

**DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND
PLANNING COMMITTEE**
Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

May 24, 2023

Online Only via BlueJeans

CONVENE: 1:36 p.m.

PRESENT: VOTING MEMBERS:
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Chair
Councilmember Nohelani U'u-Hodgins, Vice-Chair (In 2:38 p.m.)
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member (Out 1:39 p.m.)

EXCUSED: VOTING MEMBERS:
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member

STAFF: Paige Greco, Legislative Analyst
James Krueger, Senior Committee Analyst
Richard Mitchell, Legislative Attorney
Maria Leon, Committee Secretary
Jean Pokipala, Council Services Assistant Clerk
Lei Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk
Nālani Fujihara, Hawaiian Language Communications Specialist

Laura McDowell, Executive Assistant to Councilmember U'u-Hodgins
Susan Clements, Executive Assistant to Councilmember U'u-Hodgins
Jared Agtunong, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Cook
Evan Dust, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kama
Dawn Lono, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Sinenci
Arthur Suyama, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Sugimura
Axel Beers, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Johnson

Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lānaʻi Residency Area Office
Mavis Oliveira, Council Aide, East Maui Residency Area Office
Jade Rojas-Letisi, Council Aide, Makawao-Haʻikū-Pāʻia Residency Area Office

ADMIN.: Michael Hopper, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation
Counsel (DRIP-2(4), -2(5))
Joshua Cooper, Environmental Coordinator, Office of Innovation and
Sustainability, Office of the Mayor (DRIP-2(4), -2(5))
Kaiea Medeiros, Regenerative Agriculture, 'Ai Pono, and Wai Systems Specialist,
Office of Innovation and Sustainability, Office of the Mayor (DRIP-2(4), -2(5))

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

Aaron “Tuki” Drake, Development Specialist, Office of Innovation and Sustainability, Office of the Mayor (DRIP-2(4), -2(5))
Maria Ornellas, Grants Specialist, Office of Innovation and Sustainability, Office of the Mayor (DRIP-2(4), -2(5))
Cynthia Lallo, Senior Executive Assistant, Office of the Mayor (DRIP-2(4), -2(5))
Herman Andaya, Administrator, Emergency Management Agency (DRIP-2(4), -2(5))

OTHERS: Hannah Shipman (DRIP-2(4))
Alex de Roode (DRIP-2(4))
John Q. Public (DRIP-2(4))
Faith Chase (DRIP-2(4))
Lori Buchanan (DRIP-2(4))

(3) additional attendees

PRESS: Akakū: *Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR PALTIN: . . . *(gavel)*. . . Will the Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning Committee come to order. The time is now 1:36. If everyone can please silence their cell phones or other noise-making devices, that will help our cause. Members, under the Sunshine Law, if you are not in the Council Chamber, please identify by name who, if anyone, is in the room, vehicle, or workspace with you today. Minors do not need to be identified. Also, please see the last page of the agenda for information on meeting connectivity. My name is Tamara Paltin, and I'm broadcasting live and direct from the Council Chambers on the 8th Floor at 200 South High Street. Our Committee Vice-Chair, Nohelani U‘u-Hodgins, will be a little bit late. And aloha ‘auinalā, Councilmember Tom Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Good morning, Chair...or good afternoon, Chair. Aloha.

CHAIR PALTIN: Good afternoon. Councilmember Kama asked to be excused. From the Island of Moloka‘i, we have Councilmember Keani Rawlins-Fernandez. Aloha ‘auinalā.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha ‘auinalā, Chair. Aloha ‘auinalā, Members, and to those joining us from Moloka‘i nui ahina. I'm at the Moloka‘i District office alone on...alone here in the office. Mahalo, Chair. Oh, we have no testifiers at...at this moment. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: And from East Maui, we have Councilmember Shane Sinenci. Aloha ‘auinalā.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha ‘auinalā kākou. For the record, I am broadcasting from my home office in Hāna; finally made it home. And I'm here by myself, and there's no testifiers at the Hāna District office.

CHAIR PALTIN: Awesome. And last, but not least, we have Councilmember Yuki Lei Sugimura. Aloha ‘auinalā.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good afternoon. Nice to see all of you, looking forward. Thanks.

CHAIR PALTIN: Did you want to disclose your location --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- and --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, there's no...I'm in Kula at my home office, and there's no one in the room with me.

CHAIR PALTIN: Perfect. Thank you. And our non-Committee Members today are Gabe Johnson, and Council Chair Alice Lee. While they're not required to attend, they're welcome to join us at any time. Our Land Acknowledgement Statement: This meeting of the Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning Committee of the Maui County Council is located on the traditional 'āina of Kānaka 'Ōiwi, who never ceded their sovereignty to the United States. We recognize that her Majesty Queen Lili'uokalani yielded the Hawaiian Kingdom under violent duress and protest to the U.S. to avoid the bloodshed of her people. We further recognize that Hawai'i remains an illegally occupied nation-state by the U.S. as documented in a 2021 scholarly article for the National Lawyers Guild review by Andrew Reid, Adjunct Professor of Law at the University of Denver, Sturm College of Law. Generations of Kānaka Maoli, and their knowledge systems have sustainably cared for Hawai'i, and continue to do so. We are grateful to occupy this space, and learn the ways in which we can contribute. As a Committee, we seek to support the varied strategies, and the indigenous people of Hawai'i are using...that the indigenous peoples of Hawai'i are using to protect their land and their communities, and commit to dedicating time and resources to working in solidarity. From the Administration we have Deputy Corp. Counsel Michael Hopper; from Maui Emergency Management Agency we have Administrator Herman Andaya; from the Mayor's Office, Office of Innovation and Sustainability we have Joshua Cooper and Kaiea Medeiros. I will allow Mr. Hopper, Mr. Andaya, Mr. Cooper, and Mr. Medeiros to serve as resource persons to the Committee, under Rule 18(A) of the Rules of the Council because they have special expertise on today's agenda items. They are Government officials, and not paid lobbyists. Our Committee Staff today, we have Committee Secretary Maria Leon, Legislative Analysts Paige Greco and James Krueger, Legislative Attorney Richard Mitchell, and Assistant Clerk Jean Pokipala. On the agenda today we have two items; Status Report of the Draft Maui County Climate Action And Resiliency Plan (DRIP-2(4)), as well as County Of Maui Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment (DRIP-2(5)). For each item we will take testimony after opening remarks for the presentation.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

ITEM 2(4): STATUS REPORT ON THE DRAFT MAUI COUNTY CLIMATE ACTION AND RESILIENCY PLAN

CHAIR PALTIN: So, for DRIP-2(4), under Rule 7(B) of the Rules of the Council, the Committee intends to receive a presentation and discuss matters relating to a status report on the draft Maui County Climate Action and Resiliency Plan. The Committee may receive a presentation from the Office of Innovation and Sustainability, under the Office of the Mayor, on the draft Maui County Climate Action and Resiliency Plan, and may discuss other related matters. No legislative action will be taken. So, as we start off this new Administration, we just wanted to get a status update on the CARP, which is also known as the Climate Action and Resiliency Plan, and lay out a framework and timeline, and just see what the next steps are. Mr. Cooper or Mr. Medeiros, do you have any opening comments before we take public testimony?

MR. COOPER: Chair, we have a few opening comments.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Go ahead.

MR. COOPER: All right. Aloha, kākou. It's an honor to be here today. Thank you so much for hosting us, and we also appreciate the land acknowledgment recognizing inherent dignity of Kānaka Maoli people in this sovereign nation of Hawai'i. We really take our work on a serious note because we know it rests with the self, but also to the system. And as we look at this Climate Action Resiliency Plan, one exciting part we'd like to premier is our brand-new logo, so...and that was just created by our amazing person in our office, Tuki Drake, and it really looks at our holistic perspective of how we see our role in the Office of Innovation and Sustainability. Really, we know the people of Maui Nui are in one wa'a. We know that we have to have that sense of urgency of heading in the right direction together because we face an existential climate threat to all of humanity. And we take that very serious. We believe every day, as we work, every molecule of carbon matters that we can reduce, every fraction of degree matters on how we make sure we don't go above the 350 parts per million. And so, as we look at what's going on, what we would want to talk with everyone today is sort of an overview of where the Climate Action and Resiliency Plan as...is at now, but also the opportunities on how we can go forward. And really, our goal is to move from a position of analysis to application and action of what we can look at, how we can organize in the two bodies that did exist to create this plan, the community and also the Resiliency Hui that consisted of the Directors and the Deputy Directors. So, we see that it's an important document, but now we see we have to move from a document and data to a direct action so that we can make a difference in the lives of the people of Maui Nui. I'll hand it over to my colleague, and then we'll go into some more detail.

MR. MEDEIROS: All right. Mahalo, I'm grateful to be here. And so, just briefly...so, aloha, again. My name is Kaiea Medeiros, and my focus is regenerative agriculture, 'ai pono, and wai systems which is directly interconnected and intersects with our Climate Action and Resiliency Plan, as well as our Vulnerability Assessment. So, we'll go, of course, deeper into our CARP and Vulnerability Plan, but I'm just grateful to have this space to share my mana'o on...on how regenerative agriculture, and our ancestral sciences, and

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

technologies that we utilize to address climate change in our endemic ecology, and how we manage our economy is going to benefit our 'āina and...and our kama'āina.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Did you want to do more, or should I take testimony now?

MR. COOPER: We can go through that if you'd want. Or if you prefer to have testimony first, we're flexible with...with you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. I guess let's do the...the slideshow so that folks have something to testify more on.

MR. COOPER: Sounds great.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

MR. COOPER: We can definitely do that. So, building on what my colleague shared, we really want to talk to you today about the Climate Action Resiliency Plan, where it is, but more important, provide a timeline of ways that we can go forward. We believe it's...it's at the stage where it's a beautiful brochure, and it provides a lot of information. And what we really want to go to, though, is a blueprint so that we can share that with Committee Members...with Councilmembers, and see which Committees it falls into, and how we can make sure that it's not a report that'll sit on tables, but that we can really rally around. So, we have a couple of timelines. The first timeline we're looking at is, there will be a voluntary local review at the United Nations around the UN Sustainable Development Goals in July. We believe the report as it is--and the people that we talk to like the report. But when we look, and have met with two-thirds of the people that have served before, it had a very low signature rate. And it sort of came in at the...we could call it an election cycle, and there wasn't a giant amount of support there, there was not that wave. What we believe we can do, and how we want to move forward, is that we will actually organize a month, beginning June 15th, to get advice and comments on the document, open up widely to anyone that did participate, or didn't, and collect that input. From there, though, we also will be getting together the people who did serve, but also casting the net a little bit wider and bringing more people in. We're at the Energy Summit this morning, and the keynote speaker talks about the...the links between disability rights, indigenous people's rights, climate crisis, and all of those aspects. And if we look at who was serving, we definitely know we can get a handful of new people that really do also care tremendously about the issue, and breathe some new life into this document. We also believe, though, the area of focus that we would look at is meeting with the Directors and Deputy Directors, as well as multiple meetings with different Committees to see how...what the interest is on implementation. So, what we really want to do is take some time, get everybody's input on it, make sure everybody sees the document. Then keep the committees that did exist, the community one, as well as the Resilience Hui consisting of all the departments, but definitely involve and include each Committee of the Council, see where it falls into, and then work together so that we can actually build out. Because if you go through the document, I've seen it on a couple people's desks, it's a little short on the action. And so, what we really want to do is build on this analysis, and go into the action to look at the issues that matter

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

most to people, and that's where we see ourselves going forward. And so, we would definitely be open to September as a time to see where we're at, and people feel like ooh, we are actually getting a lot more input. And then all the way up until this year to see how everyone's involved. And we'd much rather...not just adopt something, but build momentum so that we can actually know that this moment in time, there's a movement to make sure that this report impacts people's lives in Maui Nui. Because we can see, for many people, shoreline erosion, we're being hit the hardest, losing the most of all the other islands. So, we know how important this is. And we're so glad, in the Office of Innovation and Sustainability, some people are like, ooh, is this a big shift? It's actually not a shift. I think we're building on and bridging what existed before. And really, it's 'āina first. It's understanding our relationship to the land. And we look, first, at ecology, and then equality, equity, and economy, and understand a holistic framework that maybe you hadn't before. We don't think environment's over here, and economy's here, we have to see them all in one lens. I'll stop there and then we'll get into the slide? Any one thing you'd like to add? Okay. We can go through. Hit it James. All right. So, looking at Our Collective Voices: To Understand Its Most Pressing Challenges. If you look at that information and see what's going on, the numbers, and the statistics, and what was done was significant. There were many community meetings, there were many different sessions, and those are all important. But when we talked to people, and had some discussions, it was exciting, but there was a lot that people didn't remember. It could have been a great holiday season. But we consider the CARP a living document, and we believe we can build on these community engagement examples that took place, these meetings that happened, focus groups, surveys, a couple of open houses, and other activities. We believe we can build on that, and add to that voice, and include more. What we've done in the new Administration, we've already been to Moloka'i, we've already been to Hāna, and we have included, and talked about these issues there, and see them as part of a larger conversation. Slide. If you're looking at the Guiding Principles, that's pretty clear because it's what many of...people have campaigned on, but then also coordinate their lives around; active stewardship, restoration of our natural environment, and really, an approach of future generations. I think that's absolutely important. I just spent Monday with 100 youth at Īao Intermediate. They wrote ten letters to the Mayor covering a whole rainbow of issues. And instead of just responding to a letter, we actually did a Environmental Justice and Climate Action Assembly, and they've agreed to do their own voluntary local review, sharing what their perspectives are on the sustainable development goals, plus the Aloha+ Challenge. So, we're excited, and believe that's absolutely essential. We have to look at reducing greenhouse gas emissions to go and achieve that net negative carbon. That's the aspect that I'm talking about earlier, that every molecule of carbon matters, and every fraction of degree matters. If we look at that, and we take actions together, we can make sure it doesn't get as bad as people say it could. And every action all of us take makes a huge impact. Also, looking at that aspect on the next one, optimizing resiliency, and collaborating local cultural practices, and ecological knowledge and values, advancing social equity and community inclusion, growing a thriving circular economy, sustainably addressing current and future infrastructure needs, and community, both institutional and individual action, and local implementation. This is where we think we need to go as we go forward. And those, in a way, are guiding us as we take the actions for government. These are the two frameworks that are known. I was just

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

yesterday on Kaua'i with the Aloha+ Challenge with the Local2030 Island Hub, as well as the Hawai'i Green Growth. And what's exciting about the Aloha+ Challenge is, it was an example of counties coming together. And excitingly enough, at the same time at the global level, the world was working from the Rio+20 Earth Summit to say, what framework do we need to make sure that we can make sure that we take care of the five Ps; people, prosperity, planet, partnership, and peace. And these 17 goals cover a whole array. It's ending poverty, zero hunger, good health and well-being, quality education, gender equality, clean water sanitation, renewable energy, that clean energy revolution we're looking at, good decent work and economic growth, innovation and infrastructure, also looking at reducing inequalities among all peoples at Maui Nui, but then sustainable cities and communities, responsible consumption and production, climate action is quite crucial under 13, 14 is life below land in the water, 15 is life on land, 16 is peace, justice, and strong institutions--and that's why it's an honor to participate with the County Council today--and 17 is partnerships. And I believe that's the way we'll have to move forward to make sure that these six Aloha+ Challenge items and the 2030 agenda of the United Nations can be achieved here on Maui. The good news is, it's in our ethos. If you grew up in Hawai'i, you understand how dear our island is, and that we'd better understand, also, that we live on an island, Earth. So, this, in a way, is a way to move forward. One of the reasons of why we propose the three timelines and are very open to discuss is, as we shared these with the people who had been involved in both groups that were working on this report, there wasn't a high recognition of all of them. That, as a professor, made me think, ooh, maybe we're...we haven't gone or done as much as we hoped we had. And I think it's better to take the time, and I think you...you build the trust, and then we can truly transform our society, as opposed to thinking, you should know already. We have to make sure everybody knows these. And the exciting part is, the UN will review Hawai'i, and there will be a voluntary local review in July. So, this Climate Action Resilience Plan, the CARP, and the voluntary local review can reinforce one another. We can take the action here on the ground, but also share it globally. And just last month, since we're talking about indigenous rights, we met with our sister city in Rapa Nui, and we had a Preparatory Pacific meeting sharing how we're both doing on these 17 global goals. So, we also see in Office of Innovation and...and Sustainability that we can pivot and partner with the Pacific because that's really where we're based, and we know we can learn from one another, and have...or since time immemorial. Next slide. Looking at that aspect there of strategies and actions, it's looking at true reality of what funding it'll take, what programs will have to be developed and implemented, policies and ordinances, and how we can adopt and move forward with community partners. We really believe we can coordinate, and get the wa'a headed into the right direction, and look, in a way, what's that low-hanging mango that's ripe that we can do that you see in your Committees that's possible. And then what's going to take a little bit of time? So, this blueprint, as I called it earlier, or this road map, will guide us to where we need to go. And I believe it'll also inspire people. We also have the Aloha+ Dashboard, and Maui is participating with all of the other four counties. It's kind of a cool culture of coopetition. Everybody says when they've done something good, how about you, where you at. And Maui is good. We've...we're the first to adopt the Fossil Fuel Non-Proliferation Treaty from your Council last time. And we know Kaua'i loves to talk how great they're doing with renewable energy; they haven't adopted that. So, it's a great way to learn from each other between

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

the Councils and seeing what we can do. We believe the...what we have here is 25 climate mitigation strategies and 83 supporting actions. We believe we actually need a lot more analysis on those actions and what we can do next. We also believe the 22 resilient strategies and 84 supporting actions can be better prepared and build resilience. But we know the more time we spend looking at it, and really coordinating, understanding what we're aiming towards as we're facing an existential threat to humanity, probably the biggest one we've ever faced, that we can do it better, and that's why we're glad to begin the conversation now, in May. Next slide. Looking at mitigation strategies and action. Here's some of them that have been brought forward by community stakeholders. This is...is just a little bit of the science. I'm also fortunate to be one of Al Gore's Climate Reality Project Trainers. The main thing that we have to look at and we have to understand is what we were looking at earlier. Every molecule of carbon that we do not release is important, every fraction of degree matters. And we can show that we are moving to take action, but we have to take action quicker, and more holistically, and comprehensively that then changes the way that we've worked so far in the past. Next slide. We can do this in many different ways. We've got a couple of ideas going to showcase what we are doing, and how we can do it. It's two points. One is looking, of course, at energy, and there's a clean energy revolution, looking at what's coming down from the Federal level. Also looking at the aspect of how we live, transportation, and also living at each household. We can look at all those aspects. And the exciting part is, the knowledge is here. The technology exists, we just have to be willing to be creative, courageous, comprehensive, and compassionate to our constituents to be able to educate, explain, to then mobilize, and realize what has been laid out in this plan, but more what we can do together. Next slide. Looking at this important aspect and seeing where we're going, you can see how much energy is being used, where the most carbon is being released. And what we're looking at now, and one of the things we're looking at the Energy Summit that's taking place that we're excited to run back down to is, how can we get to net zero? How can we reduce all of our carbon? Because we live in a special place. We know in Mauna Loa, they actually measure that for the entire world. And so, we actually believe...we probably...we love this clock, but we should have a climate clock letting us know how far we have until we hit irreplaceable and irreversible harm for future generations. But also, to see how we're headed in the right direction with the parts per million and the carbon that's being measured at the top of Mauna Loa. It is a dire situation, but this is a beginning that we can build on going forward. Next slide. Looking at the overview of action and certain aspects of what we can take place, there's a couple things that we've been looking at. From the personal, we're looking at issuing a Kuleana Carpool Karaoke Challenge...people getting in the car, singing their favorite songs, but then talking about how they're reducing their carbon, how their greenhouse gases are lower, but actually getting people to talk about. You can see that with the recent American Idol performances, being priced out of paradise; all these issues are connected. But getting people to talk and understand that actually when we drive, if we actually drove together, if we take these actions--working with the university, we had a film showing just this week, getting everyone to talk, and make it a popular conversation of how we're reducing our carbon, and making it simple to understand is absolutely crucial. Looking at exploring biodiesel, and looking at that in some...encouraging free transportation. We want to really hear from you, and get ideas from the community. So, we think that June

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

15th opening date, that's what we're looking for. And that's also the idea of the voluntary local review, what can we do to meet these 17 goals on the ground here in Maui Nui. Well, those are some of those aspects, and we can share a couple other ideas. But it goes down to even that aspect of composting food waste, and not being afraid to see what other places are doing, and if it could be applicable to us. And it's seeing the good examples that are being done already in Maui Nui, and scaling those up. Next slide. Looking at that beautiful slide there, the County of Maui Operations...oh, let's just go to Mitigation, or Resilient Strategy and Actions. Oh. Oh. Either way we're going...no, let's just go back to...no . . .(inaudible). . . that was good. That was fun to drive, vroom, vroom. You and I together, James. That's great. Okay. We'll stick there. All right. So, on pillars. First one there is securing our people. We got six strategies and potential 21 actions, those are in front of you. Also, securing our infrastructure, there's six strategies and 32 actions. Also, on securing our natural systems, five strategies, 17 actions, and funding, and implementation. Next one. So, looking at securing our people, we can look and go through these, but this is just an overview of how we're looking at that. That also, then, leads into what we're talking about the Vulnerability Assessment as well. We've been looking at housing as a human right. We've been looking at all these issues in a comprehensive manner. We know when we hear what our Governor is talking about that people who are on the street are...actually, their health is reduced drastically. We also know, in a way, healthy people, healthy planet. So, it's pulling all those aspects together and coordinating campaigns to make sure that the constituents of Maui Nui know that they can be catalysts for change moving forward. We know we...there's building energy. Just...no, it's cool. You...it's our first dance. You're doing great, James, absolutely perfect. And so, these are examples of looking at building energy, looking at what we can do to make sure that we can have more renewable energy that taps into Federal funds that's available, that's also accessible to people, that we can make sure that we move forward in that direction. And in that picture, you can actually see the windmills over there, you can see the solar, and we can see how we can move forward. We can see even here, electric vehicles in our own fleet. So, we can all take it...small steps daily, but what we have to look at through each Committee is realizing how it all fits together. How people can take action. How planting the trees takes steps, and how we can move forward. Next. Those are some of the strategies that we're looking at. We know there's a ten-minute time, so we want to definitely go through those. Next one, James. And it's all available to read. Transportation, that's an exciting one there. That's the EV station in front. On the most recent trip that we went to Hāna, we took the new EV vehicle that was from the previous Administration, an F-150. Goes all the way out to Hāna and back with one charge. So, when people say, how can this exist? Does it...how would we ever do it? People seeing that car...that truck in front of them, it's not something of the future. It's here today, and the climate crisis is also here today for the people of Tuvalu, and other places. So, we can green our fleet. We can work with each person to realize that we can live more simply, and then make a significant contribution for the climate crisis as a people. Moving forward. Next one. Securing our infrastructure, that's absolutely important. That's sustainable development goal number 9. Looking at that going forward--next slide--we got the different strategies that people can take to look at what is possible. This is where we link that aspect of housing. This is where we link that aspect of the areas that we take care of. We know, living on an island, how valuable all these

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

resources are, and water is life. We're having another film next week called, "*Awake*," looking at that aspect of water as a human right. And it's getting people to then understand...and even looking at material, when you turn on the spigot in your house, where did that come from? What did it take to get there? And looking at what Kaiea and I work on, we actually focus on the whole ahupua'a, from all the way up the ridge down to the reef, and making sure that if we're not planting trees, if we're not taking care of the 'āina, we will not have what we need to go forward. But the best part is, that model has existed, it's still there. Just yesterday on Kaua'i, unearthing the fishponds and bringing those back to life. We can do better, and it is exciting to see what's possible. Going forward.

MR. MEDEIROS: Yeah. So, just touching on infrastructure too, and how it's related to regenerative agriculture, and how our Vulnerability Assessment describes us...us being disaster...dependent on imported foods. One of the biggest challenges or gaps in our 'ai pono sovereignty or food security is the infrastructure relative to, of course, our endemic ecology, how we need to ultimately regenerate our native forest. But also from a processing standpoint relative to infrastructure, whether it's wash or packing facilities, processing facilities for our proteins, for our livestock, and then also aggregate and distribution of our local food. So, those are also critical infrastructures that we need to implement so that we can be more resilient. Yeah. So, agriculture, land use, natural resources. So, again, real briefly, just because of time, but when we're referring to regenerative agriculture, we're looking at the entire framework of our system, how we house our...our mahi'ai, our farmers, providing them economically opportunities to live on their farms, as well as provide them with health insurance. And then also, just from an actual cultivation standpoint, regenerative agriculture strives to be more reciprocal and symbiotic with our endemic ecology versus the contemporary Western industrial agricultural model. And then we're really looking at the entire system to build resiliency from an 'ai pono and food security standpoint, where we're looking at production, processing, distribution, and then also composting...so, really closing that loop relative to our food security. Yeah, and I'll speak real quick on our natural systems. So, as we spoke about earlier, the...the sort of biggest challenge and opportunity that we have here in Hawai'i is the regeneration of our native endemic sources, and...and our forests. So, right now on Maui, for example, we have less than 10 percent of our native endemic ecosystem that's still intact today, mostly because of overdevelopment or industrial agriculture. So, as Josh alluded to earlier, really the biggest changes that we can make to develop a resilient community is starting with the self, and understanding your kuleana within yourself, and then how that affects 'āina, for example, growing native plants at your home or residence and how that affects our endemic ecosystem. Yeah, and that's a big one too. Again, just real brief though, our invasive species that's currently from the entities and individuals that we spoke with, and also doing that work for a while now, invasive species, whether it's deer, ungulates, or invasive plant species, that...that is something that we're going to have to really support our community to really develop our capacity to be able to remove invasive species, and utilize it as a resource, but then also regenerate our...our native endemic ecosystem as well.

MR. COOPER: One last thing before we get into the vulnerability, that's, I think, a good place to stop before we get into the next one, is the nature-based solutions. So, that's

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

something we've seen around the world, and we see communities sharing those examples, engaging, and then being able to really create from the place-based examples of what's possible to protect our planet. So, just being there with Pu'u Kukui Watershed, and partnering with them, discussing how many plants, how many trees we could actually plant. We believe we could do a million trees of koa, planting canoes for the future, as well as a'ali'i. And everyone could then make that possible. We know we can do that. And as we restore that, then we believe the future generations will also see what's possible, and we can do a lot in this generation to make sure that we're in a place that it looks more of what we hope we could pass on to our keiki. Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you so much for those...opening presentation and opening remarks. Now, we are moving into the testimony portion of the meeting. So, public testimony for DRIP-2(4), I believe we have four testifiers signed up at this time. Oral testimony via phone or video conference will be accepted. Please note that if you are signed in, you are on the list to testify even if you did not request to testify. Please let Staff know in chat if you are signed on and do not intend to testify. Testifiers wanting to provide video or audio testimony should have joined the online meeting via the BlueJeans link or phone number noted on today's agenda. Written testimony is encouraged, and can be submitted via the eComment link at mauicounty.us/agendas. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes. If you are still testifying beyond that time, I will kindly ask you to complete your testimony. Unless you want to testify anonymously, please clearly identify your name, organization, and items you would like to testify on in the chat. We ask that you state your full name, but if you prefer to testify anonymously, Staff will identify and refer to you as "Testifier" and assign you a number. Please also indicate the agenda items, or item, you are testifying on. You may indicate in the chat if you do not wish to testify; however, chat should not be used for discussion or comments. Please be courteous to others by turning off your video and muting your microphone while waiting for your turn to testify. Once you are done testifying, or if you do not wish to testify, you can view the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, or mauicounty.us/agendas. Thank you all for your cooperation. Before proceeding, may I please request that everyone keep their microphones muted unless it is your time to speak. Decorum must be maintained at all times. Any person who behaves in a manner that disrupts, disturbs, or impedes the orderly conduct of any Council meeting or Committee meeting can, at the discretion of the presiding officer or majority of present Councilmembers, be ejected or banned from Council meetings, or Committee meetings, or if participating remotely, muted, or dropped from the meetings. Examples of disruptive behavior include heckling, shouting, use of profanity, threatening or slanderous remarks made to any member of the Council Staff, or general public. It'll be considered a breach of decorum for members of the public to use the chat for anything other than testimony sign up. Staff has been monitoring individuals joining today's meeting by phone, and by video, and we will do our best to take each person up in an orderly fashion.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON ITEM 2(4) . . .

CHAIR PALTIN: At this time, the first person wishing to testify will be Hannah Shipman,

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

followed by Alex de Roode. Ms. Shipman, it's your turn to testify, and we're ready for you.

MS. SHIPMAN: Thank you, Chair. Aloha, Councilmembers. It's so great to see you all again. I'm the former Green Building and Resilient Housing Specialist for the County of Maui, and I'm so ecstatic to see that the CARP draft is back on the agenda, and hopefully we'll get a...something going. I just wanted to make a couple of comments about it because it is a passion project of mine, I loved working on it, and you know, I'm excited to see where this Administration takes it. There's so much that can happen so, you know, can't wait to see that. I wanted to make a couple notes about the planning process. Obviously, a lot goes into a Climate Action and Resiliency Plan, and we got to see some of that today. A lot of research, our greenhouse gas inventories, and then the community outreach. I feel, you know, was...oh, there can always be more community outreach with everything, but thought that it was a really good foundation for this plan between our CARPAC, which is a group of, you know, different people in different fields that were able to give their perspective, and their expertise, and our Resiliency Hui made up of, you know, all our great Staff, and directors, and employees at the County, as well as our individual interviews we did in different communities, the workshops that were both virtual and in person on the different islands. Obviously being three islands makes it challenging, and so, being able to really go in person, you know, added a lot of benefit. And during COVID was a whole 'nother struggle, but there's definitely a lot of great community voices. And a lot of the framework that was developed for that plan was based off of, you know, research, and community, and more community than anything. You can do as much research as you want, and we had that down. And then going into community really solidified the actions and strategies. And so, it's definitely a good starting point and a good framework, and I'm excited to see where the next Administration takes it. I just wanted to highlight some of the great community work that was done so far on this draft plan. So, thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Ms. Shipman. Members, any questions for the testifier? Seeing none. We'll see you after the next presentation. Next up we have --

MS. SHIPMAN: Great. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Next up we have Alex de Roode, and Mr. de Roode will be followed by Mr. Anonymous, who will be followed by Faith Chase.

MR. DE ROODE: Aloha, Chair. Aloha, Councilmembers.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha.

MR. DE ROODE: My name is Alex de Roode. Aloha. Good to see all of you. I'm the former Energy Commissioner for the County of Maui, and I'll echo what my former colleague, Hannah, just said, that we're really excited to see this back on a Council Committee agenda, and to see the new Office of Innovation and Sustainability taking the torch and...and carrying that on towards implementation. Just a few comments I'd like to provide. One is, again, to echo what Ms. Shipman just shared, that there was extensive

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

community outreach conducted. For about a year and a half period, we worked on this plan. And prior to that, and...and kind of concurrently, the Countywide Vulnerability Assessment was also underway. And the Vulnerability Assessment is really the basis on which the resiliency part of the plan is based. All right. So, understanding what are our climate change vulnerabilities Countywide, and then the Resiliency Plan is, how do we adapt and respond to those vulnerabilities. So, they're very linked, those two. One is an assessment, the other is a...is an action plan. I'll also mention that there...as Ms. Shipman said, there was a lot of research, and also reaching out to other communities to see what they have done, and what worked, what didn't work. So, we looked at what City and County of Honolulu had done on their resiliency strategy, and then their follow-up Climate Action Plan. We're the first County in the State to do an integrated plan, climate action and resiliency plan, and really looking to see how those are...are integrated, right, the...we have to be considering both of those aspects as we plan for the future. What I...what I would leave with in my comments is really to reemphasize the sense of urgency. That a plan like this is a starting point, it's meant to be a living document. It's not meant to sit on a shelf. In the plan itself, one of the recommendations and actions is that the plan be revisited yearly with updates provided to County Council, and that at least once every five years, the plan be updated based on additional community feedback, and ongoing evolution of this field, and conditions that we face as a result of climate change, which are evolving, right, so we have to continue to assess. So, it's this approach of continuous improvement, continuous assessment. So, not to consider these documents as static, but really a starting point, and the sooner we can get them adopted, and start moving towards action, we can always continue to improve them, right, there's an opportunity to really continue to...to improve on the work. One last point is that a lot of this work is going to require funding to actually . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . implement. So, finding ways that we can leverage resources, internal and external, to fund the implementation is...is critical. So, thank you for the time. I appreciate it.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Mr. de Roode. Members, any questions for the testifier? Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Alex. You mentioned funding, both internal and external. Are...is there, like, a top three priority list of those funding efforts in your mind?

MR. DE ROODE: Yes, Councilmember. Thank you for the question. You know, part of it is opportunistic, is what funding is available right now. So, funding streams like the Inflation Reduction Act, bipartisan infrastructure bill, really looking at that funding...that pipeline coming through from Federal, to State, to County, how can we maximize and take advantage of those funding opportunities. And having a Climate Action and Resiliency Plan that's adopted and in place actually sets you up to be able to receive that funding more effectively. Some are...in some cases, it's actually a condition, you can't get the funding unless you have a plan like this in place. So, I think for that, there's an additional sense of urgency to capture the opportunity that's before us right now with that Federal funding available. Then there's other mechanisms, for example, the energy savings performance contracting on the energy side kind of unlocks

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

funding mechanisms that allow projects to happen on County facilities. Yearly County budgets as well, I think there's a lot of alignment in the plan with different priorities of the various Committees within County Council, as well as the Departments. So, where there's alignment, it can really already be an existing line item in a budget, and...and, you know, align with that. I would recommend that the plan be adopted by ordinance, and not be just an advisory plan because once it's adopted by ordinance, it...it really has more teeth, and then can be considered more integral to the County, and probably set up the County for more funding to come in if it's a plan that's really, you know, adopted as...more of a...legally adopted by the County. So, hopefully that helps. Yeah. You're welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Any further questions for the testifier? Seeing none. We'll see you--oh, Member Rawlins-Fernandez has a question for you, Mr. de Roode.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Aloha, Mr. de Roode. Mahalo --

MR. DE ROODE: Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- for all your work on the CARPAC, it was quite a big group of people who worked on the (*audio interference*), and you and Ms. Shipman did a phenomenal job at herding all the cats.

MR. DE ROODE: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, my question to clarify, you said that to adopt this into ordinance. I guess, would you...would you, I guess, elaborate a little bit more on, like, how that would happen? Like we would just adopt the plan as a whole --

MR. DE ROODE: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- and just say we (*audio interference*)...okay. Go ahead. Go ahead.

MR. DE ROODE: Yes, I think that's something you would want to get legal advice on from Corporation Counsel. They could help kind of navigate that, and structure it. But it's basically...and this is what the City and County of Honolulu did is, drafting a bill for an...an ordinance, and having that plan be adopted as the official Climate Action Resiliency Plan for the County of Maui. And that makes it, you know, more...more official than just advisory plan, right, it...it holds us more accountable to say, hey, we adopted this by ordinance, and are we following through, right? How...what's the progress? How...how are we funding this? That...that was the intent of City and County of Honolulu in...in doing that with their plan. And then they would be another good resource to reach out to to get their advice, or experience with that process.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. de Roode. So, it would be kind of

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

similar to the way that we adopt our community plans, I...I am assuming, potentially.

MR. DE ROODE: Something similar, yes. And...and it...it's...it's really unprecedented because we haven't had a plan like this before, right. So, it's kind of charting new...new...a new path here, but it can set us up for kind of that more official recurring updates to the plan, and...and have processes in place to ensure that the...the work and (*audio interference*).

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. de Roode. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Seeing any further questions for the testifier? Seeing none. We'll see you on the next item. Next up we have Anonymous Testifier in the Chambers. Anonymous Testifier, it's your turn to testify, followed by Faith Chase.

MR. PUBLIC: Aloha kākou. I was...I want to be referred to as John Q. Public, please.

CHAIR PALTIN: Mr. Public, go ahead. It's your turn to testify.

MR. PUBLIC: Aloha 'auinalā. Aloha kākou. I hope everybody out there in TV land is watching. And thank you, all the Staff guys, for being here, and the *Akakū* guys. And you guys over there, thank you. It was a pretty good presentation; it was worth coming here today. I hope Washington, and Beijing sees this TV show. And I know I came up to the front there to...to watch the screen, and it was kind of small for the people in the audience to see, and I don't have a computer device. But I did...I didn't read the...the plan or anything, but I did get on the computer a little bit trying to read the reviews. And I came up to the front there because I saw a 'Ōlelo word on the screen, and I was hoping you would put more of that language in the...in da kine, or at least have somebody translate it for the Hawaiians. And I...and I yield the rest of my time to the Hawaiians if there's no questions.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Mr. Public. Members, any questions for Mr. John Q. Public? Seeing none. Thank you for your testimony. Next up we have Faith Chase, who will be followed by Ms. Buchanan...Lori Buchanan. Faith Chase, it's your turn to testify via phone, I believe. We can come back to Ms. Chase if she's not ready. Are you ready?

MS. CHASE: Yeah, I just was waiting for somebody to unmute me. Howzit. Aloha. Okay.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha.

MS. CHASE: I didn't have enough--can you hear me okay?

CHAIR PALTIN: Yes, we can hear you.

MS. CHASE: I have not had enough time to look at this. I caught the tail end, and I need more time. So, is there...I...I guess I know, I'm not really supposed to ask a question, but is there any legislative action being made on this today?

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: No legislative action. And in fact, in the opening presentation, Mr. Cooper did mention that they were going to reopen the plan for a comment period from about June 15th through July 15th. And once we close testimony we can ask more details about how to get involved in that if you want to stay on the line.

MS. CHASE: Okay, great. I appreciate that. I just quickly want to say when I hear climate change methodologies and approaches, you know, there's this really swift move to have this Wolbachia mosquito introduction. So, I'm super jumpy on a lot of things that I feel like are being presented in fast track. You know, DLNR, a couple Fridays ago, they denied the request for a contested case hearing from legitimate scientific-based pushback, you know, to this Wolbachia mosquito. So, I just want to let you guys know that I am going to forward my Councilmembers everything I have on it. But I am hyper-alert on this issue, and I really haven't seen it be brought up in any Committee as a separate item. So, I anticipate that, if need, in a different space. But, you know, I just want to bring it home too, that I have beautiful tutus and aunties that do feather work in my family. So, in no means do I ever want to, and, you know, appear to not appreciate our native bird population. I just need to state that for the record, plain and simple...beautiful lei makers, and protectors, and gatherers, so...and my dad was a avid birdwatcher. So, I feel like this issue has been sort of masked under, you know, birds, not mosquitos, and it's really unfair, we need more time. And I just wanted you guys to know that. And so...but thank you for the presenters. No insult to what I haven't seen, and I'm definitely going to review it, and thank you for the extended public comment period of time. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Members, any questions for the testifier? Seeing none. Thank you for your testimony. Next up, and last on our list that I see so far, is Ms. Buchanan. Lori Buchanan, it's your turn to testify.

MS. BUCHANAN: Yay.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha.

MS. BUCHANAN: Okay. Aloha, I hope my computer is...thank you for having this Committee today. I really wanted to support what Alex de Roode, and what the CARPAC has done. I was a member of the CARPAC. I did attend, I would say, mostly all of the meetings. The meeting schedule was very aggressive. I felt like a lot of funds were spent in...in really good ways to bring on a lot of expertise in...in a short kind of really large project to get everyone on board. And I think the outcome was as close as we could get to a really good plan, at least identifying the big chunks of where Maui Nui needs to go in the very near future to fight climate change. And I didn't think about what Alex had said about adopting it as ordinance, but at some point you going to have to do something because climate change is right here, right now, right in our face. It's, you know, on our beaches, it's affecting our number one economy. So, I wanted to just say that I support it. I did participate in it. There were many, many really good people that participated in this, and many agencies like HECO, and stuff, that did take the time to participate. And so, I hope you guys take it seriously, and I want to further support that and trying to move that along. Thank you very much for this opportunity,

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

appreciate it.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Ms. Buchanan. Members, any questions for the testifier at this time? Seeing none. Thank you so much for your testimony. Let's see. I don't see anybody else signed up to testify. At this time I will do a last call for testimony. Anyone wishing to testify can come on down, unmute themselves, or what have you. I'll do a brief countdown...five, four, three, two, one. All righty, then. Without objection, I will now close public testimony for DRIP-2(4).

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections

. . . CLOSE PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON ITEM 2(4) . . .

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. So, now we're into the discussion phase. And because we had the testifier kind of asking about the reopening of the comment period, I was wondering if you could do a deeper dive for Ms. Chase, or whomever else might be watching, about that extended comment period, about how they could participate in it, who would they reach out to, and what they would review to comment on.

MR. COOPER: Mahalo. And thank you for all the testimony. We appreciate hearing from the community about what they care about. And one exciting aspect as well about this report is it will be in English and 'Ōlelo Hawai'i, so you can rest assured it's that way. So, fist pump to them, right back at you. And an important point though, also, is we are looking at, as that one testifier said, I won't have enough time to look at. We definitely want people to be able to read it. We want people to engage with the document, and have ideas. We will...also, I said that we had met with the community members, at least two-thirds of them, talked to them, had new ideas. And we thought the engagement meeting, and the activity schedule was important, and we would look at coming, and bringing people together, as well as bringing another segment on that also said they were interested, and had not participated. So, we're looking at keeping those two parts moving, the CARPAC, as was talked about, as well as the Resiliency Hui with the Department heads. But then also wanted to invite the Committees, as there's been a restructuring of Committees, of where you see parts of that and how it would be done. We also have been meeting with the sustainability network of all four counties. We were just together, also, on Kaua'i yesterday. Hawai'i Island just did theirs. So, it is a time that we can look at other islands, learn from that, but then also look at the global as well, so that voluntary local review does provide that opportunity. Also some of the testimony that was looked at, as we were thinking as well, that we should visit it every year, if not every other. But then the Paris Agreement is another agreement that Maui has signed onto, as well as the entire State of Hawai'i, and they have a locally-determined contribution where it is great that if we had that information, and do that every five years with the global stock take of what's happening at the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change, that that then can contribute to the United States to say how we're really doing. And that's not being done enough. So, Maui can definitely play its part, and we look forward to doing that. So, we were looking at that one month to be able to have everyday community be able to send in comments to the Office of

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

Innovation and Sustainability. But then we also were going to reinstitute the CARPAC, as well as the Resiliency Hui, and meet together in June and July to discuss, and look at next steps forward. So, those are some of the aspects of what we're looking at. We also had a deeper discussion...I think that's where we really have to get to, is where we're going. People look at the Community Implementation Plan, I think that goes as well with the vulnerability as we're going to look at. But I think we could cross-reference. We could look at that as a aspect of implementing the Action Community Plans, and...and understand that. We know now, even based with some of the CARPAC that we talked about, it's such a one-time period, and it really requires so much more. So, for dedicated to implementation, we think that we can pull these altogether that would reinforce, and not just keep people busy in different processes, but really focusing on the actions, and being able to measure, with the dashboard, what we're able to achieve so far, and what where we're headed, and if we're going in the right direction.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, that's great. Our last meeting we just went over the Maui Island Plan and the Community Plan, implementing status, so that just flows right into each other. Did you want to flash up, or say the email that you wanted people send it to? I don't know if folks know where to send their comments.

MR. COOPER: They could send it to...you can....to Mayor's Office.

CHAIR PALTIN: Mayor's Office. So, that would be mayors.office@co.maui.hi.us, if you wanted to send more feedback on this. And I don't know about the timing, but I was thinking since you just mentioned that it's also in 'Ōlelo Hawai'i, maybe the immersion classes, but their last day is on Friday, I believe. But, you know, going into next year, if it's an annual thing, I...I think they're looking for curriculum in 'Ōlelo Hawai'i. So, that might be a good opportunity as well. At this point, I wanted to open it up to the Members. Oh, and welcome our Committee Vice-Chair Nohe U'u-Hodgins to the proceedings. Just a Sunshine --

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- Law reminder, if there's anyone in the room with you, if you can disclose if they're not a minor. Aloha.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: I do...I do have children with me, early school pick-up, and then I have Jade here, as well, in the office. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay, perfect. Thank you. We just finished up the presentation and testimony on the first agenda item, which was the Climate Action and Resiliency Plan, and I was opening it up for discussion to the Members. Since there's only five of us here, I won't run the bell. But I did see Member Sinenci had his hand raised. So, go ahead, Member Sinenci, to be followed by Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. And mahalo for the presentation this afternoon. Just curious, you mentioned that there were some funding, both internal, external. I did share the [usda.gov](https://www.usda.gov) website for possible more funding. But do you have a grants

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

writer within your Division?

MR. COOPER: Mahalo, Councilmember Shane. It's good to see you. And we've...we are focusing, as an office actually, understanding the opportunity that does exist with the IRA at the Federal level, and working with Chief of Staff to explore and work on that. Actually, just at the Energy Summit, we were having two conversations about two grants that we saw that worked into that. And also, even on Kaua'i yesterday there was a local Civil Society Association that also had some grant funds to partner with. So, we're looking at public/private, and also working with our community members. We're also actively engaging on elements of this important Climate Action and Resiliency Plan.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, that's great to hear. But...so...but you don't have any people in the...the agency that is focused on that. You guys are pretty much writing those grants.

MR. COOPER: It's a kākou thing. We're working together on that, and everyone's learning --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, great.

MR. COOPER: -- about that aspect. Yes, mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you. And then...so, it looks like with this Division under the Mayor's Office, you guys would have direct, I guess, communication with all the different departments?

MR. COOPER: Yes. The Resilience Hui that existed prior, we begin to have those conversations, but then also some good candid conversations with how the report--and maybe you can look at it as well, and think about which Committees...your Committee that you're chairing, how it fits in, its relevance, but also its realization. So, it's not just the photos, it's not just the...the headlines, but it's this is what we're working on, this is how we can bring that in. So, organizing around the ordinance, as it's being shared today, is that aspect. So, I think as one ordinance is fine, but then we just have been looking as well, European Parliament, even other aspects of...on a national level. And we've been looking at elements of what a Maui Nui Green Deal could look like. So, it's...there's lots of different angles of what we could all put in that would look at the opportunity that we face today, and make the most of this obstacle to be an opportunity to see a new way forward, and make sure that that sun that shines above you in the Chambers is really producing energy, and making a brighter future for all of us.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo for that. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Mahalo for the presentation. Okay. So, my first question is, you said that there's going to be a public comment period from June 15 to July 15. Sorry if I missed it, but is it just going to be open for people to email? Are you going to...are there plans to go into the community to kind of present

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

this and get feedback so that people know what it is that they can provide feedback on, or...

MR. COOPER: Mahalo. So, (*audio interference*) is this like a good aspect for the previous testifier that the report is there, and everyone can actually read it, and then comment on it, but that's only the beginning. Then we do plan on bringing in the CARPAC with new members as well, and also the Resilience Hui, but then also connecting as we see it. It'll probably be at a time when the voluntary local review will be taking place, but also the semester starting, and bringing it together to have more of a time, depending on how we look at it, at least two to four months to make sure that everyone can look at it, and then build the elements of actions more specifically. As you look at the report, what we're looking is--what we're asking people as they comment is not only what's wrong, but also what they want, and looking at the language of the recommendations for specific steps. And as my colleague has shared, we really are looking at the full spectrum of self to system. And if we look at it, I think, in that holistic way, we can actually make a difference. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay. I have two more questions, and then I'll...I'll yield to my colleagues. Mahalo for that response, Mr. Cooper. My second question...so, in your present...opening...in your presentation, you talked about nature-based solutions. I guess...and then, you know, other places in the world are doing that. Oftentimes, what...what I...I don't hear enough is indigenous-based practices. So, restoring and reinstituting those practices developed over centuries that have worked, and are place based. So, not just, you know, going around the world, and looking at what they're doing, but looking back to what our kūpuna did, and taking that 'ike and making it...investing in that again. So, when you say nature-based, you mean indigenous based because that's kind of what --

MR. COOPER: Yeah. So, it's (*audio interference*) --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- indigenous-based practices was, right, nature based.

MR. COOPER: Yeah, actually it's kind of a synonymous term that was created really by indigenous peoples at the United Nations. So, I love the question because I've been working for the last two decades with indigenous peoples around the world at the United Nations. And we've been really indigenizing the global agenda to make sure that the values, the voice, and the vision of indigenous peoples, those seven generations, is part of the process. So, there's actually even going to be a summit of the future, and that's entirely driven by indigenous people demanding a new direction. So, when you hear nature based, it was indigenous peoples coming up with terminology to challenge what has been the dominant paradigm that has destroyed, actually, our...our Mother Earth. So, that is very true. And actually, the example I shared with Rapa Nui, it was actually looking at what the people of Rapa Nui are doing, what we're doing here on Maui, and is entirely rooted in the cosmology of our culture here in Hawai'i. So, it's...it's not, oh, it's a fancy new corporate term for...for nature base, means oh . . . (*inaudible*). . . you know, modified in any way, it's actually getting to the true source of that. And just

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

yesterday, as an example, I would say, we were looking at the fishponds in Kaua'i, and we were looking at how many there are in the entire Archipelago, and at least 288. So, that's like a nature-based solution where it's looking at a serious amount of 'ike, as you were sharing, that then produces food, but then also make sure that we're not importing. We look at other places as well where people actually are showing how far their food has come before they eat it. So, looking at what's on your plate, looking at what our hotels are serving. Everyone can vote three times a day depending on what they eat, on how they're reducing their carbon as well. So, all those aspects are absolutely crucial, and that's just why we're waving to the future generations there so that they're not facing severe circumstances. But as I remember, and was talking about in my testimony, it is actually looking at what has existed prior. So, we don't have to fantasize of ooh, can we do this? How could we? We know the model has already existed, it was thriving, it was providing for everyone, and we just have to make sure that we have the courage to bring that back. And then we can do a combination of high touch with our indigenous values with high technology that's also bringing altogether to reduce our carbon footprint at the same time. So, it's definitely indigenous. We were there with thousands (*audio interference*) --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Cooper. Okay, I'm sorry.

MR. COOPER: (*Audio interference*) --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm going to --

MR. COOPER: All good.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- I'm just going to (*audio interference*) --

MR. COOPER: Sounds great. Sounds great.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: (*Audio interference*) yeah. No, no, it's okay. I know we don't have a timer, but I also want to be mindful of my colleagues. What...so, I hear what you're saying, and I understand that. I have to sit with that a little bit because I...I feel like nature based is an erasure of native peoples. And I hear that in...at the UN it was, like, some native peoples that came up with this terminology, and that's fine. I'm trying to feel now for, like, what...what feels right for here...for Hawai'i, and not what someone else said elsewhere. You know, if...does that make sense for us. And, like, I guess my na'au is kind of feeling like calling it nature based, and...because loko i'a didn't happen by nature, it was peoples...it was the...the native peoples, Kānaka Maoli, that built that, as well as the lo'i kalo, which all worked together with our natural environment to cultivate even more abundance than would have naturally occurred without any human intervention. And so, I...I guess the approach that I would like us to take is to cultivate abundance, and that...and reaching back to that (*audio interference*) Hawai'i in doing that, and not just, you know, addressing and mitigating the impacts of humans today. So, I...I can let you respond now if you want to, and then I'll stop there, and I'll yield to my colleagues, if you want, Mr. Cooper.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

MR. COOPER: I can stop too, but I just want to say we wholeheartedly (*audio interference*) and hopefully we can understand our common points, and realizing as a global movement of indigenous knowledge that's being able to restore what was damaged by centuries of colonization.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Cooper. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for your presentation. I believe in the introduction you made a comment that really touched and resonated with me, which was, being able to live on the land and with the land. And one of the things that I think is an opportunity, and it's a challenge, but it's an opportunity for our Council is our land-use laws. And I mean I...I kind of get chicken skin now because the separation and the inability to live on the lands for someone who's farming, and someone who's basically doing it, and there's just so many benefits to actually somebody be there. A saying that I really like, for me, homesteading...the best fertilizer is the footsteps of the farmer--like being engaged, and not living on the land, but living with the land. So, it's great to hear what you're doing. There are a lot of people on Maui who are doing this, and it's almost like renegade peripheral, like, not legal kind of stuff, which is really ironic. Some things that we can work on is the permitting for a rainwater tank. It's like it has to be...it can't be a certain height, it could be really wide, and it's, like, illogical. Like why take up this much area, when you could just be taller, and put that much area. So, thank you for your presentation. I just wanted to share with you that there...I think that the Council that we currently have can be very supportive. And the more that the public is educated...if I may, I just say, I think there's a fear that if you don't have all this land use, you're going to have, like, the Wild West, and you're going to have all this stuff. And I just say, farming is funky. You need to be able to be funky. Like don't...don't try and package it all up so it's real pretty. And we can produce a lot of food, we can be much more independent, our food security. Poverty isn't just money, poverty can also be a spirit, and of the...of hope. So, thank you for what you're doing, and I encourage and look forward to working with you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Member U'u-Hodgins, I know you missed majority of the...or the presentation. Did you have any comments or questions?

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: I do have a quick question. I know that we have a new Administration, so I was just wondering if you could maybe speak to their...your guys' priorities moving forward, and your priority projects, maybe, moving forward with the new Administration?

MR. MEDEIROS: Yes, I can speak real, again, briefly on sort of my focus and kuleana within the Administration and our Office of Innovation and Sustainability with a focus on regenerative agriculture, 'ai pono, and wai systems. So, when we're looking at addressing, for example, food security, we're looking at, as Josh said earlier, a very holistic approach from housing our mahi'ai, and providing affordable economical options to house our mahi'ai, but also, for example, developing curriculum so that our

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

keiki and haumana can be developed within a system to understand their...the importance and their kuleana to 'āina, and...and have it be place and space-based so that really, we can share what is our collective kuleana to mālama 'āina. So, everything from curriculum development to, as we talked about, housing, and healthcare for our mahi'ai. But then also, projects that go all the way through to processing, packing, and then ultimately, as we shared earlier, composting as well because it's all a part of the...the loop. So, we're looking at really designing the entire framework for this system from a Kānaka Maoli aloha 'āina lens. So, that's just kind of the overall view.

MR. COOPER: Building on that, we're really...it's kama'āina prosperity. It's focusing on 'āina first, and looking at ecology, but integrated to look at equality, equity, and then thinking of the economy in that lens, not the other way around. And so we see that's very important. Building as well on what Kaiea was sharing, we're even looking at, like, a farm co-op where people could get certain equipment that everybody needs, and instead of everybody purchasing and having their own, which is too expensive, actually sharing. So, we're seeing the County then as a tool to help people make life easier so that they can grow food, and that we can all be able to enjoy what we grow here, and have that...I would say, cultivate that culture of aloha and abundance that Rawlins-Fernandez was also sharing earlier. Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. And I know most of the Members didn't have the time to read through the entire Climate Action and Resiliency Plan, but one of the things the presenters had asked if...within our respective Committees, if there were portions of the plan that each of us wanted to take up that corresponded to our subject matters. And so, I had been thinking of it, and you know, as mine is Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning, I wanted to take up the resiliency hubs under...under this Committee, if Members are agreeable to that. It's kind of like, you know, after a disaster, prior to a disaster, you...you get that going. Of course, we're not the implementing agency, but you know, just in coordinating with my District in West Maui, I can try and put out some feelers. And I also would like to share this plan with some of the Kula Kaiapuni kumu because they don't have as many resources in 'Ōlelo Hawai'i, and so, it might be a good one because it does go a lot in alignment with their curriculum, and their huaka'i, and things like that. So, maybe in the coming days, if Members go through the plan, and see which speaks directly to their Committee, you can reach out to the Office of Innovation, or the Mayor's Office, on which portions of the plan that you'd like to 'auamo or lead on. Was there anything more...else on this topic that Members had? Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. And, yeah, to your point, the WASSP Committee deals with social services, so maybe we could look at some of the equity issues that we could steward in...in my Committee, so we can reach out to...to the agency. The other question I had was, you know, we're in a housing crisis, and part of it is because of the...the shortage of material, and how expensive material is to...to be shipping to Hawai'i, so...and we've always heard about sourcing natural materials here on the island, I don't know whether bamboo or Hempcrete. Realistically, how far out are we as

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

far as being more sustainable with locally sourced building materials to possibly address our housing crises, anybody?

MR. COOPER: Well, we've had numerous meetings with people in the community and organizations that are striving in that space. There are existing models that we can see. And I think that's where we have to be creative. Also, we've been looking on other islands as well with Kauhale projects, and what they've been doing. And I think it's a time for a conversation, a real compassionate one, about how we take care of each other, and what compassionate campaigns, and really coherent policies we can create. So, there are models. We'll have to be creative, and think, first and foremost, that people do...are not able to put their heads in beds every night, and have that sense of urgency as we approach this issue. I think that's absolutely imperative. That's one of the reasons we've been hosting a series on housing as a human right, films looking at the global movement, and what people are...how they're responding to take care of themselves with the financialization of housing. So, really good points. Just being out in your District, Hāna Farms, that bamboo structure is quite phenomenal, and works as well. So, it's...it's also redefining, and making sure that it's shelter. It's shelter that's also substantive, but then also practical, that people have a place that they can call home, and that they can take care of their 'ohana as well. So, there are examples, and they actually do exist. And we've had a couple people approach us to want to build those, and show those to us, and then work together on how we can be creative. But I think when we're looking at this, it's an entire rainbow approach on how we can realize rights to housing. And there won't be just one way, there's many ways. And it's been an exciting aspect so far in our first two dozen weeks in this field to see what's possible, to meet with people who want to make a difference, and see what people say of how it's impossible, but make sure that...they always say it's impossible until it's done. So, I think we can have that Mandela approach and to make sure people have a home. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Mr. Cooper. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. And then I guess one of the members of the public did want some clarification about the feedback on the plan. Were...were you going to re-present...or how would folks know if they weren't watching this Committee? Was there going to be a press release about the opening and closing? Because while I like to think everybody and my mom watches this, I know that's not true.

MR. COOPER: I know it's shocking, but I feel the same way, everyone should be watching this everywhere. But we can also understand that. We'll definitely send out a press release. We'll also be bringing people who had served on the CARPAC, as well as the Resiliency Huis, and we are very open to coming back and sharing latest updates, and then mapping out how we'll go forward. As we know, there's options of the ordinance that had been shared earlier, and other ways of how we can look at the...even the idea of a Maui Nui Green Deal. There's...there's a lot of ways that we go forward, and I think that's where it's exciting, to see everyone coming together to realize what's possible for Maui Nui, and our planet.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Great. Any more questions, comments, or suggestions on this agenda item? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I want to check with you folks, if you had on your radar Molokai's well, I guess...Countywide Master Climate Change...Master Plan on Climate Change and Sea Level Rise Action and Resiliency...I don't know, it's something super long, I'm sorry, that was my fault--starting with Moloka'i, and then we had planned to go to each district after that. And so, the plan itself identifies, you know, like the top ten to...like top items to be addressed, and to be funded by the community so that when opportunities come up for funding, such as those that you cited, the representatives from the Department of Interior were just on Moloka'i on Monday with some funding. So, there's going to be a lot of funding opportunities, which is why we...the Council in 2019 put this into the budget for FY'20. And unfortunately, you know, the pandemic hit, and it stalled the...the plan, but it'll be completed this year...this fall, I think around September. But is this something that's on your folks' radar?

MR. COOPER: We're more than open to look at that, and we're actually planning in our work to go to each ahupua'a and...and gain insights from people, and talk to them. We know that the way this was also conducted due to COVID was predominantly through, you know, Zoom and BlueJeans, but we want to make sure that we go out and meet with people in the evenings, and actually go to the places where they are, as opposed to expecting people to show up to Wailuku and other places. So, we are looking at that approach.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, what were you talking about that was primarily done on Zoom? The...the plan that's on the agenda?

MR. COOPER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The CARPAC?

MR. COOPER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: CARP.

MR. COOPER: CARP.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MR. COOPER: And then if you tell me the acronym for yours --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, so what I...what I was *(audio interference)* was --

MR. COOPER: -- that would be good.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- CRAC (*phonetic*). It's CRAC.

CHAIR PALTIN: R-A.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, think the CRAC might be the energy one. It's CLAR (*phonetic*) or something--anyway, if you don't...the reason I --

MR. COOPER: If you tell me what it is and show me, we will.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. So, that...that's why I was asking if it was on your radar, and if it's not, I'm happy to send you information on (*audio interference*) community (*audio interference*) Sustainable Moloka'i, and they're completing it, and they did work with the former Administration representatives on it. And so, I'm not...that's why I was asking if you folks were in touch, and if you aren't, then I'll put you folks in touch.

MR. COOPER: That's great to always be connected. And we were talking just with Sustainable Moloka'i just now at the Energy Summit as well today. And hopefully we'll get back down there --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MR. COOPER: -- to continue that conversation. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Excellent. Yeah, so, they're help...they're doing the Climate Change and Sea Level Rise Action and Resiliency Plan for Moloka'i. And also, they just completed the renewable energy something something plan. So, there...there's a lot going on. Okay. I think that's it. So, I will get your email address, Mr. Cooper, and I will --

MR. COOPER: Good.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- connect you folks about this. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Then if there are no objections, the Chair will defer this item.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

CHAIR PALTIN: And we're a little bit past our halfway mark in the meeting. And so, if there's no objections we can take a pause for the cause, a little ten-minute recess, and return at 3:17, if that's okay with everyone?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. So, defer and recess, come back at 3:17. . . .(*gavel*). . .

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

RECESS: 3:07 p.m.

RECONVENE: 3:19 p.m.

CHAIR PALTIN: . . . *(gavel)*. . . Will the Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning Committee return to order. The time is now 3:19.

ITEM 2(5): COUNTY OF MAUI CLIMATE CHANGE VULNERABILITY ASSESSMENT

CHAIR PALTIN: And our next agenda item is DRIP-2(5) County of Maui Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment. And as Ms. Shipman, who had testified, said, this is kind of a package deal. So, when we were talking about the CARP, we had to bring along the Vulnerability Assessment with it. So, at this time we have the same resources, and we'll have a presentation from the Office of Innovation and Sustainability on the Vulnerability Assessment, then we'll have any opening remarks from MEMA, if any. And then, we'll open it up to public testimony. A couple of our testifiers did have to leave, but I believe there's still more testifiers on the line. So, take it away folks.

MR. COOPER: Mahalo, Chair. Thank you so much. We'll now look at the Maui County Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment report. And what we're looking at, of course, with this is sort of the same approach we had with the CARP. We're looking at... these are studies, and then we'll be shifting towards the substantive steps. And that's what we should all aim for in the final aspect, that we're looking towards actions that we can take together, being able to be aware of the vulnerability that we're facing as an island nation. Mahalo. Looking at the next--James, how we doing? Okay. Looking at that, we're looking there at 'āina, wai, kai, and really looking at lewa. We're looking at a whole assessment on all aspects, and that's the aspect that we sort of lose as we are forced to be able to survive with the monthly stresses and economic challenges that all of us face here. But also, with the larger aspect of the climate crisis that we are facing, and we will be facing with more frequency, and with more severity. And this is why it's important to be able to really look at the Vulnerability Assessment, and being able to move forward. We really appreciate all the time that everyone shared with us in that last space, and it's a great way to meet each other. We thought we would just maybe highlight four main points of this study that we thought are the basis for the conversation on...on how we could move forward. One of the aspects that came up is on page 28, the Loss of Easy Going and a Way of Life, looking at that aspect of lack of diversification for our local economy. You know, we think we really should be focusing on green jobs, but looking more importantly at green renewable energy revolution that's available to us now. Looking at solar, regenerative agriculture, sustainably-managed efforts to implement in places that really reflect the values and what we desire. When we did face COVID, it really did give us a...a time to see where we are in the world, and what matters most. And I...I hope we don't forget that as we go forward. The largest threat, of course, is sea level. It's also another aspect. As we look at it, it's first and foremost. It's the right to water. We can see how sea level rise is impacting our shores.

May 24, 2023

We also can see, of course, that coral bleaching then has an impact as well. With the right to food, we know that if we do not have thriving coral, we do not have the fish, we do not have the nutrition that's close by that we've relied on, and we have to look at those aspects in its totality. The other aspect, of course, is affordable housing. That's a huge aspect. And if we have a multi-faceted, multi-central approach, we believe we can look at all these aspects together. It does feed in what was shared earlier, that if people are in their land and farming, there's less commuting, there's actually a connection to, and we can see how we move forward. Another point that we thought was quite important, it was page 29, is the loss of housing for multi-generational families. And houselessness is really just a symptom of a deeper-seated societal problems. We're looking at the prohibitive costs for housing, electricity, food, medical care, coupled with the impacts of climate change...more drought, more flooding, it could make life more difficult. But that's why we are looking at these important documents to then be able to shed light on what is possible, and then see how we can scale up. We do see the Kauhale projects. We do see safe, overnight parking sites. We do see ways that we can help those unsheltered to make sure they have access to a home, and that functions outside of the current HUD model, but more importantly, takes care of people with where they're at to be able to make sure that we can look at affordable modular housing, tiny homes, and other aspects that allow people to be able to survive, and how we can look at that. I know in the Political Science 110 class I used to teach at UH Maui, students that studied, did everything, got good grades, got the job they dreamt of...when you add it all up, still can't make what we all need. And so, we have to look at that in its totality, and look at what we need. This also then goes to, of course, the people who we need in our workforce--teachers, firemen, police officers--all those who make Maui abundant and participating. We have to make sure that we're not losing people to...as what was talked about earlier, being priced out of paradise. Page 30, there's the Securing Our People, the Decrease in Food Access and Food Security. We are really focusing on food security, but I'll go one step further to food sovereignty because we have to make sure we have regenerative agriculture initiatives. We're looking at community food gardens that we can then have a space where people can grow and see that. For those who are in Kalana O Maui you can actually see we have kalo in the front in the planters. We consider that the first seed planted, we look forward to more planting together, and taking action in partnership with 'āina. Because we really look at our fishponds, our lands, as really...those are our grocery stores. Those are the places that we have to make sure are available to our people so that we could have 'ai pono foods, and we also have to begin from school, from elementary schools all the way through, so that our keiki will be nourished with what we grow here, and making sure that starts in the cafeterias to the community spaces. On page 31-38, there's two issues of the increase and the overall cost of living due to climate change-driven hazards, the impact to water supply, water infrastructure, and reduction in groundwater supply. So, true energy resilience comes from producing our own energy needs, we have to look at doing that. We know we have important partners here that are working on that, such as a resiliency grid of solar systems across Maui. We thought another innovative aspect is the agrisolar, looking at bringing those two together, because it is coming up with creative approaches that we can achieve, and be able to counter many of the challenges that are laid out in the Vulnerability Assessment. And I'll stop there, and appreciate everyone for their time that they spent in the earlier part of this meeting, and hand it

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

over to my colleague to share a bit more as we finalize our opening comments on Vulnerability Assessment.

MR. MEDEIROS: Yeah. Mahalo. So, I think it may need to be stated that here in Hawai'i, we live in the most geographically isolated place in the world. So, that comes with inherent challenges, but also opportunities. And...and really, what's unique to us here in Hawai'i is the concentration and richness of endemic plant and animal species. So, really, when we're looking at what makes us vulnerable here in Maui Nui is really that loss of endemic ecology. So, that's what...for my mana'o on...on how we can address our vulnerabilities, and begin to transition to a more pono resilient place and space, is really at the core of our economy, and our efforts is having our endemic ecology, and really regenerating our native forest, and our...and, of course, that's from mauka to makai. Yeah. So, I'll talk real briefly again on culture. So, on page 24 of the Vulnerability Assessment, it talks about how native Hawaiian cultural customs and language were prohibited during the colonization of the islands. And Kānaka Maoli were often forced to assimilate to Western culture, which is where we find ourselves today, operating within this Western contemporary culture, which isn't based on an island or Pacific model. So, it also goes on to say that connecting to that traditional knowledge is, and will continue to be, important and vital in developing climate resilience across Maui Nui. So, kind of interconnecting with what Member Rawlins shared earlier, really, we're...we're looking at an ancestral science, technological innovative...integrated microbial systems management practices and principles, which ultimately are 'ike kūpuna, and really utilizing our indigenous Hawaiian 'ike to really move and transition, at least relative to what we can control internally, from a Maui Nui standpoint to be better prepared.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Administrator, did you have any opening remarks to add to the Vulnerability Assessment...Climate Change Vulnerability Assessment?

MR. ANDAYA: Oh, Madam Chair, just a few words. Thank you very much, first of all, for inviting MEMA to this meeting, and thank you for discussing this matter today. At MEMA, we deal with incidents that are often the result of climate change. And so, we pay very close attention to reports, such as these, that discuss the Vulnerability Assessment. And, you know, we use these reports to accordingly plan for these types of incidents, including obtaining resources that may become necessary in light of the hazard. Tomorrow we'll be hearing from the National Weather Service, and they'll be announcing their hurricane outlook for the Central Pacific Ocean. And, you know, we've been in the...the La Niña Phase in the last three or four years now--La Niña or the ENSO neutral. ENSO Neutral is the El Niño-Southern Oscillation. And now, we are expecting to go towards El Niño...the El Niño phase, which means that we'll be seeing higher or warmer sea surface temperatures. This being said, there may be a greater propensity for hurricanes to...to occur. And so, we expect a very busy...perhaps a very busy hurricane season this year. As such, we are planning accordingly, again. And so, that's where we...we value these types of reports, and we also create our own report. We do our own very...threat assessments. And so, we consider the different kinds of hazards that may occur here in Maui, and...and we plan for those events. So, that's all I have, Madam Chair. Thank you again for having us...me.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you so much, Mr. Andaya. At this time we have a couple folks signed up for public testimony. Mr. John Q. Public, it's your turn to testify if you wanted to testify on this item. John Q. Public. I don't see him making any effort to come down. So, next up we have Faith Chase. Faith Chase, it's your turn to testify, if we can have Ms. Chase unmuted. It's your turn to testify, Ms. Chase. Oh, she dropped from the call. Okay. So, then will be the last call for public testimony. Anybody wishing to testify at this time, please either unmute yourself, or make your way down to the podium. We'll do a final call for five, four, three, two, one. All right. Members, seeing there are no more individuals wishing to testify, are there any objections to closing oral testimony and accepting written testimony into the record?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. I will now close public testimony.

. . . CLOSE PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON ITEM 2(5) . . .

CHAIR PALTIN: And at this time open the floor up to discussion to the Members. Do the Members have any questions, comments, suggestions, regarding the presentation we received from our presenters? Seeing none. Okay. I just did have one...one issue. Some of us had gone to the continent for the Western Interstate Region, and I noticed in your first slide that harm to watersheds due to invasive species, pathogens, and erosion was like...it looked like it was highlighted. And, you know, when we went to the continent, we had to go through the agricultural inspection, most of us, and on the way back in, we just had to fill out a paper. And when we were in Utah, they mentioned like they have 12 or 14 endangered species in their county, Washington County, and I think we have more than that. And so, I just was wondering if...if you had anything about the disparity. If there's anything that we can do at the County level to address those types of things, or even within the State? You know, I mean I'm from Hawai'i, but they got a lot of things there that we wouldn't want to have here, or anywhere. And I just was wondering if...if you had any things that we could partner with the Administration on to address those as...I don't know if you meant to highlight that in your slide or not, but just something that we noticed with leaving and coming back.

MR. MEDEIROS: Yeah, I can just share some of my mana'o on that subject. But yeah, it's kind of a interesting dynamic, you know, relative to import and export, how easy it is, relatively, to import goods and...and food into Hawai'i that do, a lot of times, bring in a lot of invasive species. So, just for historical context, there was only a new species introduced to Hawai'i when--before Hawai'i was even Hawai'i, before any group of people arrived here over the 220 million years these...these island chains were being born, there was only one new species introduced approximately every 300,000 years. So, today, I believe the statistic is we have a new species being introduced almost every single day. So, I guess that's more of a question of how might we figure out different...whether it's through legislation, education, to really increase the consciousness on the importance of really screening what is being imported here into Hawai'i. So, yeah, because it is, as you shared, vital to our watersheds, and our endemic ecology, which is, of course,

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

important to just life overall here on our islands.

CHAIR PALTIN: So, basically, education is our best one because of the way the government is set up.

MR. MEDEIROS: Yeah.

MR. COOPER: I think --

MR. MEDEIROS: Yeah. No, I was just going to say, I think education is always going to be at the core of all of our initiatives because if you don't know, you just don't know. And also we've been systemically miseducated as well, so really just...and really this goes back to the entire vulnerability and disaster preparedness, is really regenerating our consciousness and understanding of the situation relative to, now, Hawai'i once was the endemic...the most highly concentrated endemic capital of the world, and now, today, we are the extinction capital of the world. So, just understanding that transition and how we can mālama that space.

MR. COOPER: I would also say it's also collective kuleana. I mean that was brought up, of course, and there are many meetings bringing people together. That's our greatest resource. If we can come together as community, and then it does begin with education, but it can't end there. So, we've already been meeting also with the airport to make sure that that is the point of entry, that there's...we're saying, welcome to the most beautiful, amazing place on earth, and now you have a kuleana to understand where you're at. It's not Disneyland, it's our home. And with that aspect, there's...that entire corridor when you...they're coming in from the continent that is a space that we're looking at...native plants, messages. We have a first mural near Gate 17 that's talking about the importance of wai, working with 'Īao Intermediate, they're ready to paint other murals. But we're using that space with the artwork to begin educating people, but then also with PSAs, and making those more forthright on the aspects that we think are so important in sharing some of the information from these studies. And that's really what's important is, as we're looking at ordinance or other aspects, these are reports, they're studies. And what we have to do together is appreciate the most important points to that, lean towards action, and come up with...from study to substantive steps together. I look forward to doing that to decreasing our vulnerability.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Members, any questions for the presenters? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. And mahalo for scheduling this item. I didn't...I didn't see it yet, so thank you. And mahalo, Mr. Cooper and Mr. Medeiros, for your presentation on this. I'm just like going through it. One of the things...so...there's a section on muliwai, estuaries, and just water protection overall. One of the things...I guess I didn't quite see it framed this way, but...so, the states have sustainable yields, but the sustainable yield formula doesn't include water discharge in the estuaries and the near shore environment for limu and for the section specific to Moloka'i it does talk about less limu in general, and fewer limu species available. And

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

that's one of the flora that indicate whether there's enough water being discharged in near shore area. But it also...you know, sedimentation also is impacting the limu on all our islands. So, I guess...I don't know. My question is, the way that a lot of the impacts and vulnerabilities are framed is in a very...is very economic focused, like very focused...centered in capitalism. And so, would you speak to that? Like...yeah.

MR. COOPER: . . .*(Inaudible)*. . . --

MR. MEDEIROS: Okay. Yes. Yeah, I would presume, being in a capitalistic society, that that's why it's sort of framed that way. But I think for all of our collective kuleana and our efforts moving forward is really, we want to design the frameworks to address these systemic issues with our endemic ecology at the core. So, I think really, what is important, when...when we are looking at designing these systems is, outside of the research and the science is...is also the silence, and...and being willing to kilo, and listen to our 'āina, and really understand what our 'āina needs. And just right off the top of the head, first example is, of course, the regeneration of our wai and our streams. And...and as you shared, and as I'm grateful for, this Administration and...and our team for advocating for the language of looking at our wai systems and not our water systems. Because water, as we know, is a...referred to as a natural resource, whereas wai is really our source of life, and it should be governed, and...and managed as such. So, I think as we transition into a more pono model, it's really putting that endemic ecology, and of course, our cultural practices at the...at the core of our economy.

MR. COOPER: I echo --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your comments on that. Oh, go ahead, Mr. Cooper. You wanted to echo Mr. Medeiros?

MR. COOPER: I did. I'll just add briefly that that really got to the point of our Office on Innovation and Sustainability. That's what we were talking about earlier, that it's not just climate and thinking of environment, but it's ecology at its core, and then it's equality, it's equity, it's people, planet...all together. And that's not the way that it's been done, it's always been compartmentalized. And in a way, we're trying to shatter those silos to embrace the original understanding. And in the work that we're doing, we look first to what has existed here, and then we look at what we can learn in Oceania in the Pacific next. And we're shifting that entire approach to the way things have been done. And we definitely see it's not the way the world has seen Hawai'i, as a piece of land that could be sold. And we know it's sacred, we know it's not a resource, but a life force. And we're shifting those aspects to be able to understand that, and making sure that people see that's the approach of the office. That it's...it's a much more holistic one in breaking down those compartments that have dominated County politics. And we're really looking more, as our Mayor has talked about, of pono public policy, and...and its ends and the means are together. And we're trying to make sure that it's not just a philosophy, but it's a practice we do daily, and just talking about those aspects. And once again, these studies that were created, they were written before we're here, so we're looking at them and using them. But we want to make sure that what was used can then be, at least, learned from. Everything, we can learn from everything, and see how

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

we can then...what we can do before the adoption, and where we could have, what we're referring to, and everything is local action plans that individuals can take, plus all of our institutions together. And that's what we think has to be at the end of each one of these studies. And that's what we look forward to completing, and working with you on. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Cooper and Mr. Medeiros, for your comments in response to my comment. It answered the question I didn't even ask, so perfect. I... I was struggling to form a question, but I'm really happy with the response that you gave me. And so, I...I was a little disappointed at how...how much it focused on, you know, our...our home...our home's economic value, and not its intrinsic value, so appreciate your comments about that. One of the things that I think that I didn't see is carrying capacity, especially as our population size increases without the appropriate infrastructure in place. And so, if...if this is something that's being used as a guide--I think it's already on your radar, but if you'd like to comment on that.

MR. MEDEIROS: Yeah, I can just, again, share my mana'o relative to 'ai pono security. I mean I think overall, I mean we're over capacity relative to the infrastructure that we have in place to actually grow, produce, process, and...and distribute our 'ai pono, or food. So, you know, relative to addressing the relative over capacity, it's not...I mean relative to our kama'aina, not our external community. But there...I think there are models in place that we can invest and...and fund infrastructure so that we can feed our people, ultimately, and we aren't necessarily over capacity. But I think at the current moment, yeah, we're definitely over capacity, whether it's from a kama'aina perspective or an external community. And the Vulnerability Assessment does point out how we are dangerously reliant on imported foods. So, that is one positive, I guess, that it pointed out.

MR. COOPER: We agree with you too. In a way, we...we really have to decolonize our minds...collective mind about the way things are done, and decommodify certain aspects to get back to the intrinsic value that we all see and know, and looking at the things that matter most to us, beginning with wai, beginning with one another. And that's where I do believe collective kuleana, that's our strength, what we have here. And we also can refocus as opposed to quantity, and...and mass, quality and...and what matters most. And that reflection point, I think, is a great way for us to begin as we look at policies, as we see these studies that we understand. We're thinking not only of here, now, but many generations going forward, and understanding what has been done in the past, but that the survivance that exists today is due to the culture. And the people have shown that that is the resilient way to make the future that we want. So, it's still here. Might have to dust off a couple things, but it's there, and we know that that is where the strength is with collective kuleana going forward. But it's a...it's a lot of paper. And looking at that, we...we want to move from...from paper to policy, to make it a proactive participatory process, for more people to be involved listening to these sessions, and saying, what can we do afterwards, not being numbed to being overwhelmed. We think we can do that together.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. And then I guess, like, my final

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

question/comment, we'll see if it ends up being a question is, regarding, you know, farming. And so, you know, let's talk about 'ai pono. When we think about the industries that we've had, a lot of them, like sugar cane, pineapple, have been very extractive and, you know, heavy, heavy impacts on the...on our water, and on our soils, and to our overall health as a people, and our...and our...obviously, our environment. So, I guess when...when you're speaking about 'ai pono, to make sure that we're on the same page, the 'ai pono...so the pono is to our own physical health as a people, as an individual, as a collective people, but also to the environment, to keep as much wai in the streams as possible, to have crops...or to...you know, to cultivate crops that are maximizing aquifer recharge, such as kalo. Mea 'ai that don't just feed our bodies, and our souls, but is also feeding the systems that also give us life that bring ola.

MR. MEDEIROS: Yeah, definitely. I mean we're referring to 'ai pono, and pono, of course, that's...that does start with 'āina, and then, of course, is directly interconnected with our...our kama'āina, and our people, and...and really looking at it from that spiritual na'au, mana'o, and then ultimately your kino, and physical body, and understanding that as part of the cultivation of our mea 'ai or 'ai pono, it's really doing it in a symbiotic and reciprocal way that does, especially in the current situation that we're in, regenerates our 'āina. And like you said, really, when you're cultivating in a...in an 'ai pono type of way, you're looking at, as you said, recharging our aquifers and utilizing our native plant species to regenerate our soil, to bring our...our cloud levels down, and really, as...as you shared, putting wai as the most precious source of life, and...and doing...utilizing agricultural practices that...that cultivates more wai, and then ultimately captures it, and recharges our aquifers.

MR. COOPER: And that's what we're looking at too. So, culture really...beyond silos, we were looking for serving and sharing. And reciprocal relationships is at the core of our public policy, and also, mutual exchange. It has to be exchanged, not exploitive, not extractive. And it's connecting all those aspects. And when you know where your food comes from, when you know where your water comes from, when you know how the energy is produced, it changes how you live. And we think we can definitely not only model that, but build a movement around it in the Office of Innovation and Sustainability.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Beautiful. Mahalo for your mana'o in all of these things. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. I like that proactive participatory process, that was a good one. I did want to pivot a little to page 31 of the Vulnerability Assessment. As Mr. Andaya had said, where as we go into the El Niño season, typically, for me, I'm kind of old, I seen larger surf, stronger hurricanes...I guess, you know, that warm air kind of amplifies things. And so, on page 31 going into 32, it talks about loss of power, water, and communication services during emergencies due to all climate change-driven hazards. And, you know, for me, 2018 in West Maui, that happened. And I just was wondering if you could speak to...have we changed so much, or that people really need to be more self-reliant than they were in 2018? Because really, the County is not there to be everything for everyone, and for folks that are barely making it paycheck to paycheck, to have the idea to have two weeks' worth of food saved up in case, you know, the barges

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

stop, or things like that, or be more...have your kalo in your backyard. Did you have any message on that, Administrator Andaya, of our point in time of where we are now versus 2018, and what people should do to prepare for this upcoming El Niño?

MR. ANDAYA: Yes, Madam Chair. Thank you very much for that question. And as you mentioned, with hurricanes...great propensity of hurricanes occurring now, in this hurricane season we do...we are expecting, and we're being told, that there'll be more storm surges as a result as well. So, that's something that we are also...preparing for also. With respect to loss of power, water, communication services, that's where we encourage the public to be prepared, and being prepared meaning having a 14-day supply of food and water, being informed, and also, having a plan. Now, I know you're saying that there's some people that may not be able to afford that kind of...having 14 days of supplies, including food. And that's where, you know, we...we'll have to find ways to provide that for them. But that's something that we...we do encourage everybody to do so, and I know that there's a lot of people that...that don't. And so, we really need to have that happen, so that that way we can then focus on those that need...may need it because of economic disparities, or whatever the case may be. You know, the plan, which I appreciate, they talk about whole community resilience, which is something that we added in our mission just five years ago. And it's an important aspect, and I'm glad you...you asked this question about how about, how about those that cannot afford an emergency kit, you know. And so, we...we have plans in place, we know there's a...FEMA has a cache of food and supplies on O'ahu, and we would...we would be able to mobilize that...those resources to Maui, if need be. Also, you mentioned...and hey, you and I have had discussions about this, about shelter. Like what kind of...you know...and you mentioned tents. I said, why not use tents. Well, FEMA, as it turns out, has a supply of tents on O'ahu in Hālawā, and so, we'll be able to utilize that as well. So, those are things that we...we have...we have in mind already in the event that...that a hurricane hits. But again, you know, the important thing is, we're not going to be able to provide food for everybody. And so, that's why it's so important that those that can are prepared. That those that can, have an emergency kit, and so that way, we can then focus all of our efforts on those that may not be able to afford an emergency kit.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. And just to clarify, our...our discussion about tents and shelter was not during the disaster, it was...it was post-disaster if your house get damaged. We weren't suggesting people go in a tent during a hurricane, right?

MR. ANDAYA: Oh, yes. Yes, Madam Chair. We were...we were talking about as...and, you know, we both know that there may be some homes that will be lost, and everything. And so, how is it that we'll be able to house everybody, or...you know, and I know you mentioned tents. And...yeah. So, I was...I was very...it was refreshing to find out that FEMA had already had that in mind, and had...and do have a large amount of tents available for our use should we need it.

CHAIR PALTIN: And...and just on the sustainability front, a lot of times, you know, if we're preparing for a Category 5 hurricane, or whatever, often on the news we'll see people rushing to the stores, maybe hoarding bottled water, or toilet paper, or whatnot. And

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

realistically, like, we can, in Hawai'i, drink the water from the tap, or the icebox, or whatnot. So, I mean you can...you can fill up your...your bathtub, or whatnot, and that also cuts down on those plastic water bottles, and things like that, and maybe save the money for your canned goods, or something along those lines...just a pointer.

MR. COOPER: Yeah, to build on what Herman is saying, I think it is one of the things that we're actually working on, is we're looking at identifying ever space where you can refill your water, and actually moving people...and it begins with the education, and not to purchase the plastic. And then to be able...as you said, you can fill up so much that you do have, and we have that special sacred source in all of our homes. So, it's looking at it from that way, and it begins with education. And probably every month we should have campaigns that are going towards the preparedness aspect, that that also makes people feel a bit better about what's going on. So, I think the more constant communication that's rooted in compassion, it'll lead us in the right way.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah. And...and my bad too, just assuming that everyone has a bathtub to fill up. But, you know, whatever kind of containers you have, to fill up. I seen guys, you know, put a big tarp around a old gallon just to connect...collect their rainwater for whatever, even if you want to flush your toilet, or something, can just let it mellow if it's yellow, flush it down if it's brown. And with that, if there's any more questions, or...no? Okay. If there's no objections, the Chair will defer this item.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

CHAIR PALTIN: All right. This concludes today's Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning Committee meeting. Thank you very much, everyone. The time is now 4:00 p.m., and this meeting is adjourned. . . .(gavel). . .

ADJOURN: 4:00 p.m.

APPROVED:



TAMARA PALTIN, Chair
Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs,
and Planning Committee

drip:min:230524:ml

Transcribed by: Tricia Higa

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 24, 2023

CERTIFICATION

I, Tricia Higa, hereby certify that pages 1 through 36 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 28th day of June 2023, in Mililani, Hawai‘i


Tricia Higa