

HLU Committee

From: scyoung@mind.net
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 6:33 AM
To: County Clerk; HLU Committee
Subject: bill 9 support//www.mauicounty.us/HLU/ [HTTPS://www.mauicounty.us/HLU/]
Attachments: Aloha County Council members bill 9 str-ltr.docx

Aloha County Council members

I support the passage of Bill 9 that would move the Minatoya exemption short term rentals back into long term rental category as was the initial intent for the apartment zoning that they are in. I believe this is necessary to **increase the amount of potentially affordable housing** for the local residents. I believe this will also **drop the prices of condos which is needed** as our house prices are out of control and this would allow for an appropriate readjustment in the median price of condos hopefully.

People said this will take away too much county income and I do not believe that that is the impact we will see and this can be balanced by an increase on the property taxes for the many unoccupied second homes that people have bought that exist behind the many mostly empty gated communities particularly on the South side. The projected decrease in the TAT will not be realized because we will still have those same tourists coming to Maui but they will stay in the hotels which have said and have been studied and shown to have more than enough rooms to accommodate the decrease in the short term rental stock.

The idea of zoning is to keep the tourists living in the tourist zones and not in our neighborhoods and this bill will help accomplish that aim and push **the tourists back into** the entertainment zones and **the hotel zones rather than our neighborhoods**.

Some have said these short term rentals cannot be long term rentals and my information and the evidence I believe is there that all of them can become long term rentals quite easily as many people are living in worse accommodation since the fires. The units affected provide and they have more than enough ability to allow accommodating and comfortably **can be long term rentals** in terms of size and cupboards and parking and so on.

Let's look at tourism a little bit I think people are not recognizing that tourism is on the decline in Maui because we have been hurting our tourism environment because we have too many tourists frankly. The number of tourists is supposed to be 33 per cent and it's like 42-43 per cent of the population and that means that almost every second person you meet is a tourist and that totally **degrades the experience of coming to Hawaii** and **dilutes the Hawaiian culture** and **damages our environment** as well. We definitely do not want to have more tourists as we already have overcrowding with the tourists based on the Maui island community plan and my experience and many others. We **want quality over quantity tourism** and that's what will happen by decreasing the number of tourists a little bit and having them go to the hotels. Note that when they go to the hotels it's a little expensive and it **requires more staff per tourist** to service the hotel tourists and therefore employs more people which is good for Maui and these **tourists that go to the hotel spend more money per tourist in our islands** than people who go to less expensive accommodation. So actually it's economically a good thing. There is no right to come to Maui, there is no right to be a tourist, we need to take care of our islands for the residents.

The hotels and the tourism industry **needs enough work force housing** to actually have any industry and that is what this bill will also provide. Trying **to build work force housing will take a long time and will take more infrastructure** which we don't have- the more water and sewer capacity which we do not have. These units have existing infrastructure which is perfect and is much more sustainable.

I understand that the owners of the condominiums that will be affected will have a decrease in their investment and have to either convert to long term rental which is less lucrative or sell their units **and investments are not guaranteed** that's why they're called investments many people lose their money in the stock market and also in

real estate investments and so buyer beware; this issue has been talked about for years and years and now it's time to put things right for us, the residents, not for investors. We will still have more than half the short term rentals available they're not all going away just the ones that were improperly exempted in the past. I believe it's time to do this, it's needed and it can help with many of our problems. The transient accommodation tax - tat will still be paid and not lost because those tourists will just be moved to the hotel basically where they pay a little more and so they might even be more tat. As for the loss of property taxes because short term rentals pay more than long term rentals that can be adjusted by adjusting the property tax rates as I've mentioned before and so there won't be the loss plus there still will be long term rental tax property taxes paid.

This is not unconstitutional - the cases they cite don't apply and the county has expressed that through their lawyers who I believe are correct this is not a taking and there is adequate time to move their investment now that it's a 3 years transition ; Which I believe is too long given our affordable housing needs and crisis and one year would be more than long enough to give adequate time for transition. No exceptions should be given that would make this unconstitutional by favoring one group over another in the law; the way it's written is good and should not be changed to give exceptions which is what happened in Tahoe and created the unconstitutional issue and therefore the bill and the plan was defeated.

I am thankful that we are moving forward to working on this and discussing it and I see this as an overall good thing for the short term and long term for Maui, thank you for taking up this issue and listening to all the comments and weighing them and I trust all our council members will vote for this bill to support what the people and residents of this county need and not vote with the developers or the relatively small number of short term unit investors compared to the population of Maui that needs this help.

Mahalo,

Genesis Young MD Chair Sustainable Tourism Committee and the author of the quality over quantity tourism resolution passed by the council during the last session.

Aloha County Council members

I support the passage of Bill 9 that would move the Minatoya exemption short term rentals back into long term rental category as was the initial intent for the apartment zoning that they are in. I believe this is necessary to **increase the amount of potentially affordable housing** for the local residents. I believe this will also **drop the prices of condos which is needed** as our house prices are out of control and this would allow for an appropriate readjustment in the median price of condos hopefully.

People said this will take away too much county income and I do not believe that that is the impact we will see and this can be balanced by an increase on the property taxes for the many unoccupied second homes that people have bought that exist behind the many mostly empty gated communities particularly on the South side. The projected decrease in the TAT will not be realized because we will still have those same tourists coming to Maui but they will stay in the hotels which have said and have been studied and shown to have more than enough rooms to accommodate the decrease in the short term rental stock.

The idea of zoning is to keep the tourists living in the tourist zones and not in our neighborhoods and this bill will help accomplish that aim and push **the tourists back into** the entertainment zones and **the hotel zones rather than our neighborhoods**.

Some have said these short term rentals cannot be long term rentals and my information and the evidence I believe is there that all of them can become long term rentals quite easily as many people are living in worse accommodation since the fires. The units affected provide and they have more than enough ability to allow accommodating and comfortably **can be long term rentals** in terms of size and cupboards and parking and so on.

Let's look at tourism a little bit I think people are not recognizing that tourism is on the decline in Maui because we have been hurting our tourism environment because we have too many tourists frankly. The number of tourists is supposed to be 33 per cent and it's like 42-43 per cent of the population and that means that almost every second person you meet is a tourist and that totally **degrades the experience of coming to Hawaii** and **dilutes the Hawaiian culture** and **damages our environment** as well. We definitely do not want to have more tourists as we already have overcrowding with the tourists based on the Maui island community plan and my experience and many others. We **want quality over quantity tourism** and that's what will happen by decreasing the number of tourists a little bit and having them go to the hotels. Note that when they go to the hotels it's a little expensive and it **requires more staff per tourist** to service the hotel tourists and therefore employs more people which is good for Maui and these **tourists that go to the hotel spend more money per tourist in our islands** than people who go to less expensive accommodation. So actually it's economically a good thing. There is no right to

come to Maui, there is no right to be a tourist, we need to take care of our islands for the residents.

The hotels and the tourism industry **needs enough work force housing** to actually have any industry and that is what this bill will also provide. Trying **to build work force housing will take a long time and will take more infrastructure** which we don't have- the more water and sewer capacity which we do not have. These units have existing infrastructure which is perfect and is much more sustainable.

I understand that the owners of the condominiums that will be affected will have a decrease in their investment and have to either convert to long term rental which is less lucrative or sell their units **and investments are not guaranteed** that's why they're called investments many people lose their money in the stock market and also in real estate investments and so buyer beware; this issue has been talked about for years and years and now it's time to put things right for us, the residents, not for investors. We will still have more than half the short term rentals available they're not all going away just the ones that were improperly exempted in the past. I believe it's time to do this, it's needed and it can help with many of our problems. The transient accommodation tax - tat will still be paid and not lost because those tourists will just be moved to the hotel basically where they pay a little more and so they might even be more tat. As for the loss of property taxes because short term rentals pay more than long term rentals that can be adjusted by adjusting the property tax rates as I've mentioned before and so there won't be the loss plus there still will be long term rental tax property taxes paid.

This is not unconstitutional - the cases they cite don't apply and the county has expressed that through their lawyers who I believe are correct this is not a taking and there is adequate time to move their investment now that it's a 3 years transition ; Which I believe is too long given our affordable housing needs and crisis and one year would be more than long enough to give adequate time for transition. No exceptions should be given that would make this unconstitutional by favoring one group over another in the law; the way it's written is good and should not be changed to give exceptions which is what happened in Tahoe and created the unconstitutional issue and therefore the bill and the plan was defeated.

I am thankful that we are moving forward to working on this and discussing it and I see this as an overall good thing for the short term and long term for Maui, thank you for taking up this issue and listening to all the comments and weighing them and I trust all our council members will vote for this bill to support what the people and residents of this county need and not vote with the developers or the relatively small number of short term unit investors compared to the population of Maui that needs this help.

Mahalo,

Genesis Young MD Chair Sustainable Tourism Committee and the author of the quality over quantity tourism resolution passed by the council during the last session.

HLU Committee

From: Hauoli Kahaleuahi <noreply@adv.actionnetwork.org>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 9:42 AM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

Please SUPPORT Bill 9 to phase out the short term rentals on the Minatoya list without carveouts or special protections for timeshares.

STR owners shared in their testimony that if they could no longer short-term rent their units or buildings, some would just leave them empty and reserve them for visiting friends or family. Hewa! They wouldn't even consider long-term renting for our Maui 'ohana.

Some STR owners have 1 or more buildings, meaning they own over 400 units! That is despicable here on Maui.

I will always support our Maui 'ohana—those born & raised here, those with generational & ancestral ties to this place, those who 'auamo kuleana.

Mahalo.

Hauoli Kahaleuahi
hkahaleuahi@gmail.com

Hana, Hawaii 96713

HLU Committee

From: Chanel Guzman <noreply@adv.actionnetwork.org>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 3:14 PM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

I am a proud local resident of Kihei and mother of three. I am writing in strong opposition to the continued operation of short term rentals in our community. While I understand the value tourism brings to our island, the unchecked growth of STRs has created serious and lasting impacts on the quality of life for local residents. The rise of these rentals has led to a severe housing shortage for locals. Homes that once sheltered local families are now being purchased by outside investors and converted into vacation rentals. Disruption to neighborhoods, becoming revolving doors for visitors, often bringing noise, traffic and lack of respect to the local culture. Our sense of community is eroding and local families are being forced to live next to properties that feel more like mini hotels than homes. Strain on infrastructure and resources, increased water usage, waste management and emergency services. Cultural displacement, the needs of visitors are placed above the needs of local families. We risk losing the spirit of aloha that makes Maui so special.

Personally the rise of STRs and increased home prices have affected our family. Two of my adult children have moved to the continent. My son and his wife, who was born and raised on Maui now live in Washington State because they could not afford to live on Maui, the place where they grew up due to the high cost of living and soaring home prices. We need our children to come back to Hawaii to live and contribute to the community that raised them. Sadly we are seeing more and more people from the mainland buying up homes only to rent it out to tourists while our local people are being pushed out.

I urge you to prioritize housing for residents over profits for absentee owners and mainland investors. Please SUPPORT Bill 9 to phase out the short term rentals on the Minatoya list without carveouts or special protections for timeshares. Maui's people and culture must come first.

Mahalo for your time,

Chanel Guzman

Chanel Guzman

cguzmannursing@gmail.com

103 Pauloa Place

Kihei, Hawaii 96753

HLU Committee

From: Linda Jenkins <linda_m_jenkins@msn.com>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 1:58 PM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

You don't often get email from linda_m_jenkins@msn.com. [Learn why this is important](#)

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

Support Bill 9.

Bozeman, MT, Nashville, TN, Durango, CO, Asheville, NC, Santa Fe, NM, Denver, CO, Charleston, SC., New York City, Palm Springs, CA, San Diego, CA, Dallas, TX.

What these places have in common is that their leaders have had the courage to take a stand against STR's and put the interest of their residents ahead of outside interests. They have all recently embarked on banning or seriously restricting STR's.

Maui's leaders are not the first and are not alone in taking action.

The Irvine Study by Michael Seiler from the College of William and Mary provides strong evidence that long term rental prices decrease when STR's are reduced or strongly regulated.

Now is the time. Put the interests of the people of Maui County ahead of those of outsiders.

Be Brave! Support Bill 9!!!

Linda Jenkins

linda_m_jenkins@msn.com

369 Kamalei Circle

Kahului, Hawaii 96732

HLU Committee

From: Angela Tarantino <noreply@adv.actionnetwork.org>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 4:04 PM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

Please SUPPORT Bill 9 to phase out the short term rentals on the Minatoya list without carveouts or special protections for timeshares.

Angela Tarantino
gelathequeen@gmail.com

Cupertino, California 95014

HLU Committee

From: Taylor Mesi <noreply@adv.actionnetwork.org>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 5:50 PM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

Please SUPPORT Bill 9 to phase out the short term rentals on the Minatoya list without carveouts or special protections for timeshares.

Taylor Mesi
taylordmesi@outlook.com

Kapolei , Hawaii 96707

HLU Committee

From: Pahnelopī McKenzie <noreply@adv.actionnetwork.org>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 6:08 PM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

Please SUPPORT Bill 9 to phase out the short term rentals on the Minatoya list without carveouts or special protections for timeshares.

The days of giving colonial pleasures exceptions over local families' living has come to end. I would also hope that the council continues to place restrictions on neighborhood owned vacation rental houses to restore a sense of place for the people who live here and the safety for the children.

I understand that the taxes and all the things give money but the fact is with that comes entitlement. The residents of this place cannot continue to be second-class citizens. I know there are good people who live here that live in other nations and that they love Maui. Yet the majority of what this brings is the contribution to how things work such as, making the prices skyrocket, the beaches overcrowded, the community their servants, the water disappear, the traffic unbearable, maintenance of homelessness and the diaspora of local families. I ask how many trees have they planted for the native ecosystem, how many streams have they worked to protect, how many teachers have they thanked, how many families have they helped to rise, how many local neighbors do they know, how many legislative sessions have they stood with local families? These are the differences of occupation owners versus people living in a place. The short term rentals are houses that should be for families that live here. Long term families should not be without housing so out of town people can come occupy when they or their friends like. The data is in the short term rentals and Minatoya list needs to be dealt with. I am thankful for the Maui County council and the Mayor for standing for the people. I support Bill 9 and stand with the people of Lahaina Strong, Lahaina Community Land trust, Maui Housing Hui, HAPA, and the other countless living and past residents of Maui and the need for housing to remain accessible and community owned. Phase out these STR's and if the owners are not happy that is ok. Local families are not happy, nor consenting, or thriving from all the years of illegal and continued suffering because of American occupation.

I support Bill 9. Housing for the community first and now.

Thank you Pahnelopi McKenzie

Pahnelopi McKenzie

2spiralbirth@gmail.com

Po box 1652

Makawao, Hawaii 96768

HLU Committee

From: Kelsey Amos <noreply@adv.actionnetwork.org>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 9:55 PM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

Please SUPPORT Bill 9 to phase out the short term rentals on the Minatoya list without carveouts or special protections for timeshares.

How dare owners show up and talk about the impacts to them when they have not only a place to live but the privilege of owning investment property. There was literally a tragic natural disaster that burnt up people's homes, set back people's generational wealth, and displaced a whole community. That's the context. Either you're a part of this place and do your part to help, or you're not.

We can figure out new economies. What we can't do is replace the people who will have to leave if they can't afford housing.

We should have already done this to create affordable housing for Hawaiians and local people long before the fires. Thank you to everyone who got this bill to this point, and I hope it passes.

Kelsey Amos
kmt.amos@gmail.com

HONOLULU, Hawaii 96817-1300

HLU Committee

From: ANA GILIBERTI <noreply@adv.actionnetwork.org>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 9:58 PM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

Please SUPPORT Bill 9 to phase out the short term rentals on the Minatoya list without carveouts or special protections for timeshares.

ANA GILIBERTI
anamgiliberti@gmail.com

Honolulu, Hawaii 96815

HLU Committee

From: Taylor Santos-Balisacan <noreply@adv.actionnetwork.org>
Sent: Saturday, June 21, 2025 9:59 PM
To: HLU Committee
Subject: Support for Bill 9 to Phase Out the Minatoya List!

Housing Land Use Committee,

Aloha Councilmembers,

Please SUPPORT Bill 9 to phase out the short term rentals on the Minatoya list without carveouts or special protections for timeshares.

Taylor Santos-Balisacan
taysantosb16@gmail.com

Waianae, Hawaii 96792