

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE
Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

April 9, 2019

Council Chamber

CONVENE: 9:12 a.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Chair
Councilmember Kelly T. King, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Riki Hokama, Member
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member
Councilmember Michael J. Molina, Member
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member

STAFF: Leslee Matthews, Legislative Analyst
Shelly Espeleta, Legislative Analyst
Christy Chung, Legislative Analyst
Yvette Bouthillier, Committee Secretary

Seated in the audience:

Don Atay, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci
Sarah Pajimola, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Keani N.W.
Rawlins-Fernandez
Kate Griffiths, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kelly T. King

Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)
Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)
Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros, Council Aide, Hana Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

ADMIN.: Michele M. Yoshimura, Budget Director, Office of the Mayor
Jeffrey Ueoka, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

OTHERS: Gabe Hoeffken
Sherri Dodson, Executive Director, Habitat for Humanity Maui
Max Tornai
Adam Radford, Manager, Maui Invasive Species Committee
Vincent Mina, President, Hawaii Farmers United
Others (5)

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

PRESS: *Akaku: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . . *(gavel)* . . . Aloha kakahiaka kakou!

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aloha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: ‘Umikūmālua minuke i ka hala o ka hola ‘eiwa, ma ‘eiwa o Apelila, i ka makahiki ‘elua kaukani umikamaeiwa. E ‘olu‘olu mai, e ho‘omalū ke Komike Ho‘omohala Waiwai me Mo‘ohelu Kālā. ‘O wau ka Iku Ha‘i o keia komike, Keani Rawlins-Fernandez. It is or it was 9:12 on April 9th, 2019 with the Economic Development and Budget Committee please come to order. I am your Chair Keani Rawlins-Fernandez. I keia la, me ko kakou, eia Committee Vice-Chair and Council Chair Kelly King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Good morning, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. Member Shane Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha kakahiaka, e alaka`i.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka. Member Mike Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aloha kakahiaka, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka. Member Alice Lee. What do you have for--

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair, Buongiorno.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Buongiorno. Member Riki Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. Member Tamara Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha kakahiaka, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka. Member Yuki Lei Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. And Member Tasha Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aloha Pōalua, Chair.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha Pōalua. Okay. Members, we have one item on today's agenda, EDB-1, Proposed Fiscal Year 2020 Budget for the County of Maui. Oh, e kala mai. With us from the Administration, we have Budget Director Michele Yoshimura. Good morning. Corporation Counsel, from Corporation Counsel, Jeff Ueoka, Deputy Corporation Counsel.

MR. UEOKA: Good morning, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. And Committee Staff Leslee Matthews.

MS. MATTHEWS: Good morning, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. Yvette Bouthillier.

MS. BOUTHILLIER: Good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. Christy Chung.

MS. CHUNG: Good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. And Shelly Espeleta. Good morning. And at our District Offices we have Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros in Hana, Denise Fernandez in Lanai, and Zhantell Lindo on Molokai. Just a quick reminder to please silence everyone's cell phones or any noise-making devices.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, we'll begin with testimony on our one item today. Testimony, to testify please sign up with Staff. Testimony is limited to three minutes, and upon request up to a minute to conclude. If you're still testifying beyond that time, I will kindly ask you to complete your testimony. When testifying, please state your name and who you're representing. Please, also indicate if you are a paid lobbyist. Let's first check in with our District Offices. Ms. Oliveira-Medeiros, at the Hana Office, will you please call your first testifier?

MS. OLIVEIRA-MEDEIROS: Aloha kakahiaka, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka.

MS. OLIVEIRA-MEDEIROS: This is Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros from the Hana Office. There is no one here waiting to testify.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Ms. Fernandez at the Lanai Office, will you please call your first testifier?

MS. FERNANDEZ: Good morning, Chair.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning.

MS. FERNANDEZ: This is Denise Fernandez at the Lanai Office and there is no one waiting to testify.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Ms. Lindo at the Molokai Office, will you please call your first testifier?

MS. LINDO: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MS. LINDO: This is Zhan at the Molokai District Office and there are no testifiers.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Ms. Matthews, will you please call our first testifier here in the Chamber?

MS. MATTHEWS: Yes, Madam Chair. Our first testifier is Gabe Hoeffken testifying on EDB-1 to be followed by Sherri Dodson.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Good morning, everyone.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning.

MR. HOEFFKEN: My name is Gabriel Hoeffken and I'm here to speak in favor of funding for Habitat of Humanity purchase of Hana affordable project. I am, me and my dad are the ones that are actually putting that project together and it would be excellent if Habitat for Humanity were able to get the funding to buy the entire project because it would make financing construction of the site development a lot easier because we would actually have a buyer so it'd make the, getting a bank to give us financing a lot more viable. Additionally, Habitat for Humanity is a great non-profit. They do good work and it's just such a great opportunity for everybody in Hana. We've been working really hard to get this project to go through. Our resolution was, 201H resolution was approved, I believe, in October of '17 and we just now got our civil construction plans together so we're pretty much at the point of submittal to the County for approval of our construction plans. So, just about shovel ready once we get our plans approved. That's about all I got. I really, really hope that, you know, Habitat's able to get the funding.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Hoeffken. We have some questions for you. Member Molina and then Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Good morning, Mr. Hoeffken. Thanks for being here. Just to clarify your testimony, how many affordable units are part of this project?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

MR. HOEFFKEN: Twenty-five lots.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Twenty-five lots.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Yeah. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Thanks, Gabe, for being here today. Can you kind of explain just some basics about the project, where it's located, some of the infrastructural types of things that your guys plan on doing prior to releasing it to either the County or the owners?

MR. HOEFFKEN: Okay. Yeah, so basically gosh we put so much work into this project and had a lot of assistance from different departments in the County. Basically it's 25 lots. It is located near Kawaipapa Stream which is kind of near the landfill if you're not familiar with Hana. It is on the mauka side of the road so it's uphill. So, we don't have any SMA issues. The majority of the lots, 24 of the 25 lots will be accessed from a private road. One lot is separate and will actually be accessed from Hana Highway. The entirety of the land that's being utilized was originally zoned Interim and I believe in the community plan it was supposed to be Rural, but unfortunately there is no system to take Interim land and automatically convert to what it was supposed to be. So, you've got to go through the full zoning process and that's kind of why we looked at that, this property and decided to try and do something with it that would be good for the community. We've been working on this, gosh, since like 2011 is when we first had meetings about what we can do for the community. And is that, was that specific enough?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. Are you backhoe Tom?

MR. HOEFFKEN: My dad is backhoe Tom. I'm back junior.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Yeah. So, my dad lives most of his days in Hana and he's been working on this for a long time.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Well, I remember it coming up last year --

MR. HOEFFKEN: Yeah. Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --but I don't remember the level of funding. What's the level of funding you're asking for? Is it in the budget right now?

MR. HOEFFKEN: I don't know.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay.

MR. HOEFFKEN: This is for...it's for Habitat for Humanity. I don't know the specifics.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Do you know the specifics of what level of funding you're asking for?

MR. HOEFFKEN: I don't know exactly what they're asking for, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh okay. Maybe Sherri has that information when she comes up.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Sorry.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thanks.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: You have an appraisal for us?

MR. HOEFFKEN: I don't have an appraisal.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Well, I don't buy anything that isn't appraised, okay.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: And my understanding of the 201 is you're supposed to do this project. That's why we approved it. You're selling this now?

MR. HOEFFKEN: Well, we're selling the finished lots which was what we, what is approved in the resolution. So, it would still be, we would still be getting it completed through

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

construction. I think what Habitat would be doing is actually purchasing the finished lots.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, who gets the money you're asking of us? You get the money?

MR. HOEFFKEN: We would probably get a portion of the money once the project's completed.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: We'll wait till we see the specifics, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I just had a couple questions. You said that the land is uphill near a stream. Do you know the percent angle or the slope? Is it...I mean I never been there. Is it flat land or...

MR. HOEFFKEN: It's not flat, but there isn't, we did an Environmental Assessment, it's part of our 201H process and there was no runoff issues with the project in the 201H in the Environmental Assessment.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No BMPs required or anything?

MR. HOEFFKEN: Oh yeah during construction there will be BMPs, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Could you run us through what BMPs you're going to use near the stream.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Yeah. Silt fence, straw wattles, generally grading everything towards retention basins, stuff like that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thanks. Just checking.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Yeah. There's actually a sheet on the plan if you want to look at it. These are still preliminary, but it's on the plans.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Did you submit that with your testimony? The plans.

MR. HOEFFKEN: No.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh.

MR. HOEFFKEN: It's still preliminary so yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: How would we look at it?

MR. HOEFFKEN: I could give you a copy or e-mail you the sheet on the BMPs if you'd like.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, that would be great.

MR. HOEFFKEN: We're hoping to submit it to the County pretty soon so I think then it would be public record, but yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, cool. Thanks.

MR. HOEFFKEN: You're welcome.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, when do you anticipate completion of the project?

MR. HOEFFKEN: It depends on a number of factors. It depends how long it takes to get permitting done. It depends on if we're able to borrow the amount needed to do the work. I would like to say, first quarter next year for all the site's civil work, basically lots completed, but it depends on a number of factors. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Members, any further questions for our testifier? Seeing none, thank you so much for your testimony.

MR. HOEFFKEN: Thank you, everybody. Appreciate the time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Matthews, will you please call our next testifier?

MS. MATTHEWS: Yes, Madam Chair. Our next testifier is Sherri Dodson testifying on behalf of Habitat for Humanity Maui.

MS. DODSON: Good morning. Sherri Dodson, Executive Director --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning.

MS. DODSON: --of Habitat for Humanity Maui. Thank you for agreeing to at least hear us about this project. We've been working with Gabe and his dad for a number of years now. We've never been, had the opportunity to do an affordable housing out in Hana and we're super excited about it. When we first started talking to them, we weren't sure how many lots we would be able to purchase. As time went by, it looked like there was a possibility that we could do them all and in, we started doing some homeowner education classes out in Hana and realizing that the need is huge. The want is even bigger. So, what prompted us to investigate being able to do all 25 lots. We did put in for Affordable Housing Fund to purchase the lots, all 25, and in that request...we normally only serve 80 percent and below, but obviously with 25 lots, we're not sure what the need is in Hana. I'm sure there will be a lot of people on

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

80 percent and below, but those that are above, we want to be able to serve them so we can, and will have the opportunity to go up higher if needed. We also can sell the lots to someone who might be able to build their own. So, we as a builder, as a contractor, have the ability to be really flexible to address each and every need of the community of Hana. For those of you who don't know, we are a licensed contractor. We're also a mortgage lender, so we have to raise every dollar to build these homes. So, that is why we often come to the County for help because raising funds, this is an \$8 million project with land purchase and construction. So, we do lend the money out to the families at a 0 percent interest. Obviously, we don't get the money back right away like most contractors or lenders do. We get it over a 30-year term. So, the money comes in slowly. We use that money to build more homes. So, we have like a revolving loan fund for the money that we receive in our mortgages. We do homeowner education. We are a HUD certified housing counselor and as I said, we've started some classes out there. So, we work with the families to get them homeowner ready, once they're ready then we can start the process of building and getting them in the home. The families do sweat equity to help build the home and then we sell it at a 0 percent interest mortgage.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Dodson. We have a question for you. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Sherri, for being here today. We understand that there are some other Habitat for Humanity projects that are currently going on and that you guys are busy with. When do you, what is the timeline for this project?

MS. DODSON: Well, depending on when the lots are ready, then we would start family selection. Family selection entails people coming in, just like any other mortgage and applying. We have to abide by all the mortgage laws. Gathering all their financials. If a family is not homeowner ready, meaning maybe their credit score isn't quite high enough or their debt ratio is too high, we start to work with the families on debt plans on, you know, trying to get their credit reports, cleaning up their credit report, so that process can take, somebody could be ready right now, somebody might take 9 to 12 months to get ready, but we want to make sure that everybody has an opportunity. If we have 100 people for the 25 lots, then like what we did the Kahoma, we get all the families that are qualified and then we do a lottery. So, we could start the process as soon as, you know, we purchase and the lots are ready. We kind of have to know what the size of the lots and stuff are so we know whether where a four bedroom's going to go, where three bedrooms, because we build the houses according to the family size. So, if somebody came in and it was just a single person they would only get a two bedroom, one bath. That house would probably go on a smaller lot as opposed to somebody who had three or four kids, we might build a four bedroom, two bath. So, we'd set aside that lot that can build that kind of house.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Good morning, Ms. Dodson. Thanks for being here. Just following up on a question that was asked of the previous speaker, do you know the exact appropriation you're asking from the Mayor?

MS. DODSON: I believe we, on the Affordable Housing Fund we asked for 5 million. Part of that was for purchase of the 25 lots. The lots are being sold to us under a LOI with Gabe guys for 169,000 which includes water meters. They also are going to help us with, we'll pay for, but they'll help us with the septic systems, it's septic out there. So, 160,000 for...they're larger lots because we have to put in septic. We kind of did some, you know, investigation on the availability of land, vacant land for building out in Hana and you just can't get land out there for anything cheaper.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. And with the homeowners education component is that part of this appropriation or just something totally separate that...

MS. DODSON: Totally separate.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Totally separate. Alright. Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Lee and then Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Good morning, Sherri. Did you say you're asking for 5 million for 25 lots? Okay, and I'm sorry, what size are those lots again?

MS. DODSON: Oh, gosh. They range from 11,000 square feet, 13,000 square feet, 12,000, 10,000. They're pretty good size lots. Let me see what the smallest one is here. Ten, four, five. I think the smallest one is 10,050 or...oh 10,014. That's the smallest lot.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, they are finished lots?

MS. DODSON: That's what it will be, yes. Gabe guys will get it pad ready. They'll get water meters in. So, all we will have to do is do septic, and again we don't know what size septic until we know what size family is going on that lot and tie in to the waterline.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And how much are you paying them?

MS. DODSON: A hundred and fifty-nine thousand six hundred and thirty per lot average.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Chair King and then Member Paltin.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you, Chair. Thanks for being here, Sherri. I have a concern that we, when we approved these lots for 201H last year, you know, the

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

owners were adamant that these were going to be offered to local residents, they were going to be purchased individually and then houses built, and they were deemed to be affordable lots. So, what happened to get your guys involved and now that you're asking us for 5 million?

MS. DODSON: I don't know that there's too many affordable housing builders on Maui. We are one of the few especially that...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right, but originally these were going to be offered to residents and they were going to be purchasing the lots individually and building their own houses on them. That was my recollection of that project and so now you're coming to us asking for, you know, money for one purchase of all lots. Was there any steps taken to actually offer those lots locally and they weren't picked up or what? Do you know what happened?

MS. DODSON: I wasn't part of the 201H, but my understanding from the very beginning, we've been working with Gabe and his father from the very beginning that Habitat would be part of this project. As I said, if people can afford to buy the lots and don't qualify for us, they make too much money or then they can build their own house. It may be that half the lots end up that way. We always address the community's needs. We don't go in and build a bunch of houses.

VICE-CHAIR KING: No. No. You know, I know what you guys do and I think it's really good, it's just that when we first looked at this project and approved it last year there was no, you know, there was no request for \$5 million. It was just like, you know, approve the project and then they would sell the lot, they would divide the lots up and sell them to locals. So, I'm, you know, just it's a very different model that your bringing to us and asking for funding so I just if at some point you can explain to us why we're going this way instead of, you know, just having, offering the lots out to residents, that would be good. And that's probably the owners that need to...

MS. DODSON: Yeah, I can only address what we've heard from the community and they want us there. We only go to, we only build in places where we're wanted and where we're needed and the Hana residents have made it clear to us that, I mean, we get at least two to three calls a week of, you know, where are you on the project, when can we apply. Our waiting list for the homeowner education classes, which is a requirement before you can buy from us, I think at one point we had 80 people on the list.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I don't know, I mean I was, I just feel like this wasn't what we discussed last year when we approved the project. It wasn't funding coming from the County. It was going to be sold so that's kind of what I was just curious as to how it turned into a \$5 million request, I guess. Anyway, maybe we can get that information from the owner. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Paltin, Member Hokama, and then Member Sugimura.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha, Ms. Dodson. Thank you for being here, and thank you for what you're doing for our community. I just had a couple questions to try and understand what I was hearing to clarify it. So, each lot is average 159,635 plus or minus depending on the size, and if somebody from the community wanted to walk up and pay that \$159,635 they could?

MS. DODSON: Sure. If they can afford to build on it. We want to make sure that, you know...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's a house.

MS. DODSON: Yeah, that there's a house on it eventually.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, like 25 lots, 159, that's about 4 million. The other million is for the construction costs?

MS. DODSON: It's for, to help us. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But that doesn't cover the entire cost because you have money from your revolving loans to supplement it as well?

MS. DODSON: Yeah and we can also use 502 loans. They are an interest loan, but what we do is we discount the price of the house so that it works out to be the same payment as if it was a 0 percent interest. We also have some other financing that we do. When we sell or when we finish a project, we can sell a portion of those mortgages to get money upfront so we can do more, but we have a quite a few different financing methods.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, once the lots are sold, none of that money ever does come back to the County Affordable Housing Fund?

MS. DODSON: No, it goes into our revolving fund so that we can build more homes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And what is your capacity to do multiple projects at one time?

MS. DODSON: Well, we've got 11 homes going right now.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's the Kahoma?

MS. DODSON: Ten in Kahoma. We're also building up at Keokea. We're also finishing our commercial project our new warehouse and ReStore. We finished the 16-unit condominium project so I think we have the capacity.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you can do more than what you got going on right now if you had more money?

MS. DODSON: Yeah. You have to set up, you know, you gotta get a --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The groundwork.

MS. DODSON: --project. Yeah. We've already talked to, I can't remember the name of it right now. Rick Rutiz is, you know, to get their...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Ma Ka Hana Ka Ike.

MS. DODSON: Yeah. To get their guys, you know, involved in the project. A big problem down in Hana is going to be getting volunteers to help build because that's how we keep it affordable, but we have infrastructure in place already to bring groups from the mainland, college kids, something called Hawaii Village Build where we promote groups to come and build in Hawaii, and of course the community, I think, and the families out there will be a big help.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And looking forward, you have enough projects in the works to keep you busy or you could have some more?

MS. DODSON: We're going to build as many as we can. We just, I just had a meeting yesterday with DHHL for Lanai 16 homes over there. We have four, I think, four more families that have applied up at Keokea. We also have another project at Brush with Kindness where we do critical repairs. We keep busy.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The Keokea ones is on Hawaiian Homes?

MS. DODSON: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. Thank you so much.

MS. DODSON: Sure.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama, and then Member Sugimura, and then Member Lee

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, my first question would be for you to send a written request to Habitat, I'd like the...

MS. DODSON: Habitat.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Habitat for a pre-cap of total amount of County funds we've appropriated to them and what should the balances be in their revolving fund because I'd like to know what their balances are if they using the repayment for future housing construction.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We'll get that sent to them.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I think we should take a look at, again, what we approved because I'm feeling kind of snooker today with this \$5 million request. And my last comment is I have my concerns about Habilitat [sic] returning to Lanai and the ability to perform on our island. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, Chair, just, so your, this a \$5 million request for Affordable Housing Fund? Is that right?

MS. DODSON: It was yeah. I think, honestly, I don't know maybe. I actually came from a meeting this morning. I wasn't prepared to testify. I'm not sure whether you're requesting it to be in the budget or it's part of the Affordable Housing Fund.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh.

MS. DODSON: Actually, I'm a little confused. Sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. So, just there's, in the Affordable Housing Fund, there's no \$5 million request for this. So, I don't see it. So, this would be a brand-new request is what's being asked of the Council.

MS. DODSON: There is a current application for Affordable Housing Funds for \$5 million in.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: With Housing and Human Concerns --

MS. DODSON: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --you put it in? Oh, I see. So, it might be for another fiscal year? Not this fiscal year. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair, you know, it's a little unusual for a 20H [sic] project to be approved and then resurface again for additional funding. You know, usually people if they're going to sell lots, they develop and sell lots, they sell lots. You know, they don't come back for, you know, additional funding because they already in a sense, got their subsidy with the fast track. Yeah. So, I'm wondering if those lots were priced reasonably within, you know, 80 to 140 percent of median income. Do you have

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

people that qualify for, because these are low numbers as it is? So, apparently people did not qualify for the lots alone? Is that correct?

MS. DODSON: To my understanding, they haven't been marketed at all yet. The lots haven't even been completed. The final plans and Gabe can address this, the final plans for subdivision are not submitted. They were just completed, but once they're completed then they can start doing the site work and you can't really market stuff that's, you don't really have a TMK for yet.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Right --

MS. DODSON: And...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: --but yet your coming in for funding for something that's not finished either, yeah, you see where we are on this. My concern is the people in Hana haven't had a chance to make the choice of buying the lots only, you know, because maybe they do have the means to build their own homes and to buy the lots alone. So, I mean, this is kind of an unusual request and so would another option be perhaps selling some lots only and then doing, you know, some lots with Habitat?

MS. DODSON: Absolutely. And to your point about the 201H and then us coming in for funding, we actually did the same thing on the Kahoma project. The Kahoma project was a 201H and then we came in and requested some help from the Affordable Housing Fund to...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I know, but, Sherri, you're a non-profit okay. The other guys are for profit right? Okay, so it's a little different. So, you know, I'm hoping that the people of Hana would like to have a choice and perhaps, you know, buy the lots separately and build what they can afford or want and then for those who need, who have more difficulty qualifying, perhaps that's where you would come in and help them.

MS. DODSON: Yeah, and I think, that is exactly what our plan was. I think the purpose and I'm speaking for Gabe and he'll correct me if I'm wrong, is that they're at a point where they need help finishing the project and, you know, they need funding. I can't come up with \$5 million any other way than to request help from the County to get this project finished. If they get, if we get funding and we can purchase the lots then we could start the project within this fiscal year or this upcoming fiscal year I should say.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I have a quick question and it's for Member Sinenci. Is this 25 lots one of your priorities?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes, Chair. This was one of the asks and when I presented on the floor yesterday it was up to 5 million and we...

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, I'm wondering if perhaps we can move forward and if you need assistance maybe we can call upon them as a resource.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is that something the Members would be open to because it's one of Member Sinenci's priorities?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Right and...oh go ahead. I'll yield to the other Councilmember's questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, my question, I just want to try to understand. So, what you are doing actually at this moment is, you are selling the lots to the people of Hana, and then should they decide after they purchase these lots that they would like to build their homes on it then that's that next step that will occur?

MS. DODSON: No. We're a mortgage company so we have to actually own the lots to build on them so that we can sell them, you know, as a contractor we need to be able to build them on the lots and then we sell them as, you know, as a mortgage. I think what we plan to do is to go into Hana and find out. Right now we have no idea, you know, nobody's even, we haven't opened up the application period yet. So when the applications start coming in, we're going to start to see and we can do the option of purchase for a house or house and lot or just lot, and see what the people of Hana want, what they can actually afford, and how we can provide for the need.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, I'm looking at the 100 percent affordable Hana housing project lot pricing. So, we, I have this, I guess it's a spreadsheet and I'm assuming it's from you or somebody from Habitat.

MS. DODSON: It's from Gabe and the family. They just kind of pulled it from the, I believe, from the residential ordinance.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, your lots are priced at these numbers here?

MS. DODSON: No, not necessarily. We, as a mortgage company we have to sell at market value. We can subsidize and with a silent second. So, if a lot is, you know, the market value is, I think I looked on MLS was 249,000 and the family because we never charge more than 30 percent of someone's income towards housing costs. So, we anticipate what the house will cost for them to build it. So, let's say the house is going to be \$300,000 then they could only afford a certain amount. Then we subsidize that and on a silent second so the monthly payment is left, fits their income. Does that make sense?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you. No, but that's okay. I mean, I get, I understand what's going on, but thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I'll --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just a quick --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: ---let you comment, but I just I want to know if the Members would be open to continuing this deliberation after testimony when Member Sinenci's item for this comes up? Okay. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I appreciate because we're in testimony so we're pretty much into Committee work now. So, I appreciate your guidance on this. I would say, maybe, I would consider you instead looking at next week, I think either Tuesday or Wednesday we have the Housing Department so we'll have also the potential of the Housing Director here to give comment from the County's side of the Administration on how they may look at this project because I don't know if they're aware of it because they usually submit a recommendation on what projects are to be funded from the Affordable Housing Fund. So, I would ask that that may be part of our considerations to hold it when we do that Department's review also. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sinenci, you had a last comment?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No, I can, I concur.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And I agree with that. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, Members, thank you so much. Oh, Miss, so Member Sinenci, would you like to ask, would you like me to ask Ms. Dodson to stay on to be a resource person?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes. Yes please, Chair. Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Ms. Dodson, would you be able to stay longer to serve as a resource person if needed?

MS. DODSON: Yes, and I actually wanted to testify on another matter for Habitat.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I just wanted to add Gabe Hoeffken to that because he is the, a lot of the questions were fielded towards Sherri, but she's just with the Habitat section whereas some of the questions were geared toward the owners of the property or Gabe Hoeffken.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: So, I'd like to add his name too as a resource.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Dodson, we actually have only one item on today's agenda, and you testified up to three minutes on it.

MS. DODSON: Well, this is a budget item. It's just about a different, not the Hana project.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. So, you have three minutes per agenda item and there's only one agenda item.

MS. DODSON: Oh.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And so, but you can come in another day --

MS. DODSON: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --to testify.

MS. DODSON: Alright. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Dodson. Ms. Matthews, will you please call our next testifier?

MS. MATTHEWS: Yes, Madam Chair. Our next person signed up in the Chamber is Max Tornai testifying as an individual.

MR. TORNAI: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MR. TORNAI: Aloha, Council. Thank you for making time available to hear us out. I'm the Development Director for Habitat for Humanity and I wanted to . . . *(inaudible)* . . . the opportunity to some of the financial issues you guys were asking about for the affordable, the 100 percent affordable Hana project. I know that we've used a lot of time already, and I'm happy to defer my testimony until, you know, until a more appropriate time to get through the agenda a little bit more quickly, but I will say we did apply for the Affordable Housing Fund, not a line item. I don't know if there is

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

recommendations that that be changed, but my understanding with conferring with the Housing Department yesterday is that there is about 11 million unspoken funds in the Affordable Housing Fund now and Mayor is projecting or hoping to put in additional 10.1 in next year's budget. This is a big ask, it's a very big ask, and I know that it may not operate. I cannot speak to the questions on the 201H issues that you had, but I do know that the need in Hana is extraordinary. I know a lot of the Councilmembers weren't at the initial Land Use Committee meetings. There was one in October 18th out in Hana, and I would certainly recommend that the Council reread that testimony. I have copies of that minutes if you'd like a couple. Also wasn't aware that we'd be testifying in front of you guys today. I thought we were just coming in for a short meeting so I only brought a few copies, but that meeting was held at noon. There were a lot of comments about how it would've been, there would've been a greater response if it was held at night because a lot of people were working at that time. So, people were coming in, testifying on behalf of three, four people, or whole families. There is a lot of Habitat for Humanity support out in Hana. I guarantee it. Regardless, they have a desperate need out there. You'll read in this testimony people living in three-bedroom houses, 19, 20-plus people. They need help. They don't care how it's done. They just need the help to live in a healthy environment and Hana, especially is such a huge tourist destination that we need to support the local people out there. I'll take my time at a later date, but if, or at a later time, but if you have any questions, I'd be happy to answer them, but I know that we're trying to move.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hi.

MR. TORNAI: Hi.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you for coming. Do you know when the 201H project was presented in Hana last year if the applicant asked or mentioned that he would be asking for \$5 million from the Housing Fund for this project?

MR. TORNAI: That \$5 million request came from Habitat. We were asked by Buddy to present what our need would be to build that project. That's what our need would be to build that project. The total cost for all 25 lots, I think, was about 3.9 million, and we have information from Gabe that they've already spent about 3.7 million in the 201H process and getting the lots ready. I understand that there is a concern that this request will go to a for-profit corporation, and I understand how on an umbrella view it certainly looks like that, but really we're just trying to get private parts of the community with public parts of the community to get people housing that they desperately need. I think that Gabe guys already put a significant amount of money that is, you know, covered by the asking price. It looks like a lot, but when you have even just a \$5,000 expense times 25 houses, that balloons to \$125,000. So, it's a lot of money, but it's a major problem.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, and thank you for that clarification. The other thing is in a sense, isn't this an ask primarily to cover unanticipated costs of a private developer for an affordable housing project?

MR. TORNAI: I don't think the costs are unanticipated because they've already been expended to my knowledge. We have a list of expenses that Gabe's company provided that, my understanding, is that they've already spent.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, let me...

MR. TORNAI: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I thought I heard the previous speaker say monies were needed to finish the project. So, that's not true then?

MR. TORNAI: Well, the majority of this ask is for land acquisition and there are, there is work that needs to be done to get those lots ready for us to build on them.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Members, any other questions? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Max, for being here and the work that you do. I just was wondering, I think, Ms. Dodson maybe said that 10,000 square feet is the smallest lot. How many dwellings are you planning on putting on each lot?

MR. TORNAI: Just one dwelling on each lot. I think, she's right that it's about almost maybe given exactly 10,000 square feet is the smallest lot, and it, we don't generally build two, well two buildings for one family, you know, on the same lot. We did do a 16-unit condominium on one lot in Happy Valley so we were able to do 16 families in one lot, but for single-family homes we traditionally just do one home per one lot.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But there's a capacity to do more?

MR. TORNAI: There certainly is the potential for that I would think. I know, I have...we have lots that were about the same size that did allow for an ohana afterwards.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do they need to plan that ahead with the septic?

MR. TORNAI: I would assume that whatever permitting that they would need to get approved for the ohana after the fact they would then have to reassess, but I'm not a construction expert.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks.

MR. TORNAI: Sure.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Members, any other questions? Okay. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Good morning --

MR. TORNAI: Good morning.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --Mr. Tornai. Just to kind of cut through the chase, if you don't get this 5 million from the Affordable Housing Fund, project's dead?

MR. TORNAI: Maybe.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Members, any other questions? And, you know, this is one of Member Sinenci's items that we will be deliberating on later. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair, and thank you to the Members for clarifying and asking the important questions. For us in Hana, you know, we've seen and listening to the testifiers the housing is needed.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci, do you have a question for the testifier?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No, I don't.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, can I ask you to save your comments for when your item comes up?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Thank you. Okay, Members, any other questions for the testifier? Okay, seeing none. Thank you so much for your testimony.

MR. TORNAI: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Matthews, will you please call our next testifier up?

MS. MATTHEWS: Yes, Madam Chair. Our next testifier is Adam Radford testifying on behalf of Maui Invasive Species Committee in his role as manager.

MR. RADFORD: Aloha, Chair --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

MR. RADFORD: --and Members. Good to see you all again, and I guess, today I'm here to just also thank you for what I understand was a pretty exemplary demonstration of support for watershed protection yesterday, and so I just wanted to speak to that a little bit about what's under the Department of Water Supply budget. So, I'm not totally sure how the Department of Water Supply budget actually works because they are a municipality that brings in their own revenue, and then they're, I think, subsidized by your support and County funding for their grants program. So, I believe, they support about 14 different watershed protection initiatives so that'd be like East Maui Watershed Partnership, other watershed partnerships and the Maui Invasive Species Committee. The funding we receive is just for boots on the ground, largely for Miconia control in East Maui and other invasive species as they come up. Having that flexibility is really important because for example, like if we got rapid ohia death, that would become a huge priority for us in East Maui. So, having a bit of wiggle room in there is important, but I just want to make the point that really the funding is for people on the ground going out, controlling invasive species because we know that that's the most effective way to do the work. I believe what's in the budget currently is 260,000 which is pretty similar to what we've gotten years prior to last. Last year we had a proviso for an additional \$250,000 that we would like to see carried forward. So, we would like to, basically, see what's in the budget doubled for watershed protection at the minimum, and for perspective, our peak in terms of funding for Miconia, we were at about a million-and-a-half dollars. That was largely Federal funding that's now gone, but if we could at least keep about 555,000 in the budget for boots on the ground that would have an impact. That would be noticeable and clearly justifiable. So, that's like our minimum request under that line item, and I just wanted to add a bit of perspective on the helicopter work though, which again is not funded under Department of Water Supply. So, from 2012 to 2016, we invested about \$680,000 in helicopter work. That was mostly State funding. We protected 45,000 acres and avoided \$384 million in future management costs. So, I mean, that's just one example of how these are really good investments. So again, I know I'm out of time, and thank you for your attention. I'm happy to entertain any questions, and I will be talking about coqui frogs on Thursday night, so and again I'm sure.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your testimony. Members, any questions?
Chair King and then Member Sugimura.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Thanks for being here, Adam. My main, it's sort of the same question about the coqui frogs, but my questions is that so if we continue the funding, are you actually making headway or are you just maintaining? I mean are we gaining on the problem or are just maintaining where we're at today?

MR. RADFORD: So, that's a great question. Thank you for that, Chair. I just want to be clear with Miconia, this is a long-term management project. This is not for MISC an eradication project because, I mean, the seed longevity is so great and the volume of plants is so significant that we are not going to eradicate Miconia by going out and pulling every plant. That's just the reality. What we are working on with partners is what we call natural enemies or biologic controls that we hope will come to light and sort of level the playing at some point. Where we are incredibly effective with the

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

Miconia project is keeping it out of the upper elevation, more pristine watershed areas which is tough because people don't see that. Like they don't go there typically. I mean, I know some do for hunting and other purposes, but this is a management project that will continue for many years going forward.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, this is kind of endless funding that we are looking at as far as Miconia. So, I mean are you getting to, are you making some progress as far as clearing certain areas and moving on or is just always going to be where it is and you just keep it at bay?

MR. RADFORD: We do make significant progress. It...sort of the 1,500 foot elevation mark which is where we want to not have it above that., so we're super successful at that. And also from basically a lot of the East Maui drainages where we've done a lot of work we're really successful there, but largely we're keeping it at bay and unfortunately when funding sort of deteriorated or went away really, our Federal funding we had to let certain areas, basically just go and unfortunately we're not able to get there. If the Council chose to put really significant resources towards people we could get back in those areas, but currently that might not be the best use of funding to be honest.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. And that's, those, that type of management requires hired people who know what they're doing versus volunteers?

MR. RADFORD: So, we actually would love to have a more formalized volunteer program, but we do utilize volunteers now, like we do a lot of school groups and others that do go into areas where we typically don't work because the volume of plants is so great because, again, we're basically keeping a lid on it. So, we would very much entertain a volunteer coordinator position which we have not been able to retain.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you, Adam, for being here. So, the helicopter experience that you're talking about or the needs was funded through this Miconia fund also?

MR. RADFORD: No, the one that's in question today under the Department of Water Supply, that does not fund any helicopter work. It's only for people. It's personnel solely and what I'm proposing is to continue that, but at a higher, around a \$555,000 amount as opposed to what's in there now, I think, is 260,000.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

MR. RADFORD: So, helicopter would be funded through other sources.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Other sources.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Paltin, and then Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I had a question. You know the folks that you were saying that go into the pristine upper watershed, what measures are taken that the seeds are not tracked with them into the upper watershed?

MR. RADFORD: Sure. That's a great question. So, we are very diligent about that both when crews go into the upper elevation watershed areas, but just across the border, I mean, we decontaminate our equipment almost every day, if not every day, but also like in those areas they have specific clothing and equipment just for those different regions.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or when you, you said like, you know, some hunters or other folks that go into the upper watershed is there like general awareness of the procedures to take to not contaminate the upper watershed by the general population provided, do you guys provide that kind of education in the general population to the folks that do go into the upper watershed that aren't connected with you folks to keep the area contained to what you have it right now?

MR. RADFORD: Yeah, we do our best, but that's one of our other priorities is not just in the upper elevation watershed, but down lower we actually just put in a proposal to try to prevent Miconia from being present in places where people might move it. So, that's another priority for us, but yeah, we do our best, but we can't, clearly can't dictate what, you know, hunters or others are...what practices they're utilizing, but we provide a lot of outreach and education to those groups.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, I foresee this issue as being a forever issue that if we don't ever figure out how to eradicate this, we're always going to be managing it for centuries and centuries and centuries which means we're going to be paying. So, is there at any time, even a thought of developing an eradication plan?

MR. RADFORD: We've gone through that process. We did it in 2006 actually, and I think we estimated that it would cost about a million and a half for many years with declining costs after that. So, it's possible, I mean, anything is possible, but the other thing is that we have things on the horizon like the gregarious caterpillar that is a known consumer of Miconia leaves and is about to be released as a natural enemy, and so I guess, like our sort of perspective on Miconia management has been to manage it as

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

best we can until other things come into play that either would allow us to control the plants or they would do it themselves. And even so, how MISC started is the Melastone Action Committee in 1999. Even then we had, you know, like Bob Hobdy, Art Medeiros, the great leading scientists in our community saying this is a management project. Really early on that was their perspective, and you know, so we're carrying that forward, but yes, unfortunately it is a management project, and if the Council wanted MISC to come to you with what it would take for an eradication effort, we could put that together, but I think it would be a very large dollar amount per year, for many years to come.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Okay, Members, any other questions? Seeing none, thank you so much for your testimony and we'll see you Thursday night.

MR. RADFORD: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Matthews, will you please call our next testifier?

MS. MATTHEWS: Yes, Madam Chair. Our next testifier is Vincent Mina testifying on behalf of Hawaii Farmers Union United in his capacity as President.

MR. MINA: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MR. MINA: Aloha, Council. Hi. I brought some greens from our farm today so in case you don't agree with what I'm requesting, at least you say I can feed you folks. So, it'll go in the refrigerator okay. They're still screaming from being cut. I was in harvesting mode when I was asked to come and testify today from Councilmember Sinenci's Office to clarify any questions or answer any questions you may have today. So, I am President of, State President of Hawaii Farmers Union United. We have 12 active chapters Statewide, 1,571 members and this Council and the County has supported us in our farmer apprentice mentoring program that we have had for a number of years and to grow our farmers basically and to also support our existing farmers who have the knowledge to be able to impart upon young folks or folks who are looking to be able to farm for a living, and our organization was founded in 2009. I sat on the Farm Bureau board from 2005 to 2008. It was evident to me that they had a different priorities than what I wanted to see brought forward which specifically is about our organization focuses in a lot on regenerating the life of the land and as it goes, as we can see in the news the best way to mitigate climate change these days is to be able to put more carbon back into our soil which translates into soil health. And just as a side note to that, just to be understanding how that all works out is there's four places on the planet that stores carbon and that's in our ocean, in our sky, in our soil, and in our plant life. Well, we want to mainly in order to have a healthy environment is to focus in on our plant life and in our soil to store the carbon so that we're not acidifying

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

our oceans and we're also not putting it into the air which is causing problems with our, the UV rays of the sun, you know. So yeah, so in essence we've started this work in the community in 1998 with our first soil health conference in 2001 to 2013 under Maui Aloha Aina Association which was also supported by the County. We held educational outreach conferences focusing in on the relationship between our bodies and the soil, and so Hawaii Farmers Union United was a seed that was planted from that. So, thank you. Any questions you have I'd be happy to answer.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your testimony, Mr. Mina.

MR. MINA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Members, any questions for our testifier? Member Paltin and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha, Mr. Mina. Thank you for being here and the work that you do. I just was wondering, what is the dollar amount additional that you are requesting?

MR. MINA: Right now, ideally, we would like to be on even keel with the Farm Bureau in funding and I say that not in as a competition kind of a thing. I think Farm Bureau does really valuable work and I've...and it just goes to show the diversity of what is needed in agriculture and bringing it forward. I may want to also clarify that I sit on the Board of Agriculture and our State budget for agriculture, I don't know if you folks know this, but it's .4 percent. So, there's not much support for agriculture out there in the State unfortunately, and Maui has taken a lead which I really appreciate in valuing agriculture.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MR. RADFORD: Thank you, Councilmember.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. I wondered if...nice to see you, Vincent.

MR. RADFORD: Thank you, Councilmember.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, I wonder if you could then, because I think in the budget it's a lump sum, can you break down, not...you can maybe send him a letter or get it in writing like the breakdown of what the Hawaii Farmers Union United budget is allocated for because I think in a discussion we wanted to be sure that the mentoring program was also supported, yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The Farmer's Apprentice.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Apprentice program.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The Farmer's Apprentice...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: But we couldn't tell by the way that it was listed so --

MR. RADFORD: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --I wonder if you could get him that.

MR. RADFORD: Yes, absolutely.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Our Committee can send him a correspondence.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah. Yeah. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Nice seeing you.

MR. RADFORD: And thank you. And thank you for your support last year of our convention. Appreciate it.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Are you having another convention?

MR. RADFORD: Yes, and we're having it again on Maui this year. November 8th, 9th, and 10th.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: November 8th, 9th and 10th.

MR. RADFORD: Yeah. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Upcountry?

MR. RADFORD: No. It's actually going to be at the Tropical Plantation and doing demonstrations across the street on the President of our Mauna Kahalawai chapter Bobby Pahia's farm. Is the intention, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And is it part of your funding request, is that?

MR. RADFORD: Yes. Actually, it is. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Hokama?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Maybe you can help us to understand how the State's level of support when you say .4, what are we talking about in dollars if you are aware of it please?

MR. RADFORD: You know, Councilmember, I'm not sure exact dollars. I do know though that we, in that budget we are responsible for the weights and measures of the gas stations. So. just the fact that it's less than one half of 1 percent, plus having that other responsibility...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Of the State General Fund total?

MR. RADFORD: The State...yes. Yes. So, I'm not sure in dollar wise. I should have that information, and I could get it to you.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, that would be appreciated --

MR. RADFORD: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --because I just want to be able to relate it to the level of our support --

MR. RADFORD: Absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --dollar wise.

MR. RADFORD: Thank you. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: That would help us.

MR. RADFORD: Thank you very much.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, I appreciate that.

MR. RADFORD: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Members, any other questions for our testifier? Okay. Seeing none, mahalo for your testimony today, Mr. Mina.

MR. RADFORD: Thank you, Chair. Appreciate it. Aloha everybody.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Matthews, will you please call our next testifier?

MS. MATTHEWS: Madam Chair, we do not have any other individual signed up in the Chamber to testify.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Seeing there...oh did we hear back from the District Offices? Did we hear from them if there are any testifiers there?

MS. MATTHEWS: I have not received notification from the District Offices of any other testifiers.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. Seeing that there are...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. I just wanted to offer that I do have an e-mail from the program director of the FAM program with the breakdown of the Hawaii Farmers Union's monies and where it's supposed to go too. So, I can get that to you and save you an additional ask.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Thank you, Chair King. Okay, seeing no further testifiers, without objection I will now close public testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, public testimony is now closed.

. . .END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

**ITEM 1: PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2020 BUDGET FOR THE COUNTY OF MAUI
(CC 19-61)**

RESOLUTION ON REAL PROPERTY TAX RATES

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, the first thing that we're going to look at very quickly hopefully is the resolution that okay...so Staff is distributing the resolution on the range of real property tax rates that will be posted for the required public hearing notice, and in the spirit of transparency and better informing the public, I've taken the proposed RPT rates received this year and also looked at the adopted rates for the past four years and took the highest and the lowest and added a dollar to the highest and subtracted a dollar from the lowest to create the range on the resolution that you have before you. In the past, the range of rates has been \$3 to \$15 for most of the categories except for Timeshare and Short-Term Rental, and Homeowner. Timeshare, the range historically has been \$8 to 24, as well as the Short-Term Rental and Homeowner \$1 to \$15. To give a maximum range because once the resolution is posted, the range will be what we will be required to stay within. So, I wanted to just bring it to the Members' attention that this is my intention to pass the resolution with a more specific range instead of just a \$3 to 15, is like a really broad range because it really doesn't provide the community, you know, the kind of information for them to,

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

you know, be able to testify on and provide more meaningful input. So, I just wanted to open it up to any questions or concerns, and if there aren't any questions or concerns, then this is the range that I would like to post for the public hearing. Okay, Member Paltin, and then Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just had a question, and it's not necessarily about the rate, but how it's done for classification B Apartment, like most people that live in apartments, don't own their own apartments, they rent like affordable rentals right? So, that wouldn't be the Homeowner class if the land is designated zoned Apartment, they get taxed at the Apartment class, and then like how do the, like low-income rentals get affected? They get taxed at such a higher rate than Homeowners or I don't understand?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. Actually, our RPT is are better equipped than me to answer this, but I can give you a general explanation. For the Homeowner class, you get classified as Homeowner if you qualify and you get the homeowner exemption. So that's would put you into Homeowner. If you are in an apartment, it is possible to get the Homeowner, home exemption and be put into the Homeowner classification even though you're not the owner. If you have a long-term lease, you can get in there because in our tax code there's certain provisions that a long-term lessee is considered an owner, however you are correct, that's not the norm. As far as low- and moderate-income housing, there's currently a section, I believe it 3.48.545 in the Maui County Code which allows if a affordable housing project meets certain low and moderate income housing standards and requirements, it would qualify for an exemption from real property tax. I believe you are familiar with the project that got that in your district, the Front Street Apartment Housing. I'm not sure, but I believe Director Teruya and Mayor Victorino have sent down some modifications to that section, but I'm not sure where it is, but generally speaking that is the way it works right now.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And you said 3.48.545?

MR. UEOKA: That's the...I'm sorry, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: That's the low- and moderate-income housing exemption.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What is the source? That's like page numbers, 3.48.545 or...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. That's section 3.48.545 of the Maui County Code.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thanks.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Was that all your questions, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes. Thank you. That makes it a lot more clear for me.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Thank you. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. I think this is great. You've set some little firmer parameters regarding the rates consideration so I appreciate that. My one question I'm going to pose, and I would ask you to get appropriate guidance is whether not because we've have had proposals with regards to minimum tax that impacts property tax, and again, I say that very specifically about property tax because we've had people ask us to consider other forms of valuation that for me, our Department is not property taxation, its real property. Let's not get it confused with personal property or internal assets of a structure. So, does the minimum tax have sufficient impact that it needs to be considered as part of the resolution because if it's, with one consideration my concern is then what does the resident really pay for since most of us then become minimum tax payers? What does this mean to the balance of our books? So, I would ask that you try and give us some appropriate guidance through the Budget Office or Corporation Counsel please. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka or Ms. Yoshimura?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. I think traditionally the determination of rates section has applied to the real property tax rates and not necessarily the minimum real property tax; however, the minimum real property tax is in that section under Article 10 of the Chapter 3.48. So, in an abundance of caution, I could see why you would want to include it for discussion, but again, this body's prerogative. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. Thank you, Chair. The only other concern, again, as it ties into the revenue side component that this resolution addresses, Chair, is when are we going to talk about the vehicle taxes? Is that not something you want us to have consideration on regarding the other components like vehicle weight tax or if we make options to the tax, is that something you're going to present to us at that later date, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, and for the current resolution in front of you, the adopted tax rates for the past four years was part of the consideration in creating the range. So, in, you know, affecting the minimum tax, I guess, how it was affected in the last four years, is considered in this range that was proposed. Member Lee and then Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. I understand Councilmember Hokama's concern, but I would think that you may not want to put the minimum tax posted with this information because you're not posting the circuit breaker, you're not posting, you know, exemptions, you're not posting any other information. That could actually be confusing to the public. So, I think if you just posted the rates and the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

range so it's real clear that because it's, what it says here, adopting the real property tax rates for the County of Maui. Maybe if you added too much information, it might be a little confusing for the public. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. So, the resolution that has been posted, the range of rates in the past it was just \$3 as the minimum, and then \$15 as the maximum so that there would be a range, and so what I'm doing is just kind of limiting the range a little bit. So, I don't know if that helps with your concern. Member King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No, I just...thank you, Chair. I just wanted to thank you for sharing this with the Council and I think you...it definitely covers for myself anyway, I couldn't see going below this or above this range so, I think, it's a reasonable range and it kind of gives people more of an idea of what's possible. Just so that Councilmembers know that this is required and that once it's posted, we have to stay within those parameters, but yeah I think, I would post what you have here is as what's required. I wouldn't start adding too much into that because like I agree with Councilmember Lee that it does get confusing for people if you start putting too many components in here that aren't actual categories of the property tax. So, I would support this as is and thank you for sharing.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Members, any other questions or concerns or objections?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sorry. Just clarification question because I'm kind of new. The, so you have the land tax and the building tax in the two columns and generally is it the same per category the land tax and the building tax or do they vary?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, your question is why are, basically why are they separated into two columns?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess yeah. That's another way to ask it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. I believe Mr. Teruya touched on this in his presentation and I'll give it a shot.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like if there's no building...

MR. UEOKA: I'll give it a shot. It's basically in another section of the Real Property Tax Code, which is your code, the County's Code, it does talk about except as otherwise provided, land and building shall be classified. So, land and building shall be classified. So, the system we have here does classify land and building. Traditionally though, you are correct, the rate has always been the same. However, there is the ability to separate the rate and a building would have zero value if there is no building on vacant land, the building value, because it's, remember there's valuation and

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

there's rate. So, you could have a rate on it, but if there's no building, the value would be zero for the building. The land would still have a value of course.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That was the part where he was saying that we're the only County to do it this way?

MR. UEOKA: I believe so. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh okay. And it is...

MR. UEOKA: I should say we're the only one that still does it this way. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And, but there is possibility that the land rate might be different than the building rate in the classification, but that would just be really hard and not acceptable?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. I won't, I don't know if, how hard it is or not. I don't do that portion of it so I can't get into that, but the ability does exist from my understanding is for you guys to set a separate land and building rate. It's just traditionally not been done.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks. That's interesting.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay. So, I'd like to move forward. Are there any objections to your Chair posting the range of rates on the resolution before you?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Great. So, that's what will be posted this afternoon. Okay, next.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, do you want to take a quick break?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh.

VICE-CHAIR KING: It's 10:30.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. We can do that. Okay, are there any objections to taking a ten...our morning recess?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No. No objections.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Alright. We'll take a ten-minute break, please be back in your seats by 10:42. It is 10:32 on April 9th, the Economic Development and Budget Committee is now in recess. . . . *(gavel)* . . .

RECESS: 10:32 a.m.
RECONVENE: 10:49 a.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . . *(gavel)* . . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please return to order. It is 10:49 on April 9th. Okay. Okay, we're going to get back to the agenda on EDB-1. We will begin with our deliberations on the compiled matrix of our priorities. Our compiled priorities matrix. Staff is distributing the copies of the matrix now. We will be reviewing the matrix starting with Council priority number one and I hope to, we'll try to get through as many as we can before we recess for lunch. I will be seeking consensus from the body for each item listed in the matrix. Consensus on any item does not mean that it cannot be reopened later if a Member requests to do so and the majority of the Members agree. If at any point there are more contentious items or items that involve greater discussion, I may mark it as a revisit and we can come back to it after we make it through the entire matrix to continue discussion on that item and work towards compromise and consensus. When we return from lunch, the Members will receive the concerns matrix, and we will review it in the same manner as we did the priorities matrix, and if we don't get through all the priorities we'll start, we'll complete the priorities first and then move on to the concerns.

PRIORITY MATRIX

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The matrix was organized first by any shared top priorities, then by Members' top priorities which were organized alphabetically by department. The entire matrix was organized with fairness to everyone in mind. Each Member was asked to provide five top priorities and five top concerns and I have made sure that this matrix reflects that allowance by adjusting the proposals that were transmitted yesterday accordingly. So, everyone has five.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, thank you. So, these are not by Councilmember. They're just grouped together, the priorities?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so if there are any common priorities, then they were moved, bumped up to the top, and then --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --everyone's top priorities are first in the matrix, and then everyone's second priority is next in the matrix.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. I get it. Okay, so just wanted to find out what the process is if we, you know, after attending our Budget Sessions if we want to either, you know, add or change out, you know, if we hear things that we didn't realize were top priorities for our communities. So, I think, there's six of us that still haven't heard from our communities.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so I'm hoping to complete deliberations on this by tomorrow, but I know that you submitted an amendment, and I believe that is what Staff is distributing at the moment including additional information, I'm guessing, to like supporting documents to provide Members additional information on their priorities. And so if Members would like to replace a priority in the matrix then we can discuss that, and it would just, it would be a one budget item priority for another. So, it would just replace one for one, and I understand that you have a top four.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, I actually just kind of left room because, you know, there are a lot of small things, and so I'm trying to figure out what are the top ones for the community and if they're grouped together, you know, how to list them but I wanted to give credence to the, you know, the community session and probably come up with additional one, my, you know, to fill my blank spaces.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So yeah, we'll see where we're at tomorrow, and if we can replace at that time.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Lee, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I think the last budget year, each Councilmember was allowed 100, 140,000 per district. Is that something that you're going to propose again?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so it's in the proposed budget under OED, 140,000 per district.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, a lot of the last-minute items could fall under that right?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If it's a --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --economic development or cultural program then it could fall under the 140,000 for the district.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, it looks like you passed out these are like, these are additional questions for the departments? Is that what this is? It says from Tamara Paltin, at the top page.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's questions based on their responses.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, the questions that you received from Member Paltin were the questions that she submitted during open session yesterday, and so they're being distributed in open session now.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, I see.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, I think last week, Chair, you had mentioned that we would get a list of all the questions that were sent to the departments because they probably have or there probably were duplicates, you know, from the nine Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I wondered what the status of that list is so we can double check with the answers.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, I'll check with Staff, and I'll have a response for you when we come back from lunch.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. Okay. Okay, Members, any other questions before we start deliberations on the matrix? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I was wondering if this would be the appropriate time to amend my priorities?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is it a one for one amendment, and it would replace the priority that's in the order in the same order that your submitted yesterday? Okay, do you see where your priority is in the matrix?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. Number 30 on this page instead of mini excavator and mini dump truck for West Maui, can I cross that out and put crack sealer hot pot for West Maui and crew cab utility pick-up for West Maui estimated at \$120,000 and that could either be Finance or Public Works. I'm not sure how it would be appropriated.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can she repeat that --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: --because I got crack seed and what else?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Crack sealer.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Crack sealer hot pot.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Alice loves her dried lemon, lemon peel, lemon peels, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And a crew cab utility pick-up for West Maui Public Works, Highways, and then number 25 on the preceding page...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry. Real quick, Member Paltin, would that change the total value in the left column?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes, it should.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: This 440,000, would that be changed?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Be approximate 120,000.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then on the preceding page item number 25, I think your Staff had said that we're not doing CIP at this time. Is that, should I have not put the CIP?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Whatever your priorities are.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I kind of wanted to do the same thing as Chair King because I haven't gone to my community yet. I know that the third Saturday monies are a high priority in my community, but I'm not sure what else I'll hear tomorrow night. So, can I make that one be like for community concerns, and put like a placeholder amount of like couple hundred thousand?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, Members, I recognize that we all have more than five priorities and five concerns, and we will be reviewing CIPs and the operating budget for all the departments and at that time we can add our provisos or, you know,

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

discuss our concerns, but this is just the top five and you know, we can discuss our number six, and seven, eight, you know, during the CIP review and during the department's budget, operating budget review.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, I'll just leave it as it is then.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Paltin. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: I think it's really helpful to discuss the top concerns, and then hopefully we all have like the same issues, but I'm wondering is there like a limit to the number of items per priority because some people have like this laundry list, one priority and I wasn't sure what your thought was on that of how we're approaching that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so Members have limited their items to one top five priorities. So, I know when we presented yesterday there --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Multiple.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --seemed to be multiple.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, like a total of, you know, six, seven, eight priorities, and that's been narrowed down to five in this matrix.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'm asking like per priority, like some of them have multiple items in as one priority item, but you just wanted one item in there as far as...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Are you talking about the like provisos?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, the, you know, when --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Like on number two?

VICE-CHAIR KING: --give our top five priorities that some of them had multiple cost items in one priority. So, I wasn't sure what you were looking at as far as the priority, if it was like one item number or if it was just like one, you know, all the things you wanted in Parks and Rec and all the things you wanted in Public Works. So, that would just be, you know, I'm just trying to get a clarification so I know that, you know, if we're doing that, then I might have multiple things in one category.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Chair King. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you, Madam Chair. Just following up on Chairman King's line of questioning. My understanding was, if we have a priority like

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

a very broad priority like affordable housing, then we could implement several components of that priority such as the need to increase the Affordable Housing Fund, the rental assistance fund, and studies. That could all be encompassed as one, part of one, major priority, and I believe you've allowed that flexibility which I can appreciate. And harkening back to yesterday when Chairman King brought up the issue of getting more input from our districts as we go through the hearings, I believe you're allowing us that flexibility because this is somewhat of a fluid process in terms of getting input from the community because I'm sure tonight in Kihei we may be made aware of some other concerns that are priority of that district and we have West Maui, Ms. Paltin's district and then my district on Thursday, so this is just, I guess, as I see it a starting point if I'm correct.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, then we'll address because we don't know how many more concerns that we may be apprised of along the way with the district hearing --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --so which I can appreciate, and I appreciate you keeping the process fluid and allow for some flexibility yeah as we address our concerns and getting accustomed to this process as well. So, anyway, just wanted to kind of make that, add those points into what Chairman King had stated. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I was looking over the matrix, and I realized that there was a word that was left out that I think is important to add in onto one of my priorities.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: If we could do that now?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Item number 31.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Thirty-one.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: And so, it says to swap outstanding real properties arrears and penalties owed by the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands and you need to insert between "lands" and the word "on" beneficiaries. Yeah. It's important, yes.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Before the word existing?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Right after the word “lands” and --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: --before the word “on.” So, it reads, it’s the Hawaiian Home Land beneficiaries.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, can I ask a clarification question?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I’m just going to check to make sure Member Kama, was that everything?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Would you also be adding beneficiaries in front of the “creation of the affordable,” is the housing subdivision that’s going to be created for beneficiaries as well?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: It’s not just for beneficiaries, but it’s for actually residents because if we’re leasing the land from Hawaiian Homes, you don’t have the blood quantum requirement that usually is when you’re issued a homestead lease. If it’s a general lease, then anyone can actually lease and anyone can live on the land.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, got it.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, any other clarification questions before we get started? Okay, seeing none. Okay. We’ll start with number one and this is from, this is in Department of Housing and Human Concerns under housing program affordable fund, \$20 million in, proposed \$20 million increase. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes, thank you, Chair. So, Members, as we have all had this urgency to create affordable housing in our districts, and as we have been looking for the low-hanging fruit and as we’ve had presentations before us that it seems like it’s

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

not real clear, at least to me, exactly what it is that we're going to be doing. We were looking at the UHMC dorms for a while. I'm not sure where that's at, at this point, but I don't want to have to wait for the Mayor to have to move and do things. I think we can probably do things on our own. So, one of the things I want, we're looking at was looking at some empty properties, some abandoned properties, looking at buildings that are empty and talking to people who are open to selling their buildings that we could probably renovate or reconstruct or turn them into housing opportunities that are low-hanging fruit. So, that is why I had put that proviso in there for Affordable Housing Fund.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Members, now I'll open the floor up for questions. Chair King, and then Member Paltin.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, it looks like it's increasing the percentage of the RPT that goes to affordable housing. Is that what we're doing here? Is that what the proposal is?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Or were you just directing 20 million of it to go towards these?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: The affordable housing. I wanted the, I wanted to have \$20 million from the Affordable Housing Fund proviso'd towards the purchase of a building --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: --or towards...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Do we even have 20 million in there?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Eleven I thought.

VICE-CHAIR KING: No. So, you got a proviso amount that's already in there.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: What we have in there?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Eleven, I thought someone said 11 today.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Do we have ten? Do we have 11?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I believe it's 21,948,814, but quite a bit actually --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: --is earmarked for the Mayor's projects, but this is not the end because we may be identifying other monies to make it possible for Ms. Kama to have her \$20 million.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Does the, does the 21, is that taking into account the money that's going in from this year into affordable housing from RPT?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I think Michele can answer that better me.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Is that 21 including what's the 2020 budget?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, yes. On Appendix A2, the Page 47, the Affordable Housing Fund, the estimated balance as of June 30th is about \$11.8 million. Of that, 3 million, a little over \$3 million is designated for West Maui. We anticipate \$10.115 million going in for Fiscal Year 2020 --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: --leaving an available balance for 2020 of \$21.9 million, but of that \$21.9 million we already have proposed provisos that are listed for certain projects like the Lanai affordable housing project or West Maui project, Ka Hale A Ke Ola and First-Time Homebuyer's Program.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, Chair, my, I just wanted to because it's one of my concerns is and we probably have this question already asked of Housing and Human Concerns, but was is their capacity to do these projects and is it going to benefit them to have these things proviso'd or to leave the money, you know, to leave the funds in there with some flexibility? So, my, you know, I think, we should put money into and more money into affordable housing, but my concern is we haven't seen the plan, and we've been told there's going to be a plan that's going to be presented at the end of this fiscal year. So, we don't know what their capacity is to spend this money and if they spend it this way or some other way until we see their plan. So, I would just maybe ask Member Kama, you know, if we can look at putting more money in their, you know, on the advice of the Director of Housing and Human Concerns, but maybe waiting and not putting in the proviso until we find out what it is, what's in their plan because their plan may involve buying more property or, you know, may involve doing some of this, but we need to leave it a little bit flexible so until we see what, how they intend to go forward with that, with their affordable housing, their great grand scheme of the plan. So, that was my main concern. I want to know that there's not money just sitting there, that they can actually use it and then we're not just, like increasing taxes so that we can put a pot of money aside, but if they can use it I think we, I would be in favor of putting whatever they can use in there. I just don't know what that number is.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. And we can get that question, I believe OCS, I think, we already asked that question, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: If there's not already, yeah. Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. I think...

VICE-CHAIR KING: It's kind of a broad question --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --but I think it's something that is really pertinent to the budget, so.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right, and as a Council we can also help to direct. Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. Yes, and I think we need to help direct because the new Director said she's open and actually, she doesn't really have a plan. The only plan they have is the 12 units at UH Maui College, and that's not much of a plan. So, what we have here between Councilmember Tasha Kama and myself we have broad language which encompasses when you say, acquire land, that could be buying land, building land, renovating properties, reconstructing. I have purchase existing buildings. So, there's a wide description and a very flexible description attached to the monies that we are asking for. So, I feel really comfortable. I really honestly, do not want to rely on the direction of the Department of Housing and Human Concerns. I think we have the expertise to lead the charge in this regard. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. And I'm sorry, I, so Member Kama and Member Lee's top priorities were the only common number one priority and so they were put together. And I'm so sorry, Member Lee, would you like to speak a little bit more to your number, this priority or your comments on...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I said it all.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Ms. Tasha might want to say something else. I don't know.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair? Can we just clarify are we asking, is Member Kama asking to put additional funding besides what the Mayor's already proposed? I think it's 2 percent, he proposed 3, are we looking at 4 percent and if that's the case, figure out what the extra percentage is, but if that's what we're looking at, we can certainly do that as...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: That...yes, thank you.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: That, yes, that was the intent, but also to ensure that we didn't let this budget pass without putting something on the side, and I wasn't sure, clear, what was reasonable and what wasn't, but I'm sure that with the Council here, that we can all help to decide what's right, what's reasonable, what's appropriate and what we can actually do. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: One last comment, Madam Chair. I just wanted to make it clear that these are preliminary figures and preliminary categories by the way. If we generate another 30, \$40 million, of course we can get it from the General Fund, or we could use bond funds or a variety of other categories. So even though we put down the Housing Fund, we don't mean only the Housing Fund. We could get those monies from other areas. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. So, I had a quick question, Member Kama. Was the 20 million estimate using the Mayor's proposed 3 percent because we also heard from Member Molina a proposal for 4 percent? So, would you be able to share, you know, what percentage you were thinking of with this 20 million proposal?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I had spoken earlier a couple of weeks or months ago that I wanted to increase the Affordable Housing Fund by 100 percent. I wanted to increase the housing budget by 100 percent, and I wasn't sure what that was, and that was my intent. So, when the Mayor said 3 percent, and then yesterday I heard Member Molina talk about, you know, his increase, and then I thought then I did make the right choice to be able to put that proviso out there. So, thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Member Paltin, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sorry, a clarification question. So, if there's, if I understand correctly, there's 21.9 million available in the Affordable Housing Fund, and we want to put 20 million specifically towards acquiring existing buildings and renovating, and reconstructing affordable housing, or renovating and reconstructing the existing buildings for affordable housing, that leaves about 1.9 mil available for other things. Are we specifying if these renovated or reconstructed existing buildings will be available for rent or for sale or does it matter?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And also add on to that, are we targeting any specific AMI percentage?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: It isn't specifically one or the other. It's whatever we can get, whatever housing, whether it's rental or whether it's home ownership, and the AMI that I want to be able to serve is those 80 percent and below.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Would it...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'll also add to that that the Affordable Housing Fund does have a condition that the housing would have to be affordable in perpetuity. So, whatever project uses the funds would have to be affordable in perpetuity.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Would it then be acceptable to add on that we're targeting 80 percent and below AMI if that was the intent?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I don't see a problem with that unless others do.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I like it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Members, questions, concerns? I'm sorry, Member Sugimura. Member Sugimura, and then Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, based upon the Charter 9-20 Affordable Housing Fund, 2 percent and I'm guessing that the proposal that the Mayor submitted to us with the estimated balance as of 6/30/19 an anticipated revenues for Fiscal Year 2020, his anticipated revenues for 2020 is that his 3 percent or he anticipated the 3 percent?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, yes. The \$10.1 million is the 3 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Three percent. So, if we were to take into consideration Member Molina's recommendation, what would the amount then change to or do we have to wait for Mr. Teruya?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Yoshimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And we don't have the certified rolls yet.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

MS. YOSHIMURA: I believe it's about \$3.3 million --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: More.

MS. YOSHIMURA: --more, but you need to wait till we get the certified real property tax to know the exact amount.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Right. Right. Right. Okay. Thank you. Answers my question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. Regarding priority one, yeah I would say right now my concern is the actual for various ranges, especially when the realtors regarding what has actually grown. So, I'm not too sure that we're going to hit some of the proposed projections on valuation increases for the upcoming year. Regarding the amount, again, I'm very open to it. I understand what the Members are saying, Chair, but again, you know, I still worry about what we got to pay for contracts and associated costs relating to the contracts that are on the table, especially those that may go to arbitration. I would say my only reservation with the proviso is two things. One, I wish we would just call it what it is, subsidized housing fund, okay. That's what we're doing. We're subsidizing housing. It's not making it affordable, we're just subsidizing the differences, and I would like us to at least, or I would like to be able to explain to Lanai what it means to have a County housing project, if we're not going to do it okay. We already own the land, we already have infrastructure of abutting the property. We have the water company saying we have sufficient supply, but we haven't moved. So, is the County's own housing project going to be put on the side for non-County projects? Because I think our project has been working with the community through our third-party consultants that we have already preliminary construction plans. I would like us to look to use the money for projects that can get into construction. I don't need to wait four years for a project. Four years means all of you need to run two more elections before you see a house built. I'm not willing to wait that long with cash. So, if you're talking about borrowing, well that's something else. If it's ready, the Mayor can present a proposal and get the funding through a bond float so it wouldn't impact the cash, but you know, to say we're going to acquire an appraisal and everything that we do is at least one year, then to renovate and get plans and then move to construction, 18, 24 months, 3 years. It's already going through one election, Members. I'm not willing to wait that long, Chair. So, I would hope we would look at making some policy decisions whether or not we're going to support County-owned projects. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Members, any other discussion on this item? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just for clarification so that I know what we're talking about, when you say County-owned projects, you mean the County is the construction manager, or like what does County owned construction projects mean?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair? Thank you, my friend, for asking that question. County project, when I say County-owned project, the County owns the land, okay, as a part of a condition of zoning. So the County had, I believe, 108 acres, 108 acres, okay. We agree to give, transfer to the Department of Education 42 acres of that to build a K to or was it preschool to a, I guess, a two-year university type of facility on Lanai which would be a comprehensive educational component. The balance of the lands of 70-something acres has been proposed as a multiple phase housing project which the County owns and then we have solicited consultants, we ran it through the Land Use Commission, Council gave a 201H approval, Land Use Commission granted us their support to move this project forward. So, when I say County owned, we've gone through the stages and I will say the County worked hard. They came to the island multiple times getting a lot of community input from those that have homes, those that want homes, how it fits in to the existing community, what it would add to build these additional subdivisions which was adjacent to Hawaiian Homes and the school and our County park. And so again, when I say County owned, I believe, this is one project that can get into construction within 18 months. That's with all the work we've already done and the money that we've already invested, okay. We don't have to acquire land. We don't have to get easements. This is our property, okay. Seventy-eight-plus acres of land designated for housing and so I just need to know are we going to be serious because I understand my colleague from East Maui and his need, okay. I understand it. They're the second most subsidized district in this County. I get it. So, I don't have a problem assisting Mr. Sinenci to get some housing built, but I'm talking about projects that I think are far along the process line that we can get to construction because I'm tired of waiting. Thank you, Ms. Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you mean project, prioritizing projects that the County already owns and is ready to --

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Process.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --start on over projects where we need to kind of start from scratch a little bit you mean? Like we don't own the land, we want to try and go get an appraisal, we want to try do an EIS and do all these other things?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: That was all submitted already to the Land Use Commission for approval, we got our updated studies at the time Council gave the 201H approval of what was at one time agriculture cultivated pineapple lands. So again, my thing is as policymakers, we need to make a decision. Where does County projects stand versus non-County projects. I would hope we would support our own projects since it's our projects.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I understand it better now.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, listening to this conversation, so the entire 21 million in the Affordable Housing Fund is now being discussed and to set it aside for what has been proviso'd here, but I think the discussion is talking about that we already have that was proposed and sent to us from the Mayor provided that 2 million shall be for planning, design, and engineering for the Lanai affordable housing project. That's what Mr. Hokama is advocating for, to please keep that in as well as there's 2 million First-Time Homebuyer's Program. So that, I guess, we have to make a discussion, decision whether we will then delete it in order to meet this proviso. So the entire 21,000 goes to what has been stated with Member Kama and Member...21, I'm sorry, 21 million.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I believe it's 20 million. Member Kama proposed 20 million.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, 20 million okay. And then I think that Member Lee has the entire 21 million. So, I think, what I'm hearing the discussion is what the Mayor proposed in his budget. Are we going to keep it or delete it? That was Mr. Hokama's question which was his for the Lanai affordable housing, and I think 70 million shall be for administrative, I'm sorry 70,000 shall be for administrative expenses so that probably has to stay untouched based upon the budgets from the operating budgets. But a discussion on all the other things that are listed here, we probably should discuss if we're going to keep it in or delete it based upon the recommendations from the two Members. I think that's what, this discussion has to go yeah?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, for the sake of moving on --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: --okay, I want to amend my, where I'm getting the money from and put Department and program where it says Affordable Housing Fund, I want to add the words "and anywhere else in the budget" because that's how it's going to be. You know, we shouldn't be getting stuck in the weeds here. We need to be focusing on priorities. How we pay for it is a different issue because we don't even know how much money we have yet. We, chances are we're going to have a lot more than \$21 million. So, rather than, you know, pick this thing to death, let's concentrate on focusing on the priorities and what we can reach consensus on. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Agreed. Chair King?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. So, I noticed that item number three from Mr. Molina is relative to that, this discussion as well and he has proposed to add to increase the Affordable Housing Fund to 4 percent of real property tax so if that's what we're looking at for items, the first couple of items as well, you know, if we can get consensus around that and maybe agree to have some flexibility and not necessarily proviso all that for because, you know, we need to see where the low-hanging fruit is --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --and if you have a project, like Lanai, that's ready to go then, you know, we go there first, but we should have that flexibility.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: We should just, we know if affordable housing is priority, we might want to increase that so I would be willing to like come to consensus on that item and then kind of move on without trying to write the whole affordable housing program at this point. When we get to the departments, we can look through the Housing and Human Concerns provisos and see if we approve of all those. I mean last year there was like a \$9 million proviso when it had all these things in it. None of them were shovel ready. They were just like, kind of a wish list of things. So, we took that out because they weren't really ready to do any of those things, but you know, if we're really serious about it and we can put this money in, then we can move forward with the ones that are ready to go instead of thinking in the future what we might want to spend it on. So, I agree with Member Hokama that you know, look at what the County has done first and where we're at with our County projects, and how many people we can house with that money, and then go from there.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, I think Member Lee's proposed amendment helps to address that issue by adding "from Affordable Housing Fund and anywhere in the budget." I think, like basically this is asking us what is our commitment level or do we want to commit \$20 million from our budget for the low-hanging fruit of acquiring existing buildings, a list of which we should be receiving for rental and ownership for affordable housing at 80 percent AMI or less.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'm not...well just to kind of close out. I'm not sure, I'll ask Member Lee, I think our reference was that, if we identify projects, we don't have to just fund them out of the Affordable Housing Fund. I think that's what she was talking about.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: We don't have to, like we're not looking at right now taking monies from somewhere else and putting them into affordable housing.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

VICE-CHAIR KING: She's just saying we can look at bond funding, we can look at --

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --other funds.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So we don't have to write that part of the program, but if there's a proposal and we can all agree to go to 4 percent of RPT into the Affordable Housing Fund, then that might be something we can all come to consensus on is what I'm saying. Then we can --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, we're going to push for...we'll see if the Members are interested in, you know, agreeing to if there's consensus on this and then we can move to the next ones. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah thank you, Madam Chair, and I thank Chairman King for that suggestion and obviously I too have consensus and just looking at the simple math that I appreciate Member Lee providing the specific balance and if the current projections hold true with a 4 percent on the proviso for the real property tax we could potentially have roughly 35 million. And then if we proviso the 20 million as Member Kama had stated which I think is basically just a broad concept at this point. And trying to recall when we initiated the Affordable Housing Fund years ago, one of the, I guess, it was pretty open ended as to how these monies could be used to help offset some of the costs for developers with infrastructure concerns and I believe also the possible purchase of lands, and you know, existing infrastructure, renovation, and so forth. So, it is pretty, it was pretty wide open as far as the uses of this. So, this is something I think we can all get around on, and yeah, the direction I think should be sent by the Council and, you know, newly confirmed Director Tsuhako said, she is a blank slate at this point. So, I think by collaborating with Administration and the guidance of some of the kupuna of the Council here as well as the new Members could yeah, I'm one of those, but, you know, and Member Lee's experience as the former Housing Director, I think, we could really, we're on to something good here. We're on a good path. So, I'm in total support of all of these proposals that's before us here today. So, just my statements on that. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: One last question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura and then Member Paltin, and if we can, if there's a way we can try to move to consensus on this because it sounds like that's the, everyone's in agreement that this concept is good and also supporting, you know, our Lanai project in moving forward, I think it's, you know, we all think it's, you know, waited long enough. So, I think it was Member Paltin --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --and then, or Member Sugimura and then Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, to increase the Affordable Housing Fund to anything greater than what is already in the Charter we need to do a Charter amendment. Is that correct? No?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. If you're going to make a Charter amendment for the percentage you'd have to amend the Charter if you want to change the Charter, but you guys can put...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It can be higher, right, but it just can't be lower than 2 percent?

MR. UEOKA: Correct, and...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Or no more than, is what it says in the Charter. On an annual basis no more than 3 percent of this fund...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's for administration.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry. Administrative. Okay. I'm mistaken. That was administrative.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. And just a general reminder if you do put the money into the Affordable Housing Fund, there are the restrictions and requirements of the Affordable Housing Fund as opposed to if you are taking money that's not in the Affordable Housing Fund you can just make it into a project and scope the project proviso wise rather than be stuck with the limitations of the Affordable Housing Fund which if you look at it closely it's, the code section it's confusing a little bit. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Ueoka. Member Sugimura, pau? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin? Oh, oh, did you have...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I'll yield to my colleague from West Maui.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Member Paltin --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --and then Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, my question was when you said that the Affordable Housing Fund monies projects needs to be affordable in perpetuity, how do we ensure that like number three in the budget bill Page 48 says provided that 2 million shall be for First-Time Homebuyer's Program so whoever uses any part of that 2 million to buy a home, that home has to be affordable in perpetuity?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For the homebuyers, can we stick to this for now and then we'll talk story about that after? The proposal is to acquire existing buildings and renovate reconstruction for affordable housing and rentals. So, we'll just go talk about this priority first.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, how do we ensure it though? How do we ensure that it's affordable in perpetuity?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I believe through deed restriction. Mr. Ueoka, is there anything that you'd like to add to that?

MR. UEOKA: Yeah, Chair. Deed restrictions would work. You got to be a little more specific than affordable in perpetuity and as to what the definition of affordable would be. The deed restriction would probably spell that out. Just cautionary though with affordable and perpetuity, there will at some point, need a infusion of capital to keep the units and if they're for-sale units...there's a lot of things to think about. It's doable, don't get me wrong.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like adjustment and inflation kind of things?

MR. UEOKA: I don't necessarily mean adjustment and inflation, I'm talking more a house gets old and assuming there needs to be capital in it for someone to, for it to be worthwhile for them to rehabilitate it and maintain it. So, just things for you guys to think about. There are many ways that it can be achieved, but just cautionary with how you proceed. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Ueoka. And then for your reference, Member Paltin, you can look to Code 2.96.060. I can hand it to you after. Member Molina and then Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you, Madam Chair. I just wanted to follow up too on my earlier turn on this 4 percent increase and yeah I wanted to also add I'm in agreement with Member Hokama. Let's provide the funds for the things that we can build now and not wait four years because it's high time we get something tangible out there. People want to see it, they're tired of the studies and so forth. The, we could by doing that set aside by increasing it to 4 percent. That can be made up with adjustments in real property tax classifications, increases in certain classifications such as the Hotel classification. Now, many of their employees need housing and I'm

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

not aware of any of the hotels building housing for the employees so this is one way we can provide assistance in that area. So, the very industry that has a lot of workers that need housing, well, we can, you know, make adjustments to their tax classification and will help towards that need to provide housing for their employees. 'Cause every hotel, or every business, you want stability with your employees. You want them to...so to prevent any turnover in employees. So, that's, you know, one way we can help augment and address this problem as far as work force housing employee needs. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Members, are we ready to reach consensus? Oh, I'm so sorry, Mr. Hokama. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, again, thank you. Just a real quick historic for people like Ms. Lee and I. This County was pretty advanced, okay. There was at one time in the County Code under hotel related requirements that there was a formula, one house for every four rooms of accommodations. Okay, so this County had the foresight to require employers assess a fair, I guess, impact fee or assessment to assist in the housing inventory. One for four, okay. To my dismay it has been deleted from our Code by Council and now this is part of the issue that we deal with today. I will say I am going to be upfront. I have no problem, I will support the 20 million and I will prefer that it remain wide open on how we fund it, and not narrow the ABF through the affordable fund, and I will say I prefer no provisos and that is what I will give consensus only to. Anything else I'm going to object. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama, Member Lee, is that an amendment that you would be open to before we ask for consensus?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Personally...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Wait, I can't forget. I think Ms. Lee brought up a good point because I have no problem with the rental component either. I think rental is part of the housing formula currently so whether it's for rental or for sale, I'm in complete support of all options for housing. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama...Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair, I think we need to be somewhat flexible because we may run into a situation where Ms. Kama finds a really good deal and it's an existing building, but there are two tenants in there, and let's say those tenants we have to honor those leases, and maybe they're not going to, maybe they're paying above 80 percent of median income. So, you never know what kinds of situations you may run into, and you don't want to tie your hands with regard to opportunities out there. The only problem...and that's why I added my technical language of "and anywhere else in the budget" because we may want to use monies from other parts of the budget, other revenues, so that we are not held to in perpetuity or 80 percent and less of median income or any other of the restrictions that are tied to the Affordable Housing Fund that I don't know of at the moment. So, I think we need to be flexible

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

and, you know, keep in mind that housing purchases or development, et cetera should, those monies should come from other sources besides only the Affordable Housing Fund. We may want to use bond funds, we may want to use other types of funds. So I agree with Mr. Hokama on this point and I hope my colleague Ms. Kama does too. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair? Oh I'm sorry. I just...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama, and then Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Members, and thank you, Mr. Hokama. If anything, I want Mr. Hokama to get his housing before he leaves these Chambers. Or whatever, but certainly I can be flexible. Certainly I thank the Council for helping and leading and guiding in the discussion so that we can all come to consensus, so I concur. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you for that, Member Kama. So, my question is, are we, is this proposal to add \$20 million on top of the 3 percent or are we looking at just increasing to 4 percent? So, what's the, what are we coming to consensus on as far as additional monies? Is it getting to 4 percent of RPT or is it, and if it's putting 20 million in, is that on top of the 3 percent that the Mayor already proposed? So, do we know what we're...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: My sense is that if the 4 percent and the RPT would bring us 35 mil it would just be that and not an additional...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so we're coming to consensus on increasing the affordable --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: The...

VICE-CHAIR KING: --housing to 4 percent of our RPT.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. That makes it concise and I think that takes care of Member Molina's concern as well.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I was trying to take it in order to be fair, but if the body prefers to take up number three and come to consensus on that without discussion then we can do that at this time. Otherwise, I would like to stick with number one and take it in order. Would the body like to come to consensus on

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

Mr. Molina's proposal to increase Affordable Housing Fund to 4 percent of real property tax which would bring the total to \$3,371,925?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No, that's not right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If we're not going to discuss it. If not, we're going to wait until we get to that item.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Our counsel is frowning, so what's on your mind?

VICE-CHAIR KING: The dollar amount is wrong.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, the dollar amount? Oh, okay. Mr. Ueoka? Oh, no?

MR. UEOKA: Yeah, try, can you guys double check your numbers on the added percentage and how much it'll be and how you guys want to, well I guess we can...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Well, I mean, with the certification and everything, the idea is to increase it to 4 percent. So, if this body would like to come to consensus on that without discussion then we can do that at this time, otherwise we'll stick to discussing priority one. Is that something this body would like?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus on number three for me.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, you know, part of the, of course I agree with Ms. Lee that we shouldn't get stuck in the weeds, but the devil is always in the details. Okay, and the devil is there. So my thing to the Committee with my experience would be, can we just agree at this point in time that it be 4 percent of the certified revenues upon the Director's presentation, and that we will get a specific amount because it'll be a certified number? So let's just say 4 percent of the General Fund as certified by the Department of Finance.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, it would be increase the Affordable Housing Fund appropriation to 4 percent of the real, the certified real property tax?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Correct. Revenues.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do we consensus on that?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Yes.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Beautiful.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so...okay. So, we'll go back to item one, and let's try to reach consensus on this before lunch. Is there consensus on this item? Member Lee, would you mind repeating what it is that the Members are coming to consensus on?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair, we are asking for consensus that on the priorities that housing be the top priority and that we have monies that would come from various sources including the Affordable Housing Fund and possibly other funds.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so the body is coming to consensus on prioritizing \$20 million to acquire existing buildings and renovate or reconstruct for affordable housing ownership or rental. Is 80 percent or below something that Member Lee or Member Kama intending to include?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair, I don't think we're ready to proviso this money just in case we use other funds and we can deal with that later I believe.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. So, we are coming to consensus on prioritizing \$20 million for affordable housing. Do we have consensus?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For me, I would like to see 80 percent or below because, just because for my opinion, I've been to a lot of presentations of developers on affordable projects, and a lot of them, feedback from the community is that their affordable, 100 percent affordable project isn't affordable because it targets the 80 to 140 percent AMI and I think that if we do not target the 80 percent and below, it's not going to happen and that's what my community feels is truly affordable or accessible. The 80 to 140 percent projects are out there, like I went to like three, we went to the Waikapu Community Association where there's a lot of those things coming down the pipe, but I haven't been to one where the AMI is below 80 percent and if we're talking about affordable, to me that's truly affordable and if we're going to create affordable housing it might as well be truly affordable is how I feel.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, I appreciate that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And yes, that was a great Waikapu Community Association meeting and nice to see a lot of housing projects come up, but I would hate to see us get stuck or not be able to take advantage of, you know, a developer's proposal if we narrow it at this point and not leave ourselves with some wiggle room to do more if need be. So, that's all I have to say. I think there's projects out there and we can

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

support it and I think we can be flexible if we don't, you know, narrow it too much at this point. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you, Madam Chair. We don't...with respect to the concerns from my colleague from West Maui which I can appreciate, I think, just for now at this point, I'd like to leave it open ended, broad and not target any specific income category at this point for now to look at other options, maybe get an update from the Housing and Human Concerns, where we're at with some of these projects that have been already approved. And if we can use some of these funds for, to help augment getting these projects expedited and built, and hopefully it won't take 30-something years like Mr. Hokama's project in Lanai. Let's go, you know, to me let's go in that direction, and see where the income category needs are the most because I mean, at all levels we can all agree upon there's a need for housing. So, to lock us in at this point, I'm not ready to support locking us in for now, but again, we can consider that matter at a later point during the deliberation. So, for now, just kind of leave it open ended. That's where I'm coming from. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Kama for the last time.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Last time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. With all due respect to all my Councilmembers, a lot of the presentations that we have been receiving prior to us coming here today actually showed us that the highest need for housing is that 80 percent and below and that is why we decided to target 80 percent and below because the need was out there. Many presenters told us that. A lot of the stats told us that, and so it's not to say that we're not going to support anyone else that comes down the pipe with 100, 120, 140, but I want to be really focused because if we're not focused we're going to find ourselves back in these seats for the next 10 and 20 years. So, I just want to be focused and take care of the real need it's 80 percent and below. So, out of respect for my colleagues to consider that. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay this my last time, I promise.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair King for the last time.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I do want to say, if we're not focused we won't find ourselves in these seats after these two years. So, anyway, I totally agree and I was talking to our housing specialist in our Housing and Human Concerns, who agreed. I think the number that's floating out there right now is 9,500 units by 2025 that are 80 percent

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

and below, and you know, she made the point that the above 80 percent will take care of itself. In fact, we have enough in, probably in the pipeline right now to know that we're going to meet that, and so we do have to focus on the 80 percent and below. So, I would support that. I don't know that we have to lock that in right now. We can talk about it later, but I certainly think that after talking to Ms. Tsuhako, that she's focused on that too. I hope that's where she's going with and she, you know, she said she was going to put together a plan, but it makes sense that to focus our energies on that part of the demographic and the rest will take care of itself. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Lee for the last time.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, if you insist. I don't really believe the above 80 percent will take care of itself. It hasn't up until now. We haven't had a run on 100 percent, 90 percent, 85 percent. We have not, we don't have homes at that level. So, to try and tie our hands at this point without even knowing what we can do, what we can acquire is really like throwing darts in the dark. So, I need to go over the restrictions on the Affordable Housing Fund usage. I need to do that. If that's 80 percent and below, yeah 80 percent and below?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. Three point three five oh five oh, terms affordability which is the Code section for the Affordable Housing Fund, ownership housing units financed made affordable fund shall be subject to the restrictions of subsection 2.96.060B rental housing units 2.96.070 so it's basically follow 2.96.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, 2.96 follows a range. Where did the 80 percent and below come from?

MR. UEOKA: You guys.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, somebody said it over here?

MR. UEOKA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah, I did.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, you said it over there? Okay. No, no, no, but we're talking about, I don't think you were, Ms. Kama, talking about...you're talking about what you wanted to see, what I'm talking about what is in a law.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, and I don't think you made a comment on that. Somebody said something about if you want to use the Affordable Housing Fund, there you are subject to certain restrictions, but if the restriction is 2.96 there's nothing in there about 80 percent and below as a requirement. So, in other words, Ms. Kama, and

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

everybody else who wants to go with 80 percent and below, does the law says, the law says 2.96 and so that means, we can use that money for a variety of income families. Isn't that correct, Corporation Counsel?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, we typically would. When I say we, I work with the Department of Housing and Human Concerns. Yeah, typically we follow 2.96 with the application of the Affordable Housing Fund. However, if you guys, there's creative ways you can do other things. You guys have that ability in your budget making process.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Creative, what you mean, circumvent the law?

MR. UEOKA: Well, I never would advise you to circumvent the law. However, as mentioned earlier by Mr. Hokama, if you were to put the money, not in the Affordable Housing Fund, and appropriate it for a specific project that has certain requirements, the money wouldn't be in the Affordable Housing Fund therefore not subject to the restrictions and you can make your own restrictions through proviso. Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, but I wanted to make it crystal clear to everybody on this panel, that you, they cannot put a proviso on this money to be used for only housing units for those earning 80 percent and below median income because that would be in contradiction to Chapter 2.96 which allows 0 to 140 percent of median income.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Chair, I think if you guys have a solid proposal of what you guys want to do I can work with Staff on a way to accomplish your goal. Let us know what your goal is and we can try and help you get there. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Ueoka.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I would have a real problem because it's really clear in Chapter 2.96. You can't be throwing numbers around. It's in the law, in the Code. So, again, I would advocate for flexibility. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Member Paltin, for the last time.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. You know, one of the themes of this last election cycle was truly affordable housing and we have the law that says what HUD guidelines call affordable and it's not affordable to my community. Eighty percent and below AMI is the working poor, the folks that are one paycheck away from homelessness that we've heard it's much more economical to prevent families from becoming homeless than trying to deal with the fact after, deal with it after the fact, and, you know, all the presentations that I've gone to on affordable housing they're

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

targeting 80 to 140 percent because it pencils out for them. They can make it pencil out because that's why they're proposing all these projects. If we don't focus on the low end, nobody will because it doesn't pencil out for the developers. So, they're doing it, there's examples of it being done, but there's no examples of affordable housing developers focusing on the 80 percent and below and if we want to provide truly affordable housing, that's the only way to do it and that's the only way I'll support it 80 percent and below.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. I let you have your last time. Okay, Members, it seems like we might not be able to reach a consensus on this. I'm thinking perhaps we just, we move it to the end of our matrix and we take up number two when we get back from lunch. But I gave you your last time too.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I know, but don't you want to hear a proposal on how to reach consensus? We can reach consensus yeah by allocating monies outside of the Affordable Housing Fund that target 80 percent and below. That is how to do it. That way we're not breaking the law. That's all I'm saying.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, Member Kama, is that what you were going to say?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No, that wasn't what I was going to say, but I can see where we may not resolve this conversation at this time, but maybe we should continue it at a later time, but I'm ready to move on to number two because we're still in love with each other.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. We're still on number one. Okay, so I'm going to move that to the end of the matrix and hopefully we can figure out how to come to consensus on that after we get through the matrix of priorities. So would Members like to start on priority two or break for lunch?

UNKNOWN SPEAKER: Break for lunch.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Break for lunch, okay. Mr. Ueoka, you had something? Oh okay. Members, when we get back from lunch we'll start with number priority two, and I'm going to set a two-time limit for everyone so that we can get through our matrix as much as possible, and you know, try to, you know, try to keep our meetings, you know, finish, we can complete our meetings before 5:00, otherwise we might have to go past 5:00 in future meetings. So let --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. I mean, not tonight but in future meetings if we don't complete our business each day that we allocated time for. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just for clarification, Chair. We have some, you have designated some people as resources, can we give them a time?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think your item is number ten. It's your item regarding the \$5 million request for Habitat for Humanity is number ten on the list. It really depends on the body and how much discussion --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --we have on each item before that. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Members, any other comments before we go to recess? Okay. Alright it is 12:04 on April 9th, the Economic Development and Budget Committee will now break for lunch. We are on recess. Please return to your seats by 1:30. Thank you. . . . *(gavel)* . . .

RECESS: 12:04 p.m.
RECONVENE: 1:38 p.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . . *(gavel)* . . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please return to order. It is 1:37 or 1:38 on April 9th. Okay, we're going to get back to EDB-1. Going through the priorities matrix. Okay, so in spirit of efficiency and time management I would like to explain the process of consensus that we'll be following moving forward. For each matrix item, the proposing Member will introduce their item and rational for it. Each Member will have up to two times to speak. I will hold strong to that rule so we can remain on schedule. Any item that does not receive consensus by the end of two rounds will be marked as a revisit. A clean copy of the Council's budget proposal will be eventually, will eventually be transmitted to the full Council for final decisions. At that point in time, proposed amendments to the clean copy will be allowed and then voted on and majority will rule. We will have some time to make up today so I would like everyone to make a conscious effort to be concise and to remember that in the end the issues we may not all see eye to eye on will be taken to a final vote and that is when the final determination will be made. This process is meant to get us as close to being on the same page on various issues as possible. So, when it comes time to vote, we can feel like there was an effort made towards comprise and everyone was heard. It can be difficult to reach consensus on every issue to agree completely, but at least we'll have a better idea what those issues are before it comes time to vote at the end of this month. Please also focus less on how we will fund these items and instead focus more on whether you support funding these items. We can work out the how after we know if we want to. I would like to try and get through the priorities matrix today so we can start with the concerns matrix tomorrow. So with that, Member Paltin, are you ready or you have a question first?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is the proposal one thing and then you have two times to talk after it or is the proposal considered one of your talking times?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The proposal...you can have two times after.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, I'm ready.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I just have a question. Did we ever reach consensus on the affordable housing?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, we put it to the end of the matrix.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. I forgot.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And if we still cannot then we can mark it for a revisit till decisions week.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any other questions before I give the floor...Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, just a quick in with the hope of trying to expedite things. If one person on the floor does not agree with the consensus, then will it just be looked at like a revisit? Okay. So, even if it's just one person that makes a, not in agreement with the majority? Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Alright. Yeah. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Almost consensus if you will. Alright. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Any other questions? Okay, Member Paltin, are you ready?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm ready.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Alright. Take it away.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, my priority item is estimated 2.5 million addition to the Fire and Public Safety, Ocean Safety budget. The priority is to right size Ocean Safety to kind of, you know, finish off the process of the Charter amendment move from Parks and Recreation to Fire and Public Safety, you know, because if you look at the mission of Parks and Recreation and the mission of Fire and Public Safety, it's two completely different goals, objectives, and missions. So, my priority is to right size Ocean Safety and this proviso-type thing is how I propose to distribute the approximate 2.5 million in funds, and so, you know, one of the goals in the Mayor's narrative Page 267 goal 1.4 is to decrease the percentage of towers staffed below an optimal level and for me, I'm really passionate about ocean safety. I spent like, you know, 20 years of my career over there. I had to resign to take this position and so there's no conflict of interest was why I had to resign. And so, I know, from my approximately 20 years of service where the deficiencies are and I have a vision for us to move forward in the Ocean Safety program. You know, nearly every year we request about eight expansion positions and it nearly every year we get nothing and the times in the past 18 years or so that we've had expansion positions, it's for specific purposes like to open Hookipa or, you know, to provide 911 service outside of the beach park that we're working in and so we've always been short. And you know, I don't know if anywhere there is written what the minimum staffing for a lifeguard tower is, but the way that I see it is one of the main functions that we're trained to do as ocean safety, or they're trained to do as ocean safety officers is provide CPR and when you're trained to provide CPR you can't provide CPR by yourself. I mean to do it effectively you need three people so then you factor in, like lunch breaks and training breaks and so you need like three to four people on a tower. The other thing that's changed over the years, you know, when I started, we had jet skis that weighed like 250 pounds. Now, they are like, you know, double plus that so the things that we were able to do back in say 2000 and the things that we're able to do in 2018 has grown and, you know, the demands the tourists and everything has grown whereas we're being constantly asked to do more things, respond on 911, leave our beaches, do junior lifeguards, do training, doing public outreach. And as first responders, as community members, we want to do that, but we've never been given the resources. So, my proposal is to provide ten expansion positions of OSO II, five full time, ten half-time positions. For me, the half-time is really important because it will limit the amount of overtime because you can then pull folks who are working like say 20 hours a week if there's a shortage, injury, or sick calls, or vacation and you're not going to utilize the overtime. The other thing it does is it kind of creates a succession. I think there's two vacant positions, myself and one of my coworkers that passed away in December and instead of having to just train someone from scratch, you're going to have ten half-time positions that have been kind of vetted through the process that you can choose your best person to then fulfill the full-time position. I increased a training lieutenant because, you know, the training lieutenant does, or the lieutenant, or the training captain does so much things, run the junior lifeguard program, maintain equipment, train all the guys on the renewal of the various certifications that it's really too much for one person to do. Even to just train the 15 additional positions for one person to do that in addition to all the existing jobs is too much. I increase the secretary because there's one secretary now that assists with all the time sheets and, you know, that's a big undertaking. Training captain and the North Shore captain trucks are not

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

in like in emergency response condition and the last three vehicles we had were a Chevy Silverado so I just put it to in continuation of the fleet. And then you know, the last items is really to complete the integration of Ocean Safety into the Fire Department because, you know, that's we're now part of the Fire Department that's what the uniformed officers get. Are we not uniformed officers of the Fire Department? And you know, in the back of my mind I think about coworkers of mine on the west side, I know of three coworkers that have had heart attacks and two of them are no longer with us and I wonder to myself if possibly having those annual exams would have prevented deaths or, you know, if you have somebody that's coming to rescue you in the ocean, you want to make sure that they're able to pass that kind of medical exams. So, that's kind of a thing, and I know it's a lot of money and so I also said, you know, you can't just give the money, you need strategic planning to address succession, training, needed growth, you know, if we do have the capacity to put folks at Puu Kekaa during you know, high tourist times as a mobile unit or go do checks, document sea level rise, coastal erosion, climate change and be more of the education component of managing our tourists in the ocean environment. Like anything, I'm open to discussion, but that's where my starting point is and if there's any questions, I'm also open to answering any questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair, I move I move to consensus at this point and we can kind of discuss at a later time the specific amount and allocations for the positions and maybe possibly look at adjustments on the amount of positions, expansion positions or would...we may want to consider or essential personnel, but for the sake of expediency, I'm willing to support moving it along and then we can work out the finite details at a later point during the deliberative process. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Molina. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I concur with Councilmember Molina.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: There's always one of me. So, I have issues that I cannot give consensus on. One I think we should have some comment by Personnel Department regarding some of these I believe would be more appropriate through the collective bargaining agreement that's currently on the table with all the other employers. I would like some comment because I guess all of us receive from a department regarding the Workday implementation. I want to know what is the benefits and how does this assists us with dealing with the amount of position expansions that we shouldn't need if we implement our personnel program appropriately, and third, I cannot believe our current Chief has no plans regarding all his operations and programs and so I would really like to know what is the Chief's thoughts especially, if he has a plan to address my colleague from West Maui's concern already because I agree this is a lot of money. There's a lot of details in her proviso, which I appreciate

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

to explain her position, but those are the three areas of my concern, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, I think I would, I concur with some of the other Members. I would like to see a breakdown of the individual salaries for each of the positions, if can be made available I'd appreciate that. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, in all my time with 11 budgets, as much as Members feel certain departments need more personnel and improvements in programs, it's rare that the Mayor would accept it because he normally defers to the Chief of or the Director of that particular department, but who knows. This might be a different time. So, I have really no objections. I just have some doubt that this could possibly fly, yeah. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I have, I just have similar concerns about adding that many positions on and would like to hear from the supervisors who would be utilizing these positions. I'd like to see what vacancies they've been, you know, they've been, in housing, and if there's a way we could phase in, you know, this many people. that's a lot. And also I was wondering if any of these areas where we're addressing succession training and possibly trying to put new, I don't know if it's lifeguard stations, any of these like State parks that where we might have, we can go to the State and you know, the State provides lifeguards at Makena, but then of course the bigger issue is we need them to provide tort liability too. So, that which, now you can work on because your one HSAC, but you know, I just, you know, those would be my questions about some of those areas, and I'm not sure which ones are State or which ones aren't, but I do think with this many personnel being proposed we do need to hear from the Chief and how he would utilize these people and if he can incorporate that many positions in one year. That sounds like a lot, but...yeah. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Paltin, would you like to respond to the concerns?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure thing. You know like anything I'm open to discussion on the details. When we're talking about the Fire Department having a vision for Ocean Safety, at the end of this fiscal year, in the time that we've gone to the Fire Department, we'll have gone through two battalion chiefs in charge of Ocean Safety and we'll have gone, we're on our second chief over all of Fire Department, and I know that there's plenty folks within the Fire Department chiefs and what not that have good water knowledge and have good knowledge of emergency response, but are they intimately familiar with what we do, how we do it, and why we do it? The previous Fire Chief, you know, the Fire Department doesn't take lunch breaks. You know, they

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

are like one a 24...72 hour schedule and they can't leave the fire station until the next crew comes on shift. If the next person calls in sick, too bad so sad you got to stay. We're part of HGEA Unit 14, we get lunch breaks, you know, and that's something that I don't think...it's understood, but it's not like understood. Like at one point Chief Murray had told us like if you need your lunch break and there's nobody there to break you close the tower. And like to us, the way we have operated forever that's not acceptable, you know. You're going to stay there for eight hours and in the 45 minutes when you went to lunch, somebody drowns? Like that's not acceptable, or you know, there was talk about the ghost call. Like you have a 911 call for a different location and a 911 call going down on your beach which one do you go to if you only have you? You know, and we had a discussion like that with the Fire Department, and, you know, it was a low probability, the very next day at D.T. Flemings I had a call for someone in the water at Honolua Bay and someone in front of the Ritz Carlton and only had me. I can't be in two places at one time. You know, the bottom line is I think there's hesitancy to set minimum standards for staffing a tower because then if we don't meet it are we liable? But we're trained to give CPR with three people so we need to have three people, you know, that's, I mean common it's common sense. If a piece of machinery is like over 600 pounds, how many people do you need to push that machinery into the ocean without, if it slides off the rollies? You know, the ocean is a major economic driver for the County of Maui and the State of Hawaii. We can easily spend 200,000 a year advertising in magazines to bring people here to go to the ocean, but how much are we willing to spend to do education that doesn't make it look like Disneyland? Like no offense to the Maui Visitors Bureau or the people that put out the educational videos, but it's not, that stuff that they put out is so tame, that I would be a tourist not knowing anything about it, and I would be like I don't know what they're talking about, it's not dangerous. You know, when you look at that video, they don't show the real deal stuff, and I'm not saying that we should, but a lot of the education being provided by the Visitors Bureau and the tourism authority is being provided by people that don't know what the real dangers are. They don't know what the misperceptions by the tourists are. They don't know our job, and the thing about ocean safety is, you know, if it's rainy you might not have too much people at the beach, and then it looks like well why do they got three guys and there's nobody here? You can't predict the weather; you can't predict the surf. So, there's standards, you know, like a fire company won't operate with less than three guys. A tower shouldn't operate with less than three guys. You know, like there's standards that the Fire Department holds themselves too that they won't put for us because there's not the funding there for it, you know, and it's about equity and it's about keeping our people safe, it's about keeping our visitors safe. There's plenty folks that come from the middle where there's no ocean, that have no idea what can happen. They have no even concept that they should respect the elements, and it's been a long time coming. You know when the jet ski program started, our goal was to save lives, not to get paid, and so in the end we provided that service on the 911 system for free for 15 years. It's not that we want money, it's what...we want to be equitably compensated and we want to be equitably staffed and we want just equity, you know, and to do the job that we need to do it's we've been very lucky and a lot of the pioneers of the various programs are no longer with the Department and they've set the bar so high that you have to pretty much bleed to meet the bar that they provided and this is just to, like I said,

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

right size Ocean Safety as a continuation to the program and you know, at the very least how can we provide members of one department these medical exams and not provide another. So, that's my first comment.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair, for my second and last time on this. Upon hearing the concerns of my colleagues I think we should revisit this. So, there's obviously there's no consensus and I can understand the valid concerns and my fellow colleagues request for additional information with this appropriation, by the same token I want to compliment my colleague from West Maui because this is certainly an important area that I think additional resources should be put in because it's important for the perception our residents and visitors to have about our ocean safety right here in Maui County so people know that when they go into that water, we have a first class unit of, you know, lifesavers out there that can protect all of us. So, I await your recommendation to move on so we can go on to consideration number four. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, if there aren't. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I would concur with Mr. Molina. I would just say that I did get to view the County of Kauai's PSA program and where the response department, the Fire Department actually does the PSA announcements. So, you have the county employee speaking and showing the exact surf and ocean situations that our...their employees have to face as well as the warning about the rip tides and everything else. So, I thought that, that one county did a good job, but hearing some of the concerns of my colleague from West Maui that she has expressed very well. I would say shame on the union for not representing their members a lot better regarding those things that I believe should be a part of the contract requirements. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Members, any other comments or questions? Okay. Seeing none...oh, Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you. Just a slight comment, when you guys revisit you might want to remove the direct reference to Chevy Silverado's. I understand why Member Paltin put that in there, but we do have procurement standards. Probably just describe the type of vehicle you want and it will be bid properly. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No problem.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. So, we will mark this for revisit minus the two Chevy Silverado trucks. Yeah?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, so you just put two vehicles or two truck vehicles or something.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry. Sorry. Two vehicles without the description. Okay. Okay, so we'll revisit this. Okay, and number three we achieved consensus. And priority four. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. Again, I appreciate the proposal to have it as number four consideration. Again, Members, I think our community and this organization has worked hard to present a fair request before this Committee and I can tell you that I'm very pleased. This is one of the few requests that they have shown as well as the near future adjustments that they'll be making and this is one of the few times you will have a proposal where in their three-year plan, they come with a decreasing request proposal which shows you that they're willingness to go and seek additional outside monies, after the grant components of other foundations and other sources. So, I would just say that I believe that community healthcare benefits all over rural Maui County and I support this because I think every rural community should have a choice of having healthcare at home. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Chair King and Member Molina.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you, Chair. I support this. I think we could probably give consensus easily on this one. I was very impressed too with the fact that their, they've got a sustainable program built in. So, after the third year they're planning to be on their own. And this is the kind, I wanted to say we all heard a lot of concern in the community and this was probably the one organization that was mentioned the most. And these are the types of projects or programs that I was talking about when I thought, when I said, you know, we should have these as fixed costs so that we don't, they don't have to spend a lot of time coming back to us next year. We should just like automatically put their next amount in the next year, you know, unless something's happening and Mr. Hokama comes back and says oh it's not working, just like never mind, but I think this is what we need more of. We need more of the organization that looks down the road and that we can, you know, we get reports from them, we know they're doing a good job. We don't have to spend a lot of time talking about them every year. So, I support this project.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair, I just want to say consensus. Ready to move on.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Same here. Kakoo, I support this. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I'm getting a nod from Member Lee, a nod from Member Kama, and...

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Absolutely. Mahalo for...Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, so I'm coming back from Council on Aging, my first commission meeting and I will tell you that Lanai spoke about, she's, Joelle's sister who was, who is on the commission and she basically spoke about this project and how important it was, and I totally support it, and she had a whole story about the kind of why it was important and whatever but, I think, we heard it the other night on Lanai and I too give it a big thumbs up.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. I also support this. Member Paltin, did you get to? Oh, you're just going to nod? You can. Okay. so, Members, do we have consensus of this item?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, perfect. So, we have consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I said mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama. Okay. okay, awesome. Thank you so much, Members, for helping our body to move this along. Okay, so we're on item five and that is Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. My first priority is under the management program to create two employment positions for an archaeologist. Positions to handle the Countywide functions and I believe upwards of \$140,000 and I believe all the Members were given a budget request form for the positions I'll quickly read. Maui County has a responsibility to protect cultural assets, our current preservation process is not working. Cultural assets have been destroyed during grading and grubbing for construction projects and Hawaiian burials are repeatedly disturbed. Maui County government has a responsibility to provide local expertise and oversight. This position or positions, two at most, are intended to supplement the current State Historic Preservation Division, SHPD of the Department of Land and Natural Resources, not to replace it. SHPD is chronically under staffed and their process doesn't provide a robust preconstruction review of sites, does not do mapping or provide for an efficient electronic collection of data, and lacks a proactive oversight process for active construction activities. Even with the full staffing the current oversight process needs to be supplemented by the County if we are to fulfill our commitment to preserve and protect what makes Maui unique and to ensure we pass on to future generations of Maui whose history has not been erased by progress. And then on the second page, Chair, this is where we would, we're just looking at possibly and locating the position. The position should be housed in the Department of Management to ensure that all departments are served and its broad mission of cultural advocacy and protection is not limited by the organizational and specific

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

missions of the different departments. So the Department of Management houses other Countywide functions including the Countywide CIP program, special project assistance, information technology, and energy, and so the position located in the Mayor's Office will provide the position with the authority it needs to effect broad change, and fulfill Maui's mandated responsibility to respect and protect our cultural resources. And so at the top, it looks like and you can read on from...I won't read the entire thing, but salaries for two positions and Archaeologist I to III, and then Archaeologist IV to XI. So, Chair, yeah, this is the brief proposal and I'll give it to the Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I like this. So, thank you very much, Mr. Sinenci. Just a couple questions maybe if you can help give us...in my understanding of your intent, Mr. Sinenci, I understand. I support that. I'm just wondering whether or not SHPD will stay we're not the authorized entity to give certain State approvals so does the process still get hampered because only SHPD can do the actual signoffs and approvals of certain type of requirement, government requirements? And second, where do you see now the role of our Cultural Resource Commission then to be since some of these things are as I understand within under the current purview of our cultural resource commissioners?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci, and this won't count against your two opportunities to speak.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay. Thank you. Yeah, and so we've listed some of the possible duties any one of these positions might take up and so it's again, it's not to take SHPD's responsibilities at the State level, but because they're so understaffed and if the County can assist in either reviewing applications, permits, or prioritizing them so that the we could assist SHPD in where would be possible areas for conservation or for protection. So, I think that might be, you know, we have some leeway, or we can ask to help these duties, you know, more solidified as far as not overstepping their boundaries but still just to help the process in going through the permitting. You had another? Did I answer the second question?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: You took care the first part, so do you see then, what would be our role of our Cultural Resources Commission then since we have a body of citizens that have expertise in various areas of our culture and our history? Do you see their role being, be the, not required anymore or, I mean, they have requirements under their establishments, so I just was wondering how you see the Cultural Resource Commission in the future if we implement this?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I would think that we would work in partnership with the Commission and work hand in hand with the Commission, and, you know, like you said, they already have their duties. We don't want to step on anybody else's

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

responsibility so whatever we can assist with the Commission or even if the Commission wants to provide areas where we can focus on, we'll take those in advisement.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No, I believe in home rule and I, you know, believe that this is a way of strengthening our home rule, exercising our power as under home rule so I'm very supportive of that. But I can tell you I believe we're going to get resistance from the State because like SHPD the State Surveyor Office is understaffed. And that's basically one guy for the State, okay, and even though you may offer a previous State surveyor with all the licenses and whatnot that can do the work the current State surveyor will not accept that and he is the only one that currently requires that he sign off on all. So, Maui County's own requirements from the State surveyor is I would say at least 18 months behind schedule. So, I think we may need to do some battling, Chair, Mr. Sinenci, which I'm happy to do.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I appreciate that. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. So, it sounds like you'd be willing to go consensus or would you prefer?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, I'll consensus to move this forward.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Chair King --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --Member Molina, and then Member Sugimura.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Yeah, I think this is a good idea. We've been talking about it since last year. I would ask you that maybe to start with one position and see what that position would fulfill, and also I'd just wanted to let you know that I met with our acting head of Public Works yesterday and one of her first things that she wants to do is rescind the 30 day rule for SHPD. So, that, you know, if they don't get to it within 30 days then Public Works goes ahead. So, they want to get rid of that rule. I think that helps a little bit. I do think we need to develop that relationship with SHPD, but you know, I don't know the ins and outs of the collective bargaining of this position, but I would rather have one good architect that's high paid than two positions, because I think that's why SHPD has a hard time filling those positions because if you look at the salaries, they're not terribly high, and we're looking for, or I think we want a real professional person. So, I would just, you know, I think if we move into it with one architect and get a high-level person --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Archaeologist, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --see if there's extra work and then if you do need a full-fledged architect or if you needed an assistant, you know, can go from there, but move into it quickly, I mean carefully because you don't want to, if you create two positions now you got to

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

put the funding aside for two and they may not be able to fill that second one because they're having a hard time right now.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is that a proposed amendment?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No, I just wanted to see are you amendable to that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: You know and the reason why we did put the second one is you're right, we realized that we did lose an archaeologist to the private sector so we did want to and we spoke with the UH Maui campus that they have like intro...entry level right out of college and so we, that's why we had that second position as either as an assistant or to just do those entry level duties of an archeologist. So that's why the second position.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I just think since we don't have anybody and we're moving into that that if we start with one and see if that actually is a necessity then maybe we go with a, maybe it can be called something else too if they're just an assistant, but I think we have to hire somebody good and pay them well and that's how we're going to actually get someone to apply for that position. So yeah, if...that would be my input.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: If you're amenable to that.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I am. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, the proposal will now be for one senior position? Is that correct, Member Sinenci? Okay. Okay. Mahalo, Chair King. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. I'll wholeheartedly support the amendment for one, and again, like Chair King said when we had the State, the SHPD archeologist come and visit us through ironically Mr. Sinenci's Committee that was one of the concerns she expressed about getting archaeologists to work on the public level versus going out to the private sector. So, I think that's a good proposal here, and with Member Hokama talking about the CRC itself, as we know there's a requirement to have an archaeologist on the CRC. I don't know maybe if Corp. Counsel can chime in whether today or tomorrow, whenever, but if you have the Maui archaeologist, or the County archaeologist saying one thing and the archaeologist on the CRC saying another way, you have potential conflict. Who trumps whom? I would guess it would be the CRC that would have the final say much like our Board of Variances and Appeals where the director makes a recommendation

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

and then the board can see otherwise. So, I'm only guessing that might be the same situation with the CRC versus a recommendation from, in this case, the County archaeologist, and, you know, we also have a County arborist, one arborist as well. So, but for now, as far as the number goes, one I think is fine for a start, yeah. So, anyway I just wanted to throw that out there.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka, do you have anything to share on this?

MR. UEOKA: Yeah, you won't like the answer because I'm going to have to say it depends. It'll all depend on what type of, how you guys set up the laws and everything on who chimes in. If it's a CRC approved permit, it's kind of up to who the CRC votes, how they vote I should say. It's a commission so there's rules there. So, I guess it depends on how you set everything up. Right now I don't believe anything in our Code establishes a need for an archaeological review done by a County employee. So that'll have to change. Just on a side, Chair, since I was looking at this. I'm not sure if Mr. Sinenci's Office contacted the Department of Personnel Services, but I believe this would be a civil service position, so it would need to be created appropriately even in the Department of Management and I'm going to assume because SHPD has archaeologists the position description does exist, or the classification or job or whatever the DPS term is, but you guys might want to if you're moving forward with this, you guys might want to consult with the Department of Personnel Services to get an accurate description then you can also see what SR level the salary range level, et cetera is and you'll have a better idea for budgeting purposes. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Ueoka.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, thank you. So, I think this is, I wish we would've done this last year. We went through two years of all of this. So, thank you for this foresight. I will say, I'm wondering in my mind because SHPD has the ultimate say when they do these reviews and have the, when the studies are done the surveys are done of different projects or archaeological surveys are done, I wonder if we have spoken to them, SHPD, just to see how this would fit into their, what the structure is and if we need to adjust in any way so we don't over step or we can supplement and help them. Have we spoken to SHPD?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes. She was here. She visited at our last meeting or two meetings. We had the director here. So, the consensus was she was in support of it.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And when I looked at the archaeological, or archaeologist position on the State on their personnel website because they were looking for somebody, it is not a civil service position. So, if...and I'm not too sure what that means in terms of the State, but it would be helpful that ours is so, is that wrong, Mr. Ueoka?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Ueoka?

MR. UEOKA: Chair I...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Anyway, it doesn't...

MR. UEOKA: I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah. That's what it was when I looked at it, but...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: We can follow up, Chair, sorry.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: It's not a major for this. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, Member Lee, did you want to...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm waiting for a consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Kama, consensus? Member Paltin? Okay, I support this. So, Members, do we have consensus on this item?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, number six on our list is...

MS. MATTHEWS: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Matthews?

MS. MATTHEWS: Can I clarify, the last was brought down from two to one, does the amount indicated stay the same or is there any, do we just keep that same amount as the total?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: We were going to check for the, I believe, Corporate [sic] Counsel said the SR, the SR level with the Department of Personnel.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. That's what, I think that's what the body understood too. Okay. Okay. Is that good, Ms. Matthews? Okay. Thank you. Okay, and then so number six on our list is a proposal by Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, everyone. I wanted to bring this up as one of my priorities because for the Kula Community Association and as you heard from some of the parents who were there to testify and support this at the Upcountry Budget meeting that the Kula playground is something that is long awaited for. The playground equipment that was, is there now was kind of dismantled because it didn't have ADA requirements met, and the community has been waiting for a new one to be put in. So, the engineering company did two community meetings and got input and the community actually selected this was, there were three different proposals. This is the second one which is not the top with everything on it, but so I was glad to see that. The amount that is on Page 753 in our program book under CIP for Parks and Recreation CBS-1175 is for 850,000 and the reason that I'm bringing it up is by checking with Parks because of the ADA requirement and the topography in the park, the amount is now increased by \$138,650. So, that's what's here which would bring the total for this playground equipment, \$988,650. So, that's the project.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, let's start with Member Kama. Do you have any questions or concerns?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I guess my question would be the design part is over so it's, the money is just for construction and it's shovel ready?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: You mean it's ready to go, that...it's...yeah. Parks planning has it ready to go. You're correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And how far away is the nearest playground from this?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah so Kula community, I'm sorry, Kula Elementary is next door, but their playground equipment is fenced. So, it's not for the community to use.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, sorry. How far away is the nearest playground --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Public?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --for the community kids?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, so there's one at Keokea...Keokeo Park...Keokea Park. I wouldn't be able to tell you how many miles away it is, but there is one there. It is, I think right now it's, they're doing repairs of it so it's kind of fenced off, but it is there.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thanks.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama, any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I was just hoping that maybe we go out to bid and get a number for us and then if there's a difference we would fund it because I would hate now the bid to just go up another 140,000 because we put another 140,000. I understand the community's comments and I would agree, I think neighborhood parks should be in the neighborhoods. So, I don't have an issue with that. I believe we need to take care needs for those that have some difficulties. So with ADA, I'm in full support of that, but I would hate to give contractors ability to just up bids because more money was placed in a project, but other than that I support this. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, so I'm just a little confused because it says budgeted 850,000 so that's already there and you're adding on 138 for a shortfall?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: The response that I got back from Parks, was because of topography and just the ADA requirement, the cementing and all these, you know, requirements that the cost is this new amount.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, what is in the budget already is the 850, in the CIP.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, that's in the proposed.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Right. Right. Right. Right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay. Yeah, I mean, I would support the project. I would support getting another bid if that's helpful. I'm just disappointed that the other playground got fenced because that was a project I worked on with Dick Mayer and that was supposed to be a County playground --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: You mean at the school?

VICE-CHAIR KING: --that the school was going to use, but it was put in by a volunteer group and we did a public-private partnership on that probably for about \$40,000 because we did all the installations ourselves, but I'm just disappointed that the school fenced it off because it actually is on County property is my understanding, but I support the playground.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: You know if you can shave a little bit off that that's good, but I understand ADA is costing a lot of us a lot of money.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: They require yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So it's good we have that kind of accessibility.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair, I support the program and the request and I'm ready for the vote.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, Madam Chair, consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes, I would like to support the project. I appreciated all the Kula residents that came out including parents, children that came in support of this. So, consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay. I too support this. So, Members, do we have consensus?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Ten-second comment please because I think Ms. Sugimura brought up a good point because even on Lanai we have this issue. It's interesting that the State that has facilities that is paid for by us taxpayers closes off facilities to the community that is owned by the people and that the State depends on using County facilities many times and yet they don't share their facilities. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. So, Members, do we have consensus on item six?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you everybody. My community will be very happy. Thank you.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All of our community. Okay, item number seven, that is a proposal by Chair King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. I actually removed this item because after talking to Public Works yesterday this was originally, this is located in sea level rise area and so they pulled, and it actually was going to cost 6 or \$8 million so they pulled the project from their list of projects for the parks. So, in its place I'm going to start with Kalama Park safety issues and we have, I don't know how many people have been out to Kalama Park lately, but we have a lot of vagrants in Kalama Park. We've had a lot of incidences where people have actually gotten hurt and attacked and so I'm working with the Parks Department to install like a pilot project of cameras which is going to probably...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, Chair King what item is that?

VICE-CHAIR KING: On my top five priorities --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: On the matrix?

VICE-CHAIR KING: --it's the number one, but I didn't see it as number one on here. I saw something else as number one on here. So, you know, the Kalama Park security.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I don't...

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, on this revision that I handed out, it's the number one priority.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But on the matrix or were you replacing, are you replacing it?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, the one is number, yeah, it's listed as number seven, but I didn't find it anywhere on this matrix so I just stuck this other one in here. It might be down farther, but anyways --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --so it's a fairly small funding. It's about 40,000 for the cameras and all the peripheral equipment and that will give good coverage of that park and then one E/P it's about \$25,000 for the first eight months. So, that will be an additional security person and I think that will be probably if we get the security issues under control then that's an extra person that the Parks can float around, but that will give us two security people at Kalama Park.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Two or one?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So we're going to delete the new bike path and replace it with Kalama Park safety, an addition of one E/P and body cams? No body cams.

VICE-CHAIR KING: And about, and the cameras, the pilot project for the cameras, if this works they want to do it at other parks is 40,000.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: And the E/P is eight months.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Eight months.

VICE-CHAIR KING: That's how they figure it because it takes, after the fiscal year starts it takes them about three months to get the hire on board.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, and do you know what the total...so, it would be total 65,000?

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, the total is about 65,000.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, Members, did you get all of that information? And that falls under Police?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Under, well it's under Parks and Recreation.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. So, it's going to be a park ranger?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, it's called a security officer.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, they have several security officers right now, and they have them placed at different parks around the island. So, this would be a second security officer for that area and can float into other areas in Kihei as well.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. Members, did you get all of that information for our new item seven? Or do you have any questions? Okay. I'll start with Member Sinenci. If you have any questions on this item.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No questions at this time. I support the addition of another E/P park ranger. I do understand that the area has a lot of traffic including vagrant so I'd like to support this item. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Just to make sure we get the record straight, so it's a \$65,000 appropriation. Delete the \$150,000 for the bike path

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

Waipuilani Park and this will be for a security officer from the Parks budget and exclusive for Kalama Park. So, I support.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Lee, any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No questions. I just want to say, Madam Chair, that I am in strong support of any improvements to Kalama Park. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: One question for, can you mention about the security cameras component please, Ms. King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: It's a pilot project. I have a whole, I don't want to read this whole thing, but it's basically security coverage for all the areas where the kids are and the activities takes place.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Restrooms.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, it's a pilot project, yeah, they want...they're kind of piloting this in the parks and there's, if it works the way they think it's going to work, then they'll probably start looking at other parks that have particular issues like this one and because there's so many kids using it and families.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I'm in support of this and just as a note, we moving forward on the construction of our commercial kitchen on Lanai that Council has supported, in that we also have fund our restroom facilities because similar issues that Ms. King has brought up the project, our project is including security cameras. So, I would say this shouldn't be a pilot project. This should be part of our overall park safety program because it assists also enforcement in ensuring that they have the proper documentation evidence because I believe prosecution is a key component on the follow through of this type of vagrancy and destruction of public assets. So, I'm in a full support of this request.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Mr. Hokama, and I think the part of it that's the pilot is that it's outdoors.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, it's going to be around the pavilion, the playground, and...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: You need a camera to protect the camera.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin, any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Having worked in the parks for many years, I kind of concur with my colleague from Lanai, you know, vandalism is kind of a concern and that we

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

already know that there's an issue there. I think it needs to be really thought out about where it's going to be, the camera, and that it's inaccessible to the regular folks, but it's able to capture the information needed for convictions and whatnot. So, that's one concern I have although I'm all for safety at Kalama Park. The other concern I have is, I'm looking at this response document that we got from Personnel and there's so many park security officers existing that's vacant that I would prefer instead of creating an additional parks security officer position that we reallocate one of the existing ones to Kalama Park because they're all vacant anyway and creating another vacant position.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, can I respond to that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: I just want to let Councilmember Paltin know that I've met with our Parks Director and those positions are pretty well filled now, and allocated. They did a big recruitment for security officers for Parks and had a really good showing and so they, I don't believe they're going to be vacant at the end of this year, but they should be all filled, but this, but they only allocated one for Kalama. So, this would be an extra one, but I do have, I don't know if people are interested because I have a whole description of the camera program so it's pretty well thought out where they're going to go, 360 degree cameras, see everything and high bandwidth and I don't know if you, you know, I've got five paragraphs here that describe it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, then if all the park security officers are now filled, would we not want to see if they are able to then cover Kalama Park because in looking at this document, they all say War Memorial Gym but that's just their home base right? They're going to be roaming throughout the entire County. So, just wondering if we want to give that a chance to work before creating an addition?

VICE-CHAIR KING: They're actually all allocated. So, they're allocated to specific parks. So, this would be a second one for Kalama and this is based on the amount of incidents that we had there so trying to cover...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I just would like to see how one security officer works out. If we're going from zero to two, see how one works to start out with. That's just my comment.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Well, we have one right now. It's not enough.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, it's not a vacant position?

VICE-CHAIR KING: What's that?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's not vacant?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Not the one...

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean there's all these vacant positions.

VICE-CHAIR KING: No, those have, and when I met with the Director they had just done a recruitment for those positions. So, I'm not sure how old that paper you have, but I asked her specifically if they filled them and they have.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, there are four Park Security Officer I positions that are vacant and locations are three at the War Memorial Gym and one at the Molokai Community Rec Center.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then I see two more at the bottom of Page 19.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I see two more too. Yeah, and two are for the War Memorial Gym.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So we have five --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, they have different dates though. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --parks security officers --

VICE-CHAIR KING: What's the date on that?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --assigned to the War Memorial Gym?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Twenty...there's different dates that it was vacant and then there's a report of action on the very right column. Do you have that?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, on Page 20 also has an additional park security officer as well.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I know, but the vacant.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: One, two, three, four, five, six, seven. Seven, seven parks security officers.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. Okay. So, it, the letter was sent on March 19th, this notice.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Twenty nineteen.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah I think I talked to her last month and they had done the recruiting, but I think those are also, all those positions are allocated, you know, one each to different parks. So, even if they fill them they won't come to Kalama. That's the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

concern in Kalama is that we don't, is that we need additional security because of the, that's the biggest park and the biggest usage.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. Member Paltin, any other questions or comments?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess my question is there's six park security officers allocated for War Memorial Gym?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I can ask Personnel to let us know how many positions are assigned to War Memorial Gym unless...yeah I don't think...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because I looked also at the list that they gave us of the current positions in Parks and I didn't find any park security officer in the filled position. So, I'm assuming there's no park security officers filled and then I see six in here and I can't believe that they are all at War Memorial Gym.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: One is at Molokai Community Rec Center.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's seven, but there's six at War Memorial Gym.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, at the yeah, War Memorial Gym. One, two, three, four, five --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So it's just, you know...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --six, seven. Oh no that's power mower repair. Six.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's just like, you know, one of my concerns.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, good discussion. Do you want to get an update on that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I told Member Paltin that we would --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --I'll ask the Department.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I do know that when I worked on my underage drinking prevention and we actually got Kalama Park to be no alcohol, but I think that people still drink there so I can see the need for this as we heard many mothers come concerned about their children who are playing tennis or baseball, there's so many sports things going on there as well as the skate park, that I can see where this is a central gathering place, a major gathering place for sports activities for families. So,

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

it's a good idea. I'd like to get some of those questions answered. I have one more question, is what is the difference between a park ranger and a park security person? Is a park security person assigned to a specific location or anybody have a...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mr. Ueoka?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: They're the same?

MR. UEOKA: Thank you. I guess, I used to advise Parks. They're the same people.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, same.

MR. UEOKA: It's just rangers like a name they call them, but their official title per like DPS is park security officers.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I see. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. And just, Member Paltin, to your concern about vacancies, on my priority, on my top five concerns, I did propose to add a deadline to fill vacancies. It's something that we will discuss, but you know, just to that concern of vacancies.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I had comment on that, but I'll save it till we get there.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No questions, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members, are we ready to reach consensus on this item? Okay, Members, consensus?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great. Okay. Okay. Okay. Priority number eight is a proposal by Member Lee. Member Lee, you ready?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. This is an easy one. Okay. I can hear all those consensus voices coming down the road. Okay, this is an appropriation I'm asking that we buy the Wailuku Water Company, and as you know, this is where we have a major watershed that needs protected, and...protection, and it is also one of the most significant culturally lands that we have in Maui County, and the amount that I'm asking for is \$9.5 million. Now, the way I have it shown on the chart is broken up into columns, but it really doesn't matter where we get the money from because I'm adding to what we have, to the verbiage that's here, I'm adding "and other available funds." So, 4 million from the Open Space Fund and other available funds, 5.5 million from bonds or other available funds. This matter was proposed by Alan Arakawa, the former Mayor last year. An appraisal was done and that appraisal came in at

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

\$11.1 million, and I can't tell you how important it is for us to conserve and protect these precious lands and I'm asking for your support on this request. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Okay, I'll start on my left-hand side. Member Sinenci, any questions or comments?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I too have often heard about, you know, acquiring the Wailuku Water and through the years we've seen some of the challenges with the current status of the Wailuku Water Company so I would want to support this. We want to look into just the ramifications and the breakdown, I mean, I think if I seen, I'm kind of like I need to see the data or you know, what are some of the, you know, just the, I guess basic breakdown and where would some of these funds come from. I know we're looking at some of the open space funds too and so I'm happy that Ms. Lee included other available funds. So, and I would like to concede and listen to some of my other Members' recommendations. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. I was hoping you would start from the other side and work your way, but nah, just kidding. Yeah, I think we, I this is a, we should approach this, this is the right direction to take and I'm support of it, and certainly we should look at some of the finite details that Councilmember Sinenci has suggested as well, but there's been all the discussion I've heard leading up to today about the need to support our watersheds and this is a very significant cultural area here as well, you know, on top of the water resources. And certainly the price is, you know, if somewhat reasonable since it did come in under the appraisal price of \$11 million. So, I'm in the support of moving in this direction, Madam Chair, with the additional details provided along the way of course. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. This is a tough one because we looked at this last term and we didn't get very many answers and so this is concerning. We had a list of questions that came from the former Mayor to Wailuku Water Company and the biggest one was what does it cost to operate and what is the liability of the repairs that are needed, and that wasn't answered satisfactory. When I asked, you know, the representative about the operating costs and the operating manuals, he said, no it's all up here, and that was very concerning to me because anything that big should have, you know, written down operating manuals, it should have costs that they can tell us and so I'd like to see some of those questions answered and so we know what liability we're getting into, we know what repairs we're going to be responsible for. I'd also like to look at possibly applying eminent domain, you know, if it's a water system that can't be used by anybody else then we should look at possibly doing eminent domain on this and see what because if it is a value, but my biggest concern is that I spoke with the Water Director couple years ago about this project and his assessment of it was that it's going to be extremely expensive to repair and upkeep and that we only really use two miles of the actual piping or whatever it was, the waterway. So, if we're

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

going to look at it, I'd be interested in looking at it for open space, but then I think we have to look at that lower value if we're going to, I'm not sure if you can split it into open space funds and bond funds, but I would like to kind of delve into this and in Councilmember Lee's Committee and, you know, it's always something that we can, if we decide it's worth it and it's not going to be a huge liability, we can always bond fund it later on. But I'm just, you know, from what I've and we've had a couple meetings on this in the last term, and I just I haven't got satisfactory answers yet. So, I'm just a little bit leery about what we're taking on if we take on this system. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: As Ms. King had indicated, last term we did review the proposal from Mayor Arakawa, and the Members at that time was not convinced that the benefits outweighed the liabilities as well as what is the potential of additional capacity to the County system. Those questions were never satisfactorily answered. I'm open to potential acquisition if I can see the net benefits of acquisition. I would say I believe if this does move forward, then I need the Water Department to come up with a rate increase structure because I think water funds should be utilized for at least for half of the acquisition, okay, because not the whole County gets the benefit. Regarding the culture components, I see some benefits there, but I really don't want that much access to a watershed because of potential contamination and issues that we've heard regarding East Maui and invasive species, and I believe that under the State, I believe, they have a role that they should consider also considering that the State acquired the land and put it under the State Water Commission for jurisdiction of overall watershed protection. So, I'm hesitant to give my assent at this point of time, but I'm happy to hear if there's additional information that can convince me that this is the right thing to do. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin, any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks, Chair. I'm trying to read this voluminous thing as fast as I can. Just wondering what is the, if anyone knows off the top of their head, what is the total acreage?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Eight thousand.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so the situation was the appraisal was for like 11 something, but they're willing to sell it for 9.5?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Lee? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I concur with my previous two colleagues. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, I was in two meetings regarding this Wailuku Water Company and I'm just wondering, is there any more capacity available with the Wailuku Water Company or is it all kind of, is there, could we get new customers out of this purchase to help pay for the acquisition?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair, I'm thinking that it might be better for all the Members to put their questions in writing and then I can come back and give the answers to them.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, and one more thing. And I'm going to be asking Hokuao Pellegrino to come here and give a testimony on this project.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, good.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I'm fine.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Pau? Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I'm going to put my question in writing. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I support this effort, like my colleagues I feel like there's additional information needed, but I agree that I like the direction that you're taking. So, we'll mark this for revisit? Revisit? Okay. Any objections to a revisit?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great. Okay. So the number nine, the ninth item is mines. Okay. So, my proposal is to increase a temporary expansion position for the Molokai Wastewater Facility, so one E/P for the duration of the supervisors before he retires, until he retires. So, when he retires, then the Molokai Wastewater Facility will go back to being three E/Ps and as I mentioned yesterday there is, the director has over 15 years of experience and then the person below him who will be taking his place doesn't, has a fraction of that experience and they still haven't filled the third, they're in the process of filling the vacant position, the third vacant position, but my concern is that the person who replaces the supervisor's position will then be stuck with two really new employees who will then have a year or so of experience and so I wanted to add an additional position so that they will get to train under the current supervisor before he retires and will benefit from both the current supervisor and the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

future supervisor. And it would be for an operator trainee salary range of 60 to 80,000 including the fringe benefits. So, that's my proposal. I'll start with Member Kama and then work my way down. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I concur.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good planning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Would this, my question is, would this be like a limited-term appointment like when you're saying temporary expansion position, is that like the equivalent in personnel talk about -term appointments?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, it wouldn't be an appointment. It would be open, an open application process. Is that what you mean?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like there's a start and an end date for this expansion position?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so the end date would be determined as soon as the supervisor determines his end date.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But he does have plans to retire?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Next year.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I was wondering if this shouldn't just be a standard practice for all departments because on Lanai I have a senior employee of DEM also that's planning to retire, but you know, again, should this be a regular practice so that we have consistency and continuation of level of service because, you know, a lot of times the phone calls I get is, do you have only one employee he's on vacation, I have to wait two weeks --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --till they come back from vacation before my things get processed. So you know, I understand your request, Chair. I'm very open to it. I think an LTA is a reasonable request, consideration, LTA request so I would say yeah. I wouldn't support a one E/P, but I will support one LTA position. Then, you know, the temporary expansion would fit because what we would be asking for is 1.0 LTA

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

instead of one E/P because E/Ps are normally used for permanent civil service positions. So --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --that would be my comment, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin, wanted to follow up really quick on that comment? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I just wanted to say in my experience, limited-term appointment is still required the civil service process.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's just like the title. It's not like an actual appointment. It's like when I got hired in limited-term appointment, I still had to go through the civil service process.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo for the clarification, Member Hokama and Member Paltin. So, I'm open to it being a 1.0 LTA. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No, I support this, Chair. I think it's a good idea. I was very sad when Mr. Silva passed away at the wastewater treatment like two weeks after I saw him there, but I think it's a good idea. Like Mr. Hokama said, we should think about doing this in other departments where, even before somebody with long-time experience leaves. So, I'm ready for consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Lee?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, I'm sorry. I was going to ask you too.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, go ahead.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Did you have a cost on that position?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, it's between 60 and 80,000 --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --and that included fringe benefits.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. Usually they do like an eight month because they don't get the hire till like three months into the year.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I can get a better number.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, but that was the whole year that your quoting?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Good idea. Good idea.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus. Good foresight.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, so, Members, we're ready for consensus? Okay. Consensus? Okay. Item ten is a proposal by Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I wanted to mahalo the Members for listening to some of the testimony that was given this morning. We did, my office did ask them to come and testify because we did have some just general questions about the project. Our office was in receipt of a Land Use Committee report from previous Councilmember Carroll on October of 2017 and then a follow-up resolution approving the project with modifications and independent, the development of the 100 percent affordable housing unit project. So, and some of the clarifying things between the developer and Habitat for Humanity was that Habitat was asking for the \$5 million, and so that would be for the acquisition of the 25-lot affordable subdivision with infrastructure to make lots build ready, and to use for land purchase, construction and infrastructure upgrades. So, I mean, it sounds like the County would be subsidizing the project of in excess of 5 million. Just as a reminder Habitat is meeting with the Mayor as we speak so we'll definitely get more information after today if we wanted to wait for that response.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. I wanted to ask Mr. Ueoka really quickly if this would be required, under the affordable housing if this would be required to be affordable in perpetuity if we're going to be using the Affordable Housing Fund.

MR. UEOKA: Thank you, Chair. That's a complicated question. In one section of 3.35 it does state that the terms of affordability are set forth in 2.96 and then another section of 3.35 it states grant or loan proposals shall meet the following criteria for approval; item three demonstrate that the subject property project directly advances the objective of providing affordable housing in perpetuity. So, I am not sure, Chair.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Mr. Ueoka. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just an addition for East Maui community, it's true like other communities we are in desperate need of affordable housing. As a rural community we've seen a lot of our affordable inventory being bought out by other businesses and turned into vacation rentals, short-term vacation rentals. The other, I think, the average cost of a home on East Maui is upwards of 900,000 because we have such large, almost, estates. Those are the only types of inventory that is presented to our local community. So, I think, and some of the discussions we're trying to keep the project affordable and for residents of East Maui. We cannot be, you know, look at the mortgage processes, you know, just for Hana residents so there were some challenges with the project on trying to keep it affordable for East Maui.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Members, I know we spoke a lot about this earlier during our testimony phase. So, is there any objection and the two individuals that we asked to stay during the meeting to act as resource people are no longer here.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: They are in the meeting with the Mayor.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, if there is no objection, I'd like to just mark this as revisit.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Can I ask because I think Member Sinenci said earlier that he had the minutes from that Land Use Committee meeting that we had in Hana where we talked about this. If you could, at some, not right, you don't have to do it right now, but if at some point you could share that with the Councilmembers because I was at that meeting and so that's why I'm having a problem with us because I remember them coming out and saying, you know, we just need these lots, and then we'll sell the lots to the people and they'll build their homes. So, it would help to have those meetings [*sic*].

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, we'll provide the minutes. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Chair King, that Land Use Committee meeting was on November 3rd, 2017 and the Committee report number is 17-154.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KING: He said it was in October. You have what date?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: November 3rd.

VICE-CHAIR KING: November 3rd?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Twenty seventeen.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Twenty seventeen? Okay. There might have been more than one.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I'm sorry. That was the date of the Committee report.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The Land Use Committee met on October 18th, 2017.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah. Okay. Yeah. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry.

VICE-CHAIR KING: That's okay. Alright. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Chair King. Okay. Number 11 is a proposal from Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Alright. Thank you very much for the introduction. I appreciate it, but, you know, keep it real and short and simple like I did yesterday. The Mayor is proposing 1,150,000 for the rental assistance, rental housing program. I believe we should increase that appropriation by a million dollars because there's a much definite need for additional rentals because of the shortage of inventory for long-term rentals due to the proliferation of short-term vacation rentals, bed and breakfast and B&Bs and Airbnb's and all that other stuff. The priority for rental housing is become even greater for our community, and to offset this additional \$1 million appropriation, I believe we can get the revenue to balance things out from the General Fund with making adjustments to certain property tax classifications. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay I'll go to Member Kama first and work our way down.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you. So, I support this, but I was just wondering, if we're putting in an extra million dollars, how much are allocating per family for down payment?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: That is a good question. I guess it varies from, I believe with our rental assistance program, I believe they outsource to like organizations like MEO to make the determination. So, they would I guess manage it, I guess, so to speak and then families interested in applying for rental assistance will go through MEO as sort of a pass-through agency if I recall that.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I just was curious as to how many families can we actually support or assist with just this. I mean, if it's a 1,000 families that's great, but if it's only a 100 families that may not be so great and if it's for rental that's one thing, but if it's for home ownership that's another thing too. That's all.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I can, we can contact the Department of Housing and Human Concerns to see how many additional families could be helped with this rental assistance and give you that, give the Committee that information at a later point.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Revisit.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, we could look at it as a revisit if you want, but I think in general, I think the concept we should --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --we definitely have a high need for it.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I support it. I just want to know how much, if this is enough that's all.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Sure.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. And just a reminder to please silence your phones. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, I think there are three organizations that have this rental assistance capability. I think it's MEO, Family Life Center, and is it Ka Hale A Ke Ola? Yeah, is three.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Catholic Charities.

VICE-CHAIR KING: No.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And Catholic Charities.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Anyways, so it's there. Do you know the current, I'm just trying to look fast enough what the total number is or the total dollar amount for the rental assistance program now? I can come back to it. I got to look. Thank you. I'll look.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. We'll come back to you. Okay. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Just for my understanding, we're going through like a third party like MEO or like that so that they administer the program and they like set the guidelines so that we're not like giving somebody big money to rent out like a luxury home. It's to like use it --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Affordable.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --most efficiently as possible. That's the reason why we contract it out to a third party?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I'm not too clear about the history of how. why it was outsourced from the Department. I think it's best to get that information from the Department, but yeah, to I guess help these agencies because they're so well connected to those in need it was probably the, I guess, the train of thought was let's have these organizations work with the County service, pass through agencies, and establish the parameters as to the specific amounts that should be allocated to the families that are in need based on income I would guess and ability to pay. But yeah, we'll make sure we ask those questions as well or maybe through your Committee if that's whatever the preferred way is, but either way, my staff or your Committee we can work together to provide that information.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm supportive. I just, I never had experience with the rental assistance programs and, you know, like the rental units available in West Maui are just kind of outrageous so I'm trying to figure it out how it would work in like, I mean, when there's only luxury homes available to rent or like that kind of thing.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura, I found --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, I found it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --on Page 287, it's currently a million.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Eight dash eleven. Yes, it's currently a million.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so it would be an additional million.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Affordable rental housing.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: An additional million.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, I was just --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --it would be an additional million for a total of 2 million?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Two million one hundred fifty thousand.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: One hundred fifty thousand.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Because the Mayor has 1,150,000. Proposal is to add an additional million.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: That's Hale Mahaolu. The 150.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: On Page 287 of the Program Budget?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: It's...8-11 has it on the detail.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, while we're looking for that, I'll call on Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, I appreciate Mr. Molina's willingness to revisit. I would like us to at least get from the Department what is our ability to potentially acquire or secure additional Section 8 vouchers and whether or not that is a reasonable venue for us to follow through on because I know we've increased the amount of vouchers that we had in the past and maybe use that as another way to address the rental situation because there is a cap regarding the vouchers and as well as the houses need to be qualified to receive those vouchers. So, I would like the Department to do what we pay them to do instead of always going to a third party. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Molina?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Just as an FYI to the Members, if you look at Page 288 in your Budget narrative, under affordable rental housing programs, there are four agencies that actually administer the rental assistance; Family Life Center, Ka Hale A Ke Ola, MEO, and Women Helping Women. Just an FYI for the Members. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, and I we did receive on April 4th corrected pages to our budget and the 287 was one of the, 287 to...oh okay there's a variety of pages, but 287 was one of the pages and that one includes the \$150...\$150,000 for Hale Mahaolu for homeowners and housing counseling program. Okay. Mahalo. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. So, I just had a couple questions. One is, how do they, so there's going to be 2,150,000 in our Department budget and then that gets dispersed so how do they make those, do you know how they make those decisions on who gets how much --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: It's a good question.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --with those four organizations?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For the Department.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, for the Department which is I think...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I mean, I think it's a great program because every year we get people coming out at our budget sessions that have been access that, but I was always curious as to how they decided how much one program got over another.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: May I answer that question as the former director?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's based on the request of the organization.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, but we've got, so if we're putting this money in without a request then they're going to have to decide or they just put out RFPs?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, instead of Women Helping Women requesting 500,000, maybe they'll request 700,000 or 800,000 because they'll know, they will know that there's more money in the budget.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, yeah, my question was like is it like an open RFP or they just have those select four groups that they divvy it up among?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: They use the same groups because those are the groups that are provide annual audits, all kinds of reports. rather than going with a brand new agency it's much easier to go with existing agencies.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. You don't have to ask that question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We don't have to transmit that question to the Department. Mahalo, OCS. Chair King, you pau? Okay. Member Lee, did you want to add anything more? Okay. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No questions at this time, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. So, revisit. Okay, any objections to revisit this item?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, thank you. Okay. Item number 12 is a proposal from Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I'm getting buried in paperwork over here. So, the ask is for \$200,000 to acquire a mobile hygiene unit that would provide wraparound services also. So, at yesterday's discussion, I think, Member King had mentioned to me or somebody texted me too and told me that there's one out in South Kihei --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: --so I wanted to see if we could get more information about that --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: --to see if maybe we don't need to do this that if we could just have it travel to the other side of the island would be very helpful.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, so we've been working on this mobile hygiene unit for South Maui because we have zero, well we have hardly any homeless resource facilities out there, but it's been funded and the RFP went out so they're actually, I think, they might have even picked a vendor to provide the unit to us and because we used it outside of the 1.5 million that was put aside for work force development housing, if we had used that it would have to stay in South Maui. So, it's not necessarily limited to South Maui,

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

but that's where it will basically live so we're trying to get additional private funding for it to hopefully fund a five-year program. So, I mean, I could and there's a non-profit fund on Oahu that's being, that Josh Green kind of is involved with so he was the one who told me about it. So, I can work with you on that if you want, but if you wanted to...this is through Ka Hale A Ke Ola. So if you wanted to talk to them about, you know, I think it was less than 100,000 for the actual unit and then you have to have a truck to tow it and, you know, you have to hire somebody to run it, so.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Right. So, I thought 200,000 might be just the approximate amount.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, that would probably get your through one year. So, what we're trying to do is get it funded for five years so that we don't have to do major fundraising every year. So, I think it's a good thing. You know, it doesn't hurt to have two or three of them on the island --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --for sure. And, you know, as we, hopefully, start taking of the problems, we can move them around.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Right, but I think my concern when I thought about this was that if we have some people running around with open wounds, open sores, and it starts to get transmitted to the greater population, then we're going to be in big trouble. But if we can take care of it, and nip things in the bud sooner rather than later, then I think we save ourselves a lot of money on the backend of things.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, and, Member Kama, one of the biggest issues for us in South Maui was having those facilities to attract people to come out of the shadows, you know, for hot showers, for, to use the bathroom, to plug in their cell phones and things like that because we can't offer them services if we can't identify them. So, you know, that's the first for us, line of defense of bringing people out and starting relationships with them so there's trust there.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Did, Member Kama, did you ever have a chance to meet with Lena Staton who does that mobile hygiene?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No I did not.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Is that the same program that you're working on or is it another?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well I think she's talking about the same type of unit. If you go through Ka Hale A Ke Ola, you know, it could probably be easier because you can do the add one, but yeah, the funding is good and I support the funding. It'd be good to try to have one entity be the main entity for these mobile hygiene units because they know how to run them. Yeah, they know how to do the program.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I'm very open to this. My comment would be, I would ask that the we check with the Chancellor Ms. Hokoana [sic], at the Maui Campus, because this County, this previous Council has supported County funding regarding their programs in dental hygiene and nursing, and I think maybe the State can now kokua back our community by using those that had benefited from the County's financial support to find a way to give back to their communities and provide some services, either through the mobile hygiene unit which could be the dental as well as those that we help provide financial support for the nursing program to give some of those other concerns that Ms. Kama has just brought up because the biggest concern that we thought we have conquered that is back in the United States is measles and it is a highly contagious disease and so I would say like we did with the dengue fever let's be a little bit proactive and I think the County can now ask for some return of its investment that we have provided for many years in the near past. So, I would say that I think the State and the university program can give back to this County for its previous support. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Chair King, did you want to add anything more? Okay. Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus, and I'm just hoping that regarding Mr. Hokama's request, the State is listening. I'm trying to be optimistic, but I'm praying that they do. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci, any questions?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, Members, do we have consensus on this or...yeah, okay. Consensus. Okay. Number 13 is Chair King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Lucky 13, actually this is a pretty small amount, it's like \$25,000 for Parks and Rec and this is the parking lot that we purchased last year in North Kihei which is basically scrub right now so it's just clearing the lot, putting gravel down, trash can, making access to the north end of the beach there at Waipuilani and then the aha moku is working on a partnership to kind of adopt the beach area and keep it up because there's a lot of native plants around there. So, this is just to kind of complete, make use of that purchase we made last year, and the public is really opposed to, at least in my community is really opposed to paving parking lots anywhere near the beach because of runoff. So, it's just gravel basically.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. I'll start with Member Sinenci and then work our way down. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I would like to support this project. You know, we understand it's South Maui parks that attract a lot of our visitor industry and having, being good hosts and having areas where we have lineal descendants that are kind of watching the place and providing some, just some basic codes of conduct behavior, I can support our community in that. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: In favor.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, I support this because I believe the community needs to know they have a park there, that they felt may have misunderstood that it was part of the private condominium component of property, but that is the County's property for its residents and this will help allow the residents to utilize their beach park. So, I'm in full support.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I support this project, I support beach access, and I support keeping people safe when they get to the beach.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Spoken like a real lifeguard. Good job. Yeah, so you know, we heard this when in last term all the testimonies, so this will really help alleviate

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

some of the pressure in the community of the having to give up the perception of giving up stalls and I think this addresses the needs of the community. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, Members, it sounds like we have consensus. Any objection to consensus?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Alright. Okay, number 14 we have a proposal from Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, thank you. This is a request for \$15,000 that would go through the Department of Planning and this is to provide administrative support for what has been loosely part of our community process for I'd say, from the '80s, 1980's. I'm attaching this to Planning because of the Lanai Planning Commission component that the Water Advisory Committee would give appropriate advice especially as it regards to the County's adopted Lanai Water Use and Development Plan and its implementation, and so since we have no County system, it wouldn't be fair of me to ask the Water Department to use its water funds for such a request. So, this is a General Fund request, \$15,000 again, tied to the Planning Department in support of our Planning Commission to receive appropriate water advice for the island. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. I'll start with Member Kama, and then I'll work my, our way down. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, just kind of curious, Member Hokama. So, if Lanai has their own water system and they do not have a Lanai water...you want like this advisory board for the Pulama Lanai? Is that what they would do or what kind of...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No, no, no. Lanai Water Company is a private water system, but since it provides potable domestic water they come under the PUC. They're a utility, okay. So, for Lanai, the good and bad, we basically have one owner with 97 percent of the island's ownership. They are the developer, but they're also the water company. This is a citizen, Lanai citizenry advisory group that represents our general community, including has a seat for the Lanai Water Company. This advisory group will provide appropriate comment to the Lanai Planning Commission on applications before it as well as impacts regarding the SMA zones of Lanai. This group its main focus is on the protection and enhancement of our one and only watershed

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

because basically we have one aquifer, and so we're very conservative. We cannot jeopardize our one source of drinking water, and again, this...previous Council has adopted one of the few, the Lanai Water Use and Development Plan and this group will help oversee its appropriate implementation that the Council has adopted.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: That answers my question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Pau?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. You know, I'm very supportive of communities taking charge of their own resources regardless of who technically owns what. My question would be, and I'm supportive of this proposal, my question would be are we also willing to recognize LWAC as an advisory body by ordinance?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you for a great question because Lanai is on my okole for this one. In the past the Council has adopted resolutions. It's gone through a couple of variations like my colleague Ms. Lee knows because the Water Department has gone between an administrative department and a quasi-independent department depending upon which Charter you looked at. What I'm going to, what I'm submitting to Council very shortly is a ordinance proposal to establish it by ordinance that this be an advisory committee. One of the benefits of course is that it is then required to fulfill all Sunshine and open meeting requirements including minutes, and therefore you know transparency will be very open and that is a decision that the Council will be making in the near future and upon submittal an appropriate as Chair Lee to have the appropriate meeting for consideration.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, in that case consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. I support this. I just had a question about how often they meet and does the fund go like to the Planning Department or is there...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Currently the acting Chair Mr. Butch Gima tries and gets some monthly meeting. Part of the difficulty has been that the Lanai Water Company representative has chosen not to attend. So, there's a concern, but we are also supported with efforts from CWRM and Mr. Charles Ice who went appropriate does fly to Lanai and participates representing the State's comments on advisory. So, I would say, you know, they try and hold regular meetings. It's always open to the community. They're very open about it, actually solicit community participation, and I'm planning it to put through Planning Department because again, the Lanai Planning Commission does have their regular scheduled commission meetings and Planning is there so our intent was the same day Planning Commission meets, prior to that, if appropriate they would have the advisory committee meeting ahead of it to prepare a proposal and comment to the Planning Commission on applications before the body. So, that was the intent and why we believe that it is more efficient and cost savings since Planning will be on the island.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, I was just wondering because I didn't, I know it's not a position. I just, in my mind thinking about the Planning Department complaining about having another thing. But how does, so how does the extra money get applied to alleviate their extra...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: This is to allow the Director Ms. Mclean to use these funds to take care of the miscellaneous --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, travel.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --administrative costs whether it be transcribing of the minutes, or posting of the scheduled meeting.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: This is funds that I believe will be sufficient currently to support the administrative needs from Planning since they would already need to post for the commission meetings.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama and Chair King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you. No, I support it. Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. Mr. Hokama, you realize you're not going to be very popular with the Planning Department, but I support you anyway.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair, and I can support the concept of this. Just more, just some questions as it relates to our own water board. Now, the

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

proposal is \$15,000 and give the Planning Department oversight, and if I recall from our GET meetings when we're during the confirmation process of our Director Mr. Pearson, he did, I believe Member Hokama did ask him that question and if he is committed and supportive of this and I recall Mr. Pearson saying he did. And now the question is as Mr. Hokama stated, he would come with a proposed ordinance for us to consider for the official formation of this advisory committee and a question would be does this go to my Committee or Member Lee's Committee, and that's I guess something the Council Chair would probably have to determine at a later point, but anyway just...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Or maybe planning. I don't know who gets the bouncing ball yeah, and I guess like our water board, there would be no specific requirements for certain members of this committee to have, you know, any background in water and so it's just more questions and is \$15,000 enough at this point because now, maybe I missed it, but I would assume this committee would meet, what once a month or like our water board and if so there are travel costs to consider because you would have to staff coming over from Maui yeah from the department. So I guess that's yet to be determined if \$15,000 is enough for administrative support. So, I guess all of those things have to be considered at some point.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I believe Member Hokama said that they would time is so that the Staff would already be on island for the Lanai Planning Commission --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --meetings.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: There's a cost savings.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, it would help to offset. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, so I guess 15,000 is sufficient then. Alright. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I have consensus on this.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. East Maui recognizes the challenges and issues with Lanai island and their water issues so we support this. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, I also support this and I know the Molokai community never got to finish our water use and development plan.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

So, maybe next year that'll be something that'll be on my priority list. So, if there are no objections, I will mark as consensus.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, consensus. Okay. Moving right along, number 15 is a proposal by Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. Members, this is new. It's important ag lands which is a plan, which Department of Planning to undertake, I'm asking for \$250,000 which was the amount that the Legislature had put into a bill, I don't know how many years ago, and the County of Maui never took advantage of it; Kauai did. And the important ag lands are a designation in terms of mapping and usage of actual land in Maui County that is good agriculture. As you all know, the 36,000 acres originally with HC&S of which HC&S or A&B did 27,000 and went through the process to designate their lands as important ag lands, and I think now with all the changes going on with agriculture, it might be a good time to take this on and complete the process so that important ag lands can be mapped, designated. And another important part about this is not only mapping where the ag lands are and where it can be agriculture, but also that there has to be like communication with the landowners and a process to go through for community input. So, that is that is why it's \$250,000 if we take it from start to end. It is not something that will be fast. It's something that will take time to do the mapping. There's a 2015 department, Hawaii State Department of Agriculture study that can be used and can be updated which will give us a running start for important ag lands as where to look at, and then the Legislature Chapter 205 of Hawaii Revised Statutes has, indicate some what they call incentives for important ag lands that can be looked at. So, there's communication that has to be done as well within our County departments and once this is established with Planning and we have to discuss with Real Property also but I have been in touch with our current ag Chair Mr. Sinenci and he is aware of this process and I would like to see this move forward and not wait for the Legislature to give us money to do it, and for us to kind of take steps forward so that we can, you know, do what we need to do for our ag lands. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. So, at this time I'll start with Member Sinenci and work our way down. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Yes, we did have a conversation with Member Sugimura and that is correct that we had anticipated some funding from the State which was not appropriated this year so I support this increase for important ag lands.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Lee?

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Question. I thought the State already designated and identified all of the ag, IAL on Maui?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura??

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, yeah, thank you for that question. So, there is a report that was done as I mentioned, and it needs to be updated and looked at. As you know, with all the changes going on with agriculture that there's land that, you know, a good example is across Baldwin Beach Park, you know, where a whole bunch of sugarcane land 300 acres of it was sold to a private individual. So there's changes like that going on. There's Mahi Pono which purchased 41,000 acres of which 27,000 is in there. So, it's not something that we can look at the study and say okay this is exactly it, but that study is a starting point for us and we would have to update that to look at where the important ag lands are and figure out a mapping system.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, I can see you wanting to know the new owners of various parcels, but the IAL runs with the land so I'm not sure exactly what you're looking for.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, what happens is that if I'm an owner of important ag land, and Tamara is an owner of land that she doesn't know she has important ag lands, that we as a community cannot just assume, okay, we're going to designate her as IAL and her land will stay in agriculture in perpetuity as an important ag land and then we would need to communicate. So, there's changes that have happened, you know, and that this process would allow us to get us up to speed with where we are and then take it the next steps in terms of the incentives that the State suggested that we would have to adopt as a County.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, the State gave us new mandates for identification of land?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No, not identification of land, incentives.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Incentives?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So...yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. So, I'm still confused. So, are we trying to, for this money, identify where the important ag land designations already are or are you anticipating looking for areas that could then be designated?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Both.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So you're looking for appropriate areas to add to the important ag lands in the State?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: If it...yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, do you know what the process is, I mean, does this include like the process for going through that or is this just identifying where we might want to?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, if I can go back to that State Department of Agriculture study so that'll give us a starting point, but somebody who understands agriculture and understands, you know, who actually is farming out there so knows the farmers as well as where these parcels are, would have to take a look at where these designations have been made and see if it's still current and then the next steps would do community outreach and establishing agreements, you know, as well as looking at the incentives that would have to be agreed upon through the County and then providing those incentives to the landowners. It's a process.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so almost kind of like what Hawaiian Island Trust does with their agriculture easements.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I'm not sure, but...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I'm not sure what they do.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Yeah, I'm just not sure about, I just don't know the process of adding, you know, that important ag land designation. So, I thought if that was part of that funding that would be interesting.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I wanted to follow up on Chair King's question, Member Sugimura. So, then would the County be initiating or like the...oh okay. Okay. Okay. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Currently, Chair, my understanding in participating in a designation, the current, the landowner usually applies for the designation. It goes before the State Land Use Commission, okay. Once designated, agreed, and designated by the Commission, it's in perpetuity. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But my question was, would we go and identify that and ask the landowner to initiate an IAL designation. Is that what this effort is?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Unless you get the authorization of the property owner, we cannot speak for the property owner and initiate the designation. That is not our land.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I mean, would we ask the, would the County ask the owner to initiate the process?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: We could, but my thing is again, yeah, depending upon the intent of what the current property owner plans to do with it. Some doesn't, do not see the benefit of having the designation. A&B did it for various reasons. Of course one was to protect the prime ag lands and again that goes under a different type of categorization or the ALISH categorization of land use and that was based on the old type of agriculture the State was in, corporate agriculture. So, grade A, B, and C is good for that type of production. You want to grow orchids and other things, that's not the right land. Okay, so it depends upon what you are trying to do. The State Land Use [sic], the Commission can then set conditions of what are some of the benefits and in the past the Legislature was willing to provide some financial assistance to the counties because this is a requirement of the State and if they want the counties to do the job, then it is a mandated thing that the State needs to compensate the County for doing the State's job, okay. So, that's our incentive if we do it, we shall be compensated by the State mandate to do their job, okay. I don't have a problem with us looking at the lands, but then I think we should get assurances from the State Land Use Commission that if we do this, will they follow through and do the appropriate completion of the process because it is not our decision, it is not our jurisdiction.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I guess, well I wasn't done, but that helps me a lot --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry, Member King, Chair King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --with my question because yeah, I was, I'm trying to figure out what is the benefit to us going out and identify the lands.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: We fulfilling the State's job.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, so what's the benefit to the County if we find a land that we think can be designated, would we, if we talked the owner into designating it, is there a benefit to Maui County or you were like, Mr. Hokama was saying, will we expect the State to pay for that identification?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Again, with the situation in Kunia and in Central Oahu, part of the designation condition was on allocation of water, okay. So, there's a lot of other components that may be part of the designation process and deliberations yeah, but normally the landowner initiates the request for designation, not a governmental body.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you, Chair. It helps.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair King. So, I don't know if my question was still answered though, Member Sugimura. Would the 250,000, I understand like part of it is for mapping, but the intention of the rest is to...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Communication with the community and once...we need to designate the incentives that would come with being an IAL for the landowner to understand what the total package is and getting the land designated. You know, I'm listening to this conversation and I will tell you that the reason why this came up as a priority was just because of the land that's being exchanged out there especially with the HC&S sale and Mahi Pono purchase, and that's what kind of put up a red flag for me like okay, you know, let's do something as a County if we think agriculture is important and to preserve those areas that could be designated as IALs. So, that's what, you know, maybe interested and the Legislature did have an item with, it did have a bill with no numbers next to, you know, or no numbers or dollars associated with it, but to take this process forward and I did also hear that because the \$250,000 when it was offered before Maui County never took advantage of it, I thought let's, you know, let's take advantage of and let's take something and do something so that maybe Legislature can see that, you know, we are sincerely, you know, trying to move forward with this. Members, I would be interested then if not \$250,000 because that was the amount that was inclusive of the community outreach and that portion of the IAL process that I would be interested then if Council would consider decreasing this instead of, you know 25,000, I mean, I still 250,000 decreasing it so that we can take care of the mapping portion and I would like to revisit this and maybe ask Planning Department if they could give me a number that we could use if Members would feel more comfortable instead of, you know, like I guess I'm hearing are we doing the State's job, but I think we need to take charge of our own destiny is what I'm trying to do.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, it is my understanding that the State Constitution requires the identification already.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So Article 11, Section 3 of the Hawaii State Constitution establishes a duty to conserve and protect agriculture lands, promote diversified agriculture, increase agriculture self-sufficiency, and assure the availability of agriculturally suitable lands and provide specialized protections for lands identifies as important ag lands. So, it's in our Constitution, and I think the Legislature has tried on maybe two occasions to get us to do what we're supposed to be doing, and I just would like us to take action and start doing it, and not wait for the Legislature to appropriate money for us, is what this action or the reason why I put this as a priority. So, I'm open to revisit and maybe get from Planning a number that could take us to how much would it cost to do the mapping portion and I don't know, Member Sinenci, would you be agreeable to that?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes, you know, we're also looking at, I know the Kauai County did the same thing by starting to map and just to plan for future food security. They also looked at and like Member Hokama said about water availability, soil

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

classifications, so different types of information to be important to keepings lands in ag designation. So, I would like to continue with that mapping process.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm going to finish up with Member Hokama, and then Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. You know, overall, I mean I have no objection to Ms. Sugimura's proposal because I think currently, because of Council's previous actions, our real property assessment program where we are now a global leader can do the mapping a lot easier now than in the past. We have the digitized mapping squared away, we have 3D capabilities, and I think Planning can, it will be an affordable component if this County desires that as an asset because I believe that it is within our system's ability now to perform and RPT has the software and has been recognized internationally the capacity of us to do this type of work, Chair, at a very good price. So, it may be to our advantages as far as overall Countywide plan and this would then assist us in making assessments with Water Department on where and how we should maintain our water resources whether it be in the reservoir program, additional ditch system, dual line, use capacities, I can see this as a beneficial tool for the County, not only the State regarding other components that agriculture needs to be viable. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I definitely support the intent. I just think that with so many variables that are out of our control, maybe we should revisit and just tighten it up like and clarify and consult with the Department. I support the intent, but I just you know, I think we need to clarify things a little bit. So, to revisit.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I concur with the, my colleagues and I do believe that we should protect our prime ag lands and just so that we should know where they are so that we don't do foolish things with our best lands. I was reading or looking on the news the other day, or was it the other week, I can't remember, but I think on Oahu they wanted to put a solar farm on some of the prime ag lands over on Oahu and I thought, why would you want to do that because once you put stuff on top of ag land, you can never ever go back and grow anything on that anymore. So, I want to make sure that we protect these lands for our future, for our keiki's futures. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Okay, Member Sugimura, is it going to be quick?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, no so --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --we can revisit and --

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --I will then take the questions. I think RPT, we can talk to RPT also because I forgot, yeah, we have that ESRI system through Real Property Tax.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: The ESRI as well as Planning. So, I'll...Finance and work on this. Thank you, Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, any objections to revisiting?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Mahalo. Okay, it is 3:56. Would the Members like to take up one more or two more?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, because yours is...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Two more?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Ready to go to Kihei.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Just remember that we are only on item 15 out of, what was it, 43 --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Wow.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --and we don't want to work on Saturday, yeah. Okay so --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Might have to.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --one or two more maybe? Yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can I take mine? Can we take mine because it'll take like ten seconds?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Where is Alice's?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can I go before you?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: There's Tamara as well. I would be okay with it. Tamara, would you be okay with Member Lee taking hers before yours?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: What a good sport. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Member Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, which is item number 18, I want to change that and move that million to...where the hell is it, Jesus...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Two?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I wanted to move it to...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, no, act...number 36. So 18 to 36. Consensus?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, move it. Move the 1 million.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, move the 1 million?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, 6 million.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. So we're going to strike number 18 and --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, strike it down.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --add it, add the --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: The money. The money.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --money. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: See. Fast yeah?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Plus 1 million. Okay, did Members get that? So we're striking number 18 and we're adding that 1 million to item number 36.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, one question please for Ms. Lee.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. So, I'm open to provide consensus to this, I just want to ask Ms. Lee one thing. Okay, besides the current narrative for 36 so I get that part, after the existing reservoirs, construct new reservoirs, but are you still looking at new sources?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, because they haven't done it for 20 years so I figure what's another 21 years? No, really. Seriously they haven't been doing new wells because of "Show Me the Water." So, I'm sure they don't have any new wells, and it'll take a lot more than a million dollars.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah to construct I would agree, but if this then may be part of trying to calculate what is the current then carrying capacity and what is our current water supply, I can't support that because I think that is critical for Council to make good decisions is understanding what is our current capacity to provide potable water for our people. So, I just ask that if you consider that to be within your parameters of funding.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We'll be bringing up that subject matter, but no, at the rate these guys are moving, I mean, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I hear you. I hear you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: --molasses is faster.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. Okay. So, do you want to try to take item number 16 or 17? Sixteen or 17? It's four o'clock.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, alright. Okay, maybe tomorrow we'll be a little more expeditious in getting through our matrix so that we don't have to work on Saturday yeah. Okay. Okay. So, we left off on item 16 on our matrix and that's where we'll start off from tomorrow. Okay, if there are no objections, I will now adjourn our meeting. It is four o'clock on April 9th, the Economic, Development, and Budget Committee is now adjourned and we'll be seeing everyone in Kihei tonight at 6:00. Okay. Yeah. No objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, no six o'clock for the public. Mahalo, Chair King. Okay, ready? Meeting adjourned. . . . *(gavel)* . . .

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 9, 2019

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

ADJOURN: 4:00 p.m.

APPROVED:



KEANI N.W. RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ, Chair
Economic Development and Budget Committee

edb:min:190409:jg

Transcribed by: Jaydee Giron

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

April 9, 2019

CERTIFICATE

I, Jaydee Giron, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 2nd day of May, 2019, in Kahului, Hawaii



Jaydee Giron