

**DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND
PLANNING COMMITTEE**
Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

May 10, 2023

Online Only via BlueJeans

CONVENE: 1:31 p.m.

PRESENT: VOTING MEMBERS:

Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Chair
Councilmember Nohelani U'u-Hodgins, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Tom Cook, Member (Out 3:33 p.m.)
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Member (In 1:47 p.m.)
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member (In 1:33 p.m.)

STAFF:

Paige Greco, Legislative Analyst
James Krueger, Senior Committee Analyst
Maria Leon, Committee Secretary
Lei Dinneen, Council Services Assistant Clerk
David Raatz, Deputy Director of Council Services
Shelly Espeleta, Supervising Legislative Analyst

Laura McDowell, Executive Assistant to Councilmember U'u-Hodgins
Susan Clements, Executive Assistant to Councilmember U'u-Hodgins
Jared Agtunong, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Cook
Stacy Takahashi, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Cook
Evan Dust, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kama
Lois Whitney, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kama
Noelani Ahia, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez
Dawn Lono, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Sinenci
Kate Griffiths, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Johnson

Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Moloka'i Residency Area Office
Roxanne Morita, Council Aide, Lāna'i Residency Area Office
Mavis Oliveira, Council Aide, East Maui Residency Area Office
Jade Rojas-Letisi, Council Aide, Makawao-Ha'ikū-Pā'ia Residency Area Office

ADMIN.:

Michael Hopper, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel
Bradford Ventura, Fire Chief, Department of Fire and Public Safety
Henry "Hanale" Lindo, Assistant Fire Chief, Department of Fire and Public Safety
Parrish Purdy, Fire Captain, Department of Fire
Kathleen Aoki, Director, Department of Planning
Scott Forsythe, Planner V, Department of Planning

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

Herman Andaya, Administrator, Emergency Management Agency

OTHERS: Marvin Moniz, Maui District Airport Manager, State Department of Transportation (DRIP-3)

Testifiers

Dick Mayer (DRIP-2(2), -2(3))

Mike Moran (DRIP-2(3))

(3) additional attendees

PRESS: Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.

CHAIR PALTIN: . . . *(gavel)*. . . Will the...will the Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning Committee come to order. The time is 1:31 on May 10th, 2023. If everyone can please silence their cell phones or any noisemaking devices, that will help our cause. Thank you very much. Members, under the Sunshine Law, if you are not in the Council Chamber, please identify by name who, if anyone, is in the room, vehicle, or workspace with you today. Minors do not need to be identified. Also, please see the last page of the agenda for information on meeting connectivity. My name is Tamara Paltin, and I'll be your Chair for today, DRIP Committee, and I'm broadcasting live and direct out of the historic Lāhainā Town. With me I have Angela Lucero and Christian Balagso, and we have no testifiers waiting to testify. Next up we have Council...or sorry, Committee Vice-Chair Nohelani U'u-Hodgins. Aloha 'auinalā.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha. And we also have Councilmember Tom Cook. Aloha 'auinalā.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha. And Councilmember Tasha Kama. Aloha 'auinalā.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aloha 'auinalā, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: And Councilmember Shane Sinenci. Aloha 'auinalā.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha 'auinalā, Chair. I'm here at the home office by myself, and there are no testifiers at the Hāna District Office.

CHAIR PALTIN: Awesome. Thank you. At this time, Councilmembers Keani Rawlins-Fernandez and Councilmember Yuki Lei Sugimura is excused. Our Non-Voting Members, Gabe Johnson and Council Chair Alice Lee, are welcome to join us at any time. I do have a land acknowledgement statement. This meeting of the Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning Committee of the Maui County Council is located on the traditional 'āina of the Kānaka 'Ōiwi who never ceded their sovereignty to the United States. We recognize that Her Majesty Queen Lili'uokalani yielded the

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

Hawaiian Kingdom under violent duress and protest to the United States to avoid the bloodshed of her people. We further recognize that Hawai'i remains an illegally occupied nation-state by the U.S. as documented in a 2021 scholarly article for *The National Lawyers Guild Review* by Andrew Reid, Adjunct Professor of Law at the University of Denver, Sturm College of Law. Generations of Kānaka Maoli and their knowledge systems have sustainability cared for Hawai'i and continue to do so. We are grateful to occupy this space and learn the ways in which we can contribute. As a Committee, we seek to support the varied strategies that the indigenous people of Hawai'i are using to protect their land and their communities, and commit to dedicating time and resources to working in solidarity. From the Administration we have Deputy Corp. Counsel Michael Hopper; Fire Chief or his designee, Brad Ventura--I think there's somebody else on than him--oh, he is on. Okay. And Maui Emergency Management Agency Administrator Herman Andaya. I will have Mr. Hopper, Chief Ventura, and Mr. Andaya serving as resource persons to the Committee under Rule 18(A) of the Rules of the Council because they have special expertise on today's agenda items. They are government officials and not paid lobbyists...and I'm sorry, please include in that Director Kathleen Aoki as well, Director of Planning. Aloha. Our Committee Staff for today, we have Committee Secretary Maria Leon; Legislative Analysts Paige Greco and James Krueger; David Raatz, Deputy Director of Council Services; Lei Dinneen and Jean Pokipala as Assistant Clerks. On today's agenda we have DRIP-3, Bill 21 (2023), Relating to Conditional Zoning for Emergency Airstrip Operations at Kapalua Airport; DRIP-2(2), 2022 Annual Status Report on the Implementation of the Countywide Policy Plan and Maui Island Plan; and DRIP-2(3), 2022 Annual Status Report on the Implementation of the Maui County Community Plans. And I see Councilmember Yuki Lei Sugimura has joined us. Aloha 'auinalā.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aloha. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha. And I did want to take testimony at the beginning for anyone that has doctor's appointments and things like that. So, oral testimony via phone or video conference will be accepted. Please note that if you are signed in, you are on the list to testify, even if you did not request to testify. Please let Staff know in chat if you are signed on and do not intend to testify. Testifiers wanting to provide video or audio testimony should have joined the online meeting via the BlueJeans link or the phone number noted on today's agenda. Written testimony is encouraged and can be submitted via the eComment link at mauicounty.us/agendas. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes. If you are still testifying beyond that time, I will kindly ask you to complete your testimony. Unless you want to testify anonymously, please clearly identify your name, organization, and items you would like to testify on in chat. We ask that you state your full name, but if you prefer to testify anonymously, Staff will identify and refer to you as "Testifier" and assign you a number. Please also indicate the agenda item or items you are testifying on. You may indicate in the chat if you do not wish to testify; however, chat should not be used for discussion or comments. Please be courteous to others by turning off your video and muting your microphone while waiting for your turn to testify. Once you are done testifying, or if you do not wish to testify, you can view the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, mauicounty.us/agendas. Thank you all for your cooperation. And before proceeding,

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

may I please request that everyone keep their microphones muted unless it's your time to speak. Decorum must be maintained at all times. Any person who behaves in a manner that disrupts, disturbs, or impedes the orderly conduct of any Council meeting or Committee meeting, at the discretion of the presiding officer or a majority of present Councilmembers, be ejected or banned from Committee meetings, or if participating remotely, muted or dropped from the meeting. Examples of destructive behavior include heckling, shouting, use of profanity, threatening or slanderous remarks made to any member of the Council, Staff, or general public. It will be considered a breach of decorum for members of the public to use chat for anything other than testimony sign-up. Staff has been monitoring individuals joining today's meeting by phone and by video, and we will do our best to take each person up in an orderly fashion. So, I think...is Mr. Mayer the first person signed up to testify?

MS. GRECO: Yes, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Mr. Mayer, we're ready for your testimony. This is testimony at the beginning, we'll also take testimony after each presentation. So, if folks want to testify right before their item, that's also...or after their item is presented, that's also allowed. Okay. Mr. Mayer, we're ready for you.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

MR. MAYER: Thank you. Dick Mayer, I'm not a lobbyist. I'm speaking on my own behalf and not on behalf of any organization. I'm going to speak today regarding the two items that you have on your agenda speaking about implementation. One deals with community plans, the other deals with the Maui Island Plan, both major components of the Maui General Plan. And also, the Countywide Policy Plan is also included there. So, there are two separate items on your agenda that I'll be speaking about. I'm very concerned about the implementation of our plans. Of all the activities that our County gets involved in, the planning process of these General Plan elements is probably the most important. You first...we first have the CPACs, or the GPAC in the case of the Maui Island Plan, and then we had the GPAC on each of the islands, then we have all of the community plans. After all the CPACs do their work, they go then to the Planning Commission. They hold extensive meetings. Then it goes to the County Council where you have...first use one of the planning committees or land use committee which will take a look at that plan and massage it and develop it, and then finally, the full Council will do it. The process usually takes about two-and-a-half years to go from the first time when the Department prepares the draft plan to the County to the community plan--to the CPACs, excuse me--and then through the whole process until it finally gets adopted. This is a major effort. I'm surprised that we don't have better implementation of those plans once they're adopted. It's direction by the Council. You folks work very hard to prepare these plans, and then we find very often that the plans do not get implemented. In the reports that you have before you are a number of charts and graphs, and I've supplied you also with a summary form of that graph. And you'll see there...and it has four columns, completed, in progress, ongoing, and not begun. I want to start with the one not begun. If you look at that list, you'll see that many, many, many of the elements

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

in the plan have not been begun. We should have a reason why they're not begun. There should be a very clear...it may be finances, it may be lack of Staff, it may be that it's no longer relevant, some...some rationale needs to happen. Second item I want to point out about that is, we...each of those items that are not...not begun was given to a particular department, Parks Department, Environmental Management, Emergency Management, Police, Fire, et cetera--to be implemented. We...I do not see in this report any real attempt to get those departments to implement these things. The director should be doing it. So, I'm going to be asking...one of my recommendations is that each of you during the year, in your separate Committees, have the department directors come up before you to talk about an item that's on the agenda. I would also urge you to add to that agenda the General Plan of Maui, all of its various components, and be able to have them come up and say why that part has not been implemented, and what the status is of those which are in progress. Some of those items are very critical to the future of the island, the work that you folks and the public have worked very hard to get those set up. Now, one of the problems is the Planning Department. The...the community plan...excuse me, the Maui Island Plan was last adopted in 2012, two years later, the Planning Department set up an Implementation Division. I believe it's totally understaffed, it has not been doing the job it should be doing, and it does not have the enforcement powers to...so, in other words, the person who's directing that Department should be able to go to the Fire Chief or the Police Chief or the head of Emergency Management and be able to say these are the things that are on the agenda, I expect a report from you in three months or six months, some logical time period, that would say why you haven't adopted it or what...what you need from the Council or from the...from the rest of the County to be able to implement it. They should be held accountable. These are the most important elements that we have in our County that...things that people say...that Council says should be done, and the directors, each one of them, should be held responsible for their own department. And that goes for both the community plans, as well as the broader Maui Island Plan and the Countywide Policy Plan. And the Countywide Policy Plan is less of a task-oriented thing. It's not like...these are guiding policies, but the Maui Island Plan and the community plans, the nine community plans, one of them doesn't get counted because it's Kahoolawe and that's not under the County's real purview, it's under the Kahoolawe Commission. But the other eight on...on...the community plans, we need to know why they're not being implemented. We don't expect in the first ten years to have every one of those things in the Maui Island Plan. The Maui Island Plan was adopted in 2012. It's now 12...10 years, halfway through the 20-year planning period. A lot of those things should be begun, and they haven't been begun yet. And so, I would urge you to work in that...that direction. I don't know if you need the Mayor's Office of Management or the...the Chief of Staff doing that, somebody needs to coordinate it, and if possible, you could even give that enforcement power to the person running the Implementation Division. If that person is elevated to a higher rank, not...not at the level that they're at now, but given the real direction similar to a department director to be able to tell other directors what hasn't been done, what has been done, and let's get that job done so that we have all the work that you folks do actually being implemented. Thank you very much. And I...if there are any questions, I'll be glad to try to answer them. And I just want to thank Tom Cook, who worked with me on the GPAC. We spent several years working on that, and got it through the Council, and thank you, Tom, for doing that with me.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Mr. Mayer. That concludes your testimony on DRIP-2(2) and DRIP-2(3), correct?

MR. MAYER: Correct, that's 2 and 3.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. And we do have question for you first from Member Sinenci, followed by Member Cook. Go ahead --

MR. MAYER: Thank you, appreciate it.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. And mahalo, Mr. Mayer, for your testimony this afternoon. I did receive your...your email on the different community plans. So, my question for you is the community plans one. On our Hāna Community Plan, part 4, implementation considerations--and I haven't seen the other community plans, but I think they also have the same thing, part 4, implementation considerations. We have, in ours, first two objectives is for annual budget requests shall address requirements identified by implementing actions contained in our community plan. And number 2 is our capital improvements, programming undertaken by each agency shall incorporate, as appropriate, specific projects listed in our Hāna Community Plan. Can you speak to any of those two items?

MR. MAYER: I...I...we would have to see exactly the way it is and where it is in the plan, but obviously those are things that...but I would also...if you look at the table that I sent you, you'll notice that in Hāna, there are only 11 percent of the items that have been completed. That's...that's 30 years ago, that was in 2000...excuse me, 1994, that that plan was 29 years ago, and it's still only 11 percent have been completed. So, the items you're mentioning are part of that package, and...and I would certainly ask the Planning Department why more have not been completed. Is it maybe that they're not necessary anymore, or is there a funding problem, or what it is that's going on. That's...I mean each item should be looked at carefully and not...this...this report is the result because it's in the Charter that the Planning Department has to produce this report. And it's very similar to the one that was produced last year, a few different...the numbers are different, but the text and things like that...we need to make sure that these things are done, not just an annual report to the Council and say okay, we did the report. The Implementation...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay.

MR. MAYER: Let me just add to that. The Implementation Division has diverted from its original task. They were given the task of doing the implementation. For the last several years they took on one major task, and that was producing the MAPPS, M-A-P-P-S, map for the County, and that was their job. And now they're saying, in the report that you have in front of you, that they're also helping with the South Maui Community Plan. That's not their job. They're not...that's the Long Range Division's job to be doing the

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

South Maui Plan. They shouldn't have any role in that. Their job should be implementation and enforcement of the plan.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Mr. Mayer. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Member Cook?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Mayer, for your persistent, consistent testimony and involvement. Is part of the challenge, in your opinion, possibly that we have so many community plans, and that the...that we're like bifurcating all of the communities so much? As opposed to...like Maui Island isn't that big, and our community--the infrastructure, water, wastewater, traffic, parks, schools--I mean all the various things that are either State or County are very interconnected. Our communities are unique. So, I'm just...without me talking, I'm asking, do you think that we have too broad a spectrum in our planning process? And is that part of the problem for implementation?

MR. MAYER: When...when I first came to Maui, this is...oh, 55 years ago, everybody on the island thought their home was Maui. Now what's happened is, I think if you ask people where...where...where do you...you know, they'll say I live in South Maui, I live in West Maui, I live Upcountry. People are definitely much more...because it's so big that they identify with the activities, the parks, the facilities, the traffic, and water in their own district. So, I think we do need these community plans because each of the community plan areas is and has grown much more...much different than it was five decades ago. In those days, it was a plantation economy, sugar and pineapple were the two things. Virtually there was no tourism. Now we have tourist communities, we have agricultural communities Upcountry, we have rural...very rural communities on Moloka'i and...and East Maui, et cetera, so we have a great variety. So, I think there is a need for the separate community plans. And then that's why the Maui Island Plan was set up, was to be an umbrella to create a framework for each of the community plans, at least on this island. Moloka'i and Lāna'i have community plan and they also have...their community plan is essentially their island plan.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Chair, are we going to have a second round of questions?

CHAIR PALTIN: Not for testimony. You have more questions, you can ask them. Just reminder, it's a clarifying question, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Yeah. How big do you think...Mr. Mayer, how big do you think the Planning Department needs to be, like how many people, to be able to manage the implementation?

MR. MAYER: I...I think my...I can't give a direct number. There are two separate parts to that. One is, they need the authority and the direction to be the policemen, so to speak, for these plans. So, they need that. Now, the...so, the director should have that authority, and should have that...that power, and that...that charge to do that. Then whether they need three people or eight people, one person for each community plan area, I don't

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

think that would be necessary. I think probably somewhere in the order of six, seven people to really make sure that the things are being done. And it shouldn't just be an enforcement, they should be...they should be able to go to the Fire Chief and says we say that in the plan and on...in West Maui or South Maui this is an issue, how can we help you, what do you need to help develop a budget, to help whatever. One of the bifurcations is that right now, many of your departments have their own GIS system. The Police will have theirs. The...the original idea was that there will be one GIS system for the whole County, and it's...it's...it's spread out, and that needs to be integrated. That's what the...the MAPPS program started out that way. It was supposed to be to get a GIS system for the County, and it ended up being a permitting system.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Any further questions for the testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much for your testimony.

MR. MAYER: Thank you for letting me go first. Aloha, and good luck.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. And at this time I'll welcome Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez. Aloha 'auinalā.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha 'auinalā, Chair, mai Moloka'i nui a Hina. I'm at the Moloka'i District Office, alone on my side of the office, and we have our Community Outreach Specialist Zhantell Lindo on the other side of the office reporting no testifiers. Mahalo for excusing me for a moment. I think that's the last time my daughter will let me take birthday cake, ice cream, and balloons to her in school, so I appreciate that so much. And I also appreciate your land acknowledgement, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. Is there any other testifiers that wanted to testify at the beginning of the meeting before we have the individual presentations?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, we do have Marvin Moniz on the line. He's on BlueJeans. We have him on the testifier log, if he'd like to testify at this time.

CHAIR PALTIN: Mr. Moniz, did you want to testify at the beginning or after the presentation?

MR. MONIZ: If anything, we can go after the presentation. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Right on. Thank you so much. And --

MR. MONIZ: Okay. Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- and we might designate you a resource too because --

MR. MONIZ: There you go.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- you know so much stuff. Okay.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: No objections.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

MR. MONIZ: Okay. Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: All right.

. . . END PUBLIC TESTIMONY AT BEGINNING OF MEETING . . .

**ITEM 3: BILL 21 (2023), RELATING TO CONDITIONAL ZONING FOR
EMERGENCY AIRSTRIPOPERATIONS AT KAPALUA
AIRPORT**

CHAIR PALTIN: So, first up on the agenda we have DRIP-3, Bill 21 (2023), Relating to Conditional Zoning for Emergency Airstrip Operations at Kapalua Airport. And so, this was brought to my attention from the West Maui Taxpayers Association, and it was brought to their attention from the firefighter that works at Kapalua Airport. I think his name is Rian...well, I know his name is Rian, but I'm...I'm not sure his exact last name, it might Takeshita. That the Kapalua Airport could be used for air ambulance at night if they had lights, and I think on occasion they have to set up lights if it's used for night operations. So, this item actually started about a couple years ago, it's not just a permitting process that takes long time. We first held an online community town hall about this because it was still during COVID to let the community know what the proposal was. The main feedback we got was from the developer right below, who some of you guys went to the ground...groundbreaking. They just wanted to make sure that the lights were not pointed at the houses that they plan to build. Then it came to Council, it came to Committee, we referred it to the Planning Commission. The Planning Commission took it up, I think, in February or so. Public hearing was held with the Maui Planning Commission February 28th, 2023. With a vote of eight-zero, the commission unanimously supported recommending approval of the bill as presented. So, they just posted the communications that was on the communications log from the Planning Commission to this item on Granicus this morning, so you may need to refresh your browser if you don't see it right away. And so, as soon as it came back from the Planning Commission and we got out of budget, I scheduled it on the agenda so we can move forward. So, at this time, if there is any opening comments from the Planning Department, we'd love to hear them.

MS. AOKI: Good afternoon, Chair Paltin. Good afternoon, Members. Kathleen Aoki from the Planning Department. Really don't have any comments, other than we do support the bill. Speaking personally, as you know, I'm from West Maui, so I'm fully in support of this speaking selfishly. But yeah, it...it sailed through Planning Commission, there...there were really no comments, so all unanimous. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Director Aoki. I did notice in the verbatim minutes it was two West Maui members that made the motion and the second. I did want to clarify, I...I read some of the questions from the Planning Commission. The firefighter I spoke to, he said that they're there daily from 6:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m., and that the way the emergency lights work on Moloka'i or Lāna'i is the pilots, if they're on the same

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

frequency, can turn on and off the emergency lights by keying their microphone. So, that's pretty amazing. I think somebody asked how...Mr. Freitas asked how long it would take somebody to get up there and turn on the lights. The other thing Firefighter Rian said was that there's 24/7 security at Kapalua Airport, so the medics, if they're going to use it for the air ambulance or something, they should get in touch with the security to open the gates and be ready for them. So, they have it kind of all figured out. They're kind of just waiting on us. So, if Members had any clarifying questions, I think we better wait until after the testimony. Are we ready for testimony? Okay. All the same rules for testimony applies as it did in the beginning. Mr. Moniz, we're ready for you, if you have your testimony. And if you can turn off any listening devices in the back so there's no echo, that'd be great. Oh, shoot, we can't hear.

MR. MONIZ: How about now?

CHAIR PALTIN: Yes, we can hear you.

MR. MONIZ: Hey. Thank you, Chair and Council. Technology. But anyway, thank you for having me, and we just wanted to let you know, the Department of Transportation, we support this change to the Kapalua, West Maui. And it makes a lot of sense when we look at emergencies as we prepare our emergency preparedness plan. And it continues to grow, as well as our population on the West Side. So, having said that, I just wanted to bring out a few points of interest that support this. In the event there is a rockslide or an earthquake and we lose the Pali for an extended period of time, we'll be able to bring in emergency supplies, i.e. medical supplies, medication, emergency responders, et cetera. So, from that perspective, it supports that. We also have the flexibility of doing air ambulance as you mentioned earlier, Chair, supporting that services. We also look at the fact that if we need to shuttle people to and from Moloka'i or vice versa, it's...it's a way out for us to get people off both islands or back and forth. So, the other issue we'd have to look into obviously is the funding and whether we join forces in that because we're open for that. I did speak to Senator McKelvey and Rep. Elle Cochran, and we have that conversations with our Director of Transportation Ed Sniffen. Other than that, I think...and you...and you mentioned the security. Yes, we do have security around the clock. We do have a central dispatch that's based at Kahului Airport who has radio communication and phone communication with the guard on duty. So, 90 percent of our calls, or 95 percent of our calls, come through the dispatch and is communicated. So, I think as a whole, it's a win...a win-win for everybody. Okay. Thank you. That's all I got.

CHAIR PALTIN: Awesome. Thank you. Members, is there any desire to keep Mr. Moniz as a resource? Okay. I...I guess we're going to designate Mr. Moniz as a resource under Rule 18...resource person to the Committee under Rule 18(A) of the Rules of the Council because of his special expertise on today's agenda item. He is also a government official, and not a paid lobbyist. So, if we have any questions, we can call him up. At this time I'll entertain discussion. Oh, is there any more testifiers, Staff? I'm sorry. Besides Mr. Moniz for this item?

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, there is no one else signed up to testify on this item.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Awesome. So, without objection, I will now close public testimony for DRIP-3.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

. . . END PUBLIC TESTIMONY FOR DRIP-3 . . .

CHAIR PALTIN: All right. Okay. Now I'll entertain discussion on this item, or if you think discussion has been exhausted, I'll...I'll make a recommendation. Oh, Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: The reason why I was hoping...I wanted to have Marvin Moniz on the phone, I wanted to know how much this would cost, if they had any estimate of the cost to implement this. That's...that was my one question --

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- for him. I really have no other questions for him.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Mr. Moniz, you have an estimate of the cost?

MR. MONIZ: Yes. I...I did look at that a few years ago, and we did have a rough figure of about 220,000. This included runway lights, taxiway lights, and threshold lights. We're working with this company, and I'll pursue it even more now that we've got support and a lot of positive energy going forward with this. But I will work with Goldwings, which is a vendor that provides airfield equipment, i.e. lighting as well. So, we'll get a...an updated price. I'm sure it's not what it was years back. So, we'll get that. So, yeah, I would say maybe up another 125,000 maybe since then. That's where we're at. But Chair, I wanted to add also before I forget that by having these runway lights installed at the West Maui Airport, we would have to make an adjustments to our airport emergency plan, as well as our airport security plan, and we would be very happy to share that plans with you guys any time you wanted to see them.

CHAIR PALTIN: Awesome. Thank you so much.

MR. MONIZ: Okay. Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: Member Sugimura, did you have another question?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, I'm not done. So, one more.

CHAIR PALTIN: For Mr. Moniz?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: One last question. So, and when you were testifying, you kind of mentioned that...or I should ask it this way. Are you anticipating that the County should also support this, or is this a State expenditure? I think it's State. Because it's an airport.

MR. MONIZ: Correct, it will be State, yes. And I think, you know, some of the challenges we have, Councilwoman, is that because there are restrictions that have been put into place by the Council years ago when the airport was privately built, owned, and operated, the FAA, the Feds gave us no money. Kapalua is the only airport out of 15 airports in the State of Hawai'i does not qualify for Federal funding because of that fact that the restrictions are in place. So, it doesn't mean that we can't take that out of our own expenditures or find money within the Department to cover that, whether it be from other airports or not. But as far as that goes, yeah, I agree, I mean it's State airport, and if some private donations come in, fine, if not, then I'll get with Director Sniffen on that once we start moving forward.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. MONIZ: Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Member Sinenci, did you have a question for Mr. Moniz?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, those pretty much was my questions from Member Sugimura. Mr. Moniz mentioned he spoke with Senator McKelvey, so it sounds like he's working at the State level for the funding. Or we did have...I think the...the pilots have...Hāna Airport also has those emergency lights that pilots can access via their...their radio as well.

MR. MONIZ: Yeah, they do. So, they call those PCLs, they're pilot control lights, and what happens, there's three levels of intensity, there's low, medium, and high. Just in the...in the event there's like thick fog, or one dust storm, or anything that would...would hamper the approach, they can click three times for the highest intensity, and once for low, and twice for medium. So...so, that's the kind of neat feature, I wish I had that in my car when I pull up to my driveway, but it's pretty...it's a pretty good tool to have.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo for that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. Any further questions for any of our resources? Seeing none. Are you guys ready for a recommendation? All righty. Let's do this. Chair will entertain a motion to recommend recording of unilateral agreement and passage on first reading of Bill 21 (2023) entitled "A BILL FOR AN ORDINANCE TO AMEND ORDINANCE 2924 (CONDITIONAL ZONING) FOR EMERGENCY AIRSTRIP OPERATIONS AT KAPALUA AIRPORT."

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So moved.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Second.

CHAIR PALTIN: Moved by Member Sugimura, seconded by Member Cook. Member Sugimura, as the movant, do you have any discussion?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I think all the good things have been said. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member Cook, as the seconder, any discussion? Anyone else, any discussion? Seeing none. Oh, Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I wanted to say that this is important, and thank you for representing and spearheading this effort on behalf of all of our community. This is important, and I fully support it. Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Anyone else, any further...oh, Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Real quick. During our community meetings we had a lot of West Maui residents come out saying the need for more medical facilities in West Maui due to the traffic sometimes on the Pali, fire. So, this is a great compromise until we get there. I think this will be good for the residents. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Any further discussion? Seeing none. All those in favor, raise your hand and say "aye."

COUNCILMEMBERS: Aye.

CHAIR PALTIN: Motion passes unanimously, seven "ayes."

**VOTE: AYES: Chair Paltin, Vice-Chair U'u-Hodgins, and
 Councilmembers Cook, Kama, Rawlins-Fernandez,
 Sinenci, and Sugimura.**

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: None.

EXC.: None.

MOTION CARRIED.

**ACTION: Recommending FIRST READING of Bill 21 (2023) and
 RECORDATION of unilateral agreement.**

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Good job, folks. Moving right along. Members, if it's all right with you, DRIP-2(2) and (3) are really similar and kind of related, would...would Members mind taking the two up together?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Awesome. All right.

ITEM 2(2): 2022 ANNUAL STATUS REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE COUNTYWIDE POLICY PLAN AND MAUI ISLAND PLAN (RULE 7(B))

ITEM 2(3): 2022 ANNUAL STATUS REPORT ON THE IMPLEMENTATION OF THE MAUI COUNTY COMMUNITY PLANS (RULE 7(B))

CHAIR PALTIN: So, DRIP-2(2), 2022 Annual Status Report on the Implementation of the Countywide Policy Plan and Maui Island Plan; and DRIP-2(3), 2022 Annual Status Report on the Implementation of the Maui County Community Plans. So, I found these County communications on the communications log that's hidden somewhere on the website, and I've been going through all those communications because I feel like some of them are getting slipped through the cracks. And, you know, when...when I was PSLU Chair, I always liked to have a presentation on these communications because it's kind of like a point in time where we are. And so, I pulled these both out for a 7(B) presentation. And Members that were on...oh, I see Mr. Hopper. Did I do something wrong?

MR. HOPPER: Oh, sorry, Chair. I think you're probably getting into it, but just wanted to confirm you'll be taking testimony again after...before discussing the item?

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, yeah. This is just still part of the presentation part, no --

MR. HOPPER: Understood.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- no questions or anything.

MR. HOPPER: Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: And so, I pulled these off the communications log to get a presentation from the Director and her team, and I just wanted Members to notice, especially in the community plan, Members that were on the previous term had asked for the information to be presented in a certain way, and she did a really great job. We have it first by department, all their implementing things, and then in the back, we have the same stuff by community plan. So, if you wanted to see like all the community plan for Hāna or Moloka'i or Lāhainā or Pā'ia, whatever, it's in the back organized by community plan. If you wanted to find it based on department, it's in the front. And as my purview is over Fire and MEMA, I have asked Fire and MEMA to be present. Police didn't...had so few

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

implementing actions and a lot of them were done already that I...I didn't ask them to come, but we can if Members want to later, or Members can pull...pull this out and have whatever departments they oversee and have a presentation in their Committee if they'd like. But I thought it would be educational for everyone to see what the plans are. Some of them...I know Mr. Mayer was not real stoked on us, but some of them have a legislative action that needs to be taken or, you know, maybe it can't be taken or whatever, but I thought it would be a good way to start off our term coming out of budget. I...I kind of went over it before going into budget in the past so that people can prioritize their stuff in that way as well. But that's basically my reasoning for scheduling these items. And if we have any opening remarks on either item from Planning, and then we'll follow up with Fire, and then MEMA. And if Members could write down any questions they have, and we'll take the questions after we close up testimony. So, Director Aoki, take it away.

MS. AOKI: All right. Thank you, Chair Paltin. Today we do have a short presentation for you. I have with me Scott Forsythe. Scott is a Planner V, but is temporarily assigned to my old position as the Planning Program Manager for PID. So, we welcome him. Be kind to him. And we're here for any questions following the presentation. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. I think that's my blood donor buddy there.

MR. FORSYTHE: Yes, I am. Aloha, Chair Paltin. And good afternoon, Councilmembers. My name is Scott Forsythe with the Plan Implementation Division. And I have a really short presentation to go over.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, proceed.

MR. FORSYTHE: Is that better?

CHAIR PALTIN: Yes.

MR. FORSYTHE: Okay. And so, this presentation is not going to take too long so we can get into the questions that you may have. So, the next slide. And this slide I'll just breeze through as the previous testifier covered many of the plans. But this is basically the hierarchy of the General Plan documents. You have the Countywide Policy Plan and then you have the Maui Island Plan. Moloka'i and Lāna'i have their own community plan, but all combined, there are nine community plans. And implementing and tracking and monitoring these plans is not...is easier said than done, I believe, but it involves coordinating with 14 County Departments and State and Federal partners who have been identified as the most suitable agency to lead or implement the action items. Although Planning oversees the development of the...of the General Plan documents, the Department does not lead all of the 1,261 action items. It's really a concerted effort by...by all departments and divisions. Therefore, and as you already indicated, Chair, other departments and agencies are online to help answer any of the questions, but if you have any specific questions on some of the items, you'd probably need to refer directly to that specific department. So, going into the Countywide Policy Plan. This a comparison between last year's report and this year's report. The Countywide Policy

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

Plan is really broad, and this is the only report in which there is not a lead entity assigned to implement it just because the actions apply across the entire County. But as you can see, between 2022 and 2021, completed six. In progress there are 16, which are 2 up from last year. Ongoing 33, 1 up from last year, and not begun has decreased. But for the Maui Island Plan, there are 305 total implementing actions, which completed 31 for both years, in progress is up 4 from last year, ongoing is up 2 from last year, and not begun is down to 74, and there's 305 total implementing actions. And then for the community plans, there's 874 total actions this year...are being reported from last year, I should say. And as you can see, the totals are different from 2021, and the reason is because the West Maui Community Plan was adopted last January--or two Januarys ago, I should say--and 39 additional actions were added to the list. But as you can see from the progress, that kind of skews it in a way because there's new actions. But completed, there's 135 this year, whereas last year it was 142. In progress, there are 315 compared to 287 last year. And ongoing, 169 with 162 from last year. And not begun, 255 compared to 244 from last year. That's my presentation. There's a lot of information in the reports, as you know, and there's various tables, and...that...that provides greater detail if you're interested, but I just wanted to provide a high-level overview of...of the reports that you have. So, thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. And any opening remarks from the Fire Department on either the Countywide Policy and Maui Island plans or community plans? Okay. Chief?

MR. VENTURA: Aloha, Captain. Thank you, Chair --

CHAIR PALTIN: Captain.

MR. VENTURA: -- for...thank you, Chair, for having me today. Everybody hear me okay? Great.

CHAIR PALTIN: Perfect.

MR. VENTURA: Thank you. So, a lot of these plans were developed a while ago. Some of the...I think some of the recommendations in both plans are still very pertinent, and we're still trying to pursue. The first one, the Countywide Policy Plan only really has one item for us, and that's a regional fire facility in the Central Maui area. We are still pursuing that, as you saw in our last Fiscal Year '24 budget proposal for an admin building. And our...our goal there is to centralize and build for growth for our Department. As far as the community plans goes, there are a lot of items from the various, you know, Kihei, Moloka'i, Lāna'i, and West Maui community plans that came out. Many of the activities have begun, and are ongoing because some of them do not end. Some of them will be continued to be pursued and times change. The items such as, you know, education and posting signs, a lot of that stuff we've moved to our social media platform. So, instead of doing the traditional pass out fliers and that sort of thing, we're trying to continuously post as much as can. Especially during the seasons. If it's hurricane season, we...we advise people how to be prepared for that, along with MEMA's efforts. And then during wildfire season, we'll be putting out continuous educational notes there. That's a lot of the projects that we've been assigned in the community plan.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

And then there are certain things in there, some of the older plans, like moving the ambulance in Kula from the hospital to the fire station. But the ambulance service doesn't fall under us. At this time it's managed by the State. So, multiple reasons. They moved closer to where we are, and they're happy where they're at, but they're probably not going to move into our station. So, some of those projects won't probably get off the ground. But as the testifier Mr. Mayer had said, you know, it's good to have an explanation for projects that haven't begun. I have lots more information, but I'd rather answer your guys' questions, so I'll wait for those.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you so much, Chief Ventura. Next up we have Administrator Andaya. If you have any opening remarks. Thank you for tuning in from Honolulu.

MR. ANDAYA: Thank you very much, Madam Chair, for accommodating...allowing me to participate via BlueJeans. I just wanted to echo what Chief Ventura mentioned. We...we also agree there's some of these initiatives here that may not be relevant today, and so...and the priorities may have changed as a result. And so because of that, you know, at some point we should review this and perhaps amend it to make them more...more...more relevant and...and more...well, prioritize so that, you know, that way it's something that...that...that we would want to take care of. The same with...with MEMA with respect to communication. Chief Ventura mentioned about how we've used other...other modes of communicating to the public. No longer just fliers and things like that. And so, we've...we've also done the same thing as well. We...we now use more social media, which has been much more effective. We've used TV, radio, you know, things like that. And so, we're exploring other modes of communication as well to get the message out to the public. That's all I have, Madam Chair. Sitting here, I'm...I'm open to any questions that you may have, if I can use that time instead to answer your questions. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you so much, Administrator Andaya. At this time, if there's anyone wishing to testify on either DRIP-2(2) or DRIP-2(3), please unmute and identify yourself. I'll give a brief countdown. Oh, Mr. Moran.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON ITEMS 2(2) AND 2(3) . . .

MR. MORAN: Aloha.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha.

MR. MORAN: Yes, I...I had signed up, and I was waiting for the Clerk to call me, but no worries.

CHAIR PALTIN: I'm so sorry. Go ahead, Mr. Moran.

MR. MORAN: Okay. I had just signed up for (3), 2(3) because it's the community plan. And just to express that now that we're going through our updated plan, sitting on the CPAC we get so many members of the community come in and testify and telling us how important it is that things have to be implemented. Don't put them in there if they're

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

not going to be implemented. And, you know, we try and explain to the...to those concerned citizens that we have don't have control of that. We can put anything in the plan, but we don't have control of the implementation. And it's frustrating for everyone, and...and people will look at the current plan from '98, and you see the stats that there's so much that was never done there. So, it is that community frustration, and it makes some members of the community just turn off. They say well, why are we even bothering with this if it's not going to be implemented? And to be very clear, this is not a shot at our new Director Aoki who came from that division because first of all, it wasn't created back in '98, so there were many years that went by. And again, you can put one person in charge of doing a million things with no tools and no Staff to do it. So, again, this is not a shot at her. It's...it's questioning the system, which is what you guys are doing, and I'm not so sure even what you as legislators can do about it. But it is...it is frustrating for everyone involved that why are we spending all this time on the plan that's only...if it's only going to sit on a shelf? So, no...unfortunately, no solutions. Professor Mayer did offer some solutions...hopeful solutions, some mitigation anyway. But it's...it still goes on, and that's the...the frustration of our community, and I'm sure all the other communities with their community plans too. So, thank you very much for taking this on, and I don't know how long your meeting is going, but we have our CPAC coming up right after this. So, we'll see what you guys conclude, and then we'll move ahead tonight. Thank you very much again for the opportunity. Aloha.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Mr. Mayer [sic]. That's exactly the reason I dug this out from the communications log and brought it front and center. Members, any questions for the testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much for your testimony today --

MR. MORAN: A hui hou.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- and good luck on your CPAC.

MR. MORAN: Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: Is there anyone else wishing to testify at this time? I'll do a brief countdown. Five...four...three...two...one, sold. Okay. We can start with three-minute rounds, and I'll just go in the order that you guys appear on the agenda if that works for folks. And...

MR. KRUEGER: Apologies, Chair?

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, yes? Close public testimony?

MR. KRUEGER: Yes, please, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. If there's no objections, I'll close public testimony at this time.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Cool.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

. . . END PUBLIC TESTIMONY ON ITEMS 2(2) AND 2(3) . . .

CHAIR PALTIN: So, our resources that we have for today is Fire, MEMA, Administrator Andaya or Chief Ventura, or from the Planning Department we have Director Aoki and Planner V Forsythe. So, I'll...I'll go in the order on the agenda. Three-minute rounds for as long as we need. So, first up would be Committee Vice-Chair Nohelani U'u-Hodgins.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Mahalo, Chair. This is for you guys, I guess, as the people who implement. You know, testifier before us was wondering why so many things aren't implemented. I'm wondering if you could just give us a general reason for why so many things aren't implemented?

MS. AOKI: Madam Chair? Commissioner [sic] U'u-Hodgins, well, my first response is going to be that I disagree that a lot of...a "lot" of things are not being implemented. If you look at the community plan, and you look at the report, out of 874 action items, only 29 percent have had nothing done. I think that that's pretty good, that two-thirds have been touched, implemented, maybe started, maybe started and then died...because that does happen. So, that's my first response. Glass half full. Second response would be why they're not being done. Similar to what a lot of people have already said, the plans are dated, so there are things in there that just simply don't make sense anymore, they're not applicable. Second reason is financing. Your...you know, you have over 1,200 items, I mean you're talking billions of dollars, billions. So, people get frustrated that things aren't getting implemented, but at the same time, when you...when you say during the process we can either put in a few things and really concentrate on those few things, or we can put in everything and realize that not everything is going to get done. So, that's a decision that gets made, and we've been making that decision over and over and over and over again.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you. That was...you kind of alluded to my second question is, these are super dated. So, I mean page 1 of the Pā'ia-Ha'ikū Community Plan says that it's supposed to guide decision-making in the region through the year 2010. That's 13 years ago.

MS. AOKI: Correct.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: I have children younger than that and older than that, and this plan was done in 1992. That's the same year my brother was born, and he's gone through a lot in the last 31 years. So, how applicable are these things? Are we treating this like honey where it never goes bad, or at what point are we going to get to these quicker? Are we going to realize some of the things are outdated and not applicable or...I mean what?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member U'u-Hodgins. So, 2.80B dictates the timeline that it takes to do these plans. With the amount of Staff and the amount of plans that you have, there is . . .(timer sounds). . . no physical way to get them done every ten years. The math just doesn't add up. So, we have gotten more funding, we are now going to be attempting to

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

do two plans at the same time. We just got the contract for Central Maui. So, we're kicking that off while we're doing the South Maui plan. You have delays, for example, the South Maui Community Plan, you just approved a time extension for the CPAC review. So, delays occur as well. Nobody likes being in this position, but it's the reality of the time that it takes to do these plans.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you. That was my time. Thanks.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member U'u-Hodgins. I like that honey analogy; I might use it in the future. Next up we got Member Tom Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Director. I...I participated in the island plan like three-and-a-half years, and I...and I've been going to many of the CPAC plans, to the Kihei, South Maui plans. The...having a facilitator on it, on the...on the plans, it...it...that worked well when...on the island plan. It sort of shifted gears after a while and they got a facilitator because it was so...it just needed to be managed. Is that something that is...and when I say managed, managing the...the members, the members who all have very strong opinions. Is that going to be...is that standard, is there a way that you could have a facilitator? And if not, what are the...what are the challenges having a facilitator?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Cook. From my recollection, when we started with the Countywide Policy Plan, we started with a facilitator. And then it all got shut down, and we had to stop because there was criticism that the facilitator process wasn't working, that the members wanted a chair and vice-chair. So, we had to stop the process. Again delay, six-months delay, to take 2.80...2.80 back to Council to rework it and add in the chair and vice-chair. So, you know, either way, I think there's pros and cons to both. Right now, we're under the guise of needing a chair and a vice-chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, okay. You're done? Thank you. Next up we've got Member Kama. We're ready for your first round, three minutes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, I'm on page 5. I think this is Exhibit 1. And in the column not begun, Moloka'i, form a partnership with Moloka'i NGO, State agencies, and DHHL to remove and recycle junk cars from Moloka'i. So, this is a five-year...so...okay. So, I'm going to...you with me?

MS. AOKI: I am with you.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay.

MS. AOKI: Thank you --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay.

MS. AOKI: -- Member Kama. I am now.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, it says that it hasn't begun, but it also tells me that this is five years old. So, in a situation like this that I would think wouldn't have taken that long or that much effort to, you know, put together a small team of people to talk about how we're going to do it. So, can you tell me and explain to me...I mean I would think it would be so simple, but maybe it's not the way I would think it would be. So, could you explain that?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Kama. I can give you a shot, but this falls under the Environmental Management, Department of Environmental Management, so I can't personally really answer for them why. But all --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay.

MS. AOKI: -- I would venture to say is that this may be something that while it seems simple and easy, it is going to take a Staff person to pursue, and perhaps they don't have the Staffing, or it's not part of their priorities. I would just encourage you to reach out to them to see.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. Thank you. So...so, Chair, I have a question for you. So, as we go through --

CHAIR PALTIN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: -- the exhibit, there are a lot of departments in here, as Director Aoki had just explained, that fall under different departments and different agencies. So, at what point do we...can we actually go back and ask the different departments about the questions that we'd like to ask? Should we just go through them and then just send them to you, or what?

CHAIR PALTIN: So, what I was told is my Committee has oversight over Police, Fire, and MEMA, and --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Right.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- that --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- I can't really compel the other departments to come before us.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

CHAIR PALTIN: So, I think if any other Committee Chair that has these departments under their jurisdiction, they can certainly take this Planning document and pull out the questions or...or we can...you can pull out questions for which department that you have, and then approach the chair of that committee that has oversight of that department. Or you could always just send a straight transmittal through

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

your...through your own Staff and ask . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . the questions. I'm sorry if I took up your time. But that's why I only invited Fire and MEMA because --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- that's the departments that are under --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Your jurisdiction.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- my jurisdiction as Committee Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, would you want us to probably stick just those two departments as we're looking for questions and things like that?

CHAIR PALTIN: Well, we can always see if --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- Planning has any input because I believe...and Director Aoki, correct me if I'm wrong, but you do make contact with these departments in some way to find their progress on each of these implementing actions?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Chair Paltin. We do. But it's very...most of the time it's pretty superficial. We're emailing them asking them to update the report. Sometimes they provide us a little bit more detail, a lot of times they don't.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. Well --

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: -- thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Do you think it's the best use of Councilmembers' time to just stick to MEMA and Fire in this case, or...or just ask you Planning or general questions?

MS. AOKI: I'd say probably general questions. While we try to know a lot, we really may not, so best Member...best use of your time might be more focused towards the agencies that are here today.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member Kama, did you need an additional minute, or do you want to wait until the next go around?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I'll wait until the next go around, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Thank you. Next up, Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. And then I can add a little bit

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

more information to Member Kama's question about the junk cars. The association has been working together on Moloka'i to get all the junk cars in the homestead area together, so the next step is getting them off the island because we don't have a facility here on island, as you know. Okay. So, there are some things on here, Director, that is marked not begun that I think has been. So, mahalo for your work on the...on implementing a lot of the action items, like the relocation of the Pūko'o Fire Station, the cap on short-term rental homes and vacation rentals. There are several that this Council has helped to initiate and then complete because it takes everyone to implement these action items on behalf of our community who we represent. And I took a very active part in updating our 2018 community plan, and took kuleana over making sure that these items are implemented, even if it means I would be introducing legislation to make it happen or resourcing those things, such as Member Sinenci's legislation for the cultural overlay. And you will see in the Moloka'i Community Plan the traditional land use overlay, which I tried very hard to advocate for passage of, to complete one of the action items in our community plan. Unfortunately it was vetoed, and this Council didn't support the override of the veto. So, that's why one of the items is not completed in the Moloka'i Community Plan. But hopefully we can get that through soon. Director Aoki, Mr. Mayer testified and asked if there could be some ideas on ensuring that some of the items are taken more seriously by departments. I...my office works very hard to try to collaborate with the departments so that we work hand in hand on seeing these things through, and that has been effective. But do you have any other...other ideas on how to get some of these items going?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. I think it would behoove the Members, as Member Kama mentioned about wanting to, you know, ask questions about certain . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . departments and bringing them forward, and bringing things to light that you're interested in or want to get. A lot of these things...you know, people don't realize that there's so many action items, so if there really is a project that you're interested in, then bring it to the forefront, bring the department, you know, and ask them questions, and see if there can be enough support to...to get...get the funding if it needs the funding, to support implementation of it.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Next up we got Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. And mahalo, Director Aoki. Yeah. So, looking at the list, it seems that our current Hāna Community Plan was created in 1994. Next year will make 30 years. I understand the Hāna Community Plan is also slated to be reviewed last...behind the other ones. And so, I just wanted...is there an estimated date for the Hāna Community Plan review and update?

MS. AOKI: Thank you Member Sinenci. I don't have the list in front of me, but that was something...the...the adoption timeline was something that was adopted by this Council by resolution. If you were to estimate, you know, two...I think two-and-a-half years is...I mean two-and-a-half years isn't even what's in 2.80B, so it...it takes even longer than that. Unless we're fast or, you know, something...if...if Council does it faster, or the

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

Planning Commission does it faster. So, I think you're...I...I don't have a number in front of me, but if you took two-and-a-half years and multiplied it by the remaining plans that need to be updated, you're probably looking at, I don't know, 10, 12-1/2 years from now. When you --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Yeah.

MS. AOKI: -- think about the South Maui plan just starting, and we're in 2023 --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah. And...

MS. AOKI: -- that's not going to get adopted until 2024 or '5.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Right. I get it. Yeah, I hear you. And fortunately, we've been able to--whether unconsciously, or just following the footsteps of our kūpuna that created this plan--we've been addressing it, like Member Rawlins said, either through ordinances that we brought up or through budget proposals that been...we've been able to, you know, acquire some of those open space. And those were areas that our kūpuna wanted to put in conservation. So, we've...we've addressed actually a lot of these areas, but we still got plenty more to go as far as the...having the departments and actually doing work with upcoming bills and ordinances to try and push some of the stuff through. For...I know for emergency...again, for rural communities like ourselves, emergency infrastructure and facilities are always needed for us. So, does Director Andaya have any plans for...for East Maui? . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . Or I can wait until the next go around, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Thank you. Member...sorry, Administrator Andaya, we'll...we'll come back to you. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. So, for my plan, it's like 27 years old, and...and...so, we're waiting --

CHAIR PALTIN: If --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- and I know that --

CHAIR PALTIN: -- if you could the move mic a little closer to your...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- there's a designated schedule that everybody has to follow. But I wonder, would it be also beneficial if we go through and delete those that are no longer applicable in the...my...my particular district? Could that be done, or is it something that we have to leave there?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Sugimura. That would have to be adopted by ordinance. This is all adopted by ordinance, so if you want to add, delete, change, you have to do a community plan amendment.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Because I think what comes up when this gets discussed about moving...you know...well, moving the...the ambulance service into the fire station.

MS. AOKI: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And that came up when I first started. So, I went to visit them, and they kind of got the ambulance people a little concerned because they actually bought a house down the street from the fire station. And, you know, they...there's no room at the first station, but when it comes up, then everybody starts talking about it again. So --

MS. AOKI: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- and that's all I want to say. I think there's...it's just cleaning up that probably needs to do, and if it has to be done that way, then...then so be it. But thank you for your hard work, and it's good that you did this and now you're there --

MS. AOKI: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- can help us a lot. So, that's all.

MS. AOKI: Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Sugimura. For...for my opportunity, I guess my first question is kind of a general question. You know, the Department of Ag was created recently, and I still see a lot of the agricultural implementations under the...the Mayor. And in this upcoming fiscal year, we did move a lot of those things out from under the Mayor to the Ag Department. Do you foresee like, I guess, for the 2023 annual report that Ag will have its own category header?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Chair Paltin. That's a really good question. My gut response is no because the plans dictate...they state the agency that is supposed to be implementing these items, and that's where you run into sort of that issue with...with these dated plans. However, having that said, now that I'm thinking--see, I got to get my little brain working--Environmental Management was created and broken apart from Public Works, and we have Environmental Management, so we must have gone through and separated those out. So, I think that's very possible. But just understanding that we're not really quite following what the plan said when it was adopted, right, because new departments get created. So, I think that's something that we can definitely look at.

CHAIR PALTIN: I guess just in terms of like, you know, when we had the Ag Department before us for budget, they seemed a little, you know, still trying to get their feet underneath of them, and it might be helpful for them to see whether our Countywide Policy Plan or Maui Island Plan or our various community plans, what these implementing expectations are of them so that, you know, ten years from now, somebody says why

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

didn't you do this, that's an ag function, and they're like I never seen that, you know, it's been with the Mayor all this time, or something like that. So, it...it seems like, you know, just for practical purposes in terms of implementing, I...I hope that we're giving them a list of expectations that the community has that they're implementing at...at the least. My next question would be for the Fire Department. I'm on Exhibit 1, page 10 references 20 and 21. And this, I think, would be on me, it's a West Maui Community Plan implementing . . .(timer sounds). . . action. Oh, shoot. Okay. Next round I'll...I'll be on page 10, 20 and 21. Members, do you want to keep the order, you want to reverse it, switch it up, random or keep the order?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Keep.

CHAIR PALTIN: Stay on this path. Okay. All right. Committee Vice-Chair U'u-Hodgins, second go around.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: At least for my district, there isn't too much within Fire and MEMA and lots of Planning, but as I said earlier it's kind of difficult to ask questions because, you know, it's 31 years old. And I guess I just look forward to the update, which I guess will take a little while, but up until then, I just look forward to the update. And I'll see what I can do for my district. Although again, this thing could have ordered cocktails ten years ago, so we'll see. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: And just to...for your information as well, it's...you're also open to ask questions on the Countywide Policy Plan or Maui Island Plan. So, the community plans are specific to your community. If you have any questions on the overall Countywide Policy Plan or Maui Island Plan, those are fair game too, since we're taking both items up together. If you didn't want to focus in only on your outdated stuff.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure. We...we can come back around unless you wanted to...okay. Come back around. All right. And just putting that out there for anyone else that feels their specific community plan is outdated, we can also focus in on the Countywide or the Maui Island Plan. I know they did the...just as an aside, they did the Maui Island Plan, I think, because they...they--and Director Aoki, you can correct me if I'm wrong--they noticed that a lot of the community plans seemed to be kind of copying each other, and so, they wanted it all like, okay, this is Maui Island Plan stuff that the whole island wants, and then tried to make the specific community plans not restate things that were in the Countywide Policy Plan or the Maui Island Plan, but sometimes it doesn't work out like that. Where our community members were like well, we need this in our community plan, you know, and similarly, West Maui had some cultural overlay stuff similar to, I guess, Hāna and Moloka'i. I also tried to like, you know, the...the West Maui Community Plan had like phase out TVRs or phase out the Minatoya List, and I tried that a number of different angles and ways, and it didn't happen, but I'll...I'll...I'll address that on my round. Sorry, I'm dipping into your folks' time. Member Cook? Three minutes, second round.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. So, Director, Maui Island implementing...implementing actions, housing, 9-1-6 [sic], action 2, it has not begun, but I think you folks have begun on that. I'm trying to like cheer you on and give you some encouragement. It says streamline the permitting process as follows. Within one year of the plan's adoption, adopt new administrative rules that streamline and clarify the permitting process. Two, consider using outside consultants, third-party reviews. Three, implement a one-stop permitting process. And four, adopt a set of standards so permitting is administrative, administrative as possible. I mean the MAPPS program that you and all the departments worked on was an electronic version of that, and although it isn't functioning to everybody's satisfaction, I think that you've made a valiant effort. So, that should probably be an ongoing.

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Cook. I'm sorry, were you...can you reference the action plan number again?

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: It's page 11, Exhibit 1, 5.1.6 --

MS. AOKI: Six.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- action 2.

MS. AOKI: Two.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: First one down on page 11, housing.

MS. AOKI: I see.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: I think an extremely broad category. There's four heavy lifting items.

MS. AOKI: Well, thank you for pointing that out. I know one time we were up here and several of you...I remember Member Sugimura pointed out one that we needed to change, and I think Member Rawlins-Fernandez pointed out one that we needed to change. So, we certainly appreciate all of you looking through them and letting us know. If you see something in your community that should be different, we want you to tell us. So, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Well, I think --

MS. AOKI: *(Audio interference)*.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: -- you...I think you deserve some credit for trying.

MS. AOKI: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Next we got Member Kama. Did you...was it you wanted to continue your line of questioning?

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Actually, you know what? I asked a question about what I should do about this. So, I've been reading this whole...the plans, and I think I'm going to write to each of the different departments regarding each of their...their...their items, and ask them the question like that as opposed to trying to get the Department to answer a question that she probably is not able to if it's not within her jurisdiction. So, thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: That is a dream come true for me, that's what I hoped Members would do. So, music to my ears.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: All right. You heard her.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Okay. Let's...all right. So, I think the last time we went over the reports, the annual reports, I had brought up that X's don't really tell enough information, Director Aoki, and percentages would kind of help a little bit more. Such as for Parks, one of the items is to provide high-speed Internet at all County meeting facilities, and we have Internet at Mitchell Pauole Center. So, it says in progress, and there's an X, but it really doesn't tell as much as it could. So, do you think maybe next year we could have percentages of how much complete it is?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. So, I'm going to give you a very honest answer, no. And the reason is that I...I think it would be better to just reach out to the departments and talk to them, and I'll tell you why. When we update this report, and we email it out to all the agencies...and as you know, there's been shortages. I mean we can...we can say they're excuses, but they're real. We...we don't get responses back right away from a lot of departments. And I understand --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

MS. AOKI: -- they're busy.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director.

MS. AOKI: Yeah. It's --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

MS. AOKI: -- it's going to be *(audio interference)*.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think...I think we got the same explanation last year, and it's...I'm not...I'm not invalidating that. I...I agree that everyone has so much on their plate. And like Member Kama said, you know, we can reach out and get the departments to explain to us what's going on. We can also, if our plan isn't too dated, you know, spearhead some of the efforts to work with the departments on making it

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

happen. If I have a percentage, can I send it to you, and then you put it in the report?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. I'd have to verify it with the Department.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right. Okay. So, one of the things that...so, I've been going over the community plan in my town hall meetings with the community. And sometimes it sounds kind of dry and boring just because it's a lot of talking, but one of the things that I think would help to breathe life into the plans and keep it relevant is when there's the update that, you know, every five years or so since we do have an amendment process that we, as Councilmembers, you know, work with the community on . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . amending the plan. If we amend that plan, would...would it be added to the...the website that you have with the updates?

MS. AOKI: Thank you. If...if you amend...if you...meaning if you do amendment to the community plan, would it be...I mean it would be part of the plan. So the whole plan would be posted, and then we would change the report to reflect any new implementation action items. Does that answer your question?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good enough for now, and then next round.

MS. AOKI: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director.

MS. AOKI: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

MS. AOKI: Okay.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. Yeah, and just as recommended by Pro Tem Kama, I certainly can reach out to the Parks Department. They fall under the WASSP Committee, and so, we can go ahead and see if they can do a presentation as well. Following up on my questions for Director Andaya, was there any updates on the Civil Defense Coordinator position for East Maui?

MR. ANDAYA: Madam Chair?

CHAIR PALTIN: Go ahead.

MR. ANDAYA: Yeah, the...so we had that position years ago, and then it was taken...it was taken out of the budget because we weren't able to move on it. But we do have a coordinator out...out in the remote areas, so that's the incident command. We created incident command posts and the incident commander is the police captain there. So, they've been acting as...as the Emergency Management coordinator of the area. So,

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

they've been meeting with the community and making sure that, you know, things are...are ready in the event of an emergency.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you, Director. And then as you know, our winter storms are increasing even more each year, so...and we normally get a lot of blackouts and electricity outages. One of our plans was to provide backup generate...generators during these heavy storm areas. Is this something under the purview of the Department?

MR. ANDAYA: Madam Chair? If --

CHAIR PALTIN: Go ahead.

MR. ANDAYA: -- if the need...if the need requires that we...we...we need generators, we can get them. And so...in fact, I'm sitting right now, I can show it to you, but there's like shelves here at HiEMA filled with generators, and those are generators that could be sent to us...to Maui. And...and also, we...we found out that the airport, Hāna Airport, is able to...we can...we can land a military cargo plane there, a C-130, so we could load that plane up with generators and land it in Hāna. So, you know, these are things that we've already been thinking about, what we would do in the event something like that would occur. In my office there's a lot of what ifs that we go through, a lot of contingency planning that we do, and so...but that's something that we've thought about.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Great. Mahalo, Director. And then my next line of questioning is for Chief Ventura, since you have the Fire on. I know, Chief, we've talked about having more water safety lifeguards here in East Maui, the other thing we've also talked about, and it's on our plan, is to develop more housing units . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . for...for firemen, but we can come back for the next round for your answer. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Getting a foreshadowing of his questions for him. Next up we got Member Sugimura for your three minutes. And...and next round maybe if...if Members feel like we need five minutes, I'm open to a longer duration. Go ahead, Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, I'm just looking at my plan, and I see things that I have questions on, and...

CHAIR PALTIN: If...if you could put the mic closer to your mouth, that would help.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I believe that the situation is what I asked you earlier, that some of this information would...would be nice to be updated or whatever. So, I have no really further questions, it's just that's really what I'm looking at, and within a plan that's 27 years old, we have some work to do for update. Yeah.

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Sugimura.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. So...

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

MS. AOKI: Oh.

CHAIR PALTIN: Go ahead --

MS. AOKI: Chair Paltin? May I?

CHAIR PALTIN: -- Director.

MS. AOKI: So, one thing I just wanted to say is, you know, we all know that these plans are dated. We know that things evolve, we know that priorities change, and you, as a Council, see that every single day. And when you do the budget, when you think about it, you're prioritizing what's happening today. Affordable housing, huge. Houselessness, huge. There's affordable housing provisions in these plans, but there's not a really a lot about homelessness because I...it didn't seem to be as persuasive as it is today, but you're funding that and you're addressing that. So, as much as we want to implement the plans, and we want to do that, we also have to understand that this is one shot in time the day it got adopted. So, things are not static, right, they change. So, that's...that's another answer to your question, Member U'u-Hodgins, is that...that's another reason why because different priorities come up, different things happen in life. So, you may be funding things that are absolutely not in here because it's now. and it's...was 2 years ago, it wasn't 27 years ago. So, just...just a little bit of perspective because that's the reality again. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Do Members feel like three minutes is too short, do we need more time? Can we...should we go flexible and let people go on their own. or do we feel the timer is still needed? I'll...I'll say let's go up to four minutes and see how that goes for this round. Okay. Member U'u-Hodgins?

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you for your comments. I don't disagree with you at all. As I've said before, like I'm from Pā'ia, from Pā'ia, and the demographics have changed for sure in the last few years, especially since this has been done. So, I think one of the things that haven't been completed on the list is to, I guess, address the socioeconomic issues. And like I said, as the demographics have changed, even that list, if it was completed, would be interesting to see because it would not be the same. But I do want to thank you for all of this, it's a lot, and I really appreciate all your hard work. But I wanted to talk stories a little bit about your...I guess it's not yours, but from the previous Planning Director of the December 28th, 2022 document that we have here. So, now that we can talk about not just the Council...I mean the community plans, but on page 5 of 8, we kind...you can kind of go into the SMA stuff, and I find it interesting that it's on here. But anyway, it says in FY 2022, the Department processed 475 SMA exemptions, minor, major, and emergency permits, 5 were major, 108 was minor, 2 were emergency, and that means 360 were SMX. How can we...and SMX is...I mean they range, right, in...in what they include. How can we make the SMA process a little bit quicker, considering a majority of them were already exemptions?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member U'u-Hodgins. So, we recently...the Maui Planning Commission

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

recently adopted new rules for their SMA and shoreline. That...those are going to streamline quite a bit because there's now what we call no needs, or you won't even need to apply, and if you're going to do that, then you can just go and do it. So, that is going to be huge. We also have a next level where it's not quite a no need, but...you don't need to apply for a permit, but we want you to send in a form to at least recognize that you're doing this level of work. And lastly, the State Legislature recently passed, Governor hopefully will sign it, an amendment to 205...205A, so there's additional exemptions that got added on, which is going to be a huge relief to agencies like the Department of Public Works that can build sidewalks now without having to go through...I mean that can trigger a major permit. So, I think the State Leg and here at home, we're seeing ways to try to streamline that. Thank you for that question.

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Thank you. That's what I was looking for. I appreciate that. I'm good. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Next up, Member Cook.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you, Chair. Director, ground altering activities, is that part of the...is...is defining that, is that in that queue of recent administrative changes?

MS. AOKI: Yeah, there's...for the...for the State Leg amendment in 205A definitely because sidewalks do ground alter, but they have determined that they're okay with that, and so, State law is going to allow you, any county, to do that now. So, there were certain actions, not all, so it...it does, but not in all situations.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: So, like County parks, basketball courts, tennis courts, removing the existing surfaces, replacing it in kind, so they're maybe digging four to six inches into the substrate when they're removing it, would that fall within that exemption?

MS. AOKI: It...it could, I'm...I...I don't...I'm not totally sure, so I don't want to say yes or no, but I can tell you that we also work with the Department of Parks and Recreation and Environmental Management, and we've worked on sort of policies, if you will, between us to determine what level of review projects will take or need. But again, this HRS amendment was really big as far as the sidewalks and those kind of things. And then on our...our rules side, you know, you'd think after like a ten-hour meeting at the Planning Commission I'd remember, but I don't. But they're going to be...we're getting everything put together. Once we get all the...the map, there's going to be a shoreline map that's going to go with this, we send it to the County Clerk's Office, it has...for 30 days it has to be there, and then it becomes effective. So, I am hoping that by July these rules will be effective, and that's going to streamline a lot of things. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: One more. Fence posts?

MS. AOKI: Fence posts, I don't know if we got fence posts in there. I think all of us wanted it in there, I'm not sure it passed the muster. It may --

COUNCILMEMBER COOK: Thank you.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

MS. AOKI: -- have.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Members, I...I realize I skipped myself. If you guys don't mind I jump in the line here. I...I didn't want to leave Chief Ventura hanging too much longer. On page 10 of Exhibit 1, reference numbers 20 and 21, it looks like this is in my court because it says propose amendments to the Maui County Code to require developments incorporate defensible space around structures and communities require ongoing maintenance of defensible space. And also, amendments to the Code to require large landowners of...or landowners of large vacant land in high fire areas to prepare and carry out a fuel management plan and ensure it will not impact historic properties. So, I looked on the Westlaw, and I looked at like, you know, the wildfire urban interface, and I haven't seen any kind of legislation that I could copy. I just was wondering, is this something that we should work on together? Or I mean you're the fire expert, and I'm just the politician. Did you have any amendments to propose? Or how...how should we go about...you know, because 2018 and...and all of that, I think this is how these came up in our community plan. So, I just was wondering what you thought about how we...we should move forward.

MR. VENTURA: Thanks for the question. So, the...I think you're right because it's County Code, it's going to take multiple parties to...to address. But as far as our efforts as a Department go--and we do have my Fire Prevention Captain online with us too, he might be able to add if I miss something--but we require all the Fire Code for vacant land to be followed, and normally that kicks in when there's a structure nearby. Grass has to be cleared 30 feet from the nearest structure. However, we also are making a constant attempt to make sure people's properties are what we call fire wise and, you know, more resilient to wildfire. So, part of that on there being accessible online information...again, our social media it's going to be all over it this year. We just put out an article with the news. As far as requiring people, this is outside of the Fire Code to require people with large property to do anything outside of that firebreak area. But if we had historical sites that were, you know, earmarked, or people knew of where the historical sites were, we would be happy to work with the...with the landowner, and do site visits, and try to just give them...give them ways to clear or protect those areas from any type of burn-over, for sure.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. So, maybe try to do a deeper dive on it because I mean I don't want anyone to come back in five years and say you didn't propose an amendment to the Maui County Code. And...and then too, like if I propose it and it doesn't pass, am I off the hook?

MR. VENTURA: I would say yes. Yeah. Because yeah, if it doesn't get voted through the County Code, then it's not our fault for trying, right?

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, yeah. Okay. And then I guess my next question would be for Administrator Andaya. I was wondering if Kapalua Airport could land a C-130 as well?

MR. ANDAYA: Oh, Madam Chair, from my understanding, no. The length...the length of the

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

runway is only 3,000 feet so it's too short, and on top of that the...the thick of the...the thickness of the asphalt is too...it's too thin, so you wouldn't you be able to land a C-130 on . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . that runway. But we can land a...what do you call them, those big helicopters that...you know, so we can sling load supplies over. So, we can use it for that, you know.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Main thing, you got us covered.

MR. ANDAYA: Yes, yes. We can...Chinook. I was trying to think of the name. Those Chinook helicopters, that...the twin rotors, yeah we can land those.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, I...I think seen a Chinook there once when I used to work at Kapalua Airport.

MR. ANDAYA: Yes.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member Kama? I heard the bell, it's your turn.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair, I have no more questions. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member Sugimura? Oh, sorry. Member Rawlins-Fernandez?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Okay. This next question is on the Maui Island Plan. And one of the things that we're working on when we had the tourism management and economic diversification TIG, we...we're looking...oh, the TIG recommended an update to the Maui Island Plan to implement the quality-of-life indicators. So, the Planning Department hired a consultant to do a quality-of-life indicator report to help to, I guess, monitor and report on the quality-of-life indicators in the Maui Island Plan. After the report was done and submitted to the Department on April 2020, I don't think anything more happened with that. Do you have any information that you could share with us on that?

MS. AOKI: Yeah. Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. So, I did have a consultant that approached us and said that they had started working on looking at the indicators, and would we be interested in basically purchasing the work that they've done, and that they would complete it. At the time we were looking at hiring a consultant to really do the full-blown report, and the...the amounts came in really high. So, we got their information. Just as we suspected, there's...there's...there were indicators on there that was there was no data for, and that's what had always been an issue with me because the indicators that are in the report, in the Maui Island Plan, were basically kind of suggestions. So, instead what we've decide...we decided to do, and thanks to your funding, we have hired a...we hired a consultant to do a quality-of-life survey to start that process off, to create the indicators, one that are relevant to Maui, Maui County, to the times, what's going on. And through that, we will then...the next step is to start working on the report based on that quality-of-life survey to determine the indicators, get the data that's available. Because there's no sense having indicators if there's no data to them. So, it's an iterative process...sorry...but Scott has recently met with the

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

consultant that's going to be doing this quality-of-life survey, so hopefully it'll be coming out soon. So, if you are one of those people that gets that telephone call from SMS or, you know, an agency calling you to ask questions, please do the survey.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. So, the survey will be for Maui Island or Maui County?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. It's for the entire County. So, they are definitely doing matrices and metrics to determine how many to reach out to each island.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo. And then will the...so the...the contract for SMS or the consultant, has it been executed, and do you have like a...like an estimated timeline and...of when it should be completed?

MR. FORSYTHE: Yes, Councilmember . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . Rawlins-Fernandez. So, the consultant is Anthology, they are from Honolulu, and the timeline that we are working on with them is that they say that doing a survey before fall is the best time to do it, so kind of late summer is when we're looking at doing the survey. And we're hoping to get the results in, and they would develop a report and get it to us. We're...we're aiming for by the end of the year.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Forsythe. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I just had my follow up for Fire Chief Ventura. As I had mentioned, you know, the community is requesting more water safety and...and lifeguards along the East Maui coastline; however, I understand that having more personnel means that we need to increase our housing units out in East Maui. So, just general, what is the process of...I mean would this be something that the Department would include on their CIP list?

MR. VENTURA: Sure. Thanks for the question. So, a few things we're putting in place, and we don't want to rush too quickly into it, but Ocean Safety is transitioning from eight-hour days to ten-hour days. That was just signed by the Mayor last week, so that's gone through. And so, that's a big transition in Ocean Safety from its past, you know, history. We are going to also be building that tower hopefully out at Pu'u Keka'a, that's still in negotiations with the lawyers on Corp. Counsel and on the Kyo-Ya side. Once those things are established and kind of moving along, I definitely suggest we look at expanding lifeguard services in Hāna. The housing portion of it is basically this. Something similar to the Police Department. When you have employees that work in remote area, you provide housing for them. It's basically a rental. So, we looked at the...what's the available rental market in Hāna, and it's very lean. So, we're not going to build houses for them; however, we would provide a stipend or a payment for them to rent a home. But if there is no home, it's not going to work. So, another model we might look at is something similar to what we discussed in Lāna'i, which would be the lifeguards report to work in Pā'ia and pick up a vehicle every day, and head to Hāna,

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

work throughout the day, and then head back, and they're off duty once they reach Pā'ia. So, for their ten-hour shift, they'd probably be in Hāna for the...the bulk of the...the busy part of the day when the...you know, the winds are up, the surf is up, and the beaches are more active. Because if we can't find housing in Hāna, then we're not going to be able to keep lifeguards out there. As far as the fire side, it's a little bit more unique because we provide the housing at the fire station. You know, we've discussed also in Hāna about increasing the fire station to a six-man crew because of the tanker currently doesn't have a Staff, but that's something else that we'd want to do in the future as well. So, as far as the lifeguard thing goes, we're kind of trying to take it one step at a time and not take on too much. We really want to see...we really want to hire everybody for our vacancies. We still have 22 vacancies. 19 people passed the agility three weeks ago. As soon as we hire this group of people, we're going to get a better idea of how much closer we are to our current finish line, and then we can bump that finish line out and maybe start looking at more remote districts for Ocean Safety officers.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, may apologies, Chief, I...right, we did talk about having the...the driver for the tanker as...as additional...okay. All right. Thank you for that update. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, thank you. So, Chief, opening you mentioned that...or you mentioned that there is planned a...for a fire station in Central Maui. So, is there a location that you're looking at?

MR. VENTURA: Thank you. So, right now, our Wailuku District is our busiest district by far. So, the...the best thing for us and the community would be to somehow bifurcate that district and put an additional fire company in that area. So, what that area looks like is basically from Waiko, Waikapū, Mā'alaea, Maui Lani, Wailuku Heights area, any of that area would work for us as far as what the project is. And the recommended project is not just a fire station, but it's an administrative building with a fire station to include a warehouse for our supply. Now that we're supplying both Ocean Safety and Fire, it's just grow...we've outgrown the spaces that we're in. So, the property that was suggested we look at was the 300-acre parcel off of Waiko that the County currently owns. Of course there's a lot of research that has to be done, and that's kind of what we asked for in FY'24 Budget was some support to do some studies on that property to bring in infrastructure and see if that would be the best location.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, that's...yeah, there's a lot of exciting things happening in this area, so I look forward to supporting you on that. I just wanted to know if it was going to...if you're going to focus on that 300 acres or 100-acre parcels, the 200 acres, and that's where the West Maui...I mean Central Maui Wastewater Reclamation Facility is also targeted for that area, so kind of smart planning. Thank you.

MR. VENTURA: Thank you.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Sugimura. And I will not skip myself this round. My first question on Exhibit 1, page 1 for Administrator Andaya, the two completed projects, I was wondering where could members of the public access those...that information? Develop a post-disaster recovery and reconstruction plan that will ensure Maui's resilience to coastal hazards. Is that on a website, or is it just on the shelf? As well as plan for opening and Staffing the shelters to ensure that facilities are made available at the time of evacuation orders. Is...is there a place that we can look at those plans and...and know where they are?

MR. ANDAYA: Madam Chair, as to the...your second question, if I can answer that first. We do have plans in place. We've been setting up shelters, this...all this time. We've been working with the American Red Cross, we have a system in place, and so, there is a plan in place to...to open up shelters. And we're pretty confident that we can open up shelters in all areas. With respect to your first question, if you could repeat that question again, Madam Chair?

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, yeah. I see that you have...have these plans, I just was wondering if there's a place for the public to...to look at the plan, to know what they are. So, plan for the shelters and a post-disaster recovery and reconstruction plan that will ensure Maui's resilience to coastal hazards. Those are the two completed items for the Maui Island Plan, and I just was wondering, is there a place where the public can access that to...to learn more?

MR. ANDAYA: Madam Chair, we do have a number of plans. We have a recovery plan that's just...just completed, and so, I'm not sure if...there's some plans that we...we don't...we don't have it out to the public, you know, for...for security reasons or, you know, for things like that. And so...but for the most part some of our plans, like for instance the hazard mitigation plan update, that's online, you can find it on our...on our website. But there may be some plans...and I'll have to go back and check what the reasoning could be, but there's some plans that we...we do not publish to the public.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Yeah, just I figure if people know what the plan is, they can get onboard. But yeah, I don't know if those are...are secret plans or what. My next question would be on page 16 for Planning. Action 2.3.4, Action 1, it says it has not begun. Develop tree protection regulations that restrict the removal of vegetation outside of identified building envelopes protected areas. And Director Aoki, I was just wondering, wouldn't this be something that we could just make an item for the Arborist Committee? Is there still an Arborist Committee? Because I thought they deal with trees and...and like they said, this was a...the Maui Island Plan was many years ago, so I'm hoping to target some of those not begun stuff and...and give it to the people who know about trees maybe.

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Madam Chair. Yes, you're always welcome to look. The action items were attached to certain departments, it doesn't necessarily make it correct, so you're going to...there's...there's mistakes in here. Or, you know . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . the Department's got...sorry, let me...if I can finish. You are more than welcome --

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure, sure.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

MS. AOKI: -- to reach out and address action items that haven't been implemented that may not necessarily fall within the department that they're attached to. Don't let that hold you up. It doesn't let us...it doesn't hold up anything anyway, right, because if you have an action item that's attached to, say, an incorrect department, that doesn't mean that it may not get addressed, it's going to get addressed by the correct department. It just gets confusing because then we get called going how come this action is under us, we don't even do that. So, we just have to explain that's the way it's adopted, and we can work with the department that is responsible for it and reflect the correct status.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh. So, Arborist Committee is not under the Planning Department is what you're saying?

MS. AOKI: They are not.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, okay. All right. Well...

MS. AOKI: We don't manage them.

CHAIR PALTIN: Huh?

MS. AOKI: I'm not sure which...if it was Parks or Public Works. I know it got moved around. Is it Parks?

CHAIR PALTIN: We do have an Arborist Committee --

MS. AOKI: Yeah.

CHAIR PALTIN: -- though right?

MS. AOKI: Yeah. Yeah.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

MS. AOKI: I think it fell under Parks Department now...I think.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, okay.

MS. AOKI: It's a commission, yeah.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, commission.

MS. AOKI: So --

CHAIR PALTIN: Arborist Commission.

MS. AOKI: -- I don't know...I don't know who staffs that commission, let me put it that way.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. All right.

MS. AOKI: I know...I know it's --

CHAIR PALTIN: Got it.

MS. AOKI: -- not us, I can tell you that.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. So, this is like our third round, and I haven't given you guys any recess for how hard you guys have been working. So, what do you guys feel like, a 15-minute recess, come back...or roughly come back at 3:45 or something? Staff? Okay. All right. The Committee is in recess until 3:45. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 3:33 p.m.

RECONVENE: 3:46 p.m.

CHAIR PALTIN: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Disaster, Resilience, and International Affairs, and Planning Committee meeting of May 10th return to order. The time is now 3:46, and it looks like we lost a Member. Okay. Going into our next round, Committee Vice-Chair U'u-Hodgins?

VICE-CHAIR U'U-HODGINS: Chair, I have no further questions, but I too am happy to host the departments in my Committee to discuss this as well. But for now, I'd like to thank Planning and Fire and Director Andaya for being here with us today. Thank you, Chair, for hosting us as well.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. And next up we have Member Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. And I too have no questions.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. And then we have Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I still have questions. It's on...I wanted to finish off my questions on the quality-of-life indicators. So --

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- okay, I --

CHAIR PALTIN: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- I found the list. Mahalo, Chair. And it's on...it's in Chapter 9 of the Maui Island Plan if anyone wanted to reference it. And so, Anthology is going to be doing the survey that we heard in my last round. Some of the questions are not calling people and asking them stuff. Like so, some of them are like,

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

you know, how long is your commute from this place to this place. But some of them are...like the...the percentage of infill versus green-fill development, annual transit ridership, percentage of waste that is recycled, cost of living index, amount of dollars spent per year per visitor. So, will Anthology be doing the research on that information?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. No, I should clarify, Anthology is being hired to do a quality-of-life survey. So, we and the consultants will come up with questions for this quality-of-life survey. From those...from that survey and the report that we get back, that will help us generate the indicators. So, those indicators that you...you...or those...those items that you just read off, some of them could be included, there could be new ones. So, it's just a first step to try to help us create indicators that are relevant to the times, relevant to the County, and also being sure that there is data to support those indicators.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo for that clarification. So, some of what is included on Table 9 in Chapter 9 of...oh, Table 9.1, four indicators, that's in Chapter 9 of the Maui Island Plan will be used, but some of them will not be used.

MS. AOKI: That is correct. I...I mean I can't tell you that they...they...I don't know what's going to end up coming out of this, but the idea being that some of them could be used because some of them are good, some of them just aren't relevant or do not have the data.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then...so, for those that are listing, there's three categories. There's the built environment, social environment, and natural environment, and within each there are subcategories...land use, transportation, infrastructure, there's economic development, population, there's cultural heritage, water systems, ocean marine environment, wildlife and natural areas. And so, when the Maui Island Plan was developed, these core indicators were identified as important indicators to determine quality of life on Maui. And I think there's a lot of them that are relevant. Unemployment rate, poverty rate, college bound rate, tons of taro grown and sold, number of new designated heritage and cultural sites. So, after Anthology does this survey and determines some additional indicators to be used in quality-of-life report, will this be done annually?

MS. AOKI: So, to...we'd have to create . . .(timer sounds). . . the monitoring report, that's what...that's what...the quality-of-life survey helps to create the monitoring report. Each community plan actually now calls for a monitoring report. which is why the quality-of-life survey is going to include Lānaʻi and Molokaʻi. In theory, it should be updated every year. I think that's what the...I think that's what it says in...in the report, but the reality, again, of doing that for nine or eight community plans and one Maui Island Plan, I don't know if that's going to happen or not, but we'll do our best.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, I have two more questions regarding this. Can I ask those?

CHAIR PALTIN: Members, is it okay to allow Member...are you guys okay with it? Okay. Go

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. Okay. So, one is. how will these questions be determined for the survey, and can the community provide any input on the questions that will be asked by Anthology?

MR. FORSYTHE: So, right now we're working with Anthology. What we've done is we've provided them the information to indicators. They are going to be assessing them to start developing a range of questions, and for...for some time, there's going to be a little bit of back and forth with the consultant as we kind of formulate and mold the questions that will be going out. I don't believe that there is any plans to have any public involvement in the development of this. The contract itself, I believe is, you know, less than \$25,000 and so, we're not working with a lot here.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And then after that is developed, will...is this all going to be done internally with the Department? Are you going to develop like admin rules? Should the Council put something in the Code? Are you going to need additional funding in the budget? How much would something like this cost annually to monitor?

MS. AOKI: Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. We would be coming back for funding to do the actual monitoring report. It got broken up; we segmented it into two. As I mentioned, we had come before the body for funding for the monitoring report. The bids came in way too high for what we had. And then we took a step back and said you know what? We need a quality-of-life survey first. So, that's why we did that first, and then we'll come back to get funding for the monitoring report. It's a report. There's...there's...admin rules wouldn't need to be adopted for this.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sorry, one last one. So, you...you said the...the survey is 25,000. How much...like the range of the...the proposals --

MS. AOKI: The monitoring?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- for a monitoring report? Yeah.

MS. AOKI: I would say between 200 and...I'd say about 250,000.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Mahalo, Chair. Mahalo, Members.

MS. AOKI: Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. Next up, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Sorry. Yeah, that was all my questions, Chair, but I appreciate the Director's responses, the...and the other departments, and you yourself, Chair, revisiting this topic. Thank you.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Sinenci. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I have no more questions. A lot of appreciation because I know it's a lot of work. So, thank you very much for spending your time with us.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Sugimura. For...for my opportunity, Administrator Andaya, if you're still on the line, I'm on page 3 of Exhibit 1. Ongoing, reference number 27. Identify additional emergency evacuation routes to access West Maui and isolated neighborhoods. I just wanted to make sure that the Princess Nāhi'ena'ena subdivision, Niheu Street, is on your radar as a one-way in neighborhood. And I think that they got...there was supposed to be another way out, but then the bypass happened. And if you recall, the 2018 fire came kind of right up to the Lahainaluna Road, and we're kind of lucky that school wasn't in session. I looked at the maps and it seems like, you know, another driving way out of that subdivision might be difficult. Have you made any progress on identifying a secondary evacuation route out of that neighborhood or subdivision?

MR. ANDAYA: Madam Chair, we...we've been working...with respect to the evacuation routes and all that, we've been working with the Police Department on that. So, they've been, you know, they've been the ones who's been kind of determining what would be the best evacuation out of...out of the area. There's...there's a lot of areas similar to that, these...these neighborhoods where there's only one way in, one way out kind of thing. And so...and that's...that's all over...all over Maui County. And so, we've been kind of looking at all of that and, you know, and trying to determine which...which would be...what will be the plan in the event that that was to occur. You know, I know in that area, there's...there's...where...where it's called Mango Road or something like that. Some...someone...I remember someone talking about that once, you know, using that...that roadway as a possible egress in that area, but I'm not sure if it's in that...in that vicinity with Princess Nāhi'ena'ena School. So, but you know, those are things that we consider.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah. I know there is a shortcut through to Lāhainā Intermediate and...and, you know, walking possibly another alternative way out, but a lot of the residents in there had...had mentioned that they never thought about it, that there's only way one in and one way out of the subdivision until the 2018 fire occurred and they were trying to get out. Or even when we had our community meeting about the one way in and one way out of the new Keawe Street Apartments or the Kaiāulu O Kūku'ia. When we were trying to find a secondary exit for them, they thought about it and said hey, my subdivision only has one way in and one way out too. And so, I just was wondering, if these little subdivisions or neighborhoods or developments have been identified as one way in, one way out, if we can at the least let everyone in that community realize, hey, you're in a development area that has only one way in or one way out, and plan accordingly because you're kind of on your own to some extent. You know, and...and...so, have a plan, make a plan, you know, because that's...that's how we prepare for disasters is the understanding that the County is not going to be able to be everything for everyone. And it was kind of shocking to me that, you know, they'll live

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

there their whole time and...and not even realize that they're in a one way in, one way out, and if an emergency should happen . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . maybe don't jam the entryway with...with cars, you know, or something, have a plan. And so, I was wondering if there's any efforts to...to identify those communities where there's one way in, one way out and...and let them know hey, you're in an area with one way in, one way out, make a plan.

MR. ANDAYA: You know, Madam Chair, that's a very excellent point. And it's not only just those areas, the...you know, like roadways, one way in, one way out, but even people that live near the coast, people that live near rivers, gulches, you know, same thing. I mean and so, it would be difficult to identify all of these different threats and everything. But you're very...it's...you're...you're correct in saying that they should have a plan. Every family should...should know what to do. So, what happens if this river overflows? Or what happens if, you know, this...this emergency occurs? What does my family do? And how do we get out of the...our neighborhood? You know, things like that. So, most definitely they should consider...they should consider like those kinds of threats. In terms of what we can do, I think it's...I think it'd be very difficult to identify every single threat and to...you know, to warn...but we can tell the public, which we have been saying to them, is to be prepared, you know, know what you're going to do in the event of an emergency. Know like how you're going to evacuate, you know, and things like that, so...

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah. I just had brought it up because it is an implementing action in our West Maui Community Plan to identify additional emergency evacuation routes to access both West Maui and isolated neighborhoods. And so, you know, just...just for West Maui, they identified that as a priority, and so, I...I was wondering if...if we had taken...when it says ongoing, like what that means.

MR. ANDAYA: In short, Madam Chair, we're...we're continuing to work with the Police Department in identifying these areas and...and trying to figure out like what...what...what the evacuation route would be.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. All right. Okay. Who needs another round? Everybody all questioned out? Member Rawlins-Fernandez, you look like you got more for us.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I do, but I won't torture everyone.

CHAIR PALTIN: How thoughtful. Okay. Well, I mean I think we...we did end on a pretty good place for the Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning Committee. I just wanted to let you know that the communications log on the website is full of helpful reports that sometimes don't get noticed. These are two of them. There's also like, you know, the Cost of Government report that Michael Williams was like did you guys ever read it? And I just happened to find it on there. And the vulnerability assessment and stuff, and these two great reports were on the communications log. And like Member Kama said, feel free to draft your own transmittal if you have any questions about implementing actions of the Maui Island Plan, Countywide Policy Plan, your own community plans. You know, if...if you feel that any of the implementing actions are no

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

longer relevant, you can always propose legislation. I...I have community plans under my jurisdiction, and I'll be happy to take up any kind of legislation that you want to remove, add, or update in advance. If...I think they quoted Member Sinenci as 12 years out, so if he had some things he wanted to get in there, I'm...I'm happy to entertain legislation if it's a priority to you or entertain legislation to remove it. Let me know, I'm open. Any closing remarks from our resources?

MR. VENTURA: Just mahalo to you guys. I don't want to keep you any longer. Sorry. Just a mahalo to you guys. Thank you, Chair. Appreciate all your guys' hard work and support. We'll be working on all this stuff as usual. Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Chief Ventura. Thank you, Chief Lindo. Thank you, Administrator Andaya. Director Aoki, any parting thoughts or, Administrator Andaya? Parting thoughts?

MR. ANDAYA: Oh, no, just want to thank...just want to thank the...the Committee again for inviting us and to be able to speak to some of these initiatives and all that. And we...we are continuing to do...follow through with these initiatives. And you know, we've...we've...I think we started every single one, we've begun work on every single one, so we do take it seriously. And they're good initiatives, we just have to maybe modify it a little bit to make it more...a little bit more relevant or more pertinent to...to how it is today. So...but thank you very much, Madam Chair, for having us today.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Administrator Andaya. You know, your agency is a shining star. You have no vacancies, and no not begun, so give yourself a pat on the back. Director Aoki, any parting comments or closing remarks?

MS. AOKI: Yeah. Yes, please. Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to thank you for finding these and scheduling them today. As difficult as it is to try to answer all these questions, it keeps us on our toes, and it...it...I appreciate it because there is a lot of hard work that goes into putting the reports together, and I think it's good that the community can see. Like I say, glass half full, half empty, there's a lot of things that yes, haven't been started, but there's a lot of things that have been started, and it's just a good review every year to look over these action items. So, I thank you for that. Thank you to the Members. We look forward to coming back next year.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Yeah, I didn't want you guys to have to do all this hard work and just file it away on some log and, you know, maybe we can get together with Mr. Mayer and do a deeper dive and...and see, you know, some of those things that require legislation. I feel like we gave it a good shot effort, like phasing out the Minatoya List or whatever and...and we came up short, but that doesn't mean we didn't attempt it, you know. So, okay. Well, let me find my notes. Committee Members, if there are no objections, the Chair will defer these two items.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS (excused: TC).

ACTION: DEFER Items 2(2) and 2(3) pending further discussion.

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. This concludes today's Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs, and Planning Committee meeting. Thank you very much, everyone. The time is now 4:07. This meeting is adjourned. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

ADJOURN: 4:07 p.m.

APPROVED:



TAMARA PALTIN, Chair
Disaster, Resilience, International Affairs,
and Planning Committee

drip:min:230510min:mll:ds

Transcribed by: Daniel Schoenbeck

DISASTER, RESILIENCE, INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS, AND PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 10, 2023

CERTIFICATION

I, Daniel Schoenbeck, hereby certify that pages 1 through 46 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 5th day of June 2023, in Kula, Hawai'i

A handwritten signature in black ink, reading "Daniel Schoenbeck", is written over a horizontal line.

Daniel Schoenbeck