

MICHAEL P. VICTORINO
Mayor

DAVID C. THYNE
Fire Chief

BRADFORD K. VENTURA
Deputy Fire Chief



RECEIVED

2019 APR 16 AM 9:58

OFFICE OF THE
DEPARTMENT OF FIRE & PUBLIC SAFETY
COUNTY OF MAUI
200 DAIRY ROAD
KAHULUI, HI 96732

April 12, 2019

OFFICE OF THE
COUNTY COUNCIL

2019 APR 16 AM 9:05

RECEIVED

Ms. Michele M. Yoshimura *MJY*
Budget Director, County of Maui
200 South High Street
Wailuku, HI 96793

APPROVED FOR TRANSMITTAL

Honorable Michael P. Victorino
Mayor, County of Maui
200 South High Street
Wailuku, HI 96793

Michael P Victorino 4/15/19

Mayor Date

For Transmittal to:

Honorable Keani Rawlins-Fernandez
Chair, Economic Development & Budget Committee
Maui County Council
200 South High Street
Wailuku, HI 96793

Dear Chair Rawlins-Fernandez:

SUBJECT: FISCAL YEAR (FY) 2020 BUDGET (FS-10) (EDB-1)

The Department of Fire & Public Safety has received your communication dated April 10, 2019.

1. Please provide a list of the Department's eight core competency shortcomings identified by the accreditation report and explain which shortcomings have been addressed thus far and how.

The eight core competencies shortcomings identified in the Accreditation Report (page 3) dated February 27, 2017 are below. Detailed information provided within the Accreditation Report can be found below each competency in italics.

- I. **2B.1 Each planning zone and population area is analyzed and risk factors are evaluated in order to establish a standards of cover.**

The Department has begun a risk assessment of structures on Maui, Molokai and Lanai. However, we are unable to demonstrate all structures as being evaluated and placed in their Vision software, thus not being able to complete their fire and non-fire risk assessment.

- II. 2C.1 Each planning zone and population area is analyzed and non-fire risk factors are evaluated in order to establish a standard of cover.

Please see the explanation stated above.

- III. 2B.5 Agency baseline and benchmark total response time objectives for fire response conform to industry best practices as prescribed on pages 70-71 of first due and effective response force (ERF).

The Department has facilities located throughout the response areas, however, there is a need to do a complete assessment relying on the community risk assessment/standards of cover to evaluate the number and location of current and future stations.

Note: The response times documented in the Department's Standards of Cover are not acceptable by accreditation standards.

- IV. 2C.5 Agency baseline and benchmark total response time objectives for non-fire incidents response conform to industry best practices as prescribed on page 70-71 for first due and effective response force (ERF).

Please see the Department explanation stated above.

- V. 5A.1 Given the agency's standards of cover and emergency deployment objectives, the agency meets its staffing, response time, pumping capacity, apparatus and equipment deployment objectives for each type and magnitude of fire suppression emergency incidents.

The Department needs to evaluate FireRMS data on a frequent basis to determine areas of concern and make informed decisions on improvement of response capabilities for the citizens and visitors. The Department should develop a process to make informed decisions when establishing benchmarks for response areas not having an effective force baseline.

- VI. 5F.7 An appraisal is conducted at least annually, to determine the effectiveness of the hazardous materials program.

The Department needs to develop a formal and measurable assessment process to determine the effectiveness of the hazardous materials program. This process should be supported by standard operating guidelines to substantiate the methodology and completion requirements.

- VII. 7F.5 An occupational health and safety training program is established and designed to instruct the workforce in general safe work practices, from point of initial employment through each job assignment and/or whenever new substances, new processes, procedures, or equipment are introduced.

It provides specific instructions on operations and hazards specific to the agency.

The Department should establish the role of incident safety officer within the critical task analysis of the Community Risk Assessment/ Standards of Cover for all program areas. This position should be filled at all incidents and the department should ensure that all individuals performing this functions be properly trained and certified.

VIII. 10A.1 The agency develops and maintains outside relationships that support its mission, operations or cost effectiveness.

The department has MOUs with many different agencies, however, the department is being dispatched by a combined system coordinate by the Maui County Police Department. Even though this is a county system there needs to be a formal agreement between the department and the dispatch center to establish dispatch expectations.

None of the eight core competencies are complete. Two (2) competencies, specifically 2B.1 and 2C.1 are in the final stages of completion. There are 82 core competencies that must be achieved to gain accreditation. There are several competencies already in place within the Department, however the Accreditation Committee decided it was not at a high enough level.

In regards to 2B.5 and 2C.5, achieving better response times will require better communication and tracking between the Department and Dispatch, as well as auditing response time to check for accuracy. This has not been done.

Maui County's geography and logistical challenges make achieving identified shortcoming extremely difficult and costly.

2. Please explain how the department has decreased energy consumption. Please list the department's strategies for decreasing energy consumption by 2% in FY-20.

The continued overall effort through the chain of command to ensure day-to-day activities support our goals towards energy efficiency. The overall awareness towards this effort alone helps to reach our goal. As facility equipment/fixtures face replacement, the Department strives to invest in the newest technologies in energy efficiency while remaining conscience of cost.

3. What will happen to the six CPR mannequins, twenty turnouts and 1" and 1.5" nozzles that will be replaced?

The six (6) CPR mannequins are in poor condition and no longer meet the requirements of the American Heart Association. They will be retired and taken for disposal.

The twenty (20) turnouts will be replacing expired turnouts (10 year service life). Expired turnouts are used for non-fire related activities during Fire Fighter Trainee Recruit School.

The 1” and 1.5” nozzles are replacing equipment that has been lost or substantially damaged as a result of firefighting activities. Unusable nozzles are taken for disposal.

4. What will happen to the sedan that will be replaced?

The Department intends to trade-in the sedan upon the approval and purchase of a new vehicle.

5. Both the Budget Narrative (pg. 238) and Details (7-1) list the change amount from FY-19 to FY-20 at \$630,639 in the administrative program. However, the expansion budget request on page 240 of the Narrative lists the change amount at \$870,908. Does this indicate that \$240,269 of requests were not fulfilled? Please explain this discrepancy.

No. The \$870,908 (Narrative page 240) is for expansion budget requests only. Changes to the continuation budget needs to be taken into consideration to get the overall change amount from the current fiscal year of \$30,639 (Details 7-1). The changes to the continuation budget include:

- **Increase in salaries and wages of \$6,735.00 (Details page 7-4)**
- **Deletion of premium pay of \$1,050.00 (Details page 7-5)**
- **Deletion of Other Services of \$250,000.00 (Details 7-6)**
- **Addition to Sewer charges of \$8.00 and addition to Water delivery charges to \$9,038.00 (Details page 7-6)**

Expansion Budget		\$870,908.00
Increase Salary and Wages	+	\$6,735.00
Deletion of Premium Pay	-	\$1,050.00
Deletion of Other Services	-	\$250,000.00
Addition of Sewer Charges	+	\$8.00
Addition of Water Delivery	+	\$9,038.00
	=	\$635,639.00

The \$5,000.00 difference between the figure above and the change amount of \$630,639.00 (Details page 7-1) is due to a discrepancy in Travel 911206B-6201, Airfare, Transportation. The change amount of \$6,000.00 for airfare is shown on Narrative page 240, is reflected on Details page 7-8 as \$1,000.00

6. Please list the 250 new certification trainings done annually and the percentage of personnel attending these trainings.

Mandatory Certification Trainings – BU 11/14 Personnel

High Performance Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation (CPR) – 96%

Emergency Medical Responder (EMR) – 96%

Mandatory Certification Training – BU 11 Personnel

Hazmat First Responder Operations (HazFro) – 96%

Mandatory Certification Training – ALL BU 14 Personnel

Open Water Lifeguard Certification – 100%

Mandatory Certification Training – Fire Fighter Trainees (Recruit School)

High Performance Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation (CPR)

Emergency Medical Responder (EMR) – National Registry

Fire Apparatus Driver Operator (FADOP): Emergency Vehicle Operation

Rope Rescue Operations

Surf Rescue Operations

Confined Space Awareness

Wildland S-130

Wildland S-190

NIMS 700: Introduction to National Incident Management System

NIMS 800: National Response Framework, an Introduction

ICS 100: Introduction to the Incident Command System

ICS 200: Single Resource and Initial Action Incident

Pro Board Certification: Fire Fighter I

Pro Board Certification: Fire Fighter II

Pro Board Certification: Airport Fire Fighter

Pro Board Certification: Hazmat Awareness and Operations

Helicopter Operations: Ocean and Land Rescue

Mandatory Certification Training – Required by Position Minimum Qualifications

Rope Rescue Technician, Level 1 – Current/potential Rescue Personnel

Rope Rescue Technician, Level 2 – Current/potential Rescue Personnel

Confined Space, Rescue Hazardous Materials – Hazmat and Rescue Personnel

*NFA Chemistry for Emergency Response – Current/potential Hazmat Personnel

* Hazardous Materials Technician Level Tactics – Current/potential Hazmat Personnel

Introduction to Computer-Aided Management of Emergency Operations (CAMEO) Suite
– Hazmat Personnel

Advanced CAMEO Application for All Hazards Management and Planning Level –
Hazmat Personnel

SCUBA – Current/potential Rescue Personnel

Blue Card Certification Lab – Fire Fighter IIIs and higher

Helicopter Operations: Ocean and Land Rescue – Rescue Personnel

Non-Mandatory Certification Training Offered to BU 11 Personnel

ICS 300: Intermediate ICS for Expanding Incidents

ICS 400: Advanced Incident Command System

**NIMS ICS All-Hazards Position Specific: Incident Commander

**NIMS ICS All-Hazards Position Specific: Safety Officer

- **All-Hazards Position Specific: Operations Section Chief
- **All-Hazards Position Specific: Planning Section Chief
- **All-Hazards Position Specific: Situation Unit Leader
- **All-Hazards Position Specific: Resources Unit Leader
- **All-Hazards Position Specific: Logistics Section Chief
- **All-Hazards Position Specific: Communication Unit Leader
- **All-Hazards Position Specific: Supply Unit Leader
- **All-Hazards Position Specific: Facility Unit Leader

Fire Instructor I

Fire Apparatus Driver Operator (FADOP): Emergency Vehicle Operation – 96%

Fire Ground Operations (FGO) – 96%

***Courses offered on an annual rotation within the State of Hawaii; if Maui hosts approx. 15 attendees selected, if other island hosts approx. 5 attendees selected)**

****All-Hazard Position Specific Courses are offered on an annual rotation. For example, in 2019 the Department offered the “Logistics Section Chief” course.**

7. What is the lifespan of turnout, CPR mannequin, and a nozzle?

Turnout garments have a ten (10) year lifespan from the manufacture date as established by the National Fire Protection Association (NFPA).

CPR mannequins and nozzles do not have a set lifespan.

8. Are uniformed Ocean Safety Officers included in the annual physical exams? If not, why?

Annual physical exams are not part of the BU 14 Collective Bargaining Agreement (HGEA, Ocean Safety Officers), as it is with the BU 11 Collective Bargaining Agreement (HFFA, Fire Fighters). Therefore, the Department does not require Ocean Safety Officers to complete annual physical exams.

However, we have consulted upon a return to work fitness for duty evaluation which requires any Ocean Safety Officer who is out for any extended period of time (greater than 30 days) to provide written clearance by a licensed physician to return to work full duty without restrictions. The Department is always open to discussing with HGEA, as we believe this would need union support and ultimately be part of the collective bargaining agreement to become a requirement.

9. Are uniformed Ocean Safety Officers included in position appropriate medical exams and fitness assessments? If not, why?

Upon hire Ocean Safety Officer (OSO) must successfully complete a position appropriate pre-employment physical exam.

In addition, Ocean Safety Officers are required to maintain current certifications, which include performing a USLA annual physical evaluation/certification as mandated by their employment. OSOs are allowed a one (1) hour training period for daily workout time/physical conditioning while on duty.

10. Are uniformed Ocean Safety Officers included in the tracking of work related injuries to incorporate applicable exercises into the fitness routine? If not, why?

Yes, Ocean Safety Officers are included in work-related injury tracking. The Department is required to include all employees when tracking work-related injuries and submit an annual report to OSHA.

In regards to the incorporation of applicable exercise into the fitness routine, it is a Department performance goal that we are measuring. The Department's Training and Health & Safety Bureaus support Ocean Safety Officers in minimizing/preventing future injuries.

11. What will happen to the 4-WD diesel crew cab truck proposed to be replaced?

The vehicle which we are requesting replacement is 12 years old and has become less reliable for emergency response. Due to increased repairs this vehicle will be moved from the front line and assigned to the Department's Training Bureau. Under the assignment of the Training Bureau, the vehicle will be available to assist with various tasks, including providing rehab to personnel, during large events/incidents. It will also be utilized for training cadres to use when classes are being taught throughout the island. Instructors for cadres including ropes, jet ski, auto extrication, and FADOP currently use personal vehicles to travel island-wide to provide training to Department personnel. In addition, this vehicle may be used as a relief vehicle when maintenance and repairs are being done on a front line utility vehicle.

12. What will happen to the Titanium Folding stokes basket that will be replaced?

The Titanium Folding Stokes baskets will replace older rusted one piece metal baskets at the Paia and Napili Fire Stations. The baskets being replaced will either be used to replace baskets at other stations that are in worse condition, or serve as backups. The Titanium Folding stokes baskets are lighter, stronger, and both easier and safer for our personnel to transport in remote locations.

13. Have Grant awards for FY-20 been secured?

The Department has secured a HTA grant in the amount of \$125,000.00 which needs to be completed by December 31, 2019.

The Department has applied for a Department of Transportation grant in the amount of \$63,000.00 to obtain auto extrication equipment but it has not yet been secured.

The Department has also applied for a Homeland Security Grant in the amount of \$75,000.00. If awarded this grant, funding will be used to support training and purchase a variety of equipment. The awardees of this grant is scheduled to be announced in October of 2019.

14. How many inspections led to weed abatement clearing? How are inspection locations chosen? Have weed abatement inspections been done on all vacant government lands (county and/or state)?

Overgrown brush complaints are tracked by Request for Service (RFS) intakes. 80% of all RFS in 2018 have been cleared which means that parcels associated were cleared. The other 20% are still active and need follow-up. Unfortunately, these RFS were being handled by inspectors that were reassigned to a line-duty positions. The newly assigned inspectors must undergo training before they can begin actively working assignments such as weed abatement.

If during the RFS process, a property owner fails to respond to our request for compliance, the brush fund would be used to clear the property. The paperwork associated with the RFS and the costs for the clearing would then be submitted to Corporation Counsel for handling.

At this time, weed abatement has not been done on all vacant government lands.

15. What is needed to reach 100% of plans reviewed within 30 days of the application date?

There are several factors affecting the plan review rate at this time:

- 1) **Longevity and experience in the positions is needed. The longest tenured plan reviewer (Fire Fighter IV) has just over two (2) years of experience while the other plan reviewer has almost 18 months of experience. Both reviewers are working hard, but the lack of experience makes for longer reviews because of the necessary research and follow-up that is needed. Typically, it takes about two (2) years to get the reviewer up to speed. Unfortunately, it has been difficult to retain a reviewer for more than two (2) years before he/she ultimately chooses to leave the Fire Prevention Bureau.**
- 2) **The plan reviewers also have other responsibilities including supervising subordinates, assisting and training inspectors, conducting building inspections, conducting fire investigations, and assist with public education. These additional responsibilities are caused in part by the shortage of staffing at the Fire Prevention Bureau over the last three (3) years. Prior to October 2018, the Bureau had been short three (3) Fire Inspectors for over 18 months. The current shortage is down to one (1) Fire Inspector.**

The Fire Prevention Bureau is currently working on improvements to the plan reviewing processes to ensure better efficiency. The plans review processes are

being spelled-out to provide more consistent plan reviews, consistency amongst the reviewers, and better information for the plan submitters.

It would greatly benefit the Fire Prevention Bureau if the current plan reviewers remain in their positions for an extended period of time, at least two (2) years, to gain the experience required and put said experience to work. In addition, Fire Inspectors would need to remain in their positions for an extended period of time, at least two (2) years, to ensure the Fire Fighter IVs (plan reviewers) are available to focus on reviews instead of the other responsibilities as mentioned above.

While additional Fire Fighter IV positions would greatly alleviate some of the workload on our two (2) current plan reviewers, the Department does not believe it is in the best interest of the County. If the construction boom declines, the Department would no longer need the additional Fire Fighter IVs.

The Department feels it a better solution may be to contract a third-party firm to assist with completing plan reviews. Another option would be to hire civilians to complete plan reviews as they are more likely to remain in the positions for an extended period.

16. What is considered minimum staffing for all 12 lifeguard towers? What is needed to decrease the percentage of towers staffed below optimal level to 0%?

The current minimum staffing at each tower is two (2) Ocean Safety Officers (OSOs) per tower. However, the Department feels this is inadequate staffing and will be proposing the following staffing recommendations in the upcoming Strategic Plan which will be renewed in FY 2021.

Towers that have assigned Rescue Water Crafts (RWCs) should have a minimum of five (5) OSOs per tower. This recommendation ensures there is one (1) OSO to operate the RWC, one (1) “grabber” assigned when an RWC is operated, and three (3) OSOs to perform High Performance CPR as recommended by the American Heart Association (AHA).

Towers that do not have an assigned RWC should have a minimum of four (4) OSOs per tower. This recommendation ensures there are three (3) OSOs to perform High Performance CPR as recommended by the AHA and one (1) OSO to monitor other beach activities.

This staffing recommendation includes allowing OSOs contract mandated breaks, training, etc. while ensuring beach goers are still protected.

17. Does the State of Hawaii Makena Lifeguard services grant award cover the counties’ costs for Makena? Has the grant award amount been secured for FY-20? If not, what needs to be done to cover the state’s full obligation?

No, the grant award from the State of Hawaii for Makena Lifeguard services does not cover the costs in its entirety. While the State of Hawaii has paid as dictated by the contract, it does not cover additional expenses such as overtime and equipment.

The grant award for FY 2020 has not been secured.

18. Given the natural disaster driven events of FY-19 to date and the expected population/development growth, do we have adequate front line uniformed officers to sufficiently respond moving forward?

The Department will continue to proficiently respond to any and all incidents. The outcome of every incident is directly related to the timely response of adequate resources. Obviously, the larger the incident, the more resources required. It is not realistic to expect to staff “adequate front line uniformed officers to sufficiently respond” for every incident. For example, even if we had three times the resources during the Hurricane Lane Lahaina fire, we would still not have been able to mitigate it without property loss. Increased staffing will always have a positive impact on our capabilities. The Department is continuously evaluating staffing needs to keep up with response capabilities, while also being fiscally responsible.

19. Why the 65.9% increase in professional services for the public safety commission to \$9,100? Were meeting minutes not done previously?

In previous years, the Department has contracted CSR Maui, Inc. to transcribe minutes for the Fire & Public Safety Commission Meetings. Due to the recent closure of CSR Maui, Inc. the Department contracted Ralph Rosenberg Court Reporting. The new vendor, Ralph Rosenberg Court Reporting charges more for their services.

The Fire Administration provides an in-depth presentation during the monthly Commission meeting, including a short presentation from the Fire Chief, Deputy Fire Chief, Assistant Chief of Operations, and Assistant Fire Chief of Support Services. In addition, a Department guest speaker is invited to speak on his/her division(s) and/or project(s). With these changes, the number of pages being transcribed as increased which in turn has increased the monthly charges.

20. In FY-19 there was an 88.3% increase in small equipment from FY-17 and FY-18, why the continued need for this in FY-20?

The intent of this fund is to purchase small gym equipment for the stations. There is an ongoing need to acquire new equipment or to replace as the need arises. This type of equipment is vital for the Wellness & Fitness program for the Department. We were fortunate to receiving grant funding to purchase some equipment this year, however, this type of funding is not guaranteed in the future.

21. What is the need for overtime and standby pay for Fire Prevention Bureau?

The Fire Prevention Bureau overtime is needed as detailed below:

- 1) Fire Inspectors (Fire Fighter III, Fire Fighter IV, and Fire Captain) are requested by an Incident Commander outside of normal business hours (evenings, weekends, and holidays) to conduct an investigation with significant injuries or fatalities, high-dollar value (>\$10,000.00), or suspected as an intentionally set fire.**
- 2) Personnel providing manpower for Community Event Requests (i.e. Keiki ID, fire safety presentations, medical monitoring, etc.) outside of normal business hours (evenings, weekends, and holidays).**
- 3) Fire Fighter IVs trying to complete plan reviews within 30 days of application date. *Note: Pending availability of Fire Fighter IVs to work outside of normal business hours (evenings, weekends, and holidays).**
- 4) With the many staffing shortages Fire Prevention Bureau has experienced over the last three (3) years, there is an abundance of work that needs to be completed (i.e. weed abatement, etc.).**

The Fire Inspectors (Fire Fighter III, Fire Fighter IV, and Fire Captain) are expected to be available on a 24/7 basis if an Incident Commander requests their assist with an in-depth fire investigation. As mentioned above, Fire Inspectors are requested to report to a scene when there is significant injuries or fatalities, high-dollar value (>\$10,000.00), or suspected as an intentionally set fire.

22. What are the miscellaneous other costs for the fire fighter safety guide? FY-19 had a total of 65.5% increase from FY-18 that has continued into FY-20.

Every year the Fire Prevention Bureau provides approximately 15,000 Fire Fighter Safety Guides to the 33 elementary schools on Maui, Molokai and Lanai.

In this and previous fiscal years the Department has budgeted \$11,000.00 for the Fire Fighter Safety Guide program. The Department has been fortunate enough to be awarded a grant by Alexander & Baldwin consistently for the past 10 years to alleviate costs. With this grant, the Department has spent approximately \$4,000.00 annually on the Fire Fighter Safety Guide program.

The Department has submitted the \$11,000.00 request in the event that we are not awarded the grant by Alexander & Baldwin. The grant covers the cost of an awards luncheon and shirts for the winners of the Fire Fighter Safety Guide.

23. What will be done with five rescue boards that are being replaced?

The five (5) rescue boards that are being replaced will be utilized for Department recruit and incumbent trainings including annual USLA required training. These rescue boards can be used with the Junior Lifeguard Program offered by the Ocean Safety Bureau.

In the event a first line rescue board is damaged, these rescue boards may be used as temporary replacements.

24. Please explain why timely employee appraisals/evaluations are not included as a key goal in the Department.

The Department has worked with the Department of Personnel Services since 2012 to utilize the Performance Evaluation Process to appraise and evaluate our personnel. Our current process requires an annual evaluation of our employees on an annual basis at a minimum. We also require an evaluation of our employees prior to them passing probationary status.

As the Department of Fire & Public Safety Administration, we will continuously evaluate our department and overall goals as an agency. We will continue our efforts to utilize the performance evaluation process to appraise and evaluate our personnel on an annual and probationary basis at minimum. As we feel that we should be striving for 100% compliance in this regard to ensure that our personnel are provided a continuous evaluation of their performance, we will look to include a metric to track this goal in the upcoming fiscal years.

If you have any questions regarding this information, please contact the Fire Chief's Office at ext. 7561 or Fire Chief Thyne at ext. 7562.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'D. C. Thyne', with a large, stylized flourish extending to the right.

DAVID C. THYNE
Fire Chief