HOUSING, HUMAN SERVICES, AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

September 1, 2016

Council Chamber, 8th Floor

- CONVENE: 1:32 p.m.
- **PRESENT:** VOTING MEMBERS: Councilmember Stacy Crivello, Chair Councilmember Gladys C. Baisa, Vice-Chair Councilmember Robert Carroll Councilmember Don Couch Councilmember Don S. Guzman Councilmember Riki Hokama Councilmember Michael P. Victorino (Out 3:04 p.m.)
- **STAFF:** Michele Yoshimura, Legislative Analyst Tammy M. Frias, Committee Secretary

Ella Alcon, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge) Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge) Dawn Lono, Council Aide, Hana Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

ADMIN.: Carol K. Reimann, Director, Department of Housing and Human Concerns Gary Y. Murai, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

Seated in the gallery

Janice Y. Shishido, Deputy Director, Department of Housing and Human Concerns (Item HHT-1(7))

 OTHERS: Jerleen Bryant, Executive Director, Maui Humane Society Jamie Fitzpatrick, Director of Animal and Client Services, Maui Humane Society Mark Wilson, Director of Humane Enforcement, Maui Humane Society Dr. Miyo Kim, Shelter Veterinarian, Maui Humane Society (Item HHT-1(7))
Dr. Lisa Labrecque, Director of Community Spay and Neuter Programs, Maui Humane Society (Item HHT-1(7))
Doris MacFarlane, Chief Financial Officer, Maui Humane Society (Item HHT-1(7))
Keoni Vaughn, Executive Director, Lanai Cat Sanctuary (Item HHT-1(7))
Hoala Davis, Executive Director, Maui Humane Society (Item HHT-1(7))

PRESS: Akaku--Maui County Community Television, Inc.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: ... (gavel)... Good afternoon, Members. Thank you for being here. The meeting of the Housing, Human Services, and Transportation Committee will now

come to order. It is 1:32 p.m. on Thursday, September 1, 2016. I'm calling a brief recess before I go any further. . . . (gavel). . .

RECESS: 1:32 p.m.

RECONVENE: 1:32 p.m.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: ...(gavel)... Thank you. We will reconvene. As I was saying, it is now 1:32 p.m. on Thursday, September 1, 2016. Before we begin, may I please request that we all turn off or silence our cell phones or other noise-making devices. At this time I'd like to introduce our Committee voting Members. Committee Vice-Chair Gladys Baisa, thank you for being here.

VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Our Councilmember Bob Carroll.

COUNCILMEMBER CARROLL: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Good afternoon. Councilmember Don Couch.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Aloha. Councilmember Don Guzman.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: And, of course, Councilmember Mike Victorino.

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Aloha and good afternoon, Chair.

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: And Councilmember Riki Hokama. Thank you. We have a full quorum. Thank you very much for being here. At this time, I'd like to introduce our Administration representatives, Director of Housing and Human Concerns, Carol Reimann.
- MS. REIMANN: Good morning...oh, good afternoon.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Good afternoon. I'm not sure if you have other members of your office here, but at this time, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Gary Murai.

MR. MURAI: Good afternoon, Madam Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: And, of course, our diligent Committee Staff, Tammy Frias, Committee Secretary and Michele Yoshimura, Legislative Analyst. Thank you for being here, ladies. Members, we have two items on the agenda today, so we'll get started with

September 1, 2016

public testimony. Assisting us this afternoon from the Hana District Office is Dawn Lono.

- MS. LONO: Good afternoon, Chair. This is Dawn Lono at the Hana Office.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Aloha, Dawn. From our Molokai District Office is Ella Alcon.
- MS. ALCON: Good afternoon, Chair. This is Ella Alcon on Molokai.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Aloha, Ella. And from the Lanai District Office is Denise Fernandez.
- MS. FERNANDEZ: Good afternoon, Chair. This is Denise Fernandez on Lanai.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Aloha, Denise. As far as to, for public testimony, for individuals who will be testifying in the Chamber, please sign up at the desk located in the 8th floor lobby just outside the Chamber door. If you will be testifying from the remote testimony locations specified on the meeting agenda, please sign up with the Council Staff at that location. Testimony will be limited to the item listed on the agenda today. Pursuant to the rules of the Council, each testifier will be allowed to testify for up to three minutes per item, with one minute to conclude if requested. When testifying, please state your name and the name of any organization you are representing. Do we have any testifiers in the Chamber?
- MS. FRIAS: No, Madam Chair.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: I'm just gonna double-check again with our District Office. Ms. Lono, is there anyone wishing to provide testimony from Hana?
- MS. LONO: There is no one in the Hana Office waiting to testify.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Ella, is there anyone wishing to provide testimony from the Molokai District Office?
- MS. ALCON: There's no one here on Molokai waiting to testify.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Ms. Fernandez, is there anyone wishing to provide testimony from the Lanai District Office?
- MS. FERNANDEZ: There is no one waiting to testify at the Lanai Office.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Members, if there are no objections, I'm gonna close testimony because we have no one here in the gallery nor in our District Offices.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you.

ITEM HHT-1(7): PRESENTATION ON RESOURCES AND SERVICES PROVIDED BY THE COUNTY'S ANIMAL MANAGEMENT PROGRAM, DEPARTMENT OF HOUSING AND HUMAN CONCERNS

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: We will look at on our agenda, HHT-1(7). Pursuant to Rule 7(B) of the Rules of the Council, the Committee intends to receive a presentation from representatives from the Animal Management Program, Department of Housing and Human Concerns, on topics such as resources and services available through the County for animal care, feral animal matters, and other related services. So what we'll have today is presentation on resources and services provided by the County's Animal Management Program, Department of Housing and Human Concerns. The Committee may receive a presentation from the Maui Humane Society and other service providers and discuss related matters. No legislative action will be taken, Members. At this time, I'd like to ask if the Department of Housing and Human Concerns have any comments before we introduce our panelists?
- MS. REIMANN: Thank you, Chair. Yes, we have some opening remarks. So pursuant to Title 6 of the Maui County Code in Section 711-1109 of the Hawaii Revised Statutes regarding the shelter, care and prevention of cruelty to old, homeless, abandoned, sick or injured animals, the Maui County is mandated to establish and maintain animal management shelter and supplemental program services. For Fiscal Year 2017, the Maui County Council has appropriated the Department of Housing and Human Concerns' budget a total of \$1,684,946 for the Animal Management Program. Funding was awarded to the following agencies to accomplish the proposed services. The Maui Humane Society receives \$863,255 for animal sheltering, to accept animals such as stray, abandoned or victims of neglect or cruelty. The Lanai Animal Rescue receives \$15,000 to assist and support the community and increase the value and perception of cats through intervention, collaboration and humane population management of Lanai's homeless feral cats. The Molokai Humane Society receives \$137,634 to keep the large population of stray and feral animals off the streets of Molokai by preventing unwanted litters through spay and neutering and strengthening the bonds between the people of Molokai and animals through education, advocacy and humane sheltering and veterinary care of animals. In addition, request for proposals were solicited for the animal enforcement and spay/neuter programs. Grant funding was awarded to the Maui Humane Society as follows: for the Animal Enforcement Program, \$569,057 for the enforcement of laws and regulations governing animal control; for the Spay/Neuter Program, \$100,000 was awarded to promote the availability and provide a no-cost spay/neuter service for Maui County animals, cats, dogs and feral cats. We are here to answer any questions. Along with me is our Deputy Director, Jan Shishido. Thank you very much.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you, Director. As our Director Carol Reimann stated, this afternoon we have representatives from the Department of Housing and members of the Maui Humane Society, Molokai Humane Society and Lanai Cat Sanctuary in attendance. All of these agencies are grant recipients as you've heard of County funds and provide animal related services throughout the community. So joining us this

afternoon, I will, I'd like to introduce the Executive Director of the Maui Humane Society and she'll introduce her staff and her experts on the different programs. Thank you for being here.

- MS. BRYANT: Thank you. . . . (turns on mic). . . Okay, better. Thank you, Committee Chair Crivello and Council Committee Members. Thank you so much for having us. We really appreciate the opportunity to come in today and share some more information about Maui Humane Society and the services and programs that we offer. I also very much appreciated the opportunity to bring in some of my key staff. Over the last couple years since I took over at the shelter you've heard me speak about Maui Human Society several times so I thought it was great that we could mix it up a little bit today and that my staff had the opportunity to speak to you directly about the services and programs that they directly oversee. I also want to take this opportunity to thank you for awarding Maui Humane Society, the spay and neuter RFP. That was very much appreciative...appreciated and very forward thinking and because of this, we are now able to offer our community a service that really targets the people who needed it the most and that, instead of coupons for spay and neuter, it means free spay and neuter. So there should be no more barriers, no more excuses. So I'll just take a moment and introduce my staff and think I've asked them to keep their overview brief and I wasn't sure how much time they would have, but of course, we So first here next to me is our Director of Humane welcome any questions. Enforcement, Mark Wilson, and he has been at the shelter with us now over a couple of years and came to us with over 30 years of human enforcement experience, so we were happy to have him. And next to him is Dr. Lisa Labrecque and she is our Director of Community and Spay/Neuter Programs. So she is the one who directly oversees the Maui County RFP Spay and Neuter Grant. So and next to her, I have to look there, is doctor, oh, and Dr. Lisa joined us just this year in February so we were really--too close?--really happy to have her. And then next to her is Dr. Miyo Kim and she is Director of Veterinary Services at the shelter and she's been with us over 20 years now, so we appreciate her very much. And then, last but certainly not least is Jamie Fitzpatrick. She's our Director of Animal and Client Services. She's been with us at the shelter now I think over 3 years and came to us from Oregon with over 10 years of animal sheltering experience, so she brings a wealth of knowledge with her to the shelter and we really benefit from that. So thank you and again, we welcome any questions that you might have and I don't know if we want...
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: I'd like at this time, Ms. Bryant, introduce our other members from, you know, we have a unique County. We're separated by waters and we do have with us today from Lanai, the Executive Director, Mr. Keoni Vaughn. Am I saying that right? Keoni Vaughn, for on behalf of the Lanai Cat Sanctuary, and from the island of Molokai, we have the Executive Director, Hoala Davis, for the Molokai Humane Society, thank you for being here this afternoon. Really appreciate your presence and hopefully we can hear, get an overview from you, both of you, also. So at this time, Ms. Bryant, we'll just have your presentation and overview from your members and staff. Thank you.
- MS. BRYANT: Okay. I think, Jamie, we're gonna start with you.

September 1, 2016

- MS. FITZPATRICK: Hello. Hi. My name is Jamie Fitzpatrick and I'm the Director of Animal and Client Services for the Maui Humane Society. I oversee our customer service, our animal care and our adoption teams at the shelter. So that's a big chunk of our And our customer service team, we handle all animal intakes that operations. includes strays, pets surrendered by their owners and also animals who are coming into the shelter receiving end-of-life services, families who are bringing their pets in for owner requested euthanasia or cremation services. Last fiscal year, this included just under 8,000 animals that were received into the shelter. And what that looks like for us is an average of 22 animals coming in the doors every day, each and every day all year. That, to give you a little percentages on that, that's 55 percent of those animals are cats, 30 percent are dogs and 15 percent are others, like rabbits, birds, wildlife. other domestic pocket pets, anything like that. Our customer service team also handles the issuing of dog licenses and coordinating efforts to get animals returned to their owners through tracking identification leg licenses or microchips and also searching our lost and found reports that are submitted by customers who are missing pets. Our animal care team focuses on meeting the daily needs of animals who are in care in the shelter and at max capacity, that might be up to 200 animals at the facility at a time. So our animal care team is primarily responsible for meeting their needs and seeing to their basic care. Our adoption team focuses on marketing our animals, both in our facility and online, to help maximize our life-saving efforts. We also coordinate transfers to other organizations, whether it's to other government agencies like DLNR when we get in wildlife who they would oversee or transferring of adoptable animals to other organizations who help find more homes than our community can find homes for. At Maui Humane Society, we care about the challenges that are prevented [sic] by free-roaming feral cats and we have a dedicated staff member who serves as the community liaison to assist community members to get them information and resources to help them mitigate the impact of these populations. Even in just my department we do so much more than those quick highlights we've just been over, but I do want to make sure I stay in time and pass the mic on down and I'm happy to answer questions at any time.
- MS. BRYANT: Okay. Thank you, Jamie. I think next we have, Mark, if you wouldn't mind giving us an overview on humane enforcement department.
- MR. WILSON: Thank you. Good afternoon, Chamber Members. My name is Mark Wilson. I am the Director of Humane Enforcement at Maui Humane Society. In my department we have nine people assigned to it, one director, seven officers, one of which is a supervisor, one dispatcher coordinator. We have combined experience in my department of 42 years of law enforcement, 63 years of humane enforcement. Three officers have completed academy training and 4 are scheduled to complete their second phase this year. We have 3 certified cruelty investigators and 1 equine investigator. We have island-wide responsibility and we respond to calls 24 hours a day, 7 days a week, 365 days a year. Four days a week we have 2 officers and 1 dispatcher working during the day and 1 nightshift officer. Three days a week there's 1 officer working and 1 dispatcher working during the 3 days, we have to pull an officer off the road

to staff the phones and dispatch. Officers patrol and respond to all calls in Central Maui, Upcountry and Kihei in that order. Due to staffing levels, Lahaina and Hana are call-based responses, generally emergencies only. We will respond to Lanai if the public calls in and they've captured or they have an animal that they need to turn over to us.

- MS. BRYANT: Lahaina?
- MR. WILSON: I'm sorry, Lahaina.
- MS. BRYANT: Lahaina, okay.
- MR. WILSON: We will respond to Hana, also, if there is an emergency, even though we don't have an officer down there, we will go down for an emergency. Our officers drive over 65,000 miles a year. Our department receives over 400 calls from the public. Our officers handle an additional 500...
- MS. BRYANT: Sorry, 400 calls each week.
- MR. WILSON: No, our department receives over 4,000 calls from the public per year. Our officers handle an additional 5,500 officer-initiated calls. These are follow-ups. proactive on-view violations and beach and park patrols. That's over 790 calls a month that these officers are handling. My department carries over no less than 25 to 30 open cases from month to month as a department. Due to staffing levels, 13 percent of a non-emergency or non-immediate calls may not be handled that same day, it'll be handled the next day or possibly later. The services we offer is to the public from my department, we investigate reported animal crimes, such as cruelty, neglect cases, dogs off leash, inhumane living conditions which include adequate or inadequate shelter, food, water, vet care, tie-outs and entanglements, aggressive dogs, dog attacks and licensing. We also offer welfare checks to, from concerned neighbors. We locate/return lost pets. We pick up trapped dogs from the public and trapped cats from government agencies. We provide emergency services in the field for injured animals. We pick up stray, domesticated animals. We pick up deceased dogs and cats from our roadways, as well as remove them from private property. Our officers will accept all surrendered animals in the field. Thank you.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you.
- MS. BRYANT: Thank you, Mark. Dr. Kim?
- MS. KIM: Aloha. Good afternoon, Council Chair and Councilmembers. My name is Miyo Kim and I'm the Director of Veterinary Services at the Maui Humane Society. I've been there for little over 20 years as Jerleen said. And my department provides the medical needs for the animals at the shelter. We evaluate all animals that are entering the shelter. We will do health exams which would include necessary vaccinations, wormings for internal parasites, treatment for external parasites, such as fleas and ticks, and laboratory tests such as checking for heartworms. All our adopted animals

September 1, 2016

are spayed and neutered and also receive a microchip before leaving the shelter. If animals are found to have medical issues, then we will address them. Many animals receive daily medication and care for their conditions by my staff. We make every attempt to have our animals leave the shelter healthier than when they entered so they can have a fresh start in their new home. We also provide complimentary medical rechecks on all adopted animals within their first two weeks of adoption. We attend to all injured and sick animals that might be brought to the shelter, providing hospitalization and supportive care as needed. Some of these are reclaimed by their owners and they would be then taken to their own private vet for follow-up care. But unfortunately, the majority of them are not reclaimed so then we would provide follow-up care in our hospital and we have our own privately funded programs to help provide for this. These can range from simple wound care of, and infections to major surgeries. We're a hardworking, dedicated group of professionals that truly believe in what we do. We are committed to improving the lives of the animals in Maui County. Thank you.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you.

- MS. BRYANT: Thank you, Dr. Kim. Dr. Lisa?
- MS. LABRECQUE: How's that? Okay. Hi. I'm Dr. Lisa Labrecque. I'm the newest director at Maui Humane Society. I started on February 1st of this year. My position is the Director of Community Spay/Neuter Programs. I'm trained in high quality, high volume spay/neuter surgery and I was hired to oversee the spay/neuter services at the Humane Society for the community at-large, rather than the shelter animals. These services are provided both in our clinic five days a week as well as at our outside MASH clinics that you may have heard about that have been going on since April of 2015. We have had 10 clinics so far and 4,356 animals have been spayed and neutered at those clinics alone. Thanks to the recent funds from you all-thank you so much--we are now able to provide free spay/neuter every day in our clinic to the community. With this grant, we expect to spay and neuter 1,538 animals this fiscal year. In addition to that we have other private grants that allow us to do spay/neuter. We are undergoing an expansion right now of our veterinary facility at the Humane Society so that we can offer even more spay and neuter and help the community more over the coming year. We have some other grant applications in the works as well to provide additional funding for community spay/neuter and thanks to all of this as Jerleen said earlier, we are now able to provide free spay/neuter for any dog or cat in Maui County and that is huge. It's a very exciting time. It's exciting for me to be part of such a progressive organization that's committed to reducing overpopulation and is committed to working with the community to take the lead in animal welfare in Maui County. Thank you.

MS. BRYANT: Thank you. Thank you, Dr. Lisa.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Do you have anything else to add, Ms. Bryant?

September 1, 2016

- MS. BRYANT: I'm really proud of my team and that we have made, you know, prior to a couple of years ago when we made our big changes at the shelter, the Humane Society was doing a good job and I never want to make it seem like it wasn't. It was. It's just that with new leadership comes new perspective and fresh eyes and we took a close hard look at our agency and how effective we were being and we knew we could do better. And that was in 2014 and since then, we haven't left anything on the table and we're trying every day and evaluating our systems, our policies, our protocols and we're not complacent. We want the community to be proud of their Humane Society. I think they should be, and once again, I want to thank this Council for your support.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. And from our outside districts of Lanai, I'd like to ask Mr. Vaughn to give us an overview of the Lanai Cat Sanctuary.
- MR. VAUGHN: Thank you, Chair, Committee Members. My name is Keoni Vaughn. I'm the Executive Director for the Lanai Cat Sanctuary and I'd like to extend a special mahalo for supporting our organization throughout the years. And currently this year, \$15,000 grant has really helped us continue to do what we do. We are the only animal welfare organization on the island. We provide a humane solution to the feral cat problem. Our work benefits not only cats, but also native endangered birds on island. Our work also benefits the entire community. So whether you're a cat lover, cat hater or a conservationist, we are removing approximately 150 cats a year off of the landscape and Maui County helps us do this. We are a small staff of 4, managing the needs of 501 cats every day of the week. Yes, it's challenging. In addition to our, your grant, day trippers from Maui and other tourists play a big role in helping us find, excuse me, helping us fund what we do. For the first 6 months of this year, we've had over 3, excuse me, 1,300 visitors. We get very little financial support from local Lanai residents, so we have come to rely on donations from visitors to the island as well as your grant. We have gained the attention from other local animal welfare agencies as well as national ones such as the Humane Society of the United States and Best Friends Animal Society. We have also been recognized by conservationists like the American Bird Conservancy and have been in discussions recently with the State Department of Land and Natural Resources. I'd encourage each of you to stop by and visit us one day soon, and thank you very much.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. And from our Molokai office, our Molokai Humane Society, the Executive Director, Hoala Davis. Thank you for being here, Hoala.
- MS. DAVIS: Thank you. Aloha and thank you for the opportunity to speak before you today. My name is Hoala Davis and I am the Executive Director of the Molokai Humane Society. We are a small organization. There are five staff members and, you know, congratulations to the Maui Humane Society. I am kind of overwhelmed with what they've, you know, achieved over the last few years. Our goal has always been spay and neuter. That's our number one priority. Last year we did about 560 spay and neuter surgeries and we only had a veterinarian for half the year. So our goal this year is to double that. We keep our services at 30 and \$20 for dogs and cats, respectively and that is with the funding from the County of Maui. And we've also incorporated free to low-cost clinics which are, it's pricing based on a first come, first

September 1, 2016

serve basis for cat surgeries once a month and that allows people to get free surgeries so that there isn't any financial burden for community cats. Our goal this year is to target the larger population of unowned cats in the community and we are gonna be hosting some large scale spay and neuter clinics as well later this year. We're also incorporating a free vaccine clinic, four of them that we're going to be holding this year to alleviate the risk of spreading disease which is also matched by a donation that's allowing us to provide free flea and tick preventatives to the community and hopefully these two together will be incentives also for our spay and neuter programs and will assist with community outreach. We are also shifting a larger focus to education this year. We've always gone out into the elementary schools and focused on that age group. This year we're providing more trainings to targeted groups such as our hunting communities which would bring in both, you know, groups like the Nature Conservancy as well as subsistence hunters and with that we're going to stress the importance of spay and neuter as well as proper animal care. And then one of the biggest add on this year that we're able to provide to the community is support for our animal control officers. Animal control is a separate entity from the Maui or, I'm sorry, the Molokai Humane Society, but what we found is that it's difficult to place animals into forever homes when they are sick, when they're malnourished, when they have been coming from either abandoned, neglected or abusive households and we are able to provide the support and care and medication that they need to be placed into, you know, forever homes. And hopefully, that will also limit the burden of us having to transport animals off-island and send them here to Maui and beyond. And none of these things would be available to Molokai without the support from Maui County, so thank you so much.

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you, Hoala. Members, you've heard our panelists and all the wonderful services that our Humane Societies are providing for our animal world. So at this time, I'd like to open up the floor for Committee Members, if you have any questions or comments. Ms. Baisa?
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Thank you very much, Chair. And thank you to the panelists. I appreciate your being here. I'm just curious listening to all of you. Are any of you dealing with animals besides cats and dogs?

MS. FITZPATRICK: Chair?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Panel, yes?

MS. FITZPATRICK: Yeah, at the Maui Humane Society, about 15 percent of our intake is made up of non-cats and dogs. The majority of that's gonna be domestic like pocket pets, rabbits, guinea pigs, parakeets, love birds, those guys, little bit of livestock and little bit of wildlife.

VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Wow. Anybody else got any? No.

MS. DAVIS: So on Molokai for spay and neuter, we also provide for rabbits. And then we also have outside programs beyond what animal management covers, but we are

working with everything on island from large animals, livestock, tortoises, birds, whatever comes in.

VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Wow.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you.

MR. VAUGHN: On Lanai we recently changed our name. We were formerly called the Lanai Animal Rescue Center and that's simply because the founder Kathy Carroll when she first founded it had the vision of kind of handling all animals on Lanai. But over time, the focus has been on cats, so to answer your question, we only deal with cats now and we have since changed our name to reflect that.

VICE-CHAIR BAISA: And who deals with dogs?

- MR. VAUGHN: So there's a animal warden on the island so the Maui Police Department is responsible for that.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Oh, okay. One more question, Chair?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Yes, Ms. Baisa.

- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Do you see the problem of a lot of animals running loose or, you know, all over the place, growing or is it staying pretty steady? Jerleen, maybe you have a good idea?
- MS. BRYANT: Thank you. Well, Jamie can speak to our stray numbers. As far as our intake numbers at the Humane Society, we see them thankfully gradually decreasing. We, I guess, probably would associate that with our aggressive spay and neuter efforts and the efforts that have been going on over the years. But, Jamie, I don't know if you have percentage of what animals come in as stray or not?
- MS. FITZPATRICK: For dogs, still up over half of the dogs were coming into the shelter arriving as strays and for cats, it's vastly more than 50 percent, it's a much higher percentage of the cats who are coming in are strays.
- MS. BRYANT: And, thank you, Jamie. So you'll probably notice as you drive around that you don't see a lot of dogs crossing the street and running all, you know, you don't see...if our intake is about 7,500, you're not going to see thousands of animals running around throughout the year. And that's because we have quick response with humane enforcement, and I don't know, Mark, if you have any comments that you want to add, because it's his officers that would be going out and picking up those stray animals and bringing them into the shelter. Mark, is it...

VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Trying to get the mic to work.

MS. BRYANT: Yes.

- MR. WILSON: As my panel knows and our shelter knows that I'm death on leash law. If I could get more people conforming to the leash law here on Maui, our numbers would drop, deceased animals, strays, injured, all that would drop. Last year, last fiscal year, we picked up 524 stray animals. Now that is actually a decline over the last two years. Of the injured animals we picked up it was 154, which is also a decline and only 50 of deceased dogs off the road. So we're showing a definite decline as our mileage and our patrol hours are going up in the community.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: That's wonderful that we don't have the stray dogs. You mentioned something that I was going to ask and, Chair, last one. Who is responsible for animals that are injured or probably killed along the side of the road?
- MR. WILSON: If it's an injured animal normally a dog or a cat on the road, the Humane Society handles that. For non-dogs and cats, depending on which roadway, if it's a County roadway, then County roads picks it up or the State Highway Department picks it up. If it's an injured, we're going to pick it up unless it's wildlife and we're not equipped for wildlife pickup, and then DLNR takes care of that. But for actual deceased animals on the road that's not a dog or a cat, either County roads or State Highways.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: So those are where people should call if they run into one? You know, we travel the road. I travel up and down Haleakala Highway every day and I'm always on the road. I'm a real roadrunner and you see deceased animals and you'll see them and they're there and they're there and they're there and they're run over and then they're there and it kinda makes you feel really bad, I mean, every time you have to see this and I don't know if everybody knows who to call to have it picked up.
- MR. WILSON: We get most of the calls, I'd say 99 percent of the calls we get, if it goes to Police Department, it gets transferred over to us and then we will refer them or call, generally what we do is we just call the County or the State ourselves and let them know that the animal is out there and I have no idea what the response time is for that.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Well, thank you very much. I think it's a good thing, Chair, for the public to hear so that they know more or less if they see one, who to call. Because, you know, it's not fun, particularly if it happens to be your pet to see that, you know. It's just so sad.
- MS. BRYANT: Chair?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Yes, Ms. Bryant?

MS. BRYANT: Thank you. I just wanted to add one thing, that not all strays are picked up from our enforcement department. We do have concerned citizens in the community who do pick up the strays and bring them in. And then we have the ability to receive them 24 hours a day. And then one other thing, I apologize, I was remiss earlier. I do

have one other Director here today and that is my Director of Finance and that's Doris MacFarlane and so if there's any questions regarding budget allocations, something like that, Doris is here and she can help answer that.

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you for being here, Ms. Farlane [*sic*]. Sorry, you're hidden behind us. Members, any more questions or...
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: The person with the money is the power, she's sitting in the back.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Like our Budget Chair.

VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Mr. Couch?

- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Madam Chair. First of all, Ms. Fitzpatrick, you said pocket pet? What is a pocket pet and why are they called them that?
- MS. FITZPATRICK: Pocket pets are the endearing term for those domestic animals that are typically your caged pets, so your guinea pigs, your rabbits --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Oh.

- MS. FITZPATRICK: --those little guys. It's endearing.
- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: And I don't know who would be responsible for this one, but you have a, I've heard a lot of discussion about people who don't want their animal neutered or spayed. How do you handle that and are there other locations that require that? Whoever wants to...
- MS. KIM: Yes, we do have a few. We try to educate people first of all to explain that there's a lot of medical benefits to getting your animal fixed. There's also some alternatives, we have sometimes men that don't want their dogs neutered and there is alternative sterile, chemical sterilization that is available. Most of all, I think, we would just really emphasize the education. There's so many reasons why that they should spay and neuter, and I kind of wanted to add to I know Ms. Baisa's question about just the stray animals. A few years ago, we had a special initiative where we went out into Hana and we offered free spay/neuter, free microchipping and free vaccinations for the animals there. We did that for about two years and we watched our statistics on animal intake and it was amazing how much it dropped. It literally dropped for cats like over 60 percent of intake of cats from Hana over, as soon as we started the program. And I think it was more than just the spay/neuter. I think it was when we started to provide for their animals, I think people took more pride in them and had

September 1, 2016

more responsibility for them. And when we would go out on subsequent trips, we had a lot of people that would just stop by and say, you know, we used to always have dogs come and bother our cats or bother our house and now we don't, you know, we don't have that problem anymore. So, I think that spay/neuter also is so important in helping just the whole stray animal population. And I wish we had a, one thing that could really help in enforcing more of the spay/neuter is a lot of places have laws that make higher differential licensing for spay/neutered animals that can really encourage people to spay/neuter. In other words, your, like we right now, I think it's only \$7 if your animal is fixed and I'm not sure, 31. But there's some counties that you might have to pay 120 if your animal is, it's a higher price if you're gonna have a breeding animal. And oftentimes that's enough to convince people that oh, it's cheaper for me to just fix than, rather than pay that higher price. So it's called differential licensing and sometimes that helps.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: So we do have the differential licensing right now --

MS. KIM: We do.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --but it's just not enough?

MS. KIM: It's not enough. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: I'm sure our Budget Chair would love to have more.

MS. KIM: It's income.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Well you had mentioned about education. You have somewhat of a platform right now --

MS. KIM: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: -- is there something that you can tell people --

MS. KIM: Yes, oh, yes.

- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --that would be watching because there's a lot of people that do watch this.
- MS. KIM: Yes, oh there's many reasons, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: So ...

MS. KIM: So, okay. So, for females, if you spay and neuter your dog less than, before they come into their first heat, you basically eliminate any chance of breast cancer. Once they've come into heat, then there's a higher risk for breast cancer and that's the most common cancer of female dogs. For male dogs, well, actually any dog, you get a lot of roaming, a lot of dogs hit by car are out there because they're roaming and they're

roaming because they're either in heat or they're smelling a dog in heat and the hormones are really strong. Dogs will do anything to get out of even a fenced area to go in search of a female in heat or you know, if they're a female in heat, they will go out themselves, too. So, it, just having them fixed really minimizes the amount of roaming that dogs will do and that saves a lot of lives 'cause it's really horrible like Ms. Baisa said, you know, to find animals --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah.

- MS. KIM: --hit by a car on the side of the road. There are, let's see...
- MS. BRYANT: Aggressive behaviors.
- MS. KIM: Oh, yes, aggressive behaviors, there's a lot of dog fighting and cats, too. If you neuter a male cat, they will tend to stay close to home and they won't fight as much. There are a lot of diseases of cats, feline leukemia and feline immunodeficiency virus. These are often spread by fighting. We find the highest incidence of feline immunodeficiency virus or FIV in unneutered male cats, because they are spread by fighting and they are the ones that are the primary ones fighting out there.
- MS. LABRECQUE: Pyometra.
- MS. KIM: Oh, yes. If you do not...thank you, you put me on the spot. If you have a female dog and they are more mature, like over five years and up, usually they are not meant to be bred by that time and there is a very high incidence of pyometra or infection of the uterus. We see a large percentage of that. Even routinely, on a routine spay, people will bring their animal for a routine spay, we'll open them up and their uterus will be filled with pus. And they don't even know that the animal was sick until we talk to them and they say, oh, you know, we notice they were feeling a little poorly or we'll get the call from someone that says, I just took my dog to the vet, it's going to cost me \$2,000 'cause they said my dog's got a pyometra, can you help me? And that's a emergency pyometra because sometimes if you let it go, it'll rupture and you'll have a abdomen full with pus. So, yes, you definitely want to, if you're not, if your dog is not gonna be a breeding dog, there's no reason to not fix them because you will end up with a pyometra. We have a lot of people that will say, well, my dog's too old, they're not gonna get pregnant. They can get a pyometra and I've seen some old dogs get pregnant and when they're that old, like 12 years old and pregnant, it's a real toll on them so, yeah, there's so many health benefits to having your animals fixed.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay.

MS. KIM: Thanks for asking.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Well, that's good that everybody out there...

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Mr. Vaughn would like to respond to your question, also.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Sure, go ahead.

MR. VAUGHN: I wanted to comment on what's kind of going on Lanai and to answer both questions. So our organization's relatively new. It started in 2004 and roughly from 2004 to about 2013, there were about 1,500 cats that were spayed and neutered on the island. And at the time, the organization didn't have the resources to be able to house them all, so we were spaying and neutering and releasing. In 2013, we made a big organizational shift and decided not to return cats to where we either got them from or where they came from. And as far as I know, I think we're the only organization that has done that. And we made that shift primarily because of the native birds and endangered species on the island. So what we've done is we, every cat that is brought to us and every cat that is trapped, we also work with the island's natural resources department and they bring cats to us. We agree that we will not release the cat. So what we had to do this past year is basically extend or expand our facility. So we were 15,000 square feet from 2009 to about well, December, November, December of 2015 and we just expanded to 25,000 square feet. We are at 501 cats right now and our capacity we're thinking it as about 575 and we are, have, making plans now for a second expansion. So it's a whole different shift. You'll hear a lot about feral cat feeders and colony caregivers and whatnot. It's really different on Lanai. I spend a lot of time dealing with the few feeders that are left. For example, there's an area called the Community Gardens. Over the past year, we have brought in over 100 cats from these gardens and that's simply because of the unmanaged colonies that were happening. So we were able to make that connection with the feeder and, you know, convinced them to allow us to bring the cats into our care, so, just a little different dynamic. Thank you.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Mr. Couch?

- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you. Thank you for that information, you guys, that's really good stuff. Now comes the hard part. You have a feral program for feral cats. I'm assuming there aren't that many feral dogs, although we've heard some stories --
- MS. BRYANT: That's correct. Yeah, that's correct.
- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --about feral dogs. But we also have a lot and a lot of feral chickens and I thought we had put some money in the budget at one time and I cannot remember for a feral chicken program. It was, it may have been discussed and got removed or...
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: It was just talked about, yeah.
- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. What, if there was any funding for a feral chicken program, what kind of things would you do or is it something that you guys don't want to tackle at this point?
- MS. BRYANT: Wow, okay.

September 1, 2016

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: It's a hard one.

- MS. BRYANT: There's not, I don't have a quick or easy answer to that. At one point a couple of years ago, we attempted to try to find a feral chicken expert to come to Maui to do an analysis on the feral chicken population with possible...what's the word I'm trying to think of, possible ways to control the population and diminish it. We were unsuccessful at finding that individual and we tried hard. And what I do know is it would take a lot. It would...I mean, to give an example. Here's one example. The, you know, I'm not sure how many feral chickens there are on this island, I don't know. There's a lot. I don't know if anybody has even a guess as to how many, but I did meet with an individual who was an expert chicken trapper because it's not like trapping cats or dogs, right? And there's only certain times of day that you are successful in trapping because the chickens roost and you have to watch your traps because if you leave them, they're vandalized. I mean, we have that problem unfortunately when we put traps out for, to catch some of the stray dogs that we are having a hard time catching. Our traps are vandalized if we're not, oh, yeah, absolutely, if we're not watching them. So the chicken expert explained to me that, you know, there's only couple times a day that, a couple times of the day that you're successful in trapping and he has to watch the traps. So it was a lot of information and I said, what, on a good day, how many chickens can you catch in one day, how many feral chickens? And he said, maybe, 30. And that would be, so I looked at, okay, what if I had 1 person full-time doing nothing but trapping feral chickens, it wouldn't make a dent and that's the information that I can share today. I don't have, it would take a lot more research and I don't, is there anyone here from my team that has anything to add to the feral chickens? No?
- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Well, and this, and one of the reasons I ask is because on my way home over by the old Suda Store, there's somebody who actually feeds feral chickens and there were hundreds, literally hundreds in that dirt area back there and she was just feeding them. Is there, are there any restrictions on that or should there be restrictions on that? What would you guys recommend? Because we can always make laws, but if you can't enforce them...
- MS. BRYANT: Exactly. Thank you for recognizing that.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: No recommendations?

- MS. BRYANT: This is the hot seat today, I think. I don't have any recommendations because it does, every, there's consequences to every, anything that we would put out there and it would take enforcement and we are stretched thin truly, doing a good job with the incredible number of calls that we receive. I can't imagine if we were responsible for...yeah. Mark, do you have anything you want to add about feral chickens?
- MR. WILSON: We get feral chicken calls all the time. My suggestion to them over the phone is trap them or bring them, 'cause we will take them at the shelter. The hard part is we also tell them that they cannot kill them unless you make claim to the chicken. Hawaii law does not allow you to kill any animal that's not your own and then it has to

be done humanely. So, you just can't go out and arbitrarily kill chickens. So that creates an issue for them what to do with them in their yard, so we suggest trapping them and bringing them to us which we will accept chickens.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Members, any other questions or comments? Mr. Victorino?

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: ...(inaudible)... Turn it on. You know, thank you very much for the information you have been able to share with us. I believe you have made major improvements and thank you very much in that respect. Still not where we need to be, but getting a lot closer and I think that's important. Whether its feral chickens, feral cats, feral anything, the chances unless the public buys into it, getting it accomplished, is not gonna happen. And let's call a spade a spade, you know, I mean we can mealy mouth around every issue, but really it's the public. People buy animals, people get animals and then they just let 'em go when they can't take care of it, can't afford to or whatever the necessary challenges they may be facing. Mv question to you is, looking at these various issues, until we and get a community effort and maybe get our community associations involved and really look at some real true solutions for various areas because every area is a little bit different, you know, but I can tell you, Kauai, and I'm talking about feral chickens, Kauai has had chickens running free for as many years as and more years that I've been on this earth. They never had mongoose. They never had a mongoose on that island. They never brought Thank God for that. I think we've had a decimation of our mongoose 'em in. population because you don't see 'em around as much, but that's another story. But what can we do? More laws not going solve the problem, I know that, unless we enforce it and that means more money. So could we take that same money and put programs, incentive programs and I think, the one thing I liked is the differentiating, making it much more, much bigger, \$7, \$20, \$30 nothing to people. Tell them \$150, bam, all of a sudden, you get their attention. So that might be an alternative and I'll look into doing something like that before Ms. Baisa and I leave and see if we can get something like that for next year so the Budget Chair has something to work with. But more importantly, the bottom line is, what do you think we could do and spend money in really getting the public to buy into? Animals are to be taken care of and if you can't take care of 'em, they're like children, don't have 'em. Excuse me, please. You know, so what would you, be a couple of quick suggestions and then we can move on?

MS. BRYANT: Okay.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Yes.

MS. BRYANT: Thank you. Well, you know, there's, so your, there was two parts in your question --

COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Exactly.

September 1, 2016

- MS. BRYANT: -- I believe. The first one I'll answer. I think that everyone here is hearing a common theme up here between Keoni and Hoala and my Maui Humane Society team and that is spay and neuter and it works. I promise you, it does. We, that is the reason we work so hard towards, for our spay and neuter program. To give you an example, at the college the, years ago...Dr. Kim, and you might want to add in on this, but I just thought I'd bring this up. Years ago, there was a cat colony there and there was 200 cats and there was a very responsible colony caretaker and responsible means that they don't just throw food out. It means that they're trapping, they're removing, they're sterilizing, if the animal is sick, they're removing it, they're conscientious and they're responsible. Today that colony has 28 cats. Spay and neuter works. Trying to get people invested in spay and neuter sometimes is more difficult, but I'll say over a year ago we launched our MASH clinics and since then as Dr. Lisa mentioned, we've sterilized almost 5,000 animals and of those, I think we are at about 2,800 or so cats, somewhere in there, do you know the exact number? Okay, lots of cats. Probably the majority of those were feral cats that were trapped and brought in. Those cats are no longer reproducing and we might have a clinic where...Dr. Kim, you might want to jump in, where we would have 25 female cats and they're some times of the year where, out of those 25 cats 20 of them might be pregnant and the other, and 4 of them are in heat. And no longer are those cats going to be reproducing and adding to the population on Maui. So, I want, again, I want to thank you because in part, you are helping. That, the Spay and Neuter Grant is a step in the right direction. Education, absolutely. We are always looking for ways to try to educate the community. Unfortunately, a lot of the times if they're not willing to receive the message, it's just a lot of blah, blah, blah and talk, they don't hear it, but we're looking for ways to really try to communicate that message in a way that they might receive. Dr. Kim, Dr. Lisa, do you have anything to add?
- MS. KIM: No, but I just thought of something talking about laws. We've often talked about the three strikes and you're out.
- MS. BRYANT: Oh, yeah, yeah.
- MS. KIM: Where if an animal is found loose and comes to us as a stray by their...we usually try to encourage people when they come to reclaim their animals to fix their animal, we'll do it for you free. And some people still resist, but a three strikes and you're out is on the third time, you have no choice. It doesn't have to be three times, but that was another way to really try to encourage people or not give them any options. If your animal continues to run loose, then you need to get them fixed.
- COUNCILMEMBER VICTORINO: Well, I think, you gave us some very good ideas and I like that, that three strike or something of that nature. And also the differentiate, making it much larger where it makes good economic sense for people to do the right things and not just having animals around because my son when he got his pit bull, he immediately spayed and neutered it. Okay. And now it's 11 years old and is actually dying of cancer right now and the good thing about it is they got Hospice care up there. They got Hospice care for dogs and animals. I mean, whoa, you know, but that being said, yes, you know, being resourceful and also being a good citizen is important

and I've only found, the only two ways it works is you either give 'em incentive or you penalize 'em. And I think we give 'em the incentive by saying we'll do it for free and if they don't want to do it, then maybe the penalization system might be the next area to come into. So, thank you, Madam Chair. I appreciate that.

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you, Mr. Victorino. Mr. Hokama?
- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chairman, thank you. Two things I want to bring up. One is what role, if any, does the agencies play and I thank you for your service to the community, it's not a, always acknowledged job you folks do, but I appreciate it. So the thing that I want to ask and I know what role, if any, you folks do, but there's always this thing about mosquitos. Mosquito infects the human, the human infects the mosquito. Well, don't tell me mosquitos don't go on animals either. So, is there a factor that we should know since we talking about dengue, we talk about Zika, and now we talking about chikungunya, all mosquito-borne issues that we should at least be aware of what's happening. Is there any issues that we need to be aware of for this County as it regards to animals, mosquitos and health issues?
- MS. KIM: Mosquitos are the vector for heartworm disease in dogs. Heartworm disease is an endemic problem in Hawaii and that's why all dogs are recommended to be in heartworm preventative. It can also be found in cats, it's not as common. Cats aren't the natural host, but there is, also, heartworm preventative in cats. Now the question people ask is can heartworms get into people? And the answer is yes, it's not very common. We aren't the natural host, but I believe there have been many reports of people getting chest x-rays and then finding a spot, they think it's cancer and then they go in surgically and they find it's actually an aberrant microfilaria heartworm. I don't know of any dogs or cats being sources of any of those dengue or Zika.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: What about birds, livestock?

MS. KIM: Birds, we have the...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Cattle, horses, goats, sheep?

- MS. KIM: With mosquitos, no. I know the Avian flu, you know, of course, they're always worried about that and there were periods when they used to ask us to collect all, any wildlife, bird wildlife that were found dead, but I don't know of any other that are mosquito-borne. Yeah, heartworm would...
- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Any other issues whether it be botulism or those other associated health issues with those type of wildlife?
- MS. KIM: With the wildlife ...
- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Because I know, I mean, botulism affects, whether it's a domestic bird, wildlife bird, I mean, it'll attack a bird, so.

MS. KIM: Botulism, I think, the most of the problem is often in the ducks in the ponds they...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Water, regarding water.

- MS. KIM: Right, right. They have botulism in the water. As far as domestic animals, we don't have as much of a problem with botulism. Yeah. It can occur, but it's not as common as the...
- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So we're pretty safe as far as that mosquito issues with our animal management?
- MS. KIM: Yeah, as far as mosquito-transmitted diseases, I don't know of any that are really serious between domestic animals and people.
- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Well, I'm happy you could share that with the community. That's one of the reasons for the question. My other thing is a request for your consideration as agencies, especially when it comes with County funds. I don't like the word, free. I would request that you consider if it's a spay/neuter and being paid for by the County, you say it is supported by the County, paid for by the County, sponsored by the County, but I would like the individuals receiving service to know somebody's paying the bill. It's not really free. We're asking taxpayers to support this program and that individual getting the service should know somebody, his fellow neighbors is helping to pay that bill for his animal's benefit. You know, I think we need to be very real about the bill and who's paying it. And this term about free gives everybody a false sense that it is really free, when it's not. So I just ask you to consider that as we provide those services.
- MS. BRYANT: Can I answer, Budget Chair? That is true. We absolutely agree, so we refer to, because our funds for spay and neuter come in a variety of ways. Fortunately, we receive the Spay and Neuter Grant that is, will allow us to do 1,538 surgeries. We are looking to do several thousand more through funds that we've acquired through grants. We say, free, here because we're not charging for it; however, and I would ask Jamie because she oversees customer service, that messaging is shared. When somebody books an appointment...well, Jamie, actually if you don't mind? I can't say I'm gonna have you answer it and then I answer it.
- MS. FITZPATRICK: No worries. So, a typical messaging for something like this is, someone calls asking to get their pet fixed, well, great news there is a program that is subsidizing cost of this surgery at this time. So when can we get you booked?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Great.

MS. BRYANT: And that may, and we, in fact, we are in the process of trying to come up with a name for, it's been difficult, for, a name for the spay and neuter service that we're able to offer through County funds and it's a, and we openly share that you are

receiving this surgery today at no charge due to a generous grant from Maui County and so we do share that. Thank you.

- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I would be very open and receptive to propose some like Mr. Wilson. I have, you know, I have always been a licensed dog owner from my elementary days. I have very low tolerance for irresponsible pet owners, okay, almost no tolerance. So I don't have a problem looking at punitive measures the County can consider for violations. 'Cause I think we need the revenue. We can put it back to either more personnel for enforcement or other things, but I'm open to what you folks think as our professionals on how to, well, I want them to pay for breaking those policies and laws. So I'm open to your recommendations, your proposals as well as a revenue generator for us outside of General Fund taxation.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: You can answer us now or we can follow up with some sort of recommendation or correspondence.
- MS. BRYANT: Okay.
- MR. WILSON: I'm not sure if you're familiar with the fines that are, but on our laws are very, very low. Fifty dollars or court dismisses it if they do certain things, but a lot of ours, \$50, \$100 fines and that's it and it's really either not cost effective and/or it's really not getting the point across. I would also like to see a unfit for owner law, unfit to own a animal law, and take those animals away from them. I did 581 cruelty and neglect cases last year. We're out there all the time, same people. We just, if there was a law which we could just say, you know, enough and take them, then we could, they would actually generate money and a fine, both going out our front door getting adopted to a family that needs them and the citation that the court would then impose.
- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Well, you know, we're happy to get those type of recommendations and then people like Mr. Murai would give us advice whether it would be a required State statute revision or a County ordinance consideration. So we'll work with our attorneys to see where it would be the best venue to make those adjustments in law, so we appreciate your comments. Thank you.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Mr. Guzman?

- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to follow up on Mr. Hokama's line of questioning. On the, when you're doing these citations and they're actually fining the owners of these animals, most of the, I would say, all of it goes to the Judiciary when they pay these fines. What's your percentage of, I guess, convictions that you have right now? The cases that you have, let's say you have 100 cases, how many of that is actually getting convictions? Specifically, let's just look at dangerous dog.
- MR. WILSON: I don't have an actual percentage, but they're very high because the procedure in which we file those is very narrow from the Prosecutor and the court, so identifying the dog and identifying the owner and once we've done that, then pretty much the

case is made for us. And they generally, I've been here two years, we've never been to trial on one yet, so there, somewhere along the line they're getting pled out.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Administratively.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Well, yeah, administratively --

MR. WILSON: Yes.

- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: --because we made an amendment to the dangerous dog laws. So how's that working out in terms of that, I guess the decision, I guess there's a board, dangerous dog board?
- MR. WILSON: And I happen to have those numbers for you.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay.

MR. WILSON: Last...

- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: 'Cause we amended the, we amended that law so it was more administratively.
- MR. WILSON: Yeah, last year, we had 142 dog attack investigations. Looking into it, though, 89 of them really weren't attacks based on the description of the attacks, so we really, there was really only 53 actual dog attacks which we could go forward with and out of that, 35 or 67 percent of those were deemed dangerous. The other 24 were surrendered. We were gonna actually deem those and the people chose to surrender their animal instead which then we euthanized. And then there was only 8 which got cited out of the actual cases that were true dog bites. Comparison to 10 percent of the dogs that were deemed prior to you guys --

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Right.

- MR. WILSON: -- changing legislation, so it's very effective.
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Very good. And then getting back to your issue on the cruelty to animal laws, you don't have the ability to confiscate the animal at some point? I thought you do.
- MR. WILSON: We have the ability to take them initially if they can't correct the problem, but once they correct the problem, we have to give the dog back. There's only two sections. If we do a cruelty investigation, we will hold onto the dog until the court case has been decided. But for the, most of them are really neglect cases and we have to give the dog back once vet care...if we take them for vet care, once vet care has been done and we send them to their own vet, the dog has to be returned. If it's strictly water and food, once the violation is taken care of, we have to give the dog back. There is no law on the books that allows us to just take their dogs.

- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. I thought there was, but okay. So then, you do cite them for cruelty to animals or the petty misdemeanor?
- MR. WILSON: The cruelty ones, we absolutely cite for. The neglect ones, a lot of time it is education because either they don't know, but on our second trip back, then, yes, they do get cited.
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. Can I have a few more questions?
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Sure.
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thanks, Chair. I know that we were talking about differential licensing and the three strike type method, how would the animal community react to that? 'Cause sometimes, you know, we get a lot of pushback when we start, you know, looking into amending the laws and would this be a type of, you know, cry out to look, you're preventing animals for procreating, you know, I don't know. Is there, will we have a big backlash on this? I mean, you guys are the experts, you're in the community.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Ms. Bryant?
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: If we propose something like this to increase licensing, you know, if you do spay or neuter your animal or we do the three-strike method, would we, are we going to be in the hot seat at that point? Not you guys, we will be.
- MS. BRYANT: Okay, sure. Well, I can give my initial answer and then I'll ask my team if or anybody here that if they have any other comments. I think any time we implement anything that means stricter regulations or more money, we'll always gonna have a few people. There's gonna be some people who are gonna protest. I personally don't think that that would, that having a larger differential would create a big backlash and that's, you know, you never know until you do something, that's my opinion. I don't think so. I think a lot of, many people do the right thing. Many people do spay and neuter their animals. Many people are on the fence. Yeah, we want to, but it's not the right time or it's not convenient or I gotta talk to my husband again and I think that if you're faced with paying \$7 for a license for your sterilized animal or for 2 years or paying whatever it is, \$120, that feels, that's painful and I think that, I don't know, you know, we might have some grumbling, but I don't see a huge backlash. Do you, Jamie or anybody?
- MS. FITZPATRICK: I was gonna say as someone who works in the front office at the Maui Humane Society Shelter, I would agree with what Jerleen is saying. There would be grumbling. There would be upset, but it's the very few and the very vocal and it's those animals that are actually causing part of our problems. It's those dogs who have come into the shelter because they were running stray, because they were at-large, because they were causing problems who are now here with us and we're imposing the fees and enforcing the licensing and everything and that's when I get

called up to escort them out if they need that calming to happen. So, yes, absolutely, there would be voices raised about that, but that is the very few, the very small and often that's where the problem is coming from.

MR. VAUGHN: I'd like to just entertain a different perspective and I come from about 13 years of animal welfare experience, primarily on Oahu working for the Hawaiian Humane Society which is a very, very large shelter. When I was working there, there was about 25,000 animals coming in a year. I think that I'm a firm believer in holding pet owners accountable by far to responsible pet ownership. But I would urge a little bit of caution in raising fees a little too high, because if you get to the point where people cannot afford that license, they will surrender their pets and indirectly, that will increase possibly intakes to the Maui Humane Society, increase euthanasia because they can't find homes, increase all kinds of hidden costs. I think there's a fine balance and I think with some thought into it, I definitely agree that the current fees are really low; however, entertaining something a couple hundred dollars, I personally just from my experience would be a little extreme.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Ms. Davis? Ms. Davis?

MS. DAVIS: So I just wanted to comment really quickly on a couple of things. Molokai is so small that we, you know, we know who's coming in and out the doors. When we find a box of puppies, we can pretty easily figure out who the culprit is. But I have a feeling that it's probably the same, it's the repeat offenders. It's the same people every six months. We can pretty much bank on the fact that A, we're gonna find a litter abandoned or left somewhere. If we're lucky, they're brought to, well, maybe not if we're lucky, but if they're brought to our facility, you know, we can guarantee that we can get them in the doors and taken care of. So, you know, absolutely, if there is any way to increase the enforcement of those people that are being negligent and they are, it's easy for them. They're not getting in trouble for it. They're getting a slap on the wrist if they even do get cited. It's difficult for us because we don't have the enforcement capability. It's a separate agency, but I would suspect that even on the Maui Humane Society and possibly on Lanai, it's the same people that you see where it's recognizable. The litters are, you know, it's the same people that are continuing to do it and on the flip side, a lot of the puppies, especially puppies that we find are the leftovers for litters that are being purposely bred and these people are selling them anywhere from 500 to \$1,500 per puppy and when you have a litter of, you know, say, 10 pit bulls, and you sell 6, we get the leftover, the 4 leftover, so holding those breeders accountable, if there is a way to do it without punishing, you know, because we do have people that are trying. Mistaken litters, we work with them, but then we are constantly being left with the burden of cleaning up other people's messes and if the County can receive some funding from that to help at least pay for the spay and neuters, then we should do that.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Chair?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Can I follow up on Ms. Davis?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Yes and Ms. Bryant has a comment also.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh, okay. Oh, sorry.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Yeah.

MS. BRYANT: Oh, I was just quickly gonna respond to Keoni's statement. I, Keoni, I absolutely agree. And the last thing we need is incentive for more people to surrender their animals to us. We don't want that. And that would be why I would be in support of keeping the low license fee for a sterilized animal of \$7. That just rewards doing the right thing and not creating more of a burden for our community and then, of course, increasing the fee for non-sterilized. Many, I'm not sure what it is on Oahu, but that's not, that wouldn't be unique to us. There are many shelters that have that differential, that model.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Mr. Guzman, anything further?

- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, Ms. Davis, you mentioned about funding and I kind of want to have an understanding of how you, how the Molokai Humane Society works in conjunction with the Maui Humane Society. Because in our budget, we have two separate line items and do you not, I guess, maybe this is Doris's question as well, how do you interact or how is, are you a subsidiary of the main, are you a subsidiary of the Maui Humane Society and what is your relation, in name only, finances, what?
- MS. DAVIS: So the Humane Society name is shared by many, many, many organizations. We are, we have been umbrella'd under the Maui Humane Society so they have basically been our fiscal sponsor and until this fiscal year, now we are line itemed on the County grant so we are separating. We still, you know, we're still a tri-isle County, so the partnerships are still there and very important, but as far as, you know, now the funding is separate. We, in the past we have just expended the funds the same way any of your other recipients would have and done the reporting and received funding back on a reimbursement basis. So, but now we're gonna be fiscally responsible for ourselves.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: So does that mean...ask Doris.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Well, so Molokai is a standalone --

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Right.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: --this fiscal year.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Right.

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: But I believe there's still outreach to the Maui Humane Society as resource and they've been most helpful to our Molokai Humane Society.
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Oh, okay. And then, one more question for Mr. Wilson. I don't want to take all of the...
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Sure. Yes, of course, no.
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: And I'll pretty much be done with my questions.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Go ahead, Mr. Guzman.
- COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: So, Mr. Wilson, you mentioned that, is it, are you Mr. Wilson? Oh, Mr. Vaughn, I'm sorry. Wilson, Vaughn. Sorry. Wilson. Yeah. So you mentioned that you're actually housing about 500 or so cats. At some point, do you euthanize them or do you maintain them until they pass away by old age? Or that's, I know you expanded in terms of your property size, but it wouldn't seem like it would be enough, you know, property to keep going, yeah.
- MR. VAUGHN: Sure. Yeah, so I really appreciate the question and there's many answers to it. So, we have 501 as of probably three days ago, where capacity is about 575. I have current plans right now to seek funding for an additional expansion of about another 25,000 square feet which will allow for another 500 cats. We adopt out the past 2 years, last year we adopted out 38, the year before that, 35, 95 percent of those adoptions, believe it or not, are from visitors, so off-island. We've had a cat go to Canada, Chicago, kind of all over. It's a real unique setup. We care...once a cat is brought into us, whether we trap it and bring it in or a community member surrenders it, or it comes from the natural resources, we keep it for the rest of its life or until it finds a home. The only caveat is with the Natural Resources Department because they are capturing these cats from areas, really high-sensitive areas where Federally endangered native birds are kept, we have an internal agreement that we will not adopt out those cats to anyone on the island of Lanai with the remote chance that the cat gets adopted, the owner lets it out and it finds its way five miles up in the mountains and finds that nest. We don't want to take that chance, so we take real, we take a lot of pride in protecting our birds on our island. So it's a little different setup. But, yeah, so we are in plans to expand again before we get to that point where we are full, but by no means do we label ourselves a no-kill organization. I personally feel that it is extremely divisive term. We do euthanize to end the suffering of any cat.

COUNCILMEMBER GUZMAN: Okay. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Mr. Couch, then Ms. Baisa.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Madam Chair, a couple of follow ups for some of the other Members' questions. When Mr. Hokama talked about, you know, he doesn't like free and you guys are saying, well, County subsidized, people think that the County money is free, too. So, it would be really good if you could say taxpayers

subsidize because where do you get your other grants from? You get grants from Federal and State or is this...

MS. BRYANT: No, no, private.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. So you can say, partially taxpayer or --

MS. BRYANT: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: --something that the people know that County of Maui is everybody.

MS. BRYANT: And we want them to know.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay.

MS. BRYANT: We are, we're very, we feel fortunate and we're very proud of being the recipient of this funding and we want the community to know where, why they're not having to pay for their surgery for their animal.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Because their neighbors.

MS. BRYANT: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay.

MS. BRYANT: So, if you have a particular way you would like us to share that information?

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah, Maui County taxpayers.

MS. BRYANT: Okay.

- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: That's my opinion anyway. And, Mr. Wilson, you said you had some ideas for laws. Please by all means through your organization, send them to us, we will work with our Corporation Counsel and come up with something that will help because I like Mr. Hokama's idea, too. Make it sting a little bit. My concern is and Mr. Hokama thought that, you know, if we fine 'em more and it goes back into you guys, it's my understanding that the fines actually don't go. They go to the State Judiciary, I think Mr. Guzman mentioned that. Is there a way and maybe this is for Corporation Counsel, is there a way we can set a series of fines that, you know, we, since we have the Animal Control Board or is it the, yeah, I believe it's the Animal Control Board that does the dangerous animals, are they allowed to set fines and if they do set fines, do they come to us?
- MS. BRYANT: So we not only don't receive the funds for the fines, but reclaims, when somebody pays the boarding fee or the reclaim fee to take the animal back, we don't

September 1, 2016

keep those. Those do not stay with the Humane Society. They go to the revolving fund and...

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: They go to our County revolving fund?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Yes. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Right, but we have the other fines that have to go through, basically they go through Judiciary, right? Anything goes to Judiciary, goes to the State, so I'm trying to see if we can avoid that and keep that at least circulating in our funds. Is there any way we could do it?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Is that something we can...

- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: I don't know, that's...
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Is that something that we can further discuss and have the, some sort of, Staff will follow up --
- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: --with the Corporation.

- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. Thank you, Chair.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Ms. Baisa?
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Thank you very much, Chair. You know I'm sitting here trying to think about the math that we're hearing and in particular like on Lanai where you have a very finite number and you know what it is and you have 501 cats, how long do cats live normally?
- MR. VAUGHN: Well, since I'm a cat lover, not long enough. But realistically, our, since 2013, we've really spent a lot of time and money increasing our standards of care by, and we don't have any electricity for one at our place and please feel free to come out. We have running water. We do everything by Word and Excel and Dropbox, but we've spent a lot of time analyzing our population. Our average age within our sanctuary is anywhere from 7 to 9 years. Unfortunately, we received 26 kittens within the last 2 to 3 months. It's the most kittens that we've received since I've been there and so that's not really a good sign, but yeah. So I think, you know, they say in all the reports I've read for feral cat that has lived in the community that has never received any medical attention, the average lifespan is anywhere from three to five years. Obviously, once we bring that cat into our environment, you know, I fly a veterinary team from Oahu twice a month to tend to our cats, so that's going to increase the length of its life hopefully. So, but we have cats there that are 15, 16 years old.

- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: You know, what I'm thinking of is I heard you say Phase I and Phase II. How long did Phase I last? I mean, how soon are we going to need Phase III and Phase IV, if they live for a very long time?
- MR. VAUGHN: You're going to keep me up at night.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: You're going to have more cats on Lanai than people.
- MR. VAUGHN: No, that's a good question. I think, you know, so we went from 350 cats to 500 cats. That was our first phase. But the first phase was really to, you know, that the, pre-existing fencing had been there since 2009, it had some structural issues, so we had to redo the fencing. So we're going to basically be duplicating the main area, and by the way just so everyone's really clear, this is at no cost to the County. This is solely through donations. But I think that the issue is not so much, you know, will there be room? We can, through our lease, we have three-and-a-half acres, you know, on our little map. And so we can continue to expand, but the real hardship for us is the staffing. You know, we've had an open position now for two-and-a-half months and two applicants, two of which weren't qualified. So when we start getting into, you know, 600, 700, 800 cats, we can provide the medical care, we can provide the food and the sheltering, it's the actual staffing support for those cats that are gonna be the biggest problem for us.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Are they, do they get out of the cage? Do you have to walk them, exercise them or?
- MR. VAUGHN: Oh my gosh, no. This is a total open environment.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Oh, it's all open?
- MR. VAUGHN: Twenty-five thousand square feet of, I know I get teased, but I call it the fur seasons. It's really, the cats are there not trying to get out, you know. It's really relaxed over there. So, yeah, it's all open air.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: It's really interesting. It might be something to visit when I go to Lanai. I'd like to see this.
- MR. VAUGHN: Please, yeah, please let me know.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: I can't imagine that many cats.
- MR. VAUGHN: Yeah. And it doesn't feel like it, right. I mean that's the beauty of it. When it starts feeling like 500 cats, we know we have to expand the perimeter.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: And don't get me wrong. My first pet when I was a child was a Tabby and I loved that cat like you would not believe and unfortunately, it was poisoned by somebody and came home and died and my father never told me. He told me it ran

away, but when I was a much grown-up girl, they finally told me what they had, what had happened. I never got another one since.

- MR. VAUGHN: Yeah. It's rough and we, so we take a really big stance in trying to educate the keiki on Lanai. If we can get the kids to buy into the animal welfare and the importance of taking care of cats and the spay and neuter component and how quickly cats can breed, then, you know, hopefully we get to the next generation.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Thank you very much.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Thank you, Ms. Baisa. Mr. Carroll, any comments or question? You got to put on your...flip.
- VICE-CHAIR BAISA: Put on your thing.
- COUNCILMEMBER CARROLL: Oh, okay.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you, Mr. Carroll.
- COUNCILMEMBER CARROLL: Just one. I drive in and out of Hana almost every day and I've noticed a real reduction in cats and the chickens, especially around the Kaumahina Park and I assume I can give credit to who's over here. It used to be to where there would be over 20 cats over there, just at Kaumahina, it was really bad. And now I just, I hardly see any by the park. I see a few at night when I go down the road toward Honomanu, the gulch, but it's a big improvement. Thank you.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Members, Staff disseminated the special revenue and agency fund that's in front of you, like the sale of dog licenses, licensed dogs for neutered dog, \$6 every 2 years, for un-neutered dog, \$30 every 2 years and, you know, as far as Mr. Couch looking at what sort of revenues we're looking at, but not so much citation. It's a list that maybe we would have to consider with recommendations from the Humane Societies I think would be, you know, would be of value for us. Mr. Couch?
- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: One last question. You know I talked about the feral chicken, I thought we had a feral chicken fund. It's actually a feral animal control fund, \$50,000. What do you guys use that for?
- MS. BRYANT: That's correct. So, we have a dedicated feral animal specialist that we don't use the whole \$50,000 on. That, in fact, we'll have Jamie, Jamie directly supervises that position, so, Jamie if you want to jump in?
- MS. FITZPATRICK: Sure. So our feral animal specialist, we have one full-time employee who we look to, to serve our community members who have specific concerns about feral animals, be they cats, chickens, whatever they might be. So this person is our resident expert on trapping techniques and information, information on how people can, again, you know, mitigate the potential nuisances of those populations and help manage and control those populations. They educate on spay/neuter, they educate

September 1, 2016

on trap, neuter, return and manage colonies, they educate on how to successfully trap. This person oversees our trap loaner, our loaner trap program, so people can come free of charge and borrow traps from our shelter and use those for what time they need to help do whatever they need with those feral animals to bring them into us for sterilization or to bring them in to drop off if they don't have other options for them. As Jerleen said, not that whole \$50,000 is used for that position, remainder are used for tools that help us do our jobs with feral animals so that is purchasing more traps for that trap owner program, equipment that our staff and others would need in order to handle feral animals, appropriate housing units for those animals, safety gear like pole syringes, gloves, things like that to help keep people who work with those animals safe.

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Members, any more questions or comments? There being none, I'd really like to extend our appreciation for you taking the time and extending such valuable information. And I think it, I can appreciate, too, that the Humane Societies can remind our customers, customers that you have that it is funded by our taxpayers through the Maui County Council or Maui County as a whole. So there being...Director, any more comments or additions to this wonderful panel that we've put together?
- MS. REIMANN: No, thank you, Chair. I just wanted to thank everyone for being here today and I really appreciate all of the hard work that they do for, in our communities. I myself have a rescue dog, so I especially, I hold you guys dear to my heart, so thank you for all you do.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. And I want to say a special mahalo for Lanai and Molokai for being here this afternoon. I know the weather can be sometimes, all the news you get, but you braved the travel, so I appreciate that. Mahalo nui and I'm going to call a brief recess before we get to our next agenda item. Oh, Members, if there are no objections, I will defer this matter.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you.

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Brief recess. ... (gavel)...

RECESS: 3:04 p.m.

RECONVENE: 3:16 p.m.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: ... (gavel)... Thank you, Members.

ITEM HHT-33: LICENSING OF ANIMALS OTHER THAN DOGS (MISC)

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: The Committee on Housing, Human Services, and Transportation Committee will reconvene its meeting. Members, we're on HHT-33, Licensing of Animals other than Dogs. The Committee is in receipt of a Miscellaneous Communication, dated May 23, 2016, from the County Clerk, referring the matter relating to licensing animals other than dogs. The matter is to explore whether it would provide health and safety or other community benefits to authorize licensing for other household pets. The matter includes reviewing the extent to which other animals create demands on animal rescue or other public services, and whether the County should collect fees for associated costs. Currently licensing is limited to dogs only. The Committee may discuss the matter and no legislative action will be taken. So I'd like to know if the Department of Housing and Human Concerns have any comments and will follow, with a follow-up from our Maui Humane Society.
- MS. REIMANN: Aloha, Chair, thank you. No, we have no comments. We will defer to the experts, the Maui Humane Society on their comments.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Ms. Bryant?
- MS. BRYANT: Another challenging topic for sure. I think, I don't know that we are, that we have researched this at length. We didn't, unfortunately, have enough time in our schedules when we knew this meeting was coming up to really do the research necessary to have an educated opinion about this. What we do know is that it's not, as I'm sure all of you know, it's not as simple as just licensing additional animals. There would be, we would need an increase in our resources to handle the licensing of additional animals. The enforcement aspect of it, certainly is something to consider. I think we touched on that earlier. It doesn't do any good to pass a law if we can't, if we don't have the staff and the resources to enforce it. I think it would affect our, us implementing mandatory stray holds for our, for cats, if we were talking about cats and I'm gonna ask Jamie to expand on that, what our current policy is and what it would mean if we had cats come into us as a stray that were licensed.
- MS. FITZPATRICK: So currently with dogs, since there is licensing for dogs, we observe the ordinances about mandatory hold time, first time, hold times for dogs. So if a dog comes into the shelter, it's hold, held for a minimum of 48 hours before any disposition can be determined for that dog. If the dog comes in wearing a current County tag, that minimum hold period is 9 days. So it vastly changes, the holding times for animals who are brought into the shelter which, obviously, has associated resources that are dedicated to those animals because they are licensed. For cats, since there is no licensing for cats at this time and there are no County ordinances on minimum mandatory holding periods for time, we, as an organization are not required to follow certain, we are not required by law to follow cat holding times. We do, however, because it's the right thing to do and that's what we as an organization work into our protocols, but changing how, considering licensing for cats would change that

September 1, 2016

completely so that we would have to consider very different holding times, length and holding times and I don't know exactly what that would look like because I'm not sure what the County would be considering. But it would have vast implications on the housing and the resources required for housing at the Humane Society.

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Mr. Wilson, any comments? No. Members, for discussion or comments or your input, we're opening up the floor. Mr. Hokama?
- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chairman. I'll be shorter than Mr. Couch. I, we appreciate your comments this afternoon. We would like you to have the time to consider and come up with some considerations that we can at least have a discussion on. But as I had stated earlier, it irks me that as a dog owner I was the only guy that had to buy licenses. Okay? I see just as much problem with the chicken, the cat, the horses, other creatures, especially if you can buy it from a pet store, it obviously has value. So why wouldn't any animal or pet from a pet store be considered for licensing? It has value, somebody's making money. So why shouldn't the County get its revenue to help pay for enforcement or health and safety issues from those animals, whatever it may be?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Ms. Bryant?

MS. BRYANT: And I wouldn't want the Council to have the impression that we are taking a stand that we are opposed to it. That certainly is not our position. I just hesitate because anything more that we take on with our current resources --

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Understood.

- MS. BRYANT: --would be difficult and so...
- COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, we understand --

MS. BRYANT: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --yeah, very much, Ms. Bryant. But right now, I think we should consider what makes sense for us to consider or shall we just say, then, we'll eliminate dog licenses, too and have nothing licensed.

MS. BRYANT: I would hope not.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No, as a dog owner, I would say, why just the dog, then?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Mr. Wilson?

MR. WILSON: Outside of the revenue portion of licensing, from my department, licensing and tattooing, which we're not doing anymore, but are still out there or microchipping is hugely important to us because if we pick up an animal on the road and yours isn't licensed, we don't know who it belongs to, now it goes to the shelter and who knows

September 1, 2016

how long it'll be there if you can find it. The happy ending on this is because the shelter implemented a system that's cloud based or, I'm sorry, cloud database, the officers have access in the field to look up your license on your dog and return it quickly. That's how I look at the licensing. I've been trying to come up with a scenario for how cats would work because we really don't deal with cats that often other than people call us to say, hey, I found this cat and that would help return them to the owner. But bringing revenue on my portion of it, it would be, we would be citing these people, you know, to court which nobody gets any money from that. Forcing them to go get the cat licensed or chipped and I would go more with a microchip versus the licensing anyway at least for the cats. For the dogs, no, we're good with that because the law is in my favor for licensing of the dogs. If the dog doesn't show a license, the dog is considered unlicensed and we can impound that dog when it's running loose. So, I like the dog's one the way it is, but for the cat one, I just have a hard time coming up with a scenario for enforcement for that, where it would be beneficial to my department solely, being selfish anyway.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Well, and that's why we want your comments, Mr. Wilson. You know, we want to know what you folks think who operates the program for us. But like I said, as a former dog owner and the guy who always had to buy the license, it always irks me that it's only about the dog. And I get enough issues with the other animals, horses on the road, cattle through the fence lines, goats, deer all over the place in the community. I get wild turkeys in Lanai City every morning, people feeding rice to them. So...

MS. BRYANT: Turkeys?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Turkeys.

MS. BRYANT: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay.

MS. BRYANT: Who knew? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I mean, it's an interesting evolution going on in many places, but even for a community like us that was basically agriculture and our view of animals was more agrarian than urban, so for us we looked at euthanasia, harvesting if that's the right word, very differently from an urban area 'cause we were basically plantation/agricultural people. Okay. Animal was about food.

MS. BRYANT: Yeah. Understood.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So for us, again, but I understand the role you play it from a health and safety standpoint. I just trying to find ways to make it more equal than feeling it's so discriminatory only about one animal, the dog. Okay. And that's where I am because I'm a dog person, obviously.

MS. BRYANT: We appreciate that, thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chairman.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Mr. Wilson, did you want to add, say something?

MR. WILSON: I came from an agricultural area before I moved here and working in the street, we had mandatory branding of cattle and horses, that kind of stuff. Humane Society there didn't control that, it was controlled by the State. I could see where that would be beneficial because we do run across livestock in the field that we don't know who it belongs to. Hawaii has a unique law that says if you have an animal on your property that's not marked, it's yours. Okay. So it can go either way.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: If it's not marked, right?

MR. WILSON: If it's not marked. You find it on your property and it's not branded or tattooed in any way, an animal, not a pet animal, livestock, then, it becomes yours. We get calls all the time of a horse loose or sheep or cattle and we get there and now we have no idea who it belongs to. Markings on that, if we had a, you know, branding or something, it would be easier to find and you could charge money for that, too, I guess, but.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you.

MR. WILSON: Identifying the larger animals would be actually beneficial for my department.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Ms. Fitzpatrick?

MS. FITZPATRICK: To piggyback on Mark's comments and getting back to where we started with licensing and whatnot, for me, personally, since I oversee the animal care at the shelter and working on reunification efforts to get animals back to where they belong because that reduces the burden on the shelter, the faster we can get animals home, the fewer homeless animals are in our community vying for resources to get back into homes and tying up valuable space in the shelter. So the more animals who come in who have permanent identification that they can't lose, like they can lose a collar or a tag, helps us do our jobs better and helps us serve the community better. So identification itself as a broader topic and less so about specific licensing is where my preferences come from.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Mr. Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I like that because for Mr. Couch, I would say I have no problem working with Mr. Murai because I think we can work a structure of punitive processing fee schedules, so, as a processing fee it comes to us. And if it's the second time we gotta process you for this type of situation, wallet beware.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Ms. Bryant?

MS. BRYANT: Thank you. For us at Maui Humane Society, we would appreciate mandatory permanent identification. And my question is, does everyone here understand the, what a microchip is and how that microchip works? It's in, about the grain, the size of a grain of a rice and it's embedded into the animal, and we could always update and change information if somebody moves and whatnot.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's not GPS.

- MS. BRYANT: It's not GPS. We have many people, no, I don't want everybody knowing where my animal is. Okay. You can't, it doesn't work like that. So we oftentimes, we have, we call them frequent flyers or repeat offenders and the stray that gets, the dog that gets out all the time and is in the shelter all of the time and the people come and reclaim. Well, if they're frequent flyers, we usually know who they are. But oftentimes, pets come to us and they have an owner somewhere but there's no identification on them. We have no way of reuniting that pet with the owner and you would think that being the only animal shelter on the island, it would be easy. People would come to us to find their animal and it doesn't necessarily happen like that. It could be days later. Days and weeks later and yet, we have had to care for that animal and use our valuable resources to care for that animal until the owner does show up.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Mr. Couch?
- MS. BRYANT: So permanent identification.
- CHAIR CRIVELLO: Mr. Couch? Mr. Couch?
- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you, Madam Chair. Mr. Hokama asked most of the questions that I was gonna ask. So what it comes down to is the reason why dogs were licensed was to identify them and before we had microchips and tattoos, it was the tag. That's what it sounds like, so maybe we don't call it licensing, we call it identification and then a charge to get 'em identified, you know.
- MS. BRYANT: I don't know if that was the original reason, but it sounds good. I think it's plausible, but...

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Well, I think, Mr. Couch, you know, we can further that --

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Yeah.

- CHAIR CRIVELLO: --discussion with the Committee looking into it further and working with Mr. Murai and the Corporation Counsel and Staff. Yeah. Anybody else? Any comments? Any more questions or...Ms. Bryant and then Ms. Fitzpatrick.
- MS. BRYANT: I'm sorry, I do. If we're talking about ways that are mutually beneficial for the Humane Society and then, also generating revenue, when an animal is, does come to

us as a stray and is, I think, I just want to clarify and the owner does show up to reclaim, if there was a, if it was mandatory that that animal must leave with a microchip and we could charge for, I mean, we would charge for that microchip and then, other than our cost that that revenue maybe could go on to the County.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Mr. Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Would any of you know how the State does its licensing and enforcement as it regards to businesses collecting reef fish or ocean fish for hobby or pet care that they sell through the pet stores? Because they gotta report, they harvesting off the reef. It has to be some kind of permit process and licensing, the fees they're paying the State of Hawaii?

MS. BRYANT: I don't. I'm sorry.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: So, Mr. Hokama, perhaps we can ask Staff to look into that for us.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Or if at the next meeting, you would maybe consider some resource person that can educate us or share information, Chair, that might be something you could consider, please?

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. We'll take that into consideration. Ms. Fitzpatrick?

MS. FITZPATRICK: The other point I wanted to make about dog licensing and why dog licensing is such a big deal in our country is in most, in all states except ours, it's tied to rabies vaccinations. So that is the hold over communities to ensure that the dogs of their community are vaccinated against rabies to protect not only the dog population but the human population in their communities. So dog licensing is a critical piece because you can't get your dog license without that proof of vaccination of rabies. That's not a thing for us here so we don't have that as a hold over people to get licensing done or so it's not linked. So for us, it is much more about the identification piece and then the County revenue generated off of that but it loses its tie because we don't have the rabies vaccination issues here.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Good information. Thank you. Mr. Couch?

- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you. And thank you for that information. That's a good point, but cats don't have rabies?
- MS. FITZPATRICK: Cats certainly do and in some parts of the country where rabies is much more prevalent, that is definitely a concern and there are some counties who do license cats and do have rabies vaccines required for cats. I'm just not super familiar with those counties and how they set it up and everything but yes.
- COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Okay. And Ms. Bryant asked about, you know, if they could, if we could get something, if you have the frequent flyer come back. As from our last discussion, anything you guys can say, this is what we'd like a law on, let us know.

You know, it would rather, it's better to come from you to say what you need as opposed to us saying this is what we want to give you. So you let us know what you want, then we can get the proper language and everything taken care of, but something like that, I, you know, I can certainly understand and consider.

MS. BRYANT: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER COUCH: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you. Members, if there are no further questions or comments, I'd like to at this time thank you very much. It's been good dialog from your first presentation and continuing today, so we really appreciate you. Members, without objection, I will, would like to defer this matter.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS (excused: MPV).

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Thank you.

ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.

CHAIR CRIVELLO: Members, we have completed today's agenda. I'd like to thank the representatives from the Administration and also, I'd like to thank our Staff, Michele and Tammy. And, Members, I want to thank you for your participation and with that, the September 1, 2016 meeting of the Housing, Human Services, and Transportation Committee is now adjourned. ... (gavel)...

ADJOURN: 3:36 p.m.

APPROVED:

STACY CRIVELLO, Chair Housing, Human Services, and Transportation Committee

hht:min:160901:jb

Transcribed by: Joanne Bista

September 1, 2016

CERTIFICATE

I, Joanne Bista, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my

ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 23rd day of September, 2016 in Kahului, Hawaii

Joanne Bista