

**Subject:** Re: CRED data  
**From:** Ivor Williams <ivor.williams@noaa.gov>  
**Date:** 9/26/14, 7:13 PM  
**CC:** Bernardo Vargas-Angel – NOAA Affiliate <bernardo.vargasangel@noaa.gov>, Eric Hochberg <eric.hochberg@bios.edu>  
**To:** Steve Dollar <sdollar@mrc-hawaii.com>

That's right, new site site locations every survey round. Cheers  
Ivor

Sent from my iPhone

On Sep 26, 2014, at 12:11 PM, Steve Dollar <[sdollar@mrc-hawaii.com](mailto:sdollar@mrc-hawaii.com)> wrote:

Thanks Ivor.

This helps a lot. Just to make sure I am clear on the methods, can you verify that there is no attempt to replicate the same location of transects year to year?

thanks again.  
steve

On 9/26/2014 6:59 AM, Ivor Williams wrote:

Bernardo, Steve,

Actually, its probably not good to call it 'CRED' data .. all that data comes from a survey program that started in 2008 (when I was working with DAR). Since 2010, we (CRED) have had a partnership on the project with DAR, but its still nominally DAR's project – we are providing scientific support. So, possibly its collaborative data, but its not 'CRED' data.

All data comes from 25m long transects, haphazardly located in hard bottom areas within the Kahekili HFMA. Benthic cover comes from photo-transects, 25 photos (every 1m) per transect, analyzed using Photo-grid. In first year there were 50 dots per frame, since then it has been 15 dots per frame. Lat/long for each transect is the start of the 25m iine.

Let me know if there are any other questions. Cheers  
Ivor

On Sep 25, 2014, at 4:15 PM, Bernardo Vargas-Angel – NOAA Affiliate wrote:

Aloha Ivor-

I was approached by Steve Dollar yesterday, who asked me about the provenance of the CRED Kahekili benthic cover data in the spreadsheet attached (supplied by him by a third party, is my understanding). I was not sure whether those values came from visual estimates, direct counts (eg point intercept methods), or image analysis. Could you kindly clarify this for me please. In addition, could you provide a general description of the method used, eg. transect length, number of points; # photos and # of points analyzed per photo?

Thanks in advance,  
Bernardo

Forwarded message -----

From: **Steve Dollar** <[sdollar@mrc-hawaii.com](mailto:sdollar@mrc-hawaii.com)>  
Date: Wed, Sep 24, 2014 at 11:27 PM  
Subject: Fwd: Re: Fwd: Re: CRED data  
To: Bernardo Vargas-Angel <[Bernardo.VargasAngel@noaa.gov](mailto:Bernardo.VargasAngel@noaa.gov)>

Hi Bernardo;

Thanks for taking the time to discuss my questions regarding the benthic "CRED data" for Kahekili Maui that was supplied to us. As we discussed, please take a look at the attached file and let me know the source and methods used to obtain it.

Also, if you could forward any other NOAA benthic data for the Kahekili area, I would be very appreciative.

thanks  
steve

--

=====

**Bernardo Vargas-Ángel PhD**  
**Coral Ecologist & Benthic Team Lead**

Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center  
Coral Reef Ecosystem Division  
NOAA Inouye Regional Center

1845 Wasp Blvd, Bldg. # 176  
Honolulu, HI 96818  
Phone: 808-725-5423  
Fax: 808-725-5429

<http://www.pifsc.noaa.gov/cred/>

<all Kahekili DATA\_3.xlsx>

Dr Ivor D Williams  
Reef Fish Researcher & Fish Team Lead

Coral Reef Ecosystem Division  
Pacific Islands Fisheries Science Center  
National Marine Fisheries Service  
NOAA IRC  
NMFS/PIFSC/CRED/Ivor Williams  
1845 WASP Blvd., Building 176  
Honolulu, HI 96818  
808-725-5427