MICHAEL P. VICTORINO Mayor

MICHELE CHOUTEAU MCLEAN, AICP Director

JORDAN E. HART Deputy Director





DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING

APPROVED FOR TRANSMITTAL

COUNTY OF MAUI ONE MAIN PLAZA 2200 MAIN STREET, SUITE 315 WAILUKU, MAUI, HAWAII 96793

April 7, 2020

Honorable Michael P. Victorino Mayor, County of Maui 200 South High Street Wailuku, Hawaii 96793

For Transmittal to:

Honorable Alice Lee, Chair and Members of the Maui County Council 200 South High Street Wailuku, Hawaii 96793

Dear Chair Lee and Members:

SUBJECT: A BILL FOR AN ORDINANCE AMENDING CHAPTERS 19.12,

19.24, 19.26 AND 19.37, MAUI COUNTY CODE, RELATING TO TRANSIENT VACATION RENTALS IN THE APARTMENT DISTRICTS AND INDUSTRIAL DISTRICTS, AND

DWELLING UNITS IN THE INDUSTRIAL DISTRICTS

Please find attached a proposed bill titled, "A BILL FOR AN ORDINANCE AMENDING CHAPTERS 19.12, 19.24, 19.26 AND 19.37, MAUI COUNTY CODE, RELATING TO TRANSIENT VACATION RENTALS IN THE APARTMENT DISTRICTS AND INDUSTRIAL DISTRICTS AND DWELLING UNITS IN THE INDUSTRIAL DISTRICTS." The purpose of the bill is to prevent the further conversion of long-term rental and owner-occupied apartments into transient vacation rentals in the apartment, light industrial, and heavy industrial districts.

The bill was initiated by the Planning Director and is intended to stop further conversion of residential apartment units into transient vacation rental investments. It also includes some minor revisions to the Industrial Districts regarding stand-alone apartment units and heights.

In 2014 and 2016, the Council adopted various ordinances to codify a written opinion from the Department of the Corporation Counsel that properties that meet certain criteria could lawfully conduct transient vacation rental uses; this was essentially codifying a "grandfathered" or lawful non-conforming use. However, these ordinances went farther than protecting existing rights because they would have allowed properties that had never conducted transient vacation rental uses to initiate such uses. The Department does not believe that was the Council's intent and believes that this should be corrected.

COUNTY COMMUNICATION NO. 20-246

Honorable Michael P. Victorino, Mayor For Transmittal to: Honorable Alice Lee April 7, 2020 Page 2

The bill was transmitted to the Maui, Molokai, and Lanai Planning Commissions. The following is a summary of the Commissions' comments:

Commission	Hearing Date	Comments and Recommendations
Maui	October 22, 2019	Voted to recommend approval of the proposed changes along with the "strong sentiment that Real Property Tax should incentivize long-term occupancy."
Molokai	October 23, 2019	Voted to recommend approval of the proposed changes as presented along with the following amendment: for industrial districts on the island of Molokai, maximum building height be 40 feet, with an additional 10 feet for appurtenances.
Lanai	November 20, 2019	Voted to recommend approval of the proposed changes as presented.

Attached for your review are the following documents:

- 1. Memorandum from Michele McLean, Planning Director, to the Maui, Molokai, and Lanai Planning Commissions, dated October 22, 2019;
- 2. Minutes of the October 22, 2019 Maui Planning Commission meeting;
- 3. Minutes of the October 23, 2019 Molokai Planning Commission meeting;
- 4. Minutes of the November 20, 2019 Lanai Planning Commission meeting;
- 5. Proposed bill.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. Should further clarification be necessary, please contact Administrative Planning Officer Jacky Takakura at extension 7743.

Sincerely,

MICHELE MCLEAN, AICP

muluhan

Planning Director

Attachments

xc: Clayton I. Yoshida, Current Division Planning Program Administrator

John Rapacz, ZAED Planning Program Administrator

MCM:JSR:JMCT;ckk

S:\ALL\APO\19.12 apartment\TVR in Apartment draft Reso\JT counciltransmittal 2020.docx

ORDINANCE	NO.	
-----------	-----	--

BILL NO. _____ (2020)

A BILL FOR AN ORDINANCE AMENDING
CHAPTERS 19.12, 19.24, 19.26 AND 19.37,
MAUI COUNTY CODE, RELATING TO TRANSIENT VACATION RENTALS
IN THE APARTMENT DISTRICTS AND INDUSTRIAL DISTRICTS
AND DWELLING UNITS IN THE INDUSTRIAL DISTRICTS

BE IT ORDAINED BY THE PEOPLE OF THE COUNTY OF MAUI:

SECTION 1. Findings and purpose. The purpose of this ordinance is to prevent the conversion of long-term rental and owner-occupied apartments into transient vacation rental apartments in the apartment, light industrial and heavy industrial districts, by prohibiting transient vacation rentals on properties on which transient vacation rental use had not been conducted in lawfully existing dwelling units as of the effective date of this ordinance.

Prior to April 20, 1989, transient vacation rentals were not prohibited within the Apartment Districts. On this date, Ordinance 1797 took effect and amended Chapter 19.12, Maui County Code, to require that buildings and structures within the Apartment Districts be occupied on a long-term residential basis. However, Section 11 of Ordinance 1797 ("Section 11") states that the ordinance "shall not apply to building permits, special management area use permits, or planned development approval which were lawfully issued and valid on the effective date of this ordinance." On March 4, 1991, Ordinance 1989 fully deleted transient vacation rentals as a permitted use in the Apartment District with some exceptions. Subsequently, effective December 8, 2014, Ordinance

4167 expressly restated the exceptions set forth in Section 11 and declared the intent of the Council to exclude the requirement of long-term-residential occupancy from buildings or structures having, on or before April 20, 1989, lawfully issued and valid building permits, special management area use permits, or planned development approval. Accordingly, such buildings or structures were expressly permitted to be operated as transient vacation rentals. Additionally, Ordinance 4167 allows transient vacation rental uses for reconstructed buildings and structures, subject to certain requirements. The intent of this bill is to prevent the further expansion of transient vacation rental uses in the Apartment Districts. This bill is not intended to affect existing, lawful transient vacation rentals in the Apartment Districts if they are in operation as of the effective date of this ordinance.

In the M-1 light industrial district and the M-2 heavy industrial district, transient vacation rentals were never permitted; however, they may be lawful if they operated prior to the enactment of the comprehensive zoning ordinance effective June 9, 1960, Ordinance 286.

While these code requirements have evolved, the lack of affordable longterm rental and owner-occupied housing units continues to be a crisis in Maui County.

In addition, this ordinance clearly prohibits single family dwellings and vacation rentals in the M-1 and M-2 districts and prohibits new, stand-alone apartments and apartment houses in the M-1 district. Apartments are already

prohibited in the M-2 district. The proposed revisions provide consistency with the purpose and intent of the industrial districts.

SECTION 2. Section 19.12.010, Maui County Code, is amended to read as follows:

- "19.12.010 Purpose and intent. A. [Multiple-family apartment districts are generally established outside of the high density core of the central portion of a town. It is applicable to areas where multiple-family units are indicated; yet, the areas have not reached a transitional stage wherein public, semi-public, institutional and other uses are desirable.] The purpose of the apartment districts is to provide higher density housing options than the residential and duplex districts. Multiple-family apartment districts are generally established within or near the urban core of a town to provide residents with access to jobs, services, amenities and transportation options. Uses within the apartment districts are appropriately located near, and are compatible with, uses in the various business, residential, public/quasi-public, and park districts. Apartment districts can provide a transition between residential districts and business districts.
- B. Apartment districts [shall] <u>must</u> consist of two types: A-1 apartment district and A-2 apartment district.
- C. [Buildings] <u>Residential buildings</u> and structures within the apartment district [shall] <u>must</u> be occupied on a long term residential basis[.], except as otherwise provided herein."

SECTION 3. Section 19.12.020, Maui County Code, is amended to read as follows:

- "19.12.020 Permitted uses. Within the A-1 and A-2 districts, the following uses are permitted:
- A. Any use permitted in the residential and duplex districts.
 - B. Apartment houses.
 - C. Boarding houses, rooming houses, and lodging houses.
 - D. Bungalow courts.
 - E. Apartment courts.
 - F. Townhouses.
- [G. Transient vacation rentals in buildings and structures having building permits, special management area use permits, or planned development approval that were lawfully issued by and valid on April 20, 1989. Buildings and structures with such permits

and approvals may be reconstructed, and transient vacation rental use shall be permitted, provided that:

- 1. The reconstruction conforms to the original building permit plans, special management area use permits, or planned development approval; and
- 2. The reconstruction complies with the building code and all other applicable laws in effect at the time of the reconstruction.]

[H]G. Bed and breakfast homes, subject to the provisions of chapter 19.64 of this title.

[I]H. Short-term rental homes, subject to the provisions of chapter 19.65 of this title."

SECTION 4. Section 19.24.010, Maui County Code, is amended to read as follows:

"19.24.010 Purpose and intent. The M-1 light industrial district is designed to contain mostly warehousing and distribution types of activity, and permits most compounding, assembly, or treatment of articles or materials with the exception of heavy manufacturing and processing of raw materials. Residential uses are excluded except for dwelling units located [above or below the first floor and apartments.] in the same building as any non-dwelling permitted use."

SECTION 5. Section 19.24.020, Maui County Code, is amended to read as follows:

"19.24.020 Permitted uses. A. Within the M-1 light industrial district, no building, structure or premises [shall] will be used and no building or structure will be hereafter erected, structurally altered, replaced, or enlarged except for one or more of the following uses:

Uses

Notes and Exceptions

Any use permitted in a B-1, B-2, or B-3 business district[; provided, however, that no building, structure or portion thereof shall be hereafter erected, converted, or moved onto any lot in an M-1 district for dwelling purposes, including hotels and motels, except for dwelling units located above or below the first floor and apartments] except single family dwellings, duplexes, bungalow

courts, short-term rental homes, and transient vacation rentals

Animal kennels

[Apartment houses] <u>Dwelling units located in</u> the same building as any non-dwelling permitted use

Assembly of electrical appliances, radios and phonographs including the manufacture of small parts such as coils, condensers crystal holders and the like

Carpet cleaning plants

Cold storage plants

Commercial laundries

Craft cabinet and furniture manufacturing

Education, specialized

Farm implement sales and service

General food, fruit and vegetable processing and manufacturing plants

Harbor facilities

Ice cream and milk producing, manufacturing and storage

Laboratories—experimental, photo or motion picture, film or testing

Light and heavy equipment and product display rooms, storage and service

Machine shop or other metal working shop

Manufacture, compounding or treatment of articles or merchandise from the following previously prepared materials: aluminum, bone, cellophane, canvas, cloth, cork, feathers, felt, fiber, fur, glass, hair, horn, leather, plastics, precious or semi-precious metals or stones, shell, tobacco and wood

Manufacture, compounding, processing, packing or treatment of such products as candy, cosmetics, drugs, perfumes, refir pharmaceutical, toiletries, and food products oils

Manufacture, dyeing and printing of cloth fabrics and wearing apparel

Except the rendering or refining of fats and

Manufacture of musical instruments, toys, novelties and rubber and metal stamps

Manufacture of pottery and figurines or other similar ceramic products

Milk bottling or central distribution stations

Mortuaries and morgues

Plumbing shops

Poultry or rabbit slaughter incidental to a retail business on the same premises

Production facility, multimedia

Radio transmitting and television stations; provided, that towers are of the self-sustaining type without guys

Replating shop

Retail lumber yard including mill and sash work

Mill and sash work shall be conducted within a completely enclosed building

Small boat building

Soda water and soft drink bottling and distribution plants

Tire repair operation including recapping and retreading

Utility facilities, minor, and substations up to, and including, 69 kv transmission

Warehouse, storage and loft buildings

Wearing apparel manufacturing

Wholesale business, storage buildings, nonexplosive goods and warehouses"

SECTION 6. Section 19.24.050, Maui County Code, is amended to read

as follows:

"19.24.050 Development standards.

19.24.030 Dev	crohment scand	aius.
	M-1	Notes and
		Exceptions
Minimum lot area	7,500	Except for utility
(square feet)		facilities minor,

	and the property of the second	which shall have no
		minimum lot area
N	65	minimum lot area
Minimum lot width (in feet)	65	
Maximum building height (in feet) with five or more apartments or dwelling units	60	Except that vent pipes, fans, chimneys, antennae, and equipment used for small scale energy or communications systems on roofs shall not exceed [70 feet in total height] 10 feet above the building roof
Maximum building height (in feet) with four or fewer apartments or dwelling units	<u>45</u>	Except that vent pipes, fans, chimneys, antennae, and equipment used for small scale energy or communications systems on roofs shall not exceed 10 feet above the building roof
Minimum yard setback (in feet)		
Front	0 or the same as the adjoining zoning category whichever is greater	Where the setback of the adjoining non-industrial zoned parcel is less than 10 feet, a
Side and rear	0 or the same as the adjoining zoning category whichever is greater	minimum setback of 10 feet shall be applied
Freestanding antenna or wind turbine structures height and setback	Maximum height of 75 feet and shall be setback 1 foot for every foot in height from all property lines	

Accessory structures allowed within setback area	Boundary walls, parking area, trash enclosures, and ground signs	
Enclosure requirement	All uses are to be conducted wholly within a completely enclosed building, or within an area enclosed on all sides except the front of the lot, by a solid fence or wall or cyclone fence at least 6 feet in height"	

SECTION 7. Section 19.26.020, Maui County Code, is amended to read

as follows:

"19.26.020 Permitted uses. Within the M-2 heavy industrial district, no building, structure or premises [shall] will be used and no building or structure will be hereafter erected, structurally altered, replaced, or enlarged except for one or more of the following uses:

Uses	Notes and Exceptions
Any use permitted in the B-1, B-2 and B-3 business districts and M-1 light industrial district[; provided, however, that no building, structure or portion thereof shall be hereafter erected, converted, or moved onto any lot in an M-2 heavy industrial district for dwelling purposes, including hotels, motels, or apartments except living quarters used by watchmen or custodians of an industrially used property] except single family dwellings, duplexes, bungalow courts, short-term rental homes, transient vacation rentals and apartments	Except for living quarters used by security/watchmen or custodians of an industrially used property
Alcohol manufacture	

F	
Automobile wrecking, if conducted within a building	
Boiler and steel works	
Brick, tile or terra cotta manufacture	•
Canneries except fish canneries	
Chemical manufacture	
Concrete or cement products manufacture	
Factories	
Foundries	
Freight classification yard (railroad)	
Junk establishment used for storing, depositing, or keeping junk or similar goods for business purposes	Such establishment shall not be nearer than 8 feet from any other property line for the storage of the junk or similar goods except in buildings entirely enclosed with walls
Lime kilns which do not emit noxious and offensive fumes	
Lumber yard	
Machine shops	
Material recycling and recovery facilities	
Oilcloth or linoleum manufacture	
Oil storage plants	

Paint, oil (including linseed), shellac, turpentine, lacquer, or varnish manufacture	
Petroleum products manufacture or wholesale storage of petroleum	
Planing mill	
Plastic manufacture	
Railroad repair shops	
Rolling mills	
Ship works	
Soap manufacture	
Sugar mills and refineries	
Utility facilities, major	
In general those uses which may be obnoxious or offensive by reason of emission of odor, dust, smoke, gas, noise, vibration and the like and not allowed in any other district	Provided, however, that any use not specified in this section shall not be permitted unless approved by the planning director as conforming to the intent of this title"

SECTION 8. Section 19.26.050, Maui County Code, is amended to read as follows:

"19.26.050 Development standards.

19.20.030 Development standards.		
	M-2	Notes and Exceptions
Minimum lot area (square feet)	10,000	
Minimum lot width (in feet)	75	

Maximum building height (in feet)	90	Except that vent pipes, fans, chimneys, antennae, and equipment used for small scale energy or communications systems on roofs shall not exceed [149 feet in total height] 10 feet
		above the building roof
Minimum yard setback (in feet)		
Front	0 or the same as the adjoining zoning category whichever is greater	Where the setback of the adjoining non-industrial zoned parcel is less than [15] 10 feet, a
Side and rear	0 or the same as the adjoining zoning category whichever is greater	minimum setback of [15] <u>10</u> feet shall be applied
Accessory structures allowed within setback area	Boundary walls, parking area, trash enclosures, and ground signs	
Freestanding antenna or wind turbine structures height and setback	Maximum height of [90] 75 feet and shall be setback 1 foot for every foot in height from all property lines	
Enclosure requirement	All uses are to be conducted wholly within a completely enclosed building, or within an area enclosed on all sides except the front of the lot, by a solid fence or wall or cyclone	

	fa]
	fence at least 6	
1		
!	feet in height"	1
j	icet iii neight	L

SECTION 9. Section 19.37.010, Maui County Code, is amended to read as follows:

- "19.37.010 Geographic restrictions. A. Except as provided in this chapter, time share units and time share plans are prohibited[,] in all zoning districts. Transient vacation rentals are prohibited[,] in all zoning districts, excluding bed and breakfast homes permitted under chapter 19.64 of this title, short-term rental homes permitted under chapter 19.65 of this title, transient vacation rental units permitted by a conditional permit under chapter 19.40 of this title, transient vacation rentals permitted under chapters 19.12, 19.15, 19.18, 19.20, 19.22, and 19.32 of this title, and hotels that are permitted based on the applicable zoning in the comprehensive zoning ordinance.
- B. Existing time share units, time share plans, and transient vacation rentals that were operating pursuant to and under law and were registered pursuant to chapter 514E of the Hawaii Revised Statutes as of the effective date of the ordinance codified in this section, shall not be impaired by the provisions of this section; provided that, any time share project operating under law that records in the bureau of conveyances [within sixty days of the effective date of the ordinance codified in this section,] by May 3, 1991, a declaration in a form prescribed by the director shall be deemed exempt from this section as long as the project or apartment unit identified by the declaration continues to operate under a lawful time share plan or registration.
- C. Time share units, time share plans, and transient vacation rentals are allowed in the hotel district [and transient vacation rentals are allowed as]; transient vacation rentals are allowed in the B-2 community business district, B-3 central business district and B-R resort commercial district; and transient vacation rentals are allowed as special uses in the SBR service business residential district[;] and B-CT country town business district. [provided that, such use is explicitly and prominently authorized by the project instrument. As used in this section, "project instrument" means one or more documents, including any amendments to the documents, by whatever name denominated, containing restrictions or covenants regulating the use or occupancy of a project. As used in this section, "project" means property that is subject to project instruments, including, but not limited to, condominiums and cooperative housing corporations.
- D. If the project in which the time share unit, time share plan, or transient vacation rental is to be created is not a hotel and

does not contain time share units, time share plans, or transient vacation rentals, then the use may be approved only if it is explicitly and prominently authorized by the project instruments, or if the project instruments are amended by a vote of the unit owners as required in the project instrument to explicitly authorize time sharing or transient vacation rentals.]"

SECTION 10. Lawful transient vacation rental units in the Apartment Districts in operation as of the effective date of this ordinance may continue to operate as nonconforming uses pursuant to Subsection 19.500.110(C). If any such building or structure is reconstructed, renovated or expanded, then transient vacation rental use is limited to the building envelope as it can be confirmed to have been approved or lawfully existing on April 20, 1989, and the number of bedrooms used for transient vacation rental shall not be increased. The initiation of new transient vacation rentals in the Apartment Districts not in operation as of the effective date of this ordinance are prohibited, notwithstanding Section 11 of Ordinance 1797 (1989).

SECTION 11. Apartment units in the M-1 Light Industrial District and M-2 Heavy Industrial District lawfully existing prior to the effective date of this ordinance may continue to operate and shall not be subject to this ordinance, and may be reconstructed, expanded or modified provided that they meet all other requirements of this code.

SECTION 12. Material to be repealed is bracketed. New material is underscored. In printing this bill, the County Clerk need not include the brackets, the bracketed material, or the underscoring.

SECTION 13. This ordinance shall take effect upon its approval.

APPROVED AS TO FORM

AND LEGALITY:

MICHAEL J. HOPPER

Department of the Corporation Counsel

County of Maui 2019-1416 2020-03-06 Ord Transient Vacation Rentals