

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

June 24, 2025

Online Only via Teams

RECONVENE: 5:02 p.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Tasha Kama, Chair
Councilmember Nohelani U‘u-Hodgins, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member
Councilmember Gabe Johnson, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member (Out 8:24 p.m.)
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Member
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member

STAFF: James Krueger, Senior Legislative Analyst
Ellen McKinley, Legislative Analyst
Carla Nakata, Legislative Attorney
Jennifer Yamashita, Committee Secretary
Jean Pokipala, Council Services Assistant Clerk
Ryan Martins, Council Ambassador

Residency Area Office (RAO):

Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Moloka‘i Residency Area Office
Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lāna‘i Residency Area Office
Mavis Oliveira, Council Aide, East Maui Residency Area Office
Bill Snipes, Council Aide, South Maui Residency Area Office
Clyde “Buddy” Almeida, Council Aide, Makawao-Ha‘ikū-Pā‘ia Residency Area Office

ADMIN.: Chris Nāhulu Nunokawa, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

OTHERS: Testifiers
Robin Knox
Brian Banks
Owen Kahauhane
Nia Fitzpatrick
Kaniela Ing
Steve Cawley
Roger Williams
Sne Patel
Andrea Comstock
Dan McKenna
Kili Namau‘u

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

Jeremy Stice
Destiny Kucko
Mitchell Tipton
Patricia Cadiz
Jim Loughead
Justin Kekiwi
TESTIFIER 1
Nicole Heard
Sherry Owen-Siekmann
Rebekah Uccellini
Stacy Moniz
Ron Hansen
Tom Croly
Keala Cabanilla
Kamaehu Marrotte
Lexi Figueroa
Kelcie Rapoza
Ron Siliado
Albert Perez
Amber Ngo
Junya Nakoa
Sara
Laguna Jabola-Ing
Ember
Gretchen Losano
Keaka Mitchell
Alex Bendetov
Anon AJ
Al Medeiros
Others (150)

PRESS: *Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the recessed Housing and Land Use Committee meeting of June 9th, 2025, come to order. It is now 5:02 p.m. on June 24th, 2025. I'm Tasha Kama, Chair of the Housing and Land Use Committee. This online meeting is being conducted in accordance with the Sunshine Law. Members, when your name is called, if you are not with me in the Chamber, please identify by name who, if anyone, is in your workspace with you today. Minors do not need to be identified. Any questions before we begin, Members? Seeing none. Thank you. So, I want to say aloha 'auinalā to Committee Vice-Chair Nohe U'u-Hodgins.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Aloha, Chair. Aloha, everyone. I'm at my private residence. I have five minors running around the house and one adult, Koa Hodgins. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. I want to go and say aloha awakea to Chair Lee.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aloha awakea kākou.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Good evening, everyone, and welcome to our Chambers. Thanks.

CHAIR KAMA: I want to say good evening and aloha awakea to Council Vice-Chair Yuki Lei Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aloha awakea, and looking forward to a productive meeting. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. And we want to say aloha awakea to Councilmember Tamara Paltin. I don't see her online. Does anyone see her?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: She was here.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . She'll be back.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, okay. She's here. Okay. We'll just recognize her when she comes back. I want to say aloha awakea to Councilmember Gabe Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aloha, Chair, Councilmembers, community members. There's no testifiers over at the Lāna'i District Office, and I'm alone on my side of the office, and I'm here and ready to work. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. And we want to say aloha awakea to Councilmember Keani Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha 'auinalā. Awakea ends at about like 2:00 p.m., and then it's 'auinalā, the sun is going down.

CHAIR KAMA: Still good.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I am... . . .*(laughing)*. . . I am alone in my room at my private residence, and there are currently no testifiers at the Moloka'i District Office. And Chair --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- I was signed in earlier. and I...I fully understand what all the testifiers who had trouble with Teams --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- getting their mic to work --

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- because I heard you say, I can't see Keani. And I was on, and I was like, I'm right here, but my camera and mic won't work. So, you know, I...I...I feel for all of our testifiers. And what I did is if you have a...if you have a Mac, a MacBook, if you go to force quit, and then you force quit and then you reopen the application, then it could work. If you have a PC, I can't help you. Okay. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So, all you Mac users. Thank you for that. So, I want to say aloha 'auinalā to Councilmember Tom Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aloha, Chair. Aloha, Members. I'm at my home office in Kihei. There's nobody at the Kihei office to give testimony, and I'm looking forward to this evening. I was planning on coming to the Chambers, but I leave early morning tomorrow on a flight to Big Island for a training. So, thank you for allowing me to do it from home.

CHAIR KAMA: Absolutely. And so, we want to say aloha 'auinalā to Councilmember Shane Sinenci. I just...there he is.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Hey, aloha, Chair. Aloha 'auinalā kākou, mai Maui Hikina. Here at my home office, and I'm here by myself. No testifiers in Hāna, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. And we have with us, from the Department of the Corporation Counsel, Mr. Nāhulu Nunokawa. Aloha 'auinalā.

MR. NUNOKAWA: Aloha 'auinalā, Chair and Councilmembers.

CHAIR KAMA: So, Members, since we expect to continue to take testimony for the entire time set aside for this meeting, we are not permitted to ask questions of the Administration until we have concluded testimony to avoid the possibility of discussion that is beyond the simple question that veers into deliberations. To respect the time of the Administration Staff, their attendance in person is optional. And they may be in attendance virtually, and we welcome their attendance if their schedules allow. At this time, I want to welcome Councilmember Tamara Paltin. Aloha 'auinalā.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha 'auinalā kākou. Safe travels to anyone coming from the West Side. The surf is up, and the moon is kind of new-ish.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you for that. So, I want to say aloha 'auinalā to our Committee Staff, Mr. James Krueger, our Senior Legislative Analyst.

MR. KRUEGER: Good evening, Chair and Members.

CHAIR KAMA: I want to say aloha 'auinalā to our Legislative Analyst, Ellen McKinley. Aloha.

MS. MCKINLEY: Aloha 'auinalā.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: And we want to say aloha ‘auinalā to our Committee Secretary, Jennifer Yamashita.

MS. YAMASHITA: Good afternoon, Chair and Members...evening. Sorry.

CHAIR KAMA: We also want to say aloha ‘auinalā to our Legislative Attorney Carla Nakata.

MS. NAKATA: Aloha, Chair and Members.

CHAIR KAMA: And we have Ms. Lei Dinneen out in the lobby taking all of our testifiers. And that is our Assistant Clerk, Lei Dinneen. So, thank you, Members, for attending today’s HLU Committee meeting.

ITEM 4: BILL 9 (2025), AMENDING CHAPTERS 19.12, 19.32, AND 19.37, MAUI COUNTY CODE, RELATING TO TRANSIENT VACATION RENTALS IN APARTMENT DISTRICTS

CHAIR KAMA: And we have one single item on the agenda today. It’s Bill 9, Amending Chapters 19.12, 19.32, and 19.37 of the Maui County Code Relating to Transient Vacation Rentals in Apartment Districts. We’re scheduled to meet today until 8:00 this evening. Given the continued interest in the bill, we may still be hearing testimony up until that time. If we have many testifiers on the list, I will recess this meeting to June 25, 2025, at 1:00 p.m. But I will be asking you, Members, towards the end of our scheduled time at 8:00 p.m., if there appears to be an opportunity that we could conclude oral testimony this evening. I will also recess this meeting for one mid-meeting break around 6:30 for ten minutes. And I hope that by providing this information now, that Members and the public are better informed as to how we’ll be managing our meeting time. And I ask for your full cooperation and participation. So, in accordance with the Sunshine Law, as Chair, I will be calling for testimony for our single-item agenda in the following order. A last call for those who were called in the previous meetings on this topic, but who did not respond to that call for testimony; those who were on the testifier list yesterday, but were not called to testify; and finally, those who signed up for testimony tonight. Members, Staff will be calling those who have been on the list, but not have...but have not responded to the call to testify in our prior meetings, in groups of five. Please listen, and indicate your readiness to testify when you hear your name. If you do not indicate your readiness, we will not call you again to testify later in this meeting. Since this is a recessed meeting, if you have already provided your oral testimony, you will not be able to testify again, but you are always welcome to submit written testimony via eComment. I ask those here and online to testify, please address your comments in favor or against the bill to the Chair of the Committee, not to others in the office or other members of the public. I will need to enforce decorum in this meeting, and in all future meetings on this bill, to respect this space as a safe space for all voices to speak. Again, I ask for your kokua. So, let’s proceed with public testimony. For individuals testifying in person, you can sign up to testify with the Staff members in the 8th Floor lobby. For Microsoft Teams participants logged in via web or the Teams app, please indicate that you would like to testify by clicking the raise-your-hand icon in the top right of your window, and Staff will add your name to

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

the testifier's list. If you are joined by telephone, star-5 will raise your virtual hand, and Staff will put your name on the testifier's list. Please keep your audio and video muted until you're called to testify. Written testimony is encouraged and be...can be submitted via the eComment link at mauicounty.us/agendas. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes per item. When you reach the two-minute mark, you will hear an audible notice. We will test that audible notice now.

. . .*(timer sounds)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, James. If you're still testifying when the notice sounds, please complete your testimony within the remaining minute. Given the volume of expected testimony, I will have to hold you firmly to those limits. When testifying, we ask that you state your full name for the record, and anonymous testimony is also accepted. For those on Microsoft Teams, please ensure your name appears in Teams as the name you prefer to be referred to, or as anonymous if you wish to testify anonymously. If you're in person, please notify Staff if you'd like to testify anonymously. Otherwise, please state your name for the record at the beginning of your testimony. Decorum will need to be maintained throughout this meeting, and violation of decorum may result in being removed from the Chamber or the online meeting. Again, this is a public space, and must be a safe space for all voices to be spoken and heard, and I'm believing that we'll conduct ourselves in a professional manner. I will only enforce the rules of decorum when a testifier breaks decorum. A testifier will be reminded the first time I see the rules of decorum have been violated. Any additional reminders, I will then have to direct Staff to silence the microphone, and your testimony time will be considered complete. You can also view the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, or mauicounty.us/agendas. Thank you all for your cooperation. And at this time, I'm going to ask Staff to call our next testifiers wishing to testify on Bill 9 according to the current list of testifiers. Ellen?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, for testifiers signed up on a previous day, we will be calling names in sets of five. If your name is called, please raise your hand on Teams or identify yourself if you are in the Chamber. Here are the first five names. Susan Halas, David Switzenberg, John Angel, Marde Werner, Susan McIntosh. Chair, we'll...we will do a brief countdown to see if anyone identifies themselves...three, two, one. Chair, seeing no one, we will proceed with the next five names. Hoai Thuong Ha, Robin Knox--I do see her on Teams--and then Jenny, Tovia Tufuga, and Charles Andrion. Ms. Knox, you're unmuted on our end.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

MS. KNOX: Can you hear me?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. KNOX: Okay, great. Thank you so much. And thank you for allowing me to be on the list again, even though I didn't respond when you called earlier because I have been moving, which is something that I'm going to talk about in my testimony. I would ask

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

you to recall the saying that the definition of insanity is doing the same thing over again, and expecting different results. And I would ask you not to be insane with your vote on Bill 9. I support Bill 9 because the last two to three decades of decisions by the County Council have favored off-island investors more than they favored the residents of the County. And so, don't repeat that insanity. Vote in a way that will support residents. That being said, everything's not black and white. I think there are good amendments that could be made that might reduce the number of Minatoya lists where short-term rentals are prohibited but still provide a great number of additional rentals for our community. For instance, I personally would not object if there are residents who--and I mean full-time residents, vote here, driver's license here, all that kind of stuff--if there are residents who own one condo, I would not object to them being able to do short-term rentals. But these people that are investors, and who have multiple condos, those are the ones where some policy intervention is needed. And then I'd also like to say that the costs that everyone's talking about, the...the economic losses, and the losses of their retirement, and all of these things, a lot of those are projected, and haven't actually happened, whereas the costs that haven't . . .(timer sounds). . . been quantified, like residents, are happening...really happening. And that's where the moving comes in. I wanted to draw your attention to due to our housing shortage, people are having to move frequently, and it can easily cost \$10,000 to move by the time you get first and last month's rent, and all the requirements of landlords for professional cleaners, and pest control, and all the things you have to do when you move out. So, our people are really suffering, not just from the shortage of housing, but from the insecurity of their housing. So, thank you very much for allowing me to testify.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, any questions for our testifier? I have a question for you. So, did you say that you would be open to having local people who, by ID card or whatever (*audio interference*).

MS. KNOX: I couldn't hear you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: I'm sorry. Did you say in your testimony that you would be okay with local people owning an STR?

MS. KNOX: Yes, I did. I...I...I think the policy change that's needed is for policies to benefit our residents, not off-island investors. And, you know, the...the statistics that the Administration presented at the beginning showed that the vast majority of these are owned by off-island investors, and many of them own multiple units. I don't think any of us are kind of saying, oh, we don't want aunty to be able to realize her retirement dream, you know, that she saved up her money from cleaning hotel rooms, and she bought a condo, and now she has a short-term rental. I don't think that is the...the policy that we're trying to enact, to get rid of that opportunity for local people. I think what we're trying to do is shift our economic policy to something more reliable than tourism, and to something that benefits our local residents more than it does off-island investors.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Thank you very much. Members, any other questions? Seeing none. Thank you so very much. Ellen?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next five testifiers, please identify yourselves if you hear your name. John Simpliciano, Jacqueline Tavares, Ron Siciliato (*phonetic*), Nick Neal, and Jack Van Bowling...Boening (*phonetic*). We'll do a brief countdown...three, two, one. Chair, seeing no one identifying themselves, we'll go on to the next five. Jim Walsh, Peter Davis, Jennifer Chawn, Kelly Keahi, and John Steinbach. We'll do a brief countdown...three, two, one. Chair, proceeding with the next five. Taytum Herrick, Peter Lazzlo, Brian Banks--we do believe he's here--Brandi Corpuz, and Kathy Englert. Brian, please go ahead.

MR. BANKS: Aloha, Chairperson, Councilmembers, and my fellow citizens. My name is Brian Banks. I'm a 26-year full-time resident of Maui, and a short-term rental owner. I strongly oppose Bill 9. I want to highlight three key points that I believe have been overlooked. First, STRs don't make a profit. Contrary to what we heard many times during these hearings, most STRs don't remove the money from Maui. The STR income covers the costs, and allows owners to visit the place they love. The money stays here. It pays local property managers, cleaners, maintenance crews, contractors, and a significant amount in taxes. I shared with you a sample income statement from a typical Wailea STR. 30 percent of revenue goes to County taxes, 10 percent to State taxes--so, 40 percent total to taxes--55 percent to local jobs, 5 percent to insurance. The owner, at best, breaks even, or ends up losing about 10 percent. And that's assuming the mortgage is paid off. Second, history shows these units won't convert to local housing. We have seen this before. In 2008, when the real estate market crashed, Wailea condo prices dropped by 50 percent. Still, local families didn't buy them or rent them. Third, the importance of property rights. This is the most important point because it has long-term lasting impacts. When we erode property rights, we lose trust and investment. It discourages people from owning here, depresses property values, eliminates jobs, and weakens . . .(*timer sounds*). . . our tax base. And half the...about 100 percent of the savings of local families are tied in their homes. If the real estate prices go down by half, their retirement savings will go down by half. It won't help any of us. When we talk about the economic impacts of banning STRs, we talk about the immediate impact on tax revenues and jobs. But the long-term consequences could be much broader, and much more damaging. Look at the news. Something happens in Middle East, stock market crashes. Even if you don't own any stock, it impacts us because everything is connected. Imagine if something at the other side of the world has that much impact on us, what would be the impact of dumping 7,000 condos on the real estate market? Everyone is watching your decision. If people worry what's next and feel that their property is not safe, they'll go elsewhere, and we will . . .(*timer sounds*). . . lose jobs, tax revenue. We will all suffer.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Banks.

MR. BANKS: Thank you for your time.

CHAIR KAMA: Members, questions for our testifier? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Banks, for your testimony. Could you clarify how much STRs you own on Maui?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. BANKS: Yes. I'm glad you asked that question because for a while you stopped asking. So, I'd like to give you a more complete answer than other people did because we are not just a number.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just really need the number.

MR. BANKS: We moved here...we moved here 26 years ago. My wife and I, we love it here. We are immigrants. We love the diverse population here. We worked very hard.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Me too, but I...I just wanted the number because plenty of people want to...

MR. BANKS: I understand. But I think it would help you to hear the story of one person at least. I brought in, working with other people, more than \$100 million worth of government contracts and create more than 100 jobs.

CHAIR KAMA: Mr. Banks, I'm sorry, but could you just respond to Member Paltin's question as to how many STRs you own? Is that possible, to just give her a number?

MR. BANKS: Yes, we put all our savings to STRs.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's okay, I can just look it up --

MR. BANKS: We are proud of it --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- on the TMK that you own three [sic].

MR. BANKS: -- and we own four --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But my other question is...

MR. BANKS: -- we own four at Wailea, STRs.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks. I'm done with that. But I looked it up. You own like three [sic]. That's...thank you. But the other question I had was, you know, when you said that the prices will go down in 2008 and nobody took advantage of it, what are your statistics on that? Because after the 2008 crash, my 'ohana was able to purchase a home. And I'm a local person. So, I...I just wanted to know if you had any statistics. Because from what you said, I wouldn't be able to have a house right now.

MR. BANKS: I was very specific talking about these condominiums, especially Wailea condominiums.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But you also said everything is interconnected.

MR. BANKS: That's correct.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's the interconnected. The stock market crashed in 2008. My 'ohana was able to purchase a home after that. That's the interconnectedness.

MR. BANKS: I'm very happy for them.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I'm asking what statistics that no locals were able to own...purchase?

MR. BANKS: And I will share you my statistics. I've been in the Wailea real estate market since 1999. And I know pretty much...because there's a limited number of them, I know pretty much everything that exchanges hands.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks.

MR. BANKS: In 2008...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can you send that in? Because I don't know if I want to just take your word for it. Send it in. Thank you.

MR. BANKS: Okay.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Banks. Members, any other questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much.

MR. BANKS: Thank you for your time.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, calling the next five testifiers. If your name is called, please raise your hand on Teams or identify yourself if you are in the Chamber. Here are the next five names. Austin, Wendy Anderson, Jessica Taguiped, Kirsten, Roger Williams is on Teams. And those are the next five. *(pause)* Mr. Williams, can you unmute yourself and give your testimony, please? *(pause)* Mr. Williams, if you're having trouble, you can try calling in on the information in the chat. *(pause)* Chair, shall I go on with the next five names?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, please. Thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: Next testifiers are John Webb, to be followed by Lonnie, Paul Belshoff, Theresa O'Toole, and Bonnie. *(pause)* Do a brief countdown...three, two, one. Chair, should we proceed with the next testifiers?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes. Yes, thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: PDG, to be followed by Gregory Wilson, Arthur C, George Fulton, Bryant Ocasio. *(pause)* Do a brief countdown...three, two, one. Chair, seeing no one responding. The next five testifiers, please do raise your hand on...oh. Please do raise your hand on Teams, or make yourself known in the Chamber. The next five are Owen Kahauhane, to be followed by Cliff K, Leni English, Sarah Anne, Anne Barber.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. WEST: I have Owen on the line. Go ahead, Owen.

MR. KAHAUHANE: Hello, my name is Owen Kahauhane, and I lived in Lāhainā on 1410 Front Street. Our family owned for about six years, living there growing up as a kid. And I guess 20 years ago, housing was affordable for a lot of the employees, especially for the hotel industry. And they had condominiums set up for that. They had...they didn't have the long-term rentals available in homes, so condominiums actually took up that. And eventually, I guess, that got phased out. But unfortunately, the prices of homes kept increasing, and it's getting harder and harder for local people to afford to buy their own homes in Maui. And it was a problem, you know, 10, 15 years ago, and it's quadrupled because of the fire. And it's sad because we have people that are not part of the Lāhainā area, or in Hawai'i, that's being supported by the higher rental prices. And they're being catered, and unfortunately, the local people are being phased out, and we have to deal with the aftermath. I'm hoping that we can resolve the issue, and figure out a way to increase or completely stop these short-term rentals and allow...you know, at least in this process, find a way to make it where we don't have to tell our . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . keikis to move away. We need to keep them here in the islands. And it's tough. My son doesn't live here. He lives in Vegas because he can't afford. I have two daughters that live in Alaska because they can't afford to live here. Fortunately, I have one daughter that lives in O'ahu, and that's because her family was able to help set something up years ago. But it's sad. We can't even keep our own children here in the islands while we're letting other people dictate what kind of costs, and what prices are for the...the housing market will be. I hope that...that my testimony to you will be sufficient. And, you know, all we're asking is to consider the local people. . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . We're the ones going to be here day in, day out. And we're stuck with the taxes and --

MR. WEST: Time's up.

MR. KAHAUHANE: -- short-term rentals are doing taxes on the mainland.

MR. WEST: Brother Owen, your time's up.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Kahauhane.

MR. KAHAUHANE: Okay.

MR. WEST: Thanks, Owen.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Members, questions?

MR. KAHAUHANE: All right. Well, I hope this works.

MR. WEST: Yeah, you got...you got one question.

MR. KAHAUHANE: I appreciate...

CHAIR KAMA: Owen? Member Paltin --

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. WEST: You get one question.

CHAIR KAMA: -- has a question for you.

MR. KAHAUHANE: Yes.

CHAIR KAMA: Go ahead, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Kahauhane. I just wanted to clarify. You said that 20 years ago, long-term rental use in the condos was phased out and...and it became more short-term rentals, and kind of what you said.

MR. WEST: Did you hear that, Owen?

MR. KAHAUHANE: Yes, yes. Because a personal friend of mine actually used to live in Pohailani, and that's not available now.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MR. KAHAUHANE: People that turned that into, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So...

MR. KAHAUHANE: -- short-term rental instead of long-term.

MR. WEST: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: To clarify --

MR. KAHAUHANE: And...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- you support Bill 9?

MR. WEST: To clarify, you support Bill 9, Owen?

MR. KAHAUHANE: I...I support Bill 9, to phase out short-term rentals. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MR. WEST: Thanks, Owen.

CHAIR KAMA: Members, any other questions --

MR. KAHAUHANE: I appreciate. Thank you for hearing me.

CHAIR KAMA: -- for Mr. Kahauhane? Seeing none. Thank you.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. WEST: Mahalo. He's at work.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah, saves time. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, proceeding with the next five names, please make yourself known to Staff or raise your hand on Teams if your name is called. James Harber, Brian Paris, last four digits 0942, last four digits 9581--we do see them on the call--and last four digits 8047. *(pause)* Will the caller with the last four digits 9581 please unmute? You can do that by pressing star-6, and please state your name for the record. *(pause)* Testifier with the last four digits 9581, it's your turn to testify. Star-6 to unmute. *(pause)* Chair, should we proceed with the next?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Ali Miller, Raul Goodness, Noreen McKinley, Sherri Curry, and Jarrett Chapin. If any of you are present, please make yourself known...raise your hands on Teams, or let Staff know in the Chamber. Chair, we'll do a brief countdown for those folks...three, two, one. Chair, seeing no one, should we go on to the next? Oh.

CHAIR KAMA: Please.

MS. MCKINLEY: The next five testifiers are Rob K, Kevin, caller with the last four digits 2711, Kaliko Teruya, and Gretchen Losano. Chair, I don't see anyone responding to those. It's the last call--three, two, one--on those names. Chair, the next testifier is Nia Fitzpatrick, and then Keith J, Reverend Jules Givot, Cece Marks--and that is all from the previous day's signups. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MS. MCKINLEY: We do show that Nia Fitzpatrick is in the Chamber [sic].

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, okay. Good.

MS. FITZPATRICK: Aloha, mai kākou. This is Nia Fitzpatrick on Teams. Should I start?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, please.

MS. FITZPATRICK: Okay. Well, first, I want to say thank you guys to the Maui County Council for being here to listen to our testimony, and thank you also for your patience with the technology and all that. It's...I just really appreciate that you guys are giving us so many different ways to be heard. You know, I originally wasn't sure if I should testify. I didn't know what exactly I had to say to add to the conversation, but after attending in person last week, I felt inspired to add my piece to the conversation. So, this evening, I would like to testify in support of Bill 9. I am not Kānaka, nor was I born here, but I am keiki o ka 'āina. I grew up in Huelo, and of my eight siblings, only two of us are able to live here now. So, all of my siblings between the ages of maybe, I don't know, like 25 to 40, we've all had to move off-island. This is renters, not even talking about trying to

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

purchase our own home. I also have an uncle who was living unhoused on the beach in Kihei, and he suffered a traffic fatality. He was crossing the street, and was killed by a motor vehicle. I think if he had a home with a roof over his head, that might not have been the outcome of his story. I feel strongly that we need to focus on people over profits at this time. Despite UHERO's estimates that we may suffer approximately 1,900 lost jobs and an economic downturn, based on the fact that the future is uncertain in our nation and in the world . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . we can't really base our decisions on those projections. We have to base our decisions on a heart-centered place of what do our people and what does Maui County truly need? I'm strongly in support of Bill 9 as well because I've been struggling for approximately five years to even find affordable housing for myself as a single individual. And I now live in a one-bedroom, which feels like a luxury. A one-bedroom should not feel like a luxury. Housing should not feel like a luxury. Affordable housing should not feel like a luxury. Please take into consideration all of the powerful testimonies you have heard in support of Bill 9, and our Kānaka Maoli, and our future generations. And please vote from the heart. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions? Member Paltin has a question for you, Nia.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Fitzpatrick. I was wondering, how many parking spaces would you need if...if you were to get a unit?

MS. FITZPATRICK: I would need one parking space, but I also know unhoused individuals that don't have a car at all. So, they would probably be happy with a house and zero parking spaces.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then would 300 square feet be too little bit?

MS. FITZPATRICK: No, not at all. I also grew up in a one-room shack in Huelo with a family of four. So, any roof, any door...really, any wall can feel like a luxury for many of our families.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: You're welcome. Members, any others, questions? Seeing none. Thank you so very much, Ms. Fitzpatrick. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair --

MS. FITZPATRICK: Mahalo.

MS. MCKINLEY: -- Cece Marks has indicated that she is on the call, and we've just called her. Cece, you can go ahead and unmute yourself and testify, please. *(pause)* Cece, if you could please call in with the information listed in the chat? We're sorry that you're...it doesn't appear you're able to unmute. Chair, the --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: -- I wanted to clarify as well that for folks that signed up yesterday and didn't get called, we will be calling them now. Proceeding with those names, and we'll be calling three at a time. We have Heather, and then Kaniela Ing, and then Steve Cawley. *(pause)* Heather, if you can unmute yourself, it's your turn to testify. *(pause)* Chair, should we proceed with Kaniela Ing, please?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Mr. Ing, can you...

MR. ING: Okay. Aloha 'āina, Chair Kama. I'm Kaniela Ing. Airbnb and vacation rentals have destroyed the dream of my generation, local people owning homes and staying in Hawai'i. But this bill, Bill 9, is a rare chance to do the right thing...to return thousands of homes to kama'āina and Kānaka Maoli. To make right what was stolen from us. Every testimony I've heard these past few days opposing the bill starts with the same five words--I own a few units--and every time it's someone not from here, often not even living here. But you know who doesn't own a home? The locals. The working people who make Maui what it is. The hundreds of Hawaiians testifying these past few days in tears of people like me. I was born and raised on Maui, but I can't afford to live, or even visit the island that raised me. My mom had to sell our family home, so no more Christmas at grandma's house for my kids. They won't surf or fish or hunt in the places I learned to be Hawaiian. She lives in senior housing now, and when we visit, we have to stay at a hotel. So, yeah, it's personal. Hawai'i is short around 64,000 homes. There are 89,000 short-term rentals, roughly 75,000 of them are illegal. Converting these won't fix everything, but it's the single most impactful step we can take today, far more than we can build in the next decade. And even more importantly, it sends a message to the greedy, a demand signal that our island is not a playground for the rich, that this land is for growing food, growing family, not hoarding wealth. For our memories, not your margins. Maui is for Sunday dinners, baby luaus, quiet mornings, and musical nights. Not for someone's passive income, or your escape from a job that actually contributes to society. Now, some argue \$4,000 is too much for locals to rent, but it was under \$2,000 when you bought the place. It's your demand and artificial scarcity created by short-term rentals that raised the price. You can't blame the very problem you helped create. I worked in the city council of the State Legislature. I've led national housing campaigns. I've seen what works. Social housing in Vienna and Singapore, rent stabilization in Oregon and St. Paul. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . We have the solution. What we need is our leaders, you in this Committee, to have the political will. I see our kūpuna today, cheeks soaked with tears, not just because of the terrible reality of this issue, but because they finally have hope. They're seeing these young people standing up and realizing that we actually might have a chance this time. So, let us help you. Let all of us here help you help us rediscover the paradise of our home like the tourists get to. Many of my generation feel abandoned, like the generation before us let go of the rope. But Chair Kama and Committee, you have a chance to prove otherwise, to put a capstone on your amazing life of service, for this decision is ultimately how you will be remembered. So, please pass this bill, and return Maui's home to its working class. Mahalo me ka 'oia'i'o.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Members, any questions for Mr. Ing? Seeing none. It's nice to see you, Kaniela. Aloha.

MR. ING: Nice to see you. Aloha.

CHAIR KAMA: Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Heather, if she's able to unmute...if not, Steve Cawley. And then we'd like to go to Roger Williams, who seems to be able to testify now.

MR. CAWLEY: Can you hear me all right?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. CAWLEY: Yes. Hi. Can you hear me? Great. Thank you. I'm in opposition of Bill 9. The impact of Bill 9 on the Maui economy has already been negative, and its passage would certainly be more so. COVID, the Lāhainā fires, a strong U.S. dollar, tariffs, and now Bill 9. Maui business owners cannot afford more pressure in this tourism-reliant economy. All of this divisiveness out...airing out in public is further hurting Maui's ability to attract future investment. Why would anyone invest in an environment with so much negativity and uncertainty? To clarify, Maui isn't Barcelona, or New York City, or some other large city with multinational businesses employing thousands of people. Maui is 2,500 miles of ocean from the mainland. And due in part to expensive transportation . . . *(inaudible)*. . . tourism to afford housing, pay for groceries, et cetera. Take Mallorca. Mallorca is part of Spain. It's about an hour flight from Barcelona. It's its own island. They fully support short-term rentals, but they are regulated. So, could this be a solution? Rather than taking the dramatic plunge of Bill 9, which doesn't guarantee any housing supply, my recommendation is that Maui regulate legal short-term rentals, having all owners register their properties. This proof of registration would be mandatory to list Maui properties on sites such as Airbnb and Vrbo. Additionally, I suggest charging short-term renters for annual registration. These fees would be available to police illegal short-term rentals. A short-term rental housing task force could be formed with these funds to ensure illegal rentals would be identified quickly. This could free up hundreds of properties, which would be available for long-term rental purposes without the negative economic impact of Bill 9. Concurrently, a list should be organized of those seeking housing, and what their monthly budget would be, so that we could marry the two groups. Separately--and I take great offense . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . to this over these last four days--short-term rental owners are not greedy, uncaring people. We directly called our West Maui friends to see what we could do to help after the fires. We gave our home to a family of four for seven weeks for free until they were able to find a more permanent residence. My wife rallied our other 15 owners, which ended up housing three other fire-affected families. Two of our properties continue to house FEMA-supported families, even though FEMA stopped returning our calls. As well, many of us made donations to GoFundMe sites and charities. To further squash these poor narratives, these false narratives about owners, none of our 16 owners own more than one unit on Maui. None of our 16 owners are . . . *(inaudible)*. . . We're a leasehold property, and each pay \$1,900 to a Maui family for the use of their

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

land. That's \$365,000 per year to a Maui family. That's money that stays on-island . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . unlike the profits of multinational hotel corporations. Frankly, I really --

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Cawley.

MR. CAWLEY: -- don't understand why...

CHAIR KAMA: Members, do you have questions for the testifier?

MR. CAWLEY: Anyways, I want affordable housing for everybody on Maui.

CHAIR KAMA: Mr. Cawley...

MR. CAWLEY: There has to be a better answer than Bill 9.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, thank you. There are no questions from our Members. Thank you, Mr. Cawley. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Roger Williams, to be followed by Andrea Comstock.

MR. WILLIAMS: Aloha. Can you hear me?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. WILLIAMS: Aloha, Chairman. Thank you. First, I just want to point out that I did house first responders during their shifts when many of them were unhoused, and also other members, even though that would not be reflected in the data. I do not support the bill in its current form. It does not meet the intention of returning properties to workforce, as it impacts several resort properties that were not intended for workforce housing. The bill also eliminates a carved-out [*sic*] or planned developments in its text, which seems intentional. Great deal of these properties are not affordable by locals, by Maui's own standard, whether it's 100 or 140 percent of income. This is an issue of affordability for buyers, and they need both income and capital. Since the Mayor's announcement, condo prices have declined 30 percent. Listings have increased from 200 to 800. Where are the buyers, and where will they get the capital to buy these? The Mayor has stated many times, many of these units do not belong on the list. He also stated that he only really needs 500 units. Maui County should not rely on investors renting long-term because they will not. It does not make financial sense. Maui County should be buying these units and renting them to locals. This problem will only get worse, especially if there's no building in Maui. Hawai'i and California home prices have gone up 100 percent in the last ten years, while wages in California have gone up 60 percent, while wages in Maui have gone up only 35 percent, with one of the...with a very low minimum wage of \$14 an hour. The government needs to own its own pool for locals, and rent these properties at affordable rates to locals. Maui has the ability to issue bonds, raise taxes, and just received \$1.6 billion for affordable housing. Use this . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . instead of trying to force all housing prices down to a level that is not achievable. If you cannot build, the Maui government should buy for its residents.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

Maui residents, at current incomes, respectively...respectfully, cannot compete with outside capital. Everyone knows this, and everyone also realizes this will not solve...the current bill will not solve the issue of affordable housing. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions? Member Paltin has a question for you, Mr. Williams.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank...

MR. WILLIAMS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Williams. I was wondering if you could clarify what you meant by a carve-out for planned developments. Are you...are you saying planned developments should be included in this bill?

MR. WILLIAMS: Yes. There's a section in the bill where it says...where the...the previous bill allowed Apartment District short-term rentals that were zoned Apartment District, and planned developments that allowed short-term rentals. The current bill has that bracketed, so it seeks to eliminate that. It seems inconsistent that planned developments for resorts should be excluded. That is my point.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do you know what...what page that was on?

MR. WILLIAMS: It's in the latter section of the bill.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thank you.

MR. WILLIAMS: I can pull it up. It's in Section 19.32.040. The bracketed...the planned development, it...yeah, it talks about planned developments, and those are removed from allowing short-term rentals. So, I think if the Council took that action, it would be more consistent with the target towards original workforce housing, and it should restore that bracketed section back to the bill, as opposed to eliminate that language.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I'll check it out.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Williams. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Andrea Comstock, to be followed by Gabriel GG, and then Keith Jajko. *(pause)* Andrea Comstock, if you can unmute. If you're having trouble doing so, you can call in on the number in the chat. *(pause)* Chair, should we call the next testifiers?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MCKINLEY: Next testifier will be Gabriel GG, to be followed by Keith Jajko, and then Sne Patel. *(pause)* Chair, we're just admitting Andrea Comstock to the meeting --

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: -- and we do have Sne Patel ready, I believe.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So, who's up, Sne or Andrea?

MS. MCKINLEY: We have both Andrea Comstock and Sne Patel.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I see Sne.

MS. MCKINLEY: So, Andrea, if you can unmute, please do so now. If you're having trouble doing so, I'm sorry, please call in on the number on the chat. Sne, please go ahead.

CHAIR KAMA: Sne, you want to give your testimony?

MR. PATEL: Yeah. Can you hear me?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, we can.

MR. PATEL: Hey. Aloha Chair Kama, Vice-Chair, Councilmembers. Sne Patel, I've been a full-time resident for Maui for 23 years. Literally came here with nothing, just a phone number and a dream, I guess. Slept on a couch in Wahikuli for months. Yeah, it's hard to find rentals when you first get here. Worked multiple jobs, eventually saved enough to buy my first condo. My wife and I, currently raising three boys here. We owned a short-term rental and a long-term rental, both destroyed in the fire. You know, I...I never looked at owning property as taking from anyone. You know, I just...I earned it all. After years of renting, my wife and I bought that condo in Lāhainā. Specifically chose it, paid more for it because it was legally allowed to be a short-term rental in the future. We figured when we outgrew it...and that's what happened, we...we were able to rent it. That rental income actually qualified us to get the bigger home as our family grew. Able to send our kids to Sacred Hearts Preschool. Allowed my wife to kind of, you know, stay at home in those early years. Gave me time to actually serve in the community, to serve on these boards, commissions, advocate for businesses. I'm not here today opposing the bill because I fear, like, losing income or my rights or anything like that. I just...I just fear it because...you know, I'm opposing it because it's...it's like, I just don't get it. It's...it's not...this bill is the wrong bill for the community. These are 1970-era condos. Many with, you know, eroding shorelines, with aging infrastructure, looming assessments. It's not what the people need. It's not the vision. We need vision. We need leadership. We really need some, like, amazing vision going on right now. And especially aftermath of the fires, and it's not happening. You know, I don't think anybody realized \$1,000 in maintenance fees equates to, like, 200K in buying power. I won't even let my kids buy these condos. It's just a bad ROI. . . .(timer sounds). . . And...yeah. So, you know, here's the thing. Let me be clear. This is not an affordable housing bill. It's a reaction to a crisis that happened. And, you know, it gets the County off the hook in a way. We did something, but it's really not going to equate to what we need. And so, if the County's truly committed to helping local families stay on Maui, then, you know, I think like 3 percent collected from the STRs should all be earmarked like exclusively for programs that help generational residents, teachers, public workers, own and rent homes. I mean the problem isn't STRs exist, it's that these benefits haven't

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

trickled down into the people. Visitors come here. They get, like, five-star experience. Part of helping them do that. But our people, like, you know, people that work for me, they don't get that same experience back. And we got to change that. We got to do better. We got to do better than this bill. We don't need 7,000 condos flipped to long-term. We need homes. We need middle housing. We need, you know, ownership for the people so they can create that generational wealth. Not because STRs, you know, it's not like . . .(timer sounds). . . those are the...the baddest [sic] thing here. It's...it's...it's the fact that, look, you know, I keep hearing the word Kānaka, Kānaka, Kānaka, the whole time.

CHAIR KAMA: Sne...Sne, your time has run out.

MR. PATEL: . . .(inaudible). . .

CHAIR KAMA: So, Member Paltin --

MR. PATEL: They don't need these condos . . .(inaudible). . .

CHAIR KAMA: -- Member Paltin has a question for you.

MR. PATEL: Yeah. Yeah, I'm sorry. Just a little heated on it.

CHAIR KAMA: I know.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Patel. I just was wondering if you could clarify. I thought the Spinnaker HOA documents said they prohibited short-term renting [sic] of the property.

MR. PATEL: No, they don't. The title declarations never stated that. Never has anything to do with workforce . . .(inaudible). . . Minatoya list --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

MR. PATEL: -- to allow the use.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because when my aide looked into that property, the HOA said short-term renting [sic] wasn't allowed. But, okay. Thanks. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Member U'u-Hodgins has a question for you.

MR. PATEL: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for your testimony. Can you please clarify what you meant when you said, I think, \$1,000 equals to \$200,000 of buying power?

MR. PATEL: Yeah. So, you know, maintenance fees are something like you'd never get back. It's just...you know, it's just one of those things you keep paying into, you keep paying

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

more. But like, if you looked at it as \$1,000 going towards a mortgage payment versus \$1,000 going towards like maintenance fees, like...you're really like sucking the buying power out from, you know, what you could afford. Because now, that...instead of going to a house that you could afford, you know, \$200,000 more, that purchase price, you're putting that...banks are going to look at that and be like, oh, you know, that's less purchasing power for you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Thank you so much. Thanks, Chair.

MR. PATEL: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: You're welcome. Any other questions, Members? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Mr. Patel. Staff?

MR. PATEL: Yeah, thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, we can try to return to Andrea Comstock, to be followed by Dan McKenna, and then Susan O'Neill Lefevre.

MS. COMSTOCK: Hello?

MR. KRUEGER: *(pause)* Chair, I believe that was Andrea Comstock. We hear you.

MS. COMSTOCK: Hello?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes. We can hear you.

MS. COMSTOCK: Can you hear me? Aloha...okay. Sorry. Aloha, Chair and Committee. My name is Andrea Comstock, and I, along with my siblings, own a short-term rental property in South Maui. I support the passing of Bill 9. My siblings and I were born and raised on Maui, in Kihei, on this property, which my father bought when he was around 30...33 years old, in the 1960s on a VA loan. My parents struggled hard and worked hard to keep this family property for the future generations. We are not speculators, we are not part-time residents, and we are not mainland investors. We went to the old Kihei school, if some of you know which one that is. Hawai'i is our home, Maui is our home. While I support this bill, one of my concerns is that the small percentage of local families, like mine, that own a TVR may not be able to sustain and keep our property due to high operating costs. And no, we do not have resort-style landscaping or a pool. The ocean was our pool. What I ask though, is that the Council consider passing additional legislation that supports long-term rental owners, and it is imperative that these supporting measures are enacted concurrently with Bill 9. An example would be a long-term rental property tax exemption, similar to that's currently offered to long-term renters. We have...I have a Upcountry house, which I get an exemption on, and that could be something that you could consider as well, if you haven't already, for those that own multiple dwellings or apartments. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . I would also like to add that if the objective of the bill is to provide housing for local families and rebuild our communities, which I totally agree, then this bill needs to be...this bill needs to include TVRs that are in the residential areas.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

Targeting one group, while allowing others to continue operating their vacation rentals, is contradictory, and does not fully support the intention of this bill, which is to house our local families. The pros and cons and the arguments for and against this Bill 9 are the same arguments that we will hear if we add the prohibition of TVRs in residential areas. So, now is the time for us to open up that discussion as well. Ban TVRs in residential areas, and--including the Apartment zone. Finally, the Mayor's . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . opening statement said he noted that the...he noted that properties can --

CHAIR KAMA: Andrea?

MS. COMSTOCK: -- apply --

CHAIR KAMA: Andrea?

MS. COMSTOCK: -- for rezoning.

CHAIR KAMA: Your time is up.

MS. COMSTOCK: Yes.

CHAIR KAMA: But did you...

MS. COMSTOCK: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Did...Andrea, did you --

MS. COMSTOCK: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: -- submit your testimony in writing?

MS. COMSTOCK: No.

CHAIR KAMA: Could you do that?

MS. COMSTOCK: Oh, yes, I did. I submitted it --

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MS. COMSTOCK: -- in writing.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Okay.

MS. COMSTOCK: Yes.

CHAIR KAMA: So, Member Paltin --

MS. COMSTOCK: Yes.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: -- has a question for you.

MS. COMSTOCK: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Comstock? I just wanted to --

MS. COMSTOCK: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- clarify. Because...because it sounded like...because we do have a long-term rental exemption, and a different tax rate for the long-term rental. So, were you talking about something different than what we already have?

MS. COMSTOCK: So, I...I...I...for like an apartment, I believe...so, the long-term rentals, for example, for single-family homes, are offered. So, if I rent my long-term...if I rent my unit Upcountry to a long-term tenant, then we get a tax exempt...exemption. So...but if I have two units on that same property, we still only get one exemption. For those of us in the Apartment Zone, if we have more than one units, then I think something similar should apply, but it should be per unit.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, they're not giving it --

MS. COMSTOCK: Does that answer your question?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- to you because you're in the Apartment Zone? Like you applied for a long-term rental exemption, but they wouldn't give it to you because you're in an Apartment Zone? Is that what you're saying?

MS. COMSTOCK: No, no, no, no.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh.

MS. COMSTOCK: No, no. I don't believe the long-term rental...and I may be incorrect, but I don't believe the long-term rental exemption applies to those in the Apartment Zone.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thank you. I'll try to look into that.

MS. COMSTOCK: I...I may be incorrect, but I haven't...yeah, I haven't...I haven't applied. I believe it's for single-family homes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thank you. I'll...I'll try check that out too, and see.

CHAIR KAMA: Members, any other for our --

MS. COMSTOCK: But that's just something that we can look into and providing...

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: -- testifier? Hearing none. Thank you very much for your testimony, Ms. Comstock. Staff?

MS. COMSTOCK: Aloha.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Dan McKenna, to be followed by Susan O'Neill Lefevre, and then Kili Namau'u.

MR. MCKENNA: Aloha. This is Dan McKenna. Am I heard?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. MCKENNA: Thank you. Aloha, Chair Kama, Vice-Chair, and Voting Members. I thank you for your time and talent to represent Maui citizens in the stewardship of this special place. I'm Dan McKenna, and along with my wife, own a short-term rental property in Wailea Ekahi Village. We are testifying to express our opposition to Bill 9. Since we began renting our condominium in 1999, we have endeavored to be responsible owners who respect Maui, our people, and its heritage. We've paid all TAT, GET, and real estate taxes since our business start date in February of 1999. In addition to these government taxes, we've paid sizable assessments and monthly maintenance fees levied by the Wailea Ekahi AOA to maintain these almost 50-year-old facilities. We have paid substantial sums of money to our local cleaning staff, handymen, painters, air conditioning companies, and contractors to maintain our condominium, to provide an enjoyable environment for our guests. Ekahi employs a general manager, supervisors, and landscape and maintenance unionized workers. Our guests spend money in restaurants, tours, and many other local businesses. In turn, the amounts paid out are spent by these local service providers within the Maui economy. Many of our guests' families who have been staying with us year after year would not be able to afford to stay in Wailea hotels, would no longer visit Maui, and would not contribute to spending within the Maui economy. No one denies that Maui has an affordable housing problem. The County has begun some effective programs to provide affordable housing. These effective programs will satisfy the public policy objective of providing homes for Maui's workers. The passage of Bill 9 will not. I'm quoting from the *San Diego Union* newspaper issue . . .(timer sounds). . . of May 22nd, 1977. I found "Wailea planned residential resort community developed on 1,450 acres. Nearby is the 294-unit Wailea Ekahi condominium village. Residents and guests have access to the handsome beach pavilion, three swimming pools, two paddle tennis courts within the village. Alexander and Baldwin and co-developer Northwestern Mutual Life Insurance Company made an apparently wise move when they included condo villages as integral parts of the Wailea resort development. The number of vacationing mainland Americans and Canadians who favor these condos' features has skyrocketed." End of quote. This is an early recognition that Ekahi Village is an integral part of the Wailea resort. All of the Ekahi one-bedroom, two-bath and two-bedroom units were designed and built with a lockout that converted them . . .(timer sounds). . . into a hotel room and an efficiency or a one-bedroom unit. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you very much. Members, questions for the testifier? Member Cook?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you for your testimony, McKenna...Mr. McKenna. My clarifying question, if I may ask, how...how long does your guests normally stay? Is there an average? And how...what...what percentage of the year do you usually end up being booked?

MR. MCKENNA: Our guests...well, our average stay is probably six days. We do have some returning guests who rent for a month. We have a guest who's a friend who rents for all of February. So, she is a very good friend. What was the second? I'm sorry, Mr. Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: My second question, sir, was of...of the entire year, on an average, what percentage...how often is it occupied? How often is it empty?

MR. MCKENNA: This year is a little different because it's empty for all of July and August this year. And normally, that's not the case. We'll have at least a couple of rentals during those months.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

MR. MCKENNA: But...but it's probably rented during most...most months.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, sir, for your testimony. That's all, Chair.

MR. MCKENNA: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Any other questions, Members? Seeing none. Thank you, Mr. McKenna. Staff?

MR. MCKENNA: Mahalo.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Susan O'Neill Lefevre, to be followed by Kili Namau'u, and then Jeremy Stice. *(pause)*

CHAIR KAMA: We have Kili Namau'u coming down.

MS. NAMAU'U: Aloha ahiahi kākou, Chairman Kama and Members of the County Council. I want to mahalo this Committee for allowing all testifiers to be heard. I am Kili Namau'u, and I am in support of Bill 9. You have already heard hours of testimony that speak to the heart-rending escalation in the numbers of families that have moved to the continent in order to survive the extraordinary pressures brought on by a lack of affordable housing and the rising cost of living. The resulting breakdown of family ties is a form of cultural genocide, and Bill 9 provides an opportunity to begin to address at least one aspect of the housing crisis. I understand the motivation of some STR owners, as I own a bed and breakfast on my property. I went through a rigorous process with the Planning Commission and Department to attain the proper permits. As a part of that process, I needed to get the approval of my neighbors. I am fully aware of the impact that my B&B has on our neighborhood. I do generate income by renting my property to visitors, but more importantly, I am able to support the greater local community. Our

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

home, over the years, has hosted cultural practitioners, lecturers from UH Maui College, athletes from Moloka'i--or Molokai, as they would like to call it--and local families attending baby parties, wedding celebrations, or funerals. It is about creating space for them, and taking care of our community. Having the ability to host guests is not all about generating income. It's about welcoming people, and sharing hospitality. It is the opportunity to share the beauty of this island. And what does make Maui special beyond the 'āina? It is the people and the host culture of Hawai'i. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . This is generally not the practice for the STRs. Bill 9 further serves the greater purpose of making sorely, urgently-needed housing available for Maui residents. I am concerned about my community and future generations. In my daily life, I choose the value of being pono to guide me. I ask that the Council be brave and be bold, be pono for the sake of our community and for the generations to come. I respectfully ask the County Council to support this bill. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Members, questions for our testifier? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Namau'ū. I just wanted to clarify about...like when you were saying to host the visitors and to share the culture at the basic level is to like pronounce the name of your place correctly?

MS. NAMAU'U: Are you talking about the name of my bed and breakfast?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess all the places.

MS. NAMAU'U: Yes. Well, you know, having a bed and breakfast, you have the opportunity to meet them face-to-face, and to be able to share and get to know who they are, as well as that...them to get to know me. So, I think there's a lot more interaction and some more personalized and intimate compared to what I see with STRs, where people are just coming in and leaving, and not really knowing anything else but that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or like after the fire, coming to the hub because never have grocery stores and things like that?

MS. NAMAU'U: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MS. NAMAU'U: Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Members, any other questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you.

MS. NAMAU'U: Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Jeremy Stice, to be followed by Destiny Kucko, and then Jim Loughead.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. STICE: I'm heading down. Aloha, Councilmembers. My name is Jeremy Stice. I was born and raised on Maui. I speak to you today not just as a realtor, but as a lifelong resident who has spent nearly 20 years helping people navigate property ownership here...legally, responsibly, and with deep respect for our community. I strongly oppose Bill 9. It creates nothing. No affordable homes, no long-term rentals, no owner-occupants. It simply hopes to, but hope is not a housing strategy. This bill gambles that the good will outweigh the bad without a shred of proof. Short-term rentals are not driving people out of Hawai'i. In fact, eliminating them will do this and cause more harm, cutting off a vital ecosystem that supports good-paying local jobs. One of my current clients, a Maui-born-and-raised first-time homebuyer in West Maui, runs a cleaning business with his wife. Their income depends entirely on servicing legal vacation rentals. Before that, they worked for a hotel chain, but they couldn't make ends meet. Do you want to cut off their dreams and goals? The properties targeted by this bill are legally codified in the Maui County Code, not grandfathered in or legacy loopholes. Their transient use is explicitly outlined in A-1 and A-2 Zoning in their condo declarations. The County even published a list of these properties. If you want to talk blame, let's talk with the...start with the policymakers who wrote these laws, not with the realtors properly disclosing code and following the law. Let's use the Affordable Housing Fund, which is largely funded by short-term rental property taxes, to purchase and rent or resell these condos at subsidized rates. Most of these units can't qualify for FHA, USDA, or VA financing, and require 20 to 30 percent down. They're not viable for most local buyers. Many of these buildings face sky...skyrocketing HOA fees, insurance hikes, and major deferred maintenance. STRs didn't cause this, and converting them to long-term rentals won't fix it. The current default rate for HOA . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . fees on residential condos is already on the exponential raise...rise due to the aforementioned costs. We need to build real housing that's FHA, VA, and USDA-eligible. We need to update Ag codes to allow more flexible multiple unit 'ohana housing. Most importantly, we need to invest in water infrastructure, not act like we're short on water when we simply lack the means to move it. I live right below Pu'u Kukui. It rains there almost daily. When Maui Land and Pine and HC&S shut down, we saw massive layoffs. This bill would cut at least twice as many jobs. There have been many sad truths shared about kama'aina needing to leave Hawai'i in the past couple years. I wonder how many of those jobs were tourism-based jobs. Demand has already been crushed with the threat of this all on the table and all of the anti-tourism sentiments expressed. Do we really even want to exacerbate this even more? Should this pass, many units will sit empty or be sold to even wealthier second home buyers. Lawsuits will pile up. . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . The County could face catastrophic legal --

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Stice.

MR. STICE: -- and financial consequences, potentially --

CHAIR KAMA: Members --

MR. STICE: -- even . . . *(inaudible)* . . . --

CHAIR KAMA: -- questions for the testifier?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. STICE: -- for a policy that barely even moves the needle on our housing crisis.

CHAIR KAMA: Mr. Stice?

MR. STICE: Yes.

CHAIR KAMA: I'm sorry, you're out of time.

MR. STICE: The only winners with this law --

CHAIR KAMA: So...

MR. STICE: -- bill passing are lawyers.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MR. STICE: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. STICE: Okay. Any questions?

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. No.

MR. STICE: Want to get a question about my last sentence since we've gotten more questions about other testifiers?

CHAIR KAMA: No. I don't think --

MR. STICE: No?

CHAIR KAMA: -- anybody wants a question.

MR. STICE: Okay.

CHAIR KAMA: I don't see anyone. Thank you.

MR. STICE: Okay. Appreciate it. Thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Destiny Kucko, to be followed by Jim Loughead, and then Tom.

MS. KUCKO: Hello, Councilmembers. My name is Destiny Kucko, and I speak today in strong support of Bill 9. Opponents of this bill have leaned heavily on the points of legal battles and constitutional rights, but history teaches us that legality does not always equal morality. Segregation was once legal. Only by challenging unjust systems do we move forward. Make no mistake, opposition is inevitable when privilege is challenged. There will always be people to oppose action when they so greatly benefit from the status quo.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

Threats of what is legal cannot sway us from doing the right thing. Maui's not the first place to limit short-term rentals, and it will not be the last. Cities across the globe have taken bold action to rein in STRs, and so can we. I'm not a lawyer. Things like zoning and city planning are not in my wheelhouse, but I did do some research online, and I submitted this as written testimony with resources. New York City, after implementing [sic] STRs, surrounding areas saw hospitality job boosts as travelers moved to hotels. These businesses employ far more locals than STRs. Palm Springs, median home prices fell 13 percent year-over-year. Irvine, California, average long-term rent dropped by 3 percent, totaling an estimated 81 million in annual revenue savings for residents. It's not theoretical, it's proven. Limiting STRs works. Many opponents claim their units are not suitable for long-term rentals. If units are unsafe for long-term renters, why are they allowed to host short-term guests? Seems like a double standard. A study of Australian rentals compared renters. Their findings suggested STRs require significantly greater resource input than LTRs. Referencing testimony from yesterday, if STR renters are paying the cost to upkeep these units, why are the buildings still in a poor state? Something doesn't add up. I'm in agreement...I am in agreement with a common point surfaced by those who oppose this bill. The Maui economy is impacted by tourism. As we saw with COVID, the world can be unpredictable. It's important to build a diverse economy that can adapt. Limiting STRs uplifts locals, and creates . . .(timer sounds) . . . space for other sectors to thrive...agriculture, education, healthcare, local entrepreneurship. Reducing STRs does not mean ending tourism. Tourism was here before their rise, it will be here after. Tourism is important to Maui, but it cannot be our only economic pillar. I have seen some opposed...I have seen some opposed to this bill show up in Hawaiian shirts, say aloha and mahalo. They throw shaka to the front of their name, and then talk about how locals advocating for housing is taking too much time. Or they show up and state if this bill passes, they will keep 400 units for friends and family versus renting to locals. Disrespectful doesn't feel like a strong enough word. A yes to this bill is saying the generational future of this island matters. It's a step forward to building something better. It provides hope and sustainability for people who look at this island as their greatest treasure, not their greatest investment property. Please vote yes on Bill 9.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: *(Applause)*

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Destiny. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Jim Loughead, to be followed by Tom, and then P. Cadiz. *(pause)* Mr. Loughead, you are enabled on our end. Please try to unmute. If you're unable to unmute, please join with the information listed in the chat. There's a phone number and a meeting number. *(pause)* Chair, should we go on?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Tom, to be followed by P. Cadiz. *(pause)* Chair, I think we can go on to P. Cadiz, to be followed by Castonguay William, and then Mitchell Tipton. *(pause)* P. Cadiz, you have been enabled on our end. Please try to

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

unmute yourself. If you're unable to do so, please call in on the phone number listed in the chat. *(pause)* Chair, shall I go on?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, please. I think...

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Castonguay William, to be followed by Mitchell Tipton, and then Nicole Heard. *(pause)* Chair, we could try Mitchell Tipton one more time, and then Nicole Heard, to be followed...

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, there he is. He's at the Chamber. He's in the Chamber. Mitchell? *(pause)*

MR. TIPTON: All right.

CHAIR KAMA: Please proceed.

MR. TIPTON: All right. Aloha. My name is Mitchell Tipton, and I'm testifying on behalf of myself, and I've been a resident of Kihei for 13 years now. I also wanted to say thank you, Council, for being here and hearing us because this is important and it's part of healing. So, thank you. And I would have to agree that the vibes coming into Muku moon and Hilo tomorrow are definitely bringing a finality and new beginning to all of this. So, speaking of which, I keep hearing that short-term rentals saved the local community after the fires. And please correct me if I'm wrong, but was it not short-term rentals that didn't open the doors that led to a raised rent...5, \$7,000 from FEMA? I'm not taking away anything from the ones that did open the doors, and thank you. I can't speak to that. I'm, like I said, from Kihei, but to my understanding, there was tax breaks and an elevated monthly rent to ensure that they made the profits they needed. So, I just want to say, I don't think tourism is a bad thing. I've worked in it for 13 years. But the one thing they don't tell you about it is that the constant turnover, the transient nature, the people you work with in and out, the guests...it really leads to a feeling of numbness, or preparedness, if you will, when it comes to loss, not just the people you work with, but within your community. Because it just becomes to be expected. And I keep hearing that this isn't the solution, but I think we should start . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . with the understanding that solutions and real change don't come from one act or one piece of legislation, they come from a continued conscious effort over time. And so, this might not be "the solution." It is very much so a part of the solution, and a part of the healing. Because as we talk about aloha 'āina, in my heart, I feel mālama 'āina, and I don't think we can mālama 'āina without taking care of the people of this land. It starts with the roots, and we can't water the trees if we don't have the people. There is no Hawai'i without Hawaiians, right? And I say this as someone who flew here. I say this as someone who settled here, as someone who occupies land here, and is given this opportunity because I have stable housing. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Mister --

MR. TIPTON: Thank you.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: -- Tipton. Members, we have reached our mid-meeting break. It is now 6:31 p.m., and the recessed meeting of June 9th, 2025, of HLU is now in recess for ten minutes until 6:41. Recess. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 6:31 p.m.

RECONVENE: 6:43 p.m.

CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the recessed HLU Committee meeting of June 9th, 2025, come back to order. It is now 6:43 p.m. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, returning to Jim Loughead, we believe he's connected by phone, perhaps, to be followed by P. Cadiz, who also may be connected by phone, and then Nicole Heard. If you're on the phone, please use star-6 to unmute. *(pause)* Mr. Loughead, if you're on the phone, please use star-6 to unmute.

MS. CADIZ: Hello? This is Pat...Patty Cadiz. Can you hear me?

CHAIR KAMA: Pat Cadiz.

MS. MCKINLEY: Yes. Go ahead, please.

MS. CADIZ: Hello? Thank you, Chair Kama and Committee Members. My name is Patricia Cadiz. I oppose Bill 9. It's easy to identify the problem, it's much harder to find fair solutions. My daughter is one of the 450 Maui families that will be most deeply harmed by Bill 9. Our family purchased a single TVR unit to help her get started on Maui. Our family fully renovated the unit by our own labor, and now our daughter depends on it for her future on the island. She strives to help her guests enjoy Maui respectfully and sustainably, and urges them to support local. She is Maui-born-and-raised. Her partner is a Maui . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Her . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Oh, can you still hear me?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, we can.

MS. CADIZ: Am I on?

CHAIR KAMA: Continue.

MS. CADIZ: Oh, okay. My phone said hand lowered. Her Airbnb job has made it possible for them to stay on Maui. The original idea of Bill 9 was that it would be a quick fix, but we don't know that Bill 9 will ever provide meaningful numbers of affordable housing because of the uncertainty of how many units might actually convert as hoped, nor whether Bill 9 can even survive the certain legal challenges. But we do know that Bill 9 would harm more Maui families like my daughter, as well as the 1,900 to 3,800 who...who UHERO predicts will lose their jobs. Please note that these UHERO predictions were even before tariffs and all the global uncertainties that are now also affecting our local economy. It's my hope that we, as a community, can pursue faster and better, dignified, affordable housing solutions than the false hope that is Bill 9. We

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

could increase affordable housing development with more public-private partnerships and more government subsidies. We could get real about streamlined and fast-track permitting. We could encourage upzoning, and increase density with mixed-use buildings. We could encourage development of smaller homes and walkable . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . mixed-use neighborhoods. We could adapt and implement the intention of SB 3202 that allows two ADUs on residential lots. Let's retain the Minatoya list so that residents don't lose their jobs. We need solutions that will truly address our multi-decades of errors that created the housing crisis. Bill 9 is a cruel offer of hope that is likely to disappoint more than deliver. Bill 9 would harm my family, our Maui community, and the local restaurants, shops, and activities that benefit from the tourists that stay in the Minatoya condos. Bill 9 takes tourism away from the grassroots level and hands it to off-island corporations and private equity firms. Please oppose Bill 9, and support your residents.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. CADIZ: Any questions?

CHAIR KAMA: Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Ms. Cadiz. Staff?

MS. CADIZ: Thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair...Chair, returning to Jim Loughead--if he's on the line, star-6 to unmute, please--to be followed by Nicole Heard, and then Justin Kekiwi.

MR. LOUGHEAD: This is Jim Loughead, if you can hear me. I don't know if you can hear me.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. LOUGHEAD: Okay. Aloha, Chair, Vice-Chair, and Committee Members. Thank you for letting me testify. I apologize for not being able to unmute on my computer. Hopefully, you're hearing me fine off my cell phone?

MS. MCKINLEY: We can hear you.

MR. LOUGHEAD: So, we have...you can hear me? Okay. Thank you very much. So, we have owned our condo, it's in the Wailea resort area, since the 1980s. And we're a firm believer that there is a housing crisis on Maui. My background is engineering construction, and our focus, throughout my career, has always been on problem-solving. And we started coming to Maui in the '80s. It was definitely a stronger agricultural community. And through time and effort, it was made to try and develop these resort communities, of which Wailea was one of them. And tourism has been promoted, and has provided a lot of jobs and opportunities for people on Maui. Seeing that housing is critical, I think it's important that we, as a group, focus on solutions. Some solutions are obviously low-cost modular housing. They're currently using that in California in the LA area and Paradise Valley. We could assign a greater percent of the short-term property tax to low-cost housing, and make sure that that money ends

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

up focusing on providing the low-cost housing. We can look at the hotels and...and have them build a certain number of units each year based on the number of hotel rooms they have...because hotels require employee housing. This has been done successfully in Vail, Colorado, in Keystone, and there's many other areas . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . around the country where...where that has been done. Also, I like the idea that was proposed the other day by Grace--a church, I believe it was--with eight acres, where they come up and have low-cost housing and short-term rentals to help support the low-cost housing. To me, that's very creative ideas. I think another key thing, especially since this has become so divisive, is note that we're all citizens of the U.S., as well as our Hawai'i family, and we're approaching a need to solve this together. We've been doing that since the Lāhainā fire, I believe, with the Federal Government spending billions at the fire, and following for over a year afterwards...and most recently, here just on June 25th, signed the 1.6 billion Federal grant. So, in conclusion, decisions based on emotions generally result in the poorest outcome. So, my . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . position is to oppose Bill...Bill 9. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you very much. Members, question for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so very much. Staff?

MR. LOUGHEAD: Yeah. Thank you for your patience in getting me on.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Nicole Heard, to be followed by Justin Kekiwi, and then Lana Albright. *(pause)* Nicole, can you unmute, please? If you're having difficulty unmuting, you can try to call in on the phone number listed in the chat, please. Chair, the next testifier is Justin Kekiwi, to be followed by Lana Albright, and then the person calling in on 2681.

MR. KEKIWI: Aloha ahiahi kākou.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MR. KEKIWI: My name is Justin Kekoa Kekiwi, and I strongly support Bill 9. I want to thank Mayor Bissen and his Staff for proposing this bill, and doing a good job on their presentation. It gave us the factual information by thoroughly gathering data, while addressing both the positive and negative impacts with Bill 9. It's fairly obvious that our housing crisis far outweighs the opposition's biggest concern, which is loss of profits. I do want to echo the Mayor, and so many others, that this is not the solution to our housing crisis...but 6,000 units back to our people, that's a massive step in the right direction. You know, it was very disturbing to hear some of the opposing owners stating that they wouldn't rent or sell their units if this bill is approved. I would rather leave them empty, which is sad, but in reality, it's not surprising. It's just that typical foreign mentality we deal with here on the daily. I've also heard threats of going to court if this bill passes. Let them go. The County has prepared for that, and we literally have a retired judge as our Mayor. He wouldn't have proposed this if the bill was going to lose in court. I really hope our County takes a similar approach and course of action for the luxury developments being proposed. Roughly 10,000 units throughout Maui in the next several years surfacing, and moving forward. A very small percentage of those units will be affordable and house our working-class people. Creating new bills and

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

solutions to increase the ratio of affordable to luxury units is key to this crisis. So, please take those measures, and capitalize on our rare opportunities, which this Council will have on Friday for the Wailea 670 development. Please keep the language of obtaining 450 affordable units. That's an additional 162 . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . units that this Council can acquire just by making the right vote, a vote that places our community's needs over developers' profits. That developer insists that their numbers won't pencil out if they build more affordable units, but yet, they won't open their books. That's a big red flag. You know, the common denominator between these TVRs and the luxury developments is that investors, foreign and domestic, are making large profits while displacing our local community, our culture, and forcing families apart. You Councilmembers are part of our community. Our families and friends will all benefit from this bill. We've been clinging on to hope for far too long. It's time this government body takes action, sets history, and puts our people over profits. Mahalo kākou.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions for Mr. Kekiwi? Seeing none. Thank you so much.

MR. KEKIWI: I'm not coming Friday, so that was two things at once, yeah.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, okay. . . .*(laughing)*. . . We'll think of you when that comes up.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, returning to Nicole Heard, to be followed by Lana Albright, and then the caller with the last four digits 2681.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Go ahead, Nicole. *(pause)*

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You might have to call in if you cannot find the microphone button.

MS. MCKINLEY: The instructions for calling in are in the chat. *(pause)* Chair, the next testifier is Lana Albright, to be followed by the person calling in on 28...2681. *(pause)* Proceeding with the person calling in with the phone number 2681, you can do star-6 to unmute, please. *(pause)*

TESTIFIER 1: Hello. Can you hear me?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

TESTIFIER 1: Hi. People keep saying that we need to convert these properties back into long-term housing, but many --

CHAIR KAMA: Excuse me. Could you identify yourself --

TESTIFIER 1: -- of the Minatoya properties were never...

CHAIR KAMA: -- please?

TESTIFIER 1: No. I don't feel safe doing so.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you.

TESTIFIER 1: Many of these Minatoya properties were never built...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Were you next on the list, though?

CHAIR KAMA: That's why I wanted to know, but I can't identify.

MS. MCKINLEY: Yes, this is the caller on 2681.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

TESTIFIER 1: I was called and told to start.

CHAIR KAMA: You may continue.

TESTIFIER 1: Many of these Minatoya properties were never built or intended as long-term housing. They were not built as workforce housing. They were built on the waterfront shoreline as vacation condos and resorts, and intended to draw tourists and vacationers. My complex was built in 1969, and I have pictures of the original construction site, the billboards announcing Maui's newest vacation resort, and various brochures that list the one- and two-bedrooms nightly rates of like \$28 a day in 1971. They weren't ever long-term workforce housing. They were never intended to house local residents full-time, so we didn't really take homes away from local residents who were previously living there. Some of the statements in support of this ban mention having large families crammed into a single bedroom or a studio, and doing just fine with that space. They say that it's better than sleeping in a car or on the beach, but no one wants to put anyone out of a home or into sleeping in cars. But the Fire Marshal's code restricts many of these smaller places from having that high-density occupancy, and it just simply wouldn't be possible for legal and for safety reasons. So, it's not the owners of the STRs that are saying no to high...high occupancy, it's the HOA rules that restrict and limit the number of people allowed in some of these buildings, or condos. From listening to many of the testimonies, if there are homes that have been taken away from local residents in the last few years, that's rather different than the buildings that were constructed over 50 years ago with the intent of housing vacationers. The homes that need to be returned back to the residents should maybe be looked into. Maybe things haven't been done legally. The illegal STRs don't contribute to any of the taxes that the legal ones do. They don't declare any of the income, nor do they pay income tax on that income. They don't pay the outrageously high STR property tax on their properties that they illegally . . .(timer sounds). . . rent out. Maybe the County should initially focus on taking those illegal STRs out of the picture, and return those homes back to the local residents so that they can have their neighborhoods back. The Minatoya list deals with properties that have been on the short-term rental list prior to 1989, and that was 36 years ago. Many of these testifiers have mentioned an increase in the STRs over the last 5 to 10 or 20 years. So, that would mean that none of the properties on this list are contributing to any of the recent conversions that are taking away from these local-resident neighborhoods. This bill won't generate any affordable long-term housing

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

for local residents. All it has done is villainize and divide people. It will cause a large number of local job losses. Our cleaners, who have their own businesses and they support their families...our maintenance people, who we rely on when things need to be tended to...our favorite local shops and food trucks that we send our guests to. This bill will do nothing positive for any local residents at all. All it will do is force more . . .(timer sounds). . . job loss...oh, who rely --

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: *(Applause)*

TESTIFIER 1: -- on STRs...

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you for your testimony. Members, any questions? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Ms. Anonymous. I just was wondering...because you said if...if all the Minatoya properties were in existence prior to 1989, that it couldn't have made an impact. But did you live here full-time during those years? Because I've seen the impact, and...and partially, it's because of the online platforms. You know, it was harder before to rent it out. And so, people would rent it out long-term. And...and I've lived here through that time, and I've seen it. So, I just was wondering, were you living here from...

TESTIFIER 1: I'm not talking...I'm not talking about online or anything, or debating short-term rentals, but I'm talking --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, the question was --

TESTIFIER 1: -- about the ones that --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- did you live here --

TESTIFIER 1: -- the ones specifically...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- through that time from 1989? It's a yes or no.

TESTIFIER 1: The ones specifically on the Minatoya list? The ones specifically on the Minatoya list were all short-term prior to 1989. So, that's what I was referring to, is the people that are saying they've seen a difference in the last 10 to 20 years, in the change and increase in STRs. It's not the Minatoya list that's increased.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, I'm saying --

TESTIFIER 1: It's the other ones --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- that's what I've seen.

TESTIFIER 1: -- probably...

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, the question is, have you lived here through that time? Because I've seen...

TESTIFIER 1: You're shutting...you're...you're proposing shutting down --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I'll take that as a no.

TESTIFIER 1: -- units that were prior --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

TESTIFIER 1: -- to that problem.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Ms. Anonymous. Any other questions, Members? Seeing none. Thank you so very much. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, we can return to Nicole Heard.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MCKINLEY: She may have called in, to be followed by Sherry Owen-Siekmann, and then Rebekah Uccellini, and then Stacy Moniz. *(pause)* Nicole, it's star-6 to unmute.

MS. HEARD: Okay. Is this working?

CHAIR KAMA: I can hear you. It's working.

MS. HEARD: Okay. Awesome. Thanks for...thanks for your patience. Aloha, Chair Kama. I'm Nicole Heard, a long-time Maui resident, here today to offer testimony in support of Bill 9. I keep hearing a narrative echo throughout this process about how this bill is destined to fail because these units will never be affordable for local people. And I do understand that this bill doesn't address the affordable component of our housing crisis, but I actually see that as a moot point when the overwhelming majority of our residents have already been spending way more than 30 percent of our income on housing. We haven't had luxury to access affordable housing, as legally defined, for like many years now. It's just how we've been living for a long time. And the unfortunate reality is that we've allowed the growth of the tourism industry to go on unchecked for so long that it's now going to be incredibly difficult to create a market with true affordable housing. And it's going to be hard to bring our residents comfortably above the poverty line, which brings me to my main point, which is that perhaps we, the Maui resident community, don't, in fact, depend on the tourism industry for our survival. And the main reason for that is because we can't. It's already failed to provide livable wages and access to stable housing for our residents. We can all look around us and see the proof of how it's already failed us. We can look around and see how our community of full-time Maui residents is already barely or not surviving in this STR-driven, budget tourism-based economic landscape, as it is today, right now. Meanwhile, amongst the testimony you've been receiving, are the arguments from the second and third homeowners of these

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

Minatoya units, primarily who reside in other states and are not part of our community, along with the realtors and property managers of these units. This demographic of testifiers are clearly transcending survival, living quite comfortably as they continue to purchase these units as investments, effectively depleting our residential housing inventory while simultaneously extracting wealth via their lucrative passive income from these Minatoya units. Ironically, the functioning of these units that enables them to create this passive revenue directly . . .(timer sounds). . . depends on our resident workforce, who are making such low wages working these industry positions that these same people can't afford housing, can't find housing, and can't survive. So, clearly, the tourism and STR industry is not the thing that the Maui resident community can rely on for survival. The opposite is true. This industry has directly led to a greatly-diminished ability for our people to survive, all for the sake of a legal loophole that's allowed outside investors to exploit our resources and push our people to the margins. It really just comes down to which group of people you've heard from who you feel are more deserving of compassion and advocacy. The people from our community who have shared experience of housing instability, homelessness, and are paying way more than 30 percent of their income towards housing, or the people who own multiple non-owner-occupied STR units who have stood before you complaining about the financial ramifications of their risky investments, and who do not face homelessness regardless of whether or not this bill passes. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions for Ms. Heard? Seeing none. Thank you so very much, Ms. Heard. Staff?

MS. HEARD: Thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Sherry Owen-Siekmann, to be followed by Rebekah Uccellini, and then Stacey Moniz. (pause)

MS. OWEN-SIEKMANN: Good evening. My name is Sherry Owen-Siekmann, and thank you for allowing us to have this discussion. I have been coming here for over 40 years, and my family has celebrated many family occasions here in Kihei, Maui. I own one condo unit that I bought in the mid-'90s, and I have rented it myself and managed it myself for most of its time. Today was actually the first day I ever called a rental agency to maybe try to help me because rentals have been down a little bit, and I think it's probably due to many things. But I've never made any money on it, but I've been able to help pay the association fees. The taxes have really increased, but I just know that from being the oldest of four, this has been our family home. And my parents would stay here for seven months out of the year and live here because they enjoyed the beautiful weather here, and then they would go back to Chicago area and live there. I don't own any other properties other than my home, and I just feel like I don't...I'm not really educated about the whole bill and the Montoya [sic] listings and all that, but I just feel like some things...like it's being made decisions on too quickly. I think Maui has planned poorly for working people, and they didn't think about how this was going to impact the economy. And people that are working in the service industry, I think Maui put too many eggs in one basket, putting most of their...you know, most of their economy on tourism, and they haven't provided for the...the people that were on this land in the beginning, and the people that have come . . .(timer sounds). . . to this land.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

I think short-term rentals are maybe not really the problem. We should probably look at all the different ways to help affordable housing. I think there's many hotels that aren't being utilized, there's many apartment buildings that aren't being utilized that would be more for affordable housing, that would probably better serve, and maybe the County buying buildings and utilizing, you know, that to help people to get affordable housing. I think we also need to look at income diversity for Maui. If you shut down, you know, travel and all that income, what are you going to, you know, have people do? I mean, what is your other incomes here other than government, and police, and teaching, and...and things like that? I mean there's...you know, there's not...you know, travel has been, unfortunately, a major portion of the income here. I'm not...you know, I'm not saying that's right or wrong, but I think...well, I'm saying it's wrong. Yeah, I'm saying it's wrong. . . .(timer sounds). . . So, anyways, is that me...is that my time?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, that is.

MS. OWEN-SIEKMANN: Okay.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. OWEN-SIEKMANN: So...

CHAIR KAMA: Members, do you have any questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much for your testimony.

MS. OWEN-SIEKMANN: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Rebecca Uccellini, to be followed by Stacy Moniz, and then Ron Hansen.

MS. UCCELLINI: Aloha, Chair. Aloha, Council. I have worked across five different megafires. My role is often to catch those who slip through the cracks in systems that are not built for them, and my goal is always to help stitch those cracks closed so that fewer fall through the next time. In the weeks after the Lāhainā fires, I helped to build the backend of mutual aid systems, organizing needs and offers in real times. Hundreds of people opened their doors to displaced families, and it was sobering to see how few STR owners in the Minatoya list ended up offering their housing free of charge. I can send stats about it, and I have more paragraphs, but I don't want to feed into the us versus them. This whole thing breaks my heart, and I know it does yours. While I acknowledge that this is an imperfect bill, and I do think some exceptions could be made, this division does break my heart. The hard truth is that when our island was on fire, it wasn't the outside investors that stepped up. It wasn't the timeshare owners who would prefer to keep their housing empty, or those hoarding homes for retirement. It was neighbors. It was kūpuna with spare rooms. It was the locals setting up every hub, and they will be the ones to show up again. The strongest safeguard that we can build in times of disaster isn't investment property, it's community. It's the invisible infrastructure of interdependence. Neighbors who will knock on your door when the power is out, who

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

bring you food when you are sick, and who open their homes before FEMA ever arrives. This is a safety net that saves lives. It is not for sale. It is built over time by choosing people over profit. Sometimes the complexity of legislation clouds the clarity of truth, so let us simplify. Let us return to the canoe. Let us say we are all adrift, everyone is hungry, and there is food plenty. But some on the canoe have hoarded it in coolers, locked it up, and portioned it out to those who already have. Some would rather let it spoil and not even be used than to give it to those who are hungry, stowed a day for...stowed away for a day that is not even promised. Would you choose to sail again with the ones that have hoarded the resources? In these uncertain times . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . who do you want on that canoe with you? Because that is what you are shaping right now. Not just policy, but the crew of this island's future. Who do you trust to take care of one another best? I've heard the fears of job loss, so my heart goes out to everyone who may face some job transitions, but I've also spent time with way too many housekeepers in the last 22 months. And believe it or not, it wasn't all of their childhood dreams to one day grow up to clean up after strangers. Maintenance and landscaping will still need to continue, whether you rent long-term or short. Please don't underestimate the brilliance in this community. Let them come home, and they'll build businesses, grow industries, and create meaningful work far beyond cleaning toilets, changing light bulbs, and folding linens for someone else's profit. So, the question now is, do we continue to turn shelter into stock portfolios, or do we reclaim it as a sacred basic right? This isn't just legislation, it's about choosing the kind of story that your grandchildren will inherit. Mahalo.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: *(Applause)*

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Ms. Uccellini. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Stacy Moniz, to be followed by Ron Hansen, and then Steve Gadsby.

MS. MONIZ: Wow, that's a hard testimony to follow. Thank you so much. Aloha. Good evening.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MS. MONIZ: I thank you all for your service to our community. This is a very challenging time to be a leader, but I thank you sincerely. I don't often agree with this Mayor, but I am in strong support of Bill 9. The data presented by Matt Jachowski was clear and trustworthy. I urge you to give it full weight. In contrast, I don't trust the UHERO study so much, which I believe reflects the bias of large institutions protecting other large institutions, not local families. To those STR owners who so proudly shared how generous they were immediately after the fire, I call BS. This wasn't generosity. There were no tourists here to rent your units. Tell us about your generosity the day before the fires, the year before the fires. Tell us about how you're still giving today generously to this community. The trouble is that they're not. Meanwhile, the real community, the people who live here, who work here, who raise their families here, we are still giving. We're still showing up. We're still trying to survive in the place our families have lived

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

for generations. These fire survivors are our friends, our relatives. We know we're all connected because this is an island. Now, you have the chance to support us. I urge, I beg you to vote yes on Bill 9. ST...STR owners will figure it out, just like thousands of us kama'aina figured out every day, month-by-month, paycheck-by-paycheck. They knew this was a game of hot potato when they bought their units, and they've profited long enough. I was going to end with a bunch of Hamilton quotes because if you haven't watched Hamilton, I encourage you to watch Hamilton because history is happening right here, right now, and history has its eye on you. So, I ask you to remember us, the kama'aina . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . Kānaka, the very fabric in the community, when you vote yes on Bill 9. My family is definitely a statistic. Half my kids...well, I only have two kids, but half of them live on the continent. My son moved off-island and bought a house within six months of moving to New Mexico, and this month they paid off a duplex after five years. That would never have been happening here. My daughter and her husband and their two grandkids and I, we all live together, and we're victims of this. We're renters. We live all the way in Keokea right now because it's the only place we could find that's affordable for our family. So --

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. MONIZ: -- I'm not speaking as a...I'm speaking as somebody who's living this experience. So, mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you so much.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: *(Applause)*

CHAIR KAMA: Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Ron Hansen, to be followed by Steve Gadsby and then Tom Croly.

CHAIR KAMA: I see Ron online. We can't hear you.

MS. MCKINLEY: If you're trying to unmute your phone, it's star-6. *(pause)* Sorry, we can't hear you.

MR. HANSEN: Hello?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, we can hear you now.

MR. HANSEN: Hello?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. HANSEN: Hi. Aloha. Aloha, Councilmembers. Thank you so much for the testimony, time, and diligence that you're giving to Bill 9. My name is Ron Hansen. I am a Maui voter, and a Maui part-time resident for 22 years. I own one short-term rental at 19 Hauoli Street in Mā'alaea, I've owned this for over 20 years, and like most of my other

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

77 fellow owners, we treasure the weeks that we can enjoy beautiful Maui, and enjoy short-term renters, and...and . . .*(inaudible)*. . . As an expert real estate appraiser, giving court testimony often, the bill intrigued me, and I did extensive analysis. And as a result, I absolutely oppose Bill 9. The high costs on Maui are not caused by STR rentals, it cannot be relieved by Bill 9, and there's no clear path for any current locals to occupy. Certainly, my fellow people at the Banyan will not be long-term renting because we bought these for years and years, and have our family coming, our friends coming, and we plan to retire here. The costs to maintain are high, as we mentioned, and in fact, 100 percent of the money received in an STR rental, on my example, stays on Maui. \$46,800 of rent, 94 percent goes directly to the cost of property tax, utilities, homeowner fees, insurance, house cleaning, supplies, equipment, upkeep. The remaining 6 percent in my pocket, all of these stay in the First Hawaiian Bank, and I spend it on Maui with my family when I visit. Property rent levels, as we said, are exorbitant, and the "\$4,600 per month carrying costs," that was specified to, I believe is quite accurate. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . I have \$3,656 per month of direct costs. My surveys show that over 50 percent of the STR-designed apartments now offered are on the market for over 30 days, and also it shows that the cheap apartments in the 215 to \$500,000 range are on the market an average of 155 days. If local residents aren't occupying these units now, why would they after Bill 9? If there was a factory on the island with 1,900 jobs to be lost, we wouldn't close that factory down, and there's more likely 3,800 job loss with the trickle-down effect. None of us approve anyone's job loss, forcing them to leave Maui to find elsewhere. I oppose Bill 9. It takes a lot from Maui locals and gives little, if anything, in return. The 75 million of property tax and the sales tax, in . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . ten years that would be 750 million towards affordable housing. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Hansen. Members, do you want...oh, there's a question from Member U'u-Hodgins.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Hansen. I lost you for a second when you were describing your carrying costs per month. Can you please restate your number?

MR. HANSEN: \$3,656 of direct costs, all of which are directed on Maui.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Okay. Thank you so much. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: You're welcome. Members, any other questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Mr. Hansen. Staff?

MR. HANSEN: Mahalo.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Steve Gadsby, to be followed by Tom Croly and then Keala Cabanilla. *(pause)* Mr. Gadsby, can you please unmute now? If you're having trouble unmuting, please call in on the phone number in the chat with the meeting code. Chair, should we go on to Tom Croly?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, please.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: Mr. Croly, can you unmute?

MR. CROLY: I have. Aloha, Council. I'm Tom Croly, and I do not own a short-term rental, nor do I represent anyone who would be directly impacted by Bill 9. I have followed all the meetings, and reviewed all of the written testimony related to this bill, and I've asked myself, what would I do if I was sitting in your seat as a Councilmember? I've concluded that I would seek an alternative...alternative approaches to address Maui's resident housing shortage, because Bill 9 is unlikely to achieve its goals, and certainly will cause significant harm to Maui residents. Specifically, it will produce little or no affordable housing for residents. Maui's economy will definitely suffer, and legal challenges are likely. Instead, I would like to offer the Council five alternative strategies that I believe could create more resident housing with fewer negative consequences. Number one, enforce the existing Apartment Zoning Code. All residential buildings built in the Apartment zone since 1989 are supposed to be occupied on a long-term residential basis. Yet based on real property tax classifications, more than 50 percent of the non-Minatoya condos built since 1989 in South Maui are used as second homes, and not on a long-term residential basis. Please ask the Administration why this part of the Code is not enforced. Number two, apply long-term occupancy rules to new construction. If changing the policy for existing condo units would create new legal challenges, then consider applying this long-term occupancy requirement only to newly-built apartment projects. Many of the proposed developments in Wailea, Mākena, and Kihei openly anticipate that they're building them for...primarily for off-island second homeowners. Why continue down that path? Number three, document the history of these Minatoya properties. A thorough investigation of the origins of all these Minatoya properties could help distinguish between . . .(timer sounds). . . those originally intended for TVR and second home use, and those that were later enabled by legislation. While I wouldn't support removing anyone's property rights, I think it's important to...to draw this distinction before making any, you know, decisions. Number four, create TVR regulations. TVR regulations might allow more of the revenue to remain on Maui, specifically require local management. As you probably heard from one of the testifiers earlier, people are self-managing from elsewhere, and the reason they're doing that is, it's cheaper. So, make them have a manager here, and that might encourage some people to put properties into long-term use. And finally, create incentives for long-term rentals. Use a portion of the hundreds of millions of dollars of Transient Accommodations Tax and real property tax revenue generated by the TVRs to subsidize long-term rentals. For example, offer owners of legal TVR use . . .(timer sounds). . . financial incentives to offer their properties as long-term rentals.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Croly.

MR. CROLY: Chair, I'll...I'll stop there if you have any questions.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes. Members, questions for Mr. Croly? You have a question from Chair Lee, and Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hi, Tom. As usual, you have some very good ideas. Did you send in your testimony in writing?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. CROLY: Chair, I haven't yet because I'm still...I'm still listening to all the testimony, and I don't want to miss anything that people have brought up. These aren't strictly my ideas, but...but ideas that other people have presented, and...and I'd like to discuss them further.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. I always like compromises, especially when they involve creative incentives. I did miss...you're talking pretty fast. What was your second suggestion?

MR. CROLY: So, the second suggestion was, because we already say in the Apartment District that everything must be occupied on a long-term residential basis since 1989, then why are we building condos that are...the developers right up front are saying, these are not for long-term residential use. These are for...for something other. I suppose those should be in the...built in the Hotel District and not being built in the Apartment District. That was my suggestion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I see. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Croly. I just want to clarify if I'm following you correctly. So, you're saying that it says in the Code that Apartment Zone after the Minatoya list is supposed to be occupied on a long-term residential basis?

MR. CROLY: That's correct. And...and the Code that was changed back in 1989 defined this thing called long-term residential basis. If you look up in the definitions of the Code, you'll see what it says there, okay? So, my question is...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Occupancy of a dwelling unit or lodging unit for 180 days or more per year. So, you're kind of saying that Apartment Zone after the Minatoya list should have no non-owner-occupied tax classifications because they should all live there more than 180 days a year? Is that...

MR. CROLY: That makes sense to me.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's what you're saying? And then...

MR. CROLY: I'm saying ask the...ask the Administration what...what...what...why it is the way it is.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then if that's what you're saying is correct, then what...what is the recourse you suggest?

MR. CROLY: Well --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: They got to sell it?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. CROLY: -- again, I...I...I anticipate that even if you were to say to someone, hey, your unit that you've been using as a second home, you're not allowed to use as a second home anymore, you're going to get a legal challenge to that. There's...there's no doubt in...in my mind.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thank you.

MR. CROLY: But I'm saying, let's not go forward with new ones, you know, to allow that, right?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Got it. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Any other --

MR. CROLY: Yes.

CHAIR KAMA: -- Members have questions for Mr. Croly? Seeing none. Thank you so very much, Mr. Croly. Staff?

MR. CROLY: I think...I see Tom's hand.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I'm sorry. Mr. Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. It's a big question, but hopefully you can condense it. A thumbnail sketch of how you would use the current tax revenue to subsidize.

MR. CROLY: Thank you for that. Like I said, this is just kind of a sketchy idea, but...but in...in the big picture, you could take something like, let's say, \$50 million, okay, and...and create a fund that you would be subsidizing long-term rentals. So, someone who comes to you and says, my carrying costs for my short-term rental is \$5,000 a month, and I couldn't take less than that. Well, offer him a \$2,000 a month incentive, and then he can offer it to someone for \$3,000 a month to live in it. That's going to immediately create, potentially, a long-term rental for someone.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, that would potentially be like a transitional deal for a couple, three years or something while...

MR. CROLY: That's why I said, it has to be...it has to be vetted out. Like, yeah, how long do you allow that to take place, and how do you ensure that...that a system like that is not being abused. There's much more that's going to have to go to it, but you've got a pile of money sitting right there in terms of all these...you know, money, the TAT and the...and the RPT taxes from...from...these...these units. So, let's use it to create something like that.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. No, well, thanks. I mean, that does do something potentially like right away. So, that's the difference.

MR. CROLY: Yeah.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So --

MR. CROLY: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- thank you for your testimony.

MR. CROLY: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Croly. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, returning to Steve Gadsby, to be followed by Keala Cabanilla and then Kamaehu Marrotte. *(pause)* Mr. Gadsby, we suggest you try to call in on the number in the chat. Chair, the next testifier is Keala Cabanilla, to be followed by Kamaehu Marrotte, and then Lexi Figueroa. *(pause)*

MS. CABANILLA: Aloha mai no kākou. O Keala Cabanilla ko‘u inoa. Mahalo for this opportunity to testify on my own behalf in strong support of Bill 9. I was born and raised in Lāhainā, and I’m privileged to still be living in West Maui. I’m an educator with a daily hour-long commute to work. And I have been asked, why not move to the other side, closer to work for your convenience? My answer has always been, and will always be, no. Not just because I simply cannot afford such convenience, but because Lāhainā is my home, ku‘u ewe, ku‘u piko. And I think about my ‘ohana, my friends and community members born and raised in Lāhainā who would say the same, who would have never chosen to live anywhere else but home in Lāhainā. I am not moved by the pleas of STR owners and managers who claim that if this bill passes, they’ll have to take on a second job, move in with a roommate, or return to a prior residence they already own elsewhere--to a home they own elsewhere. These concerns feel incredibly out of touch and insensitive when weighed against the lived experiences and current circumstances of our people, as shared in many testimonies. Our people have long endured far greater hardships just to remain on Maui, home on Maui...dispersed and displaced in and out of houselessness, working multiple jobs, and constantly adjusting, adapting, and sacrificing. Yet, STR owners suggest the only way they can afford to stay here is by continuing to take, take, take...take up space, take up housing, take up resources. That is not community. Council, as you discuss in the coming days, I ask that you reflect on what community means to you, and keep in mind those in your communities that fed you and raised you. Please pass Bill 9, give our people . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . a chance, help keep our people home in our communities. Mahalo nui.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Ms. Cabanilla. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Kamaehu Marrotte, to be followed by Lexi Figueroa, and then Kelcie Rapoza.

MR. MARROTTE: That’s really hard to follow. Aloha pumehana kākou. My name is Kamaehu Kawikohana *(phonetic)* Marrotte. I am supporting...I mean, I am testifying in strong support of Bill 9 to phase out short-term rentals. I was born and raised in Waipio,

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

O'ahu. Though I cannot...though I am not from Lāhainā, I am fortunate enough now to call it home, and fortunate enough to be in a position to give back through community partnerships. I cannot speak as a kupu of Lāhainā or a data analyst, I can only echo what those before me have said, and speak as a Kānaka Maoli born and raised in Hawai'i. My parents have been educators in Nanakuli, O'ahu for over 20 years, and they have never had the privilege of owning a home. To hear the opposition stress how hard it is to own four vacation rentals puts a knot in my chest. I have heard testimony from those that refer to Lāhainā as an attraction of Maui, rather than the people and the history that makes it, all the while, while arguing how much they advocate for the community and contribute to our living and breathing economy. It is undeniably clear that our home is nothing more than an investment opportunity and a means to fill their pockets. Most of all, it shocks me to hear the opposition still demand respect, hospitality, and aloha after their exploitation and prostitution of our resources. The opposition has expressed a number of times that this bill has created a divide in the community, and that they are starting to feel as if they don't belong. If your livelihood, if your lifestyle, solely depends on restricting one's access and right to live in their homeland, the land and their ancestors' bones are buried, you do not belong here. I think this bill is a small step in whispering this message, and I look forward to hearing this message amplified. We are fighting for much more than protecting our investments. We are protecting our right to raise our keiki in our homeland. I urge the Chair and the Council to advocate for the experiences of those here on this 'āina rather than the experience . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . of tourists during their week-long stay. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Lexi Figueroa, to be followed by Kelcie Rapoza, and then Ron Siliado.

MS. FIGUEROA: Aloha, Chair and Councilmembers.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MS. FIGUEROA: My name is Lexi Figueroa, and I'm here to express my strong support for Bill 9. I may not be from Lāhainā, but I stand firmly alongside the Lāhainā community, and with those who choose to put people over profit. I live in Wailuku, and volunteered at the War Memorial shelter immediately after the fires. I'm also a substitute teacher. I've taught students who lost their homes, their sense of safety, and in some cases, even family members. As a Native Hawaiian, I carry the history of our people and our 'āina with me daily, including the impacts of exploitation and displacement my ancestors endured. Maui was already facing a housing crisis. The wildfires only deepened that crisis, and our people are still living in the aftermath, even if it's not making vast headlines anymore. Yet hundreds of units on the Minatoya list are still being used as short-term rentals, many owned by people who only visit Maui just for a few months out of the year, while many Lāhainā families remain houseless, living in cars, bouncing between relatives' homes, or on waiting lists for help that for some rarely seems to come. We've heard arguments that these STRs are not suitable for long-term occupancy, but I ask those who agree with this sentiment, is a car more suitable for a family to live in?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

Is constant instability and uncertainty more acceptable than returning these units to serve the people who actually live here, whose families have lived in Lāhainā, in Maui, for generations? Those opposing Bill 9, have you ever had to wonder where you'll sleep next week? Have you ever had to choose between rent and groceries? It's not luxury, it's survival. I support Bill 9 because I've seen the need firsthand. I've looked into the eyes of families who've lost everything. I've listened to kids in my classroom talk about what they've gone through. My family has also never been able to own a home. Although all four of us who live under the same roof work full-time . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . jobs, we often wonder how long we'll be able to afford our rent as the cost increases. I've seen and felt how deeply this crisis continues to affect our community. I urge you, Chair and Councilmembers, to stand alongside your constituents in strong support of Bill 9. I'd also like to remind those who are opposed to this bill that money should never outweigh the value of community. Mahalo.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: *(Applause)*

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so very much.

MS. FIGUEROA: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Kelcie Rapoza, to be followed by Ron Siliado, and then the caller with the last four digits 5635.

MS. RAPOZA: All right. I'm going to keep it short. Aloha mai kākou. My name is Kelcie Rapoza. I am from the beautiful moku of Wailuku. My roots run deep on Maui going generations back when our great queens and kings ruled over our islands. I strongly support Bill 9 because Hawai'i isn't Hawai'i without Kānaka, and we all know that. By passing this bill, it gives my 'ohana and many other 'ohana hope to stay on Maui, and not have to worry about housing insecurities, and where we're going to lay our head the next month. It's one step closer to build generational wealth through 'āina--not money, 'āina--reclaiming what is our birthright. In my opinion, people who aren't Kānaka should not be owning any land or property in Hawai'i, but that's another conversation that we can have at a different time, yeah? E kala mai for this next part, I know there's keiki in here, but don't shoot the messenger. When kūpuna tell you to say something, you say something, yeah? First of all, I want to say with the utmost respect to the Councilmembers and my kūpuna, e kala mai, if you oppose this bill, in the words of the great Kendrick Lamar, disrespectfully, no, you are not a colleague, you're a fucking colonizer. Mahalo nui me ke aloha.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: *(Applause)*

CHAIR KAMA: Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Ron Siliado, to be followed by the caller with the last four digits 5635, and then Albert Perez.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. SILIADO: Aloha, County Council Chair --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. SILIADO: -- and County Council. My name is Ron Siliado. I work for the ILWU. I'm a lifelong resident here, too. I had family get affected by this fire. And what I'd like to say is that all you STR owners, what you guys talking about, and your ideas, and your guys' theories is all BS. Because what these Lāhainā residents went through, there's no suffering you can imagine that you guys going through. So, I...I strongly support this Bill 9. And we went through a lot, man. This is a lot, from delivering supplies to helping whoever was...was one disaster. Nobody was prepared for this. You know, the hotels, the apartments, and...let me see. Give me a little bit of time. Had a long day. Thanks for giving me the opportunity for testify. But the Apartment Zones, local people used to live there. Now, they don't live there no more. It was not to make money. It was...it was...it's why the hotels was made, for them to make money, right? With these STRs, we no more business in the hotels as much as the hotels should be diverted. These STRs should be with...for these long-term rentals, my kids, my grandkids, and all that. So, I just wanted to throw that in too. But it touches me because I see all these keiki, all these young adults...I see the suffering that they went through. We all did our duty, tour of duty in this...this disaster. Nobody was prepared, right? . . .*(timer sounds)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. SILIADO: But lastly, I just, you know, want you guys to, you know, pass this bill, man. I mean, just have it pass, and then you STR guys, we talk story later when this pass, and see what's happening. You know what I mean? Remember, we all was born here. We never flew here. We get generations, islands-to-islands. So, I just like let you guys know, yeah? If I had my way, like the last testimony I said, I wouldn't have none of you guys get one STR on this State of Hawai'i. That's my thought. No personal ill feelings. Sorry if I getting little bit emotion, but thank you so much. Yeah.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Ron.

MR. SILIADO: Aloha.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is the person calling in with the last four digits 5635--please press star-6 to unmute yourself--to be followed by Albert Perez, and then David Matthews. *(pause)* Chair, I don't see the caller on anymore. The next testifier would be Albert Perez, to be followed by David Matthews, and then Ember. *(pause)* Mr. Perez, are you able to unmute? You may need to call in on the phone number listed in the chat with the meeting code.

MR. PEREZ: Hi. Can you hear me now? Aloha. Oh, sorry.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: Is that...

MR. PEREZ: Oh, sorry about that.

MR. KRUEGER: Mr. Perez...

CHAIR KAMA: Go ahead, Mr. Perez.

MR. PEREZ: Can you hear me? Yes. Aloha, Chair Kama and Members of the Committee.
. . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is someone going to tell him? Someone's got to tell him.

CHAIR KAMA: Mr. Perez? Mr. Perez?

MR. PEREZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: Do you want to start your testimony again --
. . .*(echoing)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: -- because it sounds like a rubber ducky.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, I think Mr. Perez is having a technical difficulty. You might want to try...you're sounding...yes. Yes, please. Maybe try call in. Thank you.

MR. PEREZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. Thank you. Okay. Okay.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next...

CHAIR KAMA: Let's go to Mr. Matthews.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is David Matthews, to be followed by Amber Ngo, to be followed by Sara Hauptman. *(pause)* Chair --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: -- going on to Amber, I'm not sure how to pronounce it, Ngo, or...it's the letters N-G-O, apologies, to be followed by Sara Hauptman, and then Junya Nakoa.

MS. NGO: Is it me? Amber Ngo, yeah. Aloha. My name is Amber, and I strongly oppose Bill 9 as this bill will take away the economic opportunities that allow me to make a living, and be present and active for my son. I worked for the Westin and Hyatt from 2015 to 2018. I made 17 to \$21 per hour, eight hours per day, and paid a sitter \$10 per hour for ten hours per day when there is no school. During school breaks, getting childcare was another stress-filled challenge. When my son got sick, getting days off was not always approved, and I had to choose between my job or my son. Many working parents and families can share in my struggles. The STR industry allowed me to earn an income and be a mom. It provided and created jobs and economic opportunities for me. When my son was sick during grade school, I got time off to care for him. I received the grace and support to care for him without fear of losing my only income. When there's no school, I could take him with me to the office. I would never be able to do this with Hyatt, or Westin, or another corporation. Phasing out 6,000 S...6,000 STRs will cause me to lose my income, and ability to be an active mom in my son's life. I don't know another job that would provide me this flexibility. I'm not alone in this position. I have friends and colleagues that are in the same position as I. I've lost friends to the mainland from job losses, and I'm scared that the passing of this bill as written may cause me to lose my livelihood. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Members, questions for the testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Amber.

MS. NGO: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, can I ask a question? Sorry.

CHAIR KAMA: Of her? Oh, Amber, Member Paltin has a question.

MS. NGO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Ngo. Do you only service Minatoya condos?

MS. NGO: Not only Minatoya condos, but anywhere from along Kapalua down to Wailea.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MS. NGO: Those also include Minatoya, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MS. NGO: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Staff?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Sara Hauptman, to be followed by Junya Nakoa, and then Andrea. *(pause)* Chair, we don't see Sarah Hauptman on the line. The next testifier is Junya Nakoa, to be followed by Andrea, and then Laguna Jabola-Ing.

MR. NAKOA: Yessah. How you guys stay? Sorry, brah, I no more voice, I cheering all weekend. But...okay. First things first. My daughter, oldest daughter, she live in Honolulu, okay? She...she worked...she's one...she worked as a social worker for the Easter Seals, like that, yeah? She's living in a one-bedroom condo, yeah, in Honolulu. And that's how she's going to live, yeah? She like come home, though. She like come home. So, maybe...well, not maybe...if the STRs can come into long-term, then my baby can come home. Because I know she like be here with her...her and her nephew, just like how I am with my grandson. She like come home, okay? She like come home. Give her an opportunity to come home. Now, my other daughter, my other daughter, she stay in a FEMA thing right now. And she living in a one-bedroom condo right now. She's been there for over a year. They get one parking stall. They get small da kine, but they make it happen. So, don't listen to all these STR guys just saying that he...that we don't know how to make 'em happen. My two daughters doing 'em right now, okay? My two daughters doing 'em right frickin' now. Now, okay, Mayor Bissen and his Administration, okay, I don't know if you guys know, I throw him under the bus every damn time, yeah? Call him any kine names. But when him and his team went make the presentation about this, holy smokes, I was so impressed. I did one standing ovation. And I go over there, and go shake his hand. Now, the reason why we in this predicament of lack of housing, yeah, gang, is because of all the developments that been passed through this...this kine...Chamber, this Chamber . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . yeah? The thing went from 50 percent, you know, affordable, to 25 percent. And then I know there's a couple of you guys in this Council who is against affordable in perpetuity, okay? The reason why all these things, all these Minatoya list things came up...because they would take 'em out of...not for affordable anymore, and then they go buy 'em. Now we stuck, because, you know, all the hotels on north Kā'anapali were built with the promise of building 2,000 workforce housing, okay? And I don't know what the hell went happen, okay? So, all these condos that...that crybaby right now, that thing was supposed to be for the working people of Lāhainā, okay? Maybe my daughter can come home if you guys do something, okay? I like be able to come over there and shake all nine of you guys' hand. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . Same thing like how I did with the Mayor. Yessah. Mahalo.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . . *(Applause)*

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Nakoa. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Mr. Nakoa.

MR. NAKOA: Peace out.

CHAIR KAMA: Staff?

MR. NAKOA: Yessah.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, we'd like to return to Mr. Perez. We believe he may be calling in--Mr. Perez, if you're calling in, please do star...star-6 to unmute--to be followed by Sara, who we believe is in the Chamber, and then Laguna...Andrea, and then Laguna Jabola-Ing. *(pause)* Mr. Perez, if that's you, star-6 to unmute. Chair, moving on to Sara, to be followed by Andrea, and then Laguna Jabola-Ing.

CHAIR KAMA: Hui. This side.

MS. SARA: Hi. My name is Sara. I will say it's taking a lot of guts for me to be here because I am speaking in opposition of this bill, and this room doesn't feel very warm and welcoming to that. I wanted to take a moment and mention that by work, I do home visits. I do home visiting with people in Lāhainā. I do home visits with people who have been displaced from Lāhainā. Now they're living in Kihei, and I need to respect the privacy of my clients. I would love to tell personal stories about them because it is very touching. But as a whole, I noticed that these...a lot of these individuals, they do depend on tourism for their work, and a lot of them have maybe one gentleman working in the home. He goes out, whether it's landscaping or cleaning, and then he brings money home to take care of his family, or he sends it--whether it's to Micronesia, the Marshall Islands, the Philippines--he sends it back to them, and this bill would be tearing the rug out from underneath them. And these individuals that I speak about, these families, there are disabled adults living in the home depending on this income. There are elderly living in the home depending on this income. So, they are...they are really affected by this. Now, I know this question is going to come up, and you're like, why is this girl here talking about this? I do own a short-term rental. I live here in Wailuku. My...yes, I heard from over there. There it is. We bought one a year ago. I've been driving the same car for 16 years. Like, I...we've scrimped and saved, and we made it happen. And, you know, if you want to make this affordable...in my eyes, an affordable one-bedroom is \$1,500, \$1,700. Like I think that's a fair price. I could never charge a local family that, the price . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . that it would cost to actually run a short-term rental as far as the maintenance fees, and all the overhead, and all the costs associated with it. I couldn't, in good conscience, tell a local family, oh, this condo cost me \$5,000 per month, your family needs to give me \$5,000 per month. But a tourist, I could ask a tourist that in good conscience, and that can maintain the buildings, do all the sprawling, everything. They're right by the ocean. The salt is very corrosive. And I will say, if you brought that value down to maybe \$200,000, you know, that's...you want this to be the golden bullet, right? The thing that fixes everything, brings all these prices down. If you bring it down, it's still going to have a carrying cost of like 2,500 or \$3,000. And to bring it down to \$200,000, my family is collateral, and you're going to put me underwater half a million dollars to make that happen. And that's a big burden for . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . my family.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Sara.

MS. SARA: Thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, we'd like to return to...

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Um...

MS. MCKINLEY: Oh, sorry.

CHAIR KAMA: I want to say something first. So, Members...okay, three are here, and the rest of them...okay. So, given that we have reached the time that I set for concluding this meeting...so this is for you, Staff. Could you please advise the Committee on the position...on the testifier list that we are at right now, and the number of testifiers remaining on that list?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair...

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair...

MR. KRUEGER: Oh.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. So, the next testifier that we'd call would be 296. I mean, other than Mr. Perez. By our count, there's approximately 12 testifiers remaining.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you. So, Members--I'm asking--given the number of remaining testifiers, do you want to continue the meeting to complete oral testimony, or recess for the next scheduled time tomorrow? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I'd love to finish it tonight. I mean, I think --

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- everybody who's here is here, and...

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Anyone else? Yeah, Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'm willing to stay. I'm willing to stay.

CHAIR KAMA: Anyone else want to weigh in on this?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

CHAIR KAMA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I'm happy to stay as well. I'm...I'm guessing that the list may grow more than 12.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But I guess my question for you is, are we going to finish, but keep testimony open and allow for testimony tomorrow if there are any? Because I...I...I think --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Are we meeting tomorrow?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- we set that --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: 1:00 . . .*(inaudible)* . . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- at 1:00. Yeah, I think we kind of...we...we said that we would still meet tomorrow at 1:00. But I'm happy to finish, you know, like the...the...the 12 that we have now, and then if we have more tomorrow.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I just...I just don't want to...you know, false advertising.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, thank you. I feel the same way, that if...if we advertised, or published notice --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- that we're having a meeting tomorrow --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- we should have a meeting tomorrow.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. We definitely will.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Okay. But I have to leave at...in about 15 minutes.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, I'll miss some of the testimony.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Okay. Member U'u-Hodgins?

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I can stay on for a little bit. But I would like to say good night to my children sooner than later. But I can stay on for a little bit.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Thank you.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Anyone else want to weigh in? Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, thank you. So, out of respect for the people who are here and are able to, you know, testify, then if we go through the list of 12 --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- and if it's okay with you --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- I'm here. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So, here's the plan. We're going to go through the list of 12 because that's what we agreed. If other people sign up after that, we're just going to have to meet tomorrow, and they'll go on that list. Does that make sense for everyone? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You meant the list of 12 plus Albert Perez?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, definitely, Albert Perez. Hopefully, his voice has improved.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or Mickey, or whatever he's going by these days.

CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(laughing)*. . . Well, we're going to hear.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I thought it was rubber ducky.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. . . *(laughing)*. . . Yes, Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: What's the intention on starting deliberations? Would we finish testimony --

CHAIR KAMA: After testimony is always...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- tomorrow, start deliberations?

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And then --

CHAIR KAMA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- and then schedule the Mayor and everybody for further deliberations?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: When we have deliberations, that's when we're going to invite the Mayor back. So, the intent, I think, was, if we can finish our testimony tomorrow, then we can start on July 2nd with the Mayor, and we can go into deliberations if, after tomorrow, we're done with all of our testifiers.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: You're welcome. Staff has asked for a short recess. So, it is 8:02. We're going to take a five-minute recess until 8:07. HLU is now in recess. . . .(gavel) . . .

RECESS: 8:02 p.m.

RECONVENE: 8:08 p.m.

CHAIR KAMA: . . .(gavel) . . . Will the reconvened HLU Committee meeting of June 9th reconvene. It is now 8:08 p.m. And Staff, where did we leave off, with Mr. Perez?

MS. MCKINLEY: Yes, Chair. The next testifier is Albert Perez, to be followed by Andrea, and then Laguna Jabola-Ing.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So, Staff...Members, if you don't mind, we may not get the 12...through the 12 in the next hour. So, if you don't mind, I'd like to be able to end our meeting tonight at 9:00, and then continue testifying tomorrow if we still have some left, and whatever might come. Is that good? Thank you, the people online. Thank you for the online. Okay. Tom said okay, Nohe said okay, Keani said okay, Gabe said okay, and I guess Shane did too...or is he not saying?

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah, go. You got to go? Yeah, we have quorum. Okay. We're at Mr. Perez; is that right, Ellen?

MS. MCKINLEY: Yes, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: All right, Albert. Speak to us.

MR. PEREZ: Yes, I'm a little bit afraid to speak. Is that any better?

CHAIR KAMA: . . .(laughing) . . . You're good.

MR. PEREZ: Okay. Mahalo, Chair Kama, Members of the Committee. My name is Albert Perez. I'm not Donald Duck.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: . . .(laughing) . . .

MR. PEREZ: So, the...so, the original plan for tourism in Maui County was to focus it in resort areas, and keep it out of our communities. Over time, using loopholes in the Apartment Zone, short-term rentals crept in, but unlike bed and breakfast homes, there's no owner on site to maintain order, and respect neighbors. So, after a while, nearby residents had two neighbors, just a parade of visitors. The Maui Island Plan says many TVRs are

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

also part-time vacation homes, with owners paying for the mortgage using TVR, thereby driving up housing costs. So, that...that jumped out at me. If we reduce the number of short-term rentals in the Apartment District, that cost of housing should decline. Existing TVRs already have water. Lack of water is already limiting housing, and climate change is reducing available water. Bill 9 would provide housing that already has water to residents, which should be our priority. But Bill 9 is only one of several things that need to be done to bring balance back to our island home, where visitors are housed at the resorts and neighborhoods can thrive. So, Maui Tomorrow supports Bill 9 as part of a three-step plan. First, pass the bill with no exemptions for particular properties. Second, include a three-year phase-out period to give owners time to adjust and apply for changes in zoning on a case-by-case basis. And third, the County can purchase appropriate Minatoya properties using Affordable Housing Funds. And I'm going to go into a little more detail. So, in step one, passing the bill with no exemptions, according to the property rights' attorneys that we have consulted, carve-outs could make the ordinance vulnerable . . .(timer sounds). . . to challenge because laws need to apply uniformly. If the Council picks winners and losers in the Apartment District, the law could be thrown out in court. They also tell us that any challenged regulation is presumed to be constitutional, especially in highly-regulated industries like STRs. Property owners have a low success rate on constitutional takings claims. The second part, the three-year phase-out, people need to make the case that short-term rental is appropriate for that property. There should be no automatic rezoning, especially not as part of Bill 9. If too many units are rezoned to Hotel, the positive impact of this bill will be reduced. And the third step, the County can offer to purchase by either buying the units outright or offering down payment assistance to local residents, which would harness the earning power of local residents . . .(timer sounds). . . and the housing funds would go five times further. And that three-step approach would ensure a good number of these units would be returned to the local housing market.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Perez.

MR. PEREZ: Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: So, your time is up, but did you send this in writing to us?

MR. PEREZ: I did not, but I can.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Members, any questions --

MR. PEREZ: Be happy to.

CHAIR KAMA: -- for Mr. Perez? Seeing none. Thank you so much. Staff?

MR. PEREZ: Okay. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MR. PEREZ: Aloha.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Andrea, to be followed by Laguna Jabola-Ing, and then we'd like to return to Ember.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Andrea. *(pause)* I don't see Andrea. I don't see Andrea. Is she on Teams?

MS. MCKINLEY: Laguna, you are unmuted on our end.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MS. MCKINLEY: You need to unmute yourself. If you're unable to do that, we suggest you call in to the phone number listed in the chat. Oh, there you are.

CHAIR KAMA: No, that's --

MR. JABOLA-ING: Hi.

CHAIR KAMA: -- that's Laguna Jabola-Ing. You...we're looking for Andrea, right? But you want to take Laguna?

MS. MCKINLEY: Yes. I don't believe Andrea is on the call anymore.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MS. MCKINLEY: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha, Laguna.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, and Chair?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, will you please make sure the other participants are muted so that it...I already heard reverb. I want to be able to hear Mr. Jabola-Ing.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. Please proceed.

MR. JABOLA-ING: Well, aloha, aunties and uncles. My name is Laguna, and I'm nine years old. I like to look pictures of me as a tiny baby on Maui with my mommy and daddy. My dad is from Maui, and so is my grammy. Now we visit, we have to stay in a hotel, and it's so expensive. I haven't been there for over a year. I want to fish where my dad learned. I want to hike on the trails my papa Mark *(phonetic)* walked on. And I want to have Christmas at my grandma's house again. But that dream just keeps getting further away because people who aren't from here just keep buying multiple houses. And that's not fair because they're turning them into hotels to make easy money. Please pass Bill 9 so kids like me can grow up knowing where they came from. Please, aunties and uncles, this is your chance to bring our home. Mahalo.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Laguna.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKERS: *(Applause)*

CHAIR KAMA: Members, any questions for Mr. Jabola-Ing? Seeing none. Thank you so much. Staff?

MR. JABOLA-ING: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good job.

MR. JABOLA-ING: Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MS. MCKINLEY: -- is Ember, to be followed by Susana, and then Rob Silvernagel.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Ember? Ember?

MS. EMBER: Aloha, Chair and Councilmembers. My name is Ember. I am in support of Bill 9. If we don't change things, kids like me won't have a place to stay. I don't know why they say local people can't live in condos. My dad has a condo in Kihei, and hopefully I can live there when I grow up if there are no houses I can afford to. Too many people...too many local people have to live in their cars or bushes. Please make this bill pass. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Ember.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good job.

CHAIR KAMA: Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Susana, to be followed by Rob Silvernagel, and then JD.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. *(pause)*

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MS. MCKINLEY: -- the next testifier is Rob Silvernagel, to be followed by JD, and then to be followed by Castonguay William. *(pause)* Chair, seeing no response and not seeing

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

them online. The next testifier would be JD, to be followed by Castonguay William, and then Gretchen Losano, to be followed by Kaliko Okalani Teruya. Chair, not seeing JD on the line either. The next testifier is Castonguay William, to be followed by Gretchen Losano, and then Kaliko Okalani Teruya. *(pause)* We did just have a phone caller join. So, if we have just called your name, you could unmute by pressing star-6 and letting us know your name. Otherwise, proceeding with Castonguay William, please unmute yourself. If you're unable to unmute, please call in on the phone number in the chat. Chair, the next testifier is Gretchen Losano, to be followed by Kaliko Okalani Teruya, and then Keaka Mitchell.

CHAIR KAMA: There we go.

MS. LOSANO: Aloha, Council. My daughter might...my daughter is Kaliko. I was telling her she had a little bit more time. She's going to have to call in because she's not with me tonight. I had to come from work. So, mahalo for the opportunity to testify. I actually just came from a really awesome meeting about our solid waste initiatives. And so, I think that...I mean, there's...there's so much to say about this. But I'm going to stick to what I think I'm best at, which is talking about the programs that...that I run, and that I do within our solid waste area. So, a lot of the waste initiatives that we have coming up are dependent on closed-loop systems, or relatively closed-loop systems. So, hotel areas, like Kā'anapali, that is a relatively closed-loop system. We have a lot of waste initiatives that are super exciting coming up to divert food waste, to divert all the compostable food service. We actually have reusable programs coming up for all of these areas. But it's...it's really important to understand that in the STR areas, like places that are supposed to be long-term rentals for residents, those programs only work if they are long-term residents living there. Because people who come for a week, they can't sign up for things like...and...and they don't want to, you know, sign up for compost services, the reusable initiatives. They're...it only works if we have all of the tourists in one area that we can . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . manage. and that we can control. And then we can allow those residential programs to happen in the residential areas for these...for...for our community members. They have to sign up for the programs, and then we can, you know, get all of this waste diversion. And I think that nobody has talked about that, but as far as our natural resources, like water, they use so much more water. We need a whole bunch of water in order to compost things. And if they're using like seven to ten times as much water in these areas, it allows less water for us to be able to compost and create more 'āina for people to use to grow food. I mean it's all...it's all a whole system that we're trying to have 90 percent of our food actually grown here, but we can't do that . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . if we don't have the resources and we don't have the people that are our local people buying into these programs or participating, so...

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you so much.

MS. LOSANO: Yeah.

CHAIR KAMA: Members, questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much.

MS. LOSANO: Okay.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Appreciate it.

MS. LOSANO: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, returning to Castonguay William--if you have called in, you can do star-6 to unmute--and then the next testifier would be Kaliko Okalani Teruya, to be followed by Keaka Mitchell. Chair, moving on to Kaliko Okalani Teruya, to be followed by Keaka Mitchell, and then Alex Bendetov.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, I think Kaliko was calling in...her mom said.

MS. MCKINLEY: Okay. Chair, the next testifier would be Keaka Mitchell, to be followed by Alex Bendetov, and then Tom Creagh. *(pause)* Keaka Mitchell, are you able to unmute yourself? Chair, we suggest that Keaka try calling in on the number in the chat. Proceeding with Alex Bendetov. *(pause)* Alex, if you're able to unmute. *(pause)* I guess we need to suggest that you call in as well. There is a phone number in the chat with a meeting code, and then you use star-6 to unmute. Chair, the next testifier would be Tom Creagh, to be followed by Anon A...Anon AJ. *(pause)* Chair, we don't see Tom Creagh on the call. So, the next testifier would be Anon AJ. If you're able to unmute, it would be your turn to testify. *(pause)* Chair, we do have new callers. If you are calling in and you're one of the people we just called, please raise your hand or unmute yourself. That's star-6 to unmute. And Chair, we see Keaka Mitchell has raised their hand. Keaka, go ahead and unmute yourself if you're able to. If you're calling in, you would do that by doing star-6. You are enabled on our end. Chair, we're admitting a new phone caller to the meeting. We need to promote them.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MCKINLEY: If you've just called in and you've been called to testify, please unmute by doing...pressing star-6.

MR. MITCHELL: Good evening.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MCKINLEY: Please identify yourself.

MR. MITCHELL: Thank you. This is Keaka Mitchell calling in.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, okay. Please proceed.

MR. MITCHELL: Oh, shame, shame. Where are we going? We have no home. We have no house. Where you think we going? We have no house. You guys get house. We like one too. You like us go camp on your house? We like live on the...we no like live on the

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

streets. Those were the cries of the keiki from the Waimanalo eviction of June 3rd, 1985, for those who's been around that long. Yes, 40 years. Aloha and good evening, Members of the Maui County Council Housing and Land Use Committee. As I shared, my name is Keaka Mitchell. I'm a Native Hawaiian, an employee of the State's largest health insurer. A community advocate that fights for our keiki in early childhood. Once served our Lāhainā community with the State Department of Health taskforce team. A licensed realtor managing an affordable housing complex in Lāhainā. However, I speak for myself and not in the capacity in which I work in. Like brave Mahealani Wilhelm, who's previously spoke and provided testimony, I too was moved to provide testimony for the first time. Today, I support Bill 9. As a child who grew up in a homeless shelter, relied on SNAP benefits and other State support, I know how fragile stability can be, and how vital access to affordable long-term housing and building for our better future. My wife and I are hardworking, and as adults, have saved up money and now reside in a home where we own and have been blessed with, in a development, also known as workforce housing. I stand here with deep personal history. In the late 1980s, I stood with my grandmother as she stood in aloha 'āina, standing up for our land, our people, and . . .(timer sounds). . . was arrested alongside her at two years old defending Hawaiian sacred spaces. The spirit of mālama 'āina has guided my life. Bill 9 seeks to restrict vacation rentals in Apartment District and prioritize long-term community-based housing. This bill is no more than policy. It's...it's a movement to protect our lands, and to show our families, like mines, who face displacement and hardship, can be put down and can put our roots and thrive here on Maui. Some of the testifiers may not have been educated on our lands and were taken from us from the great Mahele and other injustices, displacing Hawaiians, and fracturing our community ties. Bill 9 is a way to restore that balance by closing loopholes that have allowed short-term renters to replace stable long-term housing. It's about honoring our kuleana, our responsibility to mālama 'āina, to care for the families and the future generations to come. I . . .(timer sounds). . . remind you, the decision that you make today--and I'm closing--will be judged not only by your grandchildren that are yet to come. As many of us know and sit in those chairs, you guys know that what we do reflects seven generations before us and --

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Mitchell.

MR. MITCHELL: -- seven generations to come. They...

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you --

MR. MITCHELL: Thank you. Have a good night.

CHAIR KAMA: -- for your testimony. Your time is up. But Members, questions for Mr. Mitchell?

MR. MITCHELL: Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Seeing none. Thank you so much.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, doing a last call for Castonguay William--if you're on the call, please press star-6 to unmute--to be followed by Alex Bendetov, and Anon AJ. If any of you are calling in, please press star-6 to unmute.

MR. BENDETOV: Hello?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MCKINLEY: Yes, go ahead. Please identify yourself.

MR. BENDETOV: This is Alex Bendetov. Are you able to hear me?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes. Yes, we are, Alex.

MR. BENDETOV: Okay. All right. Thank you. So, dear Councilmembers, my name is Alex Bendetov. Thank you for giving me an opportunity to testify. My testimony is in opposition of Bill 9. My family owns a vacation rental we acquired a few years ago, which was previously used as a short-term rental for ten years. While I completely understand the hardship many in the local community are facing when it comes to housing affordability, Bill 9 will not solve this problem. Even if Minatoya STVRs are banned, there is no clear path how that will make a dent in the housing crisis. Even if condo prices drop 50 percent, which is more than the study predicts, there will be no...that the price will still not be affordable. Renting...renting long-term will not work for owners who use the unit part of the time, so there is a good chance the unit will just sit empty. We keep hearing about choosing people over profit. At...at the same time, let's be pragmatic. Our family is not able to afford to rent at a loss, and our break-even point is around 3,500, which no one would pay for a 700-square-foot condo. We would have to sell, and the property would likely get picked up by a different investor. This is a net effect of a local family-owned cleaning company losing business, how is this going to help anyone? Short-term rentals pay significantly more in property taxes, and if they go away, somebody would need to observe the difference, or cuts in spending will be needed to be...will...will be needed to balance the budget. This might result in taxes going up for everyone, and even if you are renting, your landlord will likely pass this on in the form of rent increases. Passing of this bill will result in job loss and local businesses closing. Your friends and neighbors might be forced to move away. I truly hope that the Council will make...will make . . .(timer sounds). . . a decision based on facts and data, and not based on emotions. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Bendelov [sic]. Members, any questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much, Mr. Bendelov [sic]. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, if we don't have a Castonguay William, or Anon AJ, we could go to Al Medeiros.

MS. AJ: Okay. This is Anon AJ.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, okay.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MS. MCKINLEY: Go ahead.

MS. AJ: Aloha, and thank you for allowing me to testify. I've listened to all these days of testimony, and although I have an STR, it is in the Hotel zone, so it's not impacted by this bill, but I do not think it is...the way it is written as a bill, there...there's so many things that...I mean, it's such a tragedy, what's happened, and, you know, the...the issues that are happening. But I see that, you know, there are places to...to buy, like the Īao Parkside, and . . .*(inaudible)*. . . for a one-bedroom, one-bath condo . . .*(inaudible)*. . . has been on the market for over 100 days. They continue to lower the price, which is now 300K, with 518 AOA fees, yet no one has bought it. Is it because it's in Wailuku? I don't know. But the first home I was able to buy was due to government assistance with a down payment, and having to commute for 45 minutes each way. I've heard people testify they could fill the pools and take...and...and take turns mowing lawns. Sounds like a plan, but my building, the lawn and pool are the least of the...least of the cost. You know, there are...for water, electricity, propane, refuse in my building alone costs \$70,000 a month. Elevator contracts and repair of 100...180K. The kicker of them all is the building insurance of 1.6 million with a \$50,000 deductible. There's also parking lot maintenance, painting, roof, et cetera. The presentation Mayor Bissen showed at . . .*(inaudible)*. . . building homes, and I believe was about 400...450 a year . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . would not help the supply. For the many, many years, that it is a problem. We must get the rate of building to a higher rate. I must say, my first home, I bought when I was 30 years old. I luckily had a 2 percent assistance down payment for a \$250,000 home. I had excellent credit, but it did require me to travel over 30 minutes to my job. You know, we have to have sacrifices to build our wealth. And I think that, you know, it's important that people build their wealth by home ownership, and not by rentals. And I think we should use all the tax dollars created by the TAT tax to help assist people. But people are not going to be able to do long-term rental. They have bad . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . credit. If they don't have good jobs . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Anon AJ. Your time is up. Members, do you have questions for our testifier? Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Could you submit your...your testimony in writing? Or did you? Thank you.

MS. AJ: No, I...I just . . .*(inaudible)*. . . to these days of public testimony, and I felt like I had to say something.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. It just was hard to hear. Thank you.

MS. AJ: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Al Medeiros, and that is currently the last person signed up at the moment.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

MR. MEDEIROS: Aloha mai kākou. ‘O Alfred Keako Hiona Medeiros ko‘u inoa. No Wai‘anae mai au (*phonetic*). Mahalo, Chair. And mahalo to all the Councilmembers. Mahalo Lāhainā for standing up for our people, not only in Maui, but all Hawai‘i nei. I support Bill 9 because we need this, and it needs to trickle down to every single island. The shame of you for the people out there that’s not of Hawai‘i, that’s not from Hawai‘i, to say what you say in every single testimony. I heard some lady say something the other day about the annexation, and this is retaliation. No, we’re looking for repatriation. We’re looking for reparations, right? We’re looking for put our people back in the homes that they belong in. Enough is enough, guys. If you guys were representing the people on that board, you guys will do what is right. I hear all these people talk about money this, money that. Hey, that’s great. We need money to survive. But you guys are thriving when we’re trying to get by to survive in this overpriced paradise. We’re hurting. Have any of you been out there to help the people of Lāhainā when it burnt down? All you big money people, a‘ole. Not one of you. You guys have more concerns about yourselves. Just like that one man that says he has over 600-something units, and he’ll leave empty, and not rent out to people. What kind of people are you? You guys have no heart. You guys have no aloha. Why are you guys here? Who invited you? Because for myself, you have overstayed your welcome. That’s not the type of people that we want to have here in Hawai‘i. You guys are pushing our own people out while you guys are coming in by the dozens, and having no care or concern about our people, about our land, about our resources. Enough is enough. I would have been up there in person today, and you guys wouldn’t want this feeling. I guarantee that. But I fell off of one . . . (*inaudible*). . . you know what I mean? I do my thing as a cultural monitor. You know, as a cultural monitor, I watch people all the time do what they do, from desecration to doing all these big property developments, and everything in between, right, while watching outside foreign workers come in and push our local people out. . . (*timer sounds*). . . This is exactly what these little short-term rentals is. They’re pushing our people out. You guys need to put our people back into homes, and please do what is right. Not for our generation, not for your guys’ generation, but for our future generations. And if you guys cannot handle what I’m saying or how the truth comes as blunt as it is, by all means, catch the next flight back home. Southwest, get \$160 flights right now, one-way, yeah? That’s what I got to say. Mahalo for your guys’ time, and I’ll be up there the next time. I’d love to fly up there and talk to everybody. And mahalo to everybody, especially our youth. that continues to fight and rise up. Mahalo to our Councilmembers that are doing what is pono to ensure that our keiki have a home in Hawai‘i nei, especially on Maui. You guys have a good night, except for you guys not from here. Aloha.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha. Members, any questions for our testifier? Seeing none. Thank you, Mr. Medeiros. Staff?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, no one else has signed up to testify. If anyone in the audience or on Teams would like to testify, please come up to the mic and begin your testimony, or use the raise-your-hand function on Teams and Staff will unmute you. I will provide a brief countdown.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, wait. I thought we were just taking the people that signed up and continuing tomorrow. Was that not the plan? Or that wasn’t the plan?

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Well, we've exhausted all of our testifiers.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No. Some went home.

CHAIR KAMA: So, unless...well...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I thought...I thought you had said that we were going to take the next 12, and then...

CHAIR KAMA: No, that was the 12. We did have...we used those 12.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, so we're just doing the last call. It's 8:40. Chair indicated that the Committee might go until 9:00. So, we're just doing the last call in case there was anybody who didn't testify, but was planning to testify tonight, we could still perhaps take them.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR KAMA: So...okay. So, Members, we've reached the end of our testifier list. I believe that we provided ample opportunity for all segments of our community. So, as such, I'd like to know...I'd like to close oral testimony, and written testimony can still be accepted. But Members, according...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: People left because you said you were going to reopen it . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, Member --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR KAMA: -- Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Yesterday, at the end of our meeting, I...I went through what I thought was the plan. And so, people heard me explain that in the meeting, and understood that to be the plan. And so, some folks felt that there was a certainty that we were giving, that there would be continued testimony on Wednesday at 1:00. And so, you know, since we've exhausted the list, I don't anticipate it being like another 200 people. But I know people relied on that statement

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

of continuing to accept testimony on Wednesday at 1:00. And so, I'd like to keep testimony open for tomorrow.

CHAIR KAMA: Comments, Members? Yes, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I thought that's what you had said, that we were going to keep it open until tomorrow, and I think that's why people went home, all the babies and stuff. Because if you hadn't said that, and that we were going to finish tonight, and...I don't think they would have gone home. But I would like to go home. I think the tide went down, and so maybe the ocean isn't crossing the highway anymore.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. Yeah. Okay. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, I think...I think people are expecting 1:00 tomorrow. Chair, it's your call, but I believe that's what has transpired. You have extended tonight past 8:00, which was --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- you know, which was an extension of time for people to sign up. But I think in that conversation, there was opportunity, it sounded like, you know, that people could also come tomorrow at 1:00.

CHAIR KAMA: Any other Members would like to weigh in on this? Member Johnson? Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aloha, Chair. I...I totally support opening, you know, tomorrow's meeting to continue as was planned. But I...I just want to let you know I have a 1:30 meeting with the Public...Public Works Committee. So, sorry, I'm just going to have to step out.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Anybody else? Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you...thank you, Chair. I'm going to be on the Big Island with some of the members of the Administration tomorrow. So, we leave at 5:00 and get back at about 8:00. Actually, we leave at 6:30, but get --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- back at about 8:00. So, I'm looking forward to the deliberations and whatnot with the Administration, but I won't be here for tomorrow.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you. Anyone else? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I guess previously I hadn't realized I was coming tomorrow because the workshops in Lāhainā is at 1:00. But I did go to that today, so I can forego going to that tomorrow, and show up over here tomorrow. And I think my household went to sleep, but if not, good night, guys. I'll see you in about an hour.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Cute.

CHAIR KAMA: Any other Members have comments? Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. So, at 7:45, when we were having the discussion about how many more testifiers we're going to accept tonight, we did have this conversation about taking the 12 testifiers, or for, you know, as long as we were going to go tonight.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then we're going to keep public testimony open, oral testimony open for tomorrow. And I know Chair Lee said that that was...she was supportive of that before she left.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, that's...if you can do it, it's you, me, Member Sugimura.

CHAIR KAMA: I think only Mr. Cook --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member...Member Johnson.

CHAIR KAMA: -- is not going to be with us. Mr. Johnson has to leave because he has his...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, he's going to step away.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But yeah. So, I think we should commit to --

CHAIR KAMA: Should be seven of us.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- what we already stated multiple times in two different meetings now. We said it yesterday --

CHAIR KAMA: So...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- in...at the end of the meeting, and then we said it today at 7:45. So --

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- I think it's important that we, you know, stick to what we've publicly said to people, and people took that to be true, and didn't testify tonight so that...you know, because they expected testimony to continue tomorrow.

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So, the will of the body is to keep testimony open until tomorrow at 1:00 when we reconvene, until 4:30. And I think hopefully, if we get through our testimonies tomorrow, then we can, according to Sunshine, have a short discussion, and then actually recess until we can go into deliberations, correct? Okay. So, Members...yes, Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, if...if we do...like if...if oral testimony only takes like an hour, are...are we going to go into any more deliberation than...than what's necessary to close public testimony?

CHAIR KAMA: Well, I think...I think the purpose of the discussion is to allow us to go into deliberation, but the Mayor and his team won't be here to be able to answer some of our questions, so...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, right, right.

CHAIR KAMA: So, they idea...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: They're going to be with Member Cook.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. So, the idea is, if our testimonies end before the closing time at 4:30, we could certainly adjourn...or not adjourn, but recess until the next time we meet.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR KAMA: Make sense?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

CHAIR KAMA: Member U'u-Hodgins?

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Hi, Chair. Sorry. There's dishwashing going on in my house right now, so if you hear noise, it's that. If tomorrow we're pau early --

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: -- I'm happy to do whatever you would like to do, but I'm wondering if Corp. Counsel is ready to go into executive session. I think there's a couple of questions we might have that might not necessarily need the Mayor's team, but we would need Corp. Counsel. I mean, they can be there too, but I think eventually, that's something we would need to discuss in executive session is some of the legal potential ramifications of this bill. So, I'm not too sure when they'll be available, but if tomorrow

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

we pau early, maybe that's something we can discuss. And if not, we can do that next week, Wednesday, when we --

CHAIR KAMA: Reconvene.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: -- come back and have admin in.

CHAIR KAMA: Mr. Nunokawa?

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: Thank you.

MR. NUNOKAWA: I think that there was sort of...both me and Kristin Tarnstrom --

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, yes.

MR. NUNOKAWA: -- both were...so, I'm not sure on her readiness, and I can't --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. NUNOKAWA: -- speak for her until I talk to her.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Okay. So, Member U'u-Hodgins, did you hear that? That his partner...

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: I did --

CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR U'U HODGINS: -- and I know that Mimi, and sometimes Tori is with the gang that's going tomorrow, which I just realized after I muted myself. But thanks, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: You're welcome. Members, any other questions that you have? Seeing none. Okay. Members, it is now 8:50 p...

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, Chair?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. If the body's intent is to recess now, then we just want to state for the record. So, the body will be recessing --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: -- to tomorrow --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: -- which is June 25th --

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: -- to 1:00 p.m.

CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: The...the Committee will be using the same online meeting connections --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: -- on Teams, as well as the same in-person location here in the Council Chamber.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. So, with that being said, Members, the HLU Committee meeting of June 9th is now in recess until tomorrow, June 25th, at 1:00 p.m. Thank you. . . .(*gavel*). . .

RECESS: 8:51 p.m.

hlu:min:250624min-r:ds

Transcribed by: Daniel Schoenbeck

HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

June 24, 2025

CERTIFICATION

I, Daniel Schoenbeck, hereby certify that pages 1 through 72 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 21st day of July 2025, in Wailuku, Hawai'i



Daniel Schoenbeck