

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

July 1, 2024

Online Only via Zoom

CONVENE: 1:35 p.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Chair
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Vice-Chair (Out 2:23 p.m.)
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member (Out 2:40 p.m.)
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member (In 1:56 p.m.)

EXCUSED: Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member

STAFF: Ellen McKinley, Legislative Analyst
Samantha Tanck, Legislative Analyst
Megan Moniz, Legislative Attorney
Jennifer Yamashita, Committee Secretary
Pauline Martins, Senior Committee Secretary
Lenora Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk

Residency Area Office (RAO):

Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lānaʻi Residency Area Office
Mavis Oliveira, Council Aide, East Maui Residency Area Office

OTHERS: Jen Mather
Additional attendees (37)

Resource Personnel

Kamuela Enos, Director, Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation,
University of Hawaiʻi at Mānoa
Kari Noe, Indigenous Technology Specialist, Office of Indigenous
Knowledge and Innovation, University of Hawaiʻi at Mānoa

PRESS: *Akakū:* Maui Community Television, Inc.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .(*gavel*). . . Aloha ‘auinalā kākou.
Kanakolukūmālima minuke i ka hala o ka hola ‘ekahi ma ‘ekahi o Iulai i ka
makahiki ‘elua kaukani iwakāluakūmāhā. E ‘olu‘olu mai, e ho‘omalū ke Kōmike

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

‘Imi Hā‘ina a me Nā ‘Ōnaehana Poepoe. ‘O wau ‘o Keani Rawlins-Fernandez, ka luna ho‘omalū o kēia kōmike. It is 1:35 on July 1st, 2024. Will the Efficiency Solutions and Circular Systems Committee please come to order. I’m your Chair, Keani Rawlins-Fernandez, and there are currently no testifiers at the Molokai District Office. And I kēia lā me ko kākou, eia hope luna ho‘omalū ‘o Tamara Paltin. Aloha.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha ‘auinalā. Streaming live and direct from my personal vehicle. . . .*(inaudible)*. . . I’m going to have to clock out in about 15 minutes. I got a doctor’s appointment.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo. Okay. And Member...Councilmember Tom Cook, aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aloha. Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good afternoon. Councilmember online, Tasha Kama. Aloha. Oh, we are not getting audio for you, but I...I see...I...I read your lips, and it said aloha, you’re alone in your workspace. Perfect. Okay. Next, we have Council Chair Alice Lee. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aloha. And I’m streaming live and direct from here, the Chambers.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(laughing)*. . . Aloha. And then Councilmember Shane Sinenci is excused, and Councilmember Yuki Lei Sugimura is also excused for now...yeah? Okay. Okay. And then Non-Voting Committee Members, Councilmember Gabe Johnson and Councilmember Nohelani U‘u-Hodgins, are always welcome to join us. Committee Staff, we have Ellen McKinley, Legislative Analyst; Sam Tanck, Legislative Analyst; Jennifer Yamashita, Committee Secretary; Pauline Martins, Senior Committee Secretary; Megan Moniz, Legislative Attorney; and Lei Dinneen, Assistant Clerk.

ITEM ESCS-1(9): CIRCULAR SYSTEMS (Rule 7B)

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We have one item on today’s agenda, ESCS-1(9), Circular Systems. In accordance with Sunshine Law, testimony can occur at the beginning of the meeting, but cannot be limited to the start of the meeting. As we have only one item on today’s agenda, we’ll be taking testimony after the presentation. Okay. We will now proceed. Under Rule 7(B) of the Rules of the Council, the Committee intends to receive a presentation relating to circular systems. We will not take legislative action on this item. Joining us today for our presentation is Director Kamuela Enos and Kari Noe. Mr. Enos is the Director of the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation at the University of Hawai‘i. Dr. Enos will be giving us a presentation entitled “Indigenizing

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

Economics,” along with Ms. Noe, who is an Indigenous Technology Specialist. Okay. And there they are. Aloha nui. If there are no objections, Members, I would like to designate Director Enos and Ms. Noe as resource persons in accordance with Rule 18(A) of the Rules of the Council. Any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Wonderful. Mahalo, Members. Okay. Director Enos and Ms. Noe, if you are ready, Staff is ready to share screen. You may unmute.

MS. ENOS: I misspelled indigenizing, sorry. . . .*(laughing)*. . . I'll...we'll send the proper. We were trying to get this out. But you can go past the first slide. So, next slide, please. So, aloha. I am Kamuela Enos. I am the Director of the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation. 'O Ka'ala ku'u mauna, 'o Honua ku'u kahawai, 'o Makua ku'u kahakai. I am from originally the community of Wai'anae, born and raised a child of activists. My father is Eric Enos, one of the founders of Ka'ala Farms, and my mother is Rochelle Nui Enos, a long-time public health worker at the Wai'anae Coast Comprehensive Health Center. And I have a background in working directly and being raised in 'āina-based organizations, but then following a career--a bachelor's in Hawaiian Studies and master's in urban and regional planning--many years working in organizations such as small organic farms and the Purple Mai'a Foundation, where we really are communities who are organizing themselves...indigenous communities organizing themselves to respond to need...their...their own community's economic and education needs. And the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation is five years old, and we sit within the Office of Research directly under Vice President Vassilis Syrmos, who asked me to move over in 2019 to start this office. And I'll turn it over, next slide, to my peer.

MS. NOE: Aloha. I'm Kari Noe. I'm the Indigenous Technology Specialist at the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation. I'm also a PhD student in computer science at UH Mānoa, where I have...I am a research assistant at the Laboratory for Advanced Visualization Applications. But I'm also the Co-Director of Create(x), which is an Academy for Creative Media, emerging media lab here at the University of West O'ahu, which is where we're sitting right now.

MR. ENOS: Mahalo. You can skip the next slide. I'm trying to get it out. But as...as noted, just a quick background. This is the general intention of our office. The general premise of our office is that our ancestral practices are sciences and technologies. They have thousands of years of R&D. And they...our ancestral sciences and technologies optimize for things differently than maybe, to be very general, contemporary sciences and technologies. Ours is not an extraction-based science, but the sciences of our ancestors optimize for regenerative models. They were done by universities in service of corporations. Our ancestral sciences were done by families in service of their watersheds in which they lived. And our goal in this office, being situated in the Office of

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

Research, is to position our communities as ecosystems of innovation, and co-produce research with them that they own so that we can change the mental model of government and policymakers to see our communities as driving innovation. But the redefining innovation is not something that is purely of the future, it comes from external spaces, but innovation that is rooted and...and serves the needs. For me...me and Kari are very focused on the next generation, sitting in a homestead community right now, or adjacent to it. What does their future look like in Hawai'i? Next slide. I'll...the primary part of...I'll go through in this idea of indigenizing economics, for me, is really critical. When Councilmember Keani Rawlins asked me to speak, she was referencing a presentation I gave at a national...national presentation on some of the work here. So, the general premise of this presentation will provide an overview of like how...what is the framework in which we are thinking about this in the office. But, you know, as practitioners, like, before I came to University, I was up in a taro farm. I think a lot of what brought the world through either that lens or the lens of going to public school in Wai'anae. Like the two modes of survival we lived through, and how we talk about them. And the biggest thing I learned from both spaces is that theory is important, practice is what makes a practitioner. And that we're going to share with Kari some of the practices that we're working with in this office to enact our theory of change. But it's really important that we start with the groundwork. So, I'll...I'll run through a series of slides that provide the theoretical framework of our office, and then I'll turn it over to Kari to talk about the space in which we're operating now, which is for this current iteration of the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation, what we're looking at, what we're standing up to enact this. So, first and foremost, the general framework of the office is the pewa. And for those who are unaware, pewa is a butterfly-shaped wedge that you'll see that fixes cracks in native implements. I try my very best to not use metaphors I actually haven't done. So, I had to make a pewa before. I dropped out of high school when I was a junior, and I was for a while wildly unemployable. So, my dad put me to work, and one of the things he taught us how to do was to make papa ku'i 'ai. And I actually...in the course of making a papa ku'i 'ai, I had to make they call it a poi board, make a pewa because it cracked. I was almost done, and it cracked. So, I went to my dad and said, how do I fix this? How can we fix this? My dad slowed me down and said, no, we're not going to hurry up and fix this. We have to understand the nature of the crack. And I was like, oh, boy. So, why I use the pewa, it really reminds me of what we're trying to do in the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation, to enter. So, the first part, when we wanted to fix something that was broken--because quite often, indigenous communities are seen through the lens of being broken--we're being traumatized, and people rush to save them. Instead, my dad had me, A, really re-understand what was the board to be used for. And the second thing was to ask questions about why did it crack? Because there's a very distinct reason. I mean, there's big differences between, it cracked because the wood was rotten, then we'd have to throw away the board, or did it crack because I wasn't listening and I was hammering away when there was a knot, he told me not to swing that hard. And that's the equity piece. That's a really

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

important part of our process is to not always assumed that indigenous people are always disenfranchised or sitting in the context of need, that we had intact systems that worked really, really well. Second part of it is to be able to tell the histories of when we lost, when we were disenfranchised, right. So, that's the first part of the framework of our office, is to A, understand, to the best of our abilities, what were the pre-contact systems that we're hoping to restore; and the second part is to understand how...the history of our loss. Like, when did we lose our agency and our own communities? The second part, though, is really critical, and this comes to my family's practice of like community-based economic development, is the reciprocity. It goes beyond just the indictment of what happened to us to begin to identify who are the people that are in the community that have been holding on to these practices if we want to restore them. And that's the reciprocity. And that's why pewas are really strong because they hold both sides tight. It is like when we're going to this reciprocity piece, if we want to invest in our communities, it doesn't live in glossy portfolio pictures, and it really lives for us in the reciprocity is the question of when are people invited into the process. And it lives in budget line items. Are you investing directly into these communities of practice that have been holding this restoration piece down? Are you just saying a lot of really cool things, having nice photo ops, but not putting...sharing risk and putting resources directly to their intervention? And the third part of the pewa, which I really love, is that it's transparent. Implements or things that have pewa on them are meant to be passed on along generations. They are beloved things. If you see a pewa on something, you know it's actually stronger than if you don't. You know, it's important because people took the time to fix it. In a similar way, we want to see the University, to me, as a graduate of University, as a beloved place. Pretty much saved my life after I dropped out of high school. But it is the way that we can make this...it also holds beloved things. So, what are the ways we can heal these fractures in an equitable and reciprocal and transparent way? Next slide. The ways we think about a pre-contact system is really important. The thing I note the most is our ancestral practice. When I say ancestral practices, were sciences and technologies. Our kūpuna's economy was their ecology. So, here's a really general slide from a paper we did that highlights how, I believe, things were managed. Regional governance...the function of regional governance was not the generation of revenues. We didn't have a GDP. The function of regional governance was to ensure that they saw the people who worked the land as wealth managers...like taro farmers, people that grew fish ponds, managed their offshore koas (*phonetic*). They basically managed an endowment where you could understand what the principle was and what the interest was. You never pull everything out. Hawaiians didn't sell everything to another community in exchange for cash. They managed their....they managed their watershed in a closed-loop system. So, therefore, everything was really driven towards that. And, you know, ecology was managed as our economy, and community had incredible agency in decision-making because they were asked to manage the daily life...the ecosystems in which they lived. And that is, we believe, we had integrated biosystems management. Next slide. The imposition of external forces then created the conditions of poverty

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

that we see in people, and the ecological degradation that we see in our landscapes. And I'm speaking really general, but if you want to look at when...when we started being poor as Hawaiians and when our ecosystems started crashing, it was after 1777, if I can be completely honest, or whenever Cook stumbled around. And that continues to this day, and people tend to try to fix these issues in silos. You know, how do we fix our ecosystems? Or how do we fix poverty? In our case, it's like you don't. And I'll go on that a little bit later. Moving forward, the next slide is our value proposition. To the University, if we can position researchers as allies and community as experts, we can begin to replicate the models that we had in pre-contact society, where we're really positioning our youth, our communities, researching community interventions to show the value of the work, but including the outputs of that research to inform policy, funding, and other types of models. Next slide. The key thing that we put in our office, how will we know? In my end is, if our office is successful, more community-based organizations, 'āina-based organizations, can move off of programmatic funding to...to receive sustained operational support. What is really clear to note, because it is the ubiquitous business model now, a lot of like 'āina organizations, you have to...if you're going to grow taro at community, you also have to know how to write grants, right? That's part of the practice. Pre-contact society wasn't funded by philanthropy. If you were growing kalo, if you were growing fish ponds, you were actually a line item in the chief's budget, and you were provided the resources necessary to sustain. So, you want to kind of return to that model via the next level is doing research...co-producing research with the community that the community asks for and it creates, and we back and support to move what was once anecdotal knowledge to peer-reviewed science, to show that this community intervention, not only our ancestral practices, meaningful interventions into contemporary climate, or health equity, or resilience models, but that the specific communities are using these practices to solve for complex persistent issues to reinforce the meritocracy that used to exist. If you could grow food really well, you were as powerful as a chief. If you could heal people, you were as powerful. You had that, really...you had an equalizer in society because you were providing value. So, to do research provides hard data to these practices that has a research-driven approach to then get to the last part, the government level. Armed with this peer-reviewed research to flip the mental model of policymakers and funders to understand communities as ecosystems of innovation, and therefore find ways for us to re-establish pre-contact systems, investing directly long-term into organizations' capacity. Next slide. So, the process of indigenization is one that I have a...I have in a presentation. There's four steps to it. The first is...first step is to retranslate. The second is to reframe. The third is to re-enter. And the fourth is to re-establish. So, we'll start with the first slide next. So, when we say retranslate, something I think a lot about is, my eldest daughter used to be in Pūnana Leo, Wai'anae. And quite often, I was like, okay, how do I think in English? What's...how do I say this English phrase in Hawaiian? And I started realizing, nah, I think a better way to do that is, how do we think in Hawaiian, and then choose the right words in English so that we are establishing...we're choosing

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

these words that actually...that actually give us choice and control as community members. So, the term that I used to think about a lot was Hawaiian culture. And interestingly, neither the word Hawaiian isn't our term for ourselves. And culture is a term, like freedom, where it's highly emotional, but poorly defined. And all my kūpuna taught me that if I'm going to speak, I have to speak clearly. So, I...okay, what...if I could choose my words in English after going to college and...what words should I choose to instead? And I came up with this idea of "Ancestral Sciences and Technologies of Integrated Bio-systems Management." Because it honors that our ancestors just didn't wake up every day surprised to be alive...like they had a really deeply rigorous empirical understanding of the world around them. And it was codified in their knowledge, which was in their chants, their hula. Like they had...to me, like our chants and mo'olelo are forms of scientific communication. Because they're embedded with all of these different data points on how our ancestors managed. And that was their sciences. Their technologies was our fish ponds, our ahupua'a systems, our...our po'owai, to muliwai, our lo'i. These are deeply powerful technologies. By naming them, then we reorient ourselves. Next slide. I kind of went over this previously, but as noted, the precedent is that we, in pre-contact society, managed our ecology as our economy. So, we didn't bifurcate, well, that's the job issues versus this environmental issues. When you live on an island, you can't bifurcate those two things. It teaches you, like, there's 3,000 years of Polynesians moving across the Pacific. You couldn't have practiced an extractive economy and survived. They had to figure out how they lived within the carrying capacity of their landscape. That is why in our cosmology, we are the youngest sibling on a sentient landscape. Everything around us, we come in at the eighth wā of the Kumulipo. And if you're in a Polynesian family, the youngest sibling has one function, is to shut up and pay attention. But the older siblings have a deep responsibility to care for and defend the youngest. And when we orient ourselves that way, we have a deep relationship with the living landscape. Next slide. And this practice was then done at the family level. In pre-contact society, we couldn't separate who is a family member from who is your educator, who is your employer, and who is your spiritual leader. They're all the same people. And more importantly, the landscape itself was your family. It was understood to be your divine ancestor. And a great peer of mine says, you would work with your family to make money? You wouldn't sell your family. No, you'd be in relationship with them. And this is a precedent that's handed down to us. Next slide. And that is a key part of retranslating the issue is, when we understood that we lived in a symbiotic relationship for millennia, and when you sever it, both sides going to get hurt. So, our goal is not to like try to deal with these issues, societal or environmental issues in silo, but to do our...we believe that the restoration of these practices is our intervention. So, next slide. The second is to reframe. With Hawaiian studies, you learn a lot about decolonial thought and decolonial thinking, which is awesome. But I...I when was working at Ma'ō Organic Farm, which is a social enterprise in Wai'ānae that sends someone else to college for growing organic food. We started to think along the lines of like, what is the...what is the follow-up to decolonizing, right? And the term that we came up

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

with was to indigenize. And a very specific example of indigenization, to make the way we described it, was to use the systems that were thrust upon you to be vehicles for ancestral obligations, to be self-sufficient in our own watershed. And like a wonderful example of it, like if you are...you play...if you're doing a documentary on taro farming and you have a film that's showing lo'i kalo, like the kalo leaf blowing in the wind, if you play slack key behind it, no one will think anything about it. Nothing about the guitar is Hawaiian. That is an imported instrument. But the person imbued it with such maoliness (*phonetic*) that it naturally became acculturated and part of our system. Like, how do we take these systems and make them intrinsically a carrier of our practices? Next slide. So, from that, we created what we called the Triple Piko Analysis, which was a term learned from one of our incredible kumu, Uncle Kekuni Blaisdell, that talked about our piko. We have our three piko points of orientation. We have our piko at the top of our fontanelle. We have our navel. We have our reproductive organ, and in the body of thought that was taught to me, that's your piko 'ō, your piko 'ī, and your piko 'ā. Next slide. Your piko 'ō in the first level is your connection to your ancestors. So, the process that we start with to designing our indigenized approach is to identify like what ancestral practice are you hoping to bring into a contemporary space? How to know it from literature review. How to know it in practice. And a key thing about indigenous practices, that every practice has a genealogy. Every practice, every business plan, should have like a lineage. You can't co-opt it and say that it's yours, that you have to be able to show who taught you and what line do you come from. So, all of those things are encompassing the first component. Like how do you know? What is the practice? How is it done? What is your lineage of thought? And how do you stay in right alignment and consent with those that taught you? The second piko 'ī is that once you've established what you hope to bring into a contemporary space--next slide--is that then, how do you use these ancestral practices in contemporary times to establish executive decision-making for your community again? Like how do you...when I worked at Ma'ō, for example, we took the practice of mahi'ai and turned it into organic farming. And then we were able to identify like how do we generate community-run revenue so that we're bringing jobs in our community, and we created a GPA for our students that were educating our kids in our community to this practice. So, we're giving them contemporary markers of success. We own land, and we have college degrees using our ancestral practice as a means. And therefore, we're creating executive, we sign paychecks and we sign college degrees, which are markers of power in contemporary society because we're no longer interested in being on advisory councils. Either executive councils or forget it. Like we want to be making decisions on our own behalf. Next slide. And the last part of the Triple Piko Analysis is, it means nothing if we establish executive decision-making for this generation if we're not allowing future gener--...creating a platform for future generations' right to abundance. While all this sounds like aspirational, this is exactly what Lili'u did. This is exactly what our kūpuna did that set us up to be successful in contemporary times. They did not think for their own generation. They made sure that we had platforms to stand up. Next slide. And I...I'll get through this part pretty quickly

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

because I want to turn it over to Kari and some of the work that she's doing. But this is...the key parts of this next slide is like how we then incorporate into contemporary business plans and other types of organizing principles. Next slide. So, for example, when I said we worked at Ma'o, we tracked two things on a daily basis...sales of products and GPAs of students. And that moved the organization from...to really being able to buy more land to grow food, as well as increase the number of young adults from our community who had a college degree. But the key metrics that we looked at, sales and GPAs, were metrics that our ancestors used in pre-contact society. If you study pre-contacts, at the end of the year--the Hawaiian calendar year, or towards the end of ho'ilo--we had what we called our Makahiki ceremony. Now it's games of fitness, and they have like . . .*(inaudible)*. . . make stuff like that. In a pre-contact society, that was a year-end reporting to your chief. You could show how fit your people was and how abundant your landscapes was. The people of the land didn't write three-year grants to their chiefs. You could show like this is your projected, your actuals, and your variance. This is what we said we would do, this is how fit we are, and this is what we're going to do next year. And by doing that, it allowed the chiefs to go to speak to the divine forces and say, I'm doing good by the people. So, we took those metrics of fitness of people and abundance of landscape and tried to find contemporary analogs. They're not perfect, nor are they complete, but we started in Wai'anae, which high number of dropouts and high like...like land...high egregious examples of environmental racism, to be able to show that no, the highest and best use of land in Wai'anae isn't a dump. Highest and best use of Wai'anae is a farm. Because what's the 20-year projection on that parcel? We can guarantee you millions of dollars of earned income, hundreds of students getting college degrees, and tons and tons of food being produced. So, we used these metrics because we didn't want success to alienate us from our identity, but to deepen our efficacy, to show that we could actually be self-sufficient again in our own community, not in a close-off-the-road kind of way, but to meet the world on our terms and...and deepen our relationship with others around us. Next slide. And then another example is how we used organizing, where we used the 'auwai model, which is the waterway that goes through all the lo'i. When we were recruiting for our program, we began to see all the silos that existed in getting young adults from Wai'anae to college, from students not knowing what to do with their lives, funders and government policymakers only able to give out scholarships, or like put these grant objectives out that they could never meet. . . .*(inaudible)*. . . numbers of high schools trying to graduate kids, the colleges trying to recruit them, and labor looking for quality employees. They're all in silos. We decided to treat this as our waterway. Next slide. Where we repositioned tracking a youth from tenth grade to employment, and aligned all the different parts of this youth's journey along a pathway that showed value for them, but allowed ultimately the youth to be matriculated through the community, and back into the community as an employee. And this is what 'auwai were. This is what we thought about when we thought about our waterways. And the most important thing in our society is our water and our youth. So, how do we treat that as value? And this model allows us...participants

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

in it to have longitudinal data on the student's success. It allows collective impacts, all the things you want on your grant reports, aggregating impacts and creating wealth as you go through. These are things that were taught to us by our ancestors. Next slide. And then finally is to reestablish our agency and show the metrics. So, some of the examples that compelled me to move over to the University, we'll share a little bit. Next slide. One of the key things that you can see when I was at Ma'o, we were already a UH employee because these are numbers of kids from--and this is like eight-year-old data at this point, this has changed a lot--that we're sending to college from our community through our projects. So, it was automatic that I would move over to the University to the other side of it because we already...we had substantially increased the number of traditional students to our community college to the point where they had to get another campus. Like we were really growing those numbers at scale and creating a culture of college. The next slide, please. And we also...this is the key thing that made me feel really passionate about moving over to the University, some of these outcomes. So, while we were at Ma'o, we had a peer, Dr. Alika Maunakea, who's a macro epidemiologist, who is the nephew of founder Kukui Maunakea, studied the gut microbiome of our students and found...actually, that...that slide is outdated, it's \$15,000, not \$150,000. But he found that the kids...they studied the gut microbiome of the interns on the farm, as well as some of their societal, their family networks, and found that the interns on the farm were 50 to 60 percent less likely to develop Type 2 diabetes, saving the State \$15,000 a year. 1,500...150 would be awesome, but \$15,000, I got to get the other slide in there. And that was exactly the point I was talking to about earlier, is that we had a sense that this was happening. We could show our metrics of like fitness of people and abundance of landscape, like CLs (*phonetic*) and GPAs. But this was the first time that we...they saw a research and participated in research that was not extractive. It wasn't trying to tell Hawaiians how sick they are again. It wasn't trying to take our knowledge and call it theirs and publish it. It wasn't trying to save us. It was using the power of research to...to...to really deeply justify the community intervention. And the cool thing about it, it was this cool...it was as good for the University as it was for the community because it gave the research access to novel research and novel funding. But we used that research on the same time. We used it to fundraise. We used it for policy advocacy. And probably the most important use case of it was that we used it to teach young adults about their gut microbiome. And there are a bunch of them that are so stoked about it, they actually went and started to study medicine because of it. Next slide. Another example of how we're entering into the University, like the precedent for the office was really a project when I was working in Planning Department. My former mentor, Bob Agres...or mentor Bob Agres . . . (*inaudible*). . . teach a planning class in the Department of Urban and Regional Planning, which was heavily practicum-based. And we did a project with my peer who has a taro farm in the middle of Pearlridge Shopping Center. And the question we asked was like, what kind of billable services can a taro farm in an urban community start to charge people for? Next slide. So, these are some of the stakeholders that were there, with Anthony in the middle. And we

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

came up with this slide at the end of the day, at the end of three semesters of work. Next slide. We were able to show on the left axis, like what are the inputs? What are the things that were going into the farm? The middle, we actually showed the farm, the medium where things were happening. And then the outputs were all of the different things, like the services a taro farm was providing a community. And that was a really powerful act. It was done not just with the taro farmer, but with KS as the landowner because Anthony owned the license. And we were able to show like, ahupua'a...like taro...like our ancestors were in commodity crop. Like growing taro wasn't just for the crop, it was for all of the ecological services, the social services, the spiritual services it provided. And you had all of these blended types of outcomes. Like that example of this...this example here of how to set up the research and the Maui Ola study were to me, examples of like what research, how to ask the right questions, and then how to do the right outputs. Next slide. So, this is where we're sitting right now, on the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation, has been around for five years now. And I think a key turning point was when we're able to have a project with Polynesian Voyaging Society, introduced me to my peer, Kari Noe, an indigenous data visualization space. And currently, she can talk more about it, but why this really matters is that we're using the space that she's created, blended with some of the frameworks and intention of the office, is to create means by which we can engage with community organizations to deepen the research. So, I'll turn it over to Kari.

MS. NOE: Thank you. So, yeah. So, one of the projects that we have at the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation is called the Indigenous Data Hub Project, and it kind of--as I describe it, you guys will probably see it--the emphasis on the kinds of frameworks and intentions that Kamu has already described as the intentions and how we run our office. And so, for this first slide that here, talking about the Indigenous Data Hub, this is kind of the structure in which we envision the behavior or the function of the Indigenous Data Hub, in which we are able to take regional students and basically allow them to have these experiences where they are learning basics in data visualization and data science skills, which we see as helpful for them because those kinds of skills will help them, those who are interested in STEM careers, whether...whatever pathway they choose, those base knowing how to collect data, clean data, analyze data, and visualize their data are basic skills that would be very useful to them. But we also tie it into the...what we tie into the experience is having them be on 'āina by pairing them with 'āina-based organizations and other local...local partners so that they have an experience of not only getting to know their communities, but they also get familiar with land, and they're working on, in terms of data visualization, place-based and community-relevant work. Because when we were first starting out, lots of the students really wanted to figure out how they could actually use the skills or their intentions of their degrees with community-relevant work instead of just projects, in which it's just theoretical or a scenario that their teacher came up with. But in the same way, by allowing students to learn in these spaces with community partners, we were able to come up with a structure

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

where then we can invest in operation funds with...to community partners so that they can, in service for teaching our students and helping them as we try to figure out how to mentor them in whatever pathway they would like to do. Because in this program, even though it's centered on data science, we actually--for what we call our fellowship, we allow students of different disciplines to enter this program because we see, again, this program and these students, these kinds of skills we see are useful for any path that they choose. And so, above all else though, we see that this experience of learning these skills and being connected with the community will help them on their self-actualization pathway. Because through this, and through this program, we do try to target students who are early in their college career, so community college or beginner undergraduate students who are from the communities that the fellowship is running, such as right now, here at Create(x), we run a fellowship with 'Ewa Moku students. In this way, they become familiar with what other skills they may need to develop in their...their career pathway as...during their university time so that they can develop skills to better help with their schooling. So, next slide. I'm going to talk a little bit more about the background of how this program was stood up. So, Create(x) is, again, the space that we're sitting in and is also an emerging media lab at UH West O'ahu. It's co-led by myself and Jason Leigh, who's a data visualization professor at UH Mānoa. And it overall is a...what we call like a living laboratory. It basically is a sandbox space for students to get access to these kinds of immersive technologies, whether it's our projection systems, or we also have like VR and AR headsets and such, so that students can come in and they can have access to these technologies. Create(x) was...actually, in the way that we run Create(x), was a model for the Indigenous Data Hub Project where not only are we thinking through of the fellowships and experiences that these data hubs can provide students, but also, how do we replicate something, like a space like Create(x), in other rural and other community colleges, so rural communities and community colleges, so that other students have access to this technology. I can say personally, I'm actually from Kaua'i, so I really would like Kaua'i to have access to this, for instance, because growing up on Kaua'i, we did not have the same resources that O'ahu people had. Next slide. So, the...

MR. ENOS: Turn the . . . *(inaudible)* . . . never mind.

MS. NOE: Oh, yeah, you can turn it on if you'd like, if you want to show. I think Kamu wants to showcase one of the things that we have in here. But while he's turning that on, you can just turn the buttons by the lights. Just for a little bit more context, this project is funded by Change Hawai'i, which is the Hawai'i EPSCoR Project, which essentially, the overall theme and goal of the Change Hawai'i Project is to make Hawai'i more climate resilient by a cohort of different researchers and partners who are doing different kinds of research and studies to make Hawai'i more...to...to basically collect data in...in service to make Hawai'i more data...climate resilient. So...but our part of this is that...a big part of once they get all this data about our...about Hawai'i, they need to visualize it. So, a

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

component is working on the data visualization aspects of it, which we created a technology called the Project Table, which I'll go...I'll go help you turn that on. . . .(laughing). . . And in...for the Project Table, there's kind of two projects ongoing, where there's a project in which we're creating software so that this Project Table can be utilized by partners, researchers, and other partners who have a stake in ener--...in the energy industry, such as like Hawai'i State Energy Office and HECO. On the other hand, it's working with...we're using the technologies in the Indigenous Data Hub Fellowship and part of that program so that students can utilize that, and build it, and innovate upon it so that they can build visualization tools for the community partners that they're working with. In that way, we...the students are actually conducting research in a kind of different degrees in the sense of they are co-designing this technology with 'āina-based organizations to provide this kind of data collection and data visualization capacity to them. Through this ongoing design process, we're finding and experiencing that 'āina-based organizations are starting to develop possible questions of what they would like to observe and track with the systems. In that way, that leads to new research that we're hoping--we're still early on in the process--will lead to bigger research questions, and also opportunities for technological innovation that could become part of just the regular industry ecosystem of the space. So, actually, why don't we switch over, and you can talk about what's happening at . . .(inaudible). . .

MR. ENOS: So, we...I felt this was an added part to the presentation because quite often...you know, why I appreciate being able to share this level is we often get stuck at the theoretical . . .(inaudible). . . The theoretical component, while important is insufficient to actually create change. So, really quickly, I'm just going to just show--I want to honor everyone's time--but show...next slide, while Kari's setting up. Next slide, yeah. The basic premise of this was that we are replicating this from here and you can see around us, we're...actually have...we're inside of a mo'olelo. So, one of the students is doing this mo'olelo of . . .(inaudible). . . For one of our partnering community college teachers is teaching the story through the lens of social emotional wellness. That we have...working with our model is that we work with students from our community who are in college to learn on Kari and how to replicate the system, and then we also hire peers for...mentors for them. So, really, it's grounding. The fundamental intention of the hub that we're creating because we're able to partner with the community organization is to create a space where a community organization can be seen as a faculty or classroom so that we can get them sustained operational support while they house their students. The next part of it is that we're able to have our students work in the...in the practice, in the field, and then come here, so...to learn how to render it into 3D models and 3D visualization. So, the technology isn't alienating students from their ancestry. You have to be outside. You have to be doing the work to land, and we can show the layering of ancestral and contemporary sciences. The last component is that this is becoming a complete community repository for place-based knowledge that I feel is really similar to the Hawaiian language and speakers. Next slide.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

We can...I want to honor our time. We can go through the next couple slides because we...we opened in Kaua'i. And next slide after that. The key partner we're working with is a community 'āina organization in a community that's restoring like the fish ponds and the muliwai in Pearl Harbor, that we're...we're taking all the students from the very...very same community that they live in, don't have access to the space. We're allowing the access and agency, but the value proposition is that the community partner is not just removing mangroves, they're actually...as the mangroves are pulled out, they're re-establishing practice. And a key function is with the earmark that we got through Schatz's office, it's a \$500,000 earmark to do this, that was central to this was not just the removal of mangrove, was the restoration of citizenry, that the...that the people in that community have a sense of...have a deep sense of relationship. And by pairing contemporary technology with ancestral sciences, it sees them both as valuable. It's like bringing these systems of our ancestors into contemporary use case that can then prepare our students for a future job. And the one types of jobs that isn't going to be going anywhere soon that you can probably make a like recession-proof salary from is data scientists and data visualization, but it's grounding it in the ethics of the community as the key function and having the communities own the means of production. Like we own the tables, we own the practices. And fundamental is that in this process, the community owns their own data. We give them the table, they use it. We give them technology, they use it for whatever they want to use it for. But they would send us data that they feel is important to help them with policy, to help them with fundraising, and to help them with --

MS. NOE: Engaging...

MR. ENOS: -- engaging their peers. Next slide. I think Kari can just talk through the model.

MS. NOE: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: So, we'll go show you a table quickly on a laptop. I'll walk around. So, this is a key aspect, a key function of...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, one moment.

MR. ENOS: We have the visualization...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Maybe we can pin the video so that it's...yeah. Okay.

MR. ENOS: So, this is a 3D printout of O'ahu, that is a projector up above. So, Kari builds all this technology. She is the technology. So, this isn't technology you can buy, it's being built by members of our community.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

MS. NOE: Yeah. So, what I'll describe about this, this is our Project Table. So, it's been developed at Lava for a while now. This architecture, very simple architecture of quick projector downloads on the table. But we've been developing different software for different purposes, as I mentioned. So, going to the IDH, our thought is that between...we kind of have three different pillars. There's the student development, there's the community investment, and then there's the applied research. The research that we've been doing is how to utilize these kinds of different immersive augmented spaces to allow for more interactive data visualizations to aid with different purposes. And so, as the IDH matures and all goes, it's not that we're married to this Project Table kind of architecture. This is what we have right now. But we're teaching the students the skills through having them experience co-design with community partners, how to build new iterations, or what the next way to visualize is. Where we're at now is this projection table, where this is a 3D printed model of an island. And we have a touchscreen interface with our software so that you can easily toggle on different data layers. Now, over the computer, I don't know if you can see it very well, but I just turned on...this is all the agriculture...this is an agricultural layer of O'ahu. So, it's showing me where all of the agricultural land that's designated on O'ahu and their productivity levels. It's kind of hard to see the scale, but you...we do this, for instance, with HECO and Hawai'i State Energy Office because when they see where all the agricultural land is, and they're trying to figure out where to put solar panels, you can turn on different scenarios they've created of where to put solar panels. And they see things like oh, in this orange area, in this scenario, this is where we potentially want to put solar panels, but it's a little bit hard to see because of the brightness. But what over here is, is actually prime agricultural productivity land. So, they found that there's a problem in which if we put solar panels there, we're lessening the agricultural land that's being used for food independence. And thus, it's...they...this is a very simple way of seeing different ways in which, through this kind of visualization, where if you're at a stakeholder meeting, people are able to upload and share their own data and have this kind of interactive presentations, they were able to figure out more were points they need to innovate or solve problems on much faster than when before, they told us they were doing these 7,000-page binder reports that everyone had to look through. And so, in this way, we're taking the same concept that was developed for Hawai'i State Energy Office and HECO, and utilizing it so that we can create different software so that in the same way, I know organizations with...with our students in the fellowship can utilize and develop on this technology for strategy, solutions, research, for community engagement with community partners.

MR. ENOS: So, that...you know, and I really appreciate allowing us to show this part of it. I know this, Councilmember Rawlins, wasn't...wasn't a part of the broader presentation. You can do the next slide.

MS. NOE: The next couple of slides, I --

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

MR. ENOS: Yeah.

MS. NOE: -- I just went over already.

MR. ENOS: Yeah. So, this is what...this provides you just some more of the infrastructure. So, this will be on the . . . *(inaudible)*. . . of what Kari has designed. The previous one has the environment and this is where we are with the practice. And then the last slide. Yeah, that's one of the biggest things that I've learned from my kumu, one of my many kumus, Auntie Pua Burgess is that the most ancient and powerful technology is the technology of community. So, hopefully to this arc, you can see the starting principle. Yeah, we're done with the...the...the formal presentation. But just to recap, that, you know, the...what we're actively looking at is repositioning our communities as...as ecosystems of innovation. This model has four layers to me that's really critical, is first, the land itself, like a very specific moku. The second thing is the practices that the land taught our ancestors. Our ancestors never taught the land anything. That's why the land is always your kumu. The last time you taught a mountain something, right? So, like, that your land is your kumu's kumu. So, the second thing is like what are the practices that came? The third layer that we're looking at is who are the community organizations that are holding it down. That have, like I'm a nonprofit baby, I have PTSD. I don't glorify activism. Like, it's not easy. It's not. To...to be chronically underfunded and underrepresented, but to still do it no matter what. Like, those are your people. And then the fourth part that we focus on is a child that was being raised by that land. And to me, all of the big apparatus of the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and where we're situated, that's great...but the focal point that we pay attention to are those four metrics. And to me, hopefully, that's the biggest takeaway of that. If you can teach ancestral and contemporary sciences through the lens of innovation, then I think we have a lot to offer, especially our...the word neighbor island is so offensive. I'm from Wai'anae. it kind of feels like O'ahu's neighbor island that's on it. It's like, you know, even though it's not...like we're not...we're not, like, oriented. Like people, we have to be on the other side. It's like, I really want to equalize, to have kids from our community that still have relationship with going outside. They still have relationship, you know, with tight family units. They still have relationship with place. How can they show up in these conversations meaningfully, and provide like a future for themselves? So, I'll step down from our formal part of our presentation. That was a bit of a fire hose. I know there was a lot of . . . *(inaudible)*. . . there. But hopefully that was resonant to what this Committee is...is really focused on. And I just asked Kari this morning, so thank you, Kari, for...for...

MS. NOE: No problem.

MR. ENOS: But I...I feel representation matters. And I'm holding the space for her to be the director of something. So, I want to make sure that whether it's this office

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

or office adjacent to it, that she...she's doing the practices that people have been theorizing for a while. So, thank you, kākou. Mahalo nui.

MS. NOE: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director Enos and Ms. Noe. We'll go into public testimony. But before going into public testimony, I'll acknowledge Councilmember Yuki Lei Sugimura, who joined us at 1:56. I didn't want to interrupt the presentation, so mahalo for your patience.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you very much for your presentation, and excuse my tardiness. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. And I...I realize after the presentation had started, I...I...I forgot to give everyone the disclaimer that we only have an hour-ish with our resource personnel. So, I was going to try to make it as quick as possible. And then I...I rushed into the presentation without explaining why I invited Director Enos to present. Member Sugimura, if you can turn off your mic, please. There you go, perfect. As Director Enos explained, right at the end of our budget session this year, I attended a four-day online conference on decolonizing economics, and had the privilege of seeing his presentation. And it was...it really resonated, and I wanted to share that with everyone here. The discussion of, you know, economics, our economics here in Maui County, especially since the fire and the introduction of the bill to phase out the Minatoya List has really been missing some important components, and that's, you know, kind of overlooked. And I thought his presentation kind of captured some of what's missing from our discussions. So, I will open up testimony, and we have two testifiers signed on. Director Enos, do you have a hard stop?

MR. ENOS: No.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MR. ENOS: We're...we're just going to be . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. We have two testifiers, and then we can do a round of questions, and then we can let --

MR. ENOS: Awesome.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- Director and Ms. Noe go. Okay. Testifiers wanting to provide testimony should sign up in the Chamber lobby, join online meeting via TinyURL link to connect to the Zoom meeting, or call in to the phone number and enter the meeting code noted on today's agenda. Written testimony can be submitted via eComment link at mauicounty.us/agendas. For individuals wishing to testify on Zoom, please use the raise-hand function by clicking on the

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

raise-your-hand button at the bottom bar. Staff will enable your microphone and video prior to your turn to testify. You can unmute yourself when you are called upon by clicking on the microphone and camera buttons on the lower left portion of the screen. For those calling in, please follow the prompts via phone. Press star-nine to raise your hand, and when it's your turn to testify, press star-six to unmute. Staff will add names to the testifier list to...in the order testifiers sign up or raise their hands. For those on Zoom, Staff will lower your hand once your name is added. Staff will then call the name you're logged in under or the last four digits of your phone number when it's your turn to testify. If you wish to testify anonymously, please notify Staff. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes. Staff has been monitoring individuals joining today's meeting by phone and video, and will do our best to take each person up in an orderly fashion. The first person signed up to testify is Jen Mather, followed by Lisa Darcy. Ms. Mather? Aloha.

. . .BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

MS. MATHER: Aloha, Chair, honorable Committee Members. My name is Jen Mather. I just wanted to say mahalo for this presentation because most people like suffer from a lack of imagination when it comes to certain things, and they have really super short-term memories, right? So many times you hear people say things like, it's been like this forever. No, it's been like this for 50 years. It's maybe like a blip on the timeline, right? And if you go back to like 200 years when our kūpuna...or even further when our kūpuna were, you know, sustaining life here on these islands for hundreds of thousands of people outside of a cash economy, we...we can't say it's always been like this extractive economy built on a single driver, right? So, really, all those people who were like threatening Maui with imminent economic collapse because their STVR might get phased out, they really should have been here watching this presentation, and they should sit in on these Committee meetings. I also think that the four steps that you outlined, Dr. Enos, are important on how we approach the rebuilding of Lahaina. And then the data visualization is super essential as well. That just like blew my mind because it helps people to better approach our biocultural landscape, and be reverent and responsible, right? So, mahalo for helping people like imagine something better, and presenting frameworks to begin to envision something different, something diverse, something indigenous. And I may not be a mahi'ai or a good gardener or a lawai'a, but my kūpuna were, our kūpuna were, right? And the genetic memory is both in our koko and our 'āina, and it's calling for that kind of resurgence based on regeneration like you folks have offered today because we did have, and we continue to have, agency, we just aren't like flotsam being pushed around and...and we never were. So, mahalo, Chair, and mahalo, Director Enos and Kari. Aloha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Mather. Any questions for our testifier? Seeing none. We'll go to our next...and...oh, okay. I guess Ms. Darcy dropped

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

from the call. Okay. So, if that's the case, I'll do a last call for testimony. Anyone wishing to testify, you may raise your hand or unmute yourself at this time. Okay. Hearing no one speaking up to testify or seeing any hands raised, we'll close public oral testimony and accept...continue accepting written testimony to the record. Any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Members.

. . .CLOSE PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. We'll now open up for questions. I think, Chair Lee, you have to leave by 2:50? You want to ask first?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you for the presentation. I thought it was very interesting. How do you include other cultures in this program?

MR. ENOS: Yeah, super good question. Part of...I'll have Kari share too. From my perspective, one of my kumus, Manu Meyer, and she says indigenous doesn't mean Hawaiian or brown people, indigenous means continuity. And everyone's indigenous to some place, you know. And that's like what Dr. Alike Maunakea was showing with their gut microbiomes and epigenetics, like how deeply your genes are defined by your geography over time. And we really believe that when places using this technology, we're actually going to be participating in a...we got some National Science Foundation funding to do a workshop to potentially have other indigenous communities learn how to like replicate this model. The general premise, to me, is that if you're in a place where the people of that place still live, then they actually have deep knowledge of how to...they...they can deeply inform ecological and your regenerative kinds of models, which so much of us are trying to figure out. And the main point we're hoping to do is to make this practice open source of a sort, but set up pretty clear use conditions, like it is to be used by a community that has genealogical ties to that landscape. It's to be used to ensure that they're recalibrating their ecosystems and their youth together to create opportunities. And it's to be used, really, to allow us to bring back these deeper practices of like how we could live within...within the context of ecosystem, provide contemporary tools and structures to have that also lead to a world-class education and potentially world-class employment. I'll talk to Kari, any adds?

MS. NOE: No, I'll just add...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I think I ran out of time. Did I run out of time?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, I thought I heard something. Oh, maybe it was your phone.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I didn't put a timer. Since we're just doing one round, I...I --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- figured everyone can ask the questions that they have --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- until pau.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

MS. NOE: Okay. So, sorry. But for the day-to-day of...for this particular project and when we're working with students, it's...we...I keep thinking of a couple of different things. One, the skills are useful for anyone to learn. Two, Hawai'i is not just made up of the Hawaiian community, it's made out of everyone. I mean --

MR. ENOS : Yeah.

MS. NOE: -- I'm Hawaiian, but look at my face. I have a lot of different cultures . . . *(laughing)* . . . and ancestors that I'm trying to honor and learn from. So, when we have students and when we think through it, we're thinking of community partners that are also...you know, we all live on Hawai'i, we all learn from the land. And so, it's really uplifting, you know. I know that kama'āina is very used because we're like, oh, the kama'āina discount, or we talk about that, but like really thinking through what seriously does it mean to be kama'āina of like from this land and what we're learning from this land. And in that way, if the students are from different places, they can take that...kind of the root. That's why we describe it as indigenous and ancestral practice, and not we're just saying this is all Hawaiian, Hawaiian, because it's not. This is a foundational practice that anyone can build up from and bring back to their home --

MR. ENOS: Yeah.

MS. NOE: -- because the center of it is just what does land teach us.

MR. ENOS: Eō.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you very much.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay. And then we'll go to Member Cook, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for the presentation, it's very interesting. *(Audio feedback)*. Oh.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Hold on. Try turn off your mic. Hmm. I think it might be his mic. Maybe borrow Chair Lee's one for now and see if that works. Just slide it over. Slide it to him. Slide...and then Member Cook, grab it. Grab it and then turn it on and use her mic. Try. Something's wrong with your mic.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I didn't turn...is that better? Troublema--...troublemaker.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It wasn't that we couldn't hear him, it was that there was feedback.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah, no, it's the...it's the feedback. Still, get a little bit.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's still doing it. Try use Chair Lee's. Turn off your mic. No, use hers one. Use her mic. Turn off your mic. Use her mic. Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Oh, I get 'em now. Okay. You only had to turn me...tell me four times. I get 'em. . . *(laughing)*. . . Thank you for the presentation. I'm curious--I...I find it very interesting--I'm curious too about like tools, how that...and I think I understand extraction, insofar as extracting resources sort of manipulatively and for like sale and export, as opposed to just utilization and recycling, reuse. But I'm just curious about like tools. Like in this modern day that we have now, how do...how do we integrate the utilization of machinery, or et cetera? Does it fit in at all? Thank you.

MR. ENOS: Yeah. No, I absolutely agree. Honestly, like, you know, I'm talking to you on a laptop . . . *(laughing)*. . . right? So, obviously, we have to be self-aware of our context. And it's not a binary, one good, one bad, as in what we're calling for is like curiosity and the willingness to calibrate. And I also think, for me, the real investment point is allowing our next generation to learn these practices, like these...both of these practices, the practices of contemporary technologies and the practices of ancestral technologies, and give them the agency to figure out the actual innovation of our office right now. Is this the innovation of integration? We're hoping to, we want the next generation to be creating a real innovation. When they're as comfortable in their ancestral practices in the field, as well as the contemporary use of them, then I think we'll start to see some real...like when they're the digital natives again, as they say, we'll start to see some wildly interesting offerings come. And I also defer to Kari because Kari builds technology like this as her daily basis, but she's rooted in a technology that she learned from her family on Kaua'i.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

MS. NOE: Yeah. So, when I think of tools, I...in my line of work, tools are the technologies and software that we develop. And so, for our design practice, we're trying to think of integrating tools into these different practices, especially with 'āina organizations who maybe have never engaged in this kind of...these kinds of digital tools, visualization or data collection tools. It's really important. And in our practice is to co-design it with them because I feel often in the technology field, what's a common metric is to find low-hanging fruit, which is a very good strategy of getting things done and piloted. But I think when you...when you design with an indigenous lens, you're also...you know, you do eat the low-hanging fruit for that pilot study, but overall, you want to know how this tool is going to integrate in a longstanding, sustainable sort of practice that can last. So, that's why when I was talking about the tool that we have right now, which is our Project Table, it's good. We have developed it in a way that you can have it at different scales. So, we thought through different kits and different ways for...to scale it from whether it's in a big exhibition space to if it is with a community organization, which honestly, they have a building that doesn't have as much electricity to run these kinds of tools. It's really designing with that forethought to know how to scale it, how can it be sustainable, and then how is the practice going to be...how is it additive to a practice that's already existing, rather than totally bulldozing over the practice? Because that is very tempting in some industries that, you know, you want to--what was the word?

MR. ENOS: Disruptive.

MS. NOE: Disrupt the...disrupt, but in actuality, that disruption disrupts. Thus, it actually can be harmful because it's good now, but it's...the use is not sustainable. So, really thinking of how to co-design things, and the adoption of technologies in ways that's additive to existing, well-researched, and implemented. You have years and hundreds of years that you know it works, other technologies.

MR. ENOS: I'll just close too. There's a lot of precedent. Like the Hawaiians--like Kamehameha lashed cannons to his canoe. They used the printing press. When you're rooted in your practices, you can get emerging technologies to see how they fit. You just...when they supplant your practice, that's when we are trying to figure out how we prevent.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you for that. I want to...can I comment? What you said about it being, you know, multi...all different...for all different kinds of people. What I...what I feel, I'm...I'm appreciating this, and what I see and what I feel is like if you have your roots, and it isn't --

MR. ENOS: Yeah.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- simply superficial, and lost in the noise, and being connected --

MR. ENOS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- literally in the process, agriculture is one of like the real foundational, in tune, in touch. And...anyway, thank you very much for that.

MR. ENOS: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Cook. Member Sugimura, and then Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. This is very interesting. So, I...your Project Table that you did, and it made me think, do you have a capability of doing this on Maui? Or are you...because of where you're located, you're primarily set to do it on O'ahu?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I got to see their Molokai map at FestPAC.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, really?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Wow.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- they had a Molokai map.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Do you have a Maui map?

MS. NOE: We had one at one point, but we haven't taken it out. But we have been talking to different partners--and Kamu, if you want to share--about possibly bringing the technology to Maui, but just in the right way.

MR. ENOS: Yeah. So, we had a nice meeting with Department Chair [sic] Hewahewa and Tech Specialist Medeiros when they came, and we had a chance to talk to them. For me, what is really critical in the replication of this technology is that it is focused on community, just in the way I think it makes sense. If the table...the goal of that table is to actually...we were trying to practice building it out and giving them to community organizations, and they learned their fluency and competence first, competencies around its use first so that they can then orient to people like me in government to say, like this is...like we really want the mental model to be like the communities can really solve their problems, and they can provide agency. And I think once that's established, once that practice is established, then there's a real wonderful opportunity for our universities and policymakers to receive community-derived feedback, or community-derived

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

approaches. Because it...and I maybe have a bias because actually, most of my life I worked in community before moving over to the University, is that if they get that agency first, it actually is really, honestly, like rebuilding trust in democratic processes because the community is seeing like people do see us as problem solvers. And also, I think it creates a meritocracy, right? It's like, if you're able to really produce something in your community and show the value of it, then that's the platform, right? You have a space to show what you're doing and how you need to be invested in. There's a lot of grievance. . . .*(laughing)*. . . I think there's a lot of that energy, and that's a part of a democracy, but I also think in pre-contact society, we lived in a meritocracy, where those that had merit and those that could produce . . .*(laughing)*. . . were the ones that were...really had the voice of advocacy. So, hopefully we can definitely build this for different use cases in government. We want the next generation in geography and the practitioners to really be fluent in it because I think this can be...help provide resources to . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, are you...

MR. ENOS: Short answer, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, are you...

MR. ENOS: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . stages of like how we want to roll it out.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Exciting.

MS. NOE: Yeah, we want to be asked to do it, not we came in there and said we should do this.

MR. ENOS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, are you --

MR. ENOS: Conflicts.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- are you also networking with our college here?

MR. ENOS: We haven't had a chance to do anything with Maui. This...this particular model is being built out through some funding we got through the National Science Foundation, so we have...well, kind of like I'm from Wai'anae, so it's actually Leeward, I actually graduated from Leeward. And then Kari and our peer, Rochelle, are from Kaua'i, so we're doing it in Kaua'i. Not just in favoritism, but because we have the --

MS. NOE: Community. Yeah.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

MR. ENOS: -- networks to roll it out. And we also want to go where we're invited and not to pull it in otherwise. So, you know, we go where asked and we go where needs are. That's part of the hope today, is to share a little bit about it, to show what we are doing, so that there's an understanding of our work.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. ENOS: But Maui would be awesome.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah. We think so. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Enos and Noe, for being here this afternoon, and for sharing the indigenizing economics. So, I'm not really familiar about what that is all about, but it sounds like an economy. The economy live...that we are living in today is a different economy than our grand...our ancestors were living in. Because the economy we live in today is capitalistic.

MR. ENOS: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: And the economy that we lived in at that time was one of sharing, right? Everybody had their own masters, whether you're a canoe builder, limu gatherer, a fisherman, kalo, you know, if you were working in the ag, in the fields, and things like that. So, how do you...I'm trying to figure out, how do you foresee taking all of this indigenous knowledge and wisdom, and converting it into an economy in which we...is pretty foreign to some people today, especially if they weren't...you know, I mean, if they're like in their 30s or 40s, they're kind of like removed from their great, great grandparents and how they were...they were living at the time. I know when I was a kid, my grandfather...both my grandparents were retired firemen, but one of them also was the one that planted the kalo and the other one was a fisherman. And they made a lot of their...of their living by doing those things. And the only reason why they went to work is they had to get real money to pay the electric and the water.

MR. ENOS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, how do you see that coming together, and in terms of how long will it take to establish the practice in which you're trying to engage the community in? And is there a living wage in that?

MR. ENOS: Yeah, wonderful question. I'm lucky enough that my dad and a bunch of his peers in the '80s were part of what they called the movement of community-based economic development.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: They were like Colette Machado, like all these --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: -- people were really heavily --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: -- asking questions of like, you cannot just hold signs in a rural --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: -- community because --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: -- you're going to split the community in half, right?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: So, they're always thinking about, well, what are the mechanisms that you can...well, can you bring these things into a contemporary economic paradigm? And I think Hawai'i actually is kind of leading the way. We have some really wonderful organizations, like Hawai'i Alliance...Hawai'i Alliance...HACBED, Hawai'i Alliance Community-Based Economic Development, Purple Mai'a Foundation, Hawai'i Investment Ready. Like there's a...Hawai'i has a really robust community of like really brilliant Hawaiian and kama'āina...not Hawaiian, but Hawaiian-allied people that are thinking deeply around that. And I think...it's a hard question because like I never deal in absolutes. Like...and I'm not a Sith . . . *(inaudible)*. . . . *(laughing)*. . . but like...like it's a gradient. And I think they'll take time because it...you know, really it took us generations to get this dependent on it. You can't just --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: -- shift it immediately. But what I have found in the spaces I work, like at Ma'o and other places, there are a lot of people willing to invest, you know, in...in these types of practices. We're able to show it to a lot of philanthropists that having money is very different than having solutions. And part of like what we could show in that presentation, for example, on the farm, my friend's lo'i kalo, I call it...funnily, I call it manatization. Mana, to me, one of the definitions was a chief's right to rule. . . . *(inaudible)*. . . ruling chiefs, a chief couldn't...our chief couldn't rule if the people weren't abundant and --

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: -- landscapes weren't productive. If you had that, you had mana. In contemporary times, you can have money, and not have people be productive, and the landscape be abundant. But if you are able to make landscapes abundant and people productive, you will attract money to it. So, some of the models we looked at, how do we bring money into the space to set a living wage for a community member...we'll, then do the research to show, and that's why policy presentations are so important, like what is the long-term impact of healthy ecosystems, right, versus the short-term gain of like these quick ROIs on flipping a house and making profit. You know, what are the long-term ways we can think about it? I think all we can ever hope to do in our side is to provide communities the tools, and do the research to show like the impacts of these practices. But I think...and hopefully it can be helpful for policymakers and other types of social impact investors to take...like to build the infrastructure for that to happen over time. But central to us always, always, is a specific geography and the next generation's ability to live on that geography...and definitely using contemporary and ancestral practices. Does that make sense, Kari?

MS. NOE: Yeah, no. I think it...there's no right answer, like immediate answer--if someone snaps their fingers, it's going to change. But these incremental projects where...when Kamu set up the office and then when we designed an Indigenous Data Hub, seeing from in our space what we could change in the ways that the practice and the processes that are things that are done that could be an example of what are these kind of shifting models is the most that we can do in hopes that we create a model that is competitive, people are going to want to copy us. And it will get spread in that way. And in the same thing, I think education would be very important, which...teaching the next generation that you should be thinking about this kind of different paradigm of design and implementing...development of practice, maybe I should say. So, that they're trying out their own things in the spaces that they can reach. And through then, I think things will start to change.

MR. ENOS: Yeah. Is that helpful, Councilmember Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: That was helpful in a way, when I think about if all things goes well. As you know, in life, not everything goes well. We get hit with disasters all over the place sometimes. Climate change is going to impact so much of the way we live today. And I'm just wondering how is that going to impact the future as we try to unravel what has been done these past 100 or 200 years.

MR. ENOS: A thousand percent. I think through climate adaptation, our ancestors were...were masters of that. Like lo'i kalo is also really good at managing floods or managing for droughts so that the part when we call our ancestral...like my thing is, I tell like, you know, you got to learn Greek if you're going to know

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

sciences. You got to learn Latin if you don't know laws. You're going to learn indigenous language of a place if you're going to learn regenerative models. Because embedded in that language is a whole intact system of how to live indefinitely on the landscape. And it's like the seat, to me, like indigenous language is the . . . *(inaudible)*. . . seat of contemporary resilience. And I think that can be like what we can help to provide. Arm...not arm, but provide communities the tools to show deeply the impact of their intervention.

MS. NOE: I think I would just also add in which...I...why I think that Hawai'i's . . . *(inaudible)*. . . to climate resilience and stuff is it's not...and basically other Pacific islands is that it's not easy to live on an island, actually. It's easy to live...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No, it's not.

MS. NOE: We perfected it and everything. But there was a time where our ancestors didn't know what the best way was to live in Hawai'i because it was different from the places they came from, but they had the practice of kilo and other practices too.

MR. ENOS: Makawalu.

MS. NOE: And makawalu to establish that familiarity and that wealth and that...those structures and knowledge so that they made technological innovations like lo'i, and loko i'a, and that kind of thing. So, in the same way, I think it's critical. And what I--me personally--try to teach in when we're teaching the fellows about design is in that same ways of observation, of really listening and observing the environment and such, how do you design with the thought of being able to sustain yourself on an island with limited resources, with not having all the capacity, where we're not going to have all the...we may never have all the electricity in the world to run these things. What is the base practice? What is the things that you're building for that can...that...and what...or what are the things that you're building for, for the problems that you're trying to solve, and always know how to scale it and be flexible with the design.

MR. ENOS: And hope that our students can then help global societies. The world is going to be more like Hawai'i than Hawai'i is.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: And where do you get the land from to do these on?

MR. ENOS: Oh, we got all over. We have all of our practitioners. A lot of what we're working with is finding organizations that already have land that want to partner, and that we're helping them with their backend, and building technologies for them. So, I think it starts with supporting our network of community practitioners and students.

MS. NOE: Really taking care of land.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

MR. ENOS: To taking care of land. And this is a practice we're trying to build. There's a lot of I don't know yet, so we're in the process of trying to move forward with people to learn together, but helping the University, which has codified and supported.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Well, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama.

MR. ENOS: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, go ahead.

MR. ENOS: Just mahalo. Beautiful question.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

MR. ENOS: Appreciate it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then...my turn. And just a reminder, Members, we're at bare quorum. So, if we can just for a few more minutes stay...stay with your cameras. Stay here. Don't go anywhere. They have to go. So, we're not going to...I'm just going to ask my question, and then we'll adjourn. Mahalo, Director Enos, for demonstrating what holding space for our next gen and...and for wāhine leadership looks like. I...I...I just...I'm loving that so much. Mahalo. I wanted to quickly dovetail off what the last discussion point...or the last point of discussion regarding kilo and makawalu of our...you know, our ancestral practices. But also reiterating what was said before, in listening to 'āina as our older sibling and kumu. So much of what is built today is now done with the expectation of permanency in mind. Structures, roads, you know, other infrastructure, and...and it hasn't been without lots of pa'i to all of us. You know --

MR. ENOS: Eō.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- building along the shoreline, and then wanting to build seawalls when erosion and sea level rise erodes the foundation of a structure or a road, and then, you know, just waiting too long before taking action oftentimes. So, on...on Molokai, we still have a thriving second economy, subsistence gathering, as Uncle Walter Ritte likes to call it. We, of course, have our...you know, our cash economy, but our community is very protective of ensuring that our subsistence-gathering economy persists for next generations. In so many ways, the...the dominant extractive capitalistic economy, if not carefully regulated, you know, can lead to our own demise. Many social,

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

environmental, and cultural costs are often externalized in the cash economy, so those costs aren't factored into a business' bottom line. For example --

MR. ENOS: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- you know, carbon footprint that a business has was never something incorporated into their cost for mitigation until society can no longer ignore that. So, my question is, what would be your recommendation...like how should a government ensure factors, like ecosystem services, are included into, you know, potential financial impact?

MR. ENOS: Yeah. No, I really love that question. I think that's the...the goal of what we're trying to do. Like one of the things like my...you know, I ran a business, I was part of running a business for many years that when we're at Ma'ō, right. So, we're not adverse to economic development. And quite frankly, I think, given the right context, we think, you know, really be critical for us to have our emerging economic engines that can factor that in. The first thing I think is really important is to have a nonperformative relationship with your indigenous communities. The one thing, when I was like studying economic...indigenous economics and so forth, is like we understood...like we...our ancestors were...if you think about an ahupua'a model, which is for most islands like except maybe for Hawai'i Island, we're able to...within that context, if you want to speak about it in business terms, it actually sounds really great. We're able to like create a good or a service for a market without externalizing the cost of production on land and people. Like when we grew kalo, we weren't polluting the waterways. Like when we were catching the fish, like we weren't like diminishing our returns, diminishing the carrying capacity of our stocks. We managed our...our natural systems as an asset. You know, we knew our principal and our interest, and we knew our carrying capacity. So, when you have a nonperformative relationship with your indigeneity, like your indigenous practices, you're really looking at it as a codex, right, that you can model contemporary...contemporary iterations of...off of, and that allows you to see the people that hold that knowledge as really fundamental to helping guide the way forward. I think the second level I think about like as a...after having a nonperformative relationship is willing to be curious and invest in pilots. You know, and like we're hopefully trying to de-risk some of that by providing technology and support for that work wraparound. And there are a lot of other organizations that are trying to do it. But I really believe that looking at ancestral models as an important basis for thinking about contemporary innovation, having community at the table, is really key to that. And the precedent...you know, like the precedent of our ability to be self-sufficient is really the basis of why we would explore it. I think there is a lot of...really, the last part is like to be aware of the existing projects, or community organizations, or like networks that are already...like there's a lot of...a lot of work has been put into this space already like because there's...like our...our office, the Office of Indigenous Knowledge and Innovation sits directly under the Vice-President of Research for the University of Hawai'i system. We're the only R1 University in

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

America that has like indigenous community this well organized to be...we're guiding how Office of Research is thinking about its research. And we're tracking...we're guiding like National Science Foundation and other folks to rethink their engagement with indigenous communities. So, like, you know, we'll continue to be at the table to support policymakers and thinking it through. But like those are some tangible steps of like a nonperformative relationship with your indigenous community. A willingness to invest in pilots, and a willingness to kind of do some like broader landscape analysis of the existing state of the field, and then figure out how that can support those types of practices. Kari?

MS. NOE: I don't know how to put this in a government way because I'm not familiar...as familiar with government, but as I see it as a designer is that to design in this way, there are just basically other additional metrics you have to consider...when it's sustainability, when it's your carbon footprint like you said. And what needs to happen is that these metrics need to be well-defined and then upheld so that a transition, that everyone has a new guiding star to design to and optimize to. Because in that way, if we don't have a direct...like direct metrics of where things need to change, or how you can ask businesses or others to change their practice to optimize for those metrics, people are going to continue, and entities are going to continue just meeting the metrics that are here now, which may not be sustainable for the future. But how do you mitigate that tension to add new metrics or optimize for that is what I feel like. But...

MR. ENOS: Yeah. And more wāhine leadership. That was the key part. That's why I wanted...Kari is going to be the next director. I'm holding space for her until she's ready to pick it up. So, hopefully that was helpful, Councilmember Rawlins.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: This Council is very much for wāhine leadership. We have a super majority of wāhine here. I think it's really interesting what you're saying, Ms. Noe. The...the metrics of...of here and now oftentimes are...are...are just used as like the minimum, you know, to...to meet, and is not, you know, looking forward seven generations, which is like part of our culture, right? And it reminded me of a quote from Uncle Mac Poepoe, and I'm summarizing. When you...when you catch a fish, you need to know how you'll put two fish back. You know...you know, in thinking about carrying capacity, more than just a net zero impact, but building that...in that mentality of abundance for the next seven generations.

MR. ENOS: Eō. No, I really agree. And I just want to close, like you know, one of the kumus that raised me is Uncle Eddie Ka'anana and Uncle Walter Paulo and they were master 'ōpelu fisheries. And I got a chance to be raised under them. And I was watching a video that was done on their practice while I was in graduate school in my econ class trying not to stick a pencil in my eye because I dropped out of high school pre-algebra...you know, because I just...but then what I realized was they were managing an endowment. They knew the principal and they knew the interest at all points. They could like understand...they would

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

never pull all the fish, but they could manage it permanently. And if we treat...if we look at those...that sound economic principles versus let's have Hawaiians open with chants and then talk about the way things...have them out of the room when we talk about business as usual. That's what I mean about the nonperformative relationship. Uncle Mac is one of...Uncle Mac would have been considered an economist in pre-contact society, not an ecologist. He understood the basis of the economy that supported the people. He understood true wealth. And he continued to understand, so I appreciate that you brought his name into the space. He's one of my me'e, Uncle Mac.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mine too. Mahalo again, Dr. Enos and Ms. Noe. I'll invite you to provide any closing remarks if you'd like.

MS. NOE: Well, and just mahalo for inviting us...I mean you invited Kamu, and I got surprised with it this morning. But I'm very grateful you...this...we were invited to share what we're working on. And I hope what we shared was useful of the time we were allotted.

MR. ENOS: We...we really want to support any way realistically we can in the time and in order of operation. But we really...I'm...we're grateful for the opportunity to present, and we really think a lot about Maui and, you know, that, what you're...what you're holding for all of us, and how you're modeling what it really means to be resilient. So, mahalo kākou, and anytime we can help within our capacity to do so, we will. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo a nunui. I think there's a lot of interest in the interactive maps. So...so, maybe we'll be in touch with you folks about that or with Deputy Director Koa Hewahewa if he's a point person on...on...on working on that. That would be amazing.

MR. ENOS: We really want to see it as a practice, not just as a map. So, we're super down to like think about it as a practice that can be taught, 1,000 percent.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: E kala mai, yeah, not a map, practice.

MR. ENOS: No, no, no, it is a map. But it's a practice. But I think that's the key part is who uses it, and how do they use it, and training them to use it is super critical.

MS. NOE: I'm not trying to get people to...infatuated just with the technology. The technology is simple, but the way we use it is integral.

MR. ENOS: I really appreciate that. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Mahalo for being with us today.

MR. ENOS: Okay. Aloha kākou.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MR. ENOS: A hui hou.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: A hui hou. Okay, Members, so that concludes item ESCS-1(9). If there are no objections, we'll defer this item.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS (excused: SS).

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. And quickly, before we adjourn, I just wanted to bring your folks' attention to our agenda. I'm sure you saw it. It's our first of all the agendas that will be both in English and 'Ōlelo Hawai'i, so, mahalo to our Communication Specialists, Nālani, for working on that and getting that all done. And then we're on Zoom today. So, I wanted to see if there was any feedback since this was our pilot. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Seamless, right? We didn't have any interruptions except that resounding echoing, but that was not part of Zoom. That was not Zoom. Anyway, good. We use it at home, so this is very familiar to many of us.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. I...I'm...I'm liking it too. Microsoft Teams was...is...is, you know, good to use, I think, in private meetings, I use that, but I think for public meetings, it's not a good fit. And so, I...I think Staff is liking Zoom better too. Oh, okay. They...they haven't...they don't love it yet. You will, though. . . .*(laughing)*. . . And Member Cook said he already gave his feedback. . . .*(laughing)*. . . Okay. Member Kama, did you have anything else? Okay. All right. So, it's 3:14. And Staff, do I need to do anything else? Did I miss anything? Good, good? Okay. Okay. Well, it's 3:14, and the ESCS Committee is now adjourned. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

ADJOURN: 3:14 p.m.

APPROVED:



KEANI N.W. RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ, Chair
Efficiency Solutions and Circular Systems
Committee

escs:min:240701:ds

Transcribed by: Daniel Schoenbeck

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

July 1, 2024

CERTIFICATION

I, Daniel Schoenbeck, hereby certify that pages 1 through 34 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 3rd day of September 2024, in Wailuku, Hawai'i



Daniel Schoenbeck