I don’t want to cut somebody. I’ll give you an example. It’s random, but Pineapple Festival’s going off the charts because it’s so expensive. But we had to go find them for another pot because it doesn’t fit in this pot. It traditionally used to fit in this pot. And that’s the thing is, these things are now...because I’m constrained to 140, we’re now fishing in other pots. And that...again, it’s not making much sense to me. So, if the mood goes a little higher, I would love to...I’d love to hear it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member U‘u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Then Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: I’m really glad, Member Johnson, he actually brought that up. Because when I was talking to the Makawao Rodeo Parade people, their biggest

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

expense is actually Police. They spend so much money on Police. And so, we give them a small budget, and then, obviously, now they have to go and fundraise too. But I want to say their biggest expense is Police.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Security.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: And I don't disagree that things are changing, and things are more expensive. Like I think they want to do drones at the...I think that's great. I think that's probably safer. And it is more expensive, but they can obviously reuse it, and it's safer for us. I'm not against going up a little bit, like you said. But I don't...I don't necessarily have a proposal. I like your 200,000. That's not too bad. It's quite reasonable. But I hear you, things are way more expensive than what it was the entire time Member Sugimura has been here.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, Member Paltin, did you want...did you have your hand up first? I'm not sure.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, then Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- going to say, I'm...I'm not supportive of him using 40 grand to teach someone how to do the OED. That's actually OED's job --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Responsibility.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- and they should be...like I would pitch a fit. Like everybody else can go in and get the training or whatever. They need to be coming to Lānaʻi. They have that whole Holomua Initiative that they're putting money into, and if they're not coming to Lānaʻi to help people do that, then that's where...and I wouldn't support \$40,000 to do that. I think that that's something that the Administration needs to do, personally.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Agree.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And for the record, Chair, I mentioned Councilmember...or Chair Lee's 250K, but I didn't want to forget Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez's proposal of 300K. So, there's...there's numbers going around here, and I want to recognize them all. We should listen to our other Councilmembers, and see where we can land on.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: She's stretching the rubber band a little bit farther than Chair Lee is, so... . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I could support 200 just to be supportive, and hopefully move on to our next task.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Anybody else? Okay. So, I can support 200, right? Just a little bit more, if it's going to help. And it sounds like the Members want to expand it a little. I actually was going to say, we'll keep it at 140. So, you want to vote? Somebody make a motion? Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'll move.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Move...move to...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 250,000?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(chuckling)*. . . Move to increase the district amounts from 140 to 200,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Do I hear a second? Second from Member Cook. All right. Let's do a roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Sorry, was that a no?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That was a no.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Fine. . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Keep the expenses down, I keep it at 140. So, no. Sorry. Anyway, I lost.  
Can we have the results?

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, there are seven “ayes,” two “noes.” The motion passes.

<b>VOTE:</b>	<b>AYES:</b>	<b>Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.</b>
--------------	--------------	--

	<b>NOES:</b>	<b>Chair Sugimura and Councilmember Paltin.</b>
--	--------------	---

	<b>ABSTAIN:</b>	<b>None.</b>
--	-----------------	--------------

	<b>ABSENT:</b>	<b>None.</b>
--	----------------	--------------

	<b>EXC.:</b>	<b>None.</b>
--	--------------	--------------

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, thank you for that discussion. And interesting, right? We all care. And Member Johnson, that cannot be one of your priorities. OED must provide that. Holy smokes.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I know. Well, it's...you know, last time they were supposed --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- to come over, there was fires and --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- it's always something...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I beg your pardon. Member Sinenci, you didn't get to vote?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, no.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, no, I did vote. It's just that we just turned in our district priorities, and I might want to just adjust it if...if...if, Chair, you'd give us an opportunity to. Because like some of them, we might not increase on the...the number of applicants, but we could add to the existing ones that we put in.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, based on this 140, that's now what?...what is it? 200. Is it okay if they turn in to you any additions by 8:00 tomorrow morning? Well, not revisions, additions.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, I think what Member Sinenci was saying, he might want to give the existing people a little bit more, so that would be a revision, not...I mean --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I see.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- but Member Rawlins-Fernandez has her hands up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. So, the point--you know again, reminding ourselves what the point of submitting it early in the week is--is so that we ensure that the organizational names that we put on there are correct, are the DCCA registered names, and not so much the amounts. So, I think it's fine because that was the purpose of doing it on Monday. And even so, we can reconsider anything throughout the week...and even at first and second reading.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I guess people could.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I guess people could, as long as we all stay in control. All right, Members. So, we are good, right? 8:00 tomorrow morning, submit your revisions. Okay? Now, Members' priorities and conditions, and that is this...well, my list is big. It's that list that you got right before lunch that had all of your...your priority matrix, right? And what I want Staff to do is to tell us which ones were duplicates so that we can talk about it openly, about what the duplicates were. And the Member sharing the priority can determine who will keep the priority. And for the Member who gives up that priority, they can then submit a new priority in its place. And it also is going to be due 8:00 tomorrow morning. For departments being taken up today, we'll have to take up the replacement priorities as we go because today we're taking up...well, besides the Legislative Branch, we're taking up Ag, Corp. Counsel, and DEM. For department...well, please submit your replacement priority in writing by 8:00 Tuesday to allow Staff time to update the matrix. Is that the time you wanted? Okay. So, do you need a recess to look over what was sent to you, or did you look it over during lunch? You looked at it over lunch, right? So, you know what the duplicate...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That was our instructions, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You ran some errands. Okay. Okay. So, Staff, can you tell everybody where the duplicates were, and what...and what it was, and who? And then we can take a break so that everybody can look at what they are.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. So, the first set of duplicates we encountered, it relates to the Maui Humane Society. Councilmember Cook, Countywide number 4, touches several line items relating to the Maui Humane Society. That's on...that's under the Department of Agriculture. So, apologies, that's Department of Agriculture's...the priorities for that one.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Page 4.

MR. KRUEGER: Page 4. Thank you. So, it's...Councilmember Cook has...the ones that conflict is his one relating to Maui Humane Society for Animal Sheltering Program. Chair Lee has her Countywide number 5, which also relates to that...that program. And then Councilmember Cook's also conflicts with Councilmember Paltin's Countywide number 4, relating to the spay-neuter programs.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm willing to withdraw.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, the...the next set of duplicates is also under the Department of Agriculture.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, do we need to see who's one we're going with, either Chair Lee or Member Cook's one?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Between the first one announced.

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, Chair, apologies. Staff thought there would be like a recess if...if Members needed time. But if we're going to discuss now, then Staff would actually request a recess to confer with the Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, let me ask, because some people didn't really have time to do this. You want to take a short recess after we say this, and then...or you had enough time to look at it?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Take a short recess. Okay. Why don't you...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'll hear...I'll hear it all. We can hear it all, like Staff suggested, and then we take a recess.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Next.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Member Kama has her hand up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, we're going to go one by one. They're going to go and tell us what the duplicates are. We're going to take a break and discuss amongst those that are duplicate what they're going to decide to do about it. Come back in, go again, other duplications, and go back out and have a recess again?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, we're going to resolve the duplicates now. So, Staff is now reading out the duplicates one by one.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And then...and then we will allow you time to take a recess if you haven't had the chance --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- to look at it --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- come back and we'll have a decision. So, we're not going to rehash it again. Anything else?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Can we have Staff say what their recommendation is for us? Because that's not what I heard or supported, what you just said.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: They're just reading out the duplicates, right?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: What...what did...what did you...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, they're going to read all the duplicates, and then we'll know what the...everyone's duplicates...but no one's going to go talk to each other during the recess. We're going to...we're going to talk about it when we --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Come back.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- reconvene.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yup, and come up with a decision.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sunshine Law.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee and Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, Chair, can you...when...as we go through the duplicates, just identifying the duplicates, can you also state whether there is a discrepancy of some kind? Because Tom Cook's proposal on the Humane Society, I don't understand it. It says increase the program by 200,000, and then he lists 150. So, what am I missing here?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: He...he's increasing the animal management by 500,000, and he's breaking it down, that 200,000 goes to animal sheltering, 150,000 to enforcement, and 100 grand to Moloka'i. And...and that kind of flows into my question because I don't know that I'm a duplicate anymore because nobody put money for spay and neutering.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair? Sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: We did, that's what'll make it 500,000 round, but it was inadvertently left off.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: We brought that to their attention. So, if you add 50K spay and neuter, that will bring it to 500,000 even.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. So 4 is an increase for Maui Humane Society for spay and neutering, 50,000. Okay. Okay. Then I can withdraw, but you guys don't want to know that yet.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You going withdraw.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then...and then Chair Lee's is 503,000, and she just says for animal sheltering. I...I kind of support Member Cook's one, but you guys don't want to know that yet, so sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, I do too, I support his. I...I would...I would take mine off --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- and add more to the spay/neuter program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, that would be...it's not numbered yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm the one that gets all the calls on the cats, for some reason.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair? Apologies.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm the one making the calls on the cats.

MR. KRUEGER: If the body wants to make calls on these ones right now, Staff would request a recess to confer with you, Chair.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. What time is it? 2:10, 2:15? One minute?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 2:11? Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I thought we were going to go through all of them.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait, Chair...Staff has a question.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I thought that was the plan.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Staff has a question.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair? Oh.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Recess. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

**RECESS:        2:10 p.m.**  
**RECONVENE:    2:26 p.m.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Okay. Welcome back to Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It is now 2:26. We had to have that interesting discussion. So, on Members' priorities and conditions. We're going to go back to that. And I'm going to ask Mr. Krueger to identify the duplications. I think we got resolved what's going to happen with the Humane Society. So, Mr. Krueger?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. Thank you, Chair. So, just for the Members' information, relating to the Maui Humane Society duplications, just...apologies on our part. Due to a Staff error, we misinterpreted Councilmember Cook's...his priority, and it kind of resulted in some misclarification [*sic*] on our part. So, there's actually no duplication as it relates to this item. Councilmember Cook's priority is actually just relating to the Animal Enforcement Program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: And then...so, Councilmember Paltin's and Council Chair Lee's priorities...respective priorities stand. So, there's no priorities on that part. And Councilmember Cook's priority is only for the Animal Enforcement Program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Got it? Member Paltin, Chair Lee. Chair Lee, you had your hand up.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can I change my description to Maui Humane Society for the spay-neuter program?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's like a whole new...

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you're going to give 503 to the spay-neuter program?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Go ahead, Mr. Krueger.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, Chair. Staff will just note that that change would result in a conflict with Councilmember Paltin's priority number 4.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Member Paltin has just said you're going to withdraw your...I wish these things were numbered so we can talk about it like they're individual items.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If...if the body is okay with Member Lee changing her description from sheltering to spay-neutering, I'm okay with it. But maybe Ms. Labrecque would comment if all of that spay-neutering money could be used. But I mean, I like the idea.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I just feel the problem is so massive that, you know, the 100,000 that we first thought about, it's just not going to cut it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, that gets...that clarified where Member Cook...oh, Member Cook has something to say.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, the way it stands, there's no money for sheltering.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Because you withdrew yours. Yeah. Mr. Krueger?

MR. KRUEGER: No...yes, Chair, that's correct. If...if Chair Lee makes that change, then there's no priority relating to Humane Society for animal sheltering at this time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Cook, yours is going to be on Animal Enforcement Program, and for 150,000; is that correct?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: It's 500,000, but I think...

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. I suppose an option would be if Councilmember Cook is concerned and...and the body's already approving Chair Lee to change hers relating to spay-neuter, and Councilmember Cook wanted to change his to Animal Sheltering Program, the body could also consider that change as well.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Well --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- I felt strongly about the animal enforcement aspect of it, but 500,000's kind of excessive for that, so about 250,000 for the animal enforcement, and call it a day.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Animal Enforcement Program.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 250,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 250. For enforcement, right?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, for 500.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And then Chair Lee is spay-neuter for half a million dollars.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: There's a lot of cats out there. Yes. Member Paltin you're withdrawing yours?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...I will, but I...I just had a comment. What...what Staff thought Member Cook had written, although I guess he hadn't written it, a little bit makes the most sense to me because it's kind of along the lines of what they asked for. If we give them more than they ask for for enforcement, or more than they ask for for spay and neutering, and not give them shelter or money to Moloka'i or whatever, we're...we're...we're not sure about their capacity to carry out what we're giving them money for. But the one...I don't know where it came from, if it didn't come from Member Cook, of one, 200,000 for Humane Society animal sheltering, 150,000 for animal enforcement, 100,000 for Moloka'i, and 50,000 for spay and neutering is kind of along the lines of what they asked for. And...and we're, I guess, showing our bias that we really care about enforcement and spay and neutering, which I mean, I, a little bit, agree with. But I just am concerned if we're upping the amount that we're giving them than what they asked for, if they have the capacity, or if...if, you know, that's even what they'll accept.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, I was told that they asked for \$700,000. 700,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And the spay-neuter can be for Moloka'i as well. But, you know, I'm open to that, you know, if...if Moloka'i needs something in particular. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sorry. Member --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Rawlins-Fernandez, and then Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I don't think you intended for us to discuss the merits of the proposal at this time. I think the intention and the plan was to just identify duplicates, and then whoever wanted to withdraw would. We wouldn't go, you know, deep into the discussion of what the amount would be, and whether there's capacity to, you know, undertake the proposal for when we come up on that department. I think that was the plan, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That was until we started digging into it and finding out how we can...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. You're our Chair, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Exactly, I am the Chair. So, I just want to solve this because it's in everybody's mind and fresh. Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Just for clarity for the body, the reason that this came up was because we discovered today that our...it had to be a single line item in our request. And the way that I had broke it down was --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Four.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- the way that it was intended, but we don't have that luxury.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, just...just to kind of clarify why we're having this conversation because...in this step, because we just determined that. I think it's going to happen about 20 times. And so --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- I won't get into reducing it to 150,000 because I'm trying to be frugal. But thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: How do we have echoes? Okay. So, Mr. Krueger, next.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. I don't have any objections to Member Cook or anyone else that had like a two-part, three-part, multi-part proposal. So, I don't consider Member Cook's four proposals in his one proposal for the Maui Humane Society. I don't...so, if you want to keep it the way it is, I would support that. And if you want to take a vote on that, I'm happy to vote on that to support the multi-prong proposal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussions? Okay. Let's go next. Next.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, the next duplication that we've identified is also in the Department of Agriculture. It's relating to axis deer mitigation.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: So, Councilmember Cook's grant number 1 adds a condition to the Ag Micro Grants Program for \$1 million relating to axis deer mitigation. And then, Chair, your priority Countywide number 4 adds a new grant relating to axis deer mitigation.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: Or adds funding for...for axis deer mitigation.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Member Cook and I will decide what we're going to do on that. I think it takes a deeper discussion. During the break, I heard that your thought about what you want your grant to do, mine is more broad. You want it to be to help those people that had a certain amount of acreage and more...or less, right? Like a gap group or something. So, we'll decide, we'll come back to that. Okay? Yeah? Okay. Next.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, the next duplication we've identified is...it's actually between the Department of Human Concerns and the Mayor's Office. It's relating to Maui Grassroots Collective, Councilmember Sinenci's Countywide number 1. That one adds to Human Concerns an appropriation relating to Maui Grassroots Collective. And then Councilmember Johnson, his...his condition or...yeah, his grant number 2, it's...is \$75,000 for Maui Grassroots Collective, Inc.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Sinenci's was for how much? Sorry about that.

MR. KRUEGER: \$450,000.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 450.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Which pages?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's so hard, yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. So, Councilmember Sinenci's one is on page 10 of the spreadsheet we distributed earlier today. Councilmember Johnson's is on page 14.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 10 and 14.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, I don't think this is duplicate. This is the same organization and it's not the same program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I'm trying to find Councilmember...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, go ahead.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sorry, Member Johnson. Did you find it, Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I found mine. James, what's the page again for Councilmember Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 10.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 10.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you.

MR. KRUEGER: Yeah, Councilmember Sinenci's in 10. And...and yes, Chair, it's...it's just...on its face, we just wanted to point it out for the Members that it could be duplicative, but if it isn't, then...and the body's okay with it, then can proceed that way.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Did you see that, Member Sinenci and Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah. We...we can come...revisit that, but it's not the same.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Sinenci, do you see that?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, and I, too, had three different things on...in there for

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

harm-reduction training and the overdose prevention training, as well as the...the Holo Holo I Ka Wai Program, which is the...the water truck and the hygiene kit. So, those are all kind of different...different programs, but we can...I can provide a breakdown for each, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And mine's simple, it's just workforce development, so totally different.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Different.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: But thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Right. I don't...I don't have any workforce development.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If we could go back to page 3, I think Chair Lee and Member Johnson have a duplicative Maui Farmer Support Network.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We haven't gotten there yet? Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean, we're still...we were in Ag, and then we jumped to Human Concerns, passed to 10...and page 10 and 14, but what about page 3?

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies for that, Member...Chair and Member Paltin. Yes, Staff would agree, that is a duplication.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Member Johnson has one for 140,000 for Maui Farmer Support Network, and then Chair Lee has one up to 140.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Same number, same pot of money, and I'll just withdraw mine.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I'm sure Ms. Pinsky and all of her group will be really happy. We were chomping at the bit to support those guys.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you're going to withdraw yours, and Chair Lee will keep hers, okay?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: OCS, you got that? Okay. Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, the next duplication that Staff wanted to bring to the body's attention--and again, it might...it might not be a duplication--but just on its face, we wanted to double-check. It relates to Roots Reborn, so Councilmember Kama's Countywide number 3.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: What page?

MR. KRUEGER: This one is on...this one is on page 10.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: And then Councilmember Johnson, his Countywide number 3 also relates to Maui Roots Reborn, and his is on page 11.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Page 10 and 11. All right. So, Member Kama is, again, page 10, and it's for Maui Roots Reborn, Inc., for immigrant services in the amount of 200,000, right? And then Member Johnson. Oh, page 11. So, yours is increased by 235,000 and insert a condition to read, 235,000 must...must be used for Maui Roots Reborn, Inc., Know Your Rights/Train the Trainer, and Community Care Navigation Support programs. Is that same?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: That is the same, Chair --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Go ahead.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- because that's what Maui Roots does. They do immigrant services, they do Train the Trainer, they do Know Your Rights Education. I knew that, I just want to write it all out.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, do you --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: But --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- one of you want to withdraw, and --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- but I...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- you can work on a new one?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I'll withdraw.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Because he has more money in his.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. By a few.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, sure. We did a lot of homework on this one, and if you withdraw, Councilmember Kama, we'll take it up. Thank you. Let's work together on this, this is wonderful. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this is a keeper. Okay. Next.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, the next duplication we have noted down relates to the Maui Nui Marine Resource Council. Councilmember Johnson, his Countywide number 5 increases the appropriation under EP&S by \$300,000. Oh, apologies, I'm just pulling up the page number now, it's page 6. And then, Chair, also on page 6, your Countywide number 3, it's \$100,000 for the Hui O Ka Wai Ola Water Quality Monitoring Program, which I believe also relates to Maui Nui Marine Resource Council.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And that's page...what did you say, page?

MR. KRUEGER: That's page 6.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Page 6.

MR. KRUEGER: So, that...that could be a duplication. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Johnson, is that yours?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, Chair. It is a duplicate because yours would fold into mine, does that make any sense?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Because it's under the umbrella of, so if it's...I would prefer it to be under mine --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- so it covers it, but I'd like to hear if you're okay with that before I just...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm fine. Member Cook, are you okay with that? Yeah, yeah. Yeah? Okay. Very good. We're fine.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, that's currently all the duplication Staff has noted at this time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Oh, there. Okay. So, I'm going to withdraw mine, I'm just going to write on this. Anything else? That's it. Okay. Now we can proceed. Okay. Okay. Thank you, everybody. And I think next year we'll get all of this beforehand so we can unsort and unravel this before we get to the floor. So, it's 2:44, sorry about that. So, any of you that are going to rework your...your priorities and conditions for this section, can you turn it in by 8:00 tomorrow so that Staff can work on it? Did you get that? So, Staff can work on it. Member Cook and I, you can...we can talk about axis deer. Yeah, because we didn't come to a solution. All right. So, the way that now this is going to appear as we move forward is when we take up the departments, like we're going to...if we take up Department of Ag, you can tell that there's things that we just talked about that's in Department of Ag, and I was going to take it up in...in it one by one. So, we'll see as we go along which ones of them are duplicates and how we're going to handle it. It got a little bit messy right now. Do we need to take a break? Are we all fine? We can move forward, right? Yeah. Okay. Good. All right. Over the period of time when we had the departments before us, we had a lot of discussion with them individually as we looked at the details about Category A. And Category A is...you all know where personnel is, right? There are over 600 vacancies, and we just saw the Police Department come forward to us for \$3 million because they had all this extra money in Category A. So, with magnifying glasses, I think, you know, you have gone through the departments and seen where we have vacancies and where, you know, expansion position, all these discussions came up. And they asked...the Department also asked for reinstated cuts from Fiscal Year '25. So, to deal with this, OCS has worked on spreadsheets. Can you pass it out? Is it...do you have the spreadsheets for the Category A related to salaries? And one for CIPs by General Fund. So, can you pass out the...those? So, I wanted to provide you with some tools that you can use as we take...take on the depart...not take on, discuss the departments, where I'm going to ask OCS Staff to explain to you what the Category A related to salaries and...and how you can utilize that. They did this very good, I think, comparison of what was adopted and...and what was implemented in the...can you pass it out? Oh. No? I mean, it's...it's tools for the toolbox, right? So, that as you're talking about the departments, Category A, you can see that in one column, in 2023, actual versus what was adopted. And then the next column, it shows you what was the leftover, right? That's the Carryover/Savings, and what we just saw, what Police did. Category A, they had \$3 million in excess, can you move it to B so that they were using it for operations, and parking, and all kind of different things. So, this spreadsheet, broken down by department--and I'm going to ask OCS to really explain it--but in general, when Pauline is passing out this sheet, you will see that this provides some data on actuals adopted, and what was underspent and a percentage, and then what we could possibly use as a percentage when we look at the departments based upon what actually happened. You're going to receive another spreadsheet on their request to reinstate positions from '25 that were cut, and this will show you the department, the program, the General Fund amount, and the department, the divisions, and the total. So, you can use that when the department comes up. And then the other spreadsheet is summary of expansion positions included in the budget, and this was what was being asked of you to reinstate...I'm sorry, that was the other one, reinstate. This is expansion positions that

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

they asked for for their department. And if we have almost 700 vacancies, and we're asking for expansion positions, I mean, that's the kind of thought process that you all were wondering about. And this summary that is passed out to you will show you the departments, the salary amount, and, you know, the division and...and explanation. So, at this time, you want to talk about this, and then we can...we can do a recess, or you want to do a recess and look at this first, and then we can...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. First. All right. So, OCS, why don't you explain it, and then I'm going to take a short recess so you can look at it, and then we'll start taking up the departments in 41. I really want to get started, but this is just tools for you to use as we go forward.

MS. SZABO: Thank you, Chair. So, what we...what has been distributed, just to start quickly, is just a summary of a list of the expansion positions that were included in the proposed budget. The next report was a summary of proposed reinstatements in the budget, so these were the reinstatement of cuts made in Fiscal Year '25. And then...then the Chair had asked us to do an analysis based on actual to budget, so you have two reports. The first one compares actual fiscal year, Fiscal Year '23 actual to Fiscal Year '23 adopted, and what that delta was under, mostly underspend, and then what that percentage is. And then that percentage is compared to Fiscal Year '24, so that there is some appearance of...of a trend, or at least some comparative data for you. The last report is the Category A, Fiscal Year '24 actual to Fiscal Year '24 adopted, and again, what that underspend number was and what the percentage is. And then just for sake of an example is, if you took that percentage and compared it to the Category A budget, what would that impact be? It is just an approach, it is not a recommendation. It's just data for the Members to use as they believe they may want, or need, or...or not.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Expansion positions, Category A, the second thing, and the third is...oh, reinstatement. And did we pass out the CIP? Did we pass out the CIP also? We did? Okay. So, the fourth one is, all along, when the departments came to us appropriately, if they did have CIP, the question was asked, you know, for their funding stack, how much of the General Fund can be moved to Bond Fund, right, as we're looking for...as we want to, I think, keep cash...as we're hearing about the Federal cuts, for us to be with cash would be significant. So, the CIP funding, it talks about the funding stack, and it has all the different funding sources on the left-hand column, and it talks about each department, and it gives totals and percentage of totals. So, that's this. Do you want to say more on that? You're fine with that.

MS. SZABO: No, Chair. But if there are any questions, we're happy to answer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. For the CIP, Members, we did send a question...Shane, I'll get to you right after I say this. We did send a question to the Budget...or Finance, I think. In order for projects to be able to be bonded, the Bond Counsel has to review the list of CIP projects, and give them an okay for legally it can be bonded. So, we sent that question to Finance. I don't know if we got the response yet. I think not yet. But we wanted to

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

know that all the...all the CIP projects that possibly, could they be moved to be bonded based upon what the Bond Counsel says. So, we're waiting for that. So, that's it. And I wanted to give you an opportunity to look at all of these spreadsheets, because it's a lot, and you can or cannot use it. It's up to you. But these are just like tools in the toolbox. For those of you online, did you get copies of it? Member Kama, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, Member Sinenci, did it get to you? Okay. We're all good. Member...Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, I'm looking at the...the sheet on salaries.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, the back page of the eight...of eight pages would be the totals, and the numbers in red are the unspent funds?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Over or underspend, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: The third column...the third column, right, you're looking at?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, it says over/under. So, which is it? Is it under?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Under...Members...

MS. SZABO: Yes, under is a negative number in red, yes. And if it was over, it would be...it would be black, a positive number.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, the...in other words, for '24, 35 million, almost 36 million, was not spent. And for '26, jumps to '26, 26 million is not spent?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait, where are you looking at? You're looking at...

MS. SZABO: Chair Lee...I'm sorry, may I, Chair? Chair Lee, I just would like to point out that we did remove some grant funds and some other programs that were funded separately. So, this is not intended to be a comprehensive report, that it is just for those programs where they are funded through General Funds, not Revolving or grants.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, but the main purpose is to show the excess. Excess after FY '24, and then it says FY '26. Did you mean '25?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, please.

MS. SZABO: Chair Lee, as an example, or some...a way to potentially use this report, that percentage that was underspent was applied to the Fiscal Year '26 Category A budget numbers for those respective departments. It is just...and it is not a recommendation.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

It is just an option, and a way to see if it...if it could...if this approach could be applicable to the budget as you evaluate salaries.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm not looking at it as a recommendation. I'm just trying to figure out what...what it is, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...I think I could explain it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, like for...take for example, Environmental Administration Program, the...the adopted salaries for the Environmental Administration Program was \$529,339. What they actually spent was \$513,402. So, they spent 3...they didn't spend 3 percent. So, if you take that 3 percent, and apply that 3 percent to what they're asking for in Fiscal Year '26, that would be a reduction of \$22,049. So, it's just the same percentage that they didn't spend in Fiscal Year '24, that same percentage is being applied to Fiscal Year '26 without any of the information that they gave us on the floor. Like we're making progress on this, or now we're...we have an engineering bonus, and all like that. It's just straight math.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: An example.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I can dumb shit down easy.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Members, so I'm going to give you a chance to look at this, and you can ask OCS Staff if you have questions. Who is...oh, I'm sorry. Member Sinenci? Sorry, I didn't see you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I was just curious by moving General Funds to bond funding, should we get the approval by the Bond Counsel? Does that change the budget?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it'll give us more cash. More cash.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just more cash on hand.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So...okay. Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Chair, I didn't get the CIP list.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Can you...Ms. Martin, do you know what the...what...202 in Granicus?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: What is the number for...to Granicus?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 202 in Granicus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's the one with the blue ribbon.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I see what you're saying. On the top, there is blue, yeah. Okay. So, Members, I'm going to take a little break. We'll come back at 3:10. Is that enough time? It's 2:58. Ten minutes? You want longer? 2:15 [sic].

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(inaudible). . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, 3:10. All right. This meeting is now in recess. . . .(gavel). . .

**RECESS:        2:58 p.m.**  
**RECONVENE:    3:13 p.m.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .(gavel). . . (Audio begins mid-sentence) --Finance, Economic Development Committee. It is now 3:13. We've had quite a day so far, and we...I want to start on Bill 41. Here we are, right? So, before the break, OCS Staff--thank you--prepared what I call tools for the toolbox, right? So, that's what you all have copies of, which is Category A, broken down comparisons for Fiscal Year '23, '24, as well as the reinstatement of positions, expansion positions which were asked for, and the CIP funding sheet. So, those are things that you can refer to, or we can go one by one. So, anybody have questions before we move on? All right. Let's go.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(inaudible). . .

**OFFICE OF THE COUNTY CLERK**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yep. No, no, no, sorry. County Clerk. We're going to start with...in Bill 41, it starts off with County Clerk. So, that's in Budget Bill, page 2. Are...are there any proposed amendments for the Office of the County Clerk? I don't think so. Oh, I didn't see any from any of you. None? They have no CIP. They have nothing in Appendix A, Part I, Grants. Appendix A, Part II, Special Purpose Revenue, not applicable. Appendix B, Rates and Fees. Appendix B, page 3. Are there any proposed amendments to the Rates and Fees for the Office of the County Clerk? I'm going to pull it up.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**OFFICE OF COUNCIL SERVICES**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That's what I'm looking for. Anybody else? Consensus? You're all fine? Consensus? Okay. Now, next. Also on page 2 on Bill 41, Council Services. Are there any proposed amendments to the Office of the Council Services? I don't see any. Okay. CIP, none. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Would...would...would we need to take up that Bill 49 now?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Getting there. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Hang on.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. CIP is none. Appendix A, Part I, Grants, not...not applicable. Appendix A, Part II, Special Purpose Revenues, not applicable. Rates and Fees, not applicable. Member priorities...okay. We'll take that next. So...so, Members, on Bill 49, which is a bill that...what happened to my notes? Hang on. I'm going to take a one-minute recess and get my notes from my Staff. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

**RECESS: 3:16 p.m.**  
**RECONVENE: 3:25 p.m.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It is now 3:25. And thanks for letting me take that break. So, we finished with Auditor and County Clerk. And on Council Services, which is also on...on Bill 41, page 2. Members, before we begin with OCS, I'd like to recommend that we defer action on Bill 49, Resolution 25-89, Resolution 25-90, relating to salaries, as we consider the broader implications for our County workers as a whole. I propose deferring action until a comprehensive Countywide salary study can be completed, which will allow for a more deliberate and equitable path forward. I'm not arguing against fair compensation for our hardworking OCS Staff. Rather, I feel we need to take a fair and consistent approach in how we support all County employees. A thorough review of compensation structures across the entire County workforce would ensure that adjustments are data-driven, not political or reactive, comparable across departments, and aligned with fiscal realities. We owe it to our civil service workers who have explicitly requested fairness. We do not operate in silos. OCS Staff work hard in hand with civil service counterparts, and this must be reflected on how we make decisions that impact long-term pay equity and workforce morale. Members, any thoughts?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. I respectfully disagree. I think we should vote on it now. I think to try and do a study is unfair because we're not talking about the same situation. We're talking about appointed officials, appointed employees who have absolutely no job security, do not have the same benefits and protections of civil service employees. So, do I agree that we should increase the compensation for our civil service employees? Absolutely. And we should take that up as a separate matter. But as far as OCS is concerned, and all the employees who will be receiving an increase in their salaries, I think they're more than well-deserved, and I think we should vote for it now. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I...I kind of agree with Chair Lee. I think that Ms. Takakura, when she testified to us on the 17th, made excellent points, and I'm really disappointed in HGEA for not commissioning an MTG (*phonetic*) study on their rates, and the comparisons between the elected/appointed officials and whatnot. But I think this is kind of one of those yes and situations. I mean, we can...we can talk about amending Bill 49 if...if Members don't feel comfortable with that, but I think we should...we would be skipping and taking things out of order. But the...the...and...and I am committed to bringing Bargaining Unit 3, 4, 11--no, not 11, sorry--3, 4, 13 and EMs up through a supplemental, but like Chair Lee said, we've seen so many of these vacancies pre-date 2019. And we've also seen plenty of our Analysts or other Staff not be renewed contract analysts, attorneys, whoever. And so, it's like you have a two-year contract, and if...if you haven't proven yourself in that amount of time to the leadership of OCS or the Members, that's it, you're done. And...and some of those people are working for civil service now. But if we have vacancies, say...say you have a six-month vacancy, that's one quarter of our term already. So, I think the important thing to note is that we have two years to come in and do a job that we're elected to do. And even if you get reelected, to some extent, everything starts over. You know, there's new rules, new whatever, depending...new makeup of the people. So, I think that's really important that we have great Staff that won't be poached, as some of them have been in the past and...and recent today or whatever...but that's part of the reason why we pay so well. We heard from people's own...own testimony that this is the way it's always been, and they made a choice to work where they did. And...and I'm not saying they made a choice to get paid shitty...sorry, badly...but we're trying to fix that, where they're...like we're trying to do the job of their union right now. And...and it's...it's junk that their union is doing so poorly, and not referencing what the elected and appointed people are being given a salary, they're not referencing...they're not commissioning their own MTG study, they're not, you know, working with Personnel on this supplemental thing. We've been working for like seven years now, and this is the first that we've heard. And every year, we're like, we need to do something about these vacancies, we need to bring up the...this pay. And this is the first we heard we can do supplemental agreements just this year because of the proposal in Bill 49. It's a question that we've asked year after year after year. And because of Bill 49 being proposed, we...we kind of have a pathway forward now. But we only have...at this point, we have three-quarters roughly of a term to work

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

on it. And...and we're going to need well-compensated, well-operating Staff to do that. So, I'm with Chair Lee on this one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. I'm supportive of the...of our OCS Staff. I'm not supportive of Bill 49 the way it's written. My understanding is that there is a pay increase of 5 or 6 percent that is already occurring from last year to this year, and it's happened the last two years. I like the idea of linking it to, and hopefully leveraging, getting a study for a broader base. Some of the other people who gave testimony who work for the County, and it was very difficult for them to come forward, clearly stated of...their feeling about how it does for morale. We are now at a budget, and increasing the budget to this degree in-house, I feel, is imprudent. I think we need to get through this budget. So, I'm not supportive. I'm very supportive of them getting the raise. I'm supportive of us talking about it. But right now, I'm not willing to vote for Bill 49. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Anybody else? Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I would happily support a study so we can pay evenly across the board. We did have that TVR study that we never spent money on in this current budget that potentially we could use. I don't know where it is, but it's somewhere. I love OCS Staff. I definitely couldn't do this job, and this...all these committees wouldn't be able to do any of their work without OCS Staff. So, it's not anything towards our Staff. They are absolutely fantastic. And they don't have the same guarantees as civil service. However, they have had step increases every year, unlike civil service. And we heard from Ms. Takakura, and so many other HGEA members and UPW members, and it was junk for them to come up and testify. And I...I...it sucks. It sucks for them right now. And I know that this is what's in our purview. But as we're going through this budget...as we're going to start going through this budget, and we do have to cut salaries because of vacancies, we're cutting salaries, and then increasing ours at the same time. It doesn't really look too good. If I was on the outside looking in, that's one. And I know....I know it's all...everybody has differences, and we don't have the vacancies--although if you look at the report, it looks like we have a bunch--but we don't have the vacancies that Admin does. And we...we learned about the HGEA contract on Thursday evening. And we saw what they were going to get. And theirs is a very small increase over the next few years. And I think it's like for Bargaining Unit Number 3, on their last year, they get .37 percent increase. That is so sad. And so, if we did a study, which I'm happy to support, I would hope that they could use it as a bargaining tool. The unions could use it as a bargaining tool, and they could say, look, the employers are willing to pay better. I think Member Rawlins made a...Rawlins-Fernandez made a really good point about adjusting for the cost of living. And when we, as Councilmembers, have a Staff of 40, but we support a Staff of thousands, you know. And on a side note, and this is nothing that we can control, I know for a fact the other employees are going to be angry with OCS Staff, and it's not at all their fault...at all. And it's creating animosity. And while they could apply for OCS, we don't have any place to hire them, and we need all of them to stay where they are,

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

and we need to get more. And sure, they could come and apply with us, of course. Majority of them...all of them are fantastic. But it...it would...it would create a weird us-versus-them scenario within our own very small government. And again, I'm going to end this with saying how much I really do love OCS Staff. And if we're going to start paying on morale, I don't know how much is enough. And one things we can...a few things we can do to support morale is be nice to the Staff, like I am...not bother them super late at night and on the weekends, like I try not to do. So, there's all these other things you can do to help morale. And being cool is one, but an increase of 30 percent while the others, as we cut their budget, is just...I don't know, a little tone-deaf. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I don't support your proposal. I support Chair Lee's proposal to pass Bill 49. I think your proposal to not pass Bill 49 continues to keep all employees down. It was because of Bill 49 that we finally learned about the supplemental agreement, like Member Paltin was saying, after over six years of being on the Council. Never heard of it. It was only until Bill 49 did...did we learn of it, and it was because of it. It motivated others in civil service to not keep settling for this .3 percent increase baloney. It...it motivated people to not remain complacent, to make noise, to be angry, to express that rage. Because that's what's needed oftentimes. Because if you're going to let people walk all over you, then that's what's going to happen. And I don't want people to continue walking all over our civil service. We need to be in solidarity, and we need to fight all together, not each other. They need to take that anger and...and direct it to the...to the right parties and the unions, to push the unions to do better. Because even when HGEA representative was testifying, she never told us about any supplemental agreement either. Increasing all of our County positions' pay would then force the private sector to also increase their pay. So, it helps everyone, because they would have to be competitive. But if we keep everyone down, then everyone just retains the same less-competitive pay because public sector continues to pay less. And so, private sector can also get away with paying less. We have very ambitious projects and programs that we are working on with our community that we need to have support Staff that will remain with us. Anytime we lose someone, it takes time to retrain. We need to be competitive with secretaries in the Administration that get paid far more. We have done...we have been doing salary supplements, sign-on bonuses, retention bonuses. We've been supporting our civil service. And what is political is claiming to support a competitive pay for Admin, and then not following through. And so, if we're going to do that, then that's great. Let's keep up the momentum. We already did a study, and the study showed that we have been underpaying our department heads. And that's where all the salaries should follow. It should be a substantial increase so that we...we...we don't continue to hemorrhage people. People, our community, the people that have been here for generations are what makes our community rich. And so, this is worth the investment. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Anybody else would like to add a comment? Member Paltin?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just wanted to point out, I think you put \$10 million for the hazard pay for Fire...Fire Department, and that they're the last unit to settle that, right? And, you know, Police, Fire, lifeguards, they all had to work during COVID, and that's what that's about. And...and, you know, to some extent, the elevated pay for Police, Fire, and...and whatnot is because they have a hazardous job by nature. Like you kind of risk your life to do that job. Our Staff, during COVID, never got no hazard pay. They don't have a union to fight for them for...for hazard pay. And on top of that, they...they transitioned, and led the way for the County to this online, and maintain this hybrid format when many counties went back to all in-person, which...it makes sense for us because we're...I guess they call it a canoe district. So, maintaining the hybrid format makes...makes better sense for us probably than other counties. And...and they got a minor increase during COVID because, you know, COVID, with all the uncertainty of that. But there...there's benefits to being a union person. You get your 45-minute break, you get your TA/TR, night-shift differential, on and on. You get your mandated like lunch break, your 15-minute break here and there. And especially, I guess, during this budget season, these guys are here with us to the end. They come in the dark, they leave in the dark. They don't get no hazard pay for...for working through COVID, like how the other unions got. And if...if we bypass this, personally, I don't have the will to...to do HGEA's job for them.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yeah? Thank you. All right. Members, I can hear the sentiment of this, and I'm going to defer this and take it up later. So, at this time I wanted to continue on with the discussion for OCS. So, Member Kama is not here, and she has a priority for...for OCS, so I'm going to skip that. And...okay. So, we'll come back tomorrow. So, we have to take up Auditor.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Also on...yes. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. You said we're going to defer Bill 49. When do you plan to take it up again so that we can vote on it?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, I'll let you know. I think I'm going to take it up when I take up all the bills at the end. So, we'll see.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Towards...towards Thursday...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And it's on the agenda so that we can take action on it?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Towards Thursday. So --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Kirsten and James, can we take it up on Thursday?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: Bill 49 and the other legislation is all posted for the remainder of the week.

**OFFICE OF THE COUNTY AUDITOR**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. Thanks. All right. So, Members, I'm going to be then taking up Auditor. Wait. Sorry, let me get my things in place. So, page 2, are there any proposed amendments to the Office of the Auditor? I don't think so. No discussion. They have no CIPs. They have no Appendix A, Part I, Grants. Appendix A, Part II, Special Purpose Revenue. Appendix B, Rates and Fees. And Member priorities, none. So, consensus, we're all good? For County, the auditors? Consensus? Okay. Consensus, Members? All right. Anything for Auditors? We're done.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Consensus.

**DEPARTMENT OF AGRICULTURE**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Next, we're going to take up our first administrative department, which is Department of Ag. So, in Bill 41, it's page 2 to 4. Are there any proposed amendments to Category A, Salaries for Agricultural Program? Yes, Member Paltin. I think...did you want to use this...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No. I did my own math, thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. What is it? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move...I'm on B.1.a.(1) A. I move to cut the amount by 65,128, plus a fringe of \$48,468. And if I get a second, I'll explain myself.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second. Motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee. And can you tell us the alphabet again? Is it a...a(1)?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's under B, Management and Other Functions; 1. Department of Agriculture; a. Agricultural Program; (1) Disbursement for Salaries and Premium Pay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Category A. Did you want the numbers again too?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Can you please say the number?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's going to be 65,128, plus a fringe of \$48,468.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then I had a second. So, my discussion would be, these are for the--in my mind, but it doesn't need to be in their mind, but in my mind--these are for the two positions where the classes still needs to be created by DPS. For me, I anticipate, based on past practice, that this will take longer to get to posting for open recruitment than their other vacancies because the class specifications still need to be created. But other than that, they've been very good at filling their vacancies, but this, a lot of it depends on DPS.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussions? Seeing none. All in favor...you want to vote or consensus? We have a motion, so let's vote. All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I guess that's eight "ayes," one excused, which is Member Kama. Okay. Motion...motion carries.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:    None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I had another couple amendments that are nonmonetary.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: On B.(3)(ix)(a), my amendment would have been to the...is to the language. It would say, the microgrants must be disbursed with efforts to ensure

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

equitable distribution among applicants in Maui, Molokaʻi, and Lānaʻi, with preference given to socially-disadvantaged farming applicants, such as women and Native Hawaiians, and to farmers who did not receive funding in prior fiscal years from the microgrant funding. The microgrants will be exclusively to food-producing and floriculture farm businesses that operate...and then everything else the same. Just basically adding floriculture farm businesses.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. After food-producing.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. And if I get a second, I'll...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Paltin, seconded by Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, there was testimony from local lei makers, as well as, you know, we got testimony from the wedding industry, and I think it benefits us to keep this revenue local. You know, we...or I...make a big deal about all the imported purple orchid Thai leis and...you know, I mean, for weddings, we definitely don't want them to import flowers from Hawaiʻi Island or other places where they don't have a MISC that works as diligently to keep out little fire ant, and so on, and so forth. So, during COVID, you know, the...it's understandable that the focus was on food-producing, and...and I think, you know, the majority of it, food-producing is very important, but our local floriculture industry is also important in this time period.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? Member --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. And for Sunshine Law purposes, my husband, Makena Fernandez, was here for a second, and now he's gone. Anyway, okay. He's not a minor. All right. So, I saw that Member Kama proposed \$250,000 to...I think, to increase...for the purposes of the lei makers, and I'm supportive of that. I'm not supportive of having florists compete with our food-producers. I think our food-producers need to be, you know, given as much of the funding as possible because when barges don't come, we can't eat the flowers. We...we need to, you know, invest in food. And so, I...I have a proposal that's attached to this, which I will come back to later, but I...I will be voting against the motion, and in support of Member Kama's proposal to allocate...to increase the funding for nonfood-producer flora...floralists [sic] when she proposes that instead. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? Member Uʻu-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER UʻU-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I thought I saw what Member Rawlins-Fernandez is talking about in our book, but can you please,

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

Member Rawlins-Fernandez, tell me what page that's on so I can see specifically? I swear I saw it, and now I can't find it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I thought it was for actually Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's on page 2. \$250,000 nonfood ag subsidy, flowers and plants to make lei. It's right below my proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I see that.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's the third one on page 2.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. It's actually --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- that looks...that's Member Cook's one, I was looking for Auntie Tasha's name or Member Kama's name, so it's...it's TC, not TK --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: TC.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- but super...okay. That's what I remember seeing, and then I couldn't find her name. Thank you so much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that correction. Tom, Tasha, same thing. Just kidding, just kidding.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: They look alike. Okay. So, that's both under Ag. All right. So, the vote is to Member Paltin's amendment. Any more discussion? All in favor, raise your hand, say...oh, we're going --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We're going to need a roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- we better do a --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- roll call. We're going to do a roll call. Okay. Roll call, please.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair?

MS. MACDONALD: Council Chair Lee.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Can I have a question real quick?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, one moment.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Sorry to interrupt.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Is there any prohibition from any rules to have both of them? So, if we vote for this, can also have the other?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: There's no prohibition.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Roll call.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Oh, Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: My apologies. I have yard work outside, but can you repeat the...the vote again? Sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Staff.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You want me to? It's basically to allow floriculture in the microgrants. I wasn't going to support Member Cook's one because I'm not looking for a lot of cuts.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. If this passes, I will definitely not be supporting Member Cook's proposal. And again, I...I don't think that we should be diminishing the amount that we're investing in food security, especially after we just published...Department of Ag just published its Food and Nutrition Security Plan. Like the 3 million is for food and nutrition security, and not floral security. Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Any other comments? Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: If you don't mind, maker of the motion, can we defer this so we can give it a little bit more thought? If...if there's a compromise in...you know, possible.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm okay with deferring it. I do have another motion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's just that, you know, I think we all support almost everything, but there's got to be an answer to this. And maybe if we give it more time, it'll come.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you want to defer it? You're fine with deferring it?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or whatever you want to call it, tabling it --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I have...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- or whatever.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I have an idea.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Is it a good one?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For my third and final.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All my ideas are good. . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- one minute.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: One minute.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Here's another idea. If...if Member Paltin wants to consider doing the up to 250,000, we can also...you know, I might be able to consider that --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You mean of the 3 million?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- but I would have to think about it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Are you talking about up to 250 of the 3 million?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. But...but I would also...that's just an idea. I haven't...I haven't like decided if that...if I would support that, but at least it wouldn't compete with all 3 million.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm down with that.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Anyway. So --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But we can still defer.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- but...but I...I would also support deferral for now...tabling of the motion so we can think about it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can I table that and make another motion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, my next motion is to amend B.(3)(xiii) to change the name from University of Hawai'i...oh, Tropical Agriculture/Human Resources to Human Resilience. And if I get a second, I'll discuss.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Second...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Motion made...motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I think we got testimony from that one guy to change the name of the agency on the 17th.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. We did. Okay. Any other discussion? Before we vote, did we check to make sure that it's legally correct? You know, because then we're going to run into a problem with DCCA.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, we'll...we'll double-check. But yes, my understanding is that CTAHR has changed that to Resilience instead of Resources.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Okay. That was the first time I heard of it. All right. So, all in favor...or we can vote on this, right? All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, that's eight...Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: What was the motion again?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, we're changing Resources to say Resilience.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Change the name of...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, okay. Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, it's eight...eight "ayes." Motion passes. Member Kama excused.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:    None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anything else?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That concludes mine. I had a priority, but I withdrew it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, any other priorities for...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I have a priority, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, you do? Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Mine is \$2 million, Local Nutritional Security Initiative Farm-to-Family. The funds must be used for a grant program for Maui County-based organizations to purchase...enter in purchasing contracts, or establish consumer subsidy programs for foods grown and harvested in Maui County. All proposed local food-purchasing incentive programs must pay market value cost to producers or farmers. Programs should be designed to benefit Hawai'i State residents. Only food that is grown or harvested in Maui County will qualify for the program. Processed foods may be purchased with this fund if 80 percent or more of the ingredients are grown or harvested in Maui County, and the final is product and made in Maui County. Preference may be given to programs that purchase kūpuna crops, and programs that

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

serve populations with the greatest need. Now, kūpuna crops, I've also heard them called canoe crops and, you know, those, but that...that language is from the...that language is from the Department of Ag. So, some examples of the Maui County-based organizations are food banks, senior centers, early childhood centers, after-school programs, youth programs, homeless shelters, Social Security program...or social service program, food hubs. So, the...okay. Let's see here. I also wanted to say that on page 5 of the Department of Ag response to my question, if they support the \$2 million grant to be awarded to grantees promoted the purchase of local food to bring in Maui-grown crops to residents' table, their response was yes, the increase in grant funding for locally-grown products would be welcome. That's from the Department. And I just want to add that this priority aligns with four of the Maui County Food and Nutritional Plan goals. And...you guys, I...I can read the four goals, but basically they're ensure all residents have access to nourishing foods, support produce and expand food production, build vibrant local food economies, and promote healthy, resilient ecosystems. So, those are in the plan as...as it is. And that's...that's the priority.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this is part of the priorities that you just submitted.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Correct? What page is it on? Just curious.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: 3.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And the Department supports it?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, they do. We approached the Department of Ag with an idea to create increased food and nutritional security for our residents after reaching to our entities who could potentially apply for the grant to help feed the people they serve. After...after getting their feedback, we proposed language and worked with the Department to craft the final proposal. So, yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: At...okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Very good. Any other questions regarding this?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: U'u-Hodgins.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Can I ask how you came up with 2 million? And can I also ask if you're going to be participating in this program in the future?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Me, myself as a farmer, I don't have any plans to, and all my food is grown on Lānaʻi. I try to keep it on there. So, I don't --

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- I...I...

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: So, this is just for like Maui...Maui Island?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I’m sure Lāna‘i resident...other farmers could probably apply to it, but I don’t...I can’t benefit from that.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Because it has...you know, ethics.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: I mean, same, like right? We have a citrus farm as well, so...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: I’m...I’m just asking for clarity. And then the 2 million, how do you come up with that number? Do you...do we know how much all the things are going to cost? Do we have like places we can shop from?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well...

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: This is cool, don’t get me wrong.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: I just...I have questions.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: The...the food...Maui Food Hub has constantly been telling us that they run out of locally-grown produce. It’s one of the highest demands that they have.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Cool.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: They opened up the Lāhainā one, you know, recently. And the Food Bank alone gives a lot of food to those...to those people who dish it out to the actual eaters of the food. So, I try to stay conservative, and...and Department said that they could handle 2 million.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, I would go more, because again, they’re running out...the food...you know, people are running out of food.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: But 2 million, I think, is...is what I...you know, working with the Department, I think is what would be best.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay. Do you know how much like pounds of food come with that 2 million or something? I know it varies, right? Like, avocados are super heavy, and they’re expensive.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, if we...if...you know, remember, this is a preference towards the kūpuna crops.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And those tend to be heavier, right?

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, the root crops, that...it’s not like a light lettuce. So, it’s a heavier, starchier...

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay. Cool. I just don’t want to see...and I get it, I just don’t want to see like \$2 million worth of like micro cilantro go on somebody’s like --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right, right.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: -- fancy tacos or something.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I...I...you know, it’s really...

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Which I’m not against it, I actually love it. It’s adorable, I’m just saying.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: You make a valid point, Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins. Because when we work with the Department, this is what their preference is.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Cool.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And I like that, the fact that they’re coming in and kind of steering the farmers what we would want you to --

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Great.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- to buy.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Thanks.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Or to grow, and we would buy.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you...thank you for providing some detail.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: A point of information. I was just wondering, are you expecting us, as we go through the first department...well, we went through others, but Ag, to bring up our Ag --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- priorities?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, that's what --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: That's what he's doing.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- that's what he's doing.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: That's...that's what we're supposed to be doing?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- so we can kind of complete it.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I see. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Or unless...unless if there's, you know, we want to revisit. That's...that's an option, too, right?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, no, no. I was just waiting to see if that's what I'm supposed to do next.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: To bring...bring up my priority. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, who has Ag priorities is Member Cook, and Member Rawlins-Fernandez, Johnson has more, and Paltin, and me.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, I withdrew mine.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You withdrew yours. And Lee, and me, and...okay. And you have also, Member U'u-Hodgins? Yeah, I don't see yours. Okay. Next...Member Johnson, are you done?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, what is the process? We're going to vote on this?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I had a question on...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you have...okay. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, my question is, it's Farm-to-Family Grant, is this 2 million, the Department of Ag is going to be administering it? But they already outsourced the 3 million microgrant program. So, when we created the 3 million microgrant program, they didn't have the capacity, so they outsourced it, and they're continuing to outsource it. Now they have the capacity for a 2 million grant program? I mean, same thing like Member U'u-Hodgins, I'm supportive, I just don't want it to become Carryover/Savings.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, neither do I. That's why...that's why I called them, and that's why...if you noticed, a lot of the...you know, they helped us work this out. For example, the kūpuna crops, those were ideas that they suggested.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But they said they have the capacity?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: But we asked them, and they said they have capacity. They said they would...it...the project aligns with all four of the Maui...they just wrote the Maui County Food and Nutritional Plan goals.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is it going to be something similar, that they're going to contract out to another entity?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I...they didn't mention that to me, that they're going to contract it out. It seems like they...they had...let's see here.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then, did they --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- after.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- do they need more Staff to take on, like...and is there a maximum? Because it says local food purchasing, Farm-to-Family Grant. So, we're awarding grants. Is there a...is there a max that...like, I think the microgrants are supposed to be in increments of, like, 25 grand, or something like that. Could...could one entity get the full 2 million? And then they implement it in that way, and so it's easy to...

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No, I don't...I don't see them...they...they didn't say...like that's not what I think they'll be doing. Because it says, awarded the grants to promote purchase of local food to bring Maui food crops residents' to the table [sic], and they responded, yes, the increase in grant funding for locally-grown produce will be welcomed. And I have the answer here, let me find it. There's a lot of papers.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I know Member Rawlins-Fernandez has her hand up. Member Paltin and Member Johnson are having this discussion about this.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. So, I see Action 1.5.1, expand farm-to-food bank purchasing to increase residents' access to locally-grown and raised products. I did a search for, you know, other sections that had purchasing to see if it aligned completely with what Member Johnson's proposal is, and I didn't see one that aligned verbatim. I'm supportive, and I could be more supportive of Member Paltin's earlier proposal with Member Johnson's program. So, I think if the concern is that, you know, you don't want...Member Johnson, you don't want, you know, all 2 million to go to one organization, like the Food Bank, for example, then you'd put that condition in, right? And if you don't have, you know, that detailed proposal now, because, you know...I mean, because that may be something that you support. I don't know. You know, in...in this, it could end up going to four organizations or something. And so, you know, with the 3 million for the microgrants...well, 25,000 divided by the 3 million is 120. So, that's 120 grants. I...I didn't subtract the admin fee amount, so it wouldn't be 120, it would be less than 120. But, you know, it's...it's a lot of grants to manage. And for this 2 million, because it's...you know, it's potentially to organizations that are doing the purchasing of local foods, then it wouldn't, you know, be 100 organizations that they would need to manage. It would...it would be much less. How much less? I think Member Johnson's trying to figure that amount out right now. And...you know, and then we can...I think they would have the capacity to be able to manage less than, you know, ten grants for the purchasing...the purpose of purchasing. My ask to you, Member Johnson, is if you, instead of preference, may be given, if it shall be given --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, I'm fine with that.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- to purchase kūpuna crops. Okay. Great. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I...I want to...if your...if I could respond to your question...because I don't want to forget it, because there's a lot. I mean, I have to...I got two questions I want to respond to. But if you had more to say, I'd...I'll...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, I --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm done.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- I asked...I asked the Department...it was number 7, I actually asked the question that we're all talking about. Would the Department support 2 million grant to the awardee to grantees to promote, purchase local food? If yes, how much funding would the Department recommend to be allocated per grantee? Which is exactly what we're just talking about today. And they said yes, to increasing grant funding for locally-grown produce would be welcome as it aligns with our Department goals. And then they went into three types. Farm-to-food bank, locally food purchasing will expand the Maui Food Bank. A produce prescription program could include our six Federally-qualified community health centers and Native Hawaiian health centers so they can...they listed all six of them. So, they're considering all of those. And then a local food subsidy program will benefit all Maui County residents, especially our ALICE people. So, they're going to be focusing on ALICE populations, the people who go to the Federally-qualified health centers, and the food banks. So, they're going to have to divide it up some way. If you...if you Members want to put a earmark on it, or say up to a certain amount...in all honesty, I want the Department to take the lead on it because they're the subject-matters...experts. You know, I would feel confident in Director and Deputy Director being in charge of how much. But just information...and here's another point of information, Maui Food Bank purchased a million dollar...or a million pounds with a \$1.3 million...a million...\$1,300,000, so they're...they're...they're big...that's...you know, those are...those are...that's what's happening is, you know, in...in practice.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. He answered all the questions. Member U'u-Hodgins, Member Paltin, anybody else on this? So, where are we in terms of whatever changes the Members are asking for?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I think the question was...is, you know, the...the type of crops--I always call it canoe crops, but they call it kūpuna crops--so, if we change it from for giving a preference to shall, I think was the term, Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez? I'm...I'm okay with that. If...again, I kind of just want to let them decide, and if...if we want to put our thumbprint on it, that's fine too, but I get where we're going with it. We want them to not have pounds of cilantro they're purchasing, but I don't think that that's what's going to happen.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, where...where did you want the shall to go, on the last line? Shall be given to programs that purchase kūpuna crops and programs that serve populations with the greatest need. So, you want preference --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Preference shall --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- shall.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- be given?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Staff would preference must over shall, if that's okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. We're...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, must. Sorry, plain language. Yes, must.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Fine with me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, there's that amendment. All right. Anything else? Seeing none. All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: -- apologies. I know the Committee's been discussing the priority --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We didn't have a...

MR. KRUEGER: -- on the floor, but there's --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No motion.

MR. KRUEGER: -- technically no motion on the floor yet.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, I move to...what is my move? To...to create \$2 million for locally nutrition security initiative Farm-to-Family Program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Your condition Countywide number 2, right? With the amendment of the word must, to the last sentence, after preference. Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, second. Okay. So, Member Cook second by...Member Johnson, second by Member Cook. All right. Members, any more discussion? All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye."

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's going to be eight "ayes." Yeah, eight "ayes." And Member Cook...I mean, Member Kama excused.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:    None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Mahalo, Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Okay. So, that's one. So...okay. In the excitement, if you can go back to Bill 41, and if we can take up operations, are there any proposed amendments to B, Operations and Equipment for Agriculture Programs? And then I'm going to take up your priorities after. Anybody have any changes for this? Seeing none. And then afterwards, there's CIP, they have none. Appendix A, Part I, Grants, none. Appendix A, Part II, Special Purpose Revenue. Animal Management Revolving, page 48. Moloka'i Farming Cost Reimbursement Program Fund, page 57. County of Maui Ag Park Revolving Fund, page 60. So, anybody have any amendments with that? Seeing none. All right. Rates and Fees, Appendix B, page 3. Are there any proposed amendments to the rates and fees for Department of Agriculture? Appendix B, page 3. Seeing none. Okay. Now I'm going to go into your priorities. We just did Member Johnson, which was one of many that are in Department of Ag. You have no others, right, Member Johnson? I do not see for you. Okay. So, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. So, from [sic] the Department of Agriculture, my Countywide number 5, Agriculture Program Grants and Distribution for Agricultural Promotion, Non-Food Agriculture. Increase the nonfood agriculture grant subsidy by 250,000 for flowers and plants used to make leis. Explanation, this will assist the flower and plant growers to meet the current demand for local lei production. I'd like to explain to the Members my motivation and logic. Besides having heard from some of the farmers Upcountry about the challenges of competing with imported leis...I remember...anyway. I think that although food production is critical and important, the farmers also having

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

other cash crops are very helpful. And the flowers feed the spirit and the soul, as well as food feeds the stomach. So, I ask the Members for their support.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, it's your Countywide...on page 2, Countywide number 5, and Agriculture Program, increase nonfood agriculture grant subsidy, right, by 250 for...okay, flower and plants used to make lei. All right. You heard the explanation. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Maybe we should take this up together with mine [sic] one because I'm...I'm not supportive of increasing for the flower, but I am supportive of Member Rawlins-Fernandez's language about carving out 250,000 of the 3 million for them. Because...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'm supportive of that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So, shall we retake that one up? Or I don't know how to proceed.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm sorry, what...Member Cook, can you speak?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, that's your motion and second for discussion.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Cook, and seconded by Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Having heard from colleague Member Paltin, I withdraw my motion because I think that her proposal is going to be satisfied. I withdraw my motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Are you fine, Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah, totally. I'm happy to support that. I supported it for discussion purposes. I love our floriculture. I got married only not too long ago, and one of the things that my husband absolutely demanded we don't do--and if you met him, you know he has very little demands--was buy flowers from elsewhere. He was happy to support our local flower growers, but he absolutely refused buying and importing flowers. As well as the open bar as soon as you get there, but he only had two requests, and this was one of them.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Open bar.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Open bar as soon as you get there, local flowers only. So, happy to support this. I think Member Paltin's...the merge between what Member Rawlins-Fernandez suggested and Member Cook and Member Paltin in the

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

Agriculture Micro Grants Program, floriculture up to \$250,000 and carve that number out, I'm happy to support.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, motion made by Member U'u-Hodgins, seconded by Member Paltin. So, you're talking about...on page 3 of the Department of Ag, number (ix), Agriculture Micro Grants Program, to carve out 250,000. And Member Rawlins-Fernandez, I guess, we got to ask her. This is kind of her baby. Member Paltin...Member Rawlins-Fernandez, you have a comment?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. So, I'm...I'm drafting up language for that. It...it would be a...Section B, and then it would just say up to 250,000 for flowers and plants to make lei.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Everybody okay with that? Okay. I need a second. All right. Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm sorry, what did you say, Member Rawlins-Fernandez? Did you...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I see Deputy Corp. Counsel Toshikiyo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Ms. Toshikiyo? Hello.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Hi. Thank you. I just have a question. So, for the Agriculture Micro Grants Program, if it's a new subsection B up to the 250K, does it have the same restrictions as subsection A?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Except for the --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I would say yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- part about exclusively food production, everything except for that part.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Okay. So it would be similar language rather than a separate grant under the Agricultural Micro Grants Program. Does that make...sorry, does that make sense? Because if we added it as a new subsection B, then it's a condition that's under (ix) for the \$3 million, but I don't think that the restrictions in subsection A would apply unless you apply them to section B...the new subsection B.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Something like up to 250,000 of the 3 million could be, but if the floriculture people don't apply for that, then it could go to food-producer stuff.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, how about the microgrants will be exclusive to food-producing farm businesses that operate on no less than an aggregate of 12 acres, or up to an aggregate of 40 usable acres for livestock producers...hoo, that's a long sentence. Okay. I won't add it there. I was going to throw it in there, Ms. Toshikiyo, but...okay. While we figure out where to put it, you want to consider my proposal? Mines is easier.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I had Staff draft . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- this was made...motion made by Member U'u-Hodgins, and do we need a second for that to even --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- continue this?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, she did? Okay. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean, usually when we were doing land use, we could say the intent, and then Staff at a later time could draft...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I got it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I got it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. Before the microgrants will be exclusive, it would...it would say, except for up to 250,000 for flower and plants used to make lei, the microgrants will be exclusively to food-producing farm businesses. How's that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo, is that okay?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I'm sorry, can you please repeat that?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Before the...where the microgrants will be exclusively to food-producing farm businesses that operate on less than, it would be except for up to 250,000 for flowers and plants used to make lei...and there's no "S."

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Okay. Yes, that works.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah? Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, we solved that. Any more discussion? Seeing none. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, Chair? Apologies.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Just before taking the vote, so should Staff interpret those changes as like a friendly amendment to Councilmember U'u-Hodgins' motion on the floor right now?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Totally.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yup.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Friendly. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Sorry. Okay. So, friendly amendment. Shall we vote? All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**VOTE:**        **AYES:**        **Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:**        **None.**

**ABSTAIN:**        **None.**

**ABSENT:**        **None.**

**EXC.:**        **Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:**        **APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. As Chair Lee would say, we like to see everybody working together. Now, next. So, I think this is one that Member Cook and I need to talk about, axis deer. And we were asked during the break for us not to talk about it amongst ourselves. So, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: In my conversations with the Upcountry ranchers and West Maui ranchers on the North Shore, it was brought to my attention that some of the grants that have been State funding for deer fencing has not been allocated to what I would call small to medium-sized ranches, like 50 to 200, 400 acres, and had been principally the rather large landowners appropriately to mitigate the deer from--I forget the word, but going all the way across the mountain. So, anyway, mine was for --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Different size.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- a broad base on the medium-sized farmers that...ranchers that have not currently been getting it. I...I don't...my preference, Chair, is not to like tie it up too much. My intent is that it basically get fences on the ground to further mitigate deer. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. So, for mine, which is on page number 4, Countywide 4, Grants and Disbursements for Animal Management, add 1.5 million for mitigation of axis deer and other feral animals. And I think where that came from, where people probably thought there was a limitation on acreage...because when we did this...I did this with Victorino, and we did, we basically said, you know, like how Member Rawlins-Fernandez created her...her microgrant program, it was kind of tied to acreage. And...but I agree with what you're saying because there's a lot of...Brendan Balthazar, and all these other, you know, ranchers that have come forward, as well as farmers of different sizes, like Hashimoto Persimmon Farm, right? So, that first one created some...some division. So, I like your train of thought, because

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

we do need to help those people. Would you be willing then to combine yours and mine and make it for 2.5? Yours is 1, right? What is yours?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah, I have no objection to that. I'm supportive.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: So, yours doesn't have any specification. Member Cook's one is for fencing. What is your mitigation for?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. Oh, I'm sorry. That is.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Oh, for fencing too?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For whatever...whatever it means, right? Is mitigation for the control of the overpopulation of feral animal and axis deer. I did speak with Lokahi Pacific, who handled the period...I mean the grant at that time when we first launched the Axis Deer Task Force. And this was the first active motion that we took for the task force. And...and we did try to accommodate those, you know, lower...because we felt like the major ranches, right, they were getting Federal help, more so than the small guys. But I like what you're thinking. So, maybe we could just make this so that it is for anybody up to your...what is your...what is your acreage that you're talking about? What is the medium-sized ranches, your acreage?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I would just sort of leave it open. It's like if they --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- basically, they're going to apply, they're going to have to qualify, they're going to have to be an active endeavor...so it probably won't be a one- or two-cow deal. And it may be the pineapple...pineapple growers?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, they have...them too. Maui Gold.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I guess we run the risk that somebody would get the whole thing, but I kind of doubt it, because that's not the intent. I don't need...I don't think we need to put a bunch of fine print in it --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I had spoken to...I see hands going up. So, I had spoken to Lokahi Pacific, who administered this previously, and they were interested, and they have their, you know, network that they learned from that first round of different farmers and ranchers. Member U'u-Hodgins, and then Member Paltin.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I have a little bit more questions. So, Member Cook's grant is related to the microgrants program...the microgrants program, and then yours is just in animal management. If you guys combine it, are you guys going to animal management? Because I don't think you want to condition 2,500,000 after we just --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- conditioned 250. So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- what, we going to fold it into yours?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I think so.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And not tie up with...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I...I concur.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: And we're going to keep the word mitigation, because that means more than fencing?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For the over...overpopulation and . . .(inaudible). . .

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. So then we're going to scratch Member Cook's one out then?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I mean, you know, on my paper, in my head, we're going to scratch it out.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Are you fine, Member Cook?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: And then yours is changing to 2?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, so we're going to combine ours. We're going to get married.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Are you guys fine? Members, are you fine? Okay. Very good. So...great.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All I can do to help axis deer and feral animals, I'm here. I want us...I want us to tackle--I'm going to say this loud so the Administration can hear--Keōpūolani Park has a really bad deer problem, and I've been talking about it...oh, maybe now for five years. So, I hope something gets done. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. You know, I understand the intent, of course. You know, I live on Lāna'i, a lot...plenty deer. Plenty deer all over the islands, you know, not just Lāna'i. But I kind of want to make it so that we could address those people who are actually ranching or actually farming. Could you put in language and say if...you know, if there's dedicated ag land, or maybe a...the size limit is what I'm concerned with. Like, I'm looking at the...the class, Agriculture class parcels...40,000 acres and above, they're...these are \$8 million parcels...I mean, \$7 million parcels. I think they can put it in their budget to protect their investment. And you look at the owners, and these folks are not...they're, you know, corporate, you know. So, something like that, where you did have a size...you know, 40,000 acres, we only know a few people that have 40,000 acres, and I think they can afford a deer fence, just saying. So, I...I would like to put a size limit on it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: In terms of acreage?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: In terms of acreage, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- 500 acres or less?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. That's...that's fine with me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else have any comments? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was...I was kind of looking through, but isn't feral animal/axis deer under Office of the Mayor --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: It is.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- currently?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so, is this a proposal to create two different feral animal things, or would it be better under the Office of the Mayor, or would it be better to move the feral animal from the office? Because, I mean, it doesn't seem efficient to have feral --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Two places.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- animal/axis deer in two different departments, one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Agree. Agree.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So, what...what...what is the proposal?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we'll...we'll take this up...we'll move it. We'll move it to OED. That's what you're talking about, right? And take it out of Ag.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, I wasn't making a suggestion. I was...I mean, if...if that's your suggestion, then that's acceptable to me. I mean, I think we...we discussed briefly about maybe next fiscal year...because Human Concerns packaged up Humane Society, animal management, and just kind of dumped it on Agriculture. It a little bit does make more sense to me for a feral animal management to be under Agriculture, and Humane Society stuff to be under OED. I don't know if that's a change we can make this year because Agriculture seemed to be up on what Maui Humane Society is doing, but it makes more sense to me that feral animal control would be under Agriculture and Humane Society would be under OED kind of stuff. And then on the...so...I mean, just so it's together, so it's not like disjointed efforts against feral animal management. And then we're...you're saying we're adding up to 2 million instead of 1.5, is that what it is?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, mine was 1.5 and yours is 1, right? So, I was trying to combine the both is what...combine both.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, it's 2, now?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, 2...2.5.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And...and I...oh, 2.5.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 2.5...because mine was 1.5, and Member Cook was 1. So, I was trying to...we're trying to combine.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I'm...I'm just saying we've...we've cut about 100,000 and we've added close to 5 million, so...and I'm...I'm --

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're going the wrong way.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- not doing heavy lifting, so this is on you folks. So, just...I can be supportive, but just be aware.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Coming up. Okay. So, we need to...so, from the discussion, the Ag Department said that they didn't really want to, but they had the Humane Society now with them, and they'll make do with it, right? Is that the gist that you got?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. I mean, for this year, they're...they're prepared, but, you know, in the long run, it's not a great fit. And I feel like feral animal management is a better fit because farming, and ranching, and like that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I mean --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Agree.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- up to you folks, if we want to force it on them now, feral animal management as well, and then move Humane Society, but I just wanted to give some foreshadowing. At least for next fiscal year, that's what I'd like to see. Whether they comply with my heart's desire or not is up to them. But maybe next year, we can force it on them.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, the discussion is...okay, Humane Society is there, right? We're not talking...we're not talking about moving it. And that feral animal then would be better fit, you're saying, in the Department of Ag versus...and I'm used to with...when I did the 1.5 years ago, it was with OED to administer it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Did you...did you speak with Department of Ag regarding your proposal if they had the capacity to oversee this in addition to Humane Society kind of things, and Member Johnson's 2 million?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You know, boy, oh boy.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You didn't?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I didn't.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, maybe we should put it under Mayor then. I mean, if you've spoken to the OED folks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'll...and I'll tell you what, I didn't speak to OED either because I did it there in...in years past, right? I mean, that's where it was housed.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. I don't know if anyone from years past is still there. But...I don't know. I don't know what to say.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I like how we're keeping...we're doing the math. We're going the wrong way. Okay. Okay. So, Members, where do you want to keep...where do...where do you want the feral animal to be?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry. Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez? Did you have your hand up?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I did, but we can continue along this. I was going to shift gears, but if we want to finish this conversation first, I can...I can support that and wait. I would...I would prefer it to be under Department of Ag. And then I did have a proposal that actually was going to move it to Department of Ag and reduce the feral animal to 100,000. But...yeah. So, I'm...I'm supportive. But also, as we were discussing, the number of grants is what makes it a little wieldy *[sic]*...I think that's the word. So, neither you or Member Cook have a condition that caps the grant awards, right? So, if one person wanted all 1 million, then there's nothing stopping a grantee from, you know, submitting an application for all --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- whatever amount, million dollars, right? So, I think the amount of grantees, you know, potentially, would...would make it a little more work for the Department of Ag. But I would support it being under Department of Ag.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, I have a...I did speak with Lokahi Pacific because they were the nonprofit that basically handled that first 1.5 that I did, and when it was in OED. And I did check back with them. They have all their reports, and they have all, you know, whatever. It was a \$30,000 grant, and it was administered for mitigation of, you know, the growing number of axis deer. So, I would recommend it to be 30,000, 40,000, if Member Cook would allow that. Yeah, is that all right?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I don't understand what...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. So, the cap...the cap for how much the grant can be is 30...I did 30, so maybe years have gone by, maybe it needs to be 40.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I would cap it at 100,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Per?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. Because to actually do fencing on acreage, it's like \$25 a linear foot depending upon where it goes, et cetera. So --

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- prices are going up. But I think \$100,000 would be at, you know, minimum 25 grants, and would be substantial, so...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Up to...up to 100,000. Okay. So, that's the cap. It's for a medium-size. Yes? Yes, Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, I wanted to ask our estimator Councilmember, \$100,000 will get you how many yards of fence?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 4,000 linear feet, which is about...5,200 feet would be a mile, so a little better than three-quarters of a mile.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. How high?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, it has to be seven.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I...I would...I'm thinking that the people who do this should...are...are going...should also be...have skin in the game, and it's like we're not doing it all.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: If we do 4,000 feet of linear fence, that's a significant contribution. And when they're doing it, they supply the labor, they supply the stuff, and expand it. So, that was my thought.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I see. Oh, so, the actual cost is like maybe double that?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, that is...I'm saying \$25 a linear foot.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. I thought you said they supply the labor.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, I'm saying if they supply materials and labor to extend and do more fencing.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, I see.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Are we good? And I think axis deer fencing is...like seven feet is what NRCS recommends, and it's gone up at...in our ag park too. Department of Land and Natural Resources put up seven-foot fences. All right. So, are we...any more

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

questions so we can move forward? Okay. So, this is going to be 2.5 million, 100,000 maximum grant per...what was the number of acres? Did you say 50?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 500.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 500. Oh, sorry. 500 acres maximum for the farmer or...or rancher. So...and this is going to be in Department of Ag. And I'm going to recommend that...can you put it there, it's for Lokahi Pacific to administer the grant? Okay. Members, all in favor say "aye." Or is it...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I had a question. So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- on page 18 of the budget bill, it says Grants and Disbursements for Water and Environmental Resource Protection, and items (i), (ii), (iii), and (iv) is for feral animal control. Did you want to move that over, decrease any amount, or what? Because I thought we wanted to keep it all together.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I think that makes sense to me.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And...and Lokahi Pacific would disburse all the Maui money?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I asked her for the project that I was going to recommend. And I can ask her before...or in time, I guess, for first reading, for more clarity.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: In the past, they had said Lānaʻi didn't apply for it because most of that was...was it Ellison land or something --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- like that?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And they got NRCS grant as well.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: They got an NRCS. So, I would...I would cut Lānaʻi. If Molokaʻi still wants theirs, maybe, I don't know, leave that one in OED. And I'm not sure why there's 38,000 for feral animal control, and then 285,000 feral animal control Maui. But maybe cut those two, just leave feral animal control Maui and Haʻikū Community Association, and move everything over...move all the rest over to Lokahi Pacific under Department of Ag.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, what did you say...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But I'll...I'll defer to Member Rawlins-Fernandez on where she wants Molokaʻi's one to go. But I mean, if OED is already...has relationship on

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

Moloka'i--I don't know that Lokahi Pacific has relationship on Moloka'i--but I would kind of cut all the other feral animal controls in OED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, cut...what is this? Oh, I. [sic], feral animal control, 38,000. Feral animal control Lāna'i. There was that nonprofit, Member Johnson, that testified. They're on the south end of Lāna'i, and they were pretty...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, the Heritage?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Heritage?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No, the Limu Farm?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, no, no. The...they were doing axis deer.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The hunting program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Hunting.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. And they...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: At...at your residency area meeting. Oh, I didn't know that there was another group besides...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, they're all Pulama Lāna'i employees, yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. So, do you want this feral animal control Lāna'i there, or no?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I can...I'd like to keep the 30,000 for Lāna'i farmers because yes, Pulama can access NRCS monies and all of the other funds...but for small farmers, on our little two-acre lots near the airport, you can't farm if you don't have a deer fence. It's just that simple. And some of these new farmers, you know, NRCS requires you to be a farm for a certain amount of time. I think this...I...I...when we talk about feral animal control on Lāna'i, we all think deer, but it's the turkeys, it's the birds --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, you have lots.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- it's the...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We all have lots.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: They just damage our crops so bad. So, I'd like to...if...if anything, I'd like to expand that, just say, you know, feral animals, including birds. Because bird netting will...is so...there's no funding for bird netting. It's real hard. We got pots of money all over here for this deer fence and that deer fence, but the bird netting...some people, they individually wrap their trees, but...and some will do, like,

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

the whole...so, I really think that that feral animal control would be great for birds and rats, you know, these things that aren't just normal deers [sic]. Here, you guys have...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, yeah, I'm sorry. I dropped a zero.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you want to keep it, right, is what you're saying?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, please.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And feral animal control, it talks about all those, right? That's why it's feral. Okay. And feral animal control Maui we'll eliminate, with...because of this new money that we're putting in. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, that works for me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Feral animal control Moloka'i. Member Rawlins-Fernandez, you want to keep that?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. I was going to move it to Department of Ag and reduce it to 100,000...but feral animal control meant to like help reduce the populations, not just put up fences. It was meant to manage the...you know, like, whatever feral animal population...turkeys, eradicate the turkeys, whatever. Nobody eats the turkeys. They have worms. And then, you know, the deer...the bird netting, you know, you can get microgrants to get bird netting or whatever. But...yeah. The intention of the feral animal control grant was to control the feral animal population.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, are you okay with the 285,000 for Moloka'i? Or did you say you were...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I said I would move it under Department of Ag, and reduce it to 100,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That was my cut.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. And then Lāna'i, we'll keep yours, right? And you're going to...you're going to...we're going to move this all to Department of Ag. All right. Members, you understand what we just did? Okay. So, we cut some. Oh, Ms. Toshikiyo? Oh, okay. Yes?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Hi, Chair. Thank you. I just wanted to make sure I have everything clear in my head. So, if you're moving the feral animal management that's in the Mayor's Office, is that going to be a new (5) under Department of Ag? Or is that going under (4), which is for, which is for...which just says animal management? And then putting

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

Member Cook's priority under that new (4), is...are they all going to go under what's currently in there under subsection (4)? Sorry, I was trying to follow along.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, for the axis deer, the...my...my, it would be under the animal management. And...wait, let me make sure. *(silence)* Oh, let's see. Grants and Disbursements for Animal Management, and it's an addition to that. So, Ms. Toshikiyo, is that allowed? Is that why you're questioning it? Or you just wondering?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Oh, I just wanted to make sure that I understood what the process is going to be, and what all the different categories are, especially since you're moving something from the Mayor's Office that I believe is for feral animal management.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, so is this.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Sorry, I keep losing that page.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it's add 1 point...add 2.5 --

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Oh, sorry. Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- for mitigation of axis deer and other feral animals, and it's for 500 acres or less, \$100,000 grant, and it's going to be for grants...disbursements for...under animal management. So, the location of this is correct for where you're referencing, unless if you tell us we cannot.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: No. And I just wanted to be very clear in my head as I'm writing my notes. Thank you. Sorry for the interruption.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, no. Thank you. Okay. So, that concludes that conversation, correct? Oh, we need...we need a what, motion? Oh, so long, this discussion. Okay. We need a motion, Member Cook. And...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So move, and I need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Second. Motion made by Member Cook, second by Member U'u-Hodgins. I just repeated where this is all going. And --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- we are...yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Could we ask Staff to repeat what the motion...what they understand the motion to be?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

MR. KRUEGER: So, Chair, currently what we understand this to be is to create a new line item under Grants and Disbursements for Animal Management, mitigation of axis deer and other feral animals administered by Lokahi Pacific in the amount of \$2.5 million, with a condition that each grantee may receive up to \$100,000 for up to 500 acres. And along with this motion, it would include the...to move from the Mayor's Office to the Department of Agriculture, line items relating to feral animal control Lānaʻi and Molokaʻi, reducing the Molokaʻi one to \$100,000, and eliminating the feral animal control line items, the general one and the one for Maui.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do you need to say how much Lokahi Pacific would receive for administering the grant, like 5 percent or whatever? Or is it the standard amount across the board for...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I don't know what their admin fee is.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, do we need to...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I didn't hear what Chair Lee said.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: She said 10 to 11 is normal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. I didn't talk to them about that, just kind of generally about the program.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The...the County has a max administrative amount unless we otherwise specify it? Is a lawyer know, any lawyer?

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you, Chair. I don't know that offhand, but we don't specify that in that agreement. Perhaps Ms. Toshikiyo knows what their...their contracts or agreements with those administrators currently state.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Thank you. I don't believe that there's anything in our Code that requires the max amount of fee. I've seen them at 5 percent, I've seen them at 10. But when the...I believe when they're reviewing the grant application, they're looking at what that fee is going to encompass.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, we don't need to specify it...oh, there's Ms. Milner.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner, you have an input?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to mention that if the body's intent is for the full 100,000 to go to feral animal control, and the full amount to go to feral animal control Lānaʻi, you may want to increase the overall amount of the line item for Lokahi Pacific to ensure there's some funding available to cover any administrative costs...if the intent is that the full amount be awarded as grants. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you for that. I think in past when I've done line items like this, I've never said, oh, the admin fee is so much, I never added onto it. I think it's just going to come from the total pot --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- has been my experience.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's fine with me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. And I don't think she realizes that I just doubled her workload, but...okay. So, Members, we got to vote, yeah? All in favor, "say aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aye. Or is this...okay. So, this is eight "ayes." Okay. Very good. One excused, Member Kama.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook,  
                                 Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci,  
                                 and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:    None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Next. Anybody else? Chair Lee, you have anything?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: What did you say? we're...ag --

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . your conditions.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- when we finish Ag, we're going home? What did you say now?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're going Department of Environmental Management. I want to go to the Department of Environmental Management.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, you're going to be by yourself talking about that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(chuckling)*. . . With all of you. Okay. Then I'm going to take up...one of my conditions was for...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, no, I have...I'm...I'm getting to mine.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you do? Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Don't forget, on page 3. Yes. Add the following condition to agriculture operations/infrastructure/education. Up to \$140,000 must be for the Maui Farmer Network, for the Maui Farmer Support Network, and Maui Farmer Navigational Coaching Program. They have...yeah, I move to approve.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Chair Lee, second by Member Johnson. And this is 140 for Maui Farm Network, right?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, it's to expand and sustain their navigational coaching program. Provides critical one-on-one support, farm business training, and skill-building for small and beginning farmers across Maui. And they plan to address local food security and economic resilience. This investment with them will directly impact over 100 farmers, helping them increase production, improve farm sustainability, and strengthen Maui's food system.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Chair Lee and second by...who second? Gabe Johnson? Okay. Member Johnson. Discussion. I see Member Paltin's hand up.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...I just was wanting to clarify if either of the proposers checked with the Department of Ag that this money isn't already spoken for?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I did not. This is what was requested by the organization. And they did give us a very detailed report...on March 27th, that they sent this in.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just was asking, like, because I was going to condition the film production stuff, but then Mr. Kohne came and testified, and he said, this is for this,

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

this is for that. So, I conditioned some other pot. But just was checking if anyone checked with the Department of Ag if they didn't have plans for this.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I don't know. Member Johnson also had this exact same priority. Did you speak with anybody in Ag?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, I...I got to check all the questions I sent out. But I will say this from Georgia Pinsky's point of view. We...she was concerned she would be taking monies from other farmers. And this pot, in particular, was the one we were looking at because it has the Department of Ag operations, infrastructure, and education. And that education, I thought, was the ideal fit for...for what Ms. Pinsky does with her organization. And yeah, so that's why I think it should go with...go there. But I don't think we did check with them on if that was reserved, like what you're asking, Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I think maybe they said it was competitive.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Can we ask Budget Director if she's on the line? Maybe she has some insight.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good idea. Ms. Milner, did you hear that?

MS. MILNER: Aloha, Chair. Yes, my understanding is that is competitive funding. They will solicit applications at the beginning of the fiscal year. But...yeah. So, adding a condition for 140,000 line item to a specific organization will just reduce the amount of funding that's available for the competitive pot. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So that's fine then, huh, is what you're saying? Director Milner?

MS. MILNER: I think that's up to the body if they want to reduce the competitive pot or they want to advise this grantee to apply for the competitive funds. But yeah, I...I think it's fine.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Great. So, by line...line-iteming it, Members, you know that it just helps expedite, right, is what it does, versus them having to apply, and the time, and whatever. So, we're fine with this? Okay. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Eight "ayes" and one excused.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**VOTE:**        **AYES:**        **Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:**        **None.**

**ABSTAIN:**        **None.**

**ABSENT:**        **None.**

**EXC.:**        **Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:**        **APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? I have...Member Johnson, you're done. Member Paltin, you're done. Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Did we take care of the Humane Society?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I have two.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. First, I move to increase by \$100,000 for the administration of the farmer microgrant data...for data collection.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second. Motion made by Member Rawlins-Fernandez, second by Chair Lee. Explain, discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. It's under Department of Ag, a. Agriculture Program, (3) Grants and Disbursements for Agriculture Promotion, (ix), Agricultural Micro Grants Program. If you're looking at your spreadsheet, please disregard the last line in the proposal. That was for a different proposal that ended up there. But it's for 100,000. And so, last year, we talked about the return on investment for these

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

microgrants that we've been infusing into the community. And Deputy Director Koa Hewahewa and I met with David Daly at MEO. And they have...every time we spoke about improvements to the process of awarding grants, they've listened, and they've made adjustments. Deputy Director Hewahewa and I had a lot of ideas on how to collect that data to tell the story of how we're increasing food security in our County. And...and so, you know, that doesn't...data collection doesn't come without additional funding and resourcing, right? So, we would like to be able to show our Council and the broader, you know, community, the broader public, what the return on...on this investment has been for the past--what's that?--four years of the existence of the microgrants.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's my motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody have any other discussion? Makes sense to me. All in favor...or ready to vote? All in favor...

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Never mind, sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: What?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Vote.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Subsection C, \$100,000. Is that what you needed, Mr. Krueger?

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, yeah. So, we...apologies, we weren't sure if there was a second, but we confirmed, so we're okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It was Member Johnson [*sic*].

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies for the interruption.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have a question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Question from Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is that what they said it would cost, 100,000 for data collection?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I checked with Deputy Director Hewahewa, and it sounded like that would be sufficient.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for the question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any others? If not, all right. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Eight "ayes," one excused, Member Kama.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:    None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Okay. My second proposal is, I move to increase Grant Subsidy Program by 500,000, with the condition that it must be used for kalo, ulu, niu production under Department of Ag, (3) Grants and Disbursements for Agriculture Promotion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second? Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Rawlins-Fernandez, seconded by Member Johnson. Go ahead, explain.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo. Okay. And so, as we've been talking about the recently published Food and Nutrition Security Plan, it aligns with Action 2.2.3, develop a tissue...tissue culture lab in partnership with cultivar banks to make disease-free verified plant material, including kalo, uala, and ulu to provide to farmers. Action 2.2.5, support production of culturally-relevant crops, such as ulu, kalo, uala, and maia by identifying and establishing institutional purchasing markets. And Action 2.3.7, identify kalo...County and State land that is suitable for farming, that can support and sustain canoe crops or kūpuna crops, including ulu, niu, and kalo. And this weekend, I had the opportunity to tag along on a workshop with NiU NOW. They came over here to provide a niu workshop, coconut tree workshop, for the teachers. And because my husband's a fourth grade teacher, I was able to, you know, get that information that he got. And one of the things that they said was, if...if we plant more kumu niu, more coconut trees, then it will help to combat the...the impact that's felt by the CRB on Maui since, unfortunately, it is there. But across the County, right? The more we plant, because it is a food source, and, you know, more than just a food source, it also is a kūpuna crop that, you know, you can get cordage from, that you can make apu from. And I made an apu...well, three apu, for drinking awa. You can make different things. And, you know, reestablishing that relationship with niu is...is more important than ever. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: How interesting. All right. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, chair. I support this initiative, and I appreciate this as a preference. I'll just add some more data that's kind of new. The Ulu Initiative got a lot of its funding from the Feds, and just recently this week, they got...or last week, they got their Federal funding cut.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wow.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And I don't know if you guys saw *Maui*...the *Maui Now* article from Lending Tree report, that we're...we pay the...we're ranked third in the highest amount of...wait, I'm saying that wrong. We pay...we're ranked...we pay the highest amount in grocery bills, and we're ranked number three in the nation. That's what I'm trying to say. So, I'll give you the numbers, it's just easily [sic]. \$10,000...10,708 annually per household, or 30 percent...32 percent more than national average we're paying on our food. So, when we...when we invest in these kinds of programs, you know, the food comes...the...the cost goes down, that's what we're trying to do. So, I support this. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? All right. I see heads nodding. This looks like a go. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Eight "ayes," one excused. Thank you. Motion carried.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**VOTE:**      **AYES:**      **Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:**      **None.**

**ABSTAIN:**      **None.**

**ABSENT:**      **None.**

**EXC.:**      **Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:**      **APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, I have one, if everybody else is done. So, this is for...to add to Department of Ag, and it would be supporting programs...include Agriculture in the Classroom. Oh, this is Maui County Farm Bureau. It's \$553,366 for Maui County Farm Bureau, agriculture operations, infrastructure education, and with that...with that condition, up to that amount for Maui County Farm Bureau. I need a...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Can I make my own motion? Okay. Can you...somebody...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Move then.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Moved, Chair Lee, thank you, and second by Member U‘u-Hodgins. And just for the Members' information, what this does for the Maui County Farm Bureau, they do Agriculture in the Classroom, Grown on Maui, Maui Ag Fest, Maui 4-H Livestock Fair, and support for Maui Association of Landscape Professionals, Maui Cattlemen's Association, Maui Flower Growers and Floriculture Collective, and Maui Coffee Association. So, those are the...the types of ag that are in their jurisdiction. Any questions? All right. They came also the...for the Upcountry regency...our residency area meeting, and they all testified, so glad to see them all. All in favor, Members, say "aye."

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You're voting, yeah, with your hand on the side, Member Paltin. Motion carries. Eight [sic] "ayes," one [sic] excused, Member Kama.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:    None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmember Cook.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? Oh, Member Cook walked out. Oh, sorry. So, that would be seven and two. Thank you. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: He walked out. I don't know that we voted on his priority with the Humane Society.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I think we didn't finish Humane Society.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I don't think so.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Because I have one too.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yeah, that's kind of an involved one.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, we can defer it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, when he comes back.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I support Member Cook's priority as it was written, like the 500,000 to Humane Society with the amounts allocated broken out. I don't support 500,000 to enforcement.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, his was on page 4. Page 4, at the top. Countywide 4, and increase grants and disbursements for animal management by 500,000 as follows. But he really meant 250,000 for Animal Enforcement Program. And here he is. We're starting to talk about Humane Society and taking up your item. And I think your increased Animal Enforcement Program by 250,000, is that what you wanted? And then Member Paltin, yours is 148,000 for Humane Society.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: She took it out.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I withdrew mine, but --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you withdrew.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- I thought we had said it was okay for his 500,000 to be distributed the way that he originally intended.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Maybe you could remind me how we did slice and dice this. I think that I ended up with the increased animal enforcement portion of it. I reduced it from 500,000 to 250, but should probably give them what they asked for, which is 150.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, yours is 150. Okay. Members, are you fine with that?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Discussion? If not, all in favor, say "aye."

MR. KRUEGER: Chair...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, there's no motion yet. Member Cook made the motion. Is there a second? Member...Chair Lee. All right. Motion made by Cook, Chair Lee. And all in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

MR. KRUEGER: Chair? Chair...Chair, I'm so sorry, apologies. Staff just wants to confirm. So...so, now the priority on the floor is to just increase Animal Enforcement Program by 150,000?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Because that's what they asked for.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Clear? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I thought they asked for 200,000 for sheltering, 150,000 for enforcement, Moloka'i and spay/neuter, 50,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No. We...go ahead, you can explain.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And so, they're getting from Chair Lee and from you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I withdrew mine, because she was going to put 500,000 to spay and neutering.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That...that never got --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We didn't finalize that.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- adjusted?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We can do that after.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- we can do that after. So, yours is 150.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. So, vote.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Members, all in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah? Good. Okay. So, we have eight "ayes" now...Member Johnson [sic] came back. And one excused, Member Kama. So, motion carries.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:    None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Now we'll take up Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, I'll reduce the Spay and Neuter Program to 200,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Not 500.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, we'll just get all the cats and a couple of the dogs.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I guess we all know about that.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: This is for Maui County, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Maui County.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. All in favor...oh, any --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: You need a second?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- other discussion? You have a discussion. Member U‘u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay. So that's Chair Lee's one. What about the...the Sheltering Program for 503? That's in a separate one, or what are we doing?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, he...it's already in Member Cook's motion. He had the...part of the...the Sheltering Program, you increased it to what, 150 and 100?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I thought...I thought we just voted on Member Cook's one, and we had only done the 150 regarding Animal Enforcement Program, but there was no sheltering, no spay and neuter, and no --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Moloka'i.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- Moloka'i.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. So, that's why I'm adding the spay and neuter.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: To 2...at 200.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: 200, which includes all three islands.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And then, I think we have to keep in mind, this is in addition to the, what?--2 million that they get? 2 million.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, this is just an addition.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah. This is for...this is for all of the shortcomings that they have. Because they have to do so much, and we --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- have whatever contract with them --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- that we're not giving them enough money to fulfill.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You want to increase that? We can do that.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Oh, no. I'm just trying to get clarification. Because there were three...this is...this is what happens when we can't talk about it--and I get the law, so we can't do that--but we had three for Humane Society. Member Paltin removed hers, withdrew hers, so now we're just down to Member Cook's and yours, Chair Lee. And then, if you do spay and neuter, and Member Cook does the Animal Enforcement Program, that leaves us zero money to accommodate for the additional requirements for the Sheltering Program? Or is yours going to also include the Sheltering Program?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I would have to add to that. How much would you like to add to that, for that?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Well, yours originally was at 500...a little bit over 500,000, and then Member Cook's was 200,000, so I don't know. There's...that's a big difference between 500 and 200, but I'm not too sure.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Member Cook is at 250, right?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: His was at --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: His was 150.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- 2 --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- but we didn't vote on that.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Two.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, I'm at 150.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, 150 now. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: But 150 only related to the animal enforcement --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- nothing to do with sheltering.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So I can change mine. My understanding is that they asked for 700,000.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And so, I can change mine to...what was it, did I say 100 or 200? 200 for spay and neuter.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And 200 for the animal sheltering, all three islands.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Mine has to do with all three islands, so it's 400,000.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion by Chair Lee...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair, can we have a brief recess?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. So, we will...what time is it? 5:16, so we'll come back at what? 5:20, is that brief enough? 5:20, four minutes?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. ...*(gavel)*...

**RECESS:        5:16 p.m.**  
**RECONVENE:    5:27 p.m.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ...*(gavel)*... Thank you for working hard to this point. And what we're going to do is, we're going to finish off Department of Ag, call Member Cook, and we're going to do a motion to reconsider, because we've got to straighten out all of this Humane Society. And then I want to see if we can go to Department of Corporation Counsel, as well as Emergency...East Maui Water Authority, so do those two.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Corporation Counsel, East Maui Water Authority.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. And then if you're...if you're...if you want to, can...we can also do MEMA, but...all right. Here we go. Member Cook, motion to reconsider.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. I would like to reconsider...make a motion to reconsider for the Humane Society.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second. Member Cook, and second by Member U'u-Hodgins. Go for it.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Increasing the grant, the distribution for animal management by \$650,000.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair? Apologies, just interject. So --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: We have to vote on the reconsideration.

MR. KRUEGER: -- we'll have to vote on the reconsideration.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Reconsideration first. Okay. Okay. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I know this is something we want to do, Member...okay. So, this looks like we have one...two...three...four...five...six. Who's not here? Six "ayes" and three excused is Member Kama...that's it, so eight.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Eight.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No Kama.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I don't...I don't see...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Is Shane on?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Shane is on. Yeah, I was just looking to see. Okay. Go ahead. Motion carries.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:     None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVE RECONSIDERATION.**

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. So, for the reconsideration --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Make a motion.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- for Humane Society, I propose we increase the Grants and Distribution for Animal Management by \$650,000. This will consist of animal sheltering, \$350,000; spay and neuter, \$50,000; animal enforcement, \$150,000; Moloka'i Humane Society, \$100,000.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, that's your motion.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That's my motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Motion by Member Cook, and second by Member U'u-Hodgins.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, apologies. So, Staff will just consider that the motion that was reconsidered withdrawn, and this new motion replacing it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, exactly.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead. So, anybody else?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Did you say \$50,000 for spay and neuter?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yes. And...and I...I called also, they have a couple of million dollars already. This is the supplementary to their principal, but they were short. So, this is...I believe, in my conversations with them, should be enough for them to be able to adequately --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I hope so.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- address it.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And you know what? I'm going to refer all the calls to you from now on. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And to clarify, that \$100,000 for Moloka'i includes the 42,000 for Moloka'i Spay and Neuter Program?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Correct. We aren't really spelling that out. They'll do what they want with it.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So...okay. I'm good with that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. And to clarify, we're increasing the grant by the numbers previously listed, not making the grant amount the numbers previously listed. So, for instance, for spayed and neutering, they requested an extra \$50,000, and they have currently \$165,000, so increasing it by another 50 would give them over \$200,000 to do all of their spayed and neutering.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good for clarifying it. All right. Members, no other discussion? All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we have eight "ayes," one excused, Member Kama.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:    None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Yay. And...and just for clarification, Member Paltin, you're withdrawing yours, and Member Lee, you're withdrawing yours because Tom Cook just embraced everything.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, but not happily. Thank you.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**DEPARTMENT OF THE CORPORATION COUNSEL**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, they're there, and we are done with this. Okay. Anything else for Department of Ag? All right. Thank you very much. Now we're going to go to Corporation Counsel. So, on...on the bill is page number 4, and Members, are there any other proposed amendments in category...for A, for Legal Service Program? Seeing none. Members, are there any proposed amendments for Category B, Operations and Equipment? Seeing none. For Legal Services? CIP, they have none. Appendix A, Part I, Grants, none. Appendix A, Part II, Special Purpose Revenue, none. Appendix B, Rates and Fees, none. Members' priorities, we don't have any...and they do have Bill 48, which, you know, is for the increase. Can...can Mr. Hanano talk about the bill, Bill 48, or...or Deputy Director? Which is the increase of salaries for their Corp. Counsel and Deputy.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You might want to mention the percentage.

MS. KAWASAKI: Yes, Chair. This particular bill was proposed by the Department of Corporation Counsel and the Department of the Prosecuting Attorney. It is for increases to salaries for attorneys. That scale goes according to the years the person has passed the bar, and I believe there is a range in there from in the 50 percent increases, and that would be for the lower end of the scale, and the higher end of the scale is 38 percent.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody have questions? Seeing none.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Are we taking all the bills up together? I thought you said.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, we're...we're going to take this up now.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 50 percent increase, we're taking it up now? I mean...

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair, this is for just attorney pay scales. So, from our understanding, over the last 35 years, every time there's been a Salary Commission increase, then those departments come in with their proposed bills, and this just tracks along the same line that it has tracked. The lower end of the scale happened to be a different percentage than the older, or more experienced, attorneys. To our knowledge, over the last 30-some-odd years, the Council has always approved these proposed increases from the Department of Corporation Counsel and Prosecuting Attorney.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, then the testimony that we received on Bill 49 was misplaced because there weren't any 50 percent increases in Bill 49, but you're asking us to give a 50 percent increase here.

MS. KAWASAKI: Our...my understanding of that question about Bill 49 was that pertained to the nonattorney salaries, that...the...it was regarding the HGEA testimony. The HGEA testimony was commenting on nonattorney salaries, but my understanding is that there was a misunderstanding from HGEA because that bill that we proposed, Bill 49, incorporates the attorneys and the nonattorney salaries. So, it's not comparing apples

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

to apples. Our nonattorney salary proposal does match that of the Department of Corporation Counsel and the Prosecuting Attorney.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I...I think that what's good for the goose is good for the gander. I'm not...I'm not voting on this, and not voting on the other one. That's ridiculous.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We'll vote on this all at once. I mean, not all at once. We'll take it up on Friday.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yup.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. And...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You said Thursday. Oh, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I did say Thursday. Staff, is Thursday, Friday? I guess it depends on how far we go, but...

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. Thursday or Friday. Yeah, depending on the pace that the Members make as...on its decisions on Bill 41, then...then afterwards, they could pivot to the other bills as well.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Question. Does the 5...\$5,200...does...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 5 million.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 5 million. Does the salary in column A for Department of Corporation Counsel include Bill 48?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I guess we have...I don't think so.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. I didn't think so. I just needed clarity on that. So, what we're looking at right now...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Here's Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yes, you're correct. The salaries included in Bill 41 do not take into consideration the proposal in Bill 48 because we weren't aware of it at the time we prepared the budget. Thank you, Chair.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins...oh, you're done? Sorry. Are you done? You're done. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Bill 48 is on the agenda, but it's not posted on Granicus. Just FYI.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Can Staff check?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, never mind. I see it. I see it. I see it now. I see it. I see it. I found it. It was like higher up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you guys all got that, right? Okay. So, we're going to take 48 when we take all the other bills up. Member...Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. I agree to deferring this matter because the...the arguments earlier in deferring the salaries for OCS had to do with the percentage of increase, and now we're talking about higher increases. So, you know, let's work all of this at the same time, to be fair. Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You're fine. Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, my question, Chair, is, with our current task right now, where we're addressing going down through the different departments, so Department of Corporation Counsel, we can continue to work on this, and --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Take up the bill.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- we can complete this and move on; is that correct?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: We don't have --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- to defer this --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- we're just deferring the bills.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we're trying to do A and B accounts for all the departments. Okay. So, that would answer your question. Yes, Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. So, for Bill 49, we got a total of what it would change in OCS' salaries, and it's like 1.-something. But we don't have the same for Bill 48. Can we have what the total would look like if we were to incorporate Bill 38, and what is the addition?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I think we don't have it, unless I missed it completely, but I don't see it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Staff --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Because we have all the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Staff, could you...

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- years and stuff, but we don't know what that looks like.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Chair?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, we'll double-check on that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Deputy Director Kawasaki?

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you. I don't believe that we have that number in the record. I think the only reference to this has been when the Budget Director indicated that, as a result of the Salary Commission's proposed increases, that there...they...that they had enough money to cover those. But we don't have a dollar amount that I have seen.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. So, in the \$5 million they have proposed for their salaries, that covers the amount they would require in Bill 48?

MS. KAWASAKI: I don't believe so, no. Because the proposal that you see in both your Budget Details and in the Program Budget, those were all submitted far in advance of --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yes.

MS. KAWASAKI: -- the Salary Commission having --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yes.

MS. KAWASAKI: -- met.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Yeah, that part I understand. But I’m just curious, what’s the total financial impact of Bill--was it--48?

MS. KAWASAKI: Right. We will have to get that from --

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Yeah.

MS. KAWASAKI: -- the Budget Director.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: That’s what I understand. Okay. Thank you so much. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Director Milner popped up. Director?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins. I don’t have the exact number in front of me right now, but we did discuss it after Corporation Counsel and Prosecuting Attorney proposed this bill, and we do feel that the funding that was included for the increases in the Countywide costs would be sufficient to cover the funding for those departments. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. So, you’re going to give us the numbers?

MS. MILNER: Yes, Chair. I can provide specific numbers for you tomorrow.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, is that what the Members want? Yeah? Thank you. Member Paltin...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: For...for all departments.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For all departments. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can somebody tell me which number on Granicus Bill 48 is?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 69.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 69.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

\*\*\*\*\*

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, that would take us to the end of Corporation Counsel, right? Okay. I...I...before we move on to this next department, I just want to say that I have been receiving, and I'm sure you have been receiving, the public thinks that we can stop the Salary Commission's actions, and we cannot. And I hope that the Administration would set the record straight that, you know, what is happening is...or...or maybe we should, that this is something that is provided by Charter, it's not something that the Council can say, oh, we don't want to pay it, or whatever, right? So, the actions of the Salary Commission for the Mayor, ours--the elected officials--as well as the directors and deputies, all came from the Salary Commission, and the Charter says that their word is final. It's pretty amazing. And I just want to make this statement here because I've been getting that from the community about what's been happening, and this ripple effect that we are seeing through the County of Maui. And we will work on this. Anyway, next we're going to change department...Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just in response to your statement, I...I think the majority of the County doesn't see the extra workload on our department heads, division heads, and the entire County workforce in the aftermath of the fire. Like for me personally, I feel like I've been working back to my night job, like when I used to work in the daytime and wait tables at night, because there's these meetings all day, and then there's meetings within my community, all these groups and stuff like that, and it's the same. It's the same for the Director of Environmental Management. They had to rebuild a whole sewer line, the Water Director. And, you know, when our Deputy Managing Director resigned, we were....like nobody really wanted to take the job. People had to kind of be begged, or...or we were a little bit scraping the bottom of the barrel. So, I mean, if...if we're not going to pay these competitive salaries for the workload that has come up in the aftermath of the fire, I would just kind of quote our Managing Director, you think things can't get any worse. Literally, they can, you know. They literally can get worse. And people might not like how things are going right now, but I...I know people are busting okole, like day and night, time away from their families, to rebuild our sewer, to rebuild our water, to redo our parks, and all of those things. And people did it for maybe the first two years out of love for Lāhainā, out of love for Maui County, but that only goes so far. People need to pay the bills, people need to pay for their kids' clothes and braces, whatever, and if...if...if you want to not pay those salary increases, it will be reflected in the services the community gets.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just responding to your comment, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. I'm not opposing it, I'm just saying that we're hearing in the community. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. I agree that, you know, the public probably doesn't understand the full scope of...of the work that all of us do. And honestly, I don't think one department should be targeted when almost all departments will receive 30 percent or higher increases in salaries, in...in...especially in Administration. We ourselves are

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

going to be receiving close to 30 percent increase. So, I don't think we should allow one particular department to take the brunt of this...this type of criticism --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- because all of us should be criticized --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- if that's the case.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, the unfortunate thing...I'm going to make this last comment, that's...probably should stop already. The...the...the thing that's happening is this bill, which is 48--49, right?--49, which is OCS. It's caused this ripple effect of discussions about...from the other employees. And so, the discussion that we had this morning was just, you know, let's look at the bigger picture and see how we can help everybody and not only one segment, which is the Legislative Branch, right? And...and that was the...the item before us. So, in fairness to really, OCS, they must be feeling like a lot of pressure from the comments that we have received, and I feel for them because it...they work hard. Everything that we all said, everything that you said is true, you know? And...but I'm just trying to look for something that's more on the equitable and with parity so that we can have facts before us to make decisions, and you're calling for the same thing with this...with the bill that is...we're going to take up later, which is Corp. Counsel, so we can look at it all with the same lens. So, that's all. Anyway, I'm going to move on.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. I thought we were talking about Bill 48, and you did make a broad general comment about all the salaries that were increased by the Salary Commission. And I just wanted to quickly add that salaries set by the Salary Commission, those positions do not get overtime. To Member Paltin's point, of all the overtime that they've been working, they do not get paid overtime. And that I think the concern that I've heard from folks in testimony, and the emails that I receive, is that the department heads will get the necessary raise, and the rank and file will be left behind...especially during active negotiations updating the collective bargaining agreement master agreement. And they want assurances that they won't be left behind. And I think we, as a Council, have been united in that messaging, that we don't intend to leave our rank and file, our valued employees behind, and that we will be making that effort to ensure that they get the raises that they deserve and need in order to live in Maui County.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

**EAST MAUI WATER AUTHORITY**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. All right. So, I'm going to take up now the next department, which is East Maui Water Authority. So, East Maui Water Authority, any...Administrative Program is on budget page 4. Are there any proposed amendments to Category A, Salaries, the Administration Program? None? Okay. I'm going to move to Category B, Operations and Equipment for Administration Program. Any amendments to that for East Maui Water Authority? None? All right. This Department has no CIP. Appendix A, Part I, Grants; Appendix A, Part II, Special Purpose Revenues; Appendix B, Rates and Fees, none. Member priority. I think we have Member Sinenci. Are you on? Okay. Your residency area one, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, this was one of my residency area priorities is to increase categories A and B by 39,252, and those funds would be to add three positions: Forestry and Wildlife Technician for three months...IV, Technician IV for three months of funding; and 14,877 for the second position, Forestry and Wildlife Worker for...for three months for the funding of 11,475; and for a third, a 0.4 student intern position for one summer internship program for three months of funding at \$10,400, Chair. And then there's also --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: -- for category B, Equipment.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Sinenci, second by Member Rawlins-Fernandez. Have you talked to the East Maui Water Authority about this?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah. In their last stakeholders meeting, they talked about having...getting a lot of inquiries from students that want to work in the watershed, and so the...they talked about that. And then also, I think having the additional workload would also increase the Department's ability to get some grant funding. As you know, we didn't put anything for any watershed management this year, so hopefully the...the additional positions will put them in a better position to apply for grant funding, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you very much. Any other discussion? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Have these class specifications been established by DPS, or are there comparable ones in other counties?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes. Hold on. The positions are established union classified positions, so we would not be creating new position descriptions. These job descriptions states that the...well, it conducts the fieldwork and resource management watershed restoration projects. So, currently, they're union classified positions.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For the counties, or...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: What was that one?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Are they union classified for County workers?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I can find out.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And has the Director created position descriptions and minimum qualifications, or if it's County or State?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I got my notes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I got my notes, Chair. Yeah, same as County and City of Honolulu.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And...and the Director has created minimum qualifications and established a class?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: There might need to be consultation, but I'll...I'll defer to Ms. Milner

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Paltin. Thank you, Councilmember Sinenci. Yes, it is going to be based on another county's classifications. I'm guessing that's why Councilmember Sinenci is only asking for three months' funding to allow the Director of East Maui Water Authority time to establish it within Maui County, as well with union consultation, and the necessary work with DPS and Management to get everything established. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I would...I would kind of propose an amendment to just establish the positions first, and then create the funding. And then also, you know, if there's

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

going to be a class series, like, are we only going to have IV...level IVs, or is there going to be I, II, III, IVs? And do you know what the SR rating is?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Councilmember Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I don't have that at this time.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. For...for me, it's going to be a no unless it's just positions with no funding, and they're not...yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Until they work on it. Member Sinenci, so you're fine?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I can get that...I can get that information, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we're voting on it today. Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair, is...does the intern position...is that something that is kind of like a union loophole, or is there...that also have to be...if there's student interns, still have a rating?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: The...thank you, Member Cook. The...the position is...I guess for the...the board, it's a cost-effective way to...to grab data for the watershed without paying the big, big numbers to...to...you know, to gather data. So, it's...it's kind of...I mean a cheaper way of...of, you know, going into the watershed to...to get more information. I have Ms. Milner on as well.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. The positions...the two positions that are not interns, it's an SR-15 and an SR-13. And we do have student interns elsewhere in the County, so I think we have a basis for establishing those positions as well. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, to go to Member Paltin's question, are the positions all established? Director Milner? So, can they...you know, what Member Paltin was saying, you know, create this, approve it, but not put any funding in it?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. I think the concern that the Department would have is if there's no funding, it might make them less competitive for grants during the coming fiscal year. It's certainly an option for the Committee to consider if they want to add the positions. I would say, I think the student intern will be less of a lift because we do already have those in the County, whereas . . . *(inaudible)*. . . the other positions. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Okay. Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. I'd be supporting this. It's a small amount of money. It's a small department getting started. If the two...if the intern positions are

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

already available, they could get that. Shovels and 2,500 bucks for some tools isn't much. So, in...in support of the Department and intent, I would support this.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Anybody else? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: SR-13 and 15 is not that bad. I can...I can support those.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. No other discussion. Chair Lee left. So, we are one...two...three...four...five...six of us. All in favor...

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Just...before the vote, so Staff would just like to clarify, as part of this motion, the equivalent personnel for this program, it also includes an increase. And is the increase 2.4 E/P?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, they're...

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, Councilmember Sinenci. We just wanted to confirm for the...for the amendment, does it include an equivalent personnel increase as well? So, right now, it's 5.6 E/P in the proposed budget. Is it an increase to 8, like, plus 2.4 E/P?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, with the additional E/Ps?

MR. KRUEGER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I think for...for the...the ones, it'll give some extra time for the Department of Personnel to...to fill those other positions.

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, okay. So, I guess Staff is interpreting it to mean that...that this would also include an E/P increase so that they have the ability to create positions --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh.

MR. KRUEGER: -- and...and...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Yeah, it is a 2.4 increase. Sorry.

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, they have requested \$67,064; is that right? One E/P increase, East Maui Water Authority. What is the number of E/Ps you're suggesting, Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: It's the Category A, that one?

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And the...the Wildlife Worker IV...Technician IV, Wildlife Worker IV, and the student intern.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is that one E/P?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: SR-15 and SR-13.

MR. KRUEGER: So, Chair, we're...we're just...because our understanding is the intent that even though it's three-months funding right now, that there would eventually be full-time positions, those two, and then...but the student intern would probably be less than a full E/P, that it's a 2.4 increase of E/P for this motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. For a small department. And...yeah, Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I'm sorry, Member Sinenci, if I missed it, but can you describe what they're going to do? The Forestry and Wildlife Technician, can you describe what they're going to do? And then can you tell me how it folds in with the strategic plan that they have budgeted in their budget for this year?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: For the...I'm sorry, for the summer intern?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: No.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Or for the...

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: For the Forestry and Wildlife Technician.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay. So, the position's job descriptions state that they'll conduct field work, and resource management, and watershed restoration projects to improve native ecosystems. They'll independently perform a variety of job operations in support of resource management programs. And for the summer intern, we talked about obtaining research and data collection, as Ms. Milner said, to secure grant funding, and also for monitoring, reporting, and evaluation of...of the programs once they get grant funding.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. And I don't mean to talk to you like you're the current director, but I know that this is probably coming from--I'm assuming you guys still have a great work relationship, which I hope you do--does this fold into their strategic plan that they have proposed for \$300,000, these three positions?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes. And...and we've had those conversations as a board as well.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay. Oh, yes. So, the strategic plan for \$300,000, they’re going to take all of this information and kind of put it all together, all these things that these technicians and interns are going to do?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Members, any other questions? Seeing none. Ready to vote? All in favor, raise your hand and say “aye.”

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And we’ll say who’s excused is Chair Lee, Kama...that’s all, right? So, seven “ayes,” two excused. Is that right, the count? Yeah? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, this is approved.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:     None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmember Lee.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

**EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AGENCY**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, that is the East Maui Water Authority, and then we have the Emergency Management. So, Bill 41, pages 4 and...4 to 5, are there any proposed amendments to Category A, Salary, for Emergency Management Program? None? Okay. Is...are there any...wait, let me move all my papers. All right. And are there any amendments to Category B, Operations/Equipment to the Emergency...for the MEMA Program? Seeing none. Okay. And are there any priorities? I...I can’t read what this is highlighted, but it’s saying Ms. Milner for item 5, Grants to Civil

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

service...Civil Air Patrol Kahului Squadron, should it be corrected to say Civil Air Patrol for the Maui County Composite...Composite--why can't I say that word--Squadron Kahului? There you are.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. I think that...I think that language has been the same in the budget for the last several years, and it hasn't been an issue in getting the grants issued to the organization, but if you would like to tweak it a little bit, I don't think there would be any objection. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Grant to Civil Air Patrol Kahului Squadron. So, Staff, do you have a preference? We're going to have to do the legal checking.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. I think, based on our research, the organization might be called Maui County Composite Squadron Kahului. So, if the Members...like Ms. Milner said, it sounds like they didn't have a problem using the current name, but if the Members wanted to consider changing it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: To...to the legal name that it should be.

MR. KRUEGER: Yeah, that might be --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: -- more accurate.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Are you all fine with that? Okay. So, we'll do that then. Thank you, Ms. Milner. CIPs, there are none. Appendix A, Part I, Grants, bill...Budget Bill is page 40. Any...any proposed amendments to the grants for Emergency Management Agency? Seeing none. Appendix A, Part II, Special Purpose Revenue, none. Appendix B, Rates and Fees, none. Member priorities, there are none for MEMA. So, that's MEMA. And we are done with that Department. I will say that when MEMA came up and...and there was discussion on salary...their salaries, and they were paying people on an 89-day--what is it called?--89-day hire. I think there's a concern about that. Is there...and...because you can't do that forever. And Ms. Milner, can you please check to see if we have a problem with that within MEMA? Because they have all these talented people that I think came from Fire. But...Ms. Milner?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yes, the Administration is definitely aware of concerns around the DM-89. And we are in discussions with the State about a variety of options to ensure that we can continue to maintain our talented workforce that we have down in MEMA.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

\*\*\*\*\*

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think that would be a concern, right? But I think there might be some restrictions on how long you can do that. So, please check on that. And will you get back to us on that? Because we certainly don't want to end up being impacted by...by the law. All right. We are now at 6:00. And Member Cook, you shouldn't look so happy. What?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Can you review the departments that we have gone over today, and then tomorrow? And then I'm...I'm looking for that memo on the...the salaries that the Salary Commission affected. Because did...did we do consensus on Corp. Counsel and Auditor and Council? Because this says Legislative Branch. I know we did Clerks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But did...did we...if we did consensus...okay. Here's my question --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We did consensus on...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- for...for you or Staff.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We did consensus on Auditor, but we deferred Bill 49, so they're...and 48.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it's not done.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And we...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, so it's not done.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, mahalo, Member Paltin. So...and that's because of the salaries part? So, the Auditor was not part of the Salary Commission salaries? Okay. We used to set their salaries, but I think INB sets their salaries now?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think we set...well, we set his salary. We did that, right? We voted for the...the INB nominated...well, and then we confirmed. Ms. Kawasaki, do you...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I was just double-checking.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm looking for my calendar.

MS. KAWASAKI: The Salary...Chair, the Salary Commission sets the Auditor's salary.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Oh, that . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, did we make that amendment before we did consensus? Because if not, then we got to go make that change, yeah? Or did we?

MS. KAWASAKI: I will need to look to see whether or not he was included in the letter that the Salary Commission sent.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And I see Budget Director Milner. Maybe she has some information for us.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. I don't have the exact amount of the salary increase in front of me at the moment, but we do have sufficient funding to cover the increases that were voted on for all the directors, whether Legislative or Executive Branch. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. The County Auditor is included in the Salary Commission...it was. What was the other question? That was it?

MS. KAWASAKI: Madam Chair, I did locate that. It's listed on a letter to Council Chair Lee dated March 28th, 2025, and it is listed at 192,458.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, I don't remember us having that discussion about the salary change to the Auditor, that's why. So, I'm just making sure. It sounds like Countywide has those increases covered. But also, I think...so I...so then we just assume that it's going to be taken out of Countywide, and we would not be putting it under the Auditor? Oh, there's Budget Director. So, would we take it out of Countywide...move out of Countywide, and put the appropriate amount into the Auditor in Bill 41, Director Milner?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez. I think you could do it either way, but our intention was, by having it under Countywide, it would just happen automatically, so you don't need to move it for every department.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But shouldn't the budget bill reflect the accurate salaries of everyone that...oh, I guess it's just salary, it's just Account A, yeah? Oh, okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

MS. MILNER: Correct. It's just overall A Account.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Very good. Mahalo for that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, just...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm good, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Director Milner, so all of the salaries that are included in that letter that you referenced, right, from the Salary Commission, you're saying that all of that has already been included in the budget with the respective departments?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. It has been included for the General Fund departments in the Countywide costs. And in the Liquor Department and Water Department, they have salary adjustments in their A budget that will cover the increases. So, there's...there's no need to amend. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right.

MS. KAWASAKI: And Chair, if our Staff can have the opportunity to confer with Ms. Toshikiyo to discuss whether or not those amounts should be included, and those amounts indicated in the budget bill should go up for a small budget, such as the Auditors, that may be significant, whereas it could be absorbed into larger departments. So, we'd like the opportunity to confer, and then we'll note that as a change in the budget documents --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. KAWASAKI: -- if needed.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, could we...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Kawasaki.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, for each department that we have completed, we did talk about Category A, and there were no amendments, no changes from what the Administration presented, so we're fine. But let us know, then, with what you discover then, Deputy Director, if we need to...you're thinking that we might need to change the decision?

MS. KAWASAKI: If the body indicates by consensus that they would allow us to make that change, it would appear in the documents that you will vote on finally at the end.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, are you fine, Members? Okay. All right. So, just for clarification, we did complete some of the departments, right? So, we did the County Clerk. We did do Office of Council Services without Bill 49, and the...also, the resolutions discussed. The Auditor, we're...we're fine with that. So, was there

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

consensus for all of that with the changes? Okay. Department of Agriculture, we went through a lot of back and forth on it, but I think we are done with it. Consensus? And we just finished East Maui Water Authority, as well as MEMA, Maui Emergency Management, right? So, we're all ready for tomorrow, which is going to be Environmental...Department of Environmental Management, correct?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, did we finish MEMA?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, shoot. I had things. I thought you were talking about East Maui Water Authority.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, we were.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We were.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I had...I had some things for MEMA.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We...we didn't do consensus.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're getting there. All right. So, all the other departments...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I was just letting Member Paltin know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Paltin.

**EMERGENCY MANAGEMENT AGENCY**

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I move to cut...I'm on 4.a.(1)A, or salaries. I...I move to cut \$159,305 plus \$118,554.78 fringe. And if I get a second, I'll explain.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second. Oh, need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Paltin, and second by Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Six of the seven undescribed expansion positions, I'm cutting it to six months instead of eight...or instead of whatever they asked for, to give additional

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

time for establishment, as the answers that were given is that MEMA and Personnel are still going back and forth with job titles and whatnot. So, cutting the funding for six out of those seven undescribed positions. I think the seventh one, I forget why I didn't cut it, but I think it was pretty important. So, that's why.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Could Staff have the numbers one more time?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. It was 159,305, and then fringe, I calculated at 118,554.78.

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And...and to be clear, my intention was the six of seven undescribed expansion positions, but if they are able to describe them and post them, they can use it for whatever first gets described and posted. I didn't put the position ID or anything attached to it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Ready for the vote?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, ready. . . .*(inaudible)*. . . second? Okay. It was Member Paltin, then Member U'u-Hodgins. Any other discussion? Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I want to clarify a quick question for you, Councilmember. You said six months. Would...would eight months be better?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think they are giving eight months, and I'm cutting it to six months. I got to look. I didn't write down the exact reason. But in one of the answers, they said that DPS and MEMA have been going back and forth, and so they're having a hard time to come to an agreement. So, I was cutting it down to six months.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, was it eight and you are bringing it down to six? Okay. And it's because they can't seem to...I mean, that's a common story, I think I hear.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For each position undergoing a title change. Oh, I...I didn't cut the Cert Coordinator one, but challenges related to position titles have presented obstacles to the planned organizational changes. Despite initial discussions with the Department of Personnel Services at the beginning of calendar year 2025, which emphasized the primacy of classifications and duties over specific titles, we have encountered persistent confusion in our subsequent interactions with DPS. While progress is being made in this area, these title-related issues have undeniably delayed

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

our ability to effectively recruit and hire qualified candidates. A specific example involves the roles of Community Outreach Specialist, Public Affairs Officer, and Public Information Officer. We have reached an understanding that the classification of information and education specialist aligns with these responsibilities, enabling us to onboard two personnel. However, the title of Public Affairs Officer intended to denote the leader of our community engagement efforts has been proven problematic with DPS. We have informed DPS of the existence of a comparable community engagement specialist role within the Hawai'i Civil Defense, which aligns with our intended responsibilities and structure. And then...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: There was something else here about like, you know, the...the ones that were unclassified.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Thank you for that. I appreciate the...the...the reasoning, but I just think our community deserves better than...you know, I want them to get this done, and it's...I don't know if this is the best way, so...okay. If we vote, I'll just do roll call vote, that's all. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, are you ready to vote then? All right. Okay. Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Excused.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Excused.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that's six "ayes," one "no," two excused, Council Chair Lee and Committee Vice-Chair Kama. Motion passes.

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Paltin,  
                              Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       Councilmember Johnson.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:   None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmember Lee.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Okay. Anybody else? Going back to MEMA.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have one more amendment. I move...this is for...4.a.(1), Category B, I move to transfer \$400,000 from 903013B-6132 for resilience hubs, based on work already being done. It might go to 912014B-6132, but I'll leave that to them to decide. And if I get a second, I'll give my explanation.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Paltin, second by Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The continuity provided by Emergency Management Agency while still being able to work with the Mayor's Office and adhere to the six core components listed at <https://www.resiliencehubcollaborative.org/what>, and three conditions--nondisruption, disruption, and recovery. Please note, seven communities were promised to be supported by the County in January and February of this year as the first phase resilience hubs for Maui County. Those include Na Moku, Living Pono, Hāna Resilience Hub and Community Kitchen, Kaupō Resilience Hub, Lei Ali'i Resilience

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

Center, Lāhainā Resilience Hub Two, Kualapu‘u Hub on Moloka‘i. These were all promised in January and February that they would receive support and resources from the County of Maui. Each site has a thorough breakdown of what their immediate needs are, and where money can best be spent. Second phase, Kipahulu Hub, Haggai Institute or Hale O Laie Kihei, Honokōwai, Kapalua, MNRH, Makawao, Kula, Kaunakakai, Lāna‘i. Working with current Resiliency Hub Hui and the Mayor’s Office and Resilience Hub Collaborative. And I can email that to Staff.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Okay. Staff, you need anything else on that?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. So, Chair, just to confirm the way that we’ll reflect it on the budget bill, it’s a reduction of 400,000 from the Office of the Mayor Administration Program and we’ll...under Operations and Equipment, Category B. And then we’ll reflect that \$400,000 increase under Category B for the Emergency Management Program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is that right?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Members, I think Member Paltin had...yeah, during departmental deliberations talked about this, including both sides. So, all in favor, raise your hand and say “aye.”

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, I was raising my hand.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you have a discussion. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. But...okay. I’m just going to make it quick. I’m voting aye, obviously, but I just wanted to also highlight one of the testimonies that we heard at the Moloka‘i hearing about waiting on the funding to be open, and the RFP was never published, and the funds was...they...they were told that the funds would be available, and it never was. So, that’s all I wanted to say. I support.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That...that was for this fiscal year. I think there was 600-something or so put under the Mayor’s budget. And so, the Mayor, or the OED, or OIS was the agency. So, here’s hoping to MEMA can do a better job.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Anything else? All in favor, raise your hand and say “aye.”

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think we’re at...who is not here? We just don’t have Chair Lee and Member Kama, so seven “ayes,” two excused. Motion carries.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

**VOTE:       AYES:       Chair Sugimura and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

**NOES:       None.**

**ABSTAIN:   None.**

**ABSENT:     None.**

**EXC.:       Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmember Lee.**

**MOTION CARRIED.**

**ACTION:     APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anything else, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, that’s it. Sorry, I guess I wasn’t paying very good attention.

\*\*\*\*\*

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, is there consensus that MEMA is done then with these changes? All right. Until tomorrow. Okay. Everybody’s ready to go home. So, as indicated by the calendar, I guess we’re one department behind, but we’ll start off with DEM, and proceed on to Finance, Fire, Human Concerns, Liquor Control, Housing. We’ll see how far we can go. We’ll try to go as...as...as many as we can, departments, and of course, you have the calendar for the rest of the week. We will take up the bills that we have been putting aside for the different departments. And until we do that, then, those departments will not be complete for consensus as all of you have given for other departments. Any questions? Yay. We’re going to defer this, and we will continue tomorrow...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair? Oh, my goodness. Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Chair Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. The only department that we gave consensus to was the Auditor.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yup.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. Wait, Agriculture.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: To correct you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Agriculture. Do we not have --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I don't know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- consensus for Ag?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Well, we're...we're waiting to hear back from...Miss...Ms. Kawasaki asked if she can confer with Ms. Toshikiyo on the salaries from Countywide into Account A for each of the departments. And then there would be less motions we would have to make for reconsiderations to open back up departments if we don't do...if we don't do consensus on all the departments today.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, that if we're...if we are going to make those changes, then we don't have to, you know, do the reconsideration.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, the only department that has not been...or was not impacted by the Salary Commission so far is MEMA, right? All the rest were with directors, deputies. Yeah. Okay. So, we have no consensus for all those departments, and we will have Deputy Director Kawasaki then check, and you can get back to us. I think it started off with checking with the Auditors, but it sounds like now you're going to check on all the departments.

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you, Chair. Actually, we were going to confer with Corporation Counsel. We do have a call that we're going to try to do at 8:00 a.m. tomorrow morning.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. And you can report back tomorrow if possible. Okay. Members, thank you. We're going to defer this. And it's...

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

MR. KRUEGER: I'm so sorry. There's just one technicality that Staff just wanted to check in and address as it relates to Agriculture. There is a floating tabled motion relating to the microgrants, and we just wanted to confirm that...that it's technically withdrawn because the Committee dealt with it another way with an additional condition for the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For the floral.

MR. KRUEGER: -- for the...yeah, for the leis.

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we're fine, right? So, that's removing that one motion, correct?

MR. KRUEGER: Right. It was made by Councilmember Paltin, and so if...if she's okay --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Withdraw.

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Very good. All right. Anything else? No? All right. Thank you, everybody. Appreciate it. Tom is like, hurry up and gavel out. So, this meeting...the item is deferred.

**COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS (excused: TK, AL).**

**ACTION: DEFER.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We'll continue tomorrow. And this meeting is now adjourned.  
...*(gavel)*...

**ADJOURN: 6:29 p.m.**

bfed:min:250421:ds

Transcribed by: Daniel Schoenbeck

**BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 21, 2025**

---

CERTIFICATION

I, Daniel Schoenbeck, hereby certify that pages 1 through 162 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 29th day of May 2025, in Wailuku, Hawai'i



---

Daniel Schoenbeck