

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

April 25, 2025

Online Only via Teams

CONVENE: 9:06 a.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Chair
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member
Councilmember Gabe Johnson, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Member
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Nohelani U'u-Hodgins, Member (left at 6:54 p.m.)

STAFF: Kirsten Szabo, Legislative Analyst
Pauline Martins, Senior Committee Secretary
James Krueger, Senior Legislative Analyst
Peter Hanano, Legislative Attorney
Richelle Kawasaki, Deputy Director, Office of Council Services
Yvette Bouthillier, Senior Committee Secretary
Jarret Pascual, Legislative Analyst
Clarissa MacDonald, Legislative Analyst
Lenora Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk
Jean Pokipala, Council Services Assistant Clerk
Ryan Martins, Council Ambassador

Residency Area Office (RAO):

Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros, Council Aide, East Maui Residency Area Office
Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lānaʻi Residency Area Office
Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokaʻi Residency Area Office
Bill Snipes, Council Aide, South Maui Residency Area Office
Clyde “Buddy” Almeida, Council Aide, Makawao-Haʻikū-Pāʻia Residency Area Office

ADMIN.: Lesley Milner, Budget Director, Office of the Mayor
Tiare Horner, Budget Specialist, Office of the Mayor
Kristina Toshikiyo, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel
Kristie Wigglesworth, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

OTHERS: Jenny Sullivan, PV Sullivan Construction
 Kelly O’Kief, PV Sullivan Construction
 Douglas Bigley
 Josiah Nishita, Managing Director, Office of the Mayor
 Pahnelopi McKenzie
 Thomas Fischer
 Sarah Sexton
 Mahealani Bright-Wilhelm
 Leilani Pulmano
 Stacey Vinoray
 Zhantell Lindo
 Jasee Law
 Junya Nakoa
 Others (6)

PRESS: *Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Welcome to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. Today is April 25th, and we are in a very critical moment in terms of our decisions week, so thank you, everybody, for being here. It is now 9:06 a.m., and my name is Yuki Lei Sugimura, I’m the Chair of this Committee. I’d like to welcome all of you, and mention at this time that this meeting is being conducted in accordance with the Sunshine Law. And as a reminder, when your name is called, if you are not in the Chambers--it’s...look like the only person not here is Member Sinenci, but all the other Members are here--please mention who’s in the workspace with you, and minors do not need to be identified. So, I’d like to say good morning first to Chair Lee, if you have a greeting for us?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, I do. And it’s all the way from Jamaica, so you can play with this one. Actually, it’s duh why be *(phonetic)*.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Duh why be?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Or...or you can say, duh, why not? Good morning.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(chuckling)*. . . Oh, I can tell the Members are going to have happy times with that. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha kakahiaka, and duh why be kākou.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Duh why be, Chair, Councilmembers, community members. There’s no testifiers at the Lāna‘i District Office, and I’m here and ready to work. Mahalo.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Good. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka kākou. There are currently no testifiers at the Moloka'i District Office. I'm ready for our last day of budget, and adjourning by lunchtime. Mahalo Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . . *(chuckling)*. . . Oh, all right. And somebody has to catch a flight back home to Moloka'i?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, at 7:55. But I'm looking forward to getting on an earlier flight home. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Well, it's still daylight, that's safe. Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aloha, Chair. Good morning, Members. There's nobody at the Kihei Regional Office, and Jamaica says hello, and good morning.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . . *(chuckling)*. . . Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Good morning, all. Duh why be.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Member Sinenci. Oh, I don't see him. Member Sinenci? Oh, there you are.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: My apologies. My...my camera...my screen just went blank, and I didn't know that my mic was --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: -- unmuted. Sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yeah...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Can you see me?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, we cannot see you, but we can hear you. So, you're going to work on that?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah. The electric went out yesterday, so I'm not sure what's going on.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, my God. Okay. And I guess yesterday it was determined by our legal that it's okay if we can't see you, though we would like to see you. Okay. We still can't see you. All right. Office of the Mayor, Lesley Milner, Budget Director. Department of Corporation Counsel, Kristina Toshikiyo, as well as Kristie Wrigglesworth. Committee Staff, Pauline Martins; Kirsten Szabo...Kirsten Szabo, Legislative Analyst; James Krueger, Senior Legislative Analyst; Jarret Pascual, Clarissa MacDonald,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

Legislative Analysts; and Peter Hanano, Legislative Attorney; Richelle Kawasaki, Deputy Director of Corporation Counsel [sic]; Lei Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk. Thank you very much, Staff, for working on this. And over and beyond the names that I called, there is a lot of our OCS Staff who are working on budget to help all of us. See the last page for information on meeting connectivity. Thank you, Members, for attending today's BFED meeting.

ITEM 1: PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2026 BUDGET FOR THE COUNTY OF MAUI
(BILL 41 (2025), BILL 42 (2025), BILL 43 (2025), BILL 44 (2025), BILL 45 (2025), BILL 46 (2025), BILL 48 (2025), BILL 49 (2025), BILL 50 (2025), Bill 54 (2025), RESOLUTION 25-83, RESOLUTION 25-89, and RESOLUTION 25-90)

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We have one item on the agenda, which is BFED-1, Proposed Fiscal Year '26 Budget for the County of Maui. If there are no objections, I would like to take testimony after receiving opening comments from Staff on Exhibit 1.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. All right.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I just want to say good morning to everyone.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I did not call on you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Aloha kakahiaka and --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm sorry.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- duh why be, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Oh, I'm sorry. Good morning.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Good morning.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, at this time then, Mr. Krueger, do you have Exhibit 1, which is the work that we did yesterday, and the motions, and where we are?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. I'm sorry, I'll start a screen share in just a sec.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair, just for the record, I'm here at the Hāna District Office, and I'm here with District Staff Dawn Lono. Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Now we can see you. Great. Thank you, Member Sinenci.

EXHIBIT “1”

MR. KRUEGER: Okay. Thank you, Chair. So, we have two spreadsheets to kind of share with everybody today...or two documents to share, rather. So, the first one is the Exhibit 1, as always. And again, we're just sharing the departments that the Committee went over yesterday so you can review the...the changes that you've made. You know, once again, please take a look. If you see anything that, you know, we...we didn't capture, you feel we didn't capture accurately, please let us know, and we can discuss and...and discuss if any adjustments are necessary. The sheet starts with Management, and then it'll cover Mayor. You'll see all the conditions being added in from like the OED conditions, things like that. And then the Committee also went over the...the P documents...the P departments, sorry, Parks, Personnel, Police. So, that should be all included in this handout as well. So, that...that's the Exhibit 1 to show the...the...the details of what the Committee went...what the Committee went through yesterday. The second document that we're going to share--I'm just going to stop the screen share for a second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Members, right now, Staff is passing out the Exhibit 1 document so you can see it. It's still pretty light, I guess...but easier to see, I guess. What is...what is the second document that you're...you'll be...

FY26 SUMMARY OF REDUCTIONS AND ADDITIONS

MR. KRUEGER: Oh. So, the second document, you know, Members and Chair requested that we...we kind of do a more summary kind of...of what...what the Committee has done thus far. So, that's what this second document is. So, what...what we've done is basically we've...we've taken each department, and we've...we've shown what the Mayor's proposed total was for the department, the reductions that the Committee has done to the department, the Committee's adds to the department. The fourth column is basically the new department total. And so, the last column is the difference between the Mayor's proposal and the current status, where the Committee is at with its adds and cuts. So, you can see that a positive number in each row means that that's an overage, and then a negative is an underage.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Are you passing this out? Sorry.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes. Yes, we can distribute this document as well. And then I think there was some request for some additional information for us to share. So, just as far as fund balance goes right now, we...again, you know, as we...at the end of every night, you know, we take some time, we make some background adjustments to account for transfers, fringe, things like that. So, with that all taken into account right now, we're showing that the Committee is short \$21,977,061 in the General Fund, and it's over \$2,968,650 in the Sewer Fund. All other funds, right now, are...are...are balancing after

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

Committee has done...after Staff has done the background adjustments. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, hard to read your...well, we can't read that, and definitely, can you please, please get this passed out for the Members so that they can see? Oh, can you leave that up? We only got...I...I only got Exhibit 1. Okay. Thank you. Are you getting that...are you getting that back up? I guess I'm trying to...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Question for James.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Does that number include the 10 million that Lesley suggested...Director Miller?

MR. KRUEGER: So, this...this number just accounts for appropriations. I don't believe the Committee has...has taken a motion yet to accept that...that Carryover/Savings as revenue. So, no, in our spreadsheets, we're not accounting for that 10 million additional Carryover/Savings.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thanks for that clarification. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this is basically all the work that we have done up until last night?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You know, I can't read...I would summarize it, but I can't read it, it's too small. So, I will wait for...

MR. KRUEGER: Is...is there a column you want us to zoom in? Apologies, Chair, we're working on getting that distributed to the Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, get the document to the Members. All right. We will...we will...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Do you want to take a five-minute recess so we can kind of read it?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do you have it?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, not the second one, but the first one. You know, we have to squint to read, that's why.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Yeah, yeah, yeah. So, the second one, which I think is important, and Members did ask for this information. So, this, to me, is an important document. When we started off, Members, looking at all of the priorities that we have...that we

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

asked for, it was 100 million over the Mayor's Budget. So, this document will show us what we've added so far, and I think Member Paltin has done a really good job in terms of, you know, cutting, and with your votes to support it. I wanted to, you know, express to her appreciation because we're going to need to have more cuts as we look at the budget, and...and...and figure out where that's going to be. And some of you have already given up some of your priorities. I saw that from Chair Lee yesterday, where you didn't add...yeah, you didn't add in a lot of your priorities. You kept it out, and maybe we can look at it for future budgets. So, that's where we are today, and we are also...will be working with our real property tax to figure out what the final budget is going to be with these changes. I think I saw Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I just wanted to clarify that reducing the budget is not the only option...that, as you stated, we will be working with the Department of Finance's spreadsheet, and I'm guessing Finance Department on adjusting, and looking at the different rates to also --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- cover the...the budget.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. That is...that is definitely where we are.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I like listening to you too, Member Kama.
...*(chuckling)*...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you got this...following public testimony today, I want to briefly discuss real property tax so the Members have an opportunity to ask the Budget Director any outstanding questions. This will give her time to get out answers before we propose any amendments to the real property tax. We will have our larger real property tax discussion later today. We will then discuss Countywide costs, the general budget provisions, and afterwards, we'll proceed with our revisits and outstanding matters, including Bills 48, 49, Resolutions 25-89, 25-90, and the Weight Tax and Fuel Tax. Once those matters are resolved, we will discuss real property, and next, we'll take up any final decisions on Bill 41, which is our...our bill we've been working from, as well as Bill 50 and 54. We will end the meeting by taking actions on the budget bills...Bills 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, and Resolution 25-83. So, you got your Exhibit 1 handout. Did we ever get the other document? Oh, she's working on it. Okay. All right. So, Members, I'm going to ask for public testimony at this point. Thank you very much. So, I see we have testifiers in the audience, and testifiers wanting to provide testimony should sign up with Staff, join the meeting...on...online meeting with Teams link, or call in to the phone numbers noted on today's agenda. Testimony on the budget is not limited to the departments scheduled for today. Written testimony is encouraged and can be submitted via the eComment's link at mauicounty.us/agendas as well. For individuals wishing to testify on Teams, please raise your hand by clicking on the raise-your-hand button. If calling in, please follow the prompts via phone, star-5 to raise and lower your hand, and star-6 to mute and unmute. Staff will add names to the testifier's list in the order testifiers sign up or raise

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

their hands. For those on Teams, Staff will lower your hand once your name is added, and Staff will add...thank you. Staff will then call the names you've logged in and under...or under the last four digits of your phone number if you wish to testify by phone. At this time, Staff will then enable your microphone and video. Please ensure your name appears on the Microsoft Teams as the name you prefer to be referred to, or anonymous if you wish to testify anonymously. If you're...if you're in-person, please notify Staff that you would like to testify anonymously. Otherwise, please state your name for the record at the beginning of your testimony. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes, and if you're not done, we'll give you another...another 30 seconds to complete your testimony. Oral testimony is welcome, and we also welcome written testimony. And once you're done testifying, or if you do not wish to testify, you can also view the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, or mauicounty.us/agendas. We will do our best to take each person up in an orderly fashion. Staff, please call the first testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the first testifier is Jenny Sullivan, to be followed by Kelly O'Kief.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Jenny Sullivan, and you have your support team, I see, coming down to be with you.

. . . OPEN PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

MS. SULLIVAN: We come as a team, yes. . . .*(chuckling)*. . . Good morning. My name is Jenny Sullivan, and I'm an employee of PV Sullivan Construction. Chair and Councilmembers, thank you for the opportunity to testify today. I'm here to speak in strong opposition of Bill 54. Bill 54, as it is written, is not about fairness, employing local people, or getting homes built faster. It's about control. This bill hands over authority for all County capital improvement projects over \$500,000 to the unions at the cost and expense of local, experienced, merit-based contractors who have built Maui from the ground up. Councilmember Paltin said yesterday, this is an effort to ensure local labor, whether union or nonunion, just get the work done, and they should get the work first. Bill 54 clearly states it is to require responsive bidders be signatories to the community workforce agreement. This is not an option. There's no option in that statement. Bill 54 is going to eliminate competition, shut out qualified local contractors, and drive up costs. Bill 54 will act as a barrier to the entry, contradicting the inclusiveness of many public and community-oriented projects. Most public projects already enforce David-Bacon *[sic]* laws, which ensure prevailing wages, safety, and local hire requirements. Therefore, mandating a community workforce agreement is redundant, and benefiting the unions only. Section 5. c. of the bill states any qualified bidder can be selected, as long as they agree to the terms of the community workforce agreement. Once again, not an option. Under this bill, if a merit-based company wants to work, we must sign union agreements. And if we do sign, here's what it looks like. Nearly \$37 an hour per employee will be diverted to the pay...diverted from our payroll to the union pensions and healthcare, plans that our workers will never see unless they stay in the union, typically for five years, and vest. Thousands of dollars will be taken from workers' paychecks and funneled to union accounts, money that could have been...gone towards

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

real benefits that they can actually use now. Long-time employees, like these guys, some who've been with us for decades, will be forced to give up their current healthcare and retirement, delay coverage, and start over on systems they never asked to join. Yesterday, the Council allocated \$250,000 for a Project Labor Administrator, a role that was agreed to exist independently of Bill 54. This position can promote efficiency and economic development without mandating union participation, suggesting Bill 54 is unnecessary. The foundation of this County and this country was built on open opportunity and free enterprise. Please prioritize policies that support local contractors, regardless of their labor affiliation . . .(timer sounds). . . and facilitate the fastest possible recovery for our community. Please vote no for Bill 54. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Anybody have questions? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Sullivan. I was wondering if...I...I got the written testimony you provided. I was wondering if you have anything in writing where a community workforce agreement says that you need to join a union, like if...if you have a community workforce agreement, because that hasn't been created yet.

MS. SULLIVAN: I'm so glad you said that because there is a lot of ambiguity around the whole community workforce agreement. What is it? Nowhere in that bill does it say exactly what that means. However, there's a section in the bill, we were just talking about it, my colleagues and I, that refers to a union strategy, that there's actual word, the union's in there, and going into the union halls, that typical idea and direction of how they're going to run this. So, you're right. This plan is so ambiguous, there's not a lot of detail, but everything alludes to that type of workforce. If you can rewrite it to include all labor sectors, union and nonunion, I think there's a lot of potential in this. But the way it's written now, it's really not clear, and therefore, it leads us down this path.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That...that was the assignment on the project assignment form, but...so if we remove that section that says about that?

MS. SULLIVAN: I think there's a lot of more detail that has to be entered. I think a whole description of what you think the community workforce agreement actually is. I think there's...I think this was...you even mentioned yesterday, you were kind of rushed to get this done. So, I can appreciate that, and it's a little bit obvious that there wasn't --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean --

MS. SULLIVAN: -- a lot of detail.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- the...the goal is to hire local first, we don't have --

MS. SULLIVAN: 100 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- the housing for off-island workers.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. SULLIVAN: 100 percent. We...oh, we know. Our guys are hardly having...having hard times finding housing, so we get that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, do you have any proposed language to get to where you would like it to be?

MS. SULLIVAN: Thank you. Not on the top...not right with me, but this is something that I think Councilmembers, a lot of people, should weigh in, not just one number. I understand that a lot of these...a lot of you haven't even had a chance to participate or add value to this bill. So, I think it's a bigger discussion, not just for me, but there's a lot of community members that would...I mean, did you read the testimonies, the comments that are on the eComment? I went through them, and there's some really great facts from other merit-based companies that are just concerned, and they have some great suggestions. But I think this is...if it...to really pass as a bill, there's a lot that has to be done, a lot of work, a lot of detail. Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any...

MS. SULLIVAN: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Are you done?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Did I miss anybody? Anybody...oh, Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for being here. So, I think the intent is supposed to be if all the unions can get together, and union and nonunions, the construction workers, all the people in the trades, got together and looked at this, and actually tweaked it together, and came out with something that everybody can adhere to, would that be workable?

MS. SULLIVAN: Of course. That's a starting point. But my question really is--so we already have the Davis-Bacon laws, so what is the difference? Like, why are we putting it in? I mean, this bill almost alludes that there's problems with the workforce now. We're trying our best. The reality is, guys that live here need homes. For us to employ local workers to actually do the job, they need somewhere to live. So, we need to employ local. We want to employ local. We want to get the jobs. But when we are forced to join unions, and then our costs go up, we have to increase our hourly rate by \$37 just to even bid a job, we are out of the loop. There's no way we can get the work. So, what happens? There's a small pool of labor here. So, then, union companies will pull labor from other counties, other states, and then what happens? Our guys, they don't get to work unless they join the union. But then if they join the union, they have to wait five years to see anything that they've contributed in. So, guys that are in their 50s and 60s, it doesn't make logical sense. So, then what do we do as a company who's been in

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

business over 30 years, building multiple communities in this...on this island? What do we do? So, I think the intent, as it's written, is not what Councilmember Paltin wants to have. I think her intent...her intention is right, I just don't think the paper is written --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Properly.

MS. SULLIVAN: -- properly.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you.

MS. SULLIVAN: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any more questions? Seeing none. Oh, sorry. Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. My clarifying...my clarifying question would be, what would...as a tool, what potentially can the County do to facilitate and enable more local construction workers?

MS. SULLIVAN: Great question. To enable local construction workers, it all comes down to people who live here. These guys are willing and able. We have...we're a part of ABC that helps us with training, and getting these guys qualified.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...

MS. SULLIVAN: If they don't live here, they can't work.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, basically a place to live.

MS. SULLIVAN: Absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Housing...focusing on housing.

MS. SULLIVAN: Housing is the priority.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Focusing on making projects easier to get started, possibly.

MS. SULLIVAN: Absolutely. And, you know, we're all talking about affordable housing, so that's what these guys can afford. That's what most of us can afford, is affordable housing. So, you know, I know there's developments going up all over Kihei that are going to accommodate this if they don't get roadblocked. You know, this is the point. There has to be funding. There has to be support. There can't be...and I mean, you guys are doing what you need to do. I think you're getting there.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you very much.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. SULLIVAN: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And thank...I...I just want to, if I may, Chair, acknowledge for you to bring your crew today, and all of them not to be on the job site, is a real testament to how deeply you feel and care about this. And hey, bruddah, you got to go work.

MS. SULLIVAN: . . .*(chuckling)*. . . Yeah, we're a big family. I love these guys, so thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, thank you. Thank you very much. Thank you. That's it.

MS. SULLIVAN: Okay. Thanks. Thanks, guys.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Kelly O'Kief, to be followed by Douglas Bigley.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Members, so we have a long day. I'm being reminded by Staff that we got to do clarifying questions. Okay. Is it Mr. O'Kief?

MR. O'KIEF: Good morning, Chair. And good morning, Councilmembers. So, to...to back up what Jenny said, you know, I had this...this testimony in...in strong opposition to Bill 54, but I...I think that the...the definition of the community workforce agreement is...is what we need. Because we read through the bill, and we just...we started seeing buzzwords jump off the...the...the table here. Union hall hiring provisions, applicable crafts master agreement, you know, five...five-year...five-year contract. And so, there's been a frenzy in the office about, does this mean a mandate for union labor on projects over \$500,000? And so, if that is not the bill's intent, then we're...we're good. I mean, we...we...we're absolutely committed to hiring local. I mean, Maui local, like, you know, we...we don't hire off-island guys, you know, and so there's...there's going to be this huge chunk of...of Federal dollars coming for the...for the Lāhainā effort. We're 100 percent committed to hiring local, 100 percent committed to hiring our guys on Maui. We don't want to see...I mean, there's going to be off-island guys, I mean, but mainland...we don't want to see mainland guys coming here. You know, we don't want to hire from the mainland. We want to keep everything local. So, if we misunderstood the intent of the bill, then...then the...the...the frenzy we've been going through the last couple days will...will absolutely mellow out. But...but if...if there is an intent to...to mandate that not...you know, that merit-based, open-shop companies have to join the union, then...then we're in strong opposition. We've been...you know, Pete and Dave have...have, you know, been doing the right thing for 30 years. We've got a super strong, you know, super good reputation. You know, we've got good guys working for us. We do good work, and, you know, we're just trying to do the right thing. So, yeah, that's...that's...that's where we're at. If the intent is not to have union affiliation, and...and we're absolutely...absolutely willing, and we'll be available to sit down and help...help rewrite, or help reword, or whatever it takes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Any questions? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. I was wondering if you could...like I read the testimony, but if you could...like if you had a copy of the bill, and highlight all the portions of the thing that are concerning, and then maybe submit that or something?

MR. O'KIEF: Yeah. Yeah, yeah, absolutely. I've got them circled right here, so that's...yeah, that's...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, you can just hand it over.

MR. O'KIEF: Yeah, yeah. Yeah, just...just like I said, some buzzwords that, you know, got...got us a little bit jumpy are...you know, are in there. So, yeah, maybe...maybe it's a super easy fix.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, yeah. Well, I...I didn't give the project assignment form assignee a lot of time to do it, but that was the request on the thing is union or nonunion.

MR. O'KIEF: Okay. Yeah. I mean, it sounds like, you know, if the...the...the figure is \$2 billion, I mean, there's going to be...there's going to be so much work that, you know, all the union shops and all the...everybody's going to be full of work. I mean, it's...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's the...the goal, is that us guys get the work first, and then anything else, you can go out...further out.

MR. O'KIEF: Absolutely. Yeah, 100 percent.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. Thank you.

MR. O'KIEF: Yep.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thanks for bringing your team.

MR. O'KIEF: Yeah, yeah, thank you. Thank you guys.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. O'KIEF: Yeah.

ALL: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next testifier. Thanks, yeah.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Douglas Bigley, to be followed by Josiah Nishita.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. BIGLEY: Hi. I'm here today...really, I have heard that we're going to be possibly a topic of discussion today. So, I thought I would go ahead and register as a resource if you should need me. I don't think I have to really talk about the need for housing because the groups that just came before me did that job. And the other thing is, we'd like to see...we are interested in getting both of these projects that we were talking about underway. It's in everybody's interest to see how we can get both of them done, not just one or the other. So, I'll be here should you need me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, we're not really doing resources at this point. But the next speaker is Josiah Nishita. So, maybe that's who you're talking about you need to be a resource to. I'm not sure. But...yeah. Anybody have questions for...no? Okay. Thank you, Mr. Bigley. Next testifier.

MR. BIGLEY: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Josiah Nishita.

MR. NISHITA: Aloha, Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aloha.

MR. NISHITA: Aloha, Chair. Thank you for allowing me to be here today to testify on a few items. I apologize, I didn't realize you guys weren't taking resources at this point, but I guess it's understandable, with time constraints. But a couple items I wanted to testify on. One is, I believe a proposal will be coming up today in Countywide Costs, potentially, in regards to a settlement agreement with Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association. So, I just wanted to let you know that we are in full support of that request. The...the union still needs to have members ratify the contract. I actually just ended a meeting with...Mayor and I met with HFFA, and all the firefighters who were able to join the call to ask questions and whatnot. And so, we're hoping for a favorable outcome and ratification vote on that. But we do support the funding request to allow us to help resolve that. The other piece that is likely going to come up in Countywide Costs that we do support is a request for supplemental agreements as it relates to...I...I haven't...I know there's a lot of discussion around this. I haven't had a chance to talk to Mayor about every conversation that has come up. But one item that we've been pursuing that we would like to include in those supplemental agreements is similar to what Kaua'i did, with a provision of basic medical for all employees.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wow.

MR. NISHITA: So, we would like to pursue that. We have had many discussions already. And I think the funding request that is likely going to come up today for the Countywide Costs would help us support that measure for all of our employees. So, if there's any questions on that, please let me know. And then finally, I know that there's been a lot of discussion on...on the affordable housing projects. And I haven't been able to monitor those meetings, but there was, I've been told, a lot of discussion about trying to find funding potentially for the project at Lipoa. So, for the Council's consideration, we did try to string together what could be a funding mechanism to allow that to happen, if that's the Council's intent, that the Administration would support as well. Would be...we are holding about roughly \$14 million in carryover right now for the acquisition of two structures in Wailuku. I know you guys had some robust discussion about borrowing versus using cash. But if the Council so chose, that's about \$14 million that we'd be willing to provide in that carryover cash that we're holding for acquisition of two buildings in Wailuku. So, our request, when we come in for that acquisition to Council, would ultimately be for bond, if you guys did make that determination. And then the other piece would be-- . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . and if I could just have 30 seconds to conclude--would be altering slightly the Affordable Housing Funds to change the Ikaika 'Ohana Project from a \$12.4 million loan to roughly about a \$2 million grant, and then freeing up about \$10 million in there for the project. So, that's one proposal to consider. I'm sure you guys probably may have questions for the developer. Or if you have any questions for me, I'm happy to . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . answer, but wanted to be able to provide some opportunity for Council if you guys did want to consider funding that. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you very much. So, you are saying for the affordable housing Lipoa project, I think they're...they're...what they would need is 25 million, so...

MR. NISHITA: Yeah. So, as I was mentioning--and I just want to make clear, I think Lesley brought up about the \$10 million yesterday. So, this is the same money we're talking about, not, you know, duplicating things. But yeah, it would be about \$14 million in carryover for...that we had set aside for two acquisitions, and then \$10 million from the Affordable Housing Fund would roughly be about \$24 million, which would leave, you know, about a \$1 million gap there that would be a lot easier to make up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I see hands. So, I think I saw Member Rawlins-Fernandez first, and then Member U'u-Hodgins, Johnson. I'm sure Member Kama had her hand up, sorry. Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Aloha, Managing Director. Mahalo for your testimony. I appreciate the proposals on trying to make the Council's...some of the Councilmembers' desire to add the Lipoa project to the budget. I think it's a testament to the Administration's wish to collaborate with the Council. So, mahalo for that. However, I...you know, I'm a process person. And we heard from the Housing Director yesterday about trying to stick to the process. I'm sure...if you listened to that discussion yesterday. And I also don't know, we would have to find out where

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

the Lipoa project scored on, you know, the...the committee's vetting of...of...of that, of the 19 projects that they were given. So, my question to you is, if...if you did hear the discussion that we had with Housing Director Mitchell and Deputy Director Mataafa, if that is something that the Administration, yourself, also strongly supports, which is sticking to the process, and having integrity in a process that's as depoliticized as possible.

MR. NISHITA: Yeah, absolutely. And...and I didn't see your guys' meeting with Remi and Saumalu, but I did have multiple conversations with them offline over this, I don't know, maybe past week, kind of regarding similar situations. The Administration stands in full support of the process that we established. We did ask that you keep the integrity of the process intact. I think what was relayed to us a little bit--and I apologize, I didn't get to see the meeting at all--but there were some concerns about cutting projects out, or altering some things or, you know, where the money ultimately would come from. And so, you know, we worked with a lot of our...our partners, and also, you know, mechanisms that we have available to try to come up with something that would allow projects to continue moving forward rather than outright, I guess, cutting things that we've already established through the process that should receive funding and whatnot. So, yes, we want to keep the integrity of the process, we want to depoliticize it, but, you know, ultimately, if the Council does want to consider something, we want to make sure it's something that's kind of workable, that...that we can live with. And so, that's why just coming forward to offer an alternative, and it's up to Council whether, you know, you guys ultimately want to support it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Managing Director. And then my last question is, regarding the two properties that the funding was held aside for the acquisition in Wailuku, what then happens to that plan?

MR. NISHITA: Thank you. Ultimately, we would...we're still going to move forward with them. I know you guys had some discussion on this the other day on using cash versus bond for things, but ultimately, we would have to come...we would be forced at that point to come in and requesting bond authorization for those projects when we make the acquisition request, as opposed to identifying the Carryover/Savings that we had set aside.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Managing Director. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. And thank you very much, Managing Director. I know we did have a lot of discussion on the process, and Member Rawlins-Fernandez is really good at loving processes. I'm going to say I don't like the process that happened. What we saw was projects heavily weighted to LIHTC projects, and we continue to miss the missing middle. So, I don't think I like the process. I know that we can follow it, but I don't like it. And it was probably created by people who don't do housing just yet. And I know that they had maybe one developer on there, or a housing provider on there, and I can appreciate it, but how many people have

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

actually provided homes that were scoring these projects? The process wasn't transparent. We haven't...as Member Rawlins-Fernandez said, we haven't seen the list on how people scored. So, right now, I don't love the process. But nonetheless, what annoys me in the process is that we have all these funding, more than just Kaiāulu O Nāpili. So, I don't want to only talk about that project. I'm kind of...like, I get it. I...I appreciate Mr. Bigley. Probably ready to say what he was going to say, and then you said it. But we have lots of projects here that are going to use the money on an application, but not for construction right now. So, we're just holding it. We have the money on paper, but it can't be used. So, the process in that way, in my head, is flawed, and so is the timing for our projects. And it doesn't coincide with LIHTC projects. They need more...we need more money from them than they need from us, so we should probably better conform to their schedule and not expect them to conform to us. But my...my clarifying question is, if we are going to expect Kaiāulu O Nāpili to reduce their monies, and go from a loan to a grant, can we not expect that for everybody else, instead of just defunding--well, I don't want to say defunding--instead of just taking it from one project? Because there looks like to be about \$20-something million that is just on paper, but not used. So, what else can we do instead --

MR. NISHITA: Thank you...

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- of just going for one project?

MR. NISHITA: Thank...thank you, Chair. I think those are great comments. I did get...I think this is the first time we're going through kind of like this new process.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yes.

MR. NISHITA: So, I think the only thing...or the main thing we'd ask for is any changes to the process, which we always got to get better, and we always got to improve upon things --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Sure.

MR. NISHITA: -- is to be made kind of after, not to change it kind of in the... in the middle of things. I think that's...

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah, don't change it now.

MR. NISHITA: Yeah, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: But maybe let's have the advisory board partici... --

MR. NISHITA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- help kind of create this process.

MR. NISHITA: Yeah, and I know I received some concerns about, you know, regarding how projects can score because of AMI levels --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

MR. NISHITA: -- and...and things like that. So, I think it's all things that we got to take into consideration, you know, to be able to provide the full spectrum of housing --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

MR. NISHITA: -- that's...that's needed for people. So, I think --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I appreciate that.

MR. NISHITA: -- I think that's understood.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah.

MR. NISHITA: I think there's a million ways to skin the cat, so to say. And the last time I used that phrase, I got in a lot of trouble.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: How many times do you skin a cat?

MR. NISHITA: I got in a lot of trouble because apparently Council was talking about the Lānaʻi Cat Sanctuary that day. So, I apologize.

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Sorry, Gabe.

MR. NISHITA: That was no...in relation to that. But the --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: That's hilarious.

MR. NISHITA: -- there's....there's a ton of different ways to do this.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

MR. NISHITA: You know, I think what was relayed to some of the concerns--and like I said, I didn't get to watch any of the discussion or meetings--but was that I think Kaiāulu O Nāpili was one of the bigger projects funded.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yes.

MR. NISHITA: And I think that there was a lot of discussion and/or questions about that. And we really want to keep moving that project forward. And so, I think, you know, from our standpoint, we had a concern about Council just completely cutting funding to that project, and allocating it elsewhere. So, you know, like I said, I mean, you could take a little bit here, a little bit there, a little bit here, a little bit there, and still come up with

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

the same solution. But we wanted to at least provide one proposal for the Council's consideration so that, you know, we're...we're in this dialogue, and can make something workable.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I appreciate that. I don't want you to skin a cat several different ways. I assume you can only skin the cat once, and then you got to practice on other cats. But...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It just got worse.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Let's be real. I live in the country. I know what it's like. I think this is probably a bigger conversation. So, I do look forward to having this conversation on how we can figure out how to best utilize the money we have in the year that we actually need to spend it in. But it's not going to be solved right now. So, thank you so much. I really do appreciate your time, and you providing us with some option. Thank you.

MR. NISHITA: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Who was next? Member Johnson? Member...okay. Johnson and Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Thank you, Chair. Thanks for joining us, Managing Director Nishita. I know you're busy so I'll just jump right to the questions. You know, builders need security. And as we talk about this process, you know, Ikaika 'Ohana, we're...in the discussions, we're going...we're weaving. Okay. We're all over the place sometimes, it seems. So, tell us, have you spoken with Ikaika 'Ohana on it? Are they supportive of the 2 million? And...let's hear from that first.

MR. NISHITA: Thank you very much, Chair. And I think Doug's on the line. So, you know, ultimately, I'd love for them to speak for themselves. But I really appreciated Ikaika 'Ohana because throughout our entire time of working together, they've always been really open to try to help resolve things, and come up with, you know, really creative solutions and stuff. Even things that maybe are contrary to their own personal benefit, so to say. And so, you know, they...they did want to be a partner in helping to resolve some of these issues. I think the ultimate question is, whether they prefer to get the money that was already allocated and was asked for. I think...I think the question...the answer is yes. I think in the...you know, knowing that there's other needs in the community, and that the Council is trying to find ways to support additional projects as well, I think, you know, in talking with them, we came up with this --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MR. NISHITA: -- kind of alternative solution to --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MR. NISHITA: -- help the Council and the County kind of --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's...that's --

MR. NISHITA: -- move forward.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- where I'm curious, is as long as you guys are working together, and you come to an agreement. Because developers and builders want that security, right? We can't be yanking their chain left, right, and center. I'm going to talk a little bit about the process, right? I...I understand what you guys did. But remember, we're...we're part of this process as well, and I feel like we're left out until the last...you know, the last minute, where all of a sudden a project comes before that we didn't even get to discuss about in Committee. That's concerning. So, in the future, moving forward, if you guys do that kind of committee of which ones to select, it would be really helpful if you guys brought in one of...one of the Councilmembers to join you at the table. Remember, we've got equal powers. We can defund, veto all the things. We...we...we are...we are part of the process, but I feel we're a little bit left out. You don't have to do all nine of us, but maybe the Chair of Housing, or maybe the Councilmember of that district would love to be at a seat at the table, and speak on what they think the community would need. That is a really important part of the process. So, moving forward, please try to include us before it comes down to the ninth hour where we're all of a sudden, you know, at each other's throats because of the process. And I don't want it to be like that. If we can bring it to Committee, that's another way. So, you know, those are...those are ways that I think not only brings us to the table, but now, for your...for your...for your point of view is, you have a champion, right? Let's say Councilmember Paltin believes in a project really strongly, and she's got...she knows a lot about it. She can come and explain to this Council. She could be that champion, and carry that project over the finish line. That's, I think, is a really important part of the process that we're...we're being left out of. So, please consider that as we move forward, that we...we're equals in this process, right?

MR. NISHITA: Yeah, no, appreciate the comments. All good stuff, and...and how we can improve. I would just note--and, you know, should get verification if this is important in your discussions from Department of Housing directly--but my understanding is that the Lipoa project was next on the list below the ones that did receive funding. So, it's not that they're, I guess, jumping out of order. They're not like five spots down or something. They were next on the list, just as FYI. That's my understanding anyway. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. And --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- before I call the next speaker, then Doug Bigley who popped up, I guess he's agreeable to what you're proposing.

MR. NISHITA: Chair, I mean, I'm guessing, under the Sunshine Law, you guys can't call back up testifiers, and since you're not doing resources, maybe he's unable to re-speak on it.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

But I think my...what I relayed to Councilmember Johnson is correct that...I mean, they did apply for the \$12.4 million. That was, you know, that...that was their intention, and is their intention to seek. And just knowing that, you know, there was a lot of discussion about this and the...you know, the desire to help find funding for additional projects, it's one way in which the Council can consider. There's many different ways, of course. But I just appreciate them even being willing and...and open to talking with us, and trying to find a way to, you know, find a funding mechanism if Council wanted to proceed forward.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Next we have Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I just wanted to clarify the part of your testimony. My priority was the 26 million for supplemental agreements, and I kind of got lost in all of the whole testimony. So, if...if you could clarify what you were saying about that one because that one was me.

MR. NISHITA: Okay. Sorry about that, Chair. I know it's...it was kind of a run-on sentence. . . .*(chuckling)*. . . But yeah, specific to that, I noted that, you know, we are asking for support of the request. I did note that I haven't been able to touch base with Mayor on the...I think the additional parts of discussion that came up related to that. But the funding that would be provided in relation to the request, we are asking to allow us to be able to use...oh, to support it, and then allow us to be able to use it for supplemental agreements to cover basic medical costs for all of our employees.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And did you say something about what the total amount you're asking for, if 26 million was too little or too much, and something about that being combined with the 10 million HFFA request, or...

MR. NISHITA: No, that might have been my lack of speaking clearly on the subject. I believe there's...there's going to be a request for Countywide Costs...separate request from Countywide Costs for settlement of the, yeah, HFFA THP request. So, we are supportive of that. And then...yeah, and then in relation to the...the basic medical costs. I think we're still running the numbers, but our anticipation is about \$10 million or less for coverage of that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, 10 million for HFFA and 10 million for salary adjustments?

MR. NISHITA: Well, I guess it wouldn't be classified...I don't know the...how payroll's going to tag it, but...I don't know if it's salary adjustments, but it would be under maybe fringe benefits or whatnot in relation to the medical for that. Like I said, HFFA is going to have to ratify their agreement, so some...a couple of things could change, but we don't anticipate that being in excess of \$10 million.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And then the benefits or adjustments, that you're willing to provide 10 million for that, or is 26 million?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MR. NISHITA: For the medical portion, it would be 10 million or less. As I said, we're still, you know, calculating everything out. We're going to have to run some numbers with EUTF and whatnot as well, but it should be less than \$10 million. It just so happens the numbers are the same, but it's two separate pieces.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And...and you're okay like, kind of with...Ms. Takakura testified about like supplements, or studies across the board, by...not by department, for, you know, those...those guys that are hard...chronic hard to fill, or like the EM, which other counties give the EN and the EM same time, so there wasn't that situation. Those...those, you guys are still looking into, so maybe the 26 million is needed, or...

MR. NISHITA: Yeah. So, in general, we...we need a ratified agreement. So, I know...I think UPW ratified, and I think HGEA just did. So, for the other ones, I think SHOPO, HFFA, I think they're going to arbitration, I believe. DPS can speak more to that. But my understanding is, we wouldn't be able to do supplemental agreements in absence of the...the contractual, you know, period being established.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Per bargaining unit.

MR. NISHITA: Yeah. So...but in relation, I know Council had some discussion about this, I think this week, regarding some type of classification study or whatnot. And I think similar to kind of what the Salary Commission asked for, I think, you know, if we're going to look at something, I think, you know, we should look at everything holistically, and then be able to identify where the actual, you know, points of need are. And...and you've identified a couple of them already, but I know Mayor does want to take like a holistic approach to it, rather than a departmental-by-departmental basis.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, like maybe 20 million this time instead of 26?

MR. NISHITA: Well, I mean, ultimately, it depends on what, you know, the Council and the Mayor ultimately agree to, or want to do regarding a supplemental agreement. I think you guys have discussions about, you know, like a small stipend, monthly payment, things like that. But that could be tens of millions of dollars, or, you know, the medical coverage could be under \$10 million. So, it kind of depends on what kind of benefit is being provided, and then how many employees are being affected.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, to clarify, like if the intent was for people that are working with chronic vacancies, and you can only give overtime like eight hours a week, but the rest of the week they're doing all the work, but they're just not getting the overtime, maybe at the end of each month, some of the money for the vacancy can go to them because they're essentially doing the work?

MR. NISHITA: Yeah. I mean, I've...I've heard probably about 30-something different proposals of what would be best for the employees. And I think that's why, you know, looking at holistically, I mean, obviously we need to retain our employees and the institutional knowledge that they have, and to take care of our workforce who serves our community. And so, you know, we are completely open to working with the Council on how best to

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

make that happen. But one of the first steps that we would like to take--and agreements would come before Council for approval ultimately, other than just the funding mechanism--but would be to help negotiate this basic medical coverage for all employees.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Kama, did you have a question?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes. Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Nishita, for being here. Thank you for trying to do a workout as to how we're going to take care of the Lipoa project. And dependent upon whether or not my colleagues actually, when we come to that time to approve the...because that is one of my projects, my...my criteria of my priorities. But...and the other day, as we were having this discussion on the floor, I think Member Paltin had asked if I was willing to give up something for this project. And so, the process continued. And so, what I want to say today is, the thing that moved me most about this project is that it's 175, one-, two-, three-bedrooms, right? Total. In Kīhei, which is very badly needed. But also, that when I listened to the testimony of both Mr. Bigley--and Mr. Bigley, you can correct me when you testify--and the testimony of Ms. Pulmano was that she would be able to put people in their homes fourth quarter, 2027. And Mr. Bigley said he'd be able to start their project in 2027. And that was one of the things that I listened to. And I paid attention to, you know, who's doing what, when, and whether or not we put the money on the side now, or we spend it later. But the idea is that if we have something that we can do now, and we're able to do it and work it out, I'm very grateful for that. But I'm also realizing the amount of *(echoing)* collaboration that it takes for everybody to come together to give up something, to put something on the table, and those kinds of things moving forward. So, I do not have a question for you, but I just want to say thank you so very much. And thank you to my colleagues.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I thought you were pulling off a Member Rawlins-Fernandez, and then asking one question at the end.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No, no, no. No. She's the...she's the --

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're getting...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- queen. She's a queen. Let her be the queen.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, today you got the queen back. So, I wanted to ask...oh, I didn't see Member Sinenci. Member Sinenci? Okay. Sorry about that. Then I have a question

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

too. Member Sinenci? Oh, you don't have a question. Okay. All right. So, I want to go back to the firefighters, Mr. Nishita. And I just want clarification because I know that when we had the department...not department, probably Finance or Budget Director come before us, you have appropriated 2 million that's already in the budget, and it was said it's for the settlement of the firefighters. But it sounds like you may need another 8 million more to reach the 10 million amount. Is that what you're...you're saying?

MR. NISHITA: Yeah, Chair. I mean, it's going to depend on the final details of everything that, you know, gets identified. And of course, we got to work with ERS on retirement payments in relation to the hazard payouts. But I don't foresee a situation where it's in excess of \$10 million total. It could be less than that, and in all likelihood, I believe it will be. But that's kind of the top end of the range, depending on these last details being worked out.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I guess I'm asking you because we have the...that's one of my priorities. And if I don't have to put in 10 million, I don't want to. If I can just put in 8 million, you'd be happy.

MR. NISHITA: Yeah, 8, plus the 2 we already budgeted would give us the ceiling that we would need --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right.

MR. NISHITA: -- to ensure it could move forward.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. Oh, Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Just real quickly on the clarifying question. You mentioned two Wailuku properties you were thinking on deferring. Can you tell us the two? And is this the best way to say not...to find the money is not buying these items? Could we look at maybe increasing RPT to find the money?

MR. NISHITA: Thank you, Chair. So, I think the Administration's position is that we are still going to move forward, and we are moving forward with the acquisition of the...the structures. And when it comes to a point that something's negotiated and settled --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MR. NISHITA: -- we'll present that to Council. So, we're not going to stop that process.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MR. NISHITA: I think all I would relay is that understanding we're all on the same page, that if you do, you know, utilize that cash for the Lipoa project, that, you know, please don't be upset with me when I come in for bond authorization for that because I used up the cash for...for another project. I just want to make sure we're all on the same page with

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

that. One project I already...or one property I already noted to Council, I think probably a few months ago, that was the Mental Health Kokua building that we're going to be acquiring for CDBG-DR.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MR. NISHITA: That...and there was a question raised previously about, can DR funds be used to purchase the building, and the answer's no. But it can be used...the DR funds can be used for rental expense. So, instead of renting an office space from somebody else, the County's going to acquire a building, and then we'll charge CDBG-DR for the debt service related to that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Very good.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's a good plan.

MR. NISHITA: And then the other building, we haven't noted publicly. I'd be happy to talk to --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MR. NISHITA: -- each of you privately --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: All right.

MR. NISHITA: -- but because negotiations are still going on, I don't want to...yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: What about your response to increasing RPT?

MR. NISHITA: Well, I mean, there's all...I mean, I don't want to say the phrase I used the last time, but there's obviously different mechanisms to create funding--raising rates, cutting expenses, bonding. I mean, there's a whole list of options that are available.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, and...

MR. NISHITA: But, you know, ultimately, Council will end up making that decision.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: All right. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Seeing no one. Thanks...thanks for spending...oh, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think you should get it in writing from my colleagues that they won't give you a hard time when you come in for a bond authorization, or like --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . . *(chuckling)*. . .

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- some little cut with some blood, and shake hands, or something like that.

MR. NISHITA: Okay. Will do.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Mister...Managing Director, just so...just so, I guess, maybe people listening don't think that we're cutting all the funding for the Nāpili project. So, now it was 100 percent loan for the 12.4, I think, in the Affordable Housing Fund. Now it's going to be 2 million in a grant? And can you explain the rest?

MR. NISHITA: Yes. Well, I mean, like I said, there's many different ways the Council can decide to do this. But under one proposal that...that we're providing for consideration is to reduce the \$12.4 million loan to a \$2 million grant. That would free up about \$10.4 million. And then in relation to the other funding that we identified, that would come out to basically \$25 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Because I don't want people to think that we're not doing the Nāpili project, which was kind of the scare when we first started talking about it, so...

MR. NISHITA: Yeah, I mean...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We stand side-by-side on it.

MR. NISHITA: Yeah. I mean, I think the...the biggest impact is the, you know, potential LIHTC application next year. So, you know, the...the \$2 million grant at least would allow the project to continue to move forward to try to get through permitting and building permits for the next round of LIHTC applications. So, you know, under this proposal, the project would still be able to move forward, just albeit, you know, at a slightly slower rate, I guess.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other questions? Thank you for spending your morning with us. I'm quite sure you're pretty busy.

MR. NISHITA: No, thank you very much, Members. And, of course, if you guys have any questions, please...please let us know. But thank you for all your support.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you very much. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Pahnelopī McKenzie, to be followed by Thomas Fischer.

MS. MCKENZIE: Hi, everybody. So, I'm not even sure the bill number, but this is in relation to the farms-to-family bill for the Maui Food Bank. They had said that that was being shared about today. But again, I don't know the bill number, so I'm sorry, I'm not as prepared. I just left the food bank. I just want to say, the food bank is such a crucial,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

crucial line of sustenance for our community. Since the fires happened, Kelaweā Mauka Hub was at the ballpark, and it became a mobile situation. And because it was just a small-run situation, a lot gran...a lot of nonprofits didn't want to give food to it because it didn't have the numbers. But the Maui Food Bank continued to believe in us, and we continue to serve over 400 families a week. We buy produce when we can, but we're just two people, mostly, trying to do this thing. And the Maui Food Bank has just always supported us. And what we see the community wants...like we have people returning their canned goods. Not that we shouldn't have canned goods, but people want fresh produce. They want fresh, local produce. So, Uncle Bobby and other organizations that try as best they can, Hāna Ono Farms, you know, like even if it's five boxes of bananas, like people are so happy. And so, we serve the Kelaweā neighborhood. Now we're going to Ka La'i Ola. We're going to Integrated Health Center. But without the Maui Food Bank, this island--and I'm sure Moloka'i and Lāna'i experience it too--the...the struggle that people face being able to get fresh food, which is what they want. So, I just really want to...it's especially like the houses, the state and FEMA houses open, when people are getting their grocery bags, now they're coming out, they see us, and they're like hey, hey...because now they know. And in Kelaweā, people will come. We have every Thursday, 4,000 pounds of produce, milk, eggs, and bread, and it's gone in an hour. People are coming. And then Saturdays we go out, and it's like there's not enough food. There is so much struggle. And so, the Maui Food Bank, I just...again, all the other organizations, and I don't know the details of this bill, so you guys know a lot more, but I can only speak for the amount of food waste that is out there is unbelievable, and the Maui Food Bank gives an avenue for that food to get in homes. Expired or not, people are starving, and the fresh produce...the fresh produce from the farmers locally is the greatest goal. And so, I know that local produce is expensive. I know the chaos that's going on with the world and economics, but this...this fresh food going into people's home is like...the joy that people have. Like even when we were getting eggs, when nobody had eggs, people felt like they were winning, like they were bawling in Kelaweā. They were like, we got eggs, we can do...you know, and just that they weren't left out. Because people that are poor or struggling are often left out, and the people know that they're . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . not left out. So, just...the Maui Food Bank is crucial.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you . . . *(inaudible)*. . . Member Johnson has a question for you, a clarifying question.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Just to let you know that one of my initiatives was the local nutrition security initiative Farm-to-Family through the Department of Ag...Agriculture --

MS. MCKENZIE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- \$2 million, and this Council, this Committee supported it. So, there'll be money coming down the pike for exactly what you're talking about.

MS. MCKENZIE: Perfect.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: We're putting in an extra 2 million for that.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MCKENZIE: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: In addition, Maui United Way, just...this Committee supported my other priority, the \$12 million, for helping out people who are ALICE, you know, like they --

MS. MCKENZIE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- they're a little bit above...so you know what I'm talking about.

MS. MCKENZIE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, it's really great that this body has been really pushing forward your concerns, and we're...we're going to try to address them in this budget. So --

MS. MCKENZIE: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- thanks for your testimony.

MS. MCKENZIE: Thank you. And I...I --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And thanks for doing what you do.

MS. MCKENZIE: -- I work at Women Helping Women also, and so we can only buy what we can buy. But when we go to the food bank, it's like sometimes you get, you know, special chocolate, and special things, and extra produce, and people can really utilize it. So --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

MS. MCKENZIE: -- yeah. So, thank you guys for all that you do in supporting it. So, it's very important.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you.

MS. MCKENZIE: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. I hear some...something ringing.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Thank you very much for testifying. All right. Any more testifiers?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MACDONALD: Yes, Chair. There's currently three left signed up to testify. The next testifier is Thomas Fischer, to be followed by Sarah Sexton.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Fischer?

MR. FISCHER: Thank you. Aloha, Chair and Councilmembers. I just wanted to make a brief statement. We are in agreement with the discussion from Managing Director Nishita, and we're, again, happy to try to be of assistance to the community in any way we can. So, just want to get that on the record for you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Any questions to Mr. Fischer, which is Mr. Bigley also? Seeing none. Thank you. Thanks for making the time for us this morning.

MR. FISCHER: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. FISCHER: Aloha.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aloha. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Sarah Sexton, to be followed by Mahealani Bright-Wilhelm.

MS. SEXTON: Aloha kākou. I hate public speaking . . . *(chuckling)* . . . but I think today is one of those pivotal moments that I need to do it. And so, here I am. Most of you all know me. I work for Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez, but I'm taking a break to testify on my own time, and on my own behalf, in strong support of Bill 49. I don't have an epic speech. And like us all, I don't have time to write one. So, I'm going to keep it brief. The bottom line is that I think the idea of holding one person back from what is fair because another person may not get the same isn't a great way forward for this world. And I truly believe that we should take the opportunity to give folks a livable wage anytime we get it. Most of us that work for the County are not doing it for the pay, but because we want better for our community, and sometimes better comes to us piecemeal. I'm okay with that. OCS works so hard, and I appreciate them so much, but even still for me, that is not the point. I believe we need to put pressure on a status quo system that ultimately does not serve 99 percent of us. I know it hurts not being able to increase wages for all County employees. I believe you want us all to live without fear of looking at our bank accounts after we pay rent, and buy groceries, and pay for childcare--you all have seen my baby--because I do not pay for childcare, which would take up most of my money. But this is not where we're at right now. We can't do this for everybody right now, but we can do it for some of us. This is your moment to move the needle for some of us. That's all. So, please make the right decision. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Wait one second in case anybody has questions for you. Seeing none.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. SEXTON: Like I haven't seen this done a million times. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I have a comment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well...

MS. SEXTON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I have a comment. Sarah, I just want to thank you for coming up and testifying. I know it was very brave of you to do that, and I commend you. Thank you.

MS. SEXTON: Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. All right. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Mahealani Bright-Wilhelm, to be followed by Leilani Pulmano.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. BRIGHT-WILHELM: I know, oh, my gosh. I'm getting better, I'm getting better. Okay. . . .*(chuckling)*. . . Aloha, Committee Chair and Councilmembers. My name is Mahealani Bright-Wilhelm, and I'm testifying on my own time, and on my own behalf, in support of Bill 49 regarding the salary increases for OCS Staff. This is a huge opportunity to support our people by giving them a living wage. The end game, of course, is that everyone is able to not only afford to live here, but live here in a quality of life that isn't working multiple jobs just to pay rent and keep food on the table. I've been there, and so many others have been there. Every big revolution starts small, so let OCS be that first step. Give them what they deserve, and open that door for further discussion to raise all pay and keep our people home, hopefully. The cost of living is horrible, with multiple families living under one roof, a housing shortage, the rebuild of Lāhainā, luxury homes taking precedence over residence *(phonetic)*, the list goes on. I understand the backlash that will come with this, but if you had an opportunity to live comfortably without the worry of where your next meal would come from, wouldn't you fight for that? These first steps of raises could be that ticket to achieve this type of security our people need. I wanted to quote a very strong, beautiful, and ambitious woman. There are two types of people, those who struggled and want others to struggle because they did, or those who struggled and don't want people to struggle because they did. Personally, I wouldn't wish that on anyone. So, why not go and support the first step in making a difference for our residents? Why should we put someone else down just because we haven't gotten there yet? So, let's not talk the talk, but walk the walk. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair?

MS. BRIGHT-WILHELM: Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Mahealani, that was great. I just want to know, who...who did you quote? Was it Keani Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

MS. BRIGHT-WILHELM: Yes --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay.

MS. BRIGHT-WILHELM: -- it was --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I had a hunch.

MS. BRIGHT-WILHELM: -- beautiful Councilmember.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you. Yeah. She can be wise at times.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is it next testifier? No questions. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next individual signed up to testify is Leilani Pulmano.

MS. PULMANO: Hi. Good morning, Chair and Councilmembers. I...I don't have a speech prepared for you all. I...I...I know that you guys have questions for the Lipoa affordable project, but I do just want to make a couple comments. First, I want to thank Councilmember Kama for...for bringing this in front of the Committee. I also want to thank the Administration for working so hard to try to find a solution. And most importantly, I'd like to thank Doug Bigley and his team for being so gracious, to try to find a path forward for both of our projects. And I'd just like to end, but--it's difficult for me to be here to be asking this request--but for me, in the background, I have 175 families that want to call this place a home. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Any questions for Leilani? Member Paltin? Oh, did you raise your hand too, Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you. So, I...I...I was looking at your handout sheet for the project, and I looked at the rents, and honestly, they are kind of high. I get it, you have to go under AMI. But how about project vouchers for the project? Have you guys considered that?

MS. PULMANO: That's a great question. I was just having a conversation with Kate, your aide, and she brought that up. We're open to having Section 8 vouchers. I don't think that we would...we would turn Section 8 vouchers away at all.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: How about the project vouchers, which is, as you know, they're specific to your project?

MS. PULMANO: So, my understanding, when I was on the Hawai'i Housing Public Authority Board, project-based vouchers are awarded through either the County--because a county gets...gets an allocation of...of Section 8 vouchers, as well as the State--and they have to award those vouchers to a project. We have not gone out or talked about that on our financing. I mean, we...we can go try to seek those out. But again, we're...we are open to Section 8 vouchers.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I just...I just want to see if you'd consider it. It sounds like you're open, so thank you very much for responding.

MS. PULMANO: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. Any other questions for Ms. Pulmano? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: A couple of things I just wanted to verify. You've gone through SHPD?

MS. PULMANO: We have. We have no historic effect.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, that's not going to be a holdup. And you can use the full 25 million in this fiscal year?

MS. PULMANO: We can.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And the subdivision process, you don't need to go to the State?

MS. PULMANO: We don't.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then, I did want to clear up, some folks had said that as a requirement of building the tech park, 100 affordable homes were required, and that has been in noncompliance to this day. If we give the 25 million for this project, does

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

that go to satisfying a requirement that they already have, or is that going to be a separate 100 affordable housing that we're already owed, not counting this ones, and these won't apply for workforce housing credits?

MS. PULMANO: That was a really good question. So, your concern really is about us trying to double-dip, basically.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's the theme of Lāhainā, where we're told every day, no double-dipping.

MS. PULMANO: Sure. So, what I can say is that, from my understanding, I wasn't there during...I wasn't working for the company, and I certainly wasn't there when the Council was contemplating Maui Research Technology Park, which we've rebranded to Lipoa. But my understanding is that during the deliberations, there was discussion about affordable housing, and how the company would satisfy that affordable housing. And there was a discussion about, was it going to be for-sale or for rental? And at that time, rental was...was really needed, or...or felt like it was needed at that time. So, that's why that condition is there. It doesn't necessarily mean that we have to do 100 rentals, plus we have to meet 2.96, just that in the meeting of 2.96, 100 of those have to be rentals, and that was...that's my understanding. So, we've been always going through with that as...as our understanding.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then, is it your understanding--someone had told me, and I don't know the truth of it or not because I haven't seen the emails that was referenced--that former Director McLean would send noncompliance letters to GBI because no workforce housing has been created that is tied to the creation of the--what is it called?--tech park?

MS. PULMANO: The Maui Research Technology Park. I have not seen any noncompliance letter for...or email on that. And we...and to be honest, we haven't really built anything yet. Now we are in mass grading, and so we're building now.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then the other thing I had heard about the process, points were scored lower because it's a 25-year affordability in exchange for 25 million. Could it be in-perpetuity affordability?

MS. PULMANO: Yeah, we would commit to that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I like that. And then I guess the only other thing, like before we vote or whatever, or whenever it's finalized, second reading...first/second reading, if we know about also not...not applying for workforce credits for...in exchange for the 25 million?

MS. PULMANO: So, you're basically...we're...we're going back to the whole double...double-dipping. I would say that we would like to meet our affordable housing requirements with the 2.96. I mean, of course, we would love to get credits because that helps our overall project. But our main concern would be that we satisfy the

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

condition of the 100...100 rentals in our condition.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I'm not super clear, but we can probably talk offline.

MS. PULMANO: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez, then Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Aloha, Ms. Pulmano.

MS. PULMANO: Hi.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your testimony, and for being with us this week. My...I'll make my statement, and then I'll make my question. So, I don't...I don't support having any of the projects named in the affordable housing list. As I've stated multiple times, my past practice has been to leave the funding in there, and to delete the names until we, as a Council, have an opportunity to go through each of the projects, and have all those approvals in writing...because talk is cheap. Talk is not enforceable. So, my question is, is there any other approvals that would need to come to Council in order for this project to be built?

MS. PULMANO: No.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. My clarifying question is about the rents. When I looked at the rents. and I thought they were high, but then I asked further questions, they include utilities?

MS. PULMANO: They do include utilities.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, that's water, sewer, electric?

MS. PULMANO: Electric will be metered separately. Water, sewer, R-1 water because we do have R-1 water available there. So, the way how I understand it is that there is a HUD allocation for utilities, and the rate that...let's call the...the County affordable rents are, say, 2,000, and the...the HUD utility rate is \$200. So, for us, we would be charging \$1,800 for those...for the rents, and they have the \$200 to meet their utility bills. That's how I understand it.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, thank you for the clarification because that...that helped me understand that this is how much I got to pay each month, but it includes these other items too, besides just the rent.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. PULMANO: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you very much. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you for being here again. I feel like you've been here the whole week. So, my question is, the concern that our Council has with the cost, and...and the concerns that some of our Members have. If you didn't need the 25 million, you wouldn't even have to come here, right?

MS. PULMANO: Right. If we didn't need it.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MS. PULMANO: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, if you didn't have to come here, and the Council decided that they did not want to fund my priority, what would happen to your project?

MS. PULMANO: We would seriously have to take a look at it not being affordable, or not as many affordable units. So, Council Chair Lee asked a great question of me the last time. Why...why did we start if we didn't have all of our funding? Because one, we...we could stop, but also we could change direction. We're at a very pivotal point in our development right now is, do we provide affordable homes, or do we go market, or a portion of that? So, this funding helps us take that path of providing affordable homes.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. Any other questions? Member Sinenci? Okay. I think we're good.

MS. PULMANO: Okay. Thank you guys for so much for your time. I really appreciate you guys having some discussions about this, and it just gives me hope. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Oh, one moment.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Before...before we vote on the funding, we're...we can iron out that double-dipping thing, right? Or can we?

MS. PULMANO: Sure. I guess if what you're asking me, what's more important to me, the credits or the...the 100 to meeting our...our condition, I would say that we would want to meet our condition first. And if we have to forego credits, then we could forego credits.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. PULMANO: But please don't do that.

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Don't forego credits? Oh.

MS. PULMANO: But I understand if you want to.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Main thing, you understand what I want to do.
. . .*(chuckling)*. . .

MS. PULMANO: Yes, I...I do understand.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No other questions. Okay. Thank you, Ms. Pulmano. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Zhantell Lindo, to be followed by Stacey Vinoray.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, I think there might be tech issues. We can go with the next testifier.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Next testifier, we'll try again.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, then the next testifier is Stacey Vinoray.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning, Stacey.

MS. VINORAY: Good morning, Councilmembers, Chair. Great to be here again. I just wanted to say, my name is Stacey Vinoray. I am an employee of the County. I'm here on my own time. I appreciate you folks allowing testimony. I'm in total support of you guys on Bill 49 if you added the EAs because they work so hard. I didn't see them on the bill, so I didn't know that the...you know, the raise would cover them as well. I just saw, like, other, you know, or employees of OCS. But yeah, we keep forgetting they're...they're a huge part, right? So, yeah. Give your EAs the raises they deserve. My only pilikia was that, you know, different jobs require different, you know, levels of experience, technicality, you know, doing research is really tough. So, just seeing the across the board was just like super shocking. I do feel that, yeah, there is a disparity of the wages, but is it just across the board because you want to do it that way, or you're looking at it, are they doing that job well, and you want to reward them? So, kind of look at it that way. I heard about the union vote yesterday, and it was so sad. I don't know if it was announced, but I think they...you know, they okayed like a 3 percent or 3 point-something percent increase. And that kind of hits you, right? So, just feel that. Feel it for the rest of the employees when you make your decision. And gosh, you know, OCS is a great place to work. I loved my time there. And...and again, I have a different perspective. So, I hope you, you know, accept that. It's not a negative. It's to say that, yes, there are some people in your department that deserve it, and that's all. Okay?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Good morning, and good to see you, Ms. Vinoray. So, clarifying your question is, you know, you...you said we should support our EAs as well, and I totally hear where you're coming from. And how about our clerks, and supplementing their...their pay as well? Because they...I find that their pay is one of the lowest.

MS. VINORAY: So, look at...absolutely. I mean, are you talking about like the County clerks, or the...the Clerk's Office? Absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

MS. VINORAY: I mean --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

MS. VINORAY: -- during elections, you should see them work.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right?

MS. VINORAY: I mean there's...you cannot...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. VINORAY: Okay. Well, from afar. But ask the rest of your department how hard the Clerk's Office works. As a testament, they are a well-oiled machine, and we need to keep them. Keep them.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I hear you. Thank you for your testimony, Ms. Vinoray.

MS. VINORAY: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair.

MS. VINORAY: Thank you. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. No further questions. Thank you. Nice seeing you, Stacey. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, there is no one else signed up to testify. If we could go back to...oh, there, I see Ms. Lindo --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: There she is.

MS. MACDONALD: -- popping up right now.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. LINDO: Hi. Aloha. Thank you, Chair Sugimura, and my favorite Council. So, I can be number one someday. I aspire to be the number one testifier. But mahalo nui, I'm testifying on my own behalf, and on my own time. And I wasn't going to because I...you know, I...I felt like you guys are being held to listen to so much testimony. But I couldn't sit here and not take the opportunity to publicly acknowledge the foundation of every legislative decision and ability that this Council has by the hardworking OCS Staff. And it's true that individual personalities and all that kind of stuff can make one difference in the way we work together, and what we do...and sometimes take time to find the right team and the right niche. But...but all in all, the kind of work that is done here, and the kind of requirements and...and just personal integrity and commitment that it takes to be a worker in the Office of Council Services is...is something that you cannot just find. They're all diamonds in the rough, for real. And I think the biggest thing that I wanted to highlight is that we're always making this pitch to hire professionals and give good wages so we can attract these...these professionals, and...and people come and go in and out of our workforce. But there are some of us, some of them, who work in OCS that we're going to live here forever, whether you pay them the higher wage or not. They're not leaving. They stay, and they endure, and they withstand, and they put their best foot forward to do everything that they can. And they endure everything because they not leaving. They're one fixed part of Maui County. They're one fixed part of the workforce, and they dedicated to all this stuff. And as somebody who can see the ins and outs of what goes on in this amazing work tank of all of you, and...and the miracles and things you guys do for this community, I know that it would not be possible with all these women. So, I just want to publicly acknowledge my appreciation for OCS. Whether this bill passes or not, they deserve to be acknowledged for the work that they do, and for the commitment that they have to this County and to the people. They're a quiet workforce that is never acknowledged, and that is never highly highlighted when great bills are passed, or resolutions, or landmarks, or mountain moving, but they still come to work, and they still do their job. And I also want to speak to the idea that whoever is leading the charge in being against Bill 49, and using the a'ama crab division tactic of saying that, you know, one person deserves it more than the other...I think...I think that's really one junk way of trying to uplift and empower people. Everybody deserves one better wage. The hardship for you guys is trying to figure out how we make that happen for everybody. And so, I just wanted to end with a quote by Robert S. Schuller that says, problems are not a stop sign, they are guidelines. And right now, we have one opportunity for set up some guidelines to empower our people, to lift them up to one place. And it has to start somewhere. And I don't know, I mean, I'm amazed at what you guys do. So, I trust your decisions, and I truly do see how hard you guys work. And I...and I . . .(timer sounds). . . honor that by the support that I give you. But I do support Bill 49 in some creation, and I know you will figure it out. But mahalo to our OCS Staff, and mahalo to all of you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Anybody have questions for Ms. Lindo? Seeing none. Okay. Next testifier. Thank you.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, there's currently no one else who has signed up to testify. I see someone approaching the podium.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MR. LAW: Thank you, Clarissa. O wau (*phonetic*) Jasee Law. Aloha ka'aha O ke kalana O (*phonetic*) Maui. Aloha, Maui County Council. Aloha, *Akakū*. Thank you for broadcasting across the airwaves. The coconut wireless is kind of slow sometimes. And maybe more people are watching during prime time since you all been working late. Mr. Ambassador is so tired I probably could have smuggled in some cardboard today without him seeing. So, yes, to Bill 49, and big brother David. And I got some good news for Director of Solid Waste, Shayne Agawa. I saw a truck this morning across the street at the Wailuku Library, and they were dropping off a cardboard recycle bin. So, it's working. Thank you for the bully pulpit here. And...and across the street over there, though, I heard earlier during the budget session that the Kaahumanu Church guys are looking for some financial assistance. So, I just wanted to call to your attention that I think the clock has stopped over there.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any questions for the testifier? Seeing none. Thank you. Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, the next testifier is Junya Nakoa.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning.

MR. NAKOA: Yessah, good morning. Good morning, good morning, good morning. Happy Aloha Friday. Suck 'em up day. Okay. Guys, first things first, I think I went talk about the projects, yeah, the Lipoa and the West Maui one. I told you guys about...I told you guys, hey, no forget Lāhainā, but I just heard about the Lipoa. They...they like double-dipped. We're tired of your double-dipping, okay. We going give you money, and then they still, they take credits. That's...that is screwing...I tell you right now, I'm against credits as a...as a whole. Okay? I think the credits does not help, does not work. Okay. And then now we're going to give you guys money and credits? You know what? I'm trying...eh, I'm gonna throw this out there. Trying to work this thing out with this...I know the thing was brought up to the...that other development, the Wailea one, and I making...I try to get them for commit to not doing the double-dipping. Okay. Because I tired...I'm sick and tired. We're losing so much houses here in Lāhainā because of the double-dipping thing. Okay. So, Lipoa, only one or the other. No more go get...no more go take two...two slaps and then da kine, leave us with nothing. The other one is Bill 49. I don't really know about 'em, but it sounds like it's going to give some...somebody some raises and all that. You guys know how I feel about that, I testified at the West Maui meeting. Okay. All I'm gonna say is, this is a start. Yeah, it's a start. You know, no forget, eh, because as much as I keep on bringing up the Park and Recreation, the Public Works, firemen, and all da kine, even those buggahs inside that office, inside that 8th Floor, and the clerks. Boy, they got to deal with Junya every time they come over here and talk stories like that. So, I think they deserve a big raise...nah, only a joke. But all I'm going to say is, do it right. You know what I mean? Take care, it's a start. Let's take care, let's no forget about the housing of our...our County workers, too. That's one big one, gang. That's one big one. If we get housing for those County workers, will be bad okole. Okay? Bad okole. Okay. That's all I get. Okay. See...pretty soon, 12:00. You guys have a good day.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Any questions for Mr. Nakoa? Seeing none. Thank you.

MR. NAKOA: Yessah. Beer-thirty.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next testifier.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, there is currently no one else who has signed up to testify. Would you like me to do a last call?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, please.

MS. MACDONALD: If somebody would like to testify in the Chamber, please let Staff know, or on Microsoft Teams, please raise your hand. This is final call...three, two, one. Chair, it appears that nobody wishes to testify.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. Members, with your permission, I want to close public testimony and receive written testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

. . . CLOSE PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you very much. All right. So, I wanted to, well, thank everybody for all the interesting testimony we had this morning. It's very good. I wanted to open up the floor for you to ask any outstanding questions you may have related to real property tax, and this will be provided to the Budget Director to get us in preparation for when we...when we do the RPT calculations later today. So, does anybody have any questions, and you can send it over to Budget Director? Yes, Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't...I don't think I have a budget question, but HSAC meets at 12:00, and if either me or Member Sinenci isn't there, then they won't have quorum.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we will definitely make that lunch so that you can go. Is that what you're saying?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Adjourn by . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Adjourn by. That's the dream come true. That's the...that's the wish. Okay. So, anybody...anybody has more than that, if anybody has any real property tax questions, please send it. Oh, okay. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. And I can jump on the HSAC if we go over so that Member Paltin can remain if we go over. But we did send in Finance questions, I believe it was last year...I mean, excuse me, last...the other week, you had another deadline, so is this another opportunity to...to send in another Finance question?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, to...regarding real property tax, right? We're not doing priorities or anything. Just in case you had any questions for real property tax --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: For Finance.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- we wanted to send to the Budget --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Director, and then, you know, have...so they'll have enough time to answer your questions while we're proceeding on with our meeting until we get to RPT this afternoon. Understand?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you.

REAL PROPERTY TAX

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And all of you got from the RPT calculation, calculator thing, so that you can use that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What...what number is that on Granicus?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do you have that, James?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. So, that's...apologies, just pulling it up real quick. The letter number is FN-14. The Granicus number is 206.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...gosh, I'm losing my voice. It must be I'm talking too much. All right. So, that's it. So, I'm going to...what I'm going to do is I'm going to take a recess so you can all take a break. We'll come back here at 11:00. Is that all right?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah? Okay. Thank you very much, everybody. We'll see you at 11:00.
...*(gavel)*...

RECESS: 10:51 a.m.
RECONVENE: 11:14 a.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ...*(gavel)*... Thank you, everybody. Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It is now 11:14. So, Members, at this time, what I wanted to do, based upon the testimony that we just heard from Mr. Bigley, Mr. Fischer, as well as Managing Director, I wanted to entertain...go back to a revisit for

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

Member Kama's priority under the Affordable Housing Fund, and...and then move to Countywide. Member Kama.

REVISITS

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Let me look for my notes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do you know what page it is?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I got it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you got it? Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I move to add a new condition for up to 25 million for a grant to the Lipoa Investments, LLC for an affordable rental housing development in Kihei.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Kama, second by Chair Lee. Discussion.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, I just want to say, first of all, thank you for all the discussion that went here on the floor this past week, I guess I can say that, and for all of the discussion had gone on, and everybody's willingness to collaborate on this project to...depending upon what we decide here, whether it will go through or not. And so, at this point, after all the discussion, I would just ask the Members to support my priority. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Just to...before I turn it over to Members for questions, according to Managing Director, 10...10 million is from Carryover/Savings, 3.9 million from Carryover/Savings, 10.4 million from Affordable Housing Fund, and 7 million...sorry, 700,000 also from the Affordable Housing Fund, which makes the 25 million. Members have questions? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I can be...mahalo, Member Kama, for your proposal. So, I can be supportive of the funding portion, but not conditioning the development project named in the Affordable Housing Fund. Is that your motion?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: To name it? Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, your mic.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh. Oh, sorry. Yeah, the mic...your mic.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Your mic.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I'm so sorry. So, in my proposal, it has the name, and you're asking to remove the name?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Correct.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: As long as we can figure out and to understand that this is for those guys.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: How do we determine that?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: In Council. This is our only opportunity to make that determination. Because they won't come back for any other approvals.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And I know you're committed to having the...the project's named in the Affordable Housing Fund --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- in the HLU Committee, so that we can ensure no double-dipping. We can ensure that the AMI levels are as they said.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We can ensure that the conditions of what is presented in Committee to Council is enforceable because it's in writing. And so, I can be supportive of the funding, but I...I...I would ask that we not name the development. And then when we...after, you know, the budget is adopted, that the...the Administration has the power to amend the operating budget. And we've done this in almost every past budget year. We've removed the...the names of the developments that have not come before us so that we have the opportunity. Because most projects, they're just...once they get the funding, then that's it. They don't --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: They're gone.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- they don't need to come to Council ever again, unless they want to ask for more money. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That's your discussion. Any other? Chair Lee.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I think, you know, I can understand the reasoning for the request, but I have difficulty with this. Because this is quite a leap of faith here. You know, our full intention is the money for a particular project. And I can't understand why conditions can't be attached to the Affordable Housing Fund today or tomorrow. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? So, Member Kama, based upon the matrix, right? So, you're saying add the following condition: up to 25 million must be for a grant to Lipoa Investment, LLC, for an affordable rental housing development in Kihei.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right. But...but I just found out that it's Lipoa Apartments, LLC --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- not investments.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I just got that now.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, apartments?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Apartments, yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: LLC?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, that's...that's the motion.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: That's what it is.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. To Chair Lee's question, yesterday, when we discussed the district funds about having the condition for consultation and approval, and that is not legal. That's the...the same things. Like we...we cannot put conditions to have...condition that money on future approval. Once we approve it, that's it. The operations portion of the budget is not...we don't have the authority to make any amendments, or to condition approvals, is...is my understanding. And, you know, if...if you don't want to take my word for it, you can ask one of the attorneys.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, let's ask. Because I can't see why we can condition the project from the Affordable Housing Fund to be, let's say, affordable in perpetuity, was one suggestion, and anything else the Members want to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- add.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I...I guess I want to ask Ms. Toshikiyo. There. Good morning.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes, Chair. Thank you. Good morning. I'm still trying to wrap my brain around this because I think the... . . .*(chuckling)*. . . the concern is that you would like them to at least do a presentation, and have the...sorry, I'm going to think out loud, the discussion with the Council, but they are not required to obtain any more Council approvals on this specific project. So, I think the Members are right in that you have conditioned funding, but I don't think that you can condition the funding on Council's approval of the future funding because this will be your approval process now. I suppose that you could say that the funding is conditioned upon the developer providing a presentation, and allowing discussion and deliberation in the future, but then that would satisfy the condition, even if the Council, at that point, did not want to support this project any longer. Because they would still be in the budget, and that condition would be satisfied. I think I would need a little bit more information on what types of conditions you would want to put if you are naming the entity, and I think that I would then...would like to confer with OCS Staff to kind of craft some language that would be legal, and meets the Council's intention on this funding.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have conditions if she's asking for them, but at the appropriate time. I don't want to jump the line.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Ms. Toshikiyo, so you're...actually just want to hear what the Members would like to see as conditions, and then you'll get back to us after you have time to think about it?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes. I think I'm looking for a little bit of clarity on if there was a condition on Council's approval, what type of approval are you...are you asking for? Because as we know, the actual project itself already has all of its approvals.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Sinenci, then Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I, too, would be supportive of putting the funding back into the Affordable Housing Fund without...without naming it, and...and I understand that Director Mitchell has a process. I want to respect their process. And then, of course, Mr. Nishita said that Lipoa was going to be the next one on the list, so kind of know that it'll be for the...it'll be the next one on the list, especially if we're just

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

giving a grant to Kaiāulu O Nāpili. So, I can be supportive of that, Chair, at this time. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you're saying the project in the Affordable Housing Fund, and without a name? Is that what you just said? Without naming it? Is that you said? Okay. Next, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, this is for Ms. Toshikiyo. If she wanted to know what kind of conditions we're looking at. For me, my condition would be, you know, affordable in perpetuity as opposed to 25 years, and whatever language you need, like affordable and affordable again, and then affordable again. And then no double-dipping in the form of...out of the 175 proposed affordable apartments, 1...100 of those would be to satisfy the condition of the development of the park, tech park, and 75 of those left over would be to comply with 2.96 for the 300 market they have planned in the area. So, no credits...I mean, no double-dipping.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Done? Chair Lee, then Member . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. I suggest that we continue this discussion after lunch, after Deputy Toshikiyo has an opportunity to speak with our OCS Staff, et cetera. I cannot understand why we cannot condition funding, you know, as part of our job. And so, for it to be deferred, and then the...and...and with a nameless project, that's too much of a risk. You know, now is the time. All the effort to find the money, and then don't put a name on it? I think that's too much of a risk.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And if --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- we go that route, everybody has to have a chance because only I said condition. So, I don't want to be like the condition hog.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I'm planning on doing that. I'm trying to do that. All right. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I'll join in on this condition though. So, I...I...I want to make sure that the project has 25 percent of their units be eligible for project vouchers, or Section 8 vouchers, individual Section 8 vouchers. So, that's really where I was going with my condition, is to have them use a certain percentage, and my percentage recommendation is 25 percent for Section 8 vouchers. That way, it'll...it kind of...we look at the cost of these units, they are kind of high, but with a Section 8, the developer can get paid, and the renter can actually rent them at a reasonable rate. So, that would be my condition. Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Shoot, and can I add on no paid parking, and that there needs to be...if not in-unit laundry, that there needs to be laundry facilities?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Like a laundry facility?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If...unless they...they're going to give everyone their own laundry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, that is...anybody else? Member --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Chair. I think I got the question answered, that they...these are rentals and not for-sale. Unlike my colleagues, I did not meet with the developers to know the details of the project. As you all know, I am a proponent of open and public meetings, so that the public has an opportunity to learn about the project, not just me and my private office. I...I guess a condition would be...that we usually put on is that...that it would be as...comply with as close to what is presented to the Council. I don't have that language, but that's usually a condition that we...we put on there. So, I would want that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, comply with what the developer has said to the Council, is that what you said?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, in a --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like comply with --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- future Committee meeting.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- the developer's representations, probably to the Housing Committee as well as the Council because they...they vetted it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, just not right now, in testimony. That's not what I mean. Like a full...like presentation in Committee, not in testimony.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, this would be a future meeting. Okay. Anybody else? Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. I'm in support of the project. What I heard was that they would change from 30 years affordability to in...in-perpetuity, and I assume that would be with the AMI at the now and future. Yeah, I kind of like...I understand that...I kind of understand, but also it's like this project is ready to go. I think it's...we're...we're going to...the Managing Director vaguely discussed it, apparently felt that it was viable, and had legs to...to happen. They didn't go out of their way and do all of this for any other reason except for the fact, in my opinion, that this is a housing project that is going to come online relatively soon by a developer that's not going to come back and ask for any more money. That is ready to build. And instead of being market homes, this is going to be affordable rentals in-perpetuity in an area that has a lot of housing...a lot of jobs. So, I'd like us to make an amended (*echoing*) ...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Now you're not echoing. Member Cook, are you done?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'm done.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I'm...I'm happy to support this project. I'm happy to support it being named as well. I completely understand Member Paltin...I mean sorry, Rawlins-Fernandez's concern, though, considering she hasn't had a time to meet with them, and she would prefer it in an open meeting. I totally get that. For me, the reason why I'm okay to name this project is, I appreciate Mr. Bigley's move. I will say it's not his call, though, but I...I would prefer to actually not defund that project, and figure out how we could move things around. But if that's what works for him, then you know, Member Rawlins has a flight to catch at noon. I'm just joking. But this is a...this is a well-vetted establishment. These com--this...this home provider--because I don't say developer--they're really a part of our community in every way, sense of the form. And I trust them to do exactly what they presented to us. Not only do they have to see us today, but they will see us tomorrow, maybe, and maybe next week, maybe next month. They live among us, and I don't think they would misrepresent what they're trying to do...not today, or not tomorrow. I do appreciate that this project is ready to go vertical ASAP. And we can have heads in beds sooner than later in a time when we really do need housing, which is why I support all the other housing projects as well. I think laundry is absolutely critical, so I can appreciate that. I'm okay with Member Paltin's conditions. I do wonder about the percentage requirement for Section 8 for Member Johnson. Not that I don't want them to have Section 8, but my question is, what if we don't have enough people apply? And then 25 percent of that--because it's supposed to be reserved for certain criteria, and we don't have enough people, then those are vacant units. So, I'm just wondering if there's another way we could make that make sense. But otherwise, I'm happy to support this project, and I look forward to having more affordable homes and affordable rentals in our community. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, thank you. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just have to say, to the point of these folks being accountable in our community, these are the same folks that got the original entitlements for Pulelehua. So, if we believe and support them, and Pulelehua is not going forward, I don't know what to say. I mean, they can sell it, same like they sold Pulelehua, I guess, you know? I mean, so credibility in that case, it doesn't mean much if Pulelehua doesn't go forward. Because they lived and worked in our community in West Maui. They got the entitlements. I mean, I still hear workers from Kapalua, I was on the list, I went to that charrette in 2007, where is my housing? So, just making that point, like developers' credibility only goes so far as long as you know the history, and...and we're still waiting for Pulelehua. So, that's all I got to say.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I would like the words of Member Cook also a condition, that if the representation is that there will be no further requests for money, that that be a condition.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. If you go on Zillow or Craigslist...well, mostly Craigslist, I should say, whenever people are looking for apartments, there's a lot of no Section 8 voucher. That's...I don't even know if that's legal, but I see a lot of people doing that as landlords. To have a project that...that accepts Section 8 vouchers, that allows...that's a winner...win for everybody. I really don't think there's going to be folks who...or like the developer can't find folks who have a Section 8 voucher. I've...I've gotten calls in the past for someone who has a Section 8 voucher, and they just couldn't find a landlord willing to take them on. And I think that is...when we talk...like when I was first learning about affordable housing--as you know, it's very complicated--individual Section 8 vouchers is different than a project-based Section 8 voucher, where developers or builders say, this project accepts Section 8 vouchers. And, you know, the percentage is debatable. That's why I...I originally was saying 50, but understanding that, okay, let's be...you know, I'm willing to move, I'll go 25 percent. That way, I'm...I'm really confident that the folks who have a Section 8 voucher in-hand can go to this place. Because the individual landlords are blocking these folks out. To have a space where they can say, this project accepts Section 8 vouchers, is...is, I think, a good thing for our community because obviously there's a huge demand. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anything else? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Again, since I didn't meet with the developers, I don't know the finances of it, if...if someone can enlighten me. Because I wasn't planning to put the name, so I wasn't going to go into deliberation in...in public testimony. That's why I don't want to put the developer name, so that we can deliberate on this. But since I...I feel like I'm being forced at gunpoint here, I'm going to vote no --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- but, you know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, are you asking for the total development costs, or that kind of...what are you asking for?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, the stuff that we usually talk about in...in committee.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The public deserves to know.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we are in...I don't know, Members, you want Leilani Pulmana [sic] to come back and...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Then who would have that information?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Well, I mean, if you don't know the answer to this question, how are you, with integrity, putting this in there?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I have the folder in my office, so...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Well, if somebody...I guess, if we...when we come back from lunch, if someone can share that publicly, please.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I really don't think that would be a good condition, requiring the developer, or the property owner, to accept Section 8 tenants. Because it should be done on a case-by-case basis. Every tenant is different. And so, you...I don't think you can take away that, you...we shouldn't take away the right of the tenant...I mean, of the property owner, and force that person, property owner, to take tenants that may not be actually, you know, qualified for...for those premises.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Interesting.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Point of information, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: If you guys recall, a project that comes before us quite often is Coach Atherton's project. And he came in one time, and it was just literally a, hey, would you accept Section 8...Section 8 vouchers to your project, and he said yes, and he was there with all his lawyers. So, you know, it's not unheard of for us to ask a builder to do it, and especially with, you know, someone like Coach Atherton, who wants...wants to see his project go forward, they agreed to it. I don't think that's asking out of bounds for us. So, just letting everybody know that, you know, other...other builders have. Thank you, Chair.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm talking about a requirement. You know, I think most property owners would be happy to consider those with vouchers, and it's on a case-by-case basis, you know. It shouldn't be part of a condition. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member U'u-Hodges [sic], then Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. I actually...I just have a question for Member Johnson about this. So, when...when we have done other apartment buildings like this, let's say the one over here by Foodland, or even the Atherton project that you just mentioned, is it a percentage requirement that you required, or did you ask them to accept it? Because I...I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right. Well, my understanding was...is that when we asked them on the floor, would your project be open to...to project-based vouchers? You know, there's...there's individuals, and then there's the project --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- based, so...

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: That part I understand.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: He was for the...doing it for the project. But I...I don't think that stops them from taking individuals, it's just a place --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- that takes on Section 8 vouchers. So, I...I mean, 25 percent is my proposal. If you guys want to go less, down to 10 percent, I'm willing to hear it. But I want to have a place that says this place takes them. Because these folks, they're struggling, and they --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- and they have it in hand.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: No, and I don't disagree. I'm just trying to figure out what percentage, if any, would be best. Like, have we put on a percentage condition to --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- another --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, I hear...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- project, and do we have information on how that's working out? Like, if we put on a 25 percent condition--or a 50, as you were originally thinking--and if that's the case, are they full? What's it like? We haven't?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: We have not, but --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- I know builders would certainly...you know, like Coach Atherton was mentioning, they --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- certainly would consider. You know, remember what the Section 8 voucher does. Some of the concerns, and we all hear it, is that the...the...the rents are really high. With a Section 8 voucher, it solves that issue.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: No, I get that.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, that's where I'm...I'm trying to --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: No, I get that.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- find that place for them.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I do. The only reason I'm concerned is not the Section 8 issue at all. That's not my concern.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: If it's empty, you mean?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: My concern is that if we put on a requirement--and I know this is probably...you're not the person I want to use this example to--but like when we couldn't find anybody to sit on our CRC from Lānaʻi, and it remained empty. I just don't want to have an empty room.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: That's all. Not that I...I completely hear you on Section 8, I'm just trying to figure out how we can ensure that all of it is rented out, and we don't...we don't have vacant rooms. That's all.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: How about...how about we do it like within three...you know, six months, you know, if you can't find one, then fine, go on to...you know, give them a time limit. We do that quite often. If you can't find an AMI at this level, then you can go a little higher. I mean, that's for-sale units, but certainly, if we could give them a bit of a time, if this unit remains empty for three months, then you...you don't need to have a Section 8 voucher. But, you know, I'm trying...help me help them. You know what I

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

mean? Like let's help the folks who have the voucher in-hand. That's...that's really where I'm trying to go. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I believe the testifier answered the question, that they would be willing to take Section 8. And similar to one of my colleagues, as far as this...this meeting here, and the...and the...the commitments being made, or the conversations are being recorded, and this...basically, this is what people will be, you said this, this is what we expected, this is what we approved. So, I think that addresses the Section 8 issue. My hesitancy to put numbers and percentages, et cetera...I understand. Because we're wanting to make that happen, but I think too often, it also just makes it more bureaucratic and problematic. And...I mean, we...we should...we're going to...this project is going to move forward as an affordable rental in perpetuity with a--I think it's about \$137,000 per room, I don't know the exact amount--a buy-down to make this condition for the community function. And comparatively to other ones in the past, it's not that expensive. So, we have a lot of work to do today, and I would very...I would very much like to...I am supportive of Member Kama's proposal. I heard the testifier. I would definitely hold them accountable to what they said. I believe that they are authorized by the company to come before us, make this request, and be held to the agreements.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, my last thought on this.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- so...so...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That's my...that's...I'm done.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'd like to move on.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: My last thought on is, if we are putting in 25 million, then certainly, we should be able to have a say, right? And the say that I'm trying to say is that please include --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Take Section 8.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- some Section 8 folks.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's it. You know --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- 25 million, I...we're...we're at the table. We should be able to have a say on that. So, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Any other...so these are thoughts for conditions that we're going to ask Ms. Toshikiyo to look at, and then after lunch, she can come back and give us some kind of determination. Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, in this...thank you, Chair. I just wanted to respond to Member Johnson. I think Ms. Pulmano said they're open to Section 8, but...I mean, if 100 people come with Section 8, they're open to all of that. If only 50 come, they're open to that too. The issue with Section 8 is, I think, the eligibility requirements to be...to receive a Section 8 voucher is at 50 percent below AMI. And if this project is for those who are --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Missing middle.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- what we call the middle...the gap, right?--which is your 81 to 140...120 percent, they may not...I'm not sure. But it depends on their...the entire household of that voucher holder, right? So, I'm not sure. But the fact that they were open to having HUD vouchers, whoever can qualify should get in there. I support that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you, Member Kama. Anything else? All right. So, what we're going to do then is, cumulatively, I...I'm going to guess that Ms. Toshikiyo was listening. Staff, did you keep track of that, and could you send to Ms. Toshikiyo? Yeah? Okay.

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you, Chair. We're planning to confer with her during lunch.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. And so, what I'm going to do is, I'm going to...it's now 11:46, I'm going to take a recess...lunch recess, take lunch, and come back here. Do you want to come back here at...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 30 minutes?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, only 30 minutes for lunch?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'm just talking to the...the body. We have a lot of work to do today. I mean, I'm...and people have to leave. So, I'm just throwing that out there. I'll...I'll just break for lunch.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Member Paltin guys have a meeting . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, either...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'll come back when you tell me to.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Do you...you want to have a...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Feel free to proceed without me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Or Member Sinenci said he could go to that same meeting, so between the two of you. All right. So, I'm going to...it is now 11:47, so 11:45-ish. You want to come back at 12:15, and you can eat lunch in half an hour, or shall we come back at 12:30? 45?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: How about...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 12:30.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 12:30?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: It's 11:47, why don't you just come back at 12:47? That's one hour. I mean, 12:50. 12:30?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, you're in control.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Up to you guys.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: 12:45.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 12:45. Okay. 12:45, this...we're...we're in lunch recess.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It'll probably end up being 1:00 anyway.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Lunch recess. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 11:47 a.m.
RECONVENE: 1:03 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It is now 1:03, and we left off by talking about the Lipoa Apartments. And all of you had thoughts, which we had sent to, I guess she was listening, but Kristina Toshikiyo, which is our Corp. Counsel person. Mr. Hanano, I

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

know you met with Corp. Counsel, and proceed...what would you like us to do for next steps forward?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair? Point of clarification.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If...if we're going to continue talking about the Lipoa Project, can we please pronounce it correctly? It's an I, but not a short I as in English. It's a Hawai'ian word, and it's Lipoa, Lee, L-E-E poa, and not Lipoa.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Nails on the chalkboard. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Mr. Hanano.

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair. Yes. So, during the break, we did confer with Ms. Toshikiyo, and we went over the conditions that were discussed on the floor. And basically, you know, she, as well as us, you know, we need more time to solidify the...the conditions. We do have, you know, some research that needs to be done in order to finalize those.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do you have a list? Oh, here's Ms. Toshikiyo. So, you heard us. Did you need us to send you something, or do you have...or can you read to us what you're considering? And I'm trying to get this done in this budget cycle, so I don't know how much more lead time you need for research, if you could let us know.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes. Thank you, Chair. Yeah, like Mr. Hanano said, we had an opportunity to meet during the...the lunch break, and discussed Member Kama's motion that's on the floor. But before I touch upon the added conditions that Member Paltin and Member Johnson suggested...or requested, I did want to kind of touch upon what Member Cook and Member Rawlins-Fernandez was talking about, about holding the developer to the representations made in this Committee, I guess, through public testimony and...and through the...the...the questions. So, I guess...in order for the County to enforce, I guess, the representations that have been made, I guess our recommendation would be to be as specific as possible in any budget appropriation. So, for instance, you'll...and the Council has done this in the past, when you've done appropriations from the Affordable Housing Fund, to really be specific about the project. So, of course, we have to have the legal entity name, we specify if it's a grant or a loan, the amount. But also, you've included the...the unit counts, the AMIs. And that way, when it's time to actually craft the grant agreement, that all has to be consistent with the grant application, which we then incorporate as part of the grant contract so that in the future, any deviations from those specs would potentially have to go back to Council as an amendment to the budget ordinance. So...so, I guess that's my first recommendation is, in order to hold the developer to those representations, is to include it within the...the budget appropriation. And as to the added conditions, and that's something...again, I apologize, I'm not familiar with this project. On its face, I...I...I

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

would say that Member Paltin's requirement for affordable in perpetuity, as well as the free parking and the laundry, I don't know in the plans whether or not they're already offering those things, but that would probably be correct, but I would want to confirm that...yeah, I guess at this point, I'm not that comfortable speaking to the legality of something that I'm not familiar with the project. And to Member Johnson's request about the Section 8 vouchers, I did have a similar concern of what was raised about if you're setting aside, you know, 25 percent of those units, and whether or not there was a mechanism if all the units were not at that point used, will they be...be empty? Ideally, there would be a process to say like, you know, "X" amount of time, you know, what would happen next, would they be opened up? One suggestion that we came up with is to say that 25 percent of units, or up to, or at least--I wrote it funky--basically that the developer shall give preference of up to 25 percent of units for Section 8 voucher holders, or something along that line, depending on what the Council feels like. So, it'd be a preference rather than holding a certain amount of units available without a process if they're not filled. So, those are some of our thoughts, but...so yes, like Mr. Hanano said, we might need a little bit more time on some of the added conditions, but the big one was to ensure that any of the representations you want to hold the developer to, that we would include them in the budget appropriation. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you very much. I see your hand up, Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You...you did?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I thought you were...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I...I didn't. I was just hoping, since you called on me, that people just make a motion on the condition that they want, we take a vote, we go and move to the next condition, and be --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- make it as simple and efficient as that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. It...what Chair Lee suggested is one way to move forward. However, both Mr. Hanano and Deputy Corp. Counsel Toshikiyo were...we are not giving them enough time and information in order to make a determination on the legality of putting these conditions on today. So, we put them in not as good of a place. And so, some of these we won't be able to vote on...and for me, would be deal breakers. I don't...I won't speak for anyone else. I...I...I know that they feel kind of strongly about that. But, you know, to the point that Mr. Hanano, Ms. Toshikiyo have stated about, you know, like being put on this spot right now, that is why I asked for this to go to Committee, for it to not be named as a project so that we can have this discussion not on the last day of budget. Because I agree with Member Cook...before we took our lunch recess, that we have a lot to do. And we've

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

now spent all these hours talking about this one thing, which we could have just have settled in Committee. Because all those other projects that are in the Affordable Housing Fund, we can, you know, treat equally, and we remove the names of those projects, and these are all projects that the Administration wants to move forward. And so, it's...it's not like we don't have that leverage. They're going to have to come back to us and get the approval...the...the budget amendment approved by us, to add the names, to have the funding for Affordable Housing Fund. And so, I understand the concern, like with Pulelehua, where they didn't move forward, and so we...there's some, you know, nervousness about, you know, maybe the Lipoa project won't move forward the way that Pulelehua didn't move forward. But if we remove the...the project names from some of the other projects that didn't come to Committee yet, then it'll...it'll give the Council that leverage, and motivate the Administration to work together with us to, you know, get those moving as quickly as possible. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Anybody else? Okay. So, we're going to have to move forward on this, and we have a motion on the floor, Member Kama. And do we need to repeat it? Do all of you know what it is? Okay. So, this is Lipoa Apartments --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Lipoa.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Lipoa Apartments, Inc...I'm sorry, LLC. And the motion on the floor was stated by Member Kama, and for \$25 million, for up to...must be...up to 25 million must be for a grant to Lipoa Apartments, LLC, for an affordable rental housing development in Kihei. So, that's the motion; is that correct? Okay. So, the name, I got that correct. And how I want to move forward is, we understand from Administration they do support this project, so it's not like a...something that is all of a sudden appearing, and the Administration will not...I always get concerned that they will not release funds, right? So, this is being supported, and...and we did hear the funding source. I did clarify with our attorneys...where would this go? It wouldn't go in the Affordable Housing Fund. Keeping with the integrity of what we heard from Director Mitchell and Deputy Director Mata'afa...Mataava [sic], it would then go on page 10 and would be number 11 under this Department of Housing, Housing Program General, and it would be the 11th project listed here, and not in the Affordable Housing Fund. So, the next thing is, how to deal with whatever you have said that Corp. Counsel, and I guess our attorneys are saying, there may be need for more time. I want to get our budget bill done. If we could get what your...whatever you want to say in here, and--before we have first reading--then if we could hear back from Corp. Counsel to then make a decision. So, I am fine with submitting this as is. There are some items in this are conditions that you want Corp. Counsel to research, but they just said that they needed more time, so I totally respect that. So, this is what I'm thinking of how we can move forward so I can get this bill done, Bill 41. Ms. Toshikiyo, I just see you popped up.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes, Chair. Thank you. I just wanted to get some clarification of something that you just mentioned. So, I guess just to point out the difference between Affordable Housing Fund and putting this in...under the operating budget is that the Affordable Housing Fund has additional restrictions on the use of the fund. So, I just

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

wanted to point that out. Because by not placing this project and the funding in that Special Revenue Fund, then it actually opens it up, and I wasn't sure if that was the Council's intent, especially as it was originally set by Member Kama. Her request was to fund it out of the Affordable Housing Fund. It's the additional legal requirements that I just wanted to make the Members aware of.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: What are the additional...what is the difference...or explain?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Okay. So, under the Affordable Housing Fund, there are specifics on the use of fund. There's a whole long list, but for...there's a section on grant or loan requirements that the funding is tied to. So, we include that in all of our grant agreements that the...the grantee has to abide by. So, for instance, you know, requirements to submit annual reports, that the titles of any real property is held in perpetuity by the grantee unless conveyed to the County or a qualified nonprofit, that they can't distribute or redistribute grant or loan funds to other organizations without Council's prior approval. So, there are just additional restrictions, rather than putting it in the General Fund, which would make it unrestricted, other than what's in the requirements in the grant application in Chapter 3.36 of the Maui County Code.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Johnson has a question for you, but before I...so you're saying by...it's more advantageous to put in the Affordable Housing Fund, based upon what you just said?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: No, Chair, I'm not making a recommendation. That's a policy decision for this body. I'm just wanting to point out that there is a difference. Rather, it's...it's not just about where the funding is coming from, it's just that there are additional legal restrictions by placing it in the Affordable Housing Fund, which is what I believe Member Kama had originally intended.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Okay. Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. I hear the Committee's...or the Chair's recommendation that we pass it and go on to first reading, but can we do a Housing Committee before first reading, and then in that Housing Committee we can make...make conditions or amendments during...and during the first reading? But I'd like to have a discussion before, as opposed to no discussion, you know, so...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I think...oh, okay. Like the 7...we could have a 7(B) in Councilmember Kama's Committee before first reading, and then on first reading, we could make amendments if we needed to. But again, it goes back to idea, I...we got...I'd like to have a discussion and, you know, talk about this. But again, doing it now, as you know, we're jamming up our...our lawyers...and also, I'm not really fully clear on this project.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ms. Toshikiyo popped up.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Sorry, Chair. If I could punt that question to the OCS Staff. They're a lot more knowledgeable on your process than I am.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Deputy Director Kawasaki.

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you, Chair. In terms of whether you can have a meeting, you absolutely can have a meeting, or a 7(B). It just depends on what your schedules look like and if the Chair of that Committee is wanting to do that with regard to having that, and having us roll that into first reading. That is where the challenge would come about. Because we have certain posting requirements for first reading, so we would just need to know when that was happening, or if you're planning to do that as an ASF on the floor. One question that we would have is whether or not...if this project is not ready to be...you know, funds for this project are not ready to be appropriated now--we're not familiar with the project, so we don't know where it is in terms of the process. So, if that would be more appropriate for a subsequent budget, or whether or not the Administration had any intention to come down with a budget amendment for a portion of the funds. We're just not familiar with the project, so we can't, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, me neither.

MS. KAWASAKI: -- adequately comment on it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Except for a two-sheet page. So, remember, I'm trying...I'm trying to find a way, and we're spending a lot of time on this. I'm...I'm kind of out of ideas right now at this time, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. So, Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: For clarification, you are recommending that we proceed with the vote on this --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Include...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- motion --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yep.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- and then any proposed conditions be prepared for first reading...to be taken up at first reading, and then we will deal with any changes at that time. Is that what you're proposing?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yep, yep, yep.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, you're not proposing --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: A delay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- that a separate HLU meeting be set?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, if Member Kama wants to do that, that's really up to her. I'm not going to dictate that. But for today, with what we need to do, I think before us is, we want to pass this 25 million in this budget bill, add it to wherever we need to. And as far as the conditions, that whole list of conditions, that Corp. Counsel and our OCS attorneys--or Corp. Counsel, I guess--can let us know when it's in your ball cart...ballpark...with Council, on your agenda. And then if you...if you would allow us to discuss this when we take up Bill 41, if you would allow it. That's what I'm thinking.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes. I mean, I allow everything, right? But...yeah, I do.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's...it's really up to Pro Tem Kama if she wanted to have an extra meeting. It's up...that, I don't control.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I don't mind having an extra meeting. I just don't know when we're going to have it done before second reading, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: First.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: First reading? When's first reading? May 2nd; is that right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You have the exact date?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. Right now, the Committee is projecting that first reading...first reading will occur on May 16th.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Kama, it's your --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- call if you want to do that. But for us...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I think...don't I have a meeting on the 14th, James? Do we have an HLU meeting?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. Yes, that is a Committee week, so HLU does have a meeting on May 14th.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. We can do that then, could we not?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's your call.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: As long as posting and everything is done. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. All right. So, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I think my question is for Ms. Toshikiyo?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo. There. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Hey, Ms. Toshikiyo. So, I...I didn't feel like I had a long list of conditions as it was made out to be, but, you know, mines [sic] was perpetuity, 100...no double-dipping, in essence, and free parking, and laundry. I'm not speaking to Member Johnson's condition because I don't know too much about that kind of stuff, but if the developer agrees to those conditions, when the Administration writes up the residential workforce housing agreement, it could be put inside of that; is that correct?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes. So, you mean without the condition in the budget appropriation?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Either/or.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: It's just an agreement between the Administration and the developer?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I'd have to think about that one. The one that gives me the most pause to make any recommendations or...or comments on is the second condition, about the double-dipping. I've heard the concerns, but I guess I just wanted to be able go back and research what, you know, the original requirements are, and what the law states. Not necessarily the...the free parking and the...the --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Laundry.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: -- the laundry facilities because...yeah. Because for all I know, that's already included within the plans, and within their projected budgets.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I guess...I mean, for me, we can work at the speed of trust if...if...if--I mean, I'm not saying I trust the developer. I'll never trust the developer to do it in words only, any developer--but I can trust Mr. Mitchell, or I can trust Josiah, that they'll work with us on the conditions in the residential workforce housing agreement to get it in writing. Because the money doesn't get released until a residential workforce housing agreement is signed and yada, yada, right?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Correct.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I mean, I really don't want to do more sitting in meetings, but whatever. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, I'm looking at all the information that I have, which is two pages. It says 175 rental units; 54 one-bedroom, one-bath; 113 one-bedroom, two-bath; 8 bedroom...8 one-bedroom, two-bath. And then on the bottom corner, it has for households earning 100 percent AMI and below, one-bedroom for 2,000, two-bedroom for 2,400. And then households earning 120 AMI and below, two-bedroom, 20...or 3,000, and three-bedroom, 3,400. If 175 is broken down into all one-bedrooms, can someone please tell me where the two- and three-bedrooms are?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It...it says that there are two-bedrooms and...two-bedrooms and three-bedrooms, but the 175 is broken down on the left with all one-bedrooms. So, I...I don't...this...again --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- many questions.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's a typo because...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No more answers. Our attorneys are not even familiar enough with this project to be able to give us, you know, good guidance because they're not familiar with this project. I'm not familiar with this project. The public's not familiar with this project. It's irresponsible of us to...to do this, which you're trying to push us to do right now, and it's really upsetting.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Any more discussion? Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I believe that's a typo, but we could ask the people...

CHAIR SUBIMURA: To correct it.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: You don't even know.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, I do, because...because it isn't all one-bedroom. I'm an advocate of moving it forward, with the understanding that the Department of Housing, when they do the agreement, is going to dot the I's, cross the T's with the attorney. If it doesn't meet the criteria, then the funds won't be released for this project, and that I don't think anything's going to be done with lack of transparency. I personally would like to take a vote on this. I would like to move on.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: It looks like we're going to be here tomorrow too, and I'm just sort of planning on doing our principal work, which is...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: The rest of the budget.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. That's my --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- two cents.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, Members. So, we have a motion before us. Is there...oh, Member U'u-Hodgins? Sorry about that.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. Thanks, Chair. I can vote today too. I...I do think this is a typo, but I understand Member Rawlins' concern. This is a little bit confusing. To be fair, I don't know any of these projects, not one. All 13 of them, pretty much, except for a few, are relatively familiar. All of them, we'll need to discuss. I get that this one, we won't really have an opportunity to discuss completely. We can discuss it in a 7(B), or we can discuss it at first reading. I like Member Paltin's idea with working with Admin, and get what we want in the workforce housing agreement. However, I don't think I'm comfortable with the percentage appropriation to Section 8. I like that Member Johnson asked if they would accept it, and they said yes. I'm comfortable with affordability in perpetuity, one parking stall included, laundry facilities included on-site or in-unit machines. I think it's a good thing. If they said they don't need any money, and we hold them to it, I'm hoping they comply with the presentation. We can add that in as well. And the no-credit vouchers, if we can incorporate that since we've discussed that. But I'm...I'm okay to vote today. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Members...Member Sinenci, I don't see you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, he's in HSAC now. Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, you can stay. Or...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Members, are --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You want to defer this?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- are you ready to...what? I was going to ask, you're ready to vote.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, she's leaving, and so two are gone.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No, she's going to bring Member Sinenci back.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: One of them going come back.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, so you want to wait?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: They're tag teaming [sic] HSAC.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You want to take a short recess?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We can work on something else.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we'll work on something else. Okay. So, we'll put aside this...this project. We heard what your thoughts are. And then maybe Member Sinenci might have a thought on it. So, I wanted to start talking about Countywide, which is...change hats. So, it's budget bill, page 829. And Staff, you have the changes to the Countywide costs because of other amendments?

MR. KRUEGER: Oh.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Page 829...oh, I'm in the wrong section.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. Are you referencing the spreadsheet we distributed this morning?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I don't know which one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you just want everybody to look at their Exhibit 1?

MR. KRUEGER: Well, Chair, if...if...if you'd like to bring up the two priorities relating to Countywide costs?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, that's where I'm trying to get to.

MR. KRUEGER: That's on page 7 of the priority matrix.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNTYWIDE COSTS

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And one is for Member Paltin, and one is for mine, for the firefighters. So, I'm going to take this up. I think during discussions, we've...we've spoken a lot regarding Fire--this is mine, by the way, so I'm going to have to ask somebody to help me make the motion--but this is in regards to Countywide 1, number 1, adding 100...I mean, sorry, 10 million for hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association. And this would be revising the proposal to increase fringe benefits under Countywide Costs by 8 million, and conditioning 10 million for a temporary hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association. And...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good. Motion made by...thank you, Chair Lee, and second by Member Kama. And 2 million is already included in the Mayor's proposed budget, as...as...as the...I guess it was Budget Director, who said, when she came before us, that they had accommodated for the pay increases for whatever, the unions, as well as this. And so, they have 2 million in there for that. So, I'd like to...the motion is to increase fringe by 8 million and condition 10 for temporary hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire's [sic] Association, of which you made the motion. Are there any more discussion? And I think you heard...Managing Director said that they supported it, right?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Ready to vote.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ready to vote.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair, could you clarify?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yeah. So...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Number 9 Countywide, one fringe benefits.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Wait. Where is...what...what are you looking at? You're looking at this. Let me look at this.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, you're looking at the matrix?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. So, it's on page...it's on page 7 of the matrix. On the budget bill...it would be on page 8 of the budget bill.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: So, the motion...Staff's understanding of the motion on the floor is to increase Countywide Costs, number (1) Fringe Benefits by \$8 million, and then to insert a condition as follows. Up to \$10 million must be for hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Okay. You got it, Members? Okay. Let's...ready to vote, or any more discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have a...I have a question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, we don't actually know what the amount is that they're going to negotiate to, so...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, if I could, Member Paltin. So, by what Managing Director said this morning, I understand that an agreement was reached between the firefighters and the Mayor, and that has to be taken to the vote by the...by the Members. So, that...they're waiting for that. But what Member...Managing Director said was that this amount would be sufficient, based upon what they negotiated. So, he recommended this 8 million here, and then agreed that 2 million were already included in the Countywide, so total 10 million.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, because of the budgetary reasons, we cannot just say whatever is agreed-to? We cannot say that because we need a number?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Or I don't...I don't know what that is. I'm not sure.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is there...Attorneys, do you know?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We cannot just say whatever they agree to?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Do you...do you know if we can...

MR. HANANO: I think we need...thank you, Chair. I think...I think we need a number --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay.

MR. HANANO: -- in order...because we got to balance the budget.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You mean the dollar amount, right? Aren't you asking if...you want to know what the negotiated amount was?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MR. HANANO: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, I'm just saying like when they agree to it, we got to give them the money. So, I mean, we cannot know what the negotiated amount is right now because that's a secret? . . .*(chuckling)*. . . Oh. So, can we just say that, or...I mean, that number?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If it's not a secret.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I don't know how these things work. So, I'm going to call a short recess, 1:37. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 1:35 p.m.
RECONVENE: 1:41 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Very good. Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It's now 1:41, and we are talking about the...my, actually, recommendation for hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association. And Member Paltin had a question, of which--can you repeat your question? And...and Mr. Hanano will reply.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You want me to repeat my...my question was --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- do they need a dollar figure, or can we just agree to whatever the calculations come out to?

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Member Paltin. So, I think, for purposes of the budget, we do need a number. You know, if that's what your question is, we...we need to have some kind of figure in there so we can make sure that the budget is balanced. I understand what you're trying to say as far as, you know, you don't want to give more than what is the settlement amount, and I don't think we can...well, I don't think we know the settlement amount, for one, and we probably won't know it until after it's finalized.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. HANANO: But as far as the budget, we need to have a number. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we now have two attorneys...well, Budget Director, and we have Kristina Toshikiyo popped up. One of you can go first. Ms. Toshikiyo.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Hi, Chair. Thank you. Part of your motion is to increase the overall fringe benefits by \$8 million --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Correct.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: -- so that would cover whatever the agreed-upon amount is, which we don't know at this point, but according to Managing Director, should cover it. So, I think that you could condition this pot that it would be...that the agreed-upon amount would be paid for...hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. So, I have a question. So...

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I'm not sure if Budget Director has additional information.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Budget Director, and then I...I can...I can change what my...what I had said. Go ahead.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you...thank you, Chair. That's your question. . . .*(chuckling)*. . . Yes, I would agree with Kristina Toshikiyo. As long as the 8 million is added into the overall fringe benefits amount, it won't affect the balance. We don't need a specific amount named in the condition. And actually, you know, if it comes out being \$10,100,000, we would have to come back to you for an amendment, so it would allow us to pay whatever the negotiated amount is. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, just so yourself and Ms. Toshikiyo then, so I do not have to say and condition 10 million for temporary hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association. You want us to not put 10 million just in case it comes up to more than 10 million? Is that what you're saying? The 10 million, we got from Managing Director.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yes, that way it allows the flexibility. Because then if it's less than \$10 million, we're not allowed to use any of that \$10 million for anything else, so we would have to come back for a budget amendment that way if we needed it for other fringe benefit costs. So, I think if you wanted to condition it to say the negotiated amount...these funds must be used to pay the negotiated amount for the temporary hazard pay for Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association, or something like that, if that meets your legislative intent, I think that kind of condition would be fine, but I don't think there's any need to specify a dollar amount.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin, are you okay with that? Okay. Did you get that, Mr. Krueger, Miss...

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Could we have that proposed language read out one more time? Apologies.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Director?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. These funds must be used to pay the negotiated amount for temporary hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Got that? Okay. I see --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

MS. MILNER: And, you know, we'll talk to Kristine Toshikiyo to make sure that doesn't make it sound like the entirety of the funds have to be used for that purpose. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: They might like it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha, Budget Director. I have a question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, is the conditional language even necessary?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez. I defer to the body. I think at this point, the conditional language is a policy decision. We are obviously still waiting on the vote, but as Managing Director said, you know, we have come to an agreement, and obviously, if we're coming to an agreement, we do intend to pay that. But if the body would like to have that in writing in the budget ordinance, you know, that's not a problem. Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, it would not...there's no benefit or harm, is kind of pointless putting in there?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Budget Director?

MS. MILNER: I...I think it's up to the body. I won't comment on that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think that's what you said. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Chair, so you heard the Budget Director.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: There is really no point in putting the language there.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Because they're going to pay it. It's not like we have to make them do it. They're...they're going to do it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. And we're adding money.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're not adding money.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm adding in 8 million. I adding...I'm adding 8 million.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, she said we're not adding money.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: There's 2 million in the pot, as they indicated when they came before us, and that the rest of the money in that pot is to pay for the raises that are going on, I think with H...HGEA, et cetera. And so, therefore, we needed to add \$8 million more to make it 10 million for the firefighters. Okay. Okay. Members, are you...any more questions on this?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I would like Mr. Krueger to read the motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Krueger?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, our motion...our understanding of the motion is, made by Chair Lee, seconded by Councilmember Kama, to increase under Countywide Costs, Fringe Benefits by \$8 million, and to add the following condition. These funds must be used to pay the negotiated amount for temporary hazard pay for the Hawai'i Fire Fighters Association.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is this a roll call? You're fine?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: My...Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I move to amend the motion by removing the language, and just adding the money.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second for discussion. . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I already discussed it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, the amendment made by Member Rawlins-Fernandez, and Chair Lee made the second. Members, for me, this is a...well, I don't know what you're going to...a roll call, I guess. It's a roll call vote.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Discussion...because it sounds like you're confused.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm not confused.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm just removing the language.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I know.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The...the Administration is going to...to pay it out. We don't need to put the language and put a condition in there for...for nothing. It's unnecessary, and then it's confusing because you want to make it up to this much, and we're like trying to figure out...just we can add the money, 8 million, no need put the language.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That was your motion and your discussion. Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. I feel by putting the language in, although it might not be necessary for budget, would be appropriate for the general public to understand why we're including...why we're raising this particular line item. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. Whether the...whether it's specified for HFFA or not, I know what it's for, and therefore, I'm going to be recusing myself. My husband is a fireman, and I wanted to state that for the record. I think the last time we discussed the reso, I walked out of the room, and technically, I was excused. But I want to make it very clear that I'm recusing myself because this would benefit my household financially. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Any other discussion? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Member Cook has convinced me, he's persuaded me to withdraw my motion. I support more transparency, so I agree. It does --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- it does promote more transparency. So, good job, Member Cook. I withdraw my motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And...and the second.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Sinenci is back. I'm going to take a vote. You want to walk out?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You can just stay here? Okay. Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: This is nine "ayes." The motion carries.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Paltin. Oh, sorry.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yeah. Okay. So, that's eight "ayes," one...one recused.

VOTE:	AYES:	Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.
--------------	--------------	--

	NOES:	None.
--	--------------	--------------

	ABSTAIN:	Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.
--	-----------------	-----------------------------------

	ABSENT:	None.
--	----------------	--------------

	EXC.:	None.
--	--------------	--------------

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Pineapple. Okay. Next we have a Countywide discussion from Member Paltin. And this is on...regarding your...I think, Member...I think Managing Director spoke of it this morning.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to increase the Countywide Fringe Benefits by 26 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is there --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- is there a second? Okay. Member Paltin, and second by Member Keani Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, while we may not have 700 vacancies because we haven't purged old positions for the Mayor and the Council, there's hundreds of vacancies, for sure, in the full-time category, not the seasonal or...or like that. And, you know, the...the heads of the departments have received substantial raises. We're discussing substantial raises for the Prosecuting Attorneys and Corp. Counsel, some said even like up to 50 percent, as well as our own Staff and Council Services. I...I came from Unit 3. I worked in Unit 3 for a couple decades, or maybe not two full decades because I got to leave Unit 3 and go into Unit 14, and then I got a double-digit raise in percentages. So, Unit 3 has been consistently left behind. Unit 3 is primarily women, a lot of single mothers, as we heard the Secretary that just started ten months ago say. And...and to me, they've been consistently left behind. As...also, to speak a little bit to folks that haven't received the double-digit percentage increases, when you have so much vacancies, like say in your section, you're supposed to have three secretaries and you only have one, you can only earn eight hours of overtime a week. But the whole rest of the week, that workload is still there, and it's expected to get done. So, I think, you know, that needs to be looked at Countywide. And then there's also the issue of EM positions. We heard about engineers getting a bonus, and then their managers, who may also be engineers, getting paid less, and then wanting to go back down to engineers. So, like Ms. Takakura said, I don't know if a study is the way to go, but it definitely needs to be made right. And that's what this money would be for. Mr. Nishita said that he was looking at following in the footsteps of Kaua'i and taking care, I think, of the 75/25 plan, allocating a sum for people who are on their spouse's insurance, and so on and so forth, which, you know, I'm...I'm supportive of because I would like our people to be healthy and taken cared [sic] of in that way. But I...I think that's not good enough for the people who have been consistently left behind, and who work hard, administration in, administration out, and provide the continuity and the public services for our community. So, that's why I'm proposing that. I'm not sure if I did the motion and the second, or if I skipped the...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: It did.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: It did.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, that was the motion, the second, and the...my discussion.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, all in one. Okay. So, it was...your second was from Member Rawlins-Fernandez. Whose hand was up? Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. I speak in strong support of this motion. Mahalo, Member Paltin, for adding this as one of your proposals. We...well, I don't know about anyone else, but I just heard...I just learned today in testimony that there was an agreement that was struck. I don't...and that was it. I was assuming that maybe it was HGEA before the June 30th master agreement expires. And what we learned today...this year, was that in order to have a supplemental agreement, you need to have a master agreement. So, if they've come to the master agreement, then I would like us to be able to move on the supplemental agreement as quickly as possible. One of the supplemental agreement ideas that we discussed, that DPS seemed to be supportive of, was tying the cost of living here, to Maui County, which is so much higher than the other counties, so that our...our...our County civil service workers are able to continue to...to live and work here, and thrive, and not have to have multiple jobs, and have time for their families. And this is so long overdue --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- and I...I...I appreciate this proposal, and I...and I hope we can get this into the budget. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, I made a mistake. I didn't give the wording, and that was wording that I was working on with Ms. Toshikiyo. So, I would defer to her on the wording. But it was something like for a supplemental agreement for salary adjustments to the master agreement, and --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Miss...here she is.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- I'm sure she'll pop up if...oh, there she is.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: She's popped up.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Thank you. I...I think the wording...thank you, Chair. I think the wording we worked on was, up to 26 million must be for supplemental agreements to the master agreements. And I think we...I had suggested removing adjusting salaries because the supplemental agreements can cover much more than just salaries.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Friendly amendment, that's what I...that's what I said...meant. That's what I meant.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I accept that friendly amendment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, you see the motion on the floor, Members. So, did you raise your hand, Member --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Kama? Please.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I was going to say to Member Paltin how very grateful I am for you, for doing this. Because like Member Rawlins-Fernandez said, I think one of the very first meetings we had, that's when we heard from...from HGEA, and we were trying to get them to get their unions to negotiate better for them. But it's been, what?...six, almost seven years? But today, we have an answer. And it's a good one for everybody, especially if we're talking about Bill 48 and 49. But thank you. Grateful for that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And I'm sure our people will be too. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I just would love to discuss maybe a little bit of details, and what you have maybe planned for the 26 million. I am completely unsure how many people we have in Bargaining Unit 3, 4, and 13. I see you excluded E/Ps, but about how many people do you think are going to be affected by this? Oh, Ms. Toshikiyo's here.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I cannot say that, 3, 4, and 13.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, like the language --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- that Ms. Toshikiyo went with would have to be the language.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: It's more broad.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And we don't necessarily have control, but I mean, we can, each of us call up the Mayor and Josiah. Like the Mayor would have to be the entity to sign off on any agreement. I spoke briefly to Josiah this morning and told him like my intentions with what the words that you just read out said --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- and he said he's willing to look into it. So, I mean, like I said, personally, I...I can trust Josiah to do his best to...you know, I'm...I'm looking at people that have had vacancies, people who haven't had raises, double-digit raises, like how other entities or units have. When he talked to me...approached me first about what I had proposed, he wanted to do across the board the medical --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- which I was like, can we just do it for the people that have been left behind? And he's like, no, we're doing it for everyone.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then like, you know, we talked about certain departments, like Planning or the Clerks, and the Mayor's preference was to do it as a whole, rather than department-by-department. Because say...like Planning has a bunch of Planning [sic] Vs, then maybe all the Planning [sic] Vs from other departments might go over to Planning. So, that's a little bit of their concern.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, it...it is a work in progress, but it seems that Josiah and the Mayor have heard of the need to look at, you know, salaries and...and --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- as it correlates to chronic vacancies and whatnot. But since Ms. Toshikiyo is still on, I'm assuming she has something to add.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. And then I do have more questions, but let's...let's hear from Ms. Toshikiyo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Ms. Toshikiyo?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Oh, actually, sorry. It's actually...my apologies, that I wasn't clear that it was not including the...that second part of Member Paltin's original language in the matrix. So, my apologies for not making that clearer.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: No worries.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You have more questions?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I do. So, are we looking at this as a lump sum? Are...we're going to give people just like raises? Is it going to...is this money going to add to their high three? Are we going to do this again next year? What...what are we thinking like long-term, and how people might receive some of this funds?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, ultimately, I think it would have to be a discussion with the Mayor and the Managing Director as to like what me, you, or each one of us individually wants to see. But I don't think it will contribute to like their ERS benefits and things like that. And then in that case, I don't think it will contribute to their high three.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It'll be...like whatever it is would be like a lump sum. Like the medical thing, it wouldn't contribute to anything like that. Because if it's a supplemental just for Maui, we can't affect state kind of programs, which is like ERS, EUTF...or maybe not EUTF because we're giving the medical things, but we can't unilaterally increase what we're giving our employees --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- outside of collective bargaining.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. And this might be kind of splitting hairs, and I don't disagree. Like I don't want to condition this right here, right now, and I'll let Admin figure out what makes the most sense. If we do give our people lump sums, I hope we warn them to prepare for taxes when the time comes, just because we don't want them to go, oh, my God, 20 percent or something. You know, at least we can just give them a fair warning that please, you know, make this make the most sense for you, but just in case. Sometimes taxes are kind of nuts when we give people lump-sum money, but I hear you. And I appreciate this, and I'll be supporting. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And I guess too, I mean, in our discussions with the Managing Director and the Mayor, we could say, like let's withhold the taxes for people and then give it to them when it's time to pay the taxes, or...or whatever we work out. You know, like, hey, this is going to be your taxes. You better put that on the side, or something like that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? All right. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. When we had DPS before us telling us about the supplemental agreement, and we asked them what's needed to make this happen, they said money. And that's what this proposal is, the money. And then this is one...what we have control over, and then the Administration needs to take it to the finish line. They need to do the rest of it. To do the negotiations, to ensure that all those that we receive testimony from, the units that we receive testimony from, that have conveyed to us how they feel like they got left behind, that they never got the fair

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

local labor market standard, like prevailing wages, and they should be paid properly. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And...and I didn't speak to what Member U'u-Hodgins said in terms of lump sum, are we going to do this every year and...and whatnot. But in looking at one of the sheets that was provided to us by Staff, I think it said, you know, Category A...the carryover from Category A alone, even with--I don't know what kind of cuts we did in 2024--was close to like 30-something million, maybe on the higher end. And so, I guess that would be my proposal going forward, like how it looks this year, if we have that many vacancies, that we have that much carryover, that really belongs to the people that have been shouldering the work. You know, like the people that show up, and are doing the best they can, but they know that there's vacancy positions, and then the public getting mad at them because they're not fully staffed, you know, and just...so it's like you're penalizing the person that shows up. You know, like when you go to a public meeting and they say, oh, this is all the people that are here. It's like, these are the people that are here. Don't be downing them for showing up. Down all the people that didn't show up, you know? So, I think, you know, this is just a starting point, and it's not meant to be a one-time appropriation. But at the same time, it's not meant to be an annual appropriation, whereas we can work within our thing to maybe develop a system to say like if you're carrying more than your workload because of chronic vacancies, how do we address that monthly, or something like that? It would be my hope of where this goes. Because we don't want people to be...and then, you know, I don't know how that will play out. Like will they come tell their friends to help them carry the load, or will they want the money? I don't know, but I'd like to see everybody distributed an even workload for what they're supposed to do. And in some cases, I think that's part of the problem with...we got to add positions, we got to add positions. And it's like you didn't fill all the vacancies, so how do you know you got to add positions because you've never been fully staffed, you know? So, that's kind of part of the discussion about when you asked if this is going to be an annual appropriation. My hope is that we're able to work out a system with carryovers from salaries, and like right-size our workforce, delete all the obsolete positions, get a handle on exactly how much vacancies we have, like maybe on a quarterly or monthly basis. Ensure like all the accurate position IDs get uploaded into the Budget Details, and so on and so forth. But it's...it's just the starting point.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Rawlins...you know what? I'm going to...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Just real quick to the lump sum. Because we're talking about the supplemental agreement, and the master agreement usually lasts for about six years, right? So, I'm...I'm hoping, in the negotiations, it'll not be an annual

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

supplemental agreement, that they will figure out something that won't make it a lump sum every time. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, everybody spoke? Okay. So, I am...I'm going to support...Member Cook has a item that he submitted for a study to be done, kind of like the...the MGT study that the Salary Commission did, but to look at all the positions in the County of Maui, and to satisfy this question about pay and equity with all the employees, and not only what brought this up was Bill 49 with OCS. So, I am going to vote against this because I think I want that study to happen, so we understand what we're doing and how to step forward rather than trying to just throw something out and, you know, hoping that the Administration does this and does that. I think...I think that it's a step forward, and I believe the first step forward would be to get this study done, and then take it forward for all the employees, and working with the problems that we see with Personnel and the unions, and, you know, et cetera, et cetera...and positions. Go ahead, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, I just ask you to please reconsider. These are our people that we see in the hallways. These are the people we see in the parking lot. They're doing the work for us. Just...I...I don't have anything else except to speak to your empathy. Please reconsider, so we can have a universal voice on this. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. All right, Members. Okay. Member Cook, Member...Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. I could be supportive of this, it's just in your question, is this adding \$26 million to what we're doing now?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Excuse me. What is the motion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin's motion.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You want to say it? Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, so the motion on the floor, made by Councilmember Paltin, seconded by Member Rawlins-Fernandez, is to amend Fringe Benefits under Countywide Costs by increasing Category B by \$26 million, and adding the following condition. Up to \$26 million must be for supplemental agreements to the master agreements.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: To the master agreements. Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, I can support that. Because as you know...when are we going to take up the OCS?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: After...after we do --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: After this?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- after we do the revisits. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, after the revisits.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. We're going through Countywide, and then we got to do revisits.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, this is supplemental for other departments? Yeah?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And...and OCS, right? Because everybody, all County employees, as they're included in it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, in working with the Administration, my...what I would advise is not for guys that made double-digit increases in percentage, which depending, it may or may not be, but the Managing Director said a starting point would be taking care of everyone's medical co-pays.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: He did say that to today.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. I'm going to support the motion because I believe that we need to stand up for our employees. And unfortunately--I don't know why--there some...there seems to be a break somewhere in our system that allows for disparity within the union structure. And...and we really need to encourage that to be fixed. And however we can...even though our role is limited, whatever we can do to help, I think we should. And we're already trying to do that in our own...in the Legislative Branch. And we're now trying to help other departments. and all of our employees within the system. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Deputy Director just said this does not include OCS. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: That's what my question was going to be to Ms. Toshikiyo. Because I think her language was a supplemental agreement to the master agreement, which means they would have to be union employees, and therefore, not OCS, yes?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. I just wanted to confirm my understanding of who this is applicable to. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else have any discussions? Seeing none. Member Paltin.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think in this case, I would use Member Johnson's yes, and to your study, and Member Cook's study idea. Because we know...like I tried to lower the sewer increases, and that was a wash, so people are going to be paying more for sewage. And we're still like trying to right-size from the insurance and FEMA rent payments. And, you know, I don't have the data, but I imagine a lot of the ALICE people are our employees...the SR-09s to the SR-15s, at least. Like I don't know how...if you see how much SR-09 to SR-15 makes, and then, like, if you started at A, oh, my goodness, you know, and then it takes how long to even get to a C or a D, you know, but maybe they changed that. I think SR-9 maybe starts at a C now or something, but still, that's not good pay. And...and I think we had a conversation one time about John in the mailroom, which...I mean, he's a veteran, and nobody...I mean, people aren't going to come...to continue to work for the County for those kind of salaries. Like, when...when...when I grew up, I grew up in Hilo, and...and there's not much jobs...or there wasn't much jobs over there. So, if you had a job, it was like, yay. But like if you worked for the County, it was like, oh, yay, you know? And...and now, like how many of us want our kids to work for the County? Like, a little...that's why I was trying to plant the seeds with those STEM kids, you know...because I...I imagine choke people are like, oh, don't work for the County, you'll never be able to buy a house. And so, if we don't want our own kids to work for the County, if we don't want these super smart STEM kids to work for the County, what's the point of having a County? Because we're not going to have anybody to serve our community, you know? And I'm not sure where it...when it got to the point, like, oh, don't let your kids work for the County...because when I was growing up, it's like, oh, if you get a job with the County, you got a good job, you know, and it's not like that anymore. It's like, you know, if you got a job for the County, too bad. Like look at all those people working at the hotels, and getting free overnights from their employer, and the Christmas party with all the concierge switch-arounds, and things like that, you know? Like the County is not the place you want to send your kids to be successful. Like do you want your child to work for the County? You know, that's...that's what I'm saying. Like, if...if...if working for the County is not a good job, where you can serve your community, and make a living, and only have to work one job, then we're doing something wrong.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. So, this is 26 million, and we just spent most of the morning and a part of the afternoon discussing 25 million for the Lipoa Apartments, and who do you think going to live in there? Like Member Paltin's the one that made, by far, majority of the...of the reductions because she knew she had big asks, and she was doing her part to try to reduce it because folks like the Chair don't want to have a bigger budget than the Mayor. I am--I've been talking about it every time--I am going to be a proponent of increasing Tier 3 of Non-Owner-Occupied. So, I wasn't trying to make cuts because I'm trying to increase on the luxury mansions that Member Cook is supporting Wailea 670 for. We're going to tax them, right? That...that's...that's what the plan was, tax the vacant mansions in order to subsidize these apartments, and in order to improve the quality of life of our County employees.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

That's supposed to be the plan, not fund studies only. Don't just talk, walk the talk. And that's what this does, walks the talk. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anything else? Okay. So, it's going to be roll call. And again, I stand by that we need to do something, and what happened with the Salary Commission recommendations, which all of you know for elected officials, which was us and the Mayor, as well as all the deputies and directors, those decisions were final, we had...you know, we couldn't change it. And then now, we see the ripple effect of that decision, right? So, we have Office of Council Services saying Bill 49 is coming up, that they need a raise, 30 percent because of that. And, you know...I don't know. And then the other departments are saying, well, you know, do a study. We heard that from, you know, the last testifier last week Thursday, what about the rest of us, right? And so, I think that it's our responsibility to do something and just not say, okay, here's 26 million, we're going to guess what it is. You know, I don't know any kind of validated data behind it. I do want to solve this problem, but I don't want us to do it kind of willy-nilly. And that I was glad to hear what Managing Director said--let's pay for health insurance. But even that, you need a plan, and we heard that from...when we had the presentations from Mr. Mizuno, that's what Kaua'i did. I also heard it when I went to NACo, that's what they did from Kaua'i, you know? And that the Mayor came up with that, and it's, you know, well-planned, and they're doing it. So, I just want us to take steps forward that are in that vein, if we have to be there, it sounds like it, with what our employees are saying, out in the hallways, and when we see them out amongst...outside of this building, that they're looking for some kind of equity, and not only for OCS. So, I'm going to...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Exactly. They're asking for a raise, not a study.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I am asking for a path forward. And so, therefore, I'm going to be asking for roll call. Thank you.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye, and I hope that we'd also do the study.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that's eight "ayes," one "no." The motion passes.

VOTE:	AYES:	Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.
--------------	--------------	--

	NOES:	Chair Sugimura.
--	--------------	------------------------

	ABSTAIN:	None.
--	-----------------	--------------

	ABSENT:	None.
--	----------------	--------------

	EXC.:	None.
--	--------------	--------------

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

GENERAL BUDGET PROVISIONS

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Okay. We're done with that. All right. So, General Budget Provisions, Members, which are in Bill 41. And I wanted...we talked about it before, and I would like to turn this over to Mr. Hanano to take us through the section. So, this is in Bill 41 on page 31. And we did discuss this earlier in the week, and we've worked on four proposed amendments in consultations with Corporation Counsel. A document with amendments is currently being distributed--are you going to distribute

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

it? Yeah? Okay--so, you can review them. And we're going to take the amendments up one by one. Mr. Hanano? Or you want the document first?

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, Section 18, Transfers and Loans, Subsection H, page 37.

MR. HANANO: Okay. So, on this section, as you can see in the handout, it's...this subsection's going to be amended to delete the language that's contained in the brackets. That's in, I think, the third line from...that includes a brief description all the way to the date of the project, and then we're going to add--and this is based on suggestions from the Members--including for each project the following: one, project name and capital budget system number; two, project phase, such as design or construction; three, estimated start and end dates for that phase; four, percentage of the project completed; and five, a brief description of the overall project status. So, basically, we're deleting some language and adding...adding more.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You need a motion? No, not yet.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, I wanted him to explain first, but are you ready for the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. I was going to say so moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, Chair Lee made the motion, I need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Motion made by Chair Lee, second by Member U'u-Hodges [sic]. So, you want to amend Section 18, Subsection H, shown in the document as described by Mr. Hanano. Any discussion? No? Okay. All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Sinenci? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I didn't finish reading it. I just got it, I don't read that fast.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You want to...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Section 18, not the whole page.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're going to take the whole document, but...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, we're voting on the whole document?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh....oh, no, I'm taking up 18.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor, raise your hand, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is this nine "ayes?" Nine "ayes." The motion carries.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Section 21, which is page 38.

MR. HANANO: So, Members, on that one, Section 21, that's a new section that...it's recommended that it be stricken, and that's basically because it doesn't really add anything to what's already done. It's basically, you know, I think, superfluous, and therefore, we're recommending that it be stricken. We did go over all of these conditions with Ms. Toshikiyo, and, you know, she had no issue with the recommendations that we're putting forth, just for the Members' information.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I see Director Milner, you have a comment.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Yes. I just wanted to reiterate what I said the other day during testimony, that this wasn't added to be superfluous. It was trying to cut down on the workload for OCS, Corporation Counsel, and my office. For example, we just submitted several amendments, and because we don't know the order the body will take them up in, the same overall budget totals were used for each bill. So, once those bills pass out of Committee, we will have to go back in and change all of the numbers in all of the bills before they go to Council, which is a very tight turnaround. So, that's why I was hoping we could switch to a quarterly report model, to try and cut down on those

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

quick turnarounds, and the use of time of Staff. Obviously, it's up to the body, but I just wanted to take a moment to explain the intended purpose, and it wasn't intended to be superfluous. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much for that explanation. Members, any questions regarding this? And the explanation, so you heard...you heard the Budget Director and...as well as Mr. Hanano. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. For Budget Director. Okay. So, we're going...we're striking the Section 21, but the purpose of having Section 21 is achieved somewhere?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. No, I don't believe it is. That's why I felt Section 21 was necessary.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Does Miss...

MS. MILNER: But it's up to the body. If they don't want to change our current process, then the appropriate action would be to strike Section 21. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Does Ms. Toshikiyo have a suggestion? It says on the paper that I just received that she may have a proposal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo?

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I don't have that on my paper, but...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Am I looking at the wrong paper?

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. KAWASAKI: We did have a discussion with Ms. Toshikiyo this...lunch break on this, and she did not have a proposal for this. This was in consideration of she might, and we didn't know that we were going to have the opportunity to speak about it. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo for answering my question. So, I guess if the only reason we would be removing it because it's redundant, supleferous [sic]... . . . (chuckling). . . I can't do it, I can't it. Say it again, say it again, say it again.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Superfluous.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Superfluous. . . .*(chuckling)*. . . That I'm going to vote against it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Just...yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, ready for the vote.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's...it's...it's...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Roll call.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, oh.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, I don't believe there's a motion on the floor.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Move to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- strike Section 21.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee, and second by Member Kama. Okay. So, that's the motion is to strike Section 21. Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that's eight "ayes," one "no." The motion passes.

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.**

NOES: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **None.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Next we have...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That was mine, I'll...I'll move. I move that a new section will be added to read as follows. Section ##, Grant Eligibility, unless otherwise specified, grantees may apply for more than one County grant.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee. Discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just wanted to clarify, although this is the practice, you know, sometimes we like to get things in writing.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And the example I gave last time was like I line itemed Kaibigan ng Lāhainā, and I didn't want to prevent them from going after other competitive pots. The pot that I went through, that...the amount that I gave them is what had been cut from their Federal funding to tell, you know, the oral stories of the disaster as a methodology to help with mental health.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. So...all right. So, that...that's it. Any...any discussion, any further discussion? All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: This looks like a nine "aye." The motion carries.

VOTE:	AYES:	Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.
--------------	--------------	---

NOES:	None.
--------------	--------------

ABSTAIN:	None.
-----------------	--------------

ABSENT:	None.
----------------	--------------

EXC.:	None.
--------------	--------------

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. New section, that's yours. And then the new section, Community Block Grant Disaster Recovery Funds.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Should I say it? Oh.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Was that yours?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I thought I was doing this for you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, well...okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And then he can --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- discuss it. I move to add a new section, Community Development Block Grant Disaster Recovery Funds. The Mayor must submit a quarterly report...quarterly written report to the Council on the Administration's management of funds appropriated under the Disaster Relief Supplemental Appropriations Act (2025), Public Law 118-158, including (A) proposed uses for the funds; (B) how the uses relate to the Administration's action plan; (C) whether any additional funds from other sources will be used; (D) actual encumbrances and expenditures; and (E) a copy of the quarterly report transmitted to the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. This is one of the things we thought of --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, second?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- for you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee, and second by Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And discussion will be provided by Mr. Hanano.

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair. Thank you...thank you, Chair Lee. So, this was added at the request and recommendation of the...some of the Members after discussions on this. And basically, it's to provide a little bit more accountability and information as a result of the County implementing the CDBG-DR 1.6, I think, million dollar...billion dollar grant from the Federal Government. You know, as part of the acceptance of the grant, I think the Council included in the bill that Condition (E), that they would receive a copy of the quarterly report from...that goes to HUD, but I think the Members wanted a little bit more information to be provided. And so, that's why we added, you know, other conditions in this section. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. And I guess for the section...

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Or did we just lose?

MR. KRUEGER: Oh.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: Okay. We're back, we're back.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, we're back, we're fine? Oh, okay. Good. So, for section, then, this would be number . . .*(inaudible)*. . . --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- 20...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I think we lost...we lost audio.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Can't hear.

MR. KRUEGER: Maybe just --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Shall we take a recess?

MR. KRUEGER: -- five minutes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Five minutes recess.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh.

MR. KRUEGER: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh. We can hear you.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: You're back.

MR. KRUEGER: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, we can...we can hear you now.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Can you hear us? Very good. All right. So, for this, Mr. Hanano, you described it, and then, would it then be Section number 20, I guess, 5, and then Section 25 would move down to effective date? Is that where...where do we place it? I guess there's a...

MR. HANANO: I think because we struck 21, so Councilmember Paltin's one is going to be 21, and this one will probably be...well, you know, a part of this recommendation is that the section numbers will be adjusted accordingly. So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

MR. HANANO: -- whatever it ends up as --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. HANANO: -- it's just going to be switched around, and figured out that way. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Fine, fine. All right. Anything else?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, adding to the motion, all other section number references will be adjusted accordingly.

MR. HANANO: Yes. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Vote already.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Section H. Okay. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. KRUEGER: I --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

MR. KRUEGER: -- I...I...I believe we've lost connection. I think for real this time, can we request --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: For real this time. . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

MR. KRUEGER: -- a five-minute recess?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we'll be back at 8:00...I mean 2:40.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, the technical language is for real this time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 2:40. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 2:34 p.m.
RECONVENE: 2:57 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Okay. Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. Sorry for the delay. We're having technical problems. It is now 2:57, and we made it back in time, right? To not...all right. Very good. So, where we left off before we lost connection is, we're on the general budget

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

provisions, and a new section for a Community Block Grant Disaster Recovery Fund is where we left off, and it's Member Paltin...or is this...no, this is Chair Lee's...Chair Lee's regarding the disaster recovery fund. So, any more discussion? We're ready to vote. Okay. Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Unfortunately, when Mr. Hanano sent me this language, it apparently went to my old OCS email, so I wasn't aware that he had sent it, so this was the first that I saw.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

MS. MILNER: I was able to speak to the CDBG-DR folks during the recess, so thank you to the technical difficulties. . . .(chuckling). . . But just some things I wanted to clarify. Section A, proposed uses for the funds. Is the body looking to receive a list of who's received awards from the funds? I just...if we could get a little more clarity on the purpose of that section.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We will. Mr. Hanano, or Chair Lee.

MS. MILNER: And then section...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MILNER: Oh, sorry. I'll wait.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, go ahead, we heard you.

MS. MILNER: Section D, Actual Encumbrances and Expenditures, that's not really how the CDBG-DR grant works. It's a...it's a drawdown system. So, we could provide actual drawdowns, but it doesn't really work on an encumbrance/expenditure basis like some of our other things do.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, proposed uses for the fund, it was another question that you had for clarity, as well as...

MS. MILNER: Yes. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, A and --

MS. MILNER: I was...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- A and D.

MS. MILNER: If we could provide a list of the awards under the fund instead of proposed uses, I think that would be clearer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MILNER: And then for Section D, if it could be actual drawdowns instead of actual encumbrances and expenditures. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. Thanks for popping up. Chair Lee, did you hear that? So, it would be instead of proposed uses of the fund, it would be awards under the fund.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You're fine with that. And then the other one was item number [sic] D, actual encumbrances and expenditures, is they want to just show the actual draw...draw...drawdowns. Drawdowns.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Right. Right.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You're fine?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Mr. Hanano, is that fine?

MR. HANANO: Yes, Chair. that...that's fine.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Members, all in favor...you saw...any more discussion? All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Wait, hold on. So, no one made the friendly amendments, or...like, what are we voting on?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We had the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Budget Director made some suggestions, and then is...for the record...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And she repeated.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I repeated it. So, those would be friendly amendments. Chair Lee's fine with...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Well, you didn't make the...you didn't make the motion, Chair. So...so, to make sure --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Chair Lee agreed.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- to confirm what it is that we're voting on.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm afraid somebody else has to do it. My computer died on me.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Friendly amendment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, my. Okay. All right. So, did you get...well, if Chair Lee's...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Bruce is coming.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Here comes Bruce. All right. So, friendly amendment was --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Proposed awards.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- it would be...yeah, awards that were --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And not uses.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- under the grant. And the other one --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Actual drawdowns.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- was actual draws. Chair Lee, can you...are you okay with a friendly amendment?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: By all means.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Members, any other discussion? All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Who is missing? I don't see Member Sinenci. So, that's...I don't see eight "ayes," though. One...two...three...four. Okay. Eight "ayes," and Member Sinenci is excused.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **Councilmember Sinenci.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: **APPROVED.**

REVISITS

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, I think we’re done with general budget provisions, proposed amendments. Member...Mr. Hanano, do we have any more? Did we get it all?

MR. HANANO: That...that’s all, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yay. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: That was easy.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, now, we have revisits. Member Sinenci, are you there, or did we lose you in this? His what?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

OFFICE OF THE MAYOR

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, he’s transitioning. Okay. So, Office of the Mayor, this is something that Member U‘u-Hodgins and I were working on, was for a revisit. It would be grant...condition to up to...so we put...so I put 12,000 for STEM and automotive programs, Upcountry schools. And what Member U‘u-Hodgins, we were discussing possibly, instead of it being just a flat 12, we would do 15 for the first one, and then 5 for the automotive, the STEM; is that correct? You want to make the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: I move...so moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is there a second?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second, Chair Lee. Any discussion? Thank you, Members. We will vote. All in favor, raise your hand and say “aye.”

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: There’s no Member Sinenci, and Chair Lee is actually here, but her...she’s having computer problems. We can count her vote. Thank you. So, it’s eight “ayes,” one excused.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember Sinenci.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

DEPARTMENT OF MANAGEMENT

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Moving right along here, Member Cook. So, this is Countywide replace...replacement to increase Category B to 300,000 for a classification and compensation study for all bargaining units. This is the one that you were going to check with the Management...Managing Director’s Office, as well as the amount for the revisit.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And they felt...I...we did check with the Managing Director, and they felt that that would be an appropriate amount. The reason that it was more expensive than the previous study was because it would be for a much broader group of people for all of the collective aspect.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. And...okay. So, that was his research that he did. Members, any other questions? I just saw Member Sinenci pop up, and he left. Is he still on? Not on. Okay. Oh, there he is.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I think his Wi-Fi is unstable.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Members, any other discussions? All in favor, raise your hand to support this.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it would be...oh, there. Okay. Nine "ayes." The motion carries. Yay, this is going fast. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: What was the motion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you...you didn't hear?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: The study.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But did you make a motion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I thought it was just that you said that there was a question, Member --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- Cook had the question, and you got some more information. But I mean, I'll vote on it again if you want me to.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, because I...I remember going second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Chair Lee made the second.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No. No, I think it was Tom.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, motion made by Member...Member Cook, and second by Chair Lee. And this would be for...that Management would verify that they would do this, and it was...we went to verify the amount, right? 300,000, right? And Management would do...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: And we got confirmation?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We're going to vote again?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we going vote again. All in favor, say "aye."

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Sinenci...okay. Nine "ayes." Motion carries.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

DEPARTMENT OF ŌIWI RESOURCES

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, this one was a revisit, and it is mine for increase. And this is...this had to go...the reason why we had to revisit this, it needed to go to the Ōiwi Resource Department, and not Management. And this is regarding the Von Tempsky property, which we purchased, and it was found that it...there was iwi on it. And so, this request is to do a study, and I checked with Managing Director, and also Kaponou'ai Molitau regarding being able to do this, and he said it would cost \$1 million to do a study for...archeological study and cultural preservation for the Von Tempsky property, and it would be \$1 million. So, initially I had 1.5, but he did say just a million. So, I need a motion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was...I had...oh, I had a question, but should I wait until after the motion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, somebody can do the motion. Member Kama. I need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Chair Lee. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And just clarifying, you did ask if they have the capacity, and they can complete it within...or encumber the funds within this fiscal year...this coming fiscal year?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For Fiscal Year '26? I didn't ask him that specific question, but I did say this is for the Fiscal '26 Budget. So, I guess if he couldn't, he should have said I can't do it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Managing Director pointed...connected us, so...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: He must have known, because he told you 1 million instead of 1.5, right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. He asked me how much, and I...he said...I...he said 1...1 million. Okay. Any other discussion? All in favor, Members, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: This would be nine "ayes." Motion carries.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

DEPARTMENT OF POLICE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Department of Police, Member Kama, increase Category B, Operations and Equipment by 100,000 under Technical and Support Services Program for a 4X4 truck. And this was one of your priorities.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, what I wanted to do...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, your mic.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: What I wanted to do was cut that by 30,000. Because when I called MPD, they said they could get away with buying...leasing a truck for about \$70,000 for the CORE Program.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, the motion is now for 70,000.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And you checked with them. So, motion made by Member Kama, second by Chair Lee? Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Did I do...did I do the motion? I move. I'm sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I didn't make the motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I move to increase Category C for the capital equipment by \$70,000 with the condition that a 4X4 truck be obtained for the CORE Program. And this is on Department of Police under the Technical and Support Services Program, which is where the CORE Program falls under.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have a question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Kama, second made by Member Rawlins-Fernandez. All right. Any other discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have a question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is this something that they asked for? And if they lease it, is it \$70,000 for a one-year lease?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: They did ask for it. The \$100 [sic] would have actually bought the truck outright. But I'm trying to cut wherever I can cut with my own...you know, for my own priorities. And they said they could get away with 70,000 for a lease for a year. I said, well, a lease for a year, maybe we'll come back next year and see what else we can do.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean, personally, I would rather them buy it for 100,000 --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Me, too.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- than lease it for 70,000 for one year, because --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Me, too.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- what happens next year?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Would you...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I mean, I could...I could keep it at 100,000. I mean, I was just trying to figure out ways how to cut back on some of my priorities. But I think you make sense, that a purchase outright is better than a lease for a year. Because then you got to turn it back in, right?...after that, or keep leasing it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you want to amend your motion?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I just...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: To 100 instead of 70?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: To 100, yes. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? All right. Raise your hand. All in favor, raise your hand.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: This is nine "ayes." The motion carries.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **None.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

APPENDIX A, PART I – GRANT REVENUES

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Next, we have grant revenues. So, Staff is distributing Resolution 25-84 [sic] with your review. Staff? It contains CD...CDBG programs that need to be added to Appendix A, Part I. And I...you remember, we took this up when...okay. Go ahead, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, and...Member Johnson, then Member Sinenci after.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, I'd like to reconsider the DEM grants under Environmental Protection Grants if we're ready for it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Wait, now. Okay. I'm going to take this up first, which is the --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. As you like.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- CDBG, and then we can go there. Member Sinenci, did you have a question about the CDBG?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Not on CDBG, but I, too, had a revisit, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, I am going through the list that I got.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay. Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, on this, you are being given the grants that was discussed when...okay. So, this is the list of projects--you remember this?--that need to be added to Appendix A, Part I. So, entertain a motion to incorporate the following CDBG Program line items under Appendix A, Part I as described, and with the dollar amounts provided in Resolution's 25-80. So, you got the resolution, I need a motion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin, and Member Kama made the second. So, discussion. So, you have the information, and this is what we need to then add to Appendix A, Part I, these projects. Staff, do you have anything to add to that?

MR. KRUEGER: No, Chair. If the motion's approved, we'll include the project names and amounts --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: -- as outlined in 25-80.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you. I just wanted to quickly add that I sat on this committee to review these current projects. And so, we were given a whole rating sheet, and....and it was pretty extensive because each...each applicant had to, you know, show either if they had matching funds, or anything like that. So, we had about ten of us get to review and score each project. And so, I just wanted to speak in support, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, very good.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Very good.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you for your work...because that's hard work. Appreciate it. Any other comments on this? Seeing none. Ready to vote, Members?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Johnson, you have questions? Yes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I have a question for Councilmember Sinenci. The letter D as is in delta, County-owned Senior Affordable Housing Project Na Hale Kūpuna Operations. Is that the Lānaʻi Na Hale Kūpuna?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, that's the one where they bought all the units.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Sorry, There's a lot of Hale Kūpunas out there, so I just wanted to clarify. Thank you so much. Councilmember Paltin answered my question. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other questions regarding this list? Seeing none. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Nine "ayes." The motion carries.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

APPENDIX B-1 – CONCESSION LEASE LICENSE

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you, Member Sinenci, for working on that. Okay. Appendix B, this is more revisits. Appendix B-1, Concession Lease License, and in FN-9, in number 112 in Granicus, was provided information regarding all the leases, and you got copies of it, but this is the...what we would like to put in the final bill under Appendix B-1. I need a motion and a second. I don't know if..

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to swap out the previous leases for the one that was received on April 10th, 2025.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Correct. I need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Second.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, motion made by Member Paltin, second by Member U‘u-Hodgins. This is the lease of...the lease that will be added, or the swap out, as you call it. All right. Any discussion? Seeing none. We can vote. Members, all in favor, raise your hand --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It’s just the correction.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- and say “aye.”

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Looks like nine “ayes.” Motion carries.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

APPENDIX A, PART II, SPECIAL PURPOSE REVENUE
SCHEDULE OF REVOLVING AND SPECIAL FUNDS
FISCAL YEAR ’26

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Appendix A, Part II, Special Purpose Revenue, Schedule of Revolving and Special Funds for Fiscal Year ’26. Q, Economic Development Cultural Program Revolving Fund, and Chair Lee, Revolving Fund number 1, add the condition under Economic Development Cultural Program Revolving Fund for 75,000 for Ke...Ke...Ke Kula O Pi‘ilani; is this correct?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we need a motion. Chair Lee, second...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Why did we revisit this?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, it says confirm if withdrawn is my notes.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you didn't withdraw it.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Ke Kula? Wait, may I ask James? James, you asked me about this earlier, and I said I did not withdraw Ke Kula, but I did withdraw the other one. Remember?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: So...so, yes. On the priority matrix, page 27, we do have a Revolving Fund condition from Chair Lee, which says to--on this fund, Economic Development and Cultural Programs Revolving Fund--add the following condition, up to 75,000 must be for Ke Kula O Pi'ilani to support current and new cultural programs. However, under your...no --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: District.

MR. KRUEGER: -- yeah, district funds, I believe you've also conditioned funds relating to Ke Kula --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: -- O Pi'ilani.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Right. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, it's a duplicate.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Withdraw this one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. It's a duplicate?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Because it would be a duplicate.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this one is, maybe...and Staff can explain it. We have...with three Members putting in a condition for...Member Rawlins-Fernandez for Mālama Kakanilua for 400,000, and for Member Sinenci, for the church in your community, Wananalua --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Wananalua.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Congressional Church, for 132,894, and for myself, which is for 500,000 for Ka'ahumanu Church. This became a revisit because we have overspent on this account with the three...adding the three to the Economic Development and Cultural Program Revolving Fund. And I just wanted to know if possibly, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, if you and I could split, you know, what we were putting in and do 50 percent, and Member Sinenci and ours, then would...we would then be under the maximum of the fund. Staff, could you explain what is happening?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. So, right. The three proposals that, Chair, you mentioned, if all three were added to the fund, it would result in a \$400,000 overage in the fund. So, Chair, my understanding of your proposal is for your priority...or for your Revolving Fund condition, and for Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez's priority Revolving Fund condition, if agreeable, if you both did \$250,000, and then if Councilmember Sinenci stayed the same, that would exhaust all the funding in the fund, and there'd be no overage. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Yeah. So, for mine, I tried to see if there was another pot that we could, you know, use, but there isn't. So, therefore, we're in this situation with...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Triage.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Triage. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I'm open to the proposal. So, the...in Open Space, the prior years' appropriation under the Open Space Fund has 500,000 for Mālama Kakanilua for a similar purpose, but some of the things that the organization wanted to do there, they wouldn't be able to use Open Space Fund, as I understand it. So, we could leave that Open Space Fund for the Open Space Fund purposes, and then add this 200,000 under the Economic Development and Cultural Programs Revolving Fund for the activities that wouldn't be permitted under Open Space Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. All right. So, that sounds...that sounds good. Member Sinenci, your...your item does not change, and for mine, then I'll reduce mine from 500 to 250. Would that be okay? Would that be okay, James?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, Staff would just like to confirm, I...I believe we heard Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez proposing to instead reduce hers to 200,000?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Correct.

MR. KRUEGER: So, Chair, that means your...your condition could be 300,000 instead, and that would...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, the deal was half-half.

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, mines [sic] was 400, so half would be 200, and Chair's proposal was 500, so 250, leaving a \$50 [sic] buffer. Mahalo, Mr. Krueger.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Are we fine with that? All right. So, that's let's...we're going to vote on all three, but Member Cook, you need...your hand up...your hand was up. You have a question?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'm voting.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you're voting. He's trying to get us all along. Okay. So, I need a motion for all three.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Second?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Second. Okay. Member Kama and Member Rawlins-Fernandez. So, this would be for what I just read, and the amounts would be...for Member Rawlins-Fernandez would be...did you say 200?--and mine would be 250, and Member Sinenci's would be 132,894; is that correct, for his exact amount?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Nine "ayes." Thank you. Motion carries.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **None.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: **APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Now we’re back to Affordable Housing Fund, so we are back to --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Member...yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I had my hand up for a while. For the Economic Development and Cultural Programs Revolving Fund, the repair of Ka’ahumanu Church, the 350, I believe we voted on that last night. I just wanted confirmation on that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I had to withdraw it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, not yours, Member Sinenci’s.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I think he withdraw...he withdrew his.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, we voted on it last night, didn’t we?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Can you check? I don’t think we...I think --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We didn’t?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- what he did was he substituted --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- for his new church.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, we...what we have down is that Councilmember Sinenci, Member Rawlins-Fernandez second, did make a motion to add his condition relating to Wananalua Congressional Church to this fund, and then I believe it was either withdrawn or tabled, and then the...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Last night?

MR. KRUEGER: Yeah. Yesterday, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Because it was a duplication.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, Ka'ahumanu Church is not going to get any money?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair's...Chair Sugimura's condition is relating to Ka'ahumanu Church.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, good? Are we good?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: We're good.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, are you saying Exhibit 1 is wrong by what you're reading? What are you reading?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I was not looking at Exhibit 1. I was looking at my notes of the matrix from last night.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: As you can imagine, lots of scribbles. Mahalo.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

AFFORDABLE HOUSING FUND

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, we are then done with that. Thank you very much, Member Rawlins-Fernandez and Member Sinenci, and for...compromising, is what we just did. Now, I want to go to Member Kama as a revisit for the Affordable Housing Fund, Lipoa visit...revisit. We had a lot of discussion this morning.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right. Ha'ina 'ia mai ana ka'puana.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So...so, I made the motion...oh, thank you, go ahead, do that. So, there was a motion made, we got a second, and I think we had all of this discussion that interrupted us, but we're...still got the motion on the floor.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Member Sinenci's was in the HSAC --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right. And so, we were...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- and we were like switching in and out. So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, we paused this.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- for him to be here.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: For him to comment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. And Staff, so where...can you give us where we are in the motion as...

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. So, for this matter, what the Committee tabled and...and is untabling [*sic*] now is a motion by Councilmember Kama, seconded by Chair Lee. It's to amend the Affordable Housing Fund to add the following condition. Up to 200...up \$25 million must be for a grant to the Lipoa Apartments for an affordable rental housing development in Kihei. And then, Chair, if it's okay, Staff would like to take the opportunity to clarify further. Our understanding is that there was some discussion of funding or related funding, so we wanted to clarify for this motion, is the intent to also include recognizing Carryover/Savings from the General Fund? I believe we got an exact figure from the Budget Director --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: -- which would be \$13,939,853, adding that to the supplemental...or adding that to transfer to the Affordable Housing Fund, recognizing that revenue in the Affordable Housing Fund, and then reducing the condition relating to Kaiāulu O Nāpili from 12.4 million loan to a \$2 million grant.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can we separate those? Because I'm not going to vote for that removal. Can we separate it into two votes?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, if the body's agreeable, you could do just the condition first, and then could discuss the funding afterward.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or vote for the removal first, and I won't vote yes.

MR. KRUEGER: However the body wants to proceed. I...I guess we'll note then, the condition motion is what's on the floor, so...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. We can do that next then.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, the motion is for what Member Kama said, right? So, it'll be up to 25 million under the...is it going to remain under the Affordable Housing Fund? It sounds like, right? Affordable Housing Fund for a grant to Lipoa Apartments, LLC, for an affordable housing project in Kihei. Is that your four words?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: That's it. Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah, that's it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's the motion. Okay. You have questions, anybody?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And...and...and I think we're waiting for Member Sinenci to comment because I think everybody did comment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And we're waiting for him to come back.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And then he went off to the HSAC meeting. So, did you have any comments before we take the vote?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah. Thank you. As I mentioned earlier, I did...wanted to support Member Rawlins-Fernandez about just keeping the money in there because I...I did want to respect Director Mitchell's process --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: -- that he said that they went through. And so...and then, of course, Mr. Nishita said that Lipoa was the next one on. So, I think I was okay with...with not naming it because they would pretty much be the next one that would

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

receive the additional funds that we appropriate for. So --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: -- that was my comments.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Good comments.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can the motion be repeated?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, the motion on the floor, made by Councilmember Kama, seconded by Chair Lee, is to add the following condition to the Affordable Housing Fund. Up to \$25 million must be for a grant to Lipoa Apartments for an affordable rental housing development in Kihei.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I think it's Lipoa Apartments, LLC. Right, Mister...

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. So, Staff will note that according to our research right now, Lipoa Apartments is a trade name, but they have a technical entity named, that's Lipoa Investments, LLC. I think technically, from Staff's perspective, we...we might have a preference for the Lipoa Investments, LLC, but, you know, we...we could also research that further, and make changes not substantively as appropriate, if the body's okay with that.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. I'm fine.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I think...Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I think the representatives are still here, and they could clarify that. It'd be a shame to put the wrong name in without having clarity.

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. KAWASAKI: Our office would confer with Ms. Milner, as well as checking with the State records, to make sure that any monies would be released appropriately, and that's why we're asking for a little bit of latitude to make those corrections as necessary. We'll do the correct research, and legally make sure that it's okay to transfer.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. All right, Members, ready to vote?
Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Okay. So, the motion, as I understand it, is to condition up to 25 million for Lipoa project, whatever it is going to be. That exceeds the amount. Earlier, we talked about the different funding for...for things. So, is that...that...that's what was requested to be separated? Some clarification, please.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just was requesting to separate that. I can't support taking money from the Nāpili project because they said it could add time to it, and we're working against the clock on the temp housing. And, you know, Pulelehua was defunded, Sylvia Luke's project fell through...it's kind of all we got left. So, I wouldn't support defunding it, even if I support Lipoa.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So...so, is there...are there going to be two...two votes? Because the 25 million would exceed the amount that we have in our Affordable Housing Fund. Am I missing something?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, I think we're going to make all the votes within a half an hour, so...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, this is just one, and then by the end of all the things that we address in our Affordable Housing Fund, then it should have enough money in there.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And if not, we got to keep voting.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Got it. Okay. All right.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you heard the funding stack, which Managing Director said earlier, right?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, this would...well, just...this motion is just to add 20...is just to condition 25 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But there isn't 25 million in there now. So, you would...there would have to be more motions in order to have enough money, or whatever you guys want to do.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Members, all in favor...or is this a voice?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Roll call. Okay. All in favor...start off --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- with the roll call. Go ahead.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that’s seven “ayes,” two “noes.” Motion passes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, and U‘u-Hodgins.

NOES: Councilmembers Rawlins-Fernandez and Sinenci.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, we’re...we’re done with that. And right now, I have this. Now we have Office of Council Services. This is a revisit, or...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, we’re still on Housing. We got to do all the things.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead.

MR. KRUEGER: So...so, Chair, just to reiterate the...the funding stack that the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Managing Director said.

MR. KRUEGER: -- Managing Director proposed. He proposed adding approximately 14 million through Carryover/Savings from the General Fund. The exact figure we received from Budget Director was \$13,939,853. So, adding that to Carryover/Savings from the General Fund, transferring that to the Affordable Housing Fund, recognizing that revenue in the Affordable Housing Fund, and then amending the condition for Kaiāulu O Nāpili from a \$12.4 million loan to a \$2 million grant.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You need a motion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I need a motion. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I moved...I move.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee, and second with --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: To what James said.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- okay--Member Kama. Okay. Any...and it's going to be a roll call vote, right?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is...did he include the...I mean, I'm okay with all the stuff, except for the defunding of Nāpili. So, can we separate that out too?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Sure. Take that separate.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. That's you wanted . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Roll call.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, that's the amendment, the Nāpili is not a part of this vote?

MR. KRUEGER: I admittedly...Chair, I did read out the Nāpili part, but if the body wanted to separate that and leave that out, the body could do that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. That's my amendment, separate that out.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Chair Lee and Member Kama, you're fine, right?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Wait, I'm sorry. Which one are we...

MS. MACDONALD: Council Chair Lee.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry. One moment.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Which one are we doing first? Are we doing the one where we accept the Carryover/Savings? And then that one, I don't know. Well,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

Member Rawlins-Fernandez might want a roll call. I can't speak for her. But Member Paltin only wants the roll call for the Nāpili project, that change.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Roll call.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: So, which one are we doing right now? Is it Nāpili?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: All of them.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Okay. But can you please clarify what we're currently voting on? Because we...there's been a lot of moving parts.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. So, our understanding of the motion on the floor, made by Chair Lee, seconded by Councilmember Kama, is to recognize \$13,939,853 in Carryover/Savings from the General Fund, and transferring it to the Affordable Housing Fund, and recognizing the revenue there in the Affordable Housing Fund.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, roll call. Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, there are eight “ayes,” one “no.” The motion passes.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and
 Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin,
 Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: Councilmembers Rawlins-Fernandez.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, next motion.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, the last step would be to amend condition 12 under the Affordable Housing Fund relating to Kaiāulu O Nāpili by reducing the condition amount from 12.4 million to 2 million, and changing it from a loan to a grant.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Second.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Made by Chair Lee, second by Member Cook. Discussion? No discussion? Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...I have discussion.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't support taking money away from the Nāpili project because you need new housing. I think the Director said that, and I support it, giving HHFDC lands back to DHHL because that was the promise and commitment made to people. And so, you know, if we're not going to move forward with Pulelehua, and we're not going to move forward with the Lieutenant Governor's project, and then basically, we're sending all these people to live to Kihei.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And you know, a lot of the kūpuna, which Pulelehua would have prioritized, a lot of them just want to finish their last days in Lāhainā.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I also think that we shouldn't be supporting this because, first off, you know, it...it was Ikaika Ohana moves fast, and this is a way to speed them up by giving them their original ask. They followed the process. And...and, I mean, it might not be fair, but the other project didn't follow this process and get granted. These guys did get granted, and now they're going down to 2 million. It's almost like...a 2 million grant. It's almost like they are playing our rules, and we're moving the goalpost. I don't think that's fair for a builder who's got a track record here in our...you know, in our County. And the...if it adds any time, I can't...I can't support it. We need to act fast, and have some...some consistency here. So, that's my points. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. I...I think this morning, if I could, we did hear from Mr. Bigley, as well as from Mr. Fischer, that he was agreeable to this, and that it was a \$12.4 million loan, and now he's getting 2 million as a grant. So, I think that was probably, you know, advantageous for the total project. And by the time he's going to be ready to move forward, it sounded like, you know, these funds would be helpful for him to get his permits, and then work with HHFDC. So, I hear what you're saying, but it sounded like the...the developers were supportive. Member Johnson?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. For my second and final, I also want to urge the Administration to revisit Pulelehua, get back in a room with the builders, come back before this body with a budget amendment, and move forward with this. I...I can't get a straight answer from...from...from a lot of folks who are involved in this project, and it's kind of...we really need to move fast. I'm...if the budget amendment comes before this body from the Administration, I'll have...I'll be ready to vote for that. So, please, everyone, act with some urgency. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Okay. It's...Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Last year, we adopted Reso 24-179, supporting Ikaika 'Ohana doing the Lāna'i and Nāpili projects. And we did not do a reso for this project, Lipoa project. Yet, here we are taking away money from the Nāpili project, and putting it toward this project that we never committed to last year, or even talked about in Committee. And the Nāpili project is in West Maui, where the greatest need is. And when we put forward a motion to also support another West Maui project, we didn't get the votes. So, you know, I...when West Maui comes to the Council pissed off, they're so justified in whatever rage they express because we...we are not investing properly. And like Member Johnson said, we're moving the goalposts on Mr. Bigley, and I want him to feel the genuine support that we promised in...in 24-179...Reso 24-179. And so, I will be voting against this motion as well.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other comments? Miss...Tom Cook...Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. I'll be voting for this, and also supporting, and encouraging, and advocating for the Nāpili project. Both Mr. Bigley and his associate stated that they wouldn't...they didn't need it until 2026. The...the stack aspect of it for the State is a risk that it wouldn't be used until August. So, as far as the delay, it isn't...it's a potential delay. But I am supportive of West Maui, and this is not taking anything away from them, and I do support this. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you, Chair. I'll be supporting this as well, as you probably could tell from my morning's conversation with Admin. I'm not happy about it, though...this is not how I would prefer to do this. I wanted a yes-and situation. I really wish we didn't put money on the side for projects that aren't going to be done for a few years, when this one can be done pretty soon. And I think that's not this...it's not the fault right now for the people we have in front of us. It's not Lipoa's fault, and it's not Mr. Bigley's fault. This is...this has been an issue for a while, and we hear this all the time when people ask us for funding. And we have this conversation when they say, oh, we need, you know, some help, and we got to go to HHFDC, and the timing's all weird. I'm hoping we can fix that, and so we're not looking like we're choosing anybody over another. This is how I feel, like we could get both projects, and I will 100 percent be happy to support this project for Nāpili, as I have, and I will continue to do it. I'm just trying to look for a way we can do both at this moment, that's all.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: But I appreciate everybody's thoughts in this...because this...this was a lot today. Thanks, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Thank you. Are you ready to vote? Oh, Member Sinenci?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Mr. Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. For my opportunity, I just wanted to say that on Thursday, last Thursday, I found out that the Hāna Habitat for Humanity project of 25 homes had lapsed from the affordable housing. So...but I understand that we too aren't shovel-ready as well, so...but I did want to prioritize West Maui. And so, for me, for this budget, I wanted to...that's okay, Hāna, we can wait until we get all of our infrastructure in, and then come back for...for the funding. But I was okay with that, but I was also okay that we prioritize Lāhainā. And...and I get it, Mr. Bigley has been an...an ally to...to quickly put, you know, housing up for us so that we can get people in housing, whether it be rentals or not, but I supported the...the transfer, Carryover/Savings, and I was hoping that, you know, maybe we can find the balance elsewhere, and still prioritize West Maui. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. All right. Roll call vote. I see no hands for discussion. Okay. Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Proceeding with roll call vote, Chair. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, there are five “ayes,” four “noes.” The motion passes.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and
 Councilmembers Cook, Lee, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

**NOES: Councilmembers Johnson, Paltin,
 Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.**

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Thank you. So, Staff, we’re good, right? All the motions we need to make, and we got this covered?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. That...that should complete the matters relating to this Lipoa item.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. Yay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I need --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- to clean up a motion that we voted on for the Economic Development and Cultural Programs Revolving Fund, that we voted for 200,000 for Mālama Kakanilua, the Wananalua Church, and your 250 proposal. That's fine, but it was just flagged that what I said wasn't accurate, that in Open Space...how did that get in here?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I know, a fly, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Go to Tom. . . .*(chuckling)*. . . On page 49 of Appendix...what is this?...Appendix A, Part II, Special and Revolving Funds, for Open Space, prior year appropriations (2), up to 500,000 must be for safety, security and burial and cultural preserve at the County-owned lands at Waiale. I...I said that it was named to go to Mālama Kakanilua, and I was incorrect, so I would like to make that motion. I move to add up to 500,000 to Mālama Kakanilua...or, I guess, up to 500,000 must be for the safety and security for the burial and cultural preserve at the County-owned lands at Waiale for Mālama Kakanilua.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, is it on the...is it a matrix?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, it's not. Yeah, I just made the motion, and Member U'u-Hodgins second it.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this is a brand-new, or...I don't understand. You're...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That was part of the deal. With the 400,000, I reduced it to 200,000 so that you could have 250,000, and everyone could have that funds. This...I think it used to be named for Mālama Kakanilua, and I don't...I don't know. The name is no longer there, so I'm just putting it back.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: To clarify, this is a revisit to your visit to correct the name --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- so that the right entity can receive these funds.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Revisit for a revisit. Okay. So, that's the motion. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm ready to vote.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor...

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Could...could Staff just get...apologies, to clarify one more time. So, is it just amending the...the 200,000?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, no, no.

MR. KRUEGER: No.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Page 49, Open Space Fund, the prior year appropriations, number (2). It...so, the money is already there because it was prior appropriations. It's not even part of this budget, but it's on the budget bill. So, adding Mālama Kakanilua to that 500,000. The name used to be there, but it's not there now, so I'm just adding that in.

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Got it? Okay. Great. Mahalo, Mr. Krueger, for the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- clarifying questions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's Friday.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- just for clarification, it's on page 49, and prior year appropriation number (2)?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Correct. Number 2, yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Number 2.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, that's the one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you're adding their name in there?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Correct.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That's good. Members, any questions? Seeing none. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Cook? Okay. Motion carries. And we have...who's not here, is Member Johnson. Member Sinenci's there? All right. So, that's eight "ayes." The motion carries.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U'u-Hodgins.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember Johnson.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. And then I'll just read it again clear. So, (2), up to 500,000 must be for Mālama Kakanilua for safety and security for the burial and cultural preserve at the County-owned lands at Waiale.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Michele (*phonetic*).

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Very good. My Michele. She's so good, right? All right. Anything else on that? No, right? That finalizes it. I...we're not done, we're going through the revisits. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Are you doing rates and fees or department revisits?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we are now...wait, I have to go back to the church...the churches, and...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I got to revisit couple rates and fees, and I got to give some money back to the Fire Department and Sewer.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, right there. Okay. So, those are...those are revisits. Okay. Let me...let me do Office of Council Services, which is Member Kama, going down this list, which is Countywide increase, Council Services Program for...by \$900,000 for Councilmembers' office budget, and not discussed because, Member Kama, you were not present, so I wanted to bring this up.

OFFICE OF COUNCIL SERVICES

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It was not a revisit, but it's --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- first time.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, yeah. It's not a revisit, but I --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- wasn't here, but it's a revisit for you guys, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, I...I move on her behalf to add...what is it, 900,000?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah, that's what it is.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: 100,000 each per office.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: She cannot move? She's right there.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's a long story.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: To add 100,000 to each Council office.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You made the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And I need a second.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I need a second. No second.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I have a question. I don't have a second. I have a question first.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Cook made the second. Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, I think Bill 49 adds...adds money to the...to --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: To us.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- to do this proposal --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- too, right? So, would this proposal be in...in addition to if Bill 49 passes, or if Bill 49 doesn't pass?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: If it passes --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- Bill 49 passes --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- it's in addition to. If 49 doesn't pass, then it is what it is.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Then we should do 49 first.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, bill...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. That's...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I would like to do 49 first.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Wait. 49 does not have anything with our offices, it's only about OCS. Can I get clarification, Staff?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Does...doesn't that include us? Isn't the 30 percent part of us?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I'm...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, we're talking about the \$100 [sic] per...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm talking about Bill 49.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No, we're talking about the...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I asked...my clarifying question was, is this in addition to Bill 49 if it passes, or if --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Addition.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- Bill 49 does not pass? And so, my request is that we take up Bill 49, or at least make a decision on that before this one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Staff.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, so...so Staff's current understanding is that Bill 49 is...it'll just be a Code amendment. We don't believe that...that it would result in any change to the budget proposal before you on its own, but, you know, I would defer to our...to the Deputy Director of Council Services if I got that incorrect.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. So, Deputy Director.

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you, Chair. And I'm trying to pull it up on Granicus now, but that is my understanding. The Bill 49 pertains to the Office of Council Services salaries. The proposal that went to this Committee from Chair Lee was...it included a portion that would increase the Members' office budgets. So, that would be done separately, and reflected in the ordinance...I mean, Bill 41, as well as some other things that you guys aren't talking about right now. So, there's that proposal, as well as Councilmember Kama's proposal to increase the Members' offices by different amounts.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do you know when that proposal was going to be --

MS. KAWASAKI: I believe it's in --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- discussed or --

MS. KAWASAKI: -- I believe --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- brought up?

MS. KAWASAKI: -- I don't believe you discussed it yet.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. KAWASAKI: There was discussion, I believe, on the first day of decision-making --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. KAWASAKI: -- where Council Chair Alice Lee inquired as to whether or not those things needed to be included in the matrix, and my understanding was that the answer to that question was no. It is contained in OCS-3, and I'll have to find a Granicus number for that, and I can get that to you shortly.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Deputy Director.

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I have a copy of OCS-3, Chair Lee. And so, your inquiry...you wanted to know if all of whatever's on this letter was included in Bill 49? Is that what you were...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. I...I asked you when would it be appropriate to discuss the addition --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- and you said later.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I actually said Thursday --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And so, now is later.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- we're going to take this up, and we're actually taking it up today, but...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. That's why I made the motion. But...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You made a motion? For...for what?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: To add...to add to the office of each Councilmember \$100,000 to each...the budget for each Councilmember.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right now.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- if...if that's not --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right now. No.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- appropriate, I can withdraw it, and wait until it's the right time.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, no, no. So, we're talking about...okay. I'm getting...so we're talking about Member Kama's priority, which is exactly that, 100,000 for each of the Councilmembers' offices, and you made new motion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I made the motion because we realized it was a duplicate. So, I said, okay, I'll make the motion. So, that's what happened. So, I...so, I can withdraw it to...to make sure it's the appropriate motion --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- at the right time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I only see that there's your motion on the floor. Bill 49, I don't think, has anything for the Councilmembers' offices. But in this letter on OCS, which is what was referenced, OCS-3, it does have this information, and it does include Office of Council Services...Councilmember office accounts, and it has an amount, 643,077, but that's not part of the bill...Bill 49.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Deputy Director?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We can let Pro Tem Kama handle it. I can withdraw my motion. Up to you...I mean just pick one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Well, it's not part of bill...Deputy Director Kawasaki, is it part of Bill 49? I think that's the confusing part.

MS. KAWASAKI: It's not a part of Bill 49.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 49.

MS. KAWASAKI: The proposal that Council Chair made and is in OCS-3, and Councilmember...I'm sorry, Pro Tem Kama has an alternate proposal for Member offices in the matrix.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, in other words...so in other words, Chair Lee, in 49, it doesn't say anything about the Councilmembers' offices.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That wasn't her question, that was my question.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Fine. So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I thought she and I...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And I...and I got that answer a while ago. I'm good --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- I said, long time ago.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I thought Pro Tem and I had duplicate proposals, if...but if not, I can withdraw my...my motion.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Your motion . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I still support my proposal, but, you know, if...if...but if it's more appropriate for you to say it, then that's fine with me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, I withdraw my motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Withdraw your motion, and was it Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Member Cook, I think, seconded it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Cook? Okay. Withdraw.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I would prefer to take them all together, Bill 49 and whatever other proposals were included in the memo from OCS-3, and then we can vote on them all together. I...I could be supportive if Bill 49 passes. Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Are you done?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Deputy Director, to clarify, Bill 49, does it include or not the Councilmember office accounts?

MS. KAWASAKI: It does not include the Councilmember account.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right, it does not. But OC-3 [sic], which is correspondence to the Councilmembers, has, on page 2, OCS management salaries. It was just talking about adjustments, but it has...it has your...what you're looking at on your screen, the proposed table and the breakdown. Is that all included in Bill 49?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. KAWASAKI: No.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, this 1.7 million is...is not the correct amount for Bill 49?

MS. KAWASAKI: No. That includes other cost items.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: What are you looking at me for? I mean, what you want?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I mean it's...because it's like your --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: What do you want?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- bill, right? Bill 49 is your bill, and there is a confusion about are the Office of Council Services...offices...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: There's no confusion. She answered...Deputy Director answered me a long time ago, and I said I was good. I'm not confused.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Everyone's...no one else is confused.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, Members, what we have before us is Member Kama's...as I'm trying to get to is her priority for the Office of Council Services office. Member Kama...oh no, where did all my papers go?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, I already asked if we could take that up all one time, because it's the same thing as OCS-3.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's not the same thing as OCS-3. That's what Deputy Director just said.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's part of OCS-3. It's a duplicate. That's what Chair Lee was explaining. Member...Member Kama's proposal is in OCS-3 as well. The...the...to increase the Councilmembers' offices by 100,000 is in the OCS-3 memo. And I asked if we could take it all up one time, and Bill 49 one time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So...so --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, go ahead.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- Chair, if I may?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Chair Lee, her proposal is OCS-3. This is my proposal. And the way to clarify all of this...I mean, it almost sounds like a duplicate. It sounds like maybe we should have figured this out days ago, if it was going to be you or me, right? But that didn't happen because I wasn't here, or whatever.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Amen.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: But...oh, should I keep preaching? Don't get me started, now. I'm a Pentecostal. Anyway, so I think...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm a Presbyterian.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I'm a Presbyterian.

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I think it's getting late, Chair. It's not even --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, we're trying to go home.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- 5:00. And she's a pescatarian.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Oh, okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, it has nothing to do with religion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I know. She's the devil.

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No, she's the queen. She's the queen of the butter rolls. Okay. Sorry, Chair. But I think what I was trying to get to is, can we take a look at OCS-3 too, and figure out where we're at when we do that? Or do you just want to do this then on the fly --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- on the wings?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, all of you have OCS-3, and you all --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I'm going to go look for it now.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- all of you have Bill 49. And you're...you have a separate priority, Member Kama, which is different from OCS-3.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I didn't even see OCS-3.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Can you pass out OCS-3? Or...or what Granicus number is that?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, OCS-3 is number 155 in Granicus.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: 155. 155?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, 155.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: 155.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 155. I have too many white papers here. Yeah. Okay. So, Members, I'm going to take a short recess so we could look at this document. It is now 4:04, and we'll come back at...you got...yeah, we're getting there. You got to stay here overnight, so 4 --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: What? Stay overnight?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- 4:10. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 4:04 p.m.
RECONVENE: 4:27 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. It is now 4:27, and we are doing revisits, and after that, we'll take up bills. Member Paltin.

DEPARTMENT OF FIRE AND PUBLIC SAFETY

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I need to give some money back to the Fire Department because we straightened out the position IDs, and the warm bodies, and whatnot. So...as soon as my Teams come up. Okay. For the Department of Fire and Public Safety, I move to restore the cut I made to B.7.a.(1), Category A.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, we clarified which are the vacancies, and they have a recruit class on right now. They have another one scheduled for June. And as these people come in and fill the F-1 positions, then they can hire folks to fill the F-3 positions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You want to know the amount?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you have the amount. Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, we cut 178,352 plus fringe.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 352 [sic] plus fringe. Okay. Any other discussion? All right. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. I'm sorry, Member Cook? Oh.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(inaudible). . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I did the second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. Can vote? Okay. So, we have...who is not here? I guess we do not have Member Johnson and Member U'u-Hodgins. So, that's seven, and two excused.

VOTE:	AYES:	Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.
--------------	--------------	---

NOES:	None.
--------------	--------------

ABSTAIN:	None.
-----------------	--------------

ABSENT:	None.
----------------	--------------

EXC.:	Councilmembers Johnson and U'u-Hodgins.
--------------	--

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to restore the cut made to B.7.c.(1), Category A, 100,000 plus fringe.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Same...same discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee, and you have provided the information. Any more discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No more discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Cook, or you're ready to vote? Okay. All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think we're still with seven "ayes" and two excused, Member U'u-Hodgins and Member Johnson.

VOTE:	AYES:	Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.
--------------	--------------	---

NOES:	None.
--------------	--------------

ABSTAIN:	None.
-----------------	--------------

ABSENT:	None.
----------------	--------------

EXC.:	Councilmembers Johnson and U'u-Hodgins.
--------------	--

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Continue on, Member Paltin.

DEPARTMENT OF FINANCE

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. For Finance, I move to change the rates for out-of-state vehicle permits to \$100 [sic] because, you know, the DMV is so short-staffed that this

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

is an added burden, to accommodate the ever-increasing amounts of out-of-state cars we have coming over here.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee. Were you also going to talk about aquatic life?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was also going to talk about aquatic life, but I can't find that page. If someone remembers.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, it's on page 12, towards the bottom part. Page 12.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Staff.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Could we just confirm the amount that the...the permit fee will now be?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, the out-of-state one?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, please.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 200.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was going for 100 bucks [sic].

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You got it? Did you get it?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, if we could get some further clarification, perhaps? Our understanding is that the out-of-state vehicle permit fee is already set at \$100 in Appendix B?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, sorry. I meant \$200.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: From 200 to 100 [sic].

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 100 to 200.

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And the aquatic...aquatic life?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So, did we vote on the out-of-state?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, we didn't vote. Are you taking them together, or you want to...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh...oh, you want me to take it together?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. Okay. For aquatic life operations permits, I move to change, as a part of the same motion, a) to 800, b) to 50, and c) to 50.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Paltin, second by Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You know, the Finance Department is very busy, and these are kind of, you know, luxury things for them to do. And so, they have to drop what they're doing to do this, and it's a great added expense on people.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? If not, all in favor, raise your hand and say "aye." We've got Member Johnson back, so we have...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Can you restate the motion, Chair? I'm sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. The motion is to move the out-of-state vehicle permit fee from 100 to 200, and aquatic life operations from 640 to 800.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's...that's next year.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 800,000?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Next year.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Dollars.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And b) is 50, and c) is 50.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. That's the motion. All in...any more discussion? All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye." So, we have eight "ayes," and one excused, Member U'u-Hodgins.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Moving on to DEM, I move to restore my cut to B.5.b.(1)(i), Category A, 200,000 plus fringe.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, should I do it all at once?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, can you do it all...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And as well --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Johnson...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- my restore to...move to restore cut to B.5.b.(1), Category B, \$998,750, as well to restore my cut to B.5.c.(1), Category A, 300,000 plus fringe, as well as B.5.c.(1), Category B, \$1 million, as well as my changes to rates and fees on the change to Ramseyered fees. Back to...do you want me to say it all? The part...or can I just say back...to restore it back?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: This is the sewer?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Restore it back.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: The sewer fee, right?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sewer fees --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- restore it back to what it was...to the Mayor's proposal.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Yeah. So, we believe that the...the Committee never voted on changing the sewer fees. I think it got tabled before it was voted, so it should just remain --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, remain the same.

MR. KRUEGER: -- at the Mayor's proposal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So, only I need to restore the money then? Okay. So, then that's...that's it for that proposal, and then I'll come back for something else.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, the motion then would only impact the...to restore the funds that you...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Cut from the Sewer Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. Members, all in favor, raise your hand...

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, Chair --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: -- could we confirm the second? Apologies.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member Johnson. Okay. So, Member Johnson made the second. Any more discussion? All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. so, Member Sinenci is there, so only missing is Member U'u-Hodgins.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Then I --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Motion carries.

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and
 Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin,
 Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. Are we good?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Then I move to...on 5.a.(2), restore the 1.25 for Ma‘alaea Village Association for design work-type preparation related to construction and operation of the Ma‘alaea Regional Wastewater Reclamation System.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, a motion made by Member Paltan, second by Member Rawlins-Fernandez. And so, basically you want to put back the 1--what was it?--1.25 million for Ma‘alaea --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- for their wastewater system?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. Are we on discussion?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Time...time for discussion. Okay. So, the motion made by you, and second by Member Rawlins-Fernandez. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, we...we’ve received a lot of additional clarifying information from the residents. And, you know, for me, my highest priority would be the

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

environment right there. I don't know if you guys remember the code red swell that, like, went right through Mala Restaurant, but guys were getting sick, long barrels, and...and, you know, Kai Lenny guys, when they came out, they were all covered with rash and like that, and it was just, like, really gross. So, something...something needs to be done. Not that I'm supporting the vacation rental folks, I'm supporting the...the ocean and the reef and the habitat for our marine life.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion Members? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Like Member Paltan, I did receive information that clarified this funding. There's also the million dollar EPA grant that they were able to secure, and they would lose if...without this funding. This is not a commitment for multiple years. This is a vote for this funding for this year. And it's Ma'alaea. There's an okina, M-A-'A, Ma'alaea. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussions? All right. Seeing none. So, Members, I'm going to vote against this, so we can have a roll call. And I still stand by...with the years that I've been sitting in the Council, this has gone through evolutions of this before, and that they had an opportunity to tie into our Central Maui Wastewater Reclamation Facility that's being built, but they had, I guess, decided not to because this is something new. The concerning thing is that what was shared with us in testimony was that there would be an \$8 million appropriation that they would need next year. So, I guess if nobody else, then it's roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Excused.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Thank you for the second there, Chair Lee. For my discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: If you recall, Cecile Powell came before us and testified right after we did this cut, and she said vacancies won't impact these grants. These grants help small nonprofits and startups. And I like to work with the departments, and if they say they can get it done, then I...especially DEM, I've been really impressed with them. I want to work with them. I want to give them that 400,000. That's my motion, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Okay. Any more discussion? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'd like a roll call. I mean, the money...it was an additional 400,000 for Environmental Protection and Sustainability, and we went way over adding that amount. But...yeah. So, just roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other comments? Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Excused.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: -- under their category.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- and we passed it?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: We did not. That was one of my revisions [sic].

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. You want to revisit it now?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay. If...if I may. Thank you. Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. Move to increase Category B by 200,000 for the Hāna Resiliency Hub for property clearing and build-out. And this would go to MEMA Category B.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more discussion? Member . . .(inaudible). . .

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. As you know, this was my second district priority from what my community came out to testify on. And we did have Ms. Ane, Mr. Cooper, and Mr. Kalanikau meet with the MEMA representative, Mr. Notestone (*phonetic*) and Mr. Crawford, on...on securing...we did secure the property, so they're just asking for 200 to set up the resiliency hub. The 400,000, I believe, currently in there is for West Maui and South Maui, and so the added 200,000 would be for East Maui. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Any more discussion? If not, let's vote. All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We have...who is missing? Member U'u-Hodgins is missing. So, it is eight "ayes" and one excused.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Do we have any more revisits, Staff?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I do, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member Johnson. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: This is...I'm going to ask a question to Director Milner if she's on the call, and according to her answer, maybe I do have a revisit. But Director Milner, if you're here?

MS. MILNER: Aloha, Chair. Yes, always here.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Director. You know, Director Agawa came before us and testified...you recall that, when he came? And I think he had a few alternative cuts that he would be willing to do, and for the life of me, I don't remember, so I figure I'd reach out to you. Do you know what the Department would be willing to cut after...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can...can I just say, he offered some CIP cuts to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: In trade.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- get down to the 5 percent, but the 5...the reduction wouldn't be for the residents --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- and it would further kick the can down the road.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah. All right. I'm not here for that one, but is...that was the only one he came...he came...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, that was...that was my understanding. He said --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- it doesn't work like that because of the flows, and the --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- velocity, and the algorithm.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so, if we cut 50 percent of the anticipated increase, it won't reach the residents.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. All right. Well, anything else to add, Director? Otherwise, I'm...I'm done. Nope? None? Okay.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. No, Councilmember Paltin covered it. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you so much. Thank you, Chair. No further questions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, that was kind of interesting. All right.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Members...

OFFICE OF COUNCIL SERVICES

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, I think we're going to do bill...I move to pass Bill 48.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Wait, any more revisits? Yeah, we have Member Kama's.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Increasing the Councilmembers' office budget.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. It is. It is, which started this whole discussion. Go ahead. Member Kama, that is your proposal.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Your mic. Mic.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I'm sorry. My proposal is to increase the Councilmembers' office budget allocations by \$100,000 each.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion member...made...made by Member Kama, second by Chair Lee. Discussion.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, I...I had put this in as a priority because my sense is--this is just me now, it might not be you all--but I need more Staff in my office to help me do some of the work that needs to get done. I appreciate all the work that OCS gives me, and I...I think I work them just as hard sometimes as you all work them through budget, and I appreciate them. Thank you, James. I appreciate the fact that I've had James as my HLU Staffer since I think almost the beginning when I first came, and so I still do appreciate him, but I still need office help, so that's why I put it out there. I...I couldn't ask just for myself, so I wanted to be fair to everybody, and ask for everybody. But that's my proposal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. Chair Lee, as the seconder, do you have any comments?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I support the...the motion because I, too, could use more help in my office. And, you know, we...we need to make sure that our compensation is competitive. So, as time goes on, we're going to have to do that. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Rawlins-Fernandez? Your hand is . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I could be supportive of this. I thought we were going to take it in an...in an order because I'm not going to vote to support this unless we support our OCS Staff because that's shameful. I'm not going to support our offices getting a higher...an increase unless we also support our OCS Staff. So, if we have the votes for that, then I can vote for this, but I'm not voting for this unless we bring everyone along.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more comments? Do you? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess I'm okay with giving the Staff raises and not doing this. . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, we're taking this up as...as a revisit, actually, for Member Kama, and I guess...well, we don't have to explain the Chair Lee thing. All right. All in...oh, this is a roll call. Go ahead.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm not voting.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Does that count as a "no" then? Deputy Director?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, why don't we just...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I already explained my position. I'm not going to vote on this.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That's fine.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Why don't we switch them? Is there a reason why? I might have missed it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. I'm sorry --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- we're in the middle of roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Continue.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Excused.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

MS. MACDONALD: One second, Chair. We’re just...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You’ll get the votes if we do salaries first. If we do OCS salaries, I’ll vote yes. I said that already.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You don’t have the votes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MACDONALD: Sorry, Chair, I would defer to Mr. Hanano on how to proceed with the total.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Either Deputy Director or Mr. Hanano.

. . .*(silence)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Shall I take a recess?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair, can we have a short recess, please?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we’ll come back at 4:53. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 4:51 p.m.
RECONVENE: 5:06 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Very good. All right. Thanks for the break. And we are looking again at Member Kama’s revisit. And you...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: You’re ready for me?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Keani...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Huh? You're going to withdraw?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Ha'ina 'ia mai ana ka'puana.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . . *(chuckling)* . . .

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: You withdraw.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I got to, I withdraw my motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Did she say she got to? Okay. So, that's Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hāna ukulele what?

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . . *(laughing)* . . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I withdraw my second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Everybody's getting tired. Okay. All right, Members. So, where we are is, we're going to take up Bill 48, 49, and the corresponding resolutions for 25-89 and 25-90; is that correct? Is that the order? Yeah, 89 and 90. All right. So, is there any discussion on Bill 48?

BILL 48 (2025)

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I move to pass Bill 48 on...recommend passage of Bill 48 on first reading.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member by...Member Rawlins-Fernandez, second by Chair Lee. Discussion.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Bill 48 is in response to Salary Commission setting the salaries, and then the corresponding changes from there for Prosecuting office and the Corp. Counsel...Department of Corp. Counsel.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? Seeing none.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Everybody's tired.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Just tired. All right. So, Members, I am going to ask for roll call. I stand by my position, that we need to have that study done to figure out the impacts of the Salary Commission, again, which was...which is really sending ripple effects throughout our...our County. So, I hear them, I think I want to have the study done, and then at that time, July 1, hopefully we can make the appropriate recommendation. Go ahead. Okay. Any other...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Roll call...yes.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: For clarity, this is the one that the Salary Commission passed? Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: This is regarding the deputies, it's not the Salary Commission one.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It was in response to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's what I said.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- the Salary Commission setting --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- the salaries for the Director and the Deputy Director, and then the corresponding Deputy Directors --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- and their offices...in their offices --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Correct.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- in --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: But it's...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- the corresponding
departments...Prosecuting Office, Corp. Counsel.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. It was in --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: But it's...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- response to that --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . response.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- but this is not the Salary Commission...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We did that one already.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We...we added the Director and Deputy Director when we took the Salary Commission's salaries for all the department heads, and deputies, and elected, and then we added it to Account A for all the departments. Sorry, I wasn't clear. I don't have notes, I was just winging it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, we did that. We took the...all the expenses that the Administration put in Countywide, and we did that separate resolution yesterday. So, thanks for that clarification, Member Cook. Roll call. Or anybody else?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Oh, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: You know, I...I hear where you're coming from, where you're saying, you're going to vote no, but I want to try to see if there's...first off, let me clarify. This is the OCS?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, no, this is Prosecuting --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: All the attorneys.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- Department of the Prosecutor...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: But I still want to say something.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And Corporation Counsel deputies.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, you know, I...I want us to kind of all vote on this in unison. And I...I...I understand your...your concern about this study, but I want...I want to try to see if I can...see if you could reconsider. Because, you know, again, these are the folks that do a lot of the work for us, so I don't know if this study is going to tell us anything. I think it's going to tell us that we...it's...the cost of living here is highest, second highest in the nation, third highest in the nation, and I don't know if this study's going to get the result that we...we obviously know it's very expensive to live here. So, once again, I would like for you to try to reconsider, and think about who these folks are. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you, Member Johnson. I know that you have a big heart for all the people of...in our community, and I just want to say that I appreciate...this resolution is regarding the --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Bill.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- deputies...this bill is regarding the salaries for Deputy Corporation Counsel and the deputies in Prosecuting Attorney. And we do understand that they work hard and...you know, and what we're seeing is a reaction to the Salary Commission action as it's rippling through our community. And I...and I...I stand by that we see the problem, and that I think as a body, where we have an opportunity to make a decision, that we can be...have some factual information behind us so that we can make a decision that is not...that is with more parity. So, that's the reason, and...that's the reason I'm going to ask for a roll call vote. Member Paltin first and then you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For...for my discussion, I would...I would just say like if...if you've struggled as an adult to come up with all the money to pay all the kids, if you've struggled as an adult to pay all the bills that keep increasing, then...then you would understand that this...this isn't as much of an intellectual decision as it is feeling like, you know, all of us collectively are not being paid a living wage if we have to work more than one job. Local 5 says it the best--one job should be enough. And, you know, like

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

I know we're not talking about the clerks right now, or the secretaries, or Bargaining Unit 3, but when I go out in the community, I see so many people from...from the 7th Floor working their second and third jobs. And I see choke County workers all over the place working their second and third jobs because you can't make it with just one job. And the only really way to raise it from the bottom is to give the people at the top more. Because like it was said, people have specialized skill. And so, you...you can't pay somebody at the bottom necessarily more than someone that went to school for years and years for their job. And so, this is the way that we lift everybody up. Member Johnson said it before, I seen it in the ocean, the rising tide lifts all boats. And everybody is really struggling right now. And it...it may be hard to see that if you and your friends aren't struggling, but we're going to...we're going to lose a lot more people from Maui County if...if we don't take action. And...and what is demoralizing is that the Salary Commission saw it with a study. The study flows through for everybody else, really. I mean, if...if the Mayor, and the Directors and the Deputy Directors weren't getting paid what they should be paid, then everybody isn't. And...and I know there's a lot of comments on social media knocking those guys, but, you know, nobody asked for the fire. There's...there's some crackpots out there that think that we wanted this to happen, or...or whatever, you know, like because we wanted to take people's land or something, or we wanted a new shoreline, or whatever is the reason, but that was the last thing I wanted. And personally, I'm...I'm not...I don't have free time because there is so much work to be done. And...and the salaried guys, the Directors and the Deputy Directors, it's a salary, which I think allows people to take advantage of that because they're working 24/7. And the people in those positions that have families, I want people in those position that have families because then they know why we're doing what we're doing. I mean, people that...that don't have children, maybe you can run them a little harder because they don't have to feed people. Maybe they have animals, I don't know. But I want people that have families to be part of the people that are making the big decisions because then they know. And the rents are whack because of FEMA and the insurance, the sewer fees are going up, the water fees are going up, all these things are going up, and so many of our County employees...I don't need the data. I don't need somebody to show me because I know. I know people in the County that are ALICE. And waiting for a study is not going to help the people that need the help right now. And...and if you only lift up the bottom, then people at the top are going to walk. If you only lift up the top, people at the bottom are going to walk. So, I can understand that some of us are very comfortable right now, but please understand that the majority of people are not. It's not just the missing middle housing, it's the missing middle class. It's the people in the middle that are missing. Because there's people that are very comfortable, and there's people that aren't making it, are about to come [sic] homeless, and we don't have any safety net. I mean, I just got verification that it's incorrect...what Director Tsuhako was saying is incorrect. The State Department of Human Services said that it's incorrect, and we're making it harder for folks that are homeless to enter shelter, and...and that's not even correct information. And with the higher salaries, we can hire somebody competent who won't make life harder for homeless people.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. And I echo all the sentiments that Member Paltin just shared. So, I...Bill 48 is "A BILL FOR AN ORDINANCE AMENDING SECTION 2.44.015, MAUI COUNTY CODE, RELATING TO SALARIES OF DEPUTIES CORPORATION COUNSEL AND DEPUTIES, PROSECUTING ATTORNEY." The Corporation Counsel and the Prosecuting Attorney shall have the sole discretion to set the annual salary of each deputy in their respective departments within the ranges. And so, this bill provides...updates the ranges after the Salary Commission set the salaries for the director and deputies, or First Corp. Counsel and Deputy. For...so, these...these are our attorneys. And I would like to be able to attract the...the best attorneys because these are our prosecuting attorneys. And so, you know, I want them to be able to enforce the laws that...that we pass. And this is our Corporation Counsel. And so, they represent us, the government, the County Government, when we are sued. And the investment in, you know, high-quality attorneys will pay dividends when they defend the County against, you know, frivolous lawsuits or, you know, those that's looking for deep pockets. And so, you know, like I think the return on investment for very...like for competitive salaries, it...it...it's...it's a huge return on investment. And so, if you didn't see the study that MGT did, they looked at comparable communities with...with population sizes similar to ours, with a government budget similar to ours. They looked at Anchorage, Boise, Chandler, Columbus, Muskogee, Gilbert, Glendale, Hawai'i County, Hawai'i State, Henderson, Honolulu County, Lexington, Fayette, Ontario, Oxnard, Riverside, Roseville, Salt Lake City, San Luis Obispo County, Scottsdale, Tempe, Vancouver. They...they looked at the...the cost of living. They, you know, adjusted to the cost of labor, differences between geographic areas. And they looked at all the benefits, and...and to see what would be appropriate. And that...that was the recommendation that they gave to the Salary Commission. And, you know, I'm, you know, thankful to the Salary Commission for, you know, taking the position they did so that we attract, you know, high-quality, high-performing workers to our County, to...to do the important work that needs to...to be done on a regular basis...and especially now, with recovery from the fire. So, I'm in full support of Bill 48. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. I just want to say...oh, Member Kama? Go...go ahead.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I just was looking over all of the...the bill itself, and it actually begins July 1st, 2022. And it has all the different years of ranges where people were getting paid at that time...I mean, the Corp. Counsel and our Prosecuting Attorney. And then as I read every page, they did get small salary increases, you know, over the years, '22, '23, '24, and now we come to '25. And it almost looks like it's a huge leap. But, you know, when I...when I was reading each page-by-page, I realized that those are so small, the manini. But then when you come to the last page, it's like, whoa, it's a big jump. It almost looks like that. But technically, really, it's just catching up, right? And that's what it's going to look like, I think, for the next year, or two, or three, is that as we try to play catch-up with everybody--not just those at the top, like Member Paltin was saying--but as we continue to strive to figure out how to help our County employees, you know, at the...at the different skill levels that they're at, and the different union...bargaining units they're at. So, you know, when I look at that, I think, sometimes I sit here, and we're in exec session, and I'm very grateful to the attorneys

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

that sit in front of us, and talk to us. I'm so grateful that...that they have the skills, the knowledge, the communication level...because a lot of the stuff that we get in Corp. Counsel and the legalese language is like, okay, somebody tell me, in pure English, what that means, what actually happened in this incident? So, I'm very grateful that we have some really good attorneys, and I think I want to keep these guys, and we want to get them to get better, and to get sharper, right? Because as time goes on, there's a lot more things we're going to have to contend with, Chair. So, I can support Bill 48. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Very good. Anybody else? All right. So, please don't misunderstand...oh, Member Cook. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. We talk about a livable wage, I don't know what's a livable wage. And I know that everybody needs more money, everybody deserves more money. I'm grateful for the raise that we recently received. I also know what it's like to have to do a side job. I'm supportive of a raise, it's just I feel that this 48, 49...it's a really big jump. I'm more than receptive to something less, but I can't support this big a leap one crack. I think that the...we're raising property taxes a lot from what we've done, and I think that the community has spoken loud and clear about the challenges that they're facing. And we're not fixing the community's pay scale. I'd like to work from the bottom up, and get as much bang for our buck as we can for the people who are really not making a living wage. So, I just wish it was less. I can't vote for this right now, but I'm very receptive to an increase. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair, for my third and final. There was one point that I forgot to make because I didn't write it down. You know, you see...you see the...the...the cost of...or the salaries that are set. What you don't see here is the jump in costs for school. I know, law school is so expensive, and if we don't pay a salary...I pay over \$1,000 a month for school, and...and I got a good deal. And so, you know, I...I struggle with this...with the salary I have to...to pay for all the things, plus my student loans. And...and so, I...I want people to be able to, you know, be public servants in...in our County, but be able to afford their...their...their student debt. So, I just wanted to make that point. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I just want to say real quickly that, you know, it...it shouldn't be surprising that we have 6...over 600 vacancies in the County, and that is the reason why we can't keep up with...we can't pay them what we should be paying them. In order for us to be competitive, in order for us to get our projects and programs implemented, we need to face reality. And reality is, we are so far behind. And so, that is the reason

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

why there is a substantial increase, but that's not because it's unfair. It's because we've been so far behind too long. So, here's an opportunity for us to not only recognize that for certain positions, but to keep on working for all positions. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Anybody else? Okay. So, I will say that this is not about who has more money, or who doesn't have more money, but it is about our greater community. And we all struggled through this budget process as we listened to all...all members in all different situations about the struggles of living in...in this wonderful place that we are in, with Maui County. And what I don't want to do is take positions and do it--my husband likes to call it willy-nilly--and just onesies, twosies, and...but take it more from a bigger perspective, and so that we can have a basis for a decision that's based on facts, and based upon data that will help us get to a decision that's fair for all. And I heard loud and clear the last testifier...almost the last testifier that we had, Wailuku-Kahului, a person who works in the Planning Department, asking us to take a look at everybody, not only the Office of Council Services, right? And so, to me, Bill 48 is almost like Bill 49, that is...like is a select group of people, although special, and we need them, I hear all of you, but that's why I will say again that I'm looking forward to Member Cook's recommendation, which it sounds like Management is willing to do, and put out an RFP, and get out a study for what's happening with Maui County employees. I do think that what we're going to get...get from the study is going to be--I hate to use the word earth-shattering--but it sure feels like this ripple effect of what we're seeing is breaking all the barriers that may have existed in the structure that we had no control of, but we are now looking at it, and saying we want to do something. And I believe that we will do something. And again, this bill is effective July 1, so it's not like it's effective...you know, it's going to be with the new fiscal year. So, we have some time. And Management, from what I understand from Member Cook, is willing to do this study, and, it sounds like, willing to look at our situation. So, I really appreciate that...you know, what they will do, and then we'll take it from there. I mean, this is not only one group and another group, but this is really all of the employees of Maui County who asked us, please do not forget about us. So, thank you. Thank you. Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair, for my second. I do...I...I hear my colleague about the cost of the professionalism for attorneys, as opposed to some of the other ones. Yeah, both my kids went to school, it's super expensive. And I guess that...that aspect of it for the attorneys, I can--justify isn't the right word--but I can see my way forward. So, I will be in support of this particular Bill 48.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Any other comments? Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Excused.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that’s seven “ayes,” one “no,” one excused, Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins. The motion passes.

VOTE: AYES: Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.

NOES: Chair Sugimura.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: Recommending **FIRST READING** of Bill 48, CD1 (2025).

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you, everybody. Thank you very much. All of the bosses are sitting up there, standing by your employees, appreciate it. All right. Now we'll take up Bill 49.

BILL 49 (2025)

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I move to recommend passage of Bill 49 on first reading.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait, I'm taking it out of order. I got to do the...your bosses, the bosses first, so the resos.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Recommend passage of...of...on first reading? That's what we say, no?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Recommend passage on first reading.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- pull that motion back. I'm going to take the resos up first, which is for David and...I'm sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Director Raatz and...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

RESOLUTIONS 25-89 AND 25-90

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, 25-89 and 25-90.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, take it up both together. Do I have a second?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You did? I didn't hear. Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez and --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Chair Lee...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And Chair Lee seconded.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sorry, I never pull up those resos yet. Oh, okay. So, past practice is...when the deputy...sorry, Department of Corporation Counsel and the Department of the Prosecuting Attorneys, directors, and deputies have a...have a change in their salaries from the Salary Commission, past practice, we...we match our attorneys' salaries, our Director of OCS and Deputy Director of OCS to the other attorneys.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other discussion? Member...Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Okay. History. We've been doing this since 1993. Every single Council has approved all the salary increases for OCS Deputy and Director, following all the Salary Commission's recommendations. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any discussion? Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I would make a friendly amendment for it to be a 10 percent raise instead of 30.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, wait. This is on the resos, not...it's not that. This is the resos for Deputy Director Kawasaki...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I can read the...I...I have it open now. Setting the salary for the Director of Council Services for the remainder of the 2025 to 2027 Council term. That is Resolution 25-89. And then the other one would be 25-90, setting the salary for the Deputy Director of Council Services for the remainder of the 2025-2027 Council term.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. These are the resos for the bosses-ish. Okay. Any other discussion?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Could Staff just clarify? So, the motion on the floor is to recommend adoption of both Resolutions 25-89 and 25-90?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Correct.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. No further discussion. All right. So, all in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Aye. So, who's excused is Member U'u-Hodgins. Is Member Sinenci there? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, eight "ayes," one excused.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: Recommending **ADOPTION** of Resolution 25-89, CD1 and Resolution 25-90, CD1.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Next. So, now we have Bill 89 [sic], and...

BILL 49 (2025)

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Bill 89?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I mean 40...49. Okay. Staff?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I move to pass...or recommend passage of Bill 49 on first reading.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Keani Rawlins-Fernandez, second by Chair Lee. Discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Okay. I'm pulling up Bill 49 so I can read the...Bill 49 is a bill for an ordinance amending Section 2.08.060, Maui County Code, on salaries in the Office of Council Services. And so, similar to what I stated earlier for Bill 48 is, the Salary Commission would set the salaries for the director and the deputy, and then corresponding changes would be made to the rest of the offices...the office Staff. And so, that is what is reflected here in our...the pay...pay plan. The following pay plan is established, and then it has the table setting the pay plan. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, I'm just looking at the Bill 49. And it says, B...and Member...sorry . . .*(inaudible)*. . . and Member Rawlins-Fernandez just kind of read over it. But it...but I'm looking at B.1., and it says, the annual salary for the Director of Council Services and Deputy Director may be set by the Council by resolution. We just did that, right? But it's...what's the difference between may and shall? Is there a difference? We can ask...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: May is there's discretion, and shall is there is no discretion. You must.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. Okay. So, I think...I don't know who the other may, may be...I mean, whoever that other might be. But I would like to say that shall be set by the Council by resolution, just so that we know that's what we do.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: But that's just my only thoughts about that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. That's your amendment.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. Where you see may.

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. KAWASAKI: By way of explanation, I believe the word may is used because that would allow you to do it by resolution or by ordinance. In this case --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, that's the difference.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. KAWASAKI: -- you did it by resolution.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: We do it by reso.

MS. KAWASAKI: You could do it by --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MS. KAWASAKI: -- ordinance --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: That's the reason.

MS. KAWASAKI: -- but it allows you to do both ways.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. The resolution.

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sorry, Member Kama, I didn't know in what context you were asking about may and shall.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: That's okay. I got two answers. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I propose a friendly amendment to lower the...the amount of increase.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So, your...yours is, you want it to be --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, Chair, point of...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- 10 percent?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. So, it's a pay plan, and then it's a pay range. So, we just have to have a little clearer direction on what --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- your proposal is.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- there's a lot...there's a lot of different people, and a lot of different pay ranges, a lot of different things. The average raise was 30 percent, some was even higher than that. I've gotten a lot of pushback from my constituents, from people are...who have been asking about the property tax, asking about the recent raises that

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

the Salary Commission gave, that the...in general, the cost of government and what they're getting out of government, how long it takes for permits, how frustrated people are. And I...I concur. I want OCS Staff to be paid well. They work hard, I respect them. I am not in any way...and it's painful. I said during the...previously, this is not an easy thing to do. I may be the only one that votes like this. But I'm...I want to give raises, but I just feel that 30 percent...because we got 30 percent, and just like boom, boom, boom, everybody at the top is getting all these raises, is...doesn't resonate well with the people. And it has nothing to do with the person, the people...it's the positions. And to get a, you know, 20 to 30 to \$35,000 raise for doing the same work all at once...I wish everybody could get that. And it's...the attorneys, as you said, they have law degrees, et cetera. So, I don't...it's under...it's appropriate for me to justify and clarify my position. And so, that's what I'm doing. And when I say and a raise increase, but proportionately less, I don't know...I don't have a list to give you. But in general, instead of a 30 percent raise, that on average, I would like...they were, I believe, scheduled for about a 5 percent step increase because that's what we've been doing the last three years that I've been here. I have no problem with giving a raise in excess of that step increase. So, a 10 percent would be like a 15 percent raise from what they're currently getting, and I'd be cheering them on. I just feel that it's really challenging for me because I've been told directly by a lot of people that they're not happy. And I'm trying to represent my colleagues in this building well by being supportive, and represent my constituents, who aren't getting raises, who a lot of them are in the ALICE category, and et cetera. And so, that...that's my position. Thank you all for your patience in listening for my reasoning. I don't have a crisp number, but my friendly amendment is to focus on an approval of a raise, but at a lesser amount. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I second that amendment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: But discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, motion made by Member Cook, second by Member Kama. Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, Member Cook...so, you're talking about a total of 15 percent increase --

MR. HANANO: Excuse me, Chair.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- or you're talking about just adding 10 to what they already have?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait, one...one moment.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member [sic] Hanano wants to --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- say something. No.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, we're downgrading you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry. Mr. Hanano?

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair. As I understood it, Councilmember Cook made a friendly amendment. And so, under Rosenberg's, the maker of the initial motion has to agree to that, as well as the second. If not, it'll be treated as a subsequent second motion. And under Rosenberg's, the body can consider up to three live motions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Three?

MR. HANANO: Three, yes. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. Got two. Okay. All right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I don't accept that as a friendly amendment. I didn't know we could friendly amend, like posted resos. So, then it would just become a regular motion to amend, and Member Kama seconded it. Oh, but she did have some clarifying questions, it sounds like.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Kama, you can continue.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So...so, my question to Member Cook was, when you talked about the 15 percent, was that just 10 percent above what they're getting right now, or is it a total of 15 percent?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: It's 10 percent of what they're going to be getting after this next step increase.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, okay. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, it's 10 percent increase --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- that's what you're saying. I just want to be clear so that...because when you do the numbers, the number's going to come out --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- right, right?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: The...the numbers would be 10 percent from the new increase, which would actually be 10 percent plus whatever the step increase is going to be, so...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Good.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. So, the...Mr. Hanano, the way that the bill is written, where would you insert this? Because it doesn't...I think we did calculations, so we...you know, we see what the general increase is, 30 percent, but...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair? Sorry. Member U'u-Hodgins is on. I'm...I'm guessing maybe her video and mic need to be enabled.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I see her --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- raising her hand.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Welcome, Member U'u-Hodgins. We're on...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, no, no, we got to enable her...her video and her mic, I think, so... And I think that's why she's raising her hand. I know what that feels like, Member U'u-Hodgins, I got you.

MS. KAWASAKI: I believe...

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. I think...I think I'm enabled. I was just raising my hand because I didn't want to interrupt. My video is off because I'm driving, and I don't have anything to hold my phone, so I don't want to like commit a crime while trying to set laws, that would be hypocritical of me. But I just...I just wanted to let everybody know that I'm here, and I've been at least just listening to the last few minutes, and I just wanted to let you guys know that I'm here.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I hear what Member Cook has said, and I...I do support a small increase. It's necessary, and that's all I wanted to say. But I'm...I'm here, I'm just driving. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, be safe. All right. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. I...I don't agree that we should minimize what our employees are entitled to. And I believe that whatever is being proposed should be supported, and hopefully be supported. These people--these people--our...our employees, our family, they do not have the benefit of...of any of the extras that the civil servants receive. They're...they...they are at-will employees...no hazard pay, no employment stability. They have no rights to return to OCS after serving, let's say, with the Executive Branch. They have very limited promotional activities...opportunities, no union representation or grievance process, no shortage category differential, no standby pay, no callback pay, no layoff rights, no opportunity for paid sabbatical leave...and the list goes on. This is not apples and apples. Our OCS Staff is in an entirely different category. They work for an entirely different branch of government called the Legislative Branch, and their work is very different and unique. And they should be compensated appropriately for what they do. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, could I amend that amendment to 20 percent? Or do I got to do a friendly one?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Hanano?

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Johnson. Yeah. So, as I stated earlier, you can do up to three motions on the floor at one time, live motions. And so, with your motion, Member Johnson, that will make it three.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MR. HANANO: And then what we'll do is, we'll work backwards.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right. Let's...let's start with the basics. Councilmember Cook, I understand your...your position. It moved my needle. Would you be considering 20 percent?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, it's a friendly amendment.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, no, no. Yeah, in general, no. And given the opportunity, I'll respond to Chair Lee's description of...of the position, and the...the benefits that do come with this that are in parallel with the collective bargaining variance. But thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 15.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I would love your motion, I guess. . . .*(chuckling)*. . . 15.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And...my heart's with you. My heart is here, and it...I would love to go for the whole thing. I...I...I think 15 is appropriate. I think it's appropriate. I'd be more than happy to that if it...if it met the will of the body.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, he's amending his amendment, and the seconder would be Councilmember Kama. If she would agree to his 15 percent, then that would be the amendment on the floor; is that correct?

MR. HANANO: Chair, thank you. Yes, that would be correct. If the seconder, so that would be...I mean, yeah, Member Kama, and Member Cook, who made the motion, would agree to your friendly amendment, then it would turn into just two motions.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair *[sic]* Johnson.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: The arbitrator. Okay. So, Chair Lee, I just want to...or Member Cook was also saying this, but I always...we always hear that our OCS Staff doesn't get the same benefits as the civil service.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Security. Security.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Huh?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: They don't have job security.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: They don't have job security.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, job security. So, they don't get the same benefits. But when...when you think about it, I think they receive retirement, which is, I think, a big benefit about working for government, and an organization like this. But more than that, vacation, holidays, all the sick leave, you know, all the things that we are so lucky to receive. And we...the benefits that we get are the same as, you know, the Office of Council Services, I believe. So, maybe there's no, what you call security, in that way, but I believe that there are all the other, you know, benefits that they receive. So, I just want to state that. All right. Members, so where are we? We are looking at a...oh --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Amendment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Member...Member...no, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. I think...I believe that the OCS gets overtime; is that correct?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I was told that.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I didn't mention overtime.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, no. I...I just mentioned that because they do work a lot of hours. And they do...I would expect them to get compensated for it. I think my 15 percent plus the, I believe, 5 percent step that they're receiving is going to be a 20 percent, just to be clear. So, anyway, I've said my piece. So, I'll just be quiet and see how everybody votes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair, I'd like to ask for a recess.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: At least 15 minutes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we're going to go until....right now, it's almost 6:00, so 6:05.
...*(gavel)*...

RECESS: 5:52 p.m.
RECONVENE: 6:09 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ...*(gavel)*... Welcome back to the Budget, Finance, Economic Development Committee. We are in the midst of Bill 49, and Chair Lee asked for a break, or a recess. So, Chair Lee?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Maybe you can remind us what is the main motion, and then I think somebody did an amendment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Staff, you can correct me. I think we're talking about a 15 percent. Please.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, so the main motion on the floor is moved by Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez, seconded by Chair Lee, to recommend passage of Bill 49 on first reading. And Councilmember Cook, seconded by Councilmember Kama, to...to change the amounts in the bill to 10 percent raises, and then there was a friendly amendment to make it 15 percent. So, on the floor now is an amendment to make it 15 percent in...in the bill. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Your...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm really hoping that everyone, again, will be reminded about the disparity in...in what the benefits are for one group versus the other group, and how much instability there is with our OCS Staff. Their tenure...people don't realize, their tenure is only for two years, and then they're up for either rehire or termination. It's...it's that serious, and that precarious. So, I'm...I'm hoping that people will consider a much higher increase than 15 percent. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you, Chair Lee. Any other discussion? Okay. Call for...oh, okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Okay. I wrote...I wrote it down so I wouldn't lose track. Okay. First, what I heard...in response to only the...the...the top getting raises and, you know, managers, and only a select few, I'll remind us that we just added to the budget the funding that will help to get the supplemental agreement once the master agreement is executed. And so, the intention is for...for us to bring everyone along, and not only those that we have direct control over the salaries. And I think we did put our money where our mouth is. All eight of us put the...the funding to try to do what the testifiers asked us to do, which is set the salaries so that they're not struggling. You know, that's what I heard. I...I...I did hear opposition, but the opposition was only there because they didn't want to get left behind. They wanted to have salaries set in a way that wouldn't force them to have to work more than one job. As you know, we stated, one job should be enough. The second thing is regarding government services. We've talked about vacancies, and, you know, if there's only the few employees that are willing to work in our County, then of course, the services are not going to be, you know, to the level that the community would want it to be. And if we continue to, you know, pay less-competitive salaries throughout the County, then we're just going to continue to have these vacancies as, you know, Chair Lee said, and then it's just a vicious cycle. We're not...we're not changing anything in the cycle in

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

order to address the salaries. As you know, we talked about Member Johnson increase...spearheaded...or his proposal was to increase the PALS Summer Program folks. And when I spoke with our Parks and Rec folks, you know, the lines to apply for those positions now went from, you know, begging people to work for these poverty wages to the line going out the door because the salary was competitive. So, we were attracting people because it was...it wasn't poverty wages. And that's how you break the cycle. That's how you fill vacancies. You pay competitively. And, you know, the government is always competing with the private sector for employees. Their...they don't have, you know, collective bargaining agreements that they have to stick to for...for six months, and work with three other counties, and the State who holds more votes than, you know, the counties. They can just set their salaries just a little higher, and then boom, you know, they will get...and they fill their positions faster. So, in that competition, they...they beat us. But what happens is, if we set our salaries more competitively, then their...the private sector is also forced to then compete with us, and then raise their salaries. So, those in the private sector actually get the benefit also, even though we have no control over their...no direct control over their salaries because it's private sector. But if the public sector is now paying more competitively, and then we are beating out the private sector in getting, you know, the best employees, then they're going to then lift their salaries to be more competitive with us. And that's how it works...the whole rising tide lifting all boats. That's how it works. This is...I don't see this as raises. I see this as, like Member Kama said earlier, catching up because those incremental salaries were not keeping pace with the cost of living here. It was not keeping pace to the cost of higher education. If we want highly-qualified individuals to go to college, go get the training, and then we're not going to compensate them for the education and training, certification, licenses, why would they come work for us? We have to pay competitively. We have to keep pace with the cost of education. And the final thing. So, the salaries, as it's set now is...is less than what the directors...it's a less percentage than...than the directors and deputy directors that were set by the Salary Commission. And that's just to maintain morale. Because if we leave them behind, what do you think that's going to do to morale? We need to have a strong foundation to continue the work that we do on behalf of the people. We have a lot of work to do. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Member Paltin, then Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, wait. Member Paltin first.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Oh, sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. I mean, the increase is looking between 30 to 43,000, depending upon what?...in one pop. And it's like a half...a \$21,500 pay raise this year,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

and then continued with steps. So, I agree. It's...so, yeah, I'm just...I just wanted to kind of put numerically on it that it's a substantial increase. I think that it's...so, I'm going to look forward to the vote, and let's move on. We got other stuff to do and...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Couple of things. I think it's important to remember that if you're at an M., you can't get a step. So, not everyone will get steps, and then we're kind of penalizing our most experienced guys. The other thing is, like if you look at the way it is now, because I think everything doesn't take into effect until July 1st, we got guys that are working for us that are way smarter than all of us, majority of us, whatever you want to say. And...and then we're bumping up 30 percent, so now we got stupider people getting paid more than the people that are actually doing the work, and with the brains of the situation. Like I just put in a PAF, and then automatic legislation comes about. I don't know what I'm doing. I'm not a lawyer, you know? And...and that we got paid so much is mostly because of our hours, and time, and private life, and not 20 hours a week. But if you guys think you're the brains of the operation, that's not the truth. That's all I got to say. And, you know, how humiliating is it to work for people that are stupider than you, and then they get way more money than you? Like, I just...I wouldn't do it. I wouldn't...I wouldn't constantly dumb things down for my way better-paid employer, or boss, or something like that. I wouldn't do it. And so, I don't know, we...we did have...like when we first came in, we had a revolving door of people. Most people have one boss. These guys have like 11 bosses. And a lot of us bosses don't see eye-to-eye. So, we have a hard job because we have 30,000 people...I had 30,000 people that voted for me. But they don't tell me what to do every day. These guys got 11 people kind of telling them what to do every day, and probably 9 of them are stupider than them. So, that takes a lot of patience. And I mean, I don't want to...I don't want to jinx us or anything, but I hope we don't go back to the revolving door of people that we can't even keep for two years.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other comments? Member Cook? No? Okay. Oh, Member Sinenci. Sorry, I didn't see you. Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair, for my opportunity. And like Member Cook, I, too, have been receiving numerous emails and texts from...from other Staff members. And...and, you know, they're all...they all have valid points. However, I, too, voted for the supplemental agreement because I'm not just focusing on OCS. I want to focus on everybody, and the entire County. For me, Chair, this is an investment into our people. The additional monies, all of this is...is into our people. And we've seen it, we've seen it at the Federal level and the State level. And, you know, they're...they're constantly trying to raise...raise salaries, but it's...it's not being raised fast enough to keep up with the cost of living. We talked about rebuilding West Maui. It's going to take, you know, a herculean effort by everybody, including us. So, I think we need a County government that can...is up to the challenge. And...and because their focus, their families, their...their...their sacrifices will be tremendous. And I did read the...the MGT report, and it says that the human resource functions, in order to achieve maximum efficiency and effectiveness in the delivery of municipal services, a compensation plan will help to

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

ensure that the County not only recruit the best and brightest employees, but can also retain those employees. The County avoids the cost of recruitments and lost productivity while maximizing the...the benefits of the investments it has made. And we're making that investments today in employees, into our people, and the institutional and agency knowledge acquired by these employees over these...over all of their tenure. So, I'm...with that, with my vote, I also pledge my...you know, my efforts, and my...in...in raising everybody up, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member U'u-Hodgins has her hand up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Member U'u-Hodgins? Sorry I didn't see you.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: No, that's okay, I just put it on. Thank you so much, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, for recognizing my hand being raised. I just want to say, for the most part, I don't disagree with anything by anyone that has been said tonight. I agree with Member Paltin, especially that for the most part, OCS Staff, way smarter than us. Dumber is probably not a word I use too often, but that was a funny word, I like it. If my camera was on, you probably would've seen me crack up. But I don't think that we pay our Staff poverty wages. I do think that we pay them well. I'm happy to support Member Cook's increase. I don't disagree with Chair Lee that they don't have the security. And at the same time, they do have the ability to move steps every single year. And I know Member Paltin said that at some point, they don't. But for the other HGEA, or even when I was talking to my husband about how step work...works for the Fire, it takes a long time for everybody else to move up their steps. So, I don't disagree that they don't have the security promise to the other union members. However, they get paid a little bit more because of it. And Member Paltin's right, like they have 11 bosses that pull them in all these different directions, which is why I try to be as, you know, respectful as I can to everyone all the time, to not add to anyone's burden. Because they have 11 different bosses. I have like six different bosses...my kids, my husband, my nieces and nephews. Like everybody pulls us in different directions, and we got to be everywhere, and do all the things all the time. OCS Staff make our job possible. They are amazing, unbelievable human beings, and are to be treasured. And I hope we do pay well. And they...this increase that's originally proposed in Bill 49, if it was absolutely necessary, we should have done it a long time ago, like when they first did the budget. But when we met with them, they didn't tell us about this. And I know that it was created because of what the Salary...Salary Commission did. But nonetheless, I don't disagree that they need a raise because we probably drive them nuts, and we continue to talk like right now, but I don't support the raises originally proposed in 49. I will support Member Cook and Member Johnson's compromise at 15 plus their step rate. Thank you. And thank you to OCS.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you, Member U'u-Hodges [sic], for being present. Chair Lee, you look like you want to say something.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Only that I just hope that people remember--people meaning our Councilmembers--will remember is, we wouldn't have this debate if our Staff wasn't being compared to another group of workers. We wouldn't be having this debate. If that other group of workers were paid what they deserve, we wouldn't be having this debate. If...if they were under our control, they would have...we...we would have been able to help them rise as much as anyone else. But they are not under our control. So, you know, I just hope that people keep things in perspective. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. And mahalo, Chair Lee, for that reminder that these are the salaries that we do have direct control over. So, Member Cook's, you know, proposal for a compensation study, as I mentioned earlier with Bill 48, compensation studies look at salaries for comparable positions. And by setting a higher salary for OCS secretaries, clerks, HR, support Staff, it helps to provide data to the salary to ensure that we don't end up with these, like, rinky-dink incremental 3 percent for...I forget if we're not allowed to say the bargaining units, but particularly the Bargaining Unit 3 and 13. That's...those are the ones that we're talking about that got left behind. And so, those are...those positions are similarly situated to our OCS positions. And if, when they're doing the study, they see, oh, it's all low, that's just normal, like, and I guess people are making it, then that's what the study's going to show. And ultimately, it's not going to be set at a more competitive salary. And that's one of the things, like, you know, looking at the bigger picture of how everything is connected by doing this, by setting a more competitive salary for those that we have control over...those salaries we have control over setting. We're doing this for everybody. As I stated earlier, I mahalo OCS for being willing to be the tip of the spear on this. I've been on the Council for over six years, and this is the first time that I heard about this supplemental agreement. We've been...we've been begging DPS, and others, and the Administration...like what...what can we do? Like Bargaining Unit 3 and 13 were organized in the first year that I was here. We did a reso, urging for their salaries to be set higher. We never learned about this supplemental agreement. And it...and it...it took Bill 49 for us to learn about that. And so, because Bill 49 got those that were settling for the salaries that they've been getting, and the incremental like just not catching up, not keeping pace for the cost of living here. And if Bill 49 is what it took for us to learn about the supplemental agreements, by setting the salaries like this, competitively, imagine what else we're going to learn about. We are giving DPS, who are our negotiators in doing this collective bargaining, this...this bargaining chip, this...this piece, this...this compelling reason why we should be setting the salaries for BU-3 and -13 higher. Because look...look at their salaries. We should be paid like that too. Sometimes you have to make...make waves. You have to make big waves to make people come out. Because when that one testifier like stood there and just said that she got her paycheck and she cried. She left the private sector where she was getting paid more. And then she got her first paycheck, and she cried. Like that's not fair. Like Member Paltin said, the County used to be the place to go and work. It's not anymore. And if we are the leaders that we say we are, this is the kind of change that we have to make. We have to walk the talk. And I know we're going to get criticized, and I know we've been getting criticized, and I'll take it because ultimately, I think everyone will

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

benefit. But I think the promise of a robust tourism industry and all these luxury developments was supposed to improve the quality of life for our residents, and it hasn't for so many. We owe it to them. We owe it to our Staff, and we owe it to the rest of our County employees to pay them competitively so that their life can improve. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other comments before we take the vote? All right. So, can you state the motion that's on the floor?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, so the motion on the floor right now is an amendment to the main motion made by Councilmember Cook, seconded by Councilmember Kama, and was friendly amended. So, our understanding then is that it's a change, to amend the bill to make it a 15 percent increase for...for...for the salaries. Thank you, Chair.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, yes, and Councilmember U'u-Hodgins has her hand up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member U'u-Hodgins? Member U'u-Hodgins, do you have anything to say?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: I don't. It looks just like my hand was not --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, it's stuck.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: -- unraised.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Let me...if I press it again, does it unraise my hand?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Oh, no, it looks like it's raised again. If I could unraise it, that'd be great. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, the motion on the floor is for this to be a 15 percent increase, and not 30. Okay. Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that's five "ayes," four "noes." The motion passes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **Councilmembers Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **None.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: **APPROVE amendment to main motion.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, everybody, for your passionate discussion, and I think we all stand together that we need to raise compensation. All right. Yes, Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I move to amend the reso [sic] for a 20 percent increase and the 5 percent step, and to restore the Legislative Attorneys.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: At the original reso [sic] proposal, because they're like deputy attorneys.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, in bill...in Bill 49, or what are you talking about?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, Bill 49. I said reso...sorry, bill.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you're looking at the Legislative Attorneys. Okay. So, that's your...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Like Deputy Corporation Counsel, Deputy Prosecuting Attorneys. So, to restore that instead of bringing it down by 15 percent. Because it's supposed to all be set similarly as the Bill 48...I think we said that. And if you want to ask for clarification because again, I'm winging it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Hanano.

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair, I don't think Mr. Hanano can comment on this, that would directly affect his salary, but I'm happy --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. KAWASAKI: -- to comment. The CR-6 series, those are the attorney series, those we had proposed to match Deputy Corporation Counsels and Deputy Prosecuting Attorneys. So, those...we're asking that those match the reso...I mean the bill that you passed just prior to this, that would be Bill 48.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And...okay. Thank you for that explanation.

MS. KAWASAKI: The other percentages can be applied to the nonattorney positions. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And my motion includes the 20 percent with the 5 percent step increase. That was removed from the...from the other bill.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any more...any more comments? Then Chair Lee, you look like you want to say something.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I just think it was...it's a great compromise. Oh, you need a second, I'll second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, a motion made by Member of Rawlins-Fernandez, and second by Chair Lee. Okay. I'm going to call for the vote. Right? Okay. All in favor, raise your hand, or is this a roll call?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member U'u-Hodgins, did you hear the motion?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, I guess we have...everybody's here. Nine "ayes." The motion carries.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **None.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: **APPROVE amendment to main motion.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is that it? Call for dinner.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I guess. That’s not what I wanted.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: I think we got to vote on the main motion, right?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I think she was --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- oh, I thought she was asking if there’s any other amendments.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to restore the Analysts and Secretaries.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Restore the Analysts and Secretaries to the 30 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The original to --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: To the original.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- Bill 49.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, I am...any...any comments, Members?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: They're...actually, a lot of the work that gets done, and we got a lot of work to do, and this one directly speaks to the comment about stupider and not stupid because they're smarter than us, and they do the work, and we're getting paid more.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Any other comments? Comments? Seeing none. Okay. Roll call.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, Member --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- U'u-Hodgins raised her hand for real kine this time.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Yeah, this time I did for real kine, and then after I'm done, if somebody could unraise it, and then we don't have to go. I don't know what's the opposite of raise, but...or put it down, I don't know. My question is, is so if we restore the salaries for the Analysts and the Secretaries, are we going to be putting our...like, are we going to continue to do this until we're right back to where we are? I know you guys supported that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's my last one.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: But then we're going to go...okay. Because then we're going to go, they're getting paid more than the supervisors. I don't...I'm...I'm in my car, so I don't have it with me. But if we get into a situation where they get paid more than their supervisors, then we kind of start from scratch all over again. That's just my question.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That's...that's the last one --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- for me. I mean --

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thanks.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- I think we should all agree that's the last one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Roll call. Roll call.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Roll call. Okay. Roll call.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins?

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that is four "ayes," five "noes." The motion fails.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE:	AYES:	Councilmembers Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.
	NOES:	Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, and U‘u-Hodgins.
	ABSTAIN:	None.
	ABSENT:	None.
	EXC.:	None.

MOTION FAILED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Main motion as amended. Okay. Any more amendments? None. All right. Any discussion? Seeing none. Main motion as amended. Chair Lee?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you're voting? Okay. Main motion as amended. Is this a roll call?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Nobody asked.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Where we...okay. Where we are is --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Voice vote.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- 15 percent, right?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 20 percent and 5 percent step increase.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, 20 and 5.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, it's 20 and 5.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I thought it was 15. I thought the increase was...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, no. Member --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It was a unanimous vote.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- Keani Rawlins-Fernandez...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait. I know we just voted on the Legislative Attorneys...I mean, our Attorneys so that they would be similar with Corp. Counsel and Prosecuting Attorneys. And as far as everybody else, I thought we were at 15 percent.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Maybe I could...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I...I...I said to restore the CR-6, I think, that is attorneys. And then the 20 percent or the 5 percent step increase because I said that it was taken out because --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- because of the...the salaries being set at the...around 30 percent instead.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And so...and...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, that's what it's at now.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, for the attorneys only, right? That...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, for all of it.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You can roll call if you want.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I...I misunderstood that motion. I thought it was only for the Attorneys so that they would be similar to what we just voted on, on 48.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That's...was my understanding.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Maybe we could ask Staff.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I don't appreciate that, Member Paltin.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't appreciate being here all day, every day, just talking in bubbles. Learn how to facilitate a meeting, please. I'm getting really irritated. What you got to do is just facilitate the meeting, pay attention what's going on. There's no reason for us to be here from 9:00 a.m. to 10:00 p.m. There's no reason. Just learn your job.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I...I...I am, and I don't appreciate your attitude. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't appreciate --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- being here for no reason, having a recess every five seconds because you don't know the answer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That is not true.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Maybe Staff could clarify the issues.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, so the main...the main motion was to recommend passage on...of Bill 49 on first reading. That was made by Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez, seconded by Chair Lee. It was subsequently amended by a motion made by Councilmember Cook, seconded by Councilmember Kama, to change the percentage to 15 percent for...for all positions. Then by a motion made by Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez, seconded by Chair Lee, there was an amendment to raise it to 20 percent plus the 5 percent step, and to restore the CR-6 attorneys back to...to the original proposal. And then there was a final motion by Councilmember Paltin, seconded by Member Rawlins-Fernandez to restore analysts and secretaries to 30 percent, but that motion failed. So, the body is back to the main motion as amended.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair, I thank Staff for their clarity, and I didn't follow that, and so that's what it is, and we vote.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, let's vote.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Ready for the vote.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Appreciate OCS.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we are at 20 percent --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Plus 5.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- plus 5.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And I really, really misunderstood that, and I think some of us did. I thought it was basically for the Attorneys. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Call for the vote.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Main motion as amended, call for the vote. So, now I'm going to...okay. This is going to be a roll call vote.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

COUNCILMEMBER U'U-HODGINS: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Sorry, did Councilmember --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Member...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MACDONALD: -- U‘u-Hodgins...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We can’t hear you. *(silence)* Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins, we can’t hear you.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Can you hear me now?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yes. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER U‘U-HODGINS: Okay. Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MACDONALD: Council....oh, apologies. Councilmember Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No. Okay.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that is...oh, apologies, Chair. That’s eight “ayes,” one “no.” The motion passes.

VOTE: **AYES:** **Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, Sinenci, and U‘u-Hodgins.**

NOES: **Chair Sugimura.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **None.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: Recommending **FIRST READING** of Bill 49, CD1 (2025).

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. All right. So, we are at the end of this bill. We finished the resolutions. Now we have Member Kama, your office account. Councilmember office.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, I think I'm supposed to do the OCS-3 for the salaries, but I...I...I think it needs to be recalculated, maybe. Because I need to do OCS management, which I think is not going to be the 128,643 anymore.

MS. KAWASAKI: It should be the same. That would be from the resos.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay.

MS. KAWASAKI: So, I believe that OCS management line --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. KAWASAKI: -- would just be from the two resos.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo. Okay. So, Chair, I'm going to do the motion for the OCS management salaries, the OCS Attorney salaries, not Councilmember salaries because we already did that, and then not Councilmember office accounts because Member Kama is going to do that for her priority proposal, and then I'm going to do the OCS nonattorney salaries. Okay? I move to...I think it's to add the 128,643 to Account A--and please look at me if I'm doing it wrong--165,640 to Account A, and 671,285 to Account A.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Discussion.

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. KAWASAKI: Thank you, Chair. This is where I believe we need an adjustment. So, based on the motions that just passed, we would need to recalculate the OCS nonattorney salaries. We would ask that you allow us the opportunity to do so, and we will roll that into a clean bill, and provide that to the Committee.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, is the recommendation, Deputy Director, to remove the 671 from this main motion now, and then we would make that at a later time?

MS. KAWASAKI: You can do that, or you can give us the authority to calculate --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Make that correction.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. KAWASAKI: -- the correct amount and slide that into the bill. This is just for a recommendation to pass the bill.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Chair, I'd like to include that as a...to give Staff that authority to recalculate based on the last vote.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. No further discussion. Oh, I'm sorry. So, these are the salaries based on the Bill 49 that we just passed...recommend passing, and making the...the additions necessary to Salaries, Account A. Mahalo, Chair.

MS. KAWASAKI: And Chair, for the record, our Staff is so quick in calculating this. We're going to double check these numbers, but as far as the OCS nonattorney salaries at 20 percent across the board plus the step, it should be \$537,024...and of course, the associated fringe would be corrected as well. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Correct. That's included in the motion. And then I saw...I see Budget Director turned on her screen...her video.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Director Milner.

MS. MILNER: Thank you...thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez. I just wanted to clarify, we do have funding in Countywide. We sort of anticipated that the OCS director salaries would be raised and the attorney salaries, so those can move from Countywide, and you would just need to increase your A Account by the nonattorney salaries. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you for anticipating that, and we will do it the same way that we did with all the directors and deputies then. So, Deputy Director Kawasaki, you have the numbers already?

MS. KAWASAKI: That would be the number stated at 537,024, and that would be for the A Account, 20 percent across the board, plus the step for nonattorneys.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. We did that. Do we need to do a motion to do that and take care of the transfer the way that we did for the Administration?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, Chair. The transfer?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: From...from Countywide into our accounts. It's already been account for in...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Budget Director popped on her video. She can explain that.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Director Milner?

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez. I appreciate it. If the body would indulge me, the draft motion would be to transfer from Department of Finance Countywide Costs, Fringe Benefits, \$128,643 plus \$165,640 to the OCS A Account and to increase the OCS A Account by \$537...\$537,024. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Oh, thank you. Thank you very much. All right. Members, that would take care of doing the transfers the same way that we did for the directors...directors, deputies, and the...all the actions of the Salary Commission, putting it into the...A Account into the respective departments. So, similarly. Do we need anything else?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, if...if we could just confirm with the...or with the movant that it's like a friendly amendment incorporated for...for those transfers?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Staff. Yes. That'll be...that'll be my main motion.

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez, second by Chair Lee. All in favor, say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I guess I don't see Member U'u-Hodges [sic] --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I don't see Member U'u-Hodgins --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- is not here.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- name --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- in the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- participant list.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, she is not here. All right. So, that would be seven “ayes,” and one excused. Okay. Eight “ayes,” and one excused.

VOTE: **AYES:** **Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.**

NOES: **None.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then now it’s Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Are you sure? Are you sure?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I’m sure-sure.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You got to turn on the mic.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. I don’t want to stand between anybody’s dinner. And so, we don’t have to do this.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: This is like your --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: We’ve done this all week.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- second time we’re doing this.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Move to increase Councilmembers’ office budget allocation by \$100,000 each.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: No discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Member Kama, second by --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Chair Lee. Go ahead. Any discussion? No discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, no discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think this is an egregious waste after talking about how people don't deserve money. \$900,000 of the taxpayer money. You heard everybody complain about all the raises we got. We didn't give that to ourselves. This is us giving ourselves another \$100,000, and I will not vote for it. Roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else, Members? Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: This is not going in our pockets. It's going in our office.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Anybody else? Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because we're not smart enough to do the work ourselves, we need to hire more people for \$100,000? This is a waste. I'm not supporting it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else want to say anything? Member...Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I did say that I would support this after we take up Bill 49 and OCS salaries, but it wasn't...I was...was proposed. So, it was 20 percent with a 5 percent step increase. I don't...I don't...I'm not going to do the math, but I don't know. Would the proposer accept 70,000?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Kama?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: The proposer will accept.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I support the motion.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Second, I guess.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. For the change. All right. So, it's been agreed to. Any other comments? I will then call for the --

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, Chair?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- call for the vote. Roll call. Yes?

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. Just before the vote, could Staff confirm the breakout for the 70,000 per office? Like how much would go into the A Account, and which one...how much would be accounted for the B Account?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Perhaps we should take a recess then.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...I move to collapse the accounts.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Wait. We have one motion on the floor, which we're taking here.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to amend the motion to collapse the accounts.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we're...we have Member Kama's, you know, motion on the floor and it's now changed to 70...70,000 versus 100, right? And so, this is a whole 'nother item that you're bringing up, so let's take a vote on Member...Member Kama's amended motion.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's not a whole 'nother thing. I'm moving to amend her motion to collapse the accounts because otherwise, you got to specify where the money is going for each and every Councilmember. Learn your craft.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, that's...I think that saves us time --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- and I see a lot of nodding heads, Chair. So, can we call for that amended amendment?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I know it seems to make sense to do that, but it does seem like it's two different items. But can we get clarification from Corp. Counsel?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Corp. Counsel.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Or...or our counsel.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Our counsel.

MR. HANANO: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Chair Lee. So, this would be considered a friendly amendment if the maker of the original motion...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. So, she would incorporate this in her first motion?

MR. HANANO: Yes. Because I think the 70,000...was it 70,000 or 75?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: 70.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 70.

MR. HANANO: 70...70,000 amendment was a friendly amendment, so now we have another amendment to that, which would...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I see. Okay.

MR. HANANO: So...yeah. So, as long as the maker of the original motion, which I think is Member Kama, and then Chair Lee second, agrees to the friendly amendments...amendment on the collapsing.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You did? The collapsing? You...you...you

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Kama, you're fine?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. She did.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Because you're the maker. Okay. The second.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: All right.

MR. HANANO: Thank...thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, let's take a vote on collapsing as well as the...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: She just said she'll accept it as a friendly amendment.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Roll call.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, roll call.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, proceeding with the roll call vote. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Aye.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aye.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I don’t see her. Excused.

MS. MACDONALD: Councilmember Sinenci.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Vice-Chair Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MS. MACDONALD: Committee Chair Sugimura.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No.

MS. MACDONALD: Chair, that is five “ayes,” three “noes,” one excused, Councilmember U‘u-Hodgins. The motion passes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VOTE: **AYES:** **Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, and Rawlins-Fernandez.**

NOES: **Chair Sugimura, Councilmembers Paltin and Sinenci.**

ABSTAIN: **None.**

ABSENT: **None.**

EXC.: **Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.**

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: **APPROVED.**

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anything else, Members? So, what we're going to do then is take a dinner break. How long? It's 7:01. There's food in the back here. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You want 7:45?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- how much is left for us to...to work on?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we have the...the bills that we have to take up, which are the Weight Tax and Fuel Tax bills. And that's...that's the main things besides the real property tax. Staff? Staff?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. So, before the body...the body could consider any Weight Tax or Fuel Tax proposals, if there are any, then the body could...could do its real property tax deliberations. And then once that's complete, the body may need to, you know, do any final adjustments to Bill 41, depending on the outcome of...of its Bill 41 deliberations. And then afterwards, it could start considering making recommendations on the budget bills themselves. There are two other bills as well, Bill 50 and Bill 54. Apologies, I should have mentioned that. The...the body may want to take that up. It's up to the body, but they could take Bill 50 and Bill 54 after the RPT and before doing final decisions on Bill 40, on the budget bills...the main budget bills.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we have...Member...Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair, I asked earlier if we could do RPT not when it's so late at night. And I really want us to, I don't know, cleanse the air, and come in collaboratively...and if we do it now, I got a little salt...I'm a little salty, so I'm probably not on my game. So, I think...I would ask the body if we could just do RPT at a later, you know, not so late right now.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. As...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I...I would also ask that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. I've heard that.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Go home.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Monday?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, Monday.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Monday?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Tomorrow morning?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I heard...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Monday is corrections.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah, tomorrow morning.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I heard either...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I heard either Saturday, but I also heard about the funeral. I also heard Sunday.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Sunday.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I was thinking --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- but not tonight.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- when we get back from break. My idea late might not be.
. . .*(chuckling)*. . .

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh. Oh, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I'm sorry.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: After...well, look, I'm...I'm here --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- I'm here to hear you guys out. I'm...I'm just saying, like when we get back from break is good.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: After break, if everybody's in --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I canceled my flight already, guys.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- I will.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, as opposed to putting --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're doing it tonight.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- you know, we're doing stuff that could...I think RPT after dinner would be better, and I don't want to do Saturday. We have a lot of things going on on the weekends. And Monday is what? What's Monday? Corrections.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Corrections.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, so --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- that's...that's just --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Correction.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- it's a minor adjust to the schedule, just to do it...but I see other hands.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else? Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So...so while Mr. Johnson is prioritizing what he believes is we...where...the direction we should go, maybe we should also...because we only have three...five things, right? Maybe we should prioritize and order what we want to take up so that we're going to be refreshed to take RPT, and then do whatever other things we got to do.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, the Weight Tax, Fuel Tax, you know, the things that are going to impact the budget, we got to finish that off and --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- then do RPT. If you...we should go to dinner.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, we do RPT first, then Fuel Tax and Weight Tax after. Is that okay? And then what else?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo Chair. I appreciate the suggestions, Member Kama. I think what I'm hearing from my left and my right is that RPT could be contentious. I'm hoping it's not. I'm hoping we actually all have the same proposals, and it'll just be unanimous. Throwing that out there. And...and so, what I'm hearing is just we...we break for dinner, maybe 30 minutes since it's already there, and then when we come back, we have our proposals for RPT set, and then we take up the less-contentious bills a little later as our brains get a little foggy.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And not wait too late to --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- yeah. Because --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- I don't think the Weight Tax and the Fuel Tax are going to be --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- contentious at all. I mean that's...I'm throwing that out there into the universe again.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Is a 45-minute lunch *[sic]* okay?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I could be okay with 45 minutes.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Can you guys --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- do 45 minutes for lunch?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 44...44 minutes?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Sure, 44.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, 8:00.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: It's 7:06.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 8:00?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: After dinner we go right into it.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Just pick a number.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Just pick a number.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: For dinner I mean.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You guys want to --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I'm sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- you guys want to come back at 8:00?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, 8:00.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But...but for real kine 8:00.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're in recess. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 7:06 p.m.
RECONVENE: 8:07 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(gavel)*. . . We are going to work on real property tax. So, Staff, can you give us a guideline as to where we are with bill...for the whole budget bill, and the adds...and I guess we're over, so how much are we over?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

REAL PROPERTY TAX

MR. KRUEGER: Yes Chair. So, for the purposes of RPT, so speaking just General Fund, we're showing that appropriations exceed revenue by \$60,472,133.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: \$60,432,000...

MR. KRUEGER: \$6,472,133 [sic].

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ...6 million?

MR. KRUEGER: Wait, sorry. \$60 million --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: -- 472,133.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That sounds like it.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And how much do we have in Carryover/Savings?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. Currently the Carryover/Savings number for General Fund that we have calculated is \$137,364,424.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Members, anybody have any recommendations for real property tax? Any amendments?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Do we...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I have Agricultural tier rates, if...if you're willing to hear me about them?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. I know that was one of your passions.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I guess I'll just go through the tiers and the...the levels of tiers, and then tell the proposed tax rates, or do you want me to go Tier 1 and then the proposed tax rate for Tier 1?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: What would it be better for you? Because you're going to do it online...on the screen?

MR. KRUEGER: I guess it's just whatever the body's preference is.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. I'll just read it from left to right, make it nice and simple.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, for Agricultural land class, Tier 1, is up to 3,300,000 --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 3,300,000.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- at the present rate of \$5.74, so keep that flat.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right, I'd like to adjust that Tier 1 to 3,300,000.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair? So, whatever we requested from Real Property Tax or Finance is the thresholds that we are able to work with because that's the spreadsheet. Because --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- we can only change --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, that was...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- the rates --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- we cannot change the thresholds.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: All right. Well, I'm...I'm ready for the rates then, I'm sorry. Okay. Proposed tax rate for Tier 1 is flat at \$5.74.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do you want to tell us which? Because what we received from Staff is there's two proposals...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Got it. Mahalo for that clarification. I see the requester, JIG...GJ and TP now.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. And...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, it's not numbered, but from what we got from Real Property Tax, the ag spreadsheets. Go ahead, Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: The Tier 2, the rate would be \$6.43, and that's the same as Conservation, \$6.43.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And Tier 1 is flat at \$5.74, that's correct. Now, Tier 3 is \$8.35, and that's a dollar less than the Big Island ag rate, the Hawai'i Island ag rate.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: \$8.35.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, \$8.35.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you have 5...5.94, Tier 1, and then Tier 2 is 6.43, and Tier...Tier 2...Tier 3 is 8.35?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes, that's correct, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I wanted to kind of start out small on the first...on the first year where we tier them, and those...I think, keeping Tier 1 at the present rate, Tier 2 is the same as Conservation, and Tier 3 is a dollar less than the Hawai'i Island ag rate. Those are my proposed tiers for Agriculture.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. And Member Paltin has another one.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...I'll yield to my colleague here. I don't think my tiering would yield more than the \$123,393 his would.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else have any...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Increase, I mean.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anybody else have any discussions regarding this rate? You want to...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead. Discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. So, I'll read...I move to adjust the Agricultural...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. I...I move to set the tiers in Agricultural land class for the following tiers.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Tier 1 being \$5.74, Tier 2 \$6.43, and Tier 3 \$8.35.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: The...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. All right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just say his propose...your proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, my proposed tiers, the numbers, Tier 1 goes up to 3,300,000, Tier 2 is 3,300,001 to 8,500,000, and Tier 3 is simply more than 8,500,000.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. Could Staff request clarification? Is...is the...the Tier 1 to Tier 2, is it...the Tier 1, is it up to 3 million, or up to 3.3 million?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Tier 1 is up to 3 point...3,300,000, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We can't do that because...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's why I was...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right. So...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It would have to be what he requested from Finance last...at the beginning of the week, which is...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Which is what I thought I did, but if it's not in there, it's not in there, then we'll just go with the original, unless you have a different...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No. Mr. Krueger was asking if it's up to 3.3 mil, and it cannot because we don't have that data. So, it's...it's up to what he proposed that --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I did...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- Finance look into.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I did ask him to look, and I did request him to do it. But --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I don't --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- if it's...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- see it.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Maybe...maybe I'll have to...

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: We...we do have a request from Councilmember Johnson for tiers of up to 3 million --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

MR. KRUEGER: -- and then 3 million to 8.5 million, and then more than 8.5 million. And...and Real Property Tax did provide current value for revenue projection for...for those tiers.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Then let's stick with that. Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I...I'm sorry. I'm sorry about that. Let's...let's do what we can do.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, these are fine then, right? You're just setting the rate.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody else have any discussion about this? Member Paltin, did you say you do not...you're not going to do yours?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, I'm not going to do mine, but just clarifying that this adds in \$123,393 in revenue.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is that what everyone got?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I'll let James answer it.

MR. KRUEGER: I can confirm that right now, yes, the difference is 123,393. That's what we're calculating.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Positive, not negative.

MR. KRUEGER: Positive.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, that's my proposal to the Committee, and I welcome discussion on it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I want to say I'm glad you're doing your tiers. Because last year, this is one of the things that you really wanted to do. So, thanks for doing that research. Anybody else have any comments? Member...Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm going to have a hard time supporting this because I just don't want...you know, our agriculture is an area that I think we need to support, and I'd like to hear other proposals, see if, you know, we're not going to be causing...you know, creating a plus in one area, and a big minus in another area. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, remember, the Tier 3 is a select few, and those select few are mostly corporations, and I think they can certainly afford it. The Tier 1s, I...it's wide enough to include actual farmers that are dedicating their land to farming, and that's why we kept them flat. And the second tier is the same as Conservation. So, I feel that those are...those are...those are the pretty good reasoning. And I think at the end of the day, the number of 100...120,000 roughly, is not too big of an ask for our...for our ag community.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Paltin.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For Chair Lee's viewing pleasure, if we just use my two tiers with the low rate, and then the high rate of what Member Johnson set, we would only generate an additional \$76,939. That's with Tier 1 up to 7 mil at 5.74, and 7 million-plus at 8.35. But that only generates \$76,939, as opposed to 123-something thousand.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 123,393. What was your first rate? . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: First rate is flat. Second rate is the same as Member Johnson. It's only two tiers.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Again, thank you for your work, both of you. I still rather hear from other proposals that don't necessarily touch areas that we are trying to build. And so, I know Member Rawlins-Fernandez has...has something that might be interesting. I'm...I'm hoping that we can find \$60 million and go home.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah, we're going. Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That would be nice.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: -- so, maybe it would be easier if we just started from the top. Owner...and just go down and see what everybody's going to propose. And then those that propose the moistest [*sic*], maybe we should just go with that one proposal and just do away with everybody else's proposal. But let's start to see who's got what, where, before we all decide what we're going to do.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right. Owner-Occupied. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I propose, for Tier 1, 1.6.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, what are...what are...what are the tiers you're establishing?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Going off?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- the same, the proposed. Okay. We can start there. Tier 1, up to a million. Owner-Occupied, starting at the top. And then we can set the...I don't know why it's 1. I thought the Mayor's one was 1 point...1.3.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think you're looking at Non-Owner-Occupied. If you're looking at --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- the top?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right. Well...okay. I'll stick with the...the Mayor's proposed 1.3. And then I'm open to hearing other discussion on that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, what about Tier 2?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Tier 2, I don't see any...any other proposals. So, it's just the Mayor's proposal at 1....1.3 to 5, or 1.3 and \$1, and 5. And then Tier 3 is more than 5.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, that is, I think, Member Kama's proposal --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: But...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- which I like it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I see. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If you...there's tabs on the bottom, and if it says cert, that's the Mayor's proposal one.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then you go...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Member Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Or are you done, Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I just read Member Kama's tiers.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...I like them. I like Member Kama's tiers.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I support it.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Full support.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Consensus.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies. So, there...there's a slight issue, and I may ask the Committee Attorneys to...to weigh in. So, the top threshold on Councilmember Kama's proposal does exceed the...what we advertised, what the Council advertised for its RPT range of rates.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: But I will say that we were able to work with RPT, and...and they were able to at least provide us for up to 4.5 million values for those. I can email out that...what they provided for that to the Committee, if they're interested in that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, yeah. Let's do that.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, no --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I was...I was being...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- I did the same thing on my stuff.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I was being aggressive.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Mr. Krueger, when you email it out to us, is it in the form of an Excel plug-and-play spreadsheet?

MR. KRUEGER: It is.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I like that.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I...is that FN-14, the email that you sent? And it has the tabs at the bottom, certified.

MR. KRUEGER: Oh...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, there's the certified, found it. Okay. So, it's the Mayor's proposal is up to 1 million. Oh, that's not Owner-Occupied. Okay. Where is the Owner-Occupied?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think the one he's...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's at the bottom. 1.3, and then 1.3, and \$1 to 3, and then more than 3.

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, apologies.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: So, the one that came with FN-14, yes, that should have all of the initial proposals that we requested in...in FN-14, that spreadsheet. This is an additional spreadsheet, I'm just about to hit send on my email.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Because the one on FN-14 was not advertised, so we can't go that high for the third tier.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, but Tier 3 on the cert, the first tab, certified, is 3 million and above...or above...or more than 3 million.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. And so, they went to the up of what we advertised, and so that's like--what?--4.5, you said, James?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, that's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, we can't go all the way up to 5 million, but we can go up to 4.5.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: To 4.5.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, did...and we requested that?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No. That's the upper limit of what was posted.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. So, I'm saying 3?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No. James...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is 3 not okay? 3 is below?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. James said that he requested up to 4.5 because that's the upper limit, and it's as close to Member Kama's request as we can get with what we posted. So, he's hitting send. . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Got it.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. So, same Tier 1 and 2, and then the Tier 3 is above 4.5 million. I'm okay with that too.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Tier 3 is 4.5 million up. I kind of prefer these...this one, personally, after the Stable Road bruddah went testify his property is like 5 million, and he paid \$12,000 taxes last year.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, Chair, I...I move to set the tiers for Owner-Occupied Member Kama's proposal for Tier 1 up to 1.3 million; Tier 2 \$1.300,001 to 4.5; and then Tier 3 more than 4.5.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Is there a second?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Motion made by Member Rawlins-Fernandez, second by Member Kama. Okay. We got the tiers and the rates.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do you want to take a vote on that first?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sure. If you want to do it, sure.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I would like to take a vote on that before we set the tiers.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All in favor...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sorry, the tier rates.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Who is missing is Member U'u-Hodgin [sic]. So, eight "ayes." The motion carries.

VOTE: AYES: Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Cook, Johnson, Lee, Paltin, Rawlins-Fernandez, and Sinenci.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: Councilmember U'u-Hodgins.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: APPROVED.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead, next.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, for Tier 1 up to 1.3 million, I propose 1.6.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Or \$1.60, sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And Tier 2?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For Tier 1, Owner-Occupied --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Owner-Occupied.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- 1.6.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And Tier 2?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You...oh, you want to just keep going? Okay.
Let me find my Tier 2. 1 point...1.9 and 6.5. \$1.90, and then 6.50.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: 6.50?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And it's Tier 3?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Now, do...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Can I second that? I'm sorry, did we get a...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's my motion.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. I second that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Motion made by Member Rawlins-Fernandez, second by
Member Johnson. Discussion. No discussion? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That's a little high...that's a little high for me.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You want to know what the totals are?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah, I'm just crunching it now.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's like an additional 600,000 roughly...\$597,854.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. Personally, the Owner-Occupied, I'd like to leave it alone.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That...I can't hear you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . lowered it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I can't...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'll speak with you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I didn't know what you said. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I like lowering the first and second tier. I think raising the third tier to 6.50 is excessive. This may be \$4. That's the one tier that we're striving to encourage people to have, and hopefully not be maxed out of their house. I don't know.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, you want to recommend a lower...you like the first two rates, and the...the third tier, you want it to be lower?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. The third tier, like 5. You want 6.50?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm open to suggestions. I...I...I can change it to 5 if you want.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You want to change it to 5.50?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 5.50? Sure.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is that what you said?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure, friendly amendment. And so, it's a reduction of 10 cents for Tier 1, flat on Tier 2, and then an increase by 2.25 *[sic]* on Tier 3.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 2.40 for Tier 3, an increase of 2.40?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. KAWASAKI: Chair. \$2.40 increase on Tier 3.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Sorry, what?

MS. KAWASAKI: \$2.40 increase on Tier 3. If you go \$3.10 plus \$2.40, it's 5.50.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, \$1 less.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Point of clarification.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, are we bringing in \$1,165,159 less revenue than the Mayor's proposal?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: My...my calculation says 598 (*phonetic*), but...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: At \$5.50, we're bringing in 1.16-something less --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 1.165. Sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- million less than what the Mayor proposed.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Why would it be less?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, because I reduced Tier 1 by 10 cents. That was part of the proposal. Because we can't...the assessments came in like 30 percent higher. And we can't increase the homeowner's exemption for...for this year. So, it's the same thing as like increasing the homeowner's exemption by reducing the rate. But because Tier 1 is every property that's in the...the class, then it's the...has the largest value. So, any small adjustment results in...in a larger change.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, if we raise it from 3...Chair --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- may I?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: If Tier 3 for Owner-Occupied is increased from 3.10 to 5.50, then that's an increase of 2,412,000. No. It's an increase, not a decrease. If you're raising 5...from 3.10 to 5.50.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Obviously.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, instead of generating \$3,116,707, you're generating \$5,529,641, for a net increase of 2,412,937; is that correct?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Tamara math major.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I wasn't paying attention.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I figure you guys know what you're doing.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. If using the Mayor's proposed tiers, yes, raising the third tier to \$5.50 would generate that. But I think right now, using the proposed tier of more than 4.5 million, \$5.50 I'm showing generates \$3.12 million, approximately.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Yeah, that's it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, I know the goal is to increase, but I didn't want to increase it on our...our residents, Owner-Occupied, and everyone's property assessments went up. So, you know, folks that bought when it was like, you know, 700,000 are now like a million dollars, so...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. Chair?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I...I concur --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Maybe we can table this one for now.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- I misunderstood that...I thought you...you were going higher, so I came lower than you. What did you propose for Tier 3...for the --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, it was higher.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- Owner-Occupied?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It was 6.50.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: It was higher?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If you want to go 5.50, I'm open to that.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, no. I'm just...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The reason that it's...it's so much less is because I propose reducing Tier 1 to 1.60 by 10 cents.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And that's the largest value tier.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: The largest group.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And so, it...it results in a negative \$2 million with that 10 cents change.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. I got it. And so, it affects the...the...the smallest quantity of Owner-Occupied residents because it's...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, it affects everyone in the class because everyone's in Tier 1.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: But any...but the people who are over \$3 million in that category are only 1 million.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, we set the tier, Tier 3, 4.5 million.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, because we set the tier higher, then there's less total valuation to multiply the rate by. But if we left it at the Mayor's tiers, then there would be more value in that Tier 3. So, it would be 1 billion versus 567 million.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, it's like half by...by reducing it to...by increasing it from Tier 3 over 3 million to Tier 3 more than 4.5 million.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, if we wanted to --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- use the Mayor's threshold, then it would result in a higher --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Right. Okay. Thank...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- change. Yeah.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: May I?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I thank my colleague for the clarification because I was using the Mayor's tiers.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No. And so, that's how it was generating additional revenue, and thinking that it was affecting the least amount of people.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, Tier 3 is the least amount of properties in that class.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then I'm open to more discussion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And another, you know, thing we can do is not make motions, and then we can just like set things --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Talk story.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- and then adjust as we, you know, continue.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, we can leave it at where it's at now --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- if...if...you know, and then we can continue on to see if we can adjust enough in the Non-Owner-Occupied, other classifications--Apartment, Hotel, et cetera.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, I'll withdraw my motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Withdraw my second.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Withdraw the second. Okay. Good. All right. So, your...you're at...your proposed is 1...160...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's negative 1,165,319.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And it doesn't have to stay there, but if we're not ready for other proposals at this time, we can move forward with another classification, and then see how we adjust those. And if we still feel uncomfortable with giving Tier 1 10 cents...you know, like 10 cents less because it results in a negative 2 million, then we can come back, and we can change that later.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: All right.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you want to move? Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Sorry.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'm asking for...are we using the Mayor's tiers or...or alternate tiers?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, earlier, Member...Member Kama had proposed increasing the Tier 3 to 4.5, and so I made that motion and --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- everyone voted for it. But we don't...we don't have to stick with that. We can use the Mayor's if, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, no, I...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- if we decide we want to change it later.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That's going in the right direction. Thank you for the clarification.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So, you want to go to the next, Long-Term Rental?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Non-Owner-Occupied.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Non-Owner-Occupied.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I propose setting the tiers at Tier 1 1 million...up to 1 million; Tier 2 1 to 1.5...4.5; and Tier 3 above more than 4.5.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Isn't that what the Mayor asked?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I support that.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Good.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm going to change the rates, but I'm going to leave the threshold. I mean, that's my proposal. I'm open to others.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then the rates, flat Tier 1, 8...5.87...\$5.87; Tier 2 \$9.50; and Tier 3 \$18.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: What is the last one, 18?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Correct. So, that would yield no additional funds in Tier 1 because it's the same as what the Mayor proposed. Tier 2 is a dollar above what the Mayor proposed, which would yield \$5,362,172. And then Tier 3 is \$4 above what the Mayor proposed, which would generate \$15,681,015. And that would make up for the negative 1.1 million.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: This is something I could support, Chair. I think if we could get consensus on this, is that how you want to move forward with it?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think we're just setting it, and then we're going to come back to it, and --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next week, once we go through.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- I'm cool with that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You want me to keep going?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anybody else? Member Kama has a --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- a bunch, but what do you want to do? And Member Paltin has, as well as Member Sinenci, for Non-Owner.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I kind of lost my place. So, Non-Owner-Occupied, in the book I see to 4.5, but on the cert, it says 1 to 1...to 3.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. That's 2 million.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is that what you see? On...in the book, it says to 4.5, but on the spread...Excel spreadsheet, it says 3. Is that what you're looking at too?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. I...I see that on the cert as well.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: To 3, not 4.5.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But I think if...oh, okay. I see the Non-Owner-Occupied tab. None of them have...oh. No.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like we might've got a wrong cert because...and I guess, you know, if we're going to keep it what it is, we can just go off the book instead of the fancy spreadsheet, but I really do like the Excel spreadsheet. But the spreadsheet of the Mayor's one, to me, it doesn't match what the book says. Is that what everyone else is seeing, or is it just me?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Page...page 1 of the book, Non-Owner-Occupied?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, it goes to 4.5 --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- but on the Excel spreadsheet, it's not.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. I can give you the numbers if you want.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, we'll just have to do manual math. We can't --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- use the fancy...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, for Tier 1, it's 10,427,557,420.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you're only changing...you're only changing the third tier of rate? Or you're keeping the two Mayor's rates, and you're changing the third rate? Is that what...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, I added a dollar to Tier 2...or I proposed adding a dollar.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, 5.87, 9.50, and 14?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 18.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or 18?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 5.87, 9.50, and 18?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MR. HANANO: Can you repeat what the tiers are?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Up to 1, 1 to 4.5, and 4.5...more than 4.5.

MR. HANANO: Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then 18?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. And when I did the calculations, it was still less than 1 percent. I think it was .59 percent. I'm going to correct myself in just a second, hold on.

...*(silence)*...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you got 21,043,186-plus?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 187, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, 187. Oh, I didn't do the .8, that's why. 21,043,187.

...*(silence)*...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair Lee?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. While they're working on that, could you ask Staff to figure out how much more did the Mayor add to the budget? Remember, all these millions of dollars he added to the budget in addition to the \$7 million deficit?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Staff, you understand the question?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Because we're not dealing with the original number anymore.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. Yes, we understand the question, but determining that might...I do not think we'll be able to do that in a timely fashion. Apologies, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, no, you can take 15 minutes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Oh, sorry, it's...it's Kristina.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I was just kind of looking into what Member Paltin was saying about the different numbers because I was trying to figure that out as well. Because in the . . .*(inaudible)*. . . for the Non-Owner-Occupied class in the rates and fees in Bill 41, the Mayor's proposed budget has it at up to 3 million for Tier 2, and then greater than 3 million in Tier 3, which those tiers matches the actual signed in your real property certification, so not that spreadsheet that I...the table that Member Paltin is talking about that's like on the front page of the book, but I'm looking at the certifications signed by the Real Property Tax Administrator. The values match the table, but the tiers match what's in the Mayor's proposed budget. So, if you look at that certification, the tiers are up to 3 million, and then 3 million and...and above. But I...I'm only looking at this once. I haven't checked all of them, but I looked at the values, and it's the same, but different tiers.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, we don't know what is correct, then?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Toshikiyo. So, it's just 1, 1 to 3, and then more than 3? With those values?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I'm...I can stick with that. I mean, I...I . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yeah, but the values are the same. It's just the --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: -- tiers as...are different.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The thresholds set.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, which --

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- is correct?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 1, 1 to 3, and more than 3.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, what is...

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I would have to double-check with the Real Property Tax Administrator, but the ones that I'm referring to that has the...the tiers of up to 3 million and 3 million and above, those thresholds, those are the signed...the signed ones at the beginning for the certification, where she signs upon for each class.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What is this first page about, nothing, then?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: I'm...I'm not sure. It might just be a summary.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, the first page in the certification has tiers up to 4.5 and plus.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Oh, right. Thank you. I don't have a copy of that book. I'm looking at Granicus, what was entered, and it's after the transmittal from the Finance Director. There's a series of pages that have certified amounts. I'm not sure if it's contained in that same book, or maybe it's later.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is the Budget Director still on?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Director Milner?

MS. MILNER: Yes, Chair. Can I just clarify that the concern is that the numbers provided in what was sent by RPT don't seem to match the 1.45 in the first page of the certification book, and the bill says 1.3, but the certification says 1...says 4.5?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah. The first page of the certification book is different, and we don't know why.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MILNER: Okay. Thank you for clarifying. I am looking into that right now, and I will get right back to you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'm going to ask you and everybody. This...so, basically, the sheet that has the cert as the first --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- and then all the rest of them, that cert is different than this?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That's the challenge. Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's what we're trying to figure out right now.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're all on the same page. No, you're not losing it, unless we're all losing it together, which could also be possible.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're...we're going to find out. But we can also move on. . . .*(chuckling)*. . . I propose a 5 cent increase to Hotel-Resort, and it could potentially generate 231,000 increase.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, for Hotel, you're saying what?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 5 cents.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, 11.80?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think so. It's just 5 cents.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Just for discussion, I'll be voting no on all of the proposals.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Because if we...if we found some projects worth 60 million, we could all go home, rather than nickeling...nickel and diming this real property tax, supply, revenues.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I hear 10 cents by Chair Lee. I support that too. I got a nickel, she got a dime. . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I went a quarter.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Cook says 25 cents.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: My proposal for Hotel, I was going to bring it up to...to same as the Timeshare.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 14.60?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Uh-huh. Is that too much, Chair Lee?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: You pretty sure?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That...that would generate 13.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That would give us 13 million.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mics.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: What did they do with all their money since 2019?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: One of the challenges...may I...Chair, may I weigh in on the hotels?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: One of the challenges of the hotels is they have such huge overhead operating costs that's really constant. So...and since their income isn't constant, I'd be more than happy to have the tourists pay more. My concern is basically --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You get some grapes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- the hotels, contrary to timeshares, have a high staff...all the different services and everything that they have. And so, burdening them more, I don't know. So, I don't know...I don't know if they're making money hand-over-fist. I think that with COVIC [sic] and everything, and the fires, and blah, blah, blah... So, I tend to...I could go a quarter, but I wouldn't want to...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: 25 cents above that, I would...I would be interested in that. You know...I don't know. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I think it's \$1.1 million.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I don't know of any big hotels that have closed down after COVID, after the fires. I think a lot of them are taking their opportunity now to do renovations. In fact, that's what we heard some of the people who advocate--I don't want to call them lobbyists because I'm not sure if they registered--but the...the advocates say now is the best time to renovate the hotel. And as we know, renovations of hotels is not just ten years and you're done. You have to renovate all the time. So, I think they could take advantage and renovate now if their numbers are down.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Well, I think that...that may be what they're doing, and then also, the process of when they're renovating, they're making huge capital investments into it.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, anyway, I think that some people would be pissed at me at a quarter, but that's...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, I like your suggestion of 25 cents. I mean, it's definitely getting us on the way because we do have a hole to fill, that 60 million, I do believe, is the number. And I also don't see any...I mean, I just...I think now is...it's an opportunity for them to renovate, and I hear a lot of people who are renovating the hotels, that's what...that's what we're hearing.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, from 11.80...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: To 12. I came up a nickel and Member Cook came with a quarter. Okay. Shall we go to the next one? I don't have a proposal for a Timeshare.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Timeshare.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I was just going to leave it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Timeshare is 14.60.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But if you wanted to nickel-dime there, we could also add a nickel, dime, a quarter.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I would say they should go to at least 18 if our highest owner of...highest tier of Non-Owner-Occupied is 18.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. So, 18 would generate 14.2 million.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: There you go. That's significant. But it...but...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I would caution that last time we did that, they sued us, and we were tied up for a long time.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah, I've been thinking Timeshare is the one that has the most challenges.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, can I speak to the idea of people pushing back on this? Right now, I'm speaking to someone in Finance that all of...a lot of Non-Owner-Occupieds and a lot of out-of-state folks are the ones who are challenging and sending it. So, how many...how many cases are they winning? They're not winning any cases. We...most of the time, I'm hearing that they can challenge it, but at the end of the day, that's the rate. I haven't heard many people saying that they're...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: They don't challenge the rate, they --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: They...you know what I mean.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- appeal the value.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You know what?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Appeal, that's the term I'm looking for.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Appeal the...the assessed value.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right. So, they're not winning their appeals, that's the actual term, I don't mean...oh, here comes Director Milner.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But in the meantime, it ties up --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh. Director Milner?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- 50 percent of the revenue while they're under appeal.

MS. MILNER: Aloha, Chair. I have information for you on the question on page 1 of the certification, but I'm happy to provide that after you've finished the Timeshare discussion. Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, I'm...I'm just having that discussion. I'm not going to propose bringing it up to 18. That's my two cents.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. You want to...Director Milner has an answer. Okay. Director Milner?

MS. MILNER: Mahalo, Chair. Yeah. So, the 4.5 number on the first page is a typo. Apologies for that. It is 1.3. The certified values are correct for the tiers as presented in the budget. So, if you look at page 3 and 5, you'll see that the pages that were signed have the \$3 million rate. So, apologies for the typo, and the Department of Finance will get that corrected on page 1.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Page 3 and 5?

MS. MILNER: Yes, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair, tier...Tier 3 is 5 million?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No?

MS. MILNER: Apologies, Chair. I was providing page numbers. Tier 3 is more than 3 million. Tier 2 is \$1,000,001 to \$3 million.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Director Milner...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For Owner-Occupied. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You know, since in looking at this, we thought we had that spread. Is there any way that Finance could whip that up real quick as an Excel spreadsheet?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Councilmember Paltin. I don't believe that Finance is available at the moment to do that, unfortunately, but I will check with Director Martin and let you know.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Because the young man from Stable Road, his house was like over \$5 million. So, he already was paying \$12,000 a year tax just for living on the beach and...Spreckelsville.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Owner-Occupied. He said the guy...some executive knocked on the guy next door and bought his place for 17 mil or something. So, that's why I would have liked the...the more than 4.5, or like how Member Kama had 5-plus because he asked us not to tax us...tax him out of his home.

MS. MILNER: Apologies. So, the two that have the 4.5 rate are Non-Owner-Occupied and Commercialized Residential. All the others have the \$3 million rate. So, you would like the tiers for Non-Owner-Occupied and Commercialized Residential up to 4.5 if possible?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Commercial Resident...Commercialized Residential I don't care about, but Owner...Owner-Occupied...oh, shoot, never mind. That's Non-Owner-Occupied. Never mind.

MS. MILNER: Oh, okay. Mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Toshikiyo, you also are...

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes, Chair. Thank you. But Ms. Milner just said what I was about to say that...so I'm looking at the certified amounts. It's in your Granicus number 197. That starts on page 3. I think that's what she was referring to. And for those two...two of the certifications by class, so the certifications are...the tiers are different for Non-Owner-Occupied and Commercialized Residential. So, they are correct in the certifications, it's just reflected incorrectly on the summary that I believe you're looking at for page...it's that color-coded table. So, I just wanted to clarify what I had said earlier about where the certification amounts that I was looking at since I think you have a book that's been prepared, but I was working off of your Granicus number 197.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can I...can I clarify with Ms. Toshikiyo?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Please.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sorry. I know you don't have the book, but are we saying the...the tiers are just the typo and the certified values and estimated revenues are correct in the book? And if the typo is just the tiers, or is that a Ms. Milner question?

MS. TOSHIKIYO: The one that I was looking at...I just started looking at Commercialized Residential, but the one that...for Non-Owner-Occupied, those numbers, the tiers are incorrect. But if you look at the assessed values on that page for Non-Owner-Occupied per tier, those match the assessed values that are in the certification, but it's the tiers are differently...are different. So, I think that the assessed values are correct, it's just in that one table, the...the top level for each Tier 2 and Tier 3 are incorrect.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, like if I were to just cross out 4.5 and put 3 and...in both places, everything else would be correct? Ms. Milner has --

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- a thumbs up. Okay. Okay. Got it. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Did we get that straightened out?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do you want another proposal?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. TVR-STRH, I left 1 and 2, and increased Tier 3 to 18.20.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . 18.20?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, with the thresholds, what the Mayor proposed.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. I do see in FN-14 that Member Paltin and Member Sinenci had other suggestions for the tier thresholds, if we wanted to also consider those.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I do like Member Sinenci's.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you. The...for mine, the Tier 1 was to reduce to 800,000 so that we could push more into Tiers 2 and 3, and then at the third tier, we would take the average. So, that was just my question to Finance, to get those numbers.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm open to that, too. So, Tier 1 would be up to 800,000, Tier 2 is 800 to 1.6 million, and Tier 3 is more than 1.6 million.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And what are your proposed rates?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: With the exact same rates as the Mayor, that generates like about 5-1/2 million, roughly...a little bit less than 5-1/2 million with the same rates as the Mayor.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And I can leave it to you all to...to play with the...the rates, to adjust to what we need, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, everybody sounds like...or there seems like they like your...your tiers. Any discussion? Member Kama's nodding her head. No?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: That works.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That works? Okay. And with the --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- with the rates as proposed by the Mayor. Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, to...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Chair, to restate what Member Sinenci said, was keeping the rates the same as what the Mayor had, and lowering the tiers?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is that right, Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes. And...and again, I'll leave it to the body to adjust it. That was just to...to generate how much with the...with the Mayor's proposal...the Mayor's rates.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Is it...Chair, is it simpler to increase the rates?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, you'll generate more revenue if you increase the rates. I don't know about simple. I mean, it's simple because we have an Excel spreadsheet where we just plug in the numbers. You want to increase the rates?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, I have 12.55, 3...13.50, and 18.20.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 13.50 and...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 18.20. \$18.20.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And the first...first rate is what, for Tier 1?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 12.55.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 12.55.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And the second and . . . *(inaudible)*. . . was what?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 13.50.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, stay the same.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Is there somebody's option that could use Member Rawlins-Fernandez's rates, revised rates, but with higher tiers for Tier 3?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I guess Member Paltin has higher rates for Tier 3.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's...it's minus...instead of 1.6, minus 2 mil for Tier 3. You want to try plugging Rawlins-Fernandez's rates on my tiers --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Oh, yeah, yours is...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- instead of Shane's one? Because with Shane's one, she generated almost 24.5 million. If she plug it into mine's *[sic]* one...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That's...yeah. Yeah, I'm not a big fan of the TVRs, but I know that they're all having a hard time. And they're...we're hoping that we can buy those units.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: True.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, if you use Member Rawlins-Fernandez's rates on my tiers, it generates \$19,745,875. If you use it on Member Sinenci's rates, it generates \$24,489,904.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Was...the Tier 3, was that 18.50?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 20.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 18.20.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: 18. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Any more discussion? You want to come back to it?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I have another proposal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Long-Term Rental, Tier 3, more than 3 million, \$1 to \$9.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Are you going off of Member Kama's rates...or tiers, my tiers, or the Mayor's tiers?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The Mayor's tiers.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Mayor's tiers.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I got \$117,172 more? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I have a question. The Commercial [*sic*] Residential for bed and breakfasts, is it possible for us to change it to Owner-Occupied, or is that a different parameter from where we're at right now?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, you're talk...you're talking about Commercial [*sic*] Residential. Is that what you just said, Commercial [*sic*] Residential?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: From Commercial [*sic*] Residential to Owner-Occupied.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . change the law.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. And that's...so, just change the rates.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. That's what the testifiers were saying, huh, Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah, I know. I'm just asking.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think that's all the proposals I have.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Long-Term Rental, your other proposal is that Tier 3 would go to \$9?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. . . .*(silence)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have something to look at for Long-Term Rental. If we go with my tiers, which is 0 to 1.3, \$1,300,001 to 5 million, and then more than 5 million, and then you have Tier 1 at \$3, Tier 2 at \$5, and Tier 3 at \$18.

. . .*(silence)*. . .

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So...so...yes?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Could they repeat the...I believe that was a change in Long-Term Rental rates, and was it the same tiers as the Mayor's?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It was. I proposed 0...if you...if you click on the Long-Term Rental tab at the bottom of your Excel spreadsheet, my proposal is the one on top. And then I plugged in 3, 5, and 18.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, sorry. No, I mean, that could be hers one actually. So, Member Kama's proposal...I'm working off Member Kama's proposal. And...and I guess the way...so that generates maybe 367...\$367,640. But if you own a house worth more than 5 million, how affordable are you renting it out, is a little bit what I'm saying. That...that might be Mr. Croly's case of the cottage where the...the maintenance worker lives or something.

MR. HANANO: Chair?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yes, Mr. Hanano?

MR. HANANO: I think this one for Long-Term Rental will have the same problem as...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh, it exceeds.

MR. HANANO: It's over, yeah. It's...I think 4.5 is the limit.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MR. HANANO: Yeah, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, then --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . 4.5.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 4.5 is as high up as we could go?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: In the spreadsheet that Staff just emailed us tonight, it has the 4.5 in the TK request. So, if we wanted to go with that one, we can use...we can go off of that spreadsheet.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Let's see how much that generates. Oh, it...it might generate more, actually. Almost half a mil, 495,856. . . .*(silence)*. . . That generated like...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

. . .*(Councilmembers deliberating without microphones)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I have a proposal --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: The spreadsheet.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- for Non-Occupied...Non...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Tier 3?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Huh?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: \$25, 43 million?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: . . .*(chuckling)*. . . I had, according to the Mayor's rates, 6.50, 9,

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

and 15. What did you have?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: 18.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: For anything over 4.5?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Mine would generate 9,250,000.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: There you go.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mine's 14.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Can I ask a question of Ms. Toshikiyo?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Ms. Toshikiyo.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Hey, Ms. Toshikiyo, thanks for hanging out with us. If we increase the revenue, do we also have to make corresponding increases to all our percentage funds, like Open Space, and Affordable Housing, and...what else is there?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's right.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: For Open Space and Affordable Housing? Well, Ms. Milner can correct me if I'm wrong, but at least for Affordable Housing, I believe more than the Charter-required percentage was transferred earlier. So, I'm supposing if it is...the transfer is less than what would be required under the Charter and the new increase in revenue, then yes, you would have to make a corresponding transfer. And similarly, I don't know, from the calculations, how much of the Open Space Fund had been transferred.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Hey, Ms. Milner.

MS. MILNER: Hey, Councilmembers. So, for the Affordable Housing Fund, as of right now, according to my calculations, we're transferring 46,959,284 in there, which is currently well over the 3 percent that's required. So, as long as it stays that way, no adjustments will be needed. But for the Open Space Fund, the transfer was solely 1 percent of the RPT. So, anything that...increases above that will need to be transferred. And so, you need to ensure you increase your revenues by enough to cover whatever that 1 percent difference ends up being. Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, we'll revisit that if we need to.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think we have to. It's the law.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, was it...Member Kama, you had a question?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . it's the law.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Why is Corp. Counsel making Kristina Toshikiyo work tonight?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, because her father's funeral.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I mean, it's going to be late.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, we should have...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: She'll be exhausted tomorrow.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I don't know if it's Corp. Counsel, it feels like it's us.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: I know. Tomorrow's the...she must be very busy with her family, too. All right, Members. Proceeding on.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I don't have any other amendments or proposals.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay. Owner-Occupy [*sic*], you made your proposals. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I made proposals for all of them already.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The ones that I had proposals for.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Has...has anybody...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: How does the body feel about Short-Term Rentals? Did we have any changes?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Uh-huh.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: And we're comfortable with it? I know, I think we did Tier 3. Did we do Tier 1 and 2s?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We had two...two proposals for Short-Term Rentals. With Member Sinenci's rate, we generated \$24,489,904. With my rate, we would have...or not rate --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Threshold.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- tiers, we would have generated \$19,745,000 --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- 875.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: All right. Sounds good. I won't propose mine then because yours is bigger...or I don't even know that, but...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, one of the two. I mean, we didn't choose one.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. For mine, it's the same as the Mayor's, as far as the tiers. But I think, actually, mine might be bigger. But for the first tier, it's 13.50, and that's last year's Tier 2. And then for Tier 2, it would be \$15, and that's last year's Tier 3. And I think we did Tier 3. Oh, no...no one did \$18 at Tier 3, right? I didn't...I don't see that in mine. I see it 15. So...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . 18.20.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh. Okay. Well, my Tier 3 would be 18.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But your...your Tier 2 is...would be more.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. My tier --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- my Tier 2's at \$15 flat.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Tier 2?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 31.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: 31 million?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: With Member Sinenci's proposed thresholds.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. We're going to do Member Sinenci's proposed. Okay.
You said...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What...what did Ms. Tumpap recommend for
Non-Owner-Occupied? Tier 3, \$18. Was that it?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah. She did say 18, didn't she, for Tier 3?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But what --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- did she say for Tier 1 and 2?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I don't...I don't think she gave a recommendation. I just recall
my mind triggering Tier 3 at 18.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I think so, too. Yeah, and I said 18.20 for
the TVRs.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's...that's... When the Chamber of Commerce comes in
and says 18, I think that's...you know, that's pretty good.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, for...for Owner...for Owner-Occupied --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: For...no --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- or TVR?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- for TVR.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 18.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: 18.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I thought she said Non-Owner-Occupied.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Or...did she? I...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I think it was . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. So, we have it at 18.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. All right.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I beg your pardon, that was Non-Owner-Occupied.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: That would...that would generate an additional \$15,681,014.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Is that something the body would consider? I mean, I want to try.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'll listen to Pam.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: . . .*(chuckling)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: She'll be happy.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then I think Mr. Croly said all the highest tiers the same. So, then if we go with Timeshare at \$18, that's another 14,288,031. . . .*(silence)*. . . So, with Non-Owner-Occupied, Short-Term Rentals, and Timeshare, we could get up to 49,714,920. But I think we might suffer from appeals next year.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair, I'm sorry, I was focusing on my sheet. What was the Timeshare...I had 12.75, 13.70, I had 15.75. What was proposed?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If we go to \$18, then we'll generate \$14,288,031.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. If it goes 12.75, 13.75, 15.75, it generates 6,560,465. That's 75 cents added to each one.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For TVR?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: To...for TVR with the Mayor's tiers.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, what are your tiers? I mean what is your rate, sorry, again?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 75...I mean, that's just my proposal. 75 cents apiece, it adds 6.5 million...6,560,465.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I think I...I'd rather play around with the tiers, either Member Sinenci or mine one [sic].

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, the tiers to make more money, principally, you're lowering the...the tiers.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Staff, could you put this on the screen so that everybody can see what we're talking about...Members are talking about? Your spreadsheet.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We're a little all over the place, to be fair. So, I mean...I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So...Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But with...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Can I make a comment to the group?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: By keeping the tiers that have some variation between them, it kind of separates out the people who are sort of more modest-income, moderate-income, and higher-income. If we compress the tiers, then the people...everybody's kind of getting hammered. I don't know. That's the idea?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, it's hard to see, yeah?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(inaudible). . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Is there a way to zoom that in so it's legible?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(inaudible). . .

. . .(Councilmembers deliberating without microphones). . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, we can sit here and...I'd like to hear that. Because that could end this really quickly if you got us to 60 million and we can...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, that was...that was everyone together.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah. As in...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. You want to...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: If...if we got there through all of us as a collaborative effort...because I definitely listened to all. I think everybody had a bit of a piece to this. So, can we just --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Hear it.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Well, I...if we could...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- put it out there, and then move on?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair, if we could have it as a reference point as we continue to check and...some other options. Some of them strike me as for the economy, and what we have coming with tariffs and everything--insurance increases, our local residents not being paid adequately and making enough money, the rental issues, electrical--that I'd just like to keep those in mind. It's like --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Wait, I'm going to...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- being as soft as we can and spreading it out, but getting the money that we need...and not assuming that necessarily any one group can really share the burden on. I would say one thing. I think that timeshares wit...there's several...I don't know, there's a few hundred of them --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- more coming online that aren't...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, yeah?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Well, the Hilton. And they're really nice. And I don't want to be punitive, but I just want to point that out. If we raise it a little bit, and then there's more of those coming on the market because they are being constructed, then we have some forecasting that we're going to be generating more revenue, as opposed to looking at it as if it's stagnant, and raising it up to raise the revenue.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah. I mean, it sounded like we all...we're looking...working off each other's work, which is --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. No, I...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- exactly what we want to do. We got to the number, maybe we could hear it for the record, and move on.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh. Mic. Mic.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I thought my hearing aid's dying. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, I...I just...I asked Staff to put up a spreadsheet so that you can see. It sounds like you're coming to maybe some decisions so that everybody can talk from one document. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, it seems that the group came up with a number, so that's something right now, which probably could be tweaked. But are there other options besides real property tax increases?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I like that.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, besides that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: My Staff--if you want to talk about that--my Staff, which is --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Michele.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- Michele Yoshimura, right? She...she worked really hard on this with Jordan Helle, and they basically have some...put together some proposals for where we could possibly look at cutting if you would like to.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Sure, but you're going to talk about a total, right? You're not going to just give all individual projects.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, it's...it's basically with CIP.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: For a total of what?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, we didn't look at it...well, let me pull it up.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I mean, like are we in the \$60 million range, or we're in the \$10.95 range?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I have a motion.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Here you go. Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I move to amend Commercial from 6.05 to 6.29.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Commercial...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If I get a second, I'll explain.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, Commercial is right after Apartment.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, it looks like our Commercial rate used to be 6.29 in Fiscal Year '21 and Fiscal Year '22. Then we lowered it to 6.05, and I'm kind of assuming that's like kind of COVID-related. And now, a lot of Lāhainā folks had to replace everything. So, you know, they bought a lot of stuff...Home Depot, Lowe's.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, does that make 653,497?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I got 627,595, but...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: That's at 6.29.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: At 6.29.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It's not...it's not tiered. Just in the interest of bringing us back to where it was, I guess. And if...if we follow the same suit, Apartment used to be 5.55. So, we're not...and Industrial used to be 7.20. So, those...those kind of things would just bring us back to where we were in Fiscal Year '21 and '22 with the rates, although the assessment is probably much higher. But those rates are not like unheard of, but the assessment is more.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For Apartment, if we went up...not to 5.25, but to 4.50, it's 720,000.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And it used to be 5.55, but...yeah. 4.50, you said?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, Apartment.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Too bad this bar graph doesn't also have one for the assessed value. They probably do, yeah? Oh, here...it's on page 6 of the second part. Yeah, I'd be okay with bringing Apartment close to back what it was, Commercial close to back what it was, and Industrial close to back what it was. Because if you look on page 6, bar graphs over the years...oh, but Industrial was 7.20. But this is certified revenue, not assessed value, so they might have built more or something, or...I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Members, it's 9:36. I didn't want to do this late, but can...can we kind of...I think we're...we're almost there. If you guys are ready, I'm ready. I think --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- the term was, I'll turn into a pumpkin if it gets too late. Remember the Councilmember used to say that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yours was pineapple. Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, Member Rawlins-Fernandez, you've been keeping a tally of where are with the discussions?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: On the different discussions, yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We can start with the Non-Owner-Occupied.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Mr. Krueger, you want to keep track? Yeah, it's really hard to see yours, but at least if we're talking about it, then you can be in sync with the totals. So, one moment. Okay. Then we can look at...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, that's good.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just...if that's --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You're ready?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- hard, you can look at your own screen.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You're ready? All right. So, for Non-Owner-Occupied, I think we did up to 1, 1 to 3, and over 3. Right?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, those are the thresholds. Okay. And that's what they got on the screen. And then flat for Tier 1 rate, 9.50, and 18 for Tier 3.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Tier 2, 9.50, and Tier 3, 18.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Oh, you got to turn on your mic.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Same, 5.87.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 5.87. The same as the Mayor's proposal.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 9.50.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 18.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 21 million. Okay. And then Apartment...I mean, we do have a live motion on the floor as well.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For 4.50?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 4.50 for the Commercial.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, for the Commercial.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That was the motion, yeah. So, for Apartment, no thresholds, no tiers, 4.50. Hotel Resort, 12. Timeshare, 18. And then TVRs, Member Sinenci's proposal of Tier 1, up to 800. Oh, yeah. Yeah, 1 to...sorry. 8 to...oops. 8 to 1.6, and above 1.6. And then I think we got --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 12.55.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- some from Member Johnson. Yeah, 12.55, 15, and 18.20.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I thought the middle one stayed at 13.50.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, Member Johnson had a \$15 proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, this is Timeshare?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, that's TVRs.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: TVR?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, what was it again, the number...the rates?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 12.55, 15, and 18.20.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then Long-Term Rental, I think we went with Member Kama's thresholds of up to 1.3 million, 1.3 to 4.5, and more than 4.5. And Tier 1, flat, Tier 2, flat, and Tier 3, 18. Okay. And then Ag...you want to do Ag, Member Johnson?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I know, I know.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. So, Ag is the same, at 5.74; Conservation at 6.43; Commercial, no tiers, 6.29.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Commercial, 6.29?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Same.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Did you say 6.29?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 6.29.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For Commercial.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then Industrial, 7.10. And then Commercial [sic] Residential, we didn't really talk about it, but I just have the Mayor's proposal, and then Tier 3, \$9.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Commercial...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I forgot that I did have that proposal, and I didn't say it earlier. And that should be all of it. And I think I calculated 68,653,551.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: You know, I kind of do want to do the Ag tiers because I...you know, we did work on it, and...and I...I'm...I'm just going to...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Just tell Mr. Krueger, he'll put it in right now.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. So, Tier 1, I had it at up to 3.3 [sic] million.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, you can't put the 3, though. Just 3.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Or...okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Just 3.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Then just what...just 1 or...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Just 3.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. 3?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Up to 3.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: 5.74. Tier...oh.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 3 to?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I had it 3 to 8.5 --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- at 6.43. And then more than 8.5 is \$8.35.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: I think...maybe...maybe James can explain why Tier 1 was a typo, and we...because I think Marcy Martin could work on this over the weekend. That's what she was telling our team. But Mr. Krueger, can we make it to 3.3 mil?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

MR. KRUEGER: Chair? Yeah, so apologies. So, in the FN-14, when we put in everybody's proposals for Councilmember Johnson's Ag proposal, we had put it to 3 million. I believe he requested 3.3 million.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: We received, from Director Martin, you know, what was in the letter, so the threshold for 3 million, 3 to 8.5 mil, and more than 8.5 mil. So, the reason that right now we cannot put it at 3.3 mil is that we simply don't know where...how much of the current value falls in that...that middle ground, 3 million to 3.3 million. So, we wouldn't know where it goes, so it's a bit of a gray spot. As far as Director Martin being able to...to produce that, and I suppose that just depends on the body's will. I don't know if the body wants to...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Director Martin said it would be a small difference, so I would really like for us to put it in there. We did do work on it, and it's unfortunate that there was a typo that jams everything up. There was reasons why we chose that number, to catch certain fish, if you know what I mean. So, I...I don't...I want to keep Haleakala Ranch in Tier 1 because they have over 80 parcels, and that's kind of a mess to work with that. So, that was the reason why I wanted it to be 3...3.3.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If you want to go with the tier that I proposed, which was 7 million-plus, then you can still catch your...your fish from your island.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, there's a lot of fish in the sea, isn't there, Councilmember Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: There's quite a bit of fish.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, I just...I mean, again, like the work that we did, I kind of want to recognize it and...but if...you know, it's up to the body. I...I...I don't know. It's just, I feel like, you know, we worked on it, and I wanted to make it so it would show, but at the end of the day, I wanted to kind of keep Haleakala Ranch in...in Tier 1.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And, I mean, I would just say that's great, I totally agree, but in the big picture, it's like 50,000, 100,000.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yours is easier. Two tiers is easy. Mr. Krueger, would you mind? I'm sorry to make you go backwards, but your tiers was...can you say your tiers?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Up to 7 million, and more than 7 million.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And we still get some of the fish. Next year we can get more fish.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. I don't want to...I know everybody's tired, and everybody just wants to go home, but I just wanted to make a point that we did do the...the right thing, and because of a typo, I don't want to make the work go away.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: There's always next year . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: That's what I said last year. . . *(chuckling)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. . . *(chuckling)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: But we helped you correct it.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- I'd like to run something by everybody.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Using the Mayor's tiers, Commercial *[sic]* Residential, 1.6 Tier 1; 2 Tier 2; and 8 Tier 3. It cost us 760...\$726,807, and it puts, apparently, a handful of people back into...closer to the Owner-Occupied category.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, which class?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Commercial *[sic]* Residential.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Commercial *[sic]* Residential.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. So, currently...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: What are the tier thresholds? 1 --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Tier --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- 1.4 --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- Tier 1 is...is 1.60; Tier 2 is 2, which is the same as Owner-Occupied; and 3 at 8.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Try that again...Tier 1 and 2.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Tier 1 is 1.60, Tier 2 is 2, Tier 3 is 8.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Wow, what a jump.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And that is actually...costs a little bit, but it's in a very small category, with not many...not really that many taxpayers in it. So, I propose that.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And the tiers in that were what, again?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Tier...it's up to a million for Tier 1.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, same tiers...same.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And same thing as the Mayor's. So, up to a million, up to...from \$1,000,001 to 4 million, and more than 4.5 million.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Tier 3 should be 18, too.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And the...the...the justification is these people are residents, for most...for all intents and purposes. When I was checking on the real property tax examples, there's a lot of very obvious commercial and places where people are also living, like old school upstairs or businesses downstairs.

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, Chair, I didn't quite catch that. Could...could I have that repeated one more time? I'm so sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Sure, no problem. Tier 1...

MS. MILNER: Sorry. Chair? Sorry. Chair? It's Lesley. Can I just interrupt? Apologies, I think Councilmember Cook may be looking at the typos. So, the Mayor's proposed tiers are 1, 1 to 3, and more than 3, if you were using the Mayor's proposed rates. So, I just wanted to interject before Mr. Krueger had to type more.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: No, no.

MS. MILNER: Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. For Commercial [sic] Residential, that's the case?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Because on...there again, on this, it's mistaken.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Thank you for correcting me.

MS. MILNER: Yes, that's...on page 3, it is correct --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah.

MS. MILNER: -- but that is a typo on page 1. Thank you, Chair.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, 0 to 1, 101 to 3, and then more than 3.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, 1.60 for Tier 1, \$2 for Tier 2 --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, no.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- and \$8 for that. It's basically the same rates as Owner-Occupied.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, that's...Owner-Occupied and Commercial Residents, they're apples and oranges. They make a lot of money in those B&Bs, man. I don't...I mean, if you look at...just for example, Mr. Croly, I don't mean to call him out, but he gave us his GE taxes, like the numbers he made. It's...I don't think it would be considered to Owner-Occupied. I mean, but I...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: It's...it's a small group of people. And if you look...I agree, the B&B and the Commercial [sic] Residential, and other people that are in Owner...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: You want to use the mic? I'm sorry. Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And the other people who are...other Owner-Occupied...I'll give you an example. In Kihei, on Lipoa and South Kihei Road, those multistory that have businesses--downstairs, barbershop, and residences upstairs--okay? Those are Owner-Occupied. Those are Commercial [sic] Residential. I mean, Commercial [sic] Residential, but they're...anyway. So, it's just a proposal. I'm advocating and asking.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No, I hear you. But I just...to compare them to Owner-Occupied, I'm...just it's a bit of a stretch for me.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For me, like the ones that Member Cook was talking about, like barbershop downstairs and like that, that's Commercial providing a service to our residents, whereas Commercialized Residential is...you know, it's...it's a benefit to...to commercial areas, but to other residents, like for West Maui at least, you know, Commercialized Residential, TVR, Short-Term Rental, these people add to our economy, but they also all come in in the winter. And so, when you go to Nāpili Market, you wait like half an hour in line. When you go to Nāpili Bay, you can't find any parking. So...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: For TVRs, I completely agree.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I mean, it's the same impact. It's just this money is going directly to someone that lives in our...our community, so it's...they're not getting taxed at TVR

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

rate, and I don't think they should get taxed at Owner-Occupied rate, and I think that's why they created the Commercialized Residential. I'm okay with dropping it down a little bit, but not to like what Owner-Occupied is.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Well...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And I think the highest tier should remain high because those people have been getting Owner-Occupied until we changed the law that one time. So, they've been kind of scoff-lawing for many, many years.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I got a proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Scoff-logging [*sic*]?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Lawing, scofflaw.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Scofflaw. I don't know, I'm still probably saying it wrong.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm probably saying it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. I got 3, 6, and 18.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. And 18?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. So...okay. I'll...I'll meet...I'll meet you halfway.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .(*inaudible*). . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, my God.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 3, 6, and 18.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. . . .(*inaudible*). . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: She said 18.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, it was 4, 5, and 8. So, how about 3, 5, and 18? No.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 3, 6, and...

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 3.50, 5, and 18.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. 3.50...

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Yes. Apologies to interject. I think for the Commercialized Residential, we set the max rate at...the range of rates has the max at \$12.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. \$12.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh...\$12. How about 3, 4, and 12?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I got 3, 6.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: If you have more than those.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 2, 3, and 10?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 10.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mic.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Right, the --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, then let's do it 12.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- high ones should go higher, because there's fewer, and they can afford it. If you want to give the little guys a tax break, we got to add a lot more to the big fish.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. How about 2, 2.50, and 12?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 2, 2.50, and 12. I can...I can live with that.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I was matching the Long-Term Rental. Long-Term Rental is \$3, Tier 1. And then --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We should...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- to adjust, Tier 2, I went to 6 to make up for the loss in Tier 1. And then, 12 in Tier 3.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I hate to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Chair...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- spoil the party --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- but, you know, if you don't have five votes, don't even bother talking about it. You know?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I'm...I'm trying to get five votes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, but you only have two, maybe. And that's you voting two times, you know.

COUNCILMEMBERS: . . .*(laughing)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I don't...it's not working, Tom. I know what you're trying to do, but, you know, it's not working.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess we should leave Commercialized Residential.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We're trying to help --

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah. If we just leave it alone --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- a small group of people.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: -- it might be better, and we can move on. Because, you know, it is getting late, Members. And look at us, we're...in the spirit of working together, but I hear you, let's...let's...let's put this puppy to rest, I guess.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Main thing, we're not skinning cats.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Member Johnson --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: My puppy went to bed without me.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- my Staff checked with Marcy Martin regarding your Ag rates. And she said, regarding Gabe's proposal, that may be a small difference if he uses what he has. We can adjust on Monday, is what he [sic] said.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Wonderful.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Not he, but she said.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: But I...okay. So, you want me...Mr. Krueger, you need those tiers again?

MR. KRUEGER: So, should I just put in what we have on the spreadsheet, and then we can adjust on Monday, basically?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Yeah, let's wait until Monday.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For his, but...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It'll likely not be very much.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Just save it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's not going to be a substantial change.
...*(chuckling)*...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Save the spreadsheet, gavel out, and we go home.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: ...*(inaudible)*...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, we got to do more stuff? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good try, Member Johnson. All right.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And ...*(inaudible)*...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Krueger, where did we land...with the amount?

MR. KRUEGER: Well, apologies. I guess I just need two clarifications. One, the...what I should have in there for the Commercialized Residential?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Keep the Mayor's proposal.

MR. KRUEGER: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Can we make it 10 for Tier 3?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do we have five votes?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Tier 3.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: On the Commercialized.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 4.5 million above.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, that's a typo, 3 million above.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, right. Sorry, 3 million.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: On what?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Commercialized...

MR. KRUEGER: And...and then the...I guess the other...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Commercialized Residential.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: 5.5.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: You guys are killing me.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, okay. Fine. All right. Mayor's proposal.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Well...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: What's your second clarification, Mr. Krueger?

MR. KRUEGER: Just what...so what should I put there in Agricultural for now?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: 2.50, 3.50, and 10.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Use my proposal for now.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Just leave Councilmember Paltin's for now, and we'll fix that on Monday.

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you. I...I think we went through everything starting from Non-Owner-Occupied, so I just wanted to hear from...what should be there in the Owner-Occupied rates?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For the Owner-Occupied, I got 1.6, 1.9, and 5.5.

MR. KRUEGER: With...with these tiers and...and valuation as well?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is that Member Kama's?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MR. KRUEGER: Thank you. So, right now, we're showing the proposal will generate \$712,270,170, about 68 million over the Mayor.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Getting closer.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah, I'm making...I'm making the...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: What was the target amount that...

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, just one second.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: What happened with the question earlier about is there other ways to generate revenue besides raising the tax rates...when Chair Lee asked.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, actually, that question that Chair Lee asked is, my office put together some possible cuts as other options, and that's...that's what Chair Lee is asking.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Oh, okay. So, it's not --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's not...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- okay, Carryover/Savings and all these other categories are just like the Mayor's kuleana, we can't touch it.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . deferred.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, but what...what's the total of the projects? . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mic.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mic.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Your mic.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair Lee's asking the total of the projects that they put together that can be cut.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, the cash that is available here is 5 point...oh, 8...8 million here.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What...what --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And 5.4.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- were the projects that were cut?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, these are actually CI...Public Works, right? So, it's CIP projects, and it is something that we checked with Director Molina if he would be interested. And from his communications with us, he said that these projects, he can, you know, pick and choose whichever, and we would...we could deduct some of the funds that are available...and I think it was like 10 or 25 percent, and he would be okay. I'm going to...I'm going to ask my office for that spreadsheet to share with you, but do you want to do it after you finish the RPT?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can I ask one question?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Is it...is the total 8 million, or you have more?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: The spreadsheets that I'm looking at is...sorry, 8, and I think it's 5. But what the...what...what they looked at is, how much of it could be...what percentage could be cut, so it's like 10, and they have these variables, and then we can look at it. So, let me get it from my office. I'm going to call a short recess.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, before you call a recess, can we get the target amount from Mr. Krueger?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, Chair. So, target amount is 60,472,133.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 60 million...60 million what? 4...

MR. KRUEGER: 472,133.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. What we are owed. Okay. I'm going to call a...is it ten-minute...10:15, shall we come back? ...*(gavel)*...

RECESS: 10:01 p.m.
RECONVENE: 10:25 p.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ...*(gavel)*... Thanks for that long break. Members, we are going to defer this item, continue on this discussion, and meet on Sunday at 11:00, okay?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

ACTION: DEFER.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Good.

MR. KRUEGER: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. KRUEGER: There's no need to defer right now, but if the body's intent to recess, then...then you'll just need to...should I announce the time, and place, and all of that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sure.

MR. KRUEGER: So, the body is recessing, the reconvene time...or date will be April...Sunday, April 27th, at 11:00 a.m. The same in-person location here in the Chamber, with the same Teams link as the meeting...the online meeting connection link.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. Members, thank you for working hard, and staying late as well.

MR. KRUEGER: Oh, to...to clarify, it's 11:00 a.m. I'm not sure if I said that, 11:00 a.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: On Sunday. It's 10:26, this meeting is now adjourned [*sic*]. ...*(gavel)*...

MR. KRUEGER: Chair. Chair. Recess. Recess.

RECESS: 10:26 p.m.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

April 25, 2025

CERTIFICATION

I, Daniel Schoenbeck, hereby certify that pages 1 through 265 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 12th day of June 2025, in Wailuku, Hawai'i



Daniel Schoenbeck