

**EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS
COMMITTEE**
Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

May 11, 2023

Online Only via BlueJeans

CONVENE: 9:05 a.m.

PRESENT: VOTING MEMBERS:

Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Chair
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member

NON-VOTING MEMBERS:

Councilmember Gabe Johnson (In 10:54 a.m.)

STAFF:

Lesley Milner, Senior Committee Analyst
Ellen McKinley, Legislative Analyst
Richelle Kawasaki, Legislative Attorney
Maria Leon, Committee Secretary
Lei Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk
Shelly Espeleta, Supervising Legislative Analyst

Noelani Ahia, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez
Sarah Sexton, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez
Jared Agtunong, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Cook
Davideane Kama-Sickels, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kama
Curt Takamiya, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Lee
Michele McLean, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Lee
Dawn Lono, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Sinenci
Gina Young, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Sinenci
Axel Beers, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Johnson

Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Moloka'i Residency Area Office
Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lāna'i Residency Area Office
Mavis Oliveira, Council Aide, East Maui Residency Area Office
Jade Rojas-Letisi, Council Aide, Makawao-Ha'ikū-Pā'ia Residency Area Office

ADMIN.:

Cynthia Razo-Porter, Deputy Director, Department of Personnel Services
Christie Trenholme, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation
Counsel

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

OTHERS: Faith Chase
Jasee Law

(6) additional attendees

PRESS: *Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .(*gavel*). . . Aloha kakahiaka kākou. ‘Elima minuke i ka hala o ka hola ‘eiwa. ‘O ‘umi kūmākahi o Malaki [*sic*] i ka makahiki ‘elua kaukani iwakālūkūmākolu. E ‘olu‘olu mai, e ho‘omalū ke Kōmike Efficiency Solutions and Economic Systems [*sic*], ESCS. ‘O wau ‘o Keani Rawlins-Fernandez, ka luna ho‘omalū o kēia Kōmike. Aia au ma‘ane‘i i ka Molokai District Office. Ke no ho‘okahi nei ma‘ane‘i. It was 9:05, and it’s now 9:06 on May 11th, 2023. Will the Efficiency Solutions and Economic Systems [*sic*] Committee please come to order. I’m your Chair, Keani Rawlins-Fernandez. I am here at the Molokai District Office alone. I kēia lā, me ko kākou eia hope luna ho‘omalū o Tamara Paltin. Aloha kakahiaka.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha kakahiaka kākou. Broadcasting live and direct from Historic Lāhainā Town. I have with me Angela Lucero and Christian Balagso, and we have no testifiers waiting to testify at this time. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. And we also have no testifiers here at the Moloka‘i District Office. Mahalo for that reminder. Next, we have Committee Member Tom Cook. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aloha and good morning, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Next we have Committee Member Tasha Kama. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aloha kakahiaka, Chair. And throughout today's meeting I will try to fix my camera, and hopefully it doesn't distract you and make you laugh. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We have no objections to laughing here. We welcome all the laughs in this Committee, and I'm so happy the camera is working and we can see your bright and smiley face. Next, aloha, Councilmember Alice Lee...Committee Member Alice Lee. I don't see your camera on yet, but I think you just arrived.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I'm...that's why. Very good. Thank you and good morning. Looking forward to your meeting.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Next we have Committee Member Shane Sinenci. Aloha.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha kakahiaka kākou, mai Maui Hikina. Eia au ma‘ane‘i, ka hale, ma hale nui uakea. I'm here with kākō‘o Iwalani Medeiros and Alaula Lono. There are no testifiers.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha no. And finally we have Committee Member Yuki Lei Sugimura, aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good morning, everybody. And looking forward to an interesting meeting. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then we have two Non-Voting Committee Members, Councilmember Gabe Johnson and Councilmember Nohelani U‘u-Hodgins. Both are always welcome to join us if they would like. And mai ka Administration, from Department of Personnel Services we have Deputy Director Cynthia Razo-Porter, aloha.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Aloha, and good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. And I'll invite Deputy Director to turn on her video after testimony. Aloha. And then from our Committee we have our Committee Secretary Maria Leon; Senior Committee Analyst Lesley Milner; Legislative Analyst Ellen McKinley; Legislative Attorney Richelle Kawasaki; and Assistant Clerk Jean Pokipala. Aloha no. We have one item on...all right. We have one item on today's agenda...sorry. ESCS-1(2), Operational and Budgetary Review of the Department of Personnel Services. And my apologies, I forgot that we would do our presentation first, and then testimony. So, my bad. In accordance with Sunshine Law, testimony can occur at the beginning of the meeting, but not...cannot be limited to the start of the meeting. As we have only one item on today's agenda, we will only be taking testimony after the presentation. Okay.

**ITEM 1(2): OPERATIONAL AND BUDGETARY REVIEW OF THE
DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL SERVICES (Rule 7(B))**

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We will now proceed with our first and only agenda item. Under Rule 7(B) of the Rules of the Council, the Committee intends to receive a presentation relating to the Department of Personnel Services' operations, processes, and procedures, including how the Department describes and classifies new positions, and the process for recruiting and filling new and existing positions. The Committee may also discuss other related matters. No legislative action will be taken. The Chair doesn't intend to take the entire three hours today, but we'll see where our discussion takes us. As Members know, the intention of taking up the Department of Personnel Services is because we would like to work together with the Department to identify ways that we can help improve the Department so that we can help all the other Departments carry out the kuleana necessary. So, whatever it is that we can do to kōkua, that's what we're here for. If there are no objections, I would like to designate Cynthia Razo-Porter, Deputy Director, Department of Personnel Services, as a resource person in accordance with Rule 18(A) of the Rules of the Council. Are there any objections?

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. Okay. So, I'll now invite Deputy Director Cynthia Razo-Porter to turn on her video and proceed with her presentation. Aloha.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for being with us today.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Thank you. Good morning, Committee Chair and Members. I'm happy to be here today, and hopefully give you some insight into how we operate in our Department. So, I'm going to share my screen. One moment. Can you see my screen?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We can see the top of the PowerPoint file.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I don't see the...I just tried this a minute ago. Hold on.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. No pressure.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I can't really see what you're seeing. Okay. That's not it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair, I...I have the PowerPoint up in my screen, and her page 1 is Department of Personnel Services Operational and Budgetary Review. So, I'm not sure what...I think she's trying to get to that place.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . that way. Yeah.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I just tried it a minute ago. Let me see...if I do this, if it goes away. I feel like it's showing the wrong screen. Share screen 2. There you go. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Perfect.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay. There we go. Good morning, Committee and...Committee Chair and Members. My name is Cynthia Razo-Porter, Department of Personnel Services, Deputy Director. And our first screen is...all right. So, today I'm going to...this morning I'll give you an overview of the HR Department and our functions. Primarily we do classification and pay. So, we establish a Countywide position classification system based on job analysis for all civil service positions. We conduct recruitment and exams for civil service positions for the County of Maui. We manage transactions, so we approve Department's transactions. This affects pay, this affects, you know, processing numerous records for each individual employee's employment history. This includes promotions, demotions, transfers, et cetera. We also represent the County of Maui and Labor Relations. We provide Administration for eight collective bargaining agreements.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

We represent the Mayor at collective bargaining with the other jurisdictions across the State for our collective bargaining agreements. We also have a training program that we assist to train County employees. We work with Departments on planning and developing for professional growth. In a nutshell, that's our focus areas. Our responsibilities is to classify civil service positions for all County departments, advise and assist departments on reorganizations, restructuring of jobs, and creating new classes. We assign pricing for newly established classes. We participate in Statewide meetings on statutory equal pay pricing requirements. And we develop salary and benefit adjustment recommendations for excluded managerial employees. So, basically that just means that every County employee that's covered by collective bargaining, the same benefits are shared with the excluded employees. And departments are responsible for--sorry for all this transitioning slides--departments are responsible for assigning duties and responsibilities to their positions in their department, to review each position description annually, update position descriptions when significant changes in duties and responsibilities occur, and to submit their request to reallocate or update position descriptions to our Department for our review. Kind of going back to what we do for classification. Their request to redescribe positions are routed for approval through the Department Head, the Budget Director, Managing Director, and then it's provided to us for classification audit. (Clears throat) Excuse me. There's a couple...well, there's a whole chapter in 76 on Civil Service Law. I highlight a couple provisions from the law that we use, you know, as guiding principles when we're establishing classification or...yeah, new classes. So 76-1(5) says that: "Equal pay for equal work shall apply between classes in the same bargaining unit among jurisdictions for those classes determined to be equal through systematic classification of positions based on objective criteria and adequate job evaluation." So that in a nutshell, when we're establishing new classes, we work with other jurisdictions to identify if they have similar classes, you know, what their classes...what kind of work their classes perform, and so, there's a process that we go through when we intend to adopt a class for our compensation plan. And 76-13 talks about classification. So, each Director is responsible for establishing, implementing, and maintaining one or more classification systems covering all civil service positions. And again, it refers back to equal work for equal pay. So, what is position classification? Classification is essentially systematic placement of duties and responsibilities into categories and groups based on shared qualities or characteristics. Essentially, you know, if it's a clerical type position we, you know, find the complexity. You know, who does it report to? What does it do? The level of duties that it performs, and we assign it to a class. If there is no class that's appropriate, we'll assign it...you know, we'll create a new class. So, it takes, you know, some research when we're doing this. How are positions classified? They are assigned to classes based on their current duties and responsibilities, their required knowledge, skills, and abilities, and other pertinent factors. And the purpose of the classification system allows the placement of a large number and multiple types of jobs into a unified logical and orderly plan. It provides the foundation for actions and other areas, such as compensation, recruitment, and examinations. We use this, you know, to establish the minimum qualification requirements. What type of knowledge does this position need? Training, you know, it helps kind of create the training around these positions. Assist with organizational planning and budgeting. Each position, each class of work is assigned a price and, you know, what that salary is going to be. So, this kind of runs

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

through the...you know, what we look at. So, the nature and complexity and variety of work. The knowledge skills and abilities. The supervisory controls. So, who does it report to? What type of supervision? The nature of available guidelines for the performance of work...you know, is this routine work? Is this, you know, independent, you know, every solution is different. Originality required in performing the duties. Nature and purpose of person to person contact, so who does this person work--or this position, I'm sorry--who does this position, you know, work with? What kind of contacts? Nature and scope of recommendations. The decisions this position can make, commitments, and conclusions. The nature and extent of supervisory control over the work of others. Is it supervisory, is it not? Like where in the level of the organization does this position operate? Physical demands of the position, and the type of work environment. So, we look at all these nine factors, you know, when we're evaluating the position. And the steps in classifying. So, when a position description shows up in our office, you know, we review it, we gather preliminary facts, you know, what kind of job is this? What, you know, program, what occupation...is it, you know, a blue-collar job? Is it a professional? Is it a clerical? Is it in the legal field? You know, there's a number of kind of research that we do. We conduct a job audit that may require us--you know, meeting with the supervisor; if there's an incumbent, we meet with the incumbent; you know, get...just kind of gathering more information. We research and evaluate the information that Departments provide for us. And we analyze and classify based on the information that we were provided, and prepare a classification report. Kind of the steps just to take a...make a...make a side note right here. So, some of these steps, you know, if it's a...a pool guard trainee, you know, a routine reallocation to a pool guard, we wouldn't necessarily have to go through all of those steps because, you know, it's an established position. It's expected that once they meet their, you know, time in the position, they've acquired their certifications, you know, that is a routine reallocation. So, some of these things wouldn't actually...we don't go through it every single time, but we do look at every position and, you know, just make that determination. This would be more for something that's unique and different that maybe we haven't, you know, seen prior. Should I just continue, so...or should we go with questions? I'm kind of leaving the...just continue. Okay. Okay. So, that kind of wraps up our steps in classification. So, I've also prepared a few slides to talk about recruiting and filling positions. So, just kind of following along the journey. So, now the position is established. We have, you know, the class created. Now we're looking at recruiting to fill this position. And so, the purpose of...so 76-1, you know, Civil Service Law, is all about the merit principle. So, the purpose of this chapter is required...requires each jurisdiction to establish and maintain a separately administered civil service system based on the merit principle. Basically it's the selection of persons based on their fitness and ability for public employment, and the retention of employees based on their demonstrated appropriate conduct. So, this kind of is the...the building block of our civil service, and we facilitate recruitments with that in mind. So, the first thing, a Department will establish a position, they get to decide how they want to fill this vacant position. There's a few ways that they can utilize to fill the position. Oftentimes, Departments can choose to reallocate their own employees, promote their own employees, to fill these vacant positions. You know, if they have qualified members in their...in their work group, they can choose to do a noncompetitive promotion, and that's referred to as a promotion without exam. So, that's done internally. They, you know,

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

create a posting saying, hey, we have this, you know, Equipment Operator III vacancy available, you know, interested parties can apply. That's typically what happens, you know, a...a good portion of the time. Maybe 50...50, 60 percent of the time, they're filled noncompetitively. Employees get promoted into these positions, and we fill kind of at the bottom level, you know, because there's going to be a vacancy eventually. And that's pretty much a common way of filling it. Other times, Departments may choose to just do an interdepartmental, so it's open, again, to County employees, but extended to employees in other departments. That's referred to as an interdepartmental recruitment. We will conduct those recruitments, and again, they apply through the system, which is called governmentjobs.com or NEOGOV. They could also do an intradepartmental recruitment, or open competitive is pretty much anyone in...you know, who is qualified to work in the United States will be able to apply for these jobs via an open competitive. Departments may choose, you know, any one of these options. It could also be via transfer, so from one jurisdiction, you know, entering the County as long as they meet the qualifications for the position, and it doesn't result in a promotion. It has to be a lateral or a demotion. And those are all kind of built into the rules. So, there's a few ways. Open competitive is kind of what you see on our...on our website as all...all of those jobs. Unless they're saying interdepartment, it's pretty much an open competitive recruitment. So, basically the recruitment process is the departments decide how they want to fill it. We'll go ahead and post the announcement in *The Maui News*. We post it on governmentjobs.com. We could do radio ads. We've been kind of going...doing that recently within the last six months. You know, we post it on social media. We post it, you know, word of mouth in the...in the elevators. We take it to the college. You know, we attend job fairs and those sort of things. So, once the recruitment notices are posted, you know, essentially the recruitment begins. Applicants apply via, you know, NEOGOV, or governmentjobs.com. DPS staff, you know, as applications come in, as candidates are applying, our Staff are screening for qualifications. So, each class, you know, each recruitment that we're doing has a set of minimum qualification requirements. Oftentimes, you know, we'll have to get back to the candidates, you know, if...if they're closed or, you know, maybe some information is lacking or missing. If it requires a degree we'll, you know, follow up with them if they didn't, you know, provide us a copy of their transcripts or their degree, you know, just to confirm that they have those...that they meet those requirements. So, there's a few ways of, you know, evaluating past the qualifications. We'll...you know, if you meet MQs, we may have an online assessment that we have you perform, so a candidate will perform. It could be a training and experience evaluation that we do. So, based on the information that you provide, we actually give you a score...you know, we evaluate your education, we evaluate your experience and give you a score that we can use to rank these candidates. It may also include a performance test. So, pool guards, ocean safety officers, fire...firefighters, police officers, they actually have a physical agility test that they perform that they have to pass, you know, there's some structure around that...some requirement. So, whatever the...the type of exam, exams are conducted and scored, applicants are notified of their results, the eligible list is established for the class, and departments that submit requisitions to fill these vacancies, we're...provide them a list so that they begin interviewing and do...you know, go through their selection process. That's pretty much...and then, you know, the baton passes from us to departments to do their selection. And that's kind of the rundown of my presentation. Does anyone

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

have questions?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Deputy Director. You can stop the screen share.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Would it be possible to send Staff the presentation?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Absolutely.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, Members, if there aren't any objections before I take testimony, I would like to call a brief recess while Deputy Director sends Staff the presentation, and then Staff can send everyone the presentation so everyone has the presentation before I open the floor for questions. Are there any objections or questions for...for me?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, beautiful. I'm going to give Staff until 9:45. Staff, is that an adequate amount of time?

MS. MILNER: Yes, Chair. That should be fine.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right, Members, we will recess now until 9:45. The ESCS Committee is now in recess. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 9:32 a.m.

RECONVENE: 9:45 a.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .(gavel). . . Will the ESCS Committee please return to order. It's 9:45 on May 11th, and everyone should have received DPS' presentation. Please let me know if you did not receive it. I believe it...yeah. So, it's on Granicus. It's Granicus item 4, and you should have also received it in your email. And I also put it in the chat. Okay. Okay, Members, I'll now proceed with oral testimony. Oral testimony via phone or video conference will be accepted. Please note that if you are signed in, you are on the list to testify, even if you did not request to testify. Please let Staff know in chat if you are signed on and do not intend to testify. Testifiers wanting to provide video or audio testimony should have joined the online meeting via the BlueJeans meeting link or phone number noted on today's agenda. Written testimony is highly encouraged, and can be submitted via eComment link at mauicounty.us/agendas. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes per item. If you're still testifying beyond that time, I'll kindly ask you to complete your testimony. We ask that you state your full name and organization, but if you prefer to testify anonymously, Staff will identify and refer to you as "Testifier" and assign you a number. You may indicate in the chat if you do not wish to testify; however, chat should not be used for discussion or comments. Please be

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

courteous to others by turning off your video and muting your microphone while waiting your turn to testify. Once you're done testifying and do not...or if you do not wish to testify, you can view the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, or mauicounty.us/agendas. Mahalo for your cooperation. The Chair will maintain decorum at all times. And I think I said all of that. All right. We have four individuals on the testifier's log. And I have three minutes on the clock. And just so everyone knows, it'll sound like that. Let me set up my ringer. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . Okay. Our first testifier is Faith Chase, followed by Guest 4387.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

MS. CHASE: Good morning, Chair Rawlins-Fernandez. Good morning, Committee. I just have two interesting points about this presentation...questions, I guess, if someone could ask. The first one is, when you create new positions, I'm interested in the process or the brainstorming that goes into crafting the job descriptions. When Councilmember Kama created the DHHL liaison position, I know we were changing the guard as far as Mayorship, and Managing Directors, and all that kind of stuff. But I had...I had just prematurely sort of made some suggestions, and I didn't really know where to direct them to. Now, I certainly would do it to this...this Department. But I'm curious in that...in that process. And then also, number two, I'm wondering about any kind of policy that is...comes from the Department...comes from this Department to share with the other departments in regards to...because I...I heard the part about, you know, then you hand off to the Department for them to do their hiring. But I've actually received some replies where it indicates oh, thank you for your interest. We will keep your resume on hand should the position change and, you know, we'll call you or something. And I think that's...I think that's a little...I don't think that they're following that policy, and I would just wonder if there is any internal policy that they can lend some tutelage in being careful with that kind of language. Because they're...I don't think any of the departments have been sophisticated enough to go back through their files, find out who is interested in the job, especially with employee turnover. So, that's my nerdy comments. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Chase. Members, any questions for our testifier? Seeing none. We'll thank you for your testimony, and we'll get those questions asked. Our next testifier is the caller with the last four digits 2051, followed by Jasee Law. Okay. We'll go to Jasee Law, and then check in with our caller.

MR. LAW: Hello, everybody way out there in TV land, and thank you all, Councilmembers.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MR. LAW: See, I don't have a green light like you guys do. Aloha kakahiaka, Jasee Law from Kula Uka. I don't...so, I'm glad that they put the testimony after this time because I really got to know what all's...like what the meeting was going to be about and what...like what the relevance of me having any comments, other than the...that I need a job. But it...so, I thought of the word testimony, that kind of reminded me of church or

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

something. But I think if...if we just call it a public comment, that would be more efficient. And thank you, Chair Rawlins-Fernandez, since you...it was very nice that she started the meeting in 'Ōlelo. It was music to my ears. But you forgot the theme...the theme song at the beginning of it...the start of the meeting. I have this idea that 'Ōlelo will be the...will heal the hurts that settler colonialism have caused in this lāhui. And I have another idea that goes along with the theme music that there can be...there...there should be closed captioning in 'Ōlelo for the people out there, the...the Hawaiian people that don't speak English. So, about the agenda. Thank you, Deputy Director...I...I didn't get your name...but thank you, that was a very good presentation. And I'm trying to find work, like I said. I'm...I'm not trying to get a job, I'm trying to find work. So, there's a difference there, and I could explain it to you guys after. But, when you say there is a position, I don't...I don't really think that I could--in my particular situation, I probably couldn't--well, wouldn't be able to be a County employee unless I was elected, like you guys. However, if I could get my County business license, I might be able to get under contract or qualify for a grant funding. So, I've got another idea. I don't know if I could float it out there, might...might be more work for you guys. But, I've had some luck with the temporary agencies here in...in the Valley side, and I'm wondering if the County has ever tried to hire through the...the temp agencies for maybe like smaller projects for a couple days' work. That's it. No questions?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Law. Any questions? I have a question.

MR. LAW: All right. Go ahead.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Clarifying question. What's the theme music? What's my theme music?

MR. LAW: Something Hawaiian.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MR. LAW: I know you probably . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I thought maybe...mahalo, Mr. Law. Okay. I will...okay. Let's see. I will invite everyone signed on to testify. This is the last call for testimony. Okay. Hearing no one speaking up, we'll close public testimony and receive written...any written testimony into the record. I didn't see any, but just in case. Any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

. . . END PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. Okay. All right. We'll now invite Deputy Director Razo-Porter to turn her video back on, and we'll open the floor to questions. Let's see. I'll...I'll put...I'll put four minutes on the...on the timer for everyone. Mahalo, Deputy Director Razo-Porter, for the presentation, and for getting it to us so quickly.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: You're welcome.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I...I'm going to try to share my screen. Wait. So, I...I was hoping to kind of get a better idea on timeline so that we have...the Council has an understanding of...of how long certain steps take. Okay. All right. I know that's small. And then I...I think some of the Members might be wondering the same thing. So, I figured I'd take the four minutes first, and then we can kind of like think about this. So, I...I didn't get to pull it directly from the presentation yet, I just kind of went off of memory. So, first is the classification of the position. If it's an established position, Deputy Director, how...so, when we're in budget and we say that we want another...an additional OSO, so Ocean Safety Officer I. And that position already has a description, it would do the exact same thing as other OSO Is. How long does it take for...when we add that...when we fund that position in budget session, the new fiscal year starts July 1st, how long does it take for that position to be recognized--or I don't know what the correct term is?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay. So, when a position is funded in the budget or, you know, an expansion position, a new position, the Department has to craft the PD. So, like you said it's an Ocean Safety Officer I, it's already, you know, an established...you know, we have PDs for those positions. We have the class. They have to, you know, describe it, so they have to tell us this is the position that we want to create. It goes through their department. It goes through budget, you know, it has some approval steps, and then it shows up at our door. For those positions that are...you know, we've...we've created them before, we...we have the class. It's probably like two weeks, I would say. I would give ourselves, you know, at least two weeks to...you know, the specialist to be assigned to it, for them to look at it. Does it look like all the rest? We assign it a position number, you know, we put a...put it in Workday, you know, in the structure that it belongs. So, is this West, East, you know, there...there takes a little bit of time to do that. But I would say within two weeks, that position is established. So, they receive a notice of Director's actions saying hey, this is the request that we received, you know, here's your position number, et cetera. And...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great. And so, then when it's a new position that needs to be described, such as a Land Manager...so, it starts with the Department Head to describe that position, and then that description is...do they work directly with DPS to figure out how to appropriately describe that position?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: That would be...so, a lot of times I think it's, you know, figuring out what it is that they want that position to do. In the perfect world, they would, you know, meet with the specialist assigned to that Department and just say, you know, this is what we're thinking. This is what...you know, where in the organization it...it should be. If it's creating, you know, a separate, you know, branch, division . . .(timer sounds). . . affecting the...you know, the...the lines of supervision, then it requires a reorg...a reorganization. So, now they're introducing a new, you know, position in an already established organization, you know, space. And from there it...you know, they have to come up with, you know, their justification, you know, the reason, it's a new branch,

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

it's whatever, you know, kind of justify and create some background around it, and then that function is with the Department of Management. So, they, you know, have their own kind of people looking at it, you know, asking the Department questions, like who did this work, you know, who's...you know, why, and kind of going through that, you know, is it...is it duplicate work, you know, there's questions that come of it. And then once--and then, you know, if it involves the union, you know, they may have to consult, you know, with the union and, you know, share...this is our proposal, this is, you know, the...the structure that it...you know, the...the current structure of the organization. This is where we intend to put this position. This may impact, you know, some other, you know, positions. And they have that consultation, answer any questions that the union may have. And then once that's all kind of wrapped up, and then it goes up in our office. Again, you know, following that redescription or expansion position process.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Deputy Director. Okay. And then we'll go to Committee Vice-Chair Paltin, followed by Member Cook.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. So, much questions, so little time. I guess I can follow up with the Land Manager. What I heard from the Department of Management is that Public Works already has a Land Manager position, and that's why management has been holding it up. But the Public Works Land Manager doesn't manage all the lands in all the whole County, only the ones that have been designated to Public Works. So, if Finance wanted a Land Manager, they would have to somehow compel Public Works to redetermine their Land Manager position so it's more accurate, that they only manage the lands within Public Works' authority, and then let the Land Manager that Finance wants be a Land Manager for the entire County. Is that what...is that an accurate understanding of what needs to go down?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Deputy Director.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, thank you, Councilmember Paltin, for that question. You know, honestly, I'm not real akamai with that Land Administrator, Land Manager position, so that may be...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Moving on.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: ...consultations that, you know, have occurred with Management...you know, it hasn't gotten to us yet.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. Limited time, so we can move on.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay. Okay.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: The next question I had was, you know, if there's any discretionary authority within the civil service or Personnel to describe what category or classification people fall in for our lowest-paid employees like, you know, SR-09 through -17, I guess, you know, that we're barely paying a living wage for. Is there any discretion like...you know, sometimes maybe the work...like I don't know how to say this nicely, but you

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

know, if...if a fourth grader could do the work or, you know, just...is there discretion to say like, well, given our cost of living, not just anyone off the street can do this work, you got to pay a living wage. Because if you're not going to pay a living wage, then why would anyone do the work, you know what I'm saying?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, because...I...I understand your question, I appreciate the question. So, because, you know, we have the equal work for equal pay among jurisdictions, this is kind of not just our, you know, decision to...to, you know, price people or price positions higher. So, it's, you know...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Any discretion whatsoever? No discretion? Zero?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Well, so...yeah. So, when it comes to like affecting pricing of a class, you know, we have to go to the other jurisdictions. I certainly feel...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Affecting rating of a person...discretion, no?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It's...no. So, classification--you know, a clerk is paid, you know, at the SR-10. But I feel like we're in a space right now that...I mean maybe, you know, we need to have a discussion with all the other jurisdictions that, you know, kind of...like what can we do? We're not the only one that's experiencing, you know, the challenges that we're experiencing today with, you know, trying to fill some of these positions, and bring people in. There are recruitment incentives that Departments can offer. We've been working with a couple departments, you know, and it's for those difficult to fill classes. Civil engineers, we have Planners, they have some...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. So, basically no discretion. Okay. All right. . . .*(timer sounds)*. . .

MS. RAZO-PORTER: There are some tools in the tool box, but it's...you know, it's a very small tool box.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: I'll come around next round.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Next, Member Cook, followed by Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Deputy Director. I'd like to...thank you for your presentation, and I thank the Chair for this informational meeting. This is very...especially after budget, it's very welcome and timely. What measurements...how...how do you measure the performance of exist...of employees and their...and their duties and responsibilities? Does any public input come to your office at all?

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, thank you for the question. So, Departments have responsibility...they have authority over their employees. So, they would be involved in, you know, public comment or, you know, compliments or...or what have you. So, I would imagine that they receive, you know, that type of information. Departments are charged with evaluating their employees annually. So, I...I would imagine, yeah, that they're, you know, utilizing their position descriptions and measuring success.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you for that. So, basically the...okay. Thanks. How...how does it work for DPS Staff to assess professional positions that are maybe outside of DPS Staff experience? Like is there a group that assesses for like an Engineer, or a Planner, a cultural practitioner? Like there's such a broad skill range, and --

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- and...and educational experience requirements. How is that handled by your Department?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, thank you for the question. So, when we are screening candidates, oftentimes, you know, the Department that's...you know, that's recruiting to fill that position, we'll work with their subject matter expert. So, we rely on Departments to...you know, kind of what do you think about this, without disclosing who the candidate is, just kind of in general. It's like we're looking at, you know, Candidate, you know, A and, you know, this is...you know, what do you think? So, there's some interaction. I mean obviously, if it's, you know, like easy clerical type duties, you know, we can assess that. But when we start getting into those, you know, higher level positions we, you know, rely heavily on, you know, how...how would you look at this?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Thank you. And then as far as training goes, is the training principally up to the Departments as well? I mean, that's in their...their arena as far as management to update...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: We do offer trainings for, you know, the general population. But, you know, if it's specific to, you know, Water Supply, or specific to, you know, that group of employees...you know, certainly, I don't know what kind of skills, you know, they would need to progress in their careers. So, you know...and, you know, they talk to us if they're looking for something specific, you know, and see if, you know, what we can do to, you know, add some resources to them, you know, it's...it's very...you know, it just depends. You know, we do reasonable suspicion training for drug testing, I mean, you know, we have like the general type of training, but not, you know, for every specific group.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Thank you very much, Chair. That's my questions for now to this round. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Cook. Member Kama, followed by Member Lee.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for being here Ms. Razo-Porter. So, I just wanted to get back to the...to the question that one of the testifiers had asked about the Department of Hawaiian Home Lands Liaison. And originally, it started...we put it, I think, in the Management Office, and then...then my understanding was that because of the bifurcation taking place, it's going to end up there under Housing. So, as you were working on the...the position, I think what Ms. Chase wanted to know is, what was that process...what is that process? And...and I just wanted to know, so, where are we at on this?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, I'd have to double check to be sure, but I'm not aware that we even received the position description. So, we don't describe positions. We receive the positions descriptions from Departments, and then we start, you know, kind of looking at what...what do we have in the other jurisdictions. I mean I...just from the title that you're sharing with me, I'm going to say that we don't have that existing class currently. So, we haven't even started that process yet.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. So, in getting back to Ms. Chase's question in terms of the process, so although it started in the...in the Management's Office, they may have...and they haven't sent it over...and they haven't sent that position on to you all. So, it's possible it still could be there, or it's possible that they could be waiting for the bifurcation to occur and have that Department develop that; is that correct?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Possibly. I...I wouldn't have that knowledge.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. So...okay. I just want to go on to the next question. When you hand...when...when you are recruiting, and you do all of that, and you come up with a list of eligible names to give to the departments who are seeking employees, do you submit just their names, or do you submit their scores along with it?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: No scores. We give them a list of names with their, you know, application or their resumes, their...their information. So, no, we don't share scores with the Department. We do...you know, if there's, you know, candidate...I don't know, 20 candidates on the list, we'll give the Departments the top five, up to ten, they have to request, you know, for ten names. And if we have it, we'll give them at least that many if it's an open recruitment. But we don't share scores, so they wouldn't know. It's sent to them alphabetically, they wouldn't know who's, you know, scored 100 and who didn't.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. So, your scoring...so the scoring begins at 100, and then it...and so, what is your cut off in terms of the eligibility. I mean, you know, what do you have to score to be able to get your name on the eligibility list?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, we have a training and experience evaluation that...so, if you meet MQs, you're at 70, is...you know, is kind of...at least 70, right.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Minimum...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: If you meet the minimum. So, whatever, you know, test we administer,

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

or performance test, you know, it's...it's...you're...you're expected to be at 70 when you meet MQs, and then your score is kind of based on that...how well you do, given the evaluation.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. And then...so, you have to...so, you have to at least begin with the MQs, and you work your way up?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. Okay. So, my...my next question is, when you are creating new positions, and you have...how do you...how do you determine where these . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . positions...okay. I'm coming around back again. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Okay. We'll go to Member Lee, followed by Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Member...Member *[sic]* Razo-Porter, can the Council increase salaries and/or hourly pay for civil service employees above levels established in collective bargaining agreements?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, thank you for the question. So, because...you know, I go back to the unions. All of our...our pay is tied to negotiations. So, we don't really have that...I mean we...we don't...we don't have that luxury of just, you know, increasing our salary schedules because this is all negotiated with the union.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Is the answer no to you?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Because this issue came up. As you know, I was on the Civil Service Commission, and during that time, there was a lot of controversy over this particular topic. And there was...there didn't seem to be a definitive answer. In other words, yes, collective bargaining agreements establish pay levels. But according to, I believe, Corp. Counsel at that time, that did not prohibit the County Council from increasing salary or hourly pay levels. So, are you...you disagree with that then?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: If you're just saying...so, you know, how that looks like, is it wages? Is it, you know, yeah...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Wages and salaries.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So I'm going to disagree because --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- you know, the salaries are established in consultation and negotiation and agreement with --

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- not just, you know, us, the jurisdiction and the union, but all the other jurisdictions. So, there may be a way, it's just not creating a new salary schedule.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. I think...I think there is a way, but I don't think there is a will by the Management. Okay. So, the other thing is your workers, specialists, their classification are...is EMs, right, Excluded Management.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, we have it...our series...so we have an HR, so Human Resource Specialist series. So, we...our trainees as SR-16, and it goes from I to V. So...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: EM-1...EM-1 to -5?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: No, I'm sorry. The specialist classes are HR Specialist Trainee, and it goes SR-16, and then SR-18 is a I...so, a Specialist I.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. If I recall during my term, that there were several EMs.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: EM-3s, et cetera. And so the EMs...I guess my point, EM's are non-union members.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, everyone in our office is excluded from collective bargaining. So, we're not part of the union.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, the...the structure that you have is something established by you for you only?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Well, it's with all the other jurisdictions. So, we still follow the same classification, you know, again, equal work for equal pay. So, our...our series is HR Specialist I, II, III, IV, and V, and it's 16, SR-18, SR-20, SR-22, and EM-1 and EM-3. Sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. How many EMs do you have in your Department?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I have two.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Two EMs.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I'm sorry, three. We just...we have three EMs.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Three...three of how many? . . .(timer sounds). . .

MS. RAZO-PORTER: We have EM Specialist...what is her title...HR-IV...HR Specialist IV, and

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

two HR Specialist Vs.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, three of six. Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. Nice seeing you, Deputy Director. Thank you for your presentation. And I can...I can see where the complexities are, as we have heard all through Budget from the departments about unfilled positions. And not only do they have to go through this process, but it's finding the people, I think, is a challenge in this kind of work environment, or where our economy is, and what has happened during COVID. But I wanted to focus on what you said regarding the kind of positions like the Engineers. We always heard through all the departments, it's really hard to find, and other challenges...but the Engineers, and then also the 911 Dispatchers, which has been a particular focus for myself. And could...on...on either one, can you tell me what we need to do on a bigger scale? Because I think...well, during Budget, what we did was a short-term fix, I think, where we looked at their retention pay. But I think on the long-term, that's not the way to do it, and I would like to get your advice on...on the next steps forward.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, talking about the Engineers, I've worked for the County for a few...a couple decades now. And it's been a challenge, you know, just getting the Engineers to come in, you know, I guess with the pay. I mean...so, one of the tools in the tool box is recruiting above the minimum. So, we do have that ability. Departments, you know, can...but they have to fund it out of their budget. So, recruitment above...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And are we doing that? Sorry.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Are we doing that with the Engineers?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: We are. Okay.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes, yes. We're doing it for a few levels...few, you know, classes of work. Always open to, you know, looking up those requests, you know, for what--we call them RAMs, so, Recruiting Above the Minimum. And so, with the Engineers, you know, is it putting more dollars, you know, on their pay? I mean, again, you know, we're...we're kind of straddled with the equal work for equal pay, so it's not just us deciding hey, we want to pay our Engineers more, it's, you know, just going to all the other jurisdictions and, you know...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, if I could interrupt you.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Go ahead.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Are we looking at it? Are we trying to find a solution, or are we still stuck at a place that we're waiting for the other jurisdictions?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I think we're looking at solutions. We have a meeting coming up with all the other HR Directors and, you know, this is one of the issues that's kind of front of mind. You know, we haven't had our meeting yet, so just kind of talking about it and brainstorming what can we do, you know, how can we move this. So, that's coming up.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And then, I guess, in the Dispatcher situation, we did a short-term fix, I think, but I think there's some long-term actions that are needed from the Department; is that correct? I think...I...I did have a communication with Chief, and he was going to put a working group together to look at how to solve the larger problems in this.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yeah, I think, you know, that's the...the place to start. I mean, you know, absolutely bringing us into the conversation to see what we can do, you know, with...you know, with all the...you know, everyone in the State that, you know, kind of shares in that type of, you know, work and responsibilities.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. I...I guess . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . I feel that it's kind of like spinning, so I'll wait for my second round. Thanks.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay. Round two. Mahalo, Deputy Director. All right. Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I had a couple of questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I missed you. I'm so sorry, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Well, you the one told me to unmute and cut in?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I did. You were supposed to be after Member Lee. I'm so sorry, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No worries. Just a couple questions for Director Porter. Mahalo. And mahalo, Director, for the presentation. Last term, the...the previous Mayor had included 150 new positions. I was just wanting to...if you could speak to the update, the Department, how many of those 150 positions actually is created by the Department.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I believe when I last counted, and this was maybe a month ago, we had created...132 is the number that comes to mind. There was a few of those that required extensive research and evaluation, sort of what Tamara...Councilmember Tamara Paltin was talking about, about just duplication of duties and, you know, just kind of addressing those issues.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you for that update. And then Director, do you

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

have the Staff capabilities to complete your workload at this time?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, we are working on that. We are at full staff right now. But there are...I think the number that I gave you guys at the last meeting was like at 70...you know, two-thirds of our Staff have two years or less. So, there's still a lot of training, you know, mentoring going on. So, we will be good, you know, given some time and experience. You know, there...there's a lot of training, you know, a lot of, you know, sit-down explanations. You know, we have some, you know, teams that are, you know, kind of helping everybody get up to speed. So, we're working in that direction. You know, as knowledge workers, it takes, you know, a little bit of time and experience to, you know, hit the ground running, I should say. But we're definitely starting to lift the canoe a little bit, if I could say that.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: 'Ae, 'auamo. Mahalo for that.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Thank you for the question.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: And then during our...this past Budget session, we did add a couple positions. We added an Administrative Assistant and a Grant Writer for the Water Authority, East Maui Board. Is...how long does it take to create these positions, since...if there's, I guess, other positions, Assistant positions and Grant Writer. Does it take longer since it's already established positions in other departments?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It should be...as long as it...you know, it fits into the class that we...an established classification, it...it's, you know, pretty...pretty routine reallocation or, you know, creation, actually. And so, you know, once we get the position description, so just, you know, to keep that in mind. But we have to receive the position description in order for us to, you know, start that classification process.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you. Thank you for that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. I'm so sorry about that again. Okay. Okay, round two. And mahalo for...for setting up my...my next set of questions, Member Sinenci. Okay. Okay. So, Deputy Director, you are at full Staff, but the full Staff that you have now versus the full Staff that you had pre-pandemic, there...there's...it's...it's pretty...a substantial difference in experience overall --

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Correct.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- because everyone is kind of new. Do...do you have ideas on how we could like prevent something...because there's a lot of...a number of people who retired during the pandemic from DPS, right?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Correct.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And it...there's that really sharp learning curve. For the Wastewater Office here, there's...I think there's like two or...I think there's two positions,

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

and then, you know, the person that was there was going to retire, and then I created an LTA so that the...you know, because the...the second person in the office, I think, was there for like less than five years. And so, to try to get the person up...another person up to speed before the veteran employee retires, I thought perhaps creating an LTA to have that time to be trained, so that when the veteran employee retires, the learning curve will be less sharp. Do you have any...and I know space is a challenge, but do you have any thoughts on, you know, like doing that kind of...having those kinds of things happen?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, the Budget allows creating an expansion position, you know, creating that temporary position, like that limited-term position, but it's, you know, for 90 days before we anticipate, you know, that position for leaving. You know, as a knowledge worker, like even, you know, working at a treatment plant, there's, you know, a lot more knowledge that has to be transferred within that three months. But, you know, we'll take what we can get, right? So, just speaking, you know, in my office...certainly it's good to have, you know, some senior Staff training the middle...you know, career level Staff who's, you know, constantly creating that opportunity for growth and...and having that. I think now we're up to...thank you, by the way, I saw proposed that...you know, we were given some expansion positions. So, hopefully, you know, we can continue to build that succession plan, you know, so we won't find ourselves in that, you know, the...just during COVID, it...it got pretty rough. People that were...could retire was like, see ya. And I...and I feel like, you know, we can hopefully never have a pandemic again, but, you know, kind of just building in that...that growth model, where we're...always have some senior Staff, middle...you know, middle career people and, you know, junior Staff coming up. I would say for just the County as a whole to continue to, you know, be looking out for, you know, those opportunities to bring in, you know, the trainees and to, you know, make them assistants to...to kind of, you know, have that career ladder opportunity. I think we miss out on opportunities when, you know, people are further along in their career, it's...it's easy because it's, you know, the work is getting done, but just . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . kind of having that, you know, in the back of your mind, hey, you know, we need to create that, the...the steps in the ladder.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Deputy Director. Okay. We'll go to Committee Vice-Chair Paltin, followed by Member Cook.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I was wondering about, you know, when we hire from within the County. You know, I'm all for having people work where they want to work, but I don't know how that solves our problem really. Because we're just taking from one department, and now we're giving it to another department, and we still have a vacancy. So, I mean ultimately, it doesn't really benefit us to do that, and then you got to possibly retrain someone. I mean, unless somebody really wants to leave their situation because of any like kind of personal reasons, or they move, or something like that, why...why would we want to do that?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, the career service...thank you for the question. So, I'm not sure if I'm following your question exactly. But...

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Like when you said you do like I guess interdepartmental transfers, or stuff like if we have an opening for an Administrative Assistant or an Engineer, and we put it out internally, so we could take an Engineer or a CIP Coordinator from Public Works and give them to Transportation, but that doesn't help us, the County, because now Public Works doesn't have a CIP coordinator.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Right. I guess when...you know, I look at it when the intent is to provide County employees with career opportunities to...you know, to grow and not always just be...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Exactly. And so...like, you know, Public Works has this huge long list of CIPs, and Transportation has bus shelters, who wouldn't want to go to Transportation, you know. And ultimately, that's not helping the...the County as a big picture. Now we lost a CIP Coordinator from Public Works, and we got all this pages of projects or...you know. If they move from Housing and Human Concerns in the middle of a housing crisis to Parks and Rec or...you know what I'm saying? How does that help the County?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Right. I guess it...you know, there's a...there's going to be a vacancy somewhere, right, you know, but certainly, we'd want to...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Correct. But if we prioritize putting it on the website to hire from outside, then maybe we can start filling some of the vacancies, you know what I mean, instead of creating pukas in other departments.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Right. Well, so, I see it as, you know, someone is not a CIP Coordinator, someone is not, you know, an Equipment Operator. They may be...you know, have the license, but they are, you know, a tractor mower operator or a laborer. And we have an internal vacancy in Equipment Operator III. You know, we certainly would want to promote this person from within to take that position, and fill that vacancy created at the lower level. I understand, you know, your challenge, and yeah, I...I recognize that. We're not really solving the problem, we're just moving it.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. And then the other thing like for us in the Budget and making decisions, it would help to have accurate info. You know, like so, we get a vacancy list from you that Budget Chair Sugimura had requested, then we get the vacancy information from each department, and they don't really match up. And then we were told oh, that's because some of them are not...you know, not ready to post on the website because they're still being described. Some of them are being posted internally first. Some of them need a reorg. And it would...to me, it would be helpful to know all these things. Like, here's the list of all empty position numbers or position numbers that haven't even been created. These need to be described. . . .(timer sounds). . . These need a reorg. These are being posted internally. These are not on the website because of whatever reason. Because sometimes we need to find money, and we don't want to cut warm bodies, but it's like a...like a guessing game, where the warm bodies are, or what the --

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Right.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: -- stage of the...the hiring is in and all like that. So, then we just start cutting 500,000 from your...your A Account, you know?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It's certainly a moving target, you know, having 600, 500 vacant positions. And, you know, I...I'm only recruiting the positions that Departments are saying hey, you know, we're ready to fill. They submitted a requisition, it was approved by Budget...you know, the Department by Budget. So, you know, yes, when we run that report of vacant positions, that's kind of a raw list. You know, I'm not even sure that all of them have funding or...or, you know, where they're at. So, you know, trying to match it up with, you know, our recruitment is...you know, a lot of them, you know, we have one posting for Police Officer, we have, you know, 50 vacant Police Officer positions. So, you know, they may not all line up, you know, perfectly. So, you know, it...it's a challenge --

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- to try to get that, you know...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Got it. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair Paltin. Member Cook, followed by Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Director Porter, for your information and patience with us. We're...the...the Council is very, very interested in being able to be part of the solution. I mean Budget, we...it was an eye opener for me in my first year. I appreciate what you're doing. And we hear from all the departments, the need. We also hear from the...our...you know, all of the citizens and members of our community. So, for me. my question is so I can get a better understanding of Department of Personnel Services. When I look at, you know, the strategic goals, do all of the Counties' DPS Departments, are they the same? Like Maui County, Kaua'i, Big Island, City and County of Honolulu? Is what you do mirrored in all of the Department...all of the other counties?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: And so, it...it...the pay, and ratings, and...it all circles back to the collective bargaining and the unions. When the Counties and the State negotiate with the...you know, public employees negotiate with the unions, is any of that public information either...not necessarily during, I imagine, but after, in the results? How much transparency is there in the negotiation process between the County of Maui and the various public employee unions?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, I'm going to say that that's not, you know, public information, you know, negotiations and...and that. I mean we establish an agreement, we come to an

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

agreement, you know, there's a lot that happens during that process. So, yeah, it's not, you know, available for, you know...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. That's understandable, going to be...so, is there...do you talk to your other peers in the other counties often? Are...is the challenges that Maui County is facing, is it somewhat universal?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It's somewhat universal.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Is there...is there any strategic plan? Say, like the strategic goals. The structure and the objective of what you're trying to do is admirable, and totally supportable. It's like a track value, support and retain a fully staffed qualified and diverse workforce. All of us would vote for that. All of us would fund that, cheering it on. We currently don't have that. It seems like it's been over...an ongoing challenge over a prolonged period of time. Is there any light at the end of the tunnel?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Just having the support of Council, the Administration, you know, all the Departments. I'm not going to say that we've never achieved that, you know, the County is the largest employer on the island. So, you know, it...it's really a moving target to get all of our positions filled. I...I don't know that, you know, we're ever going to achieve that. There's...you know, people move, they...they come, they go, they...you know, life happens.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. And I...I'm not painting with a negative brush. I understand that in such a large and...our community is so diverse, and the County does employ so many people at so many different levels and, you know, I'm an advocate. The continuity of employment through the public sectors, to me, is super important. Like the institutional knowledge, the cultural knowledge, the sensitivity, you know, the fact you went to, you know, you grew up here, you went to school here, you know, you've worked your life in the County. . . .(timer sounds). . . People in the Water Department, when they retire, there could be this huge gap. So, I'm being...I'm trying to find the calligraphy brush to paint in between the lines of how we can help you and help the Departments. So, thank you for this time to speak with you. My time is up.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Appreciate it. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Cook. Member Kama, followed by Member Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, I...I want to go back to...I...earlier, the first round, I was kind of talking about categories and groups, but I'll get back to that later. But my more pressing question is, you know, with the bifurcation of the Department of Housing and Human Concerns...so, is that a reorganization of the Department of Human Concerns, and is that a creation of a new department with the new Housing Department, or whatever that might be, or no?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I would say that they would need to go through a reorganization because

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

now...I'm not sure how they're going to do it, but they would, you know, have to establish their plan to bifurcate, you know, Housing and Human...or, yeah, for Housing to one department, and Human Concerns to another department. So, yes, that would be a reorganization. Because now the...the top...you know, there...there would be some impact to those employees that, you know, are affected, or potentially be affected.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: And...and in your experience, when an reorganization takes place within a department, what is the usual timeline for that to occur?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: You know, there...I...I couldn't give you, you know, like a quantifiable like timeline. I've seen all kinds. There's, you know, reorganizations that impact and...and affect, you know, 20 positions. There's reorganizations that impact, you know, three positions. So, it really just depends. We're not involved so much...you know, we're kind of on the periphery involved in that process. It's really the Department of Management that kind of handles that...those requests. And once they, you know, are screened, and evaluated, and their questions are answered, then, you know, if there's union employees...union members are part of that reorganization, then they, you know, make contact with the union and, you know, get any questions that they may have...ultimately addressing their questions and then, you know, moving on with the reorganization.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, many of the questions that were asked of you have had some part or parcel had a union component to it, especially if they involve, you know, our union brothers and sisters employees. So, just in that discussion with the unions, do you have a sense of how long those time frames are? Just to get to the...the union, get a response, and get back and forth?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, in...I'm just kind of thinking out loud. So, Ocean Safety, they moved from Parks and Rec, this was probably like five or six years ago. And that consultation process was, you know, I couldn't...maybe a year...maybe longer. Tamara might remember? But...four years?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Four years?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yeah. So, it took a long time, and it was...part of it was...you know, there was so many questions. Like just countless letters went back and forth, and it was just, you know, kind of clarifying, you know, what was going to change, how it was going to change and, you know, impact those members that were working in those, you know, units. So, yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, getting --

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- it just depends.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, getting back to what Member Cook had asked previously about public input into those kinds of discussions. So, is there any...is there a time when public input could actually be garnered regarding those things?

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, I'm not aware of, you know, the public, you know, putting in their input regarding a reorganization. I mean certainly, if it impacts, you know, the public, I would imagine that, you know, that point, you know, would be crossed, those issues would be, you know, addressed. But I'm not aware of where in that process is the public input or...

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. That's fine. Well, thank you so very much. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Kama. Okay, Member Lee, followed by Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Deputy Director, I know you were asked questions about other counties, but are you aware of any recruitment and retention initiatives advanced by any other County in our State or other states?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, I mentioned earlier, I'm not sure what question it came up. So, we have...I think it was with Councilmember Sugimura. We have...I just received an email the other day from one of the other jurisdictions, calling a meeting to discuss some of the challenges that we're encountering. That meeting has not yet been established, but I imagine that that would...you know, what we're talking about today is going to be one of those hot topics that, you know, we need to put our heads together and see, you know, what we're all doing, you know, kind of that shared vision of, you know, how we think we can, you know, maybe address some of these issues. That agenda hasn't been established yet, but --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. You...and...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- we're having a conversation on it.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And it is true that these problems are...have been ongoing for a number of decades, as a matter of fact. Is it a problem because either the unions or the State or County Governments are resistant to change?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I don't think so. You know, I mean we have some established...you know, the HRS, you know, collective bargaining, you know, there's limitations that affect, you know. Certainly we need to know where we're trying to go...you know, is it pay, is it...you know, just...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Let me interrupt you again.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It seems logical that if we don't have enough engineers, and we haven't had them for...for many years, to raise the salary level, isn't that logical? Why aren't we doing that?

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It could be. It could be.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, because it's...it...it affects a lot of things, like the promotion and construction of affordable housing, for one. Because it affects our permitting process and infrastructure development...roads, sewer expansion, you know, a lot of things. And a very important significant infrastructure developments --

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I would agree.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- are delayed as a result of not having a sufficient workforce, especially in the area of engineers. So, there must be a reason why no one has wanted to raise the level of salaries for engineers; is that correct?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, currently, engineers are paid at...you know, we recruit them above the minimum. And, you know, they're at max...so, you know, I can't speak for all of them, but, you know, they are able to get close to max salary, if not max salary. And, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: There is something systemically wrong --

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- maybe there's more discussions...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- something is fundamentally wrong if...if you have, you know, raised the salaries for engineers, and that hasn't worked. So, there's got to be...besides relooking at that issue, perhaps other...you know, other incentives may be warranted. I mean we can't do without them.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And unfortunately, working with the unions . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . they don't allow us...well, they are very opposed to us outsourcing, right?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Lee. Member Sinenci, followed by Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. Director, it looks like during our Budget proceedings, we had done this practice where instead of defunding...we defunded some of the...the positions that have been going on for a couple of years, and then just leaving that up to the...to the Department Directors, should they need additional funds from some of the other vacant positions. And I...I thought it was a great process, and I just

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

wanted to get your feedback, if...if this is, you know, something we should regularly consider?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, I think it makes sense. I haven't seen the impacts of, you know, defunding or, you know, reducing funding, I guess. I mean it made sense to me when I was listening to the Budget proceedings. I just fear that departments that could fill a position...you know, have, you know, somebody coming up, they won't have enough money to actually fund the position for the entire year.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, we did...we did have Ms. Zielinski there with the Directors on board. So, if there were positions that they were actively hiring, we did not include them in there.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay. Okay. So, yeah. So, yeah, I'm in...I mean because, you know, the position could be funded for 12 months, but they only, you know, fill it like halfway through the year. So, I mean it makes sense to me. I think it's less impactful for those departments that have, you know, a larger pool of vacancies.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Great. Thank you for that response. And then about meeting with some of the other Department Directors, some of them in those larger positions was thinking maybe changing some of those positions to more...well, I guess they wanted to maybe hire at a lower level, and then train them within the Department so that they could advance or go to the higher levels. Would that still have to go through the Department process and...if they wanted to hire at a...at a lower rate?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, speaking on...for our Department, we fill our positions at the trainee level, and train them up. So, they go through the class series. So, we would entirely support, you know, departments that wanted to fill at the lower level. Because then that creates that career ladder, it creates that career progression. You know, a lot of times departments are trying to fill at the highest level, and there's just no candidates out there that's, you know, wanting to either move here or, you know, . . . *(inaudible)*. . . of jobs. So...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. So, you're saying to keep all the different levels, and just hire at the training level like some of them want to, but not to change some of those higher positions...keep those.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Well, so, they'd have to redescribe it to be the lower level position. But once, you know, they...you know, so, just think about getting on the elevator. So, you're at the, you know, floor 1, and then get...you know, after you've, you know, gained some experience in the position, you know, you get to the 2, to the 3, and progress them up the career ladder. So, the classes are all there, it's just the position is going to be described differently each time, you know, they...they're gaining experience and knowledge, and they're taking on, you know, higher level duties and responsibilities.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you for that. And then we did talk about changing some of the entry level...the questions on some of the exams. So, what is the process

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

for that?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, we work with Departments on . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . creating exams, you know, written exams and...and those sorts. So, definitely, if we...you know, we...we can change out questions and, you know, we...we always have them look at it. They are our subject matter experts.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you. My time is up. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Before I call on Member Sugimura, I'd like to welcome Non-Voting Councilmember Gabe Johnson to the proceedings. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for allowing me to come. I was out doing some yard work, and I was listening on my headphones and I just wanted to come in and maybe ask a question if you would allow it. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You got it. I'll call on Member Sugimura, and then I'll call on you after that. Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, continuing on with my 911 Dispatcher. Besides the working group that Chief Pelletier said he would create, what would be the next steps? And the problem is--just so other Members know because I've been following this--we were hopeful that the legislature would create a bargaining unit, which was going through the legislature, that died. And the reason why it died is because of the way that our 911 Dispatchers takes care of all the emergency entities is unlike O'ahu and Big Island, and maybe we're more similar with Kaua'i, but yet, it's not all exactly alike. So, with the education that I got by your presentation, I can see where we have a problem. But I'm...I think it's a...there must be a solution, right? Because we have this whole class of employees that have 50 percent vacancy because of the difficulty and the challenges of...of this group of people and their classification. So, can you just really fast give me the next steps that we should be doing if that's possible? And if not...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Thank you for the question. So, I think a working group is important, that's a first step. Also, you know, meeting with the other jurisdictions to see, you know, where we can move this. Is it redescribing? Is it, you know, looking at their positions again to see if they're appropriately priced, you know, what we can do. I mean certainly, even working with the Department to see, you know, what are the challenges that they experience, and keeping people in there...in that seat. You know, it's...it's, you know, difficult work, you know, I realize that. So, you know, what else are we looking at? So, not just from a classification standpoint but, you know, how can we, you know, make this a more appealing, you know, type of work environment? I mean there's, you know, all kinds of factors that may impact, you know, them, you know, recruiting and retaining Staff. So, you know, everything is on the table.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Is that it?

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. That sounds easier said than done. I don't know what the...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It's easier said than done, but I mean that's where to start, right?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It's kind of where to start.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. And I know that retentions are a short-term fix, and...and that's what we did. Thank you, Councilmembers, for agreeing to do that so that we can take them to the...you know, through the next fiscal year, but we still have this problem. I stand by you because of what I'm experiencing with 911 Dispatchers to look at the engineers. And if there is a situation that we need to take steps forward, like the retention for that class, we need to, and because you can hear from all the Members. And last, I just want to say that going through the Budget process, one of the ideas came up is when the...we go through deliberations, that we should have Personnel sitting at the table also. Because everybody blames you for our deficiencies in, you know, different projects and...and challenges. And I...I think that it's...from what I hear, we really need to all work together, and that I'm grateful that Miss...Member Rawlins-Fernandez is taking this up. Because I think it's educating us and to...first to understand the depth of the problem, and hopefully we can work together to, you know, find some kind of solutions. I don't know if you want to sit with us all through Budget deliberations for all those weeks, but that was one of the thoughts I had, is that everybody, you know, kind of goes back to you, and I'm sure that you have your own responses for that. But, that's it. Thank you very much.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, Deputy Director Razo-Porter, my goal is for you to not have to sit with us for Budget session. My goal is for us to understand what the processes are, what the procedures are, so that we're familiar enough so that the...any, you know, blame isn't squarely on the shoulders of DPS, but we understand where we can make improvements so that, you know, like we're not just pointing fingers because that doesn't help anyone. Okay. So, we're going to go Member Johnson. That'll complete round two of questions. Member Johnson, if you could also please let us know if there's anyone in your workspace.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Certainly. I'm home alone. But thank you for that. So, thank you, Chair, for allowing me to come into your meeting and ask a couple questions for Deputy Director Razo-Porter. We all know...and the questions you asked were...were excellent. Everybody's...we all know there's a...an issue with helping our...you know, getting people onboard. So, my kind of solution, and I'd like to hear your opinion on it, Deputy Director, is what if we kind of looked at...I know the salaries increase is one thing, the other thing we could do is maybe benefits, and some thinking out of the box

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

kind of benefits, like free child care for County workers. Because we know as parents, you know, the cost of child care is so expensive. So, maybe we could attract workers by having a free child care if you're a County worker. And also, what about the...what about the idea of a 32-hour work week instead of the traditional 40--and I don't mean four 10s, I mean 32 hours.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, my personal opinion, yes. This...you know, all of this would have to go through, you know, I mean the union, the...the State, but that's certainly a discussion that, you know, we could have. I mean even if it's not 32 hours, maybe it's 35 hours a week. It's...you know, I like the approach that you're talking about. You know, certainly we'd have to, you know, work with all the other jurisdictions, we...you know, we couldn't fly solo on this. So, you know, if it's...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: So, if we did...if...if we had child care...free child care in, you know, a County building, and then workers could take their kids there, why would we have to reach out to other, you know, folks?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Well, I was talking...

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Oh, a 32-hour work week.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I was talking about the 32-hour work week.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. So, 32-hour work week, we'll put aside for now. But how about just the idea of having another additional benefit as a County worker, free child care? I know there's...I've seen other States do it. Would...would that be something that...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: There's currently discussions, you know, kind of kicking that idea around. Certainly, you know, we're...we're far from making that happen. Just, you know, space is an issue. You know, just the liability comes to mind, you know, some...some other factors. So...but, you know, we're looking at, you know, ways to do that, just kind of thinking outside of the box a little bit, by those traditional benefits that we've offered in the past.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. Yeah, I...I really would encourage that, and if anything I can do to help you with that, please feel free to reach out. And I think this body, we're...you know, we're...we're concerned, and we want to help. So, I don't want..you know, I don't want you to look at like we're, you know, attacking you or any kind of thing like that. We're here to help and try to find ways that we can come together on it. So, thank you so much. Thank you, Chair.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Johnson. Okay, Members, that was the end of round two. Is there a need for a round three? Would you like a shorter round three? Are there just people that have burning...burning questions? I only see Member Paltin.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

I also have a few other questions. Member Johnson, did you turn on your video because you have a few more questions too?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: No, I'm...I'm finished. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, and I see Member Cook. Okay. So, Committee Vice-Chair Paltin, and then we'll go to Member Cook. Four minutes or three minutes? I'll just let you finish. Go ahead. I not going put the timer. Okay. Member Paltin, go ahead.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Deputy Director Razo-Porter. I was wondering when and when cannot Directors or Departments, I guess, decide to promote without examination? And can we hire people without examination?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I'll take your first question. So, Departments can decide...I mean Departments make the decision how they want to fill their vacancies. So, certainly, you know, whatever their criteria is. Typically it's do we have qualified people in-house to fill these positions. Some Departments kind of just have a...kind of their...their concept is, I'm going to make this competitive. If you qualify, you can apply and, you know, get on the list. But the Departments certainly have that ability to do a noncompetitive promotion...a promotion without exam is typically what we refer to it as. Your second question...so, because, you know, it's the merit principle, you know, we have to, you know, score these people. If it's a large pool of candidates, you know, we want to rank them so that we know, you know, what top five we're going to send, or the top five that we're going to send. There's, you know, positions that are training and experience evaluations, so it's...you know, all the information that they provide is how we evaluate and create a score for these candidates, so...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: I mean like for some of the positions, I'm...I'm not sure, but like laborer, nursery worker, or...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Oh, yeah. So, they don't have...they don't have an exam. It's a registration list for park caretakers, groundkeepers, laborers. So, they just get on the registration list, we send names to Departments to fill those types...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, so you don't need to take any kind of test for different types of hands-on?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: They don't take a test. Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, okay. Okay. That's good to know. And then for the promotions without exam, where they decide to maybe just have a TA incumbent fill it or whatever, does the Personnel Department get involved to ensure that they are actually capable, or do they just say like, hey, this guy's been doing it for two years. Let's just give him the job already.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, they apply...similar to applying for any other type of job, they apply. We do screen them so there's some criteria that has to be met. They have to be a regular civil service employee. They have to meet qualifications for that position. We look at, you know, if they had another promotion without exam in the last 12 months, so the rules say that they can't...you know, they just can't keep getting promoted through the promotion exam process, or at least...you know, they can only have one each 12 months. And yeah, so...and then, you know, because these are typically union employees, you know, there...there's, you know, they have to document and make sure that, you know, they went through, you know, their evaluation process, which is, you know, typically an interview. They might have to, you know, operate a piece of equipment or...you know, somehow, you know, they could have a performance test associated with...you know, show me how you would do this.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Okay. And then if...like, for example, when we spoke to the Police, they only will accept the transfer of another Police as a Police I. When I transferred from Hawai'i Island, I had to be an OSO I, even though I had the hours to be an OSO II. And I just was wondering, is that a County policy or a State policy? Because I would imagine like if you had like a Detective from another jurisdiction wanting to move to Maui, and we're so short of Detectives, why couldn't we just pick a person up as a Detective?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I think it's...I'm not sure what the history of that is, but I feel like it's somewhat of...you know, especially for law enforcement and, you know, those types of like Public Safety positions. So, you have to know the...you know, have some familiarity with the jurisdiction that you're, you know, working in, supporting. But I'd have to, you know, go back and look at that. But, yeah, I'm familiar with, you know, you have to...you...you know, we take your years of experience, but, you know, we're going to start you...and I don't know if it's a...a I or a II.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: So, like maybe after...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . But typically if you have that experience you can get reallocated up, you know, but, you know, what kind of entry we want you to, you know, go through our training process. . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: So, acclimate yourself to Maui County Police procedures, and then you could jump up to like Detective or Sergeant or whatever, if you...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: You could qualify then.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Okay. And then the...what did you call the RAMs? The...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Recruitment Above the Minimum.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Do you have like a list of those where we're consistently having to do that, recruit above the minimum list of position descriptions where we're consistently having to do those, or...or do you aggregate that data in any way?

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yeah. So, it's...it's based on the class of work. Certainly departments have to have the funding. So, we rely on them to, you know, say, you know, we want to recruit, you know, above the minimum, you know, this is what we're requesting. Because we have to post it on the position...or the class of work when we're recruiting so that people know it's like, hey, if I apply for this job, I can...you know, I could...the...the salary is . . . *(inaudible)* . . .

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, yeah. I know. We ran into that with Environmental Management where we tried to cut the money, but they said they wanted to recruit at a higher step, but what was on your website was not that higher step. And so, it was like, you know, is this a secret thing? Because the enticement of the extra money has to be put out to the public in order for it to be an enticement.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Right.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: So, I mean I'm not sure how that's happening, but that's one of the things we ran into Budget when we tried to cut the money, and then the Director said, oh, we want to recruit at a higher step. And we're like, well, you got to let everyone know, but then it wasn't on the website as a higher step. So, I mean just little...little things falling through the gaps like that that don't help you guys' own cause.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: I...I'm not sure what exact position that that is...that's occurring with, but there are some positions that exist in other departments. So, one department...you know, say Planning is recruiting for a Planner V. They're recruiting above the min. Another department may be recruiting for Planner V and, you know, their min may not be the same, you know. So, just kind of aligning that, you know, maybe they're asking later once the position has been, you know...or the class has been...started recruitment. So, yeah, there's definitely some area of, you know, just making sure that we're all communicating.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: And I guess my last issue, so I don't totally monopolize the thing is, being a competitive hirer...like we...we pretty much understand this is a...a worker's market because there's plenty vacancies, not only in the County, but like Countywide in the private sector. I met a consultant with Stantec the other day that said she had applied for a Planner V upon coming to Maui and that, you know, it took a month and a half to hear back after she put in the application, another month and a half before she got contacted for like an interview. And realistically, if someone comes to the island with the qualifications for a Planner V, they're not going to wait three months to take a job, because guys need to eat. And so, I mean I think we're shooting our own self in the foot with such a long process. Like we're not going to...like the private industries, the consultants, they're going to gobble these people up because they can just say, oh, look at your resume, you need somebody, you're hired, you know. So, I mean how...how would we compete with that?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, we're always trying to solve...you know, find a solution for that. I mean totally, you know, we're not, you know, going to be able to, you know, see someone

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

filling out an application and... be like, hey, are you...can you interview, you know, and hired on the spot. Like that's, you know --

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Never going to happen.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- probably not going to be the County. It's not going to happen. But, we do...we are able to establish lists, add people to...you know, because a lot of our recruitments...I think like 90 of our recruitments are on continuous, like we're constantly looking at them. So, if they applied, they're on...you know, if they qualified, they're going to be on the list, you know, within a week or, you know, a couple days, you know, from there. So, you know, just getting the name to the Department, the Department calling for an interview...I mean I've seen it happen, and it's probably not the norm. But, you know, we had a candidate that called and said, hey, I applied, I'm...I'm here. I really want to, you know, get an interview. You know, our Staff screened this person. They got added to the list. We called the Department and said, hey, we got a name, you know, are you ready? And they said yes. And she was offered a job yesterday. So, you know, it...it took a lot of, you know, people, you know, getting on the phone and making the call.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: And...and could we incorporate the emergency hire into like getting more of these people into these positions like fast, especially for those ones that are RAMs or chronic, like Member Sugimura's Dispatchers, Member Lee's Engineers, my Police and things like that that we know there is vacancies that are chronic, and work in the emergency hire component into that at all. No?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, we do. So, we don't call them emergency hires, we call them DM-89s. So, it's the form that we use that says, hey, we're recruiting to fill this position, here's a warm body, we want to fit them into the role. So, we...we do, you know, have those, you know, DM-89s working in some of these positions while, you know, departments are...you know, we're recruiting, and Departments are filling positions. So, that is, you know, one...one of the...the Band-Aids, I guess, that we have...that we use.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: How would you implement that? Like how...I mean how often does that happen, and how can you make it happen more?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It happens. So, we were just talking, so I feel like I'm sharing secrets, but...so, we were just talking yesterday. So, just...you know, when people apply for a position, they're...you know, they're putting their name in this bucket, you know, saying, hey, want to be a Planner V. And we look at them, you know, we...okay, you're a Planner V, we give you a score, we put them on the list. Hey, Department, we got a name, you know, we send the name to the Department. What we were talking about just yesterday afternoon literally is, what if we had, you know, another bucket that just says you're immediately available, and you want to work, and put them in that bucket, and just, you know, we'd still --

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Let's do it.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- have to work some of those details out, you know, like --

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: -- how are we going to get those names, you know, like what are they showing up with, their resume...and then, you know, it's departments that hire positions. I just kind of, you know, am the facilitator between the people there.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Even if we put them in any one opening, and then like you said, the intra-agency or interdepartmental transfer for that higher one or something, like just get them in the door.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yeah. So...so, if you were a DM-89, you're not a civil servant, you're not a regular...so, only regular civil service employees pass probation and can transfer within those divisions. Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Can get an intradepartmental...oh, okay. Okay.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, but, you know, we thought we'd create our own little temporary kind of warm body temporary position.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Sold, let's do it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(laughing)*. . . Mahalo for sharing with us.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: We're talking about it. So, we're still...you know, we're still kind of figuring out the...the process for that, you know, and that's just a Band-Aid really.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Let us...keep us posted what you need.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. I'll yield because I monopolized a lot of time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, that was almost about 20 minutes. Okay. But it's okay, it was good. Look, we got a lot of great information out of that exchange. Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Cook, you had some last questions?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yes. Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Director Porter. And I think all of the Members' questions...this is very productive. I'm grateful to Member Rawlins-Fernandez for hosting this, and I'm grateful for the Director's participation. Does...I'm curious, does DPS have a database? Do you use a database either with IT, County managing it, or in...in...you doing it, so that all of the...there's so many different positions, there's so many different pay scales, and there's so many variables, and then during Budget, when we look at a...there's positions, and then there's the unfilled positions and, you know, we...we tried to identify where the...where we could reduce the budget without impacting the ability of the Department to function and to advance. And

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

previously, with one of the questions, you said it was...it was difficult to kind of identify which one of the...anyway, long story short. Do you have a database that you can do queries?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. That's good to know. That'll help us. Thank you. My next question, is Workday the primary training tool?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, we have Workday. We have LinkedIn Learning that's, you know, housed in Workday, I guess is the way to...to say it. We also offer in-person live training...so, yeah. That's kind of the...you know, Workday and, you know, live in-person training.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, like live...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: It could be virtual. It could be, you know, in-person.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, live in-person training, would that be for...say like a Plans Review Examiner, would they actually have so many hours that your examiner would be training them, and is that a mechanism for them to move up to the next level? I mean, I'm curious how the training works.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: All right. So...so, the training--I...I think I showed this earlier--the training that we provide are...is kind of general population, you know, for supervisors, for managers, for employees. Like customer service, it applies to everyone. As far as like land, you know, reviewers, plans reviewers, that wouldn't...you know, I wouldn't be involved in that type of training. That would be the department would have...

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. So, the department would enable an existing employee to meet qualifications to move up to the next pay level.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, they could.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: It's the department's...department's kuleana in management, that doesn't really come in to DPS.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes. Right. Right. Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Is there a...okay. So, then the E/P positions come into play. You can't...you can only have so many plan reviewers at a certain level. And so, the people that are at lower levels have to pretty much just wait until someone retires or until they make an additional position?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, I guess it just depends on how departments, you know, are organized and, you know, how they use their positions. So, in my office--I'm just speaking for our Department--you know, we have a trainee. I don't...I don't need a trainee to be a trainee

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

forever, so I'm going to assign them, you know, heavier responsibilities, you know, more complex duties and responsibilities, and they're going to go from a I, to a II, to a III, you know, to bring them up into their career. Because as they grow, as they learn, you know, they just can do more. And, you know, I'm going to give them more complex duties, like looking at a reorg, like looking at, you know, at this...this bifurcation of Housing and Human Concerns. So, you know, as they gain knowledge and responsibilities, you're going to pull them...bring them up the career chain.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you. Basically for people to progress up the ladder is the only way that they're going to basically get a...a raise in their salary, correct? They have to move up...

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Well, so, they move up, and there's also what's called step movements, so longevity pay increases, you know, if they don't move up. If they're like I'm good to just keep my role, you know, they will have, after a year, after three years, you know, and those are all driven by the collective bargaining agreements, you know, and the compensation adjustments. So, there is not just moving up into, you know, more responsible level positions, but also, you know, just longevity pay increases.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Okay. Thank you for that. In my closing and last comment, there are Equipment Operators, which is a highly skilled trade.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: But Equipment Operators and Journeyman Plumbers, Electricians make as much, or if not more--usually more--than like Licensed Professional Engineers for the County. Now, the...the benefit package added to their pay scale is what really makes the difference. But when they advertise for like \$7,500 a month, that plus benefits adds up to a lot. But the pay scale that is advertised for that they get paid, I mean, they'd have to have another source of income to actually afford a home on Maui. And, so, I'm just...I'm optimistic, I'm hopeful, and I'm encouraging. I thank you very much, and let's keep working at it. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Cook. So, I think when we see the letters, the letters and numbers in the step increases kind of reflect the advancement.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Deputy Director. Okay. So, my final questions are...and I plan to, you know, work with you more before...this isn't the final meeting, this is just the first. This is a DPS 101 for our Committee, and then, you know, we'll...we'll also advance throughout the year in understanding the processes and procedures so that we can be as helpful as possible. So, in your office, I'm...I'm not exactly sure who...what...like what...what titles would be assigned to...so, I...I understand there are people in your office, like HR Specialist perhaps, that perhaps are assigned to departments to work with them on filling vacancies; is...is that correct? And how do you determine the number of departments each HR Specialist is assigned?

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

MS. RAZO-PORTER: That's a great question. So, each department...or every department is assigned to a specialist. You know, we have a number of specialists here and, you know, it basically kind of boils down to, you know, the...the larger department, you know, kind of their needs. We factor in, you know, do they have, you know, long-term employees, you know, sitting in their Personnel...you know, DPO chairs, what we call them, the DPOs. You know, kind of that, if we have a new DPO in the department, we may team them with a senior specialist just, you know, because they'll have more questions. And so, you know, we kind of look at all those factors. We are all, you know, supportive of everyone, so it doesn't, you know, really matter if, you know, you are assigned this department, but their...they just, you know, have a lot of demands going on, like we'll parcel out whatever the work comes in and give it to other specialists. So, you know, we'll always be kind of looking, you know, in that...in that respect. But you will have...each department has an assigned specialist to work with.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, what does the DPO stand for?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Departmental Personnel Officer.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. That's what I thought. Okay. Okay, and then my final question...oh, you know what? I'll save it for later. Okay. I'll...I'll talk story with you. Because we didn't really talk too much about the final step of filling the positions too much. So, when the Department decides which candidate, or which applicant, they want to hire. Okay, I'll just ask it then.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: What does that process look like? After the Department chooses an applicant, you give the Department up to ten names of qualified candidates, and then the Department chooses one. What does that process look like to that applicant starting?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, the process from there...so departments interview ten people, you know, the panel met, they made their selection, they, you know, let the candidate know, you know, we're offering you the job, you know, they establish a start date, you know, they should write, you know. Our...our process is they, you know, tell us, you know, who was selected, who was hired, and who was nonselected. They write to those employees...or I'm sorry, those candidates and say, you know, thank you for the interview, you know. Thank you for participating, and then they, you know, move on with the hire...you know, then it's kind of up to the department to, you know, onboard this employee and bring them, you know, into the County structure. Establish, you know, a start date, this is your pay, you know, these are your benefits, and kind of...you know, we support the department, they...they go through Workday to create, you know, their portfolio and, you know, select benefits and those sort of things, you know, their tax deductions. Is that...was that your question?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I guess from the point of the...the interview to the hire. So,

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

it's all on the department to choose the candidate.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then after that selection is made, they let DPS know?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Yes. It's...it's all electronic, so they, you know, just pretty much sub...you know, say interview not selected, interview selected, hire date, and then, you know, it kind of gets scooped up into the system. . . .(timer sounds). . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: So, you know, they're really not calling us saying, hey, we hired this person. It's, you know, digitally communicated.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I just...I wanted to understand that process better because that was cited as one of the hold ups the person being hired onto...into the department. So, but...we can continue to meet offline to understand better what the departments are sharing as...in their feedback.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And figure that out. Okay. Any last questions, Members? If not, we'll...yeah, I see no questions. So, thank you so much, Deputy Director Razo-Porter. for being with us. and answering our barrage of questions. I think that really was helpful for this Committee and as...and...and for the public. So, mahalo nui.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: Mahalo. I appreciate the opportunity to, you know, just kind of educate and inform, and hopefully this will help, you know, create, you know, a better understanding anyway. Thank you. Aloha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Have a wonderful day. Aloha.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: You too. Aloha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members. If there are no objections, we will defer ESCS-1(2). Any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great. So, that's it for today. And then I think...what is after me? GREAT. We have GREAT today. No...yeah. GREAT at 1:30. So, we'll see everyone at 1:30 for GREAT Committee meeting. Mahalo, everyone, for bringing your wonderful questions. I hope that was informative. And it's 11:32 on May 11th, and the ESCS Committee is now adjourned. . . .(gavel). . .

ADJOURN: 11:32 a.m.

APPROVED:



KEANI N.W. RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ, Chair
Efficiency Solutions and Circular Systems
Committee

escs:min:230511min:mll:ta

Transcribed by: Terianne Arreola

EFFICIENCY SOLUTIONS AND CIRCULAR SYSTEMS COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 11, 2023

CERTIFICATION

I, Terianne Arreola, hereby certify that pages 1 through 41 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 6th day of June 2023, in Wailuku, Hawai'i

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Terianne Arreola', is written above a horizontal line.

Terianne Arreola