

# HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

## MINUTES

October 14, 2025

Online Only via Teams

**CONVENE:** 9:06 a.m.

**PRESENT:** Councilmember Nohelani U‘u-Hodgins, Vice-Chair  
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member  
Councilmember Gabe Johnson, Member  
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member  
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Member  
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member

**EXCUSED:** Councilmember Tasha Kama, Chair  
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Member  
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member

**STAFF:** James Krueger, Senior Legislative Analyst  
Ellen McKinley, Legislative Analyst  
Carla Nakata, Legislative Attorney  
Jennifer Yamashita, Committee Secretary  
Lei Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk  
Ryan Martins, Council Ambassador

Residency Area Office (RAO):

Keomailani Hirata, Council Aide, Moloka‘i Residency Area Office  
Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lāna‘i Residency Area Office  
Mavis Oliveira, Council Aide, East Maui Residency Area Office  
Chaelin Ryu, Council Aide, South Maui Residency Area Office  
Clyde “Buddy” Almeida, Council Aide, Makawao-Ha‘ikū-Pā‘ia Residency Area Office

**ADMIN.:** Nāhulu Nunokawa, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

**OTHERS:** Testifiers  
Lonelle Newman  
David Diven  
Steve Meyer  
Ruel Metcalf  
De Andre Makakoa  
Jackie Keefe  
Tom Croly  
Brian Wittman  
Junya Nakoa  
Paele Kiakona

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

Marilyn Steinmetz  
James Langford  
Jasee Law  
Jim Paresa  
K Smart  
Thom Rogers  
Greg Rylsky

Others (175)

**PRESS:**     *Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

---

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS:    *... (gavel) ...* Good morning, everyone. Will the Housing, Land Use Committee of October 14th, 2025, please come to order. It is 9:06 a.m. I’m the Vice-Chair of this Committee, Nohelani U‘u-Hodgins. Chair Kama is out today, so I’ll be the acting Chair for this meeting. Members, in accordance with the Sunshine Law, please identify by name who, if anyone, is in the room, vehicle, or workspace with you today. Minors do not need to be identified. I don’t see anybody online, so it looks like it’s just us for today. Member...Committee Chair Tasha Kama is excused. Good morning, Councilmember Tom Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Good morning, Chair. Looking forward to today’s meeting. There’s currently no testifiers in the Kihei Regional Office. And it’s a beautiful day.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you. Councilmember Gabe Johnson, good morning.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Good morning, Chair, Councilmembers, community members. There’s no testifiers at the Lāna‘i District Office, and I’m here and ready to work. Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you. Councilmember Tamara Paltin, good morning.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha kakahiaka and kia ora tatou. We have no testifiers at the Lāhainā District Office. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you. Council Chair Alice Lee, good morning.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Good morning, and aloha kākou. Sorry I couldn’t get my machine to work more expeditiously. I’ll just get another one. Thanks.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS:    *... (laughing) ...* Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez is excused for today, and Councilmember Sinenci may be joining us later. Good morning, Councilmember Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good morning, Chair. Looking forward to a very productive meeting.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Let's hope.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: From Corporation Counsel, we have with us Deputy Corporation Counsel Nāhulu Nunokawa. Our Committee Staff include Jennifer Yamashita, Committee Secretary; James Krueger, Senior Legislative Analyst; Ellen McKinley, Legislative Analyst; Carla Nakata, Legislative Attorney; and Lei Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk.

**TEMPORARY INVESTIGATIVE GROUP ON POLICIES AND PROCEDURES FOR  
TRANSIENT VACATION RENTAL USES IN THE APARTMENT  
DISTRICTS (HLU-4(1))**

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay, Members. For today's meeting, we will receive the Bill 9 Temporary Investigative Group report under the Sunshine Law. At this meeting, we are limited to only receiving the report. So, that means we will not be able to deliberate on the TIG's report. Deliberations on the TIG's report must wait to another duly-noticed meeting, which will be held no less than six days after this meeting. After I provide a brief presentation on the report, then we will take testimony. Once the testimony concludes, I will ask to defer this item--again, without deliberation--and adjourn this meeting. With that Staff...that being said, Staff, if you could please distribute the report. And while they're distributing, I will begin my presentation in a few as the Chair--thank you--on Bill 9. Because of the Sunshine Law related to the TIG, the report could only be distributed in an open meeting. So, that's why it wasn't posted...just FYI, guys. After I do my presentation, before we take testimony, I'm going to take a brief 15-minute recess for you folks and the members of the public to be able to familiarize themselves with this lengthy report. But, I will wait until they're all passed out, and then begin all the things I got to say related to the TIG. Does everybody have it now? Okay. Okay. Okay. Let me drink some water because this is going to be three pages of words. All right. The Bill 9 Temporary Investigative Group met on September 15th, 16th, 17th, 19th, 23, 27, and 29 of 2025, to conduct its investigation on policies, procedures for transient vacation rental uses in the Apartment districts consistent with the purpose and scope set forth in the proposal the Committee adopted to form the TIG. The TIG consisted of myself as the Chair, Councilmember Paltin as Vice-Chair, Councilmembers Cook and Sinenci as Voting Members. Present at all the TIG meetings were all four of our TIG Members, as well as Staff from the Office of Council Services, Clerk [sic], and Nāhulu from deputy...from the Department of Corporation Counsel. Throughout the course of our investigation, we met with various County officials, including the Mayor, the Managing Director, as well as business persons in real estate, housing advocates, and loan officers. We also had the opportunity to discuss...or I'm sorry, to conduct site visits around the Island of Maui. As a part of our investigation, we identified several impacts, including the following. While real property tax-related economic impacts to the County are difficult to predict because classifications, tiers, and rates may change over time, especially with RPTR, RPT revenues will likely decrease if most of the Apartment District TVRs all become Owner-Occupied, and would likely decrease the lease if they became Non-Owner-Occupied. General Excise Tax and

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

Transient Accommodation Tax revenue will also be impacted as TVR transitions into other uses. Many Apartment districts' TVRs are in West Maui, where a large number of the residents were displaced by the August 2023 wildfires. Limited water...limited water availability impedes new housing development in West Maui, but housing may still become available to displaced residents if TVR owners choose to sell their properties once TVR owners' uses are phased out, or use them for long-term rentals. While the intent of phasing out TVR uses in the Apartment districts is to increase housing availability for Maui County residents, properties placed on the market may be purchased by local and out-of-state investors as well. A key part of our work identifying Apartment District properties where transient vacation rental uses may be appropriate to continue even if Bill 9, CD1 2025, or similar legislation is enacted. The list of those properties is attached to the TIG's report as Exhibit 2. Members, do you have that in front of you? Members of the public, it is available online. Okay. Where am I? Properties of the TIG's found may be appropriate to continue TVR uses, including those with market values not attainable by most Maui County residents, and those examples include, for instance, properties on Halama Street that had less than five units with high assessed values; leasehold properties with a short amount of years left on the lease that could only be purchased through cash-only transactions; some properties where the portion or the property is in full sea level rise exposure areas, or would already be impacted by sea level rise, and would not produce long-term housing options for residents were placed on Exhibit 2. Exhibit 2 also contains properties that have timeshare units as discussed in the Committee's deliberations, which would not be required to phase out TVR uses anyway. These properties will be placed on the Hotel District or Resort and Hotel-related community plan areas. The TIG reviewed each property individually before placing it on Exhibit 2 to ensure the appropriate use is to continue the TVR uses. This process also allowed us to identify properties that clearly should have been used for residential purposes, and to keep them on the Apartment District use. We did a thorough review of some of the properties that had title reports that specified residential use only. The TIG voted unanimously to recommend the following. One, an introduction...an introduction of a resolution urging the Department of Planning to introduce legislation establishing H-3 and H-4 Hotel District...Hotel districts in Section 19.4.14, Maui County Code, that are basically a like-for-like with A-1 and A-2 Apartment districts, respectively, except that TVR uses will be outright permitted. Council-initiated changes in zoning from A-1 to A-2 Apartment districts to H-3 or H-4 Hotel districts, respectively, once the H-3 and H-4 districts have been established for the properties noted in Exhibit 2. Changes to community plan designations for properties noted in Exhibit 2 and located in South Maui are a part of the Council's review of the South Maui Community Plan update, which is going to be coming before us shortly. Council-initiated changes to community plan designations for all--hold on--for all properties noted in Exhibit 2. I would like to make it very clear and to note that the TIG's recommendation [sic] do not include amendments to Bill 9, CD1, 2025. The creation of the new Hotel districts eliminates any gray areas in which hotel uses are conducted in Apartment districts. The TIG made these recommendations with the goal of ensuring that Apartment District properties converted from TVR uses would serve as long-term homes, and they stay in the hands of local families, potentially for generations, and to be used as long-term rentals. Additionally, implementing those recommendations would shift TVR uses to Hotel districts, and keep the Apartment District reserved, again, for residential uses,

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

mitigate the decrease in RPT revenue resulting from TVRs...I'm sorry...converting to other uses, lessen the impacts of phasing out TVRs in the Apartment districts could have on hospitality-related businesses and jobs. Again, Members, we cannot do any discussion today. Members of the TIG and I will happily answer any questions you may have in our next meeting. To clarify, we all can ask clarifying questions of the testifiers in the future, but no clarifying questions amongst us. Okay. Now, thank you, Members, for the opportunity to provide this presentation on the TIG's report, and with the issuance of this report, this TIG is officially dissolved. Thank you to the TIGers [sic] for all of their hard work. At this time, it is 9:16. Members, I'm going to take a 14-minute recess, to return at 9:30 to give you folks an opportunity, and the members of the public, the opportunity to review the TIG report. It is 9:16. We'll come back at 9:00...oh, Member Paltin, do you have anything to add?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, no. I didn't see it online, but it just...I just refreshed, and it came up.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Okay. Thank you. Oh, it is 9:17, and we are now in a 13-minute recess, so 9:30 for you folks to review. . . .(gavel). . .

**RECESS:** 9:17 a.m.

**RECONVENE:** 9:35 a.m.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: . . .(gavel). . . Welcome back, everybody. It is 9:35, and will the HLU meeting please reconvene. We are going to begin with testimony now on HLU-4(1). As a reminder, today's item is for the Bill 9 TIG and the TIG's report, not necessarily on Bill 9 itself, so I just ask testifiers to keep that in mind when providing testimony. Testifiers wanting to provide testimony should sign up in the lobby, join the online meeting via the Teams link, or call in to the phone number noted on today's agenda. Written testimony is encouraged and can be submitted via the eComment link at mauicounty.us/agendas as well. For individuals wishing to testify via Teams, please raise your hand by clicking on the raise-your-hand button. If calling in, please follow the prompts via phone, star-5 to raise and lower your hand, star-6 to mute and unmute. Staff will add names to the testifier list in the order the testifiers sign up or raise their hands. For those on Teams, Staff will lower your hand once your name is added. Staff will then use the name you've logged in under or the last four digits of your phone number when it is your time to testify. At that time, Staff will also enable your microphone and video. Please ensure that your name appears in Microsoft Teams as the name you prefer to be referred as or anonymous if you wish to testify anonymously. If you are in person, please notify Staff that you would like to testify anonymously. Otherwise, please state your name for the record at the beginning of your testimony. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes per item, and if you are still testifying beyond that time, I will kindly ask you to complete your testimony. Once you are done testifying or you do not wish to testify, you can also view the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, or mauicounty.us/agendas as well. We will do our best to take up each person in an orderly fashion. And right now, Staff, if you could please call the first testifier. Thank you.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the first testifier is Lonelle Newman, to be followed by David Diven.

**. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY FOR ITEM HLU-4(1) . . .**

MS. NEWMAN: I'm Lonelle Newman and I don't feel that I need to testify because a lot of it...the things that I was going to mention have already been clarified . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you.

MS. NEWMAN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . I just want to tell everybody how much I appreciate this compromise, and I think it's a . . .*(inaudible)*. . . --

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

MS. NEWMAN: -- compromise.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you.

MS. NEWMAN: And I look forward to finding out more about it as you folks . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is David Diven, to be followed by Steve Meyer.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: If you don't feel like testifying, you don't necessarily have to give a speech. You just don't have to come up. But you can come up to the front if you do feel like testifying. Thank you.

MR. DIVEN: Thank you. First...first of all, I would like to thank the Council and the TIG for their very hard work, that...I'm sure this...this is obviously a very high emotional subject. And I am a owner at Nāpili Ridge that I...which I believe...I'm actually uncertain whether it is still affected by it or not. But I am testifying in favor. That I have...for a long-time owner at Nāpili Ridge, I've observed over the years, in the AOA meetings, that as more and more units went to short-term rental, there...it became more and more a subject of complaint and decision in the owners' meetings. That I am in favor that properties who are apartments should stay apartments, and not have short-term rentals. That I am also in favor of properties that are clearly...whether their designation or not, they're hotels. They've got a front desk. They've got bellhops. They've got restaurants. They...they're...they employ maids. They employ laundry services. They should stay hotels. But the ones that are substantially apartments should stay apartments. I think that's the...the basis. I really appreciate the very hard work, like the lady before me. Many of my concerns, I went...as soon as Tasha Kama sent the mailer out, and I went to the tax offices and said hey, how do I find out what's on it and what's not? And they gave me a list of properties. And I would look at this list of properties. And because I've spent years working in servicing fire alarms and air conditioning controls in the resorts, I knew many of these properties I worked in. And some of these properties, I went, what? That doesn't make sense. And other properties,

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

like mine, I went well, of course that makes sense. And I'm very glad that this investigative group has made a real effort to proceed deliberately on...on the goal of retaining both uses that...that are appropriate, and housing that is appropriate. Thank you very much.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you very much for your testimony. Members, any clarifying questions? I'm sorry, can you please come back?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Member Sugimura?

MR. DIVEN: I'm unfamiliar.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: That's okay. Thank you.

MR. DIVEN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you for being here. So, you're saying you're an owner at Nāpili Ridge?

MR. DIVEN: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And it should...from your testimony, I'm trying to piece it together --

MR. DIVEN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- it should stay Apartment, is what you're saying, not Hotel?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair?

MR. DIVEN: Oh, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Nāpili Ridge is part of the Nāpili Bay Civic Improvement District. It's not a part of Bill 9.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

MR. DIVEN: Yeah. So --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh.

MR. DIVEN: -- that's what I said. I'm mostly here just in support of this process, that whether or not I am personally impacted is not nearly as important to me as that the process is proceeding deliberately with looking at all factors, making decisions that are highly emotional, and will affect people.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Of course. Thank you. Thank you very much for your testimony. Staff, next testifier, please?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Steve Meyer, to be followed by Ruel Metcalf.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Steve Meyer?

MS. MCKINLEY: The testifier is on Teams.

MR. MEYER: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Hello. You may begin.

MR. MEYER: Thank you all for giving us a chance to briefly talk. I've testified before, so I won't take too much time. I just appreciate the TIG and...and all the work you've done. I wasn't able to pull up the document, but I'm sure it'll pop up eventually so I can actually read it. I'm not sure what's in there. We...we own and manage and have had condos at the Maui Sunset down in...off of Waipuilani Park. And there's a bunch of us condo complexes down here that have been vacation rental or transient accommodations...and mid-term and long-term. It's a great mixed-use property for 45 years. I've been doing it 20-plus years. And it's a great...what the point I'd like to make is it's a...it's a part of the economy that's not hotel. And we don't want to be a hotel with bars and...that would change the whole thing. But we're also not just Residential apartment. We...we have a nice mixed-use. We accommodate traveling nurses for three months at a time. We...we do workers that have been...I had a ton...ton of folks working on the Lāhainā project that stayed with us for a few months coming from O'ahu. And so, they...they have no other affordable place to stay now that the Maui Lu's gone. Even up in Kahului, the condos up there...I'm sorry, the hotels are...are more high-end now. So, there's not a lot of affordable places to stay in...in Maui. So, we fit that...that bill. But yeah, thank you very much. That's all the...that's all I have to say.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Mr. Meyer. Members, any clarifying questions? Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, your list...your Maui Sunset is on Exhibit 3, so just...when it pops up. So, basically, you'll be allowed to continue the use, I guess, is what you're saying? That's what you want?

MR. MEYER: We would like to allow...yeah. We were also 20 percent timeshare and other stuff, yeah. We...I...we would like to continue the use that we have now.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And not be impacted by this bill. Thank you.

MR. MEYER: Yes, thank you.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Members, any other clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for your testimony. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Ruel Metcalf, to be followed by De Andre Makakoa.  
*(pause)*

MR. METCALF: Good morning.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Good morning.

MR. METCALF: Thank you so much for letting me speak.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Of course.

MR. METCALF: It's been 24 years since they started a Minatoya list. Twenty-four years we've been discussing the same thing over and over again. My idea--and it is my idea--so my idea is we pay...out of our vacation room, we pay \$1,000 a month or more every month for...for the taxes that are paid by the visitors. So --

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you.

MR. METCALF: -- what we're looking at is, you got 7,100 vacation rentals that you're targeting right now. And the 7,100, paying on an average of \$1,000, that's \$7 million a month. So, why the State, the County is saying that they don't need that money anymore because they want to do away with the vacation rentals. So, if they say they don't need that money anymore, take the \$7 million a month, buy ten homes for families. Buy ten homes that will fit what the families need. Not a vacation rental that's a one-bedroom...buy a three-bedroom home for...they're...they're on the market right now. There's a...the market is fairly full of homes to buy. Buy the homes. You're only buying seven to ten the first month, then the next month, and the next month, and the next month, and you'll do something...not kick it down the road 24 years. You'll do something for these people, the people that need homes. And the County and the State doesn't have to lose the money. You don't have to give these homes to the people, you rent the homes to the people. You rent those homes to whatever the...whatever the families can afford, when they can...whatever they will afford. Because the County and the State are buying it with money that came from the vacation rentals. Nobody's losing. The people that have the vacation rentals are still generating, and there's your cash cow. You're making money every month. You can put more money into it every month with the never-ending amount of money. And this could be done. Many of the cities have come along and bought low-income housing, maybe a whole apartment complex. Buy what you need. You come along, you're getting this money in. For 24 years, how much money has the short-term rentals generated? You could have solved this problem 21 years ago. You people are the ones that can solve this problem. You can be the heroes. But no. So...so many people are trying to make the short-term rental people the villains. We are not villains. We've invested in your island. We live on your island...I do. Some don't. And...and they come along, and the ones that don't live here, that's the one you villainize. And it's like, wait a minute, those people are paying somebody to manage. They're paying somebody to do the maintenance. Everything they do, they pay more

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

money to keep it. Plus, they bought into your real estate. They've invested in your island, invested . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . in your people. So, that's about all I have to say. But I...I would like for you to consider it. I think it's a win for everybody. I think the County and the State --

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Mr. Metcalf.

MR. METCALF: -- could win because they'll never lose the money, they have the...the assets.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Thank you very much for --

MR. METCALF: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: -- your testimony. Members, any clarifying questions? Seeing none.

MR. METCALF: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you so much.

MR. METCALF: You all have a good day.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is De Andre Makakoa, to be followed by Jackie Keefe.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Aloha.

MR. MAKAKOA: Hey, aloha, Council. Mahalo nui for your time. Thank you so much for the opportunity to speak. I just wanted to address a little bit of concern with some of the recommendations regarding the shoreline. Most of West Maui, the...the list is located on the shoreline, so that would kind of carve out thousands of units. And the...the thing that necessitated Bill 9 was kind of the fire and the housing crisis. So, to carve out thousands of units in the town where we need housing the most is a little bit concerning. Obviously, we believe in climate change. We've lived here all our lives. We've seen it...seen it changing drastically throughout our short life...lifetimes, but the need for housing right now outweighs that...you know, the fear of the shoreline rise, which is kind of decades down the road. But by definition, long-term housing is anything over six months. So, when you're saying it doesn't really qualify, or is not eligible for long-term housing, I would disagree...because a lot of our community who are still displaced would consider anything over six months or anything over a year as a blessing, as long-term housing. I just wanted to address that. And then one thing I would like to say is that there's so much concerns about losing income and losing money, but we're losing people. And I think as our elected officials, as representatives of the people, that should be more important, is figuring out creative ways to keep people here rather than sticking to the status quo because we might lose some money. But mahalo nunui for your time.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you very much. Members, any clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you for your testimony. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Jackie Keefe on Teams, to be followed by Tom Croly on Teams.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Sounds good. Aloha, Ms. Keefe.

MS. KEEFE: Aloha mai kakou. Mahalo for this opportunity today. My name is Jackie Keefe, and I first would like to echo what De Andre said about the shoreline properties. I think it's really important that we don't make any rash decisions regarding those properties since they do make up such a large percentage of these short-term rentals. But the other thing that I really wanted to touch on is that I know that some of the things that the TIG addressed were, you know, economic reports versus housing reports. And I want to point out that without the environment, we have no economy. And so, I think we get a little bit lost in the economic conversation without social...sorry, social effects were the other thing. And so, we...we get a little lost in the economic conversation without putting enough emphasis on the social piece, on the quality of life for our residents. But quality of life for our residents, when we have no water, when we have no...like there...there is data showing that these units are worse for our environment when they are being held by tourists, rather than our local families. And so, I just thought it was really important to say those things to you today. So, mahalo for this opportunity. And I look forward to seeing what happens today.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Ms. Keefe. Members, any clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for your testimony. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Tom Croly, to be followed by Brian Wittman. Tom Croly's on Teams.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Aloha, Mr. Croly.

MR. CROLY: Aloha, Committee. Thank you. Tom Croly, speaking on my own behalf. First, I want to sincerely thank the TIG for the hard work that they did...seven meetings in this short period of time. You were...you were giving a lot of your time and effort to this. And...and I am in full support of...of the recommendations being made, but I think they need to be tightened up and clarified a bit. When we say property is nonattainable, obviously, I think we have to put a number associated with that so that we can, you know, figure out which properties fit, and which properties don't. I don't think that you're submitting this list as a firm list at this point. I...I would think that...that that's still open. And something that I would like you to consider, maybe adding to the criteria that you've already put forward, is the history of the use in these developments, in these...in these apartment complexes. Some of them, the history of the use has been primarily more than, say, 50 percent short-term rental use. And...and...and some of them, it was probably primarily and less than 50 percent apartment use. The hard part of this distinction is, it wasn't until more recently, like 2020, where we made the difference between someone using it as a second home and someone using it as a long-term rental. So, when we look back, it's hard to know which of those were second

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

homes, and which of those were...were long-term rentals. And that leads to a second issue here, which is, do recognize that even though we have lots of units that have been built since 1991 that are not part of the Minatoya list in any way, shape, or form, and we would hope that those units are being used to house residents, my observations are more than 50 percent of those units are still used as second homes. So, there's as much to gain from trying to incentivize using those units as resident housing as what we're talking about right here in this list. But this work that you did is what I really, really hoped was being done, or would have been done over the whole year that Bill 9 was being considered. So, now, you've...you've done the...you know, you've...you've done the hard work of getting this started, and I agree that...that...that we do need to further refine this, but I think this would...this is a very, very good start to...to a solution here. So, again, I thank you all. I'm sure there'll be many more meetings about this. And there you go. Thanks.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Mr. Croly. Members, any clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for your testimony. Staff, next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Brian Wittman, to be followed by Junya Nakoa on Teams.

MR. WITTMAN: Hi. Aloha. I'm Brian Wittman. I wrote this up, so I'm just going to read it. Aloha. My name is Brian Wittman. I just want to give you one person's background story. My parents bought a one-bedroom condo in Mā'alaea back in the '80s. I think it was under \$50,000. It's in the Hono Kai building, which is on the Minatoya list. My dad died in 1998, and my uncle moved in with my mom to keep her company. My mom died in 2002, and my uncle died that same year. Then in 2003, my brother moved in, and he stayed there until he died in 2023. We never used it for vacation rentals, just family use, so the taxes always stayed low. It would be nice to be able to keep it. My brother died right when the Governor wanted people to offer apartments for fire survivors, so we rented it to FEMA, and they paid a lot for a while, so we haven't had to make a long-term decision yet. There's no mortgage anymore, but the association fees are really high for the place now...\$1,470 a month. That's just association fee. Electricity is about 200 a month. The condo rules require insurance, so that is another 1,200 a year. Another 1,300 a year for Maui County property tax as a long-term rental. So, doing the math, that's over \$1,900 a month in expenses, not counting repairs, just to break even. Another way to say that is it costs \$63 a day to break even, and that is if it's being used for long-term rental. If the place is used for vacation rentals, the property tax goes up to \$6,000 a year, so then the break-even cost becomes \$77 a day. So, here's what we can look forward to. If you folks don't pass Bill 9, we can choose to pay the \$6,000 a year County property tax, and then try to get enough short-term bookings per month to cover all those fees, plus paying local cleaning fees, which is somebody's job, Transient Accommodation Tax, et cetera...and if we do make a little profit, then we pay income tax on that too, State and Federal. One advantage is that when it's not rented, we can let the family still use it. Five of my kids live on the continent now, and they like to visit home where they can...when they can afford it. My kids all grew up swimming in grandma's pool there in Mā'alaea. Or we could try to get a long-term lease, but we would have to charge at least 2,500 a month for a walk-up 500-square-foot apartment with just one parking space. It doesn't even have a real

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

bedroom, just a shoji screen. To offer any kind of affordable rent, the profit would have to be very small. Repairs would probably eat most of it. The lease would have to be 12 months to follow County rules so we could never use it ourselves. So, if you guys do pass Bill 9, that's going to be our only choice, other than just lose \$63 a day, or sell it. The County lists the value right now at \$432,000, but that's . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . not true anymore. When we were talking recently with a realtor friend about selling it, she said it should be listed at \$295,000, or else no one would even be interested.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Mr. Wittman, do...can you please wrap up?

MR. WITTMAN: Okay. I have one more paragraph; is that okay?

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: One more sentence is fine.

MR. WITTMAN: Okay. If current owners end up selling their places cheap because you folks pass Bill 9, and they can't do their short-term rentals anymore, guaranteed the new buyers are not going to be local families. Paying a mortgage on top of all those fees, it would be way too much. It's going to be out-of-state retirees with cash who will grab the good deals, move here --

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you.

MR. WITTMAN: -- and then pay low tax by being resident owners.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Mr. Wittman.

MR. WITTMAN: The housing crisis for locals will continue, and Maui County will lose a lot of tax revenue and vacation --

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Mr. Wittman...

MR. WITTMAN: -- rental jobs for nothing. I just hope you folks are really thinking ahead. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Members --

MR. WITTMAN: Thanks for letting . . . *(inaudible)*. . . --

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: -- any clarifying questions?

MR. WITTMAN: I apologize.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Seeing none. Thank you very much. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Junya Nakoa on Teams, to be followed by a return to Lonelle Newman.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

MR. NAKOA: Yessah, good morning.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Good morning.

MR. NAKOA: Yeah, yeah. First things first is, like the camera guy said, De Andre Makakoa, you know, the...yeah, most of the short-term rentals is all on the shoreline, over here in Honokōwai, and Kahana area, and all that stuff, and even get one in the burn zone, you know. So, we better make sure we no...we no eliminate those buggahs. ‘Cause my daughter, when she was in FEMA, she was over there. She was on one of these shoreline apartments, yeah. And the sick part about ‘em is, my grandson, who was, you know, just born last year, just made one a couple weeks ago, I had to worry about all these...the...the short-term rental guys coming in, you know, every week, and living right next door to my daughter. So, with this TIG report that I...you know, was kind of shocked, so was kind of good, is that make sure we do ‘em right, and make sure we take care. The main reason why we are talking about STRs is because of Lāhainā and the Lāhainā fires. So, let’s keep that in mind, and let’s make sure that all these people that is above here, the temporary homes out here--Ka La’i Ola, the other FEMA ones--that these guys...and most of ‘em, majority of them is renters, yeah. So, maybe these guys can go over there and stay at the ones that are on the shoreline...or anyone, any of them, any of the short-term rentals, change them into long-term. The main thing everybody got to remember is, we’re trying to make it long-term so our residents get place for stay. Remember that one bruddah who was saying in Honokōwai, he said all the tenants over there was all residents of Lāhainā, but since the thing went became short-term rental, only had like four or five residents that is...you know, that is full-time residents of...of Lāhainā and Maui. So, we need to get...Lāhainā needs to stay Lāhainā, like everybody said, but Lāhainā cannot be Lāhainā without its people, okay, because we badass, we no fut (*phonetic*) around, we stay strong, we fight, and we no care, okay. We going keep on fighting. And so, let’s keep our Lāhainā people home, yeah. And so, that’s all I have to say. And, you know, let’s talk about...so hey, you know how everybody . . . (*timer sounds*) . . . say they’re losing money? We losing our people. We losing our people. We losing our people. Okay, gang, sorry.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you, Mr. Nakoa. Members, any clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for your testimony.

MR. NAKOA: Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Aloha. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Lonelle Newman, to be followed by Paele Kiakona.

MS. NEWMAN: Aloha. Sorry.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you for joining us at the mic.

MS. NEWMAN: I’m sorry?

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you for joining us at the mic.

MS. NEWMAN: Well, I wasn’t sure if this would be redundant, but after hearing some of the other testimony, I feel like maybe I’ll just throw it out there and...and see where it sticks. So, my name is Lonelle Newman. I am a part-owner of a family-owned property management company established in 1980. First of all, I want to clarify, I’ve been listening to testimony for hours and hours and hours over the past few years, and I want to clarify that the owners that I represent are not greedy mainlanders. These are hard-working individuals who deeply love this island, and consider it a second home. Many invested in these properties for retirement and occasional visits, an option now in jeopardy...hopefully not, after this. I empathize with those affected by the current housing, I really do. I’ve been here 50 years, and I believe it’s important to provide a complete picture for everyone here in the gallery, and anyone listening, and the Councilmembers as well. I have followed this issue for years, even before the recent fire and proposed Bill 9. Previously, I voiced concerns to the Council about local condos historically being used for long-term rentals, and now being converted to short-term rentals. This happened around...around 2020. I think somebody else mentioned that. I observed this trend in areas like Honokōwai and Nāpili, particularly mauka properties, and those up Hui F, which happens to be Nāpili Ridge, and which often had lower purchase prices and AOA dues. Due to the shared zoning, these units were permitted as short-term rentals unless individual condo bylaws prohibited them. At that time, I provided the Council with names of these properties, including Nāpili Ridge, originally built in 1970 as workforce housing. My understanding is that was built for the Kapalua Land as workforce housing, which I thought was one of the things that was going to be tried to be reverted back. Of its 133 units, 66--I counted--are currently listed as short-term rentals, which I totally empathize with the gentleman prior...prior to this. I also mentioned Maui Lani, Kahana Manor, and Honokōwai Palms. Kahana Manor is in the Hotel zone, but it...all my friends have lived there. It’s above Dollies. It’s...it’s not...it’s...it’s nowhere near being, you know, what I consider to be a vacation destination.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, point of information. None of this pertains to Bill 9 or the TIG report because those properties aren’t...those are Nāpili Bay Civic Improvement District already zoned Hotel, so it’s not pertaining to what we’re talking about. We...the Bill 9 was for Apartment-zoned districts, Apartment 1 and 2, not Hotel-zoned or Nāpili Bay Civic Improvement District.

MS. NEWMAN: Okay. I have more...more...some things that I would like to just talk about. While distinguishing between historically short-term rentals and recently converted ones is complex, I believe this distinction offers a fair path forward. Discussions about potential exemptions on initial short-term rental start dates and grandfather clauses seem like fair compromising. If housing availability is the core issue, it is also worth noting that there are currently . . .(timer sounds). . . 46 rentals under 4,000 on Zillow, 25 from 14 to 3,500 on Craigslist, many of which have been available for nearly a month. The property I manage has 500-square-foot, one-bedroom units with one parking spot. The elevator is currently under repair. The building facade is crumbling.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you very much.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

MS. NEWMAN: And there are still sinkholes, despite a million dollars recently being spent on a seawall. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Thank you. Members, any clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for your testimony. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Paele Kiakona, to be followed by Marilyn Steinmetz on Teams.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Sounds good. Aloha.

MR. KIAKONA: Aloha. Good morning, Council. Chair, mahalo for the opportunity to speak today. Paele Kiakona, on my own behalf. And, you know, I...I understand a lot of the reasoning for the TIG report is, you know, to look at specific places that could be impacted or inundated by sea level rise or also, just weighing out the economic impacts that this could potentially have. And, you know, as we dig deeper into those economic impacts, we see that some of these, it is not a like-for-like, yeah? Even though we're maybe cutting about half--we have 15...14,000, 15,000 or so--we're only talking about the half, the 6 to 7,000. Many of these places are in a parcel that is not fully...say you have 400 units in this one little parcel that is down by the beach, and then you have the same short-term rental that is permitted up in Launiupoko. Launiupoko would be actually paying more property tax throughout the year rather than these 400 units on this one parcel. So, it is...it is actually skewed more towards the legal side of the...the short-term rentals when looking deeper into it. I know it's...some of this is in the report, but, you know, when we look at the real property tax value, the projected loss is about 15, 20 percent, something like that. But as far as the economic impacts, I know you folks are trying to weigh that because the economic engine or the economics that you...and revenue that you folks do generate is what you utilize to fix certain things in roads and stuff like that...so for the sole benefit of the people of the place. So, when we speak about, for say, Mā'ālaea, I know there is trajectory to go in and potentially look at beefing up the infrastructure in that area so we no longer use the injection wells, and utilizing that R-1 water. Well, if that's the case, and if our taxpayer dollars are going in to do something like that, then it should be benefit for the people, just in my opinion. You know, if we're going to sink money into it as a County, then the people of the place should still be benefiting from that. And I know these were kind of left off of the list to be converted, and maybe something to...to look into to consider down the road. Aside from that, we looked at the Lokelani's intended use in their documents from the very beginning, and it clearly stated in there that no apartment shall be rented by the owner or owners thereof for transient or hotel purposes. And I know that is one of the ones that are on the SLR-XA, but when we're looking at the sea level rise and these places . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . that are in the SLR-XA, we're looking at the year 2100, and that's kind of a long time from now for us to be thinking too far ahead when our people just need something right now. So, just context, and things to consider. Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you very much. Members, any clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for your testimony. Next testifier, please.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Marilyn Steinmetz on Teams, to be followed by James Langford on Teams. *(pause)*

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Can you please call her again? And if not, we can move on to the next testifier, and call...call her back in a few.

MR. KRUEGER: Marilyn Steinmetz, you’re unmuted on our end. You’d have to unmute on your end in order to testify. *(pause)* Chair, she might be encountering technical difficulties. Perhaps we should move on to...oh. She’s unmuted.

MS. STEINMETZ: Okay. Can you hear me now?

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: We can hear you. Thank you.

MS. STEINMETZ: Can you hear me now?

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Yeah.

...*(audio reverb)*...

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Oh, there’s a reverb though. So, if you could please silence one of your devices so we can hear you clearly.

MS. STEINMETZ: Oh, you can hear me now?

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: We can, but there’s a reverb. Can you please silence one of your devices if you have more than one on?

...*(audio reverb)*...

MS. STEINMETZ: Hello?

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Hi.

MS. STEINMETZ: Hello? *(pause)* Am I on now?

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: You are.

MS. STEINMETZ: Okay. Thank you so much. I’m sorry. I’m not used to doing this. I want to say that I’m very glad that you are considering...I can’t hear myself, so I don’t know if you can hear me.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: We can hear you. You can continue.

MS. STEINMETZ: Oh, okay. I’m so glad that you are considering adjusting the bill because I am extremely worried about the economic impact, and there are a couple things I don’t understand. Just...I live in South Kihei. I’ve lived here for 24 years. I have felt the economic impact of all this controversy and this negativity that’s hanging over Maui

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

that's affecting everyone, but what I don't understand is...I am naïve, I guess. I thought zoning would be like a couple blocks back from the beach, it's Residential or Apartment, that's understandable. But almost all of South Kihei Road is very much commercial and vacation rental, yet it hops around. It's like Haleakala Shores is Apartment, Kamaole One is Apartment, but then maybe the one in Kamaole Sands, which was obviously built for vacation rental, and Maui Vista, is Apartment, and it's got three swimming pools and three tennis courts. You don't build workforce housing with three swimming pools and three tennis courts. So, I'm kind of confused as to why the...when these were built for vacation rental purposes, why the zoning wasn't changed to be appropriate for their usage. Another thing that would be nice is if we could have a list of the ones that were built for workforce housing. I don't know where that list is. So, I'm really appreciative of the people that did this study, that they're going to take these ones that are obviously vacation rental and leave them out of this decision, or this Minatoya list, and not letting them continue as a vacation rental. I'm very appreciative of that. One other thing that I don't understand is why...that timeshare would be exempt when it's basically the same thing. It's a short-term rental, and your vacation short-term rental is not exempt. I don't see where that is equal or fair. And...and...and just like I say, I'm just worried that Maui County is going to go bankrupt or put a burden on the residential people to make up for the loss in the taxes, and that...you know, these people paid a lot of money for their units. And I don't believe that this is helping anyone, especially . . .(timer sounds). . . when it's three years out, or five years out, on making this decision. And they don't want to live somewhere where there's one parking stall, and no pets, and a very high maintenance fee. Thank you for my time.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you very much. To clarify, this TIG is not making a recommendation to alter Bill 9, but rather make sibling bills related to Bill 9. Members, any other clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you very much for your testimony. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next and currently last person signed up to testify is James Langford on Teams.

MR. LANGFORD: Aloha. Hello?

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: We can hear you, Mr. Langford.

MR. LANGFORD: Hello?

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: You're welcome to testify.

MR. LANGFORD: Oh, thank you. Aloha, Chair, Councilmembers. Bill 9 in this TIG, it's...what we're hearing is it responds to devastating wildfires, right? It focuses, though, on dollars . . .(inaudible). . . not the people behind them. So, under the oath to aloha that you take, I ask, how much does a survivor's life cost for the budget? Are we just . . .(inaudible). . . So, you guys swore an oath to aloha, an obligation . . .(inaudible). . . future generations. Yet Bill 9 allocates millions for capital and operations without really accounting for the human costs of recovery. So, we need transparency, integrity . . .(inaudible). . . and action. Recovery is not just about

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

infrastructure, it's about the lives lost, and counting all of them. The families displaced, the paperwork signed to lie about it, and the trauma that we all endure as a result of those lies. Every allocation needs to reflect the value of human life, not just the cost of materials or projects. So, I ask, how does the budget reflect aloha? How does this TIG, the survivors, the children, the kūpuna represent in your priorities? I need to know that. So, the Charter reminds us, government is a stewardship...life, liberty, and legacy. Money alone doesn't obfuscate what was lost, but the decisions that you guys make, that does. So, money alone can't restore. But I need you guys to guide us with aloha, an ethical responsibility on this HRS 92 TIG of transparency, integrity, governance. So, I need to know what the value of human life is, not the value of someone's . . .*(inaudible)*. . . And that's what our community needs, too. And we need to understand your motivations for voting about capital instead of aloha. So, that's what I pose to you guys today. I had a great court case that I won this morning, so looking forward to seeing you guys be transparent with integrity in governance going forward. May each breath find us . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Members, any clarifying questions? If not, thank you very much for your testimony. Staff, next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, no one else has signed up to testify, but I see someone approaching the podium.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Mr. Law?

MR. LAW: Aloha kakahiaka. Aloha kākou. Aloha, *Akakū*. Thank you, ka hope luna ho'omalū *(phonetic)*. Thank you for letting me use that word for the first time, ka hope luna ho'omalū U'u-Hodgins. Jasee Law from Kula Uka, Waiakoa ahupua'a. I'm not used to seeing this many people here in the Chamber. And my first thought was like, yeah, just go ahead with the...the law. And sorry, you guys, too bad. Thank you all for being...thank everybody for being here. Some peoples *[sic]* probably going to fall inside the cracks, and then have to...like the one guy is talking about, his family is living here and stuff. And I know you Councilmembers know that some people are going to have to like give it up. But I wish...and I'm not trying to make more work for you guys, but I wish there was some kind of like appeals process, so you could look at each case-by-case individual. And one of the qualifications was...would be that some...that people actually came here to...to find out what's going on. The Hawaiian word of the day is ho'olimalima, it means rent. I would highly suggest to you guys that you put heavy value on Councilmember Paltin's words and opinions, and that you get the laundromat over there in Lāhainā as soon as possible.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Any clarifying questions? Seeing none. Thank you for your testimony. Next testifier, please, if we have any?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, no one else has signed up to testify. We can proceed with the last call.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Please do so.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

MS. MCKINLEY: If anyone is...in the audience or on Teams would like to testify, please come up to the mic and begin your testimony, or use the raise-your-hand function on Teams and Staff will unmute you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: We have somebody walking down right now.

MR. PARESA: Thank you for having me. My name is Jim Paresa, I'm a full-time Kihei resident. I wanted to give a quick real-life example. I had a nephew come two weeks ago to Maui. He stayed for a week on the West Side in a little Airbnb, went to L&L Barbecue, went to Papi's for cinnamon rolls, went on hikes, went on...went to Makawao for...ate at a little grill, supported all the small businesses. The last three days of his trip, he came to Grand Wailea. He travels a lot for work, had points, so he could afford to stay there. He made a comment to me that...he goes, I don't...I don't know if I'd come back again to the resort because the kids, they love the resort. They don't want to leave the resort. We...we spend 24/7 at the resort. So, they're not spending any money on the local economy, the local businesses. So, any of that profit that the Grand Wailea gets is going back to the mainland, to corporate America, and none of that...none of that money is staying here. So, I just wanted to pass along that...that real-world example. I've testified before. I won't spend any more of your time. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you for your testimony. Members, any clarifying questions? Member Paltin? One second. Mr. Paresa, we have a clarifying question for you. Thank you.

MR. PARESA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Mr. Paresa, for your testimony. I just wanted to clarify, when your nephew went to Dollies or Papi's, did he not also see local people at Dollies and Papi's?

MR. PARESA: He didn't mention, but I'm sure he did. Absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean, local people do go to Dollies and Papi's as well.

MR. PARESA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I mean, we also spend money in the local economy as well.

MR. PARESA: Agreed.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Thank you for your testimony. Last call again, please. If we...if didn't have...

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, we have two more testifiers signed up now.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Sounds good. Please call them.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

MS. MCKINLEY: The next testifier is K Smart on Teams, to be followed by Thom Rogers on Teams. *(pause)*

MS. SMART: All right. Can you hear me?

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: We can hear you.

MS. SMART: Okay. Thank you for being here, you guys. I really appreciate all your hard work. I just want to just say something really quick. Eliminating these Minatoya list units won't help the Maui economy at all--and I know you've heard this before, but just hear me out--as it will only force owners to sell their units, like myself, who can't afford to keep it as a long-term rental due to a 3 or 4,000 per month deficit it causes the owner. They won't go to local owners either, as the monthly maintenance cost of these to upkeep is just too expensive. So, this will cause more mainland owners. I know you've heard this. Just hear me through. But it is true. It is true. I know this. So, it's going to go to all these mainland owners, which is...I thought was kind of defeating the purpose, and also defeating the purpose because it's not going to go to local owners because it's not attainable, affordable, or anything. Also, I'm going to go on to the next one. Well...and the whole purpose is...was to free up attainable housing, correct? And it's not going to do that. So, the narrative that we are losing people and we need to think about the people, not money...yes, exactly. Bill 9 hurts the people. It won't house people. It won't drive condo prices down, except for these condos. But it is still not attainable to buy because the HOAs and all that are expensive. You heard that. But I want to tell you one thing. A huge house...well, a house for the same price, costs less mortgage than these condos because of all those HOA fees. For example, I just did a quick Redfin thing, and a two-bedroom house would cost 4...oh shoot, where is it now...4,966 a month, where the two-bedroom, two-bath condo would cost 4,400 a month. So, just a few hundred more a month and you have a house, no HOAs, no huge expenses that keep going up and up and up. That is the smarter thing. Take the houses that are vacation rentals, and make those attainable for...and then they can put more people into those houses. It...it just sounds like a smarter decision. Okay. And so, they pay the same or less mortgage on a house than they do for these condos. And these condos, even at a cheap price or . . . *(inaudible)*. . . they're just too expensive. Do the math. You've got to do the math. Also, why oceanfront only condos eliminated? And I can't find that example 3...I don't know if you can tell me where to find it...but I saw example 2. And it...I have a condo at Pac Shores. It shares a fence with the Maui Coast, who got to expand, and they have nightly music. And also, the hotel next door, the Maui Vista, was on the list to keep, I think, but Pac Shores is not, although they're next to this...they're sandwiched between those two. That's a question of mine. Also . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . this new list will be protected...this is important. Also, will this new list be protected, and for how long? Because of course, the Minatoya list is not protected, I guess. So, will this new list be protected? How long? Or can it be taken away at any time as well? Okay. That is it.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you very much for your testimony.

MS. SMART: I just wanted to...thank you so much, guys.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you.

MS. SMART: Okay. Good luck with that all.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Members, any clarifying --

MS. SMART: -- buh-bye.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: -- questions? Seeing none. Thank you so much.

MS. SMART: Okay. Okay. Buh-bye.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Bye. Next testifier, please.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier, and currently last person signed up, is Thom Rogers on Teams.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Mr. Rogers?

MR. ROGERS: Thank you very much. My name is Thom Rogers. I’m the General Manager of the Kuleana Club in West Maui. I want to thank the temporary investigation group and this Committee for the time and care that went into the report presented today. In reviewing Exhibit 2 of the TIG report, I noticed that Kuleana I is included among the properties recommended to be allowed to continue short-term rental use; however, Kuleana II was not listed. Both the parcels contained timeshare units, are governed under the same AOA. The two parcels have always operated together as one resort, sharing ownership, management, amenities, and infrastructure. The zoning and usage are identical. It appears that the admission of Kuleana II is simply an oversight, and I’m respectfully ask that both parcels be recognized as qualifying properties for continued visitor use under the TIG’s recommendation. By ensuring both properties are included, you are also protecting the jobs of five employees who lost their homes in the Lāhainā fire. People who have dedicated much of their lives to the Kuleana Club depend on this work to rebuild. Thank you for your time, and your continued efforts to preserve lawful, long-standing timeshare operations that are part of Maui’s continued fabric. Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you, Mr. Rogers. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Mr. Rogers, could you tell us the names of the two properties? It was coming up muffled, so I want to make sure I get it right.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Kuleana I and II, he mentioned.

MR. ROGERS: Yeah. That’s correct.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: One and Two.

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Any other clarifying questions? Kuleana I and II. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Mr. Rogers. Can you tell us the TMK of the one that is on Exhibit 2, and the TMK of the one that is on Exhibit 3?

MR. ROGERS: Off the top of my head, what I have here for Kuleana II, which was not listed, is 430080050000 (*phonetic*).

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 4300805...sorry, what?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: 000.

MR. ROGERS: I'm sorry. Let's start over. 4300 --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Got it.

MR. ROGERS: -- 800 --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Got it.

MR. ROGERS: -- 50000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And you said that's not even listed at all on anything?

MR. ROGERS: It wasn't in Exhibit 2. I looked at it. It was 53 pages, so if it's included somewhere else, I didn't see it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, 430080050000 is not listed on Exhibit 2 or 3?

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

MR. ROGERS: Not on Exhibit 2.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Got it. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you very much. Next testifier, please.

MR. ROGERS: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you.

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, the next testifier is Greg Rylsky on Teams. (*pause*)

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Can you please call him again?

MS. MCKINLEY: Mr. Rylsky, it’s your turn to testify, and you are unmuted. *(pause)*

MR. RYLSKY: Can...can you guys hear me now?

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: We can hear you.

MR. RYLSKY: Okay. I’m having some technical difficulties. Can anyone hear me now?

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: We can hear you.

MR. RYLSKY: Okay. Thank you so much. I...I just had two things I wanted to bring up. One was all of the shoreline properties. We all know what’s happening with the shoreline properties. It would be interesting to...for that not to be necessarily excluded just because of the sea level rise. Some of us aren’t quite so young, and might enjoy spending the last few years of our life near the shoreline, so it would be an amazing opportunity if we could have that chance to be in those properties. And again, everyone knows what’s happening there. There’s no big secret. They’re carving out so many properties and so many units. It feels like it’s kind of defeating the purpose of the bill. And the other thing I just wanted to bring up is that there are a lot of residents in some of these properties along the shoreline. And speaking as a resident myself, and having to deal with the Minatoya/TVR, just absolute inability to lead a normal life because you’re living in the middle of a hotel. You know, so I just kind of beg this Committee to...to reduce the number of properties that...that you’re suggesting to be reduced. And, you know, just give the people that are residents there a little bit of an opportunity to...to enjoy their...their investment. Thank you very much. That is all I have.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you very much for your testimony. Members, any clarifying questions? Seeing none. Next testifier, please?

MS. MCKINLEY: Chair, no one else has signed up. We can continue with last call. If there’s anyone in the audience or on Teams that would like to testify, please come up to the mic and begin your testimony, or use the raise-your-hand function on Teams and Staff will unmute you. I’ll provide a brief countdown...three, two, one. Seeing none. Chair, no one has indicated they wish to testify.

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you. Members, seeing there are no individuals wishing to testify, without objection, I will now close oral testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

**. . . CLOSE PUBLIC TESTIMONY FOR ITEM HLU-4(1) . . .**

VICE-CHAIR U‘U-HODGINS: Thank you very much. As a reminder, written testimony will continue to be accepted. Members, we cannot proceed with deliberations. I know we

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

all would like to, but we cannot. Therefore, if there are no objections, I will now defer this item.

**COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS** (excused: TK, KRF, SS).

**ACTION: DEFER pending discussion.**

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you very much. This concludes the Housing Land Use and...Committee meeting. Thank you very much, Members. It is now 10:32, and this HLU meeting is adjourned. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

**ADJOURN:** 10:32 a.m.

hlu:min:251014min:ds

Transcribed by: Daniel Schoenbeck

**HOUSING AND LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
Council of the County of Maui

**October 14, 2025**

---

CERTIFICATION

I, Daniel Schoenbeck, hereby certify that pages 1 through 25 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 14th day of November 2025, in Wailuku, Hawai'i



---

Daniel Schoenbeck