MULTIMODAL TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

Council Chamber

January 28, 2019

CONVENE: 9:04 a.m.

- **PRESENT:** VOTING MEMBERS: Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Chair Councilmember Riki Hokama, Vice-Chair (in at 9:09 a.m.) Councilmember Kelly T. King Councilmember Alice L. Lee Councilmember Tamara Paltin Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci
- **EXCUSED:** Councilmember Tasha Kama
- **STAFF:** James Krueger, Legislative Analyst Stacey Vinoray, Committee Secretary
 - Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)
 - Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)
 - Mavis Medeiros, Council Aide, Hana Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)
- **ADMIN.:** Michael J. Hopper, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

Marc Takamori, Acting Director, Department of Transportation

- Pamela Eaton, Planning Program Administrator, Department of Planning-Long Range Division
- Michael Du Pont, Deputy Director, Department of Transportation
- Lauren Armstrong, Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization Executive Director, Department of Transportation
- David M. Yamashita, Planner VI, Department of Parks and Recreation
- Nolly I. Yagin, Civil Engineer VI, Department of Public Works
- Clyde "Buddy" Almeida, Housing Administrator, Department of Housing and Human Concerns
- Erin A. Wade, Planner V, Department of Management
- Linda R. Munsell, Assistant Housing Administrator, Department of Housing and Human Concerns
- David S. Taylor, County Capital Improvement Program Coordinator, Department of Management

January 28, 2019

Rowena Dagdag-Andaya, Deputy Director, Department of Department of Public Works

OTHERS: Jeffrey Paisner

Plus (5) other people in the gallery

PRESS: Akaku Maui Community Television, Inc.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ... (gavel) ... Good morning. Welcome to the Multimodal Transportation Committee meeting. This is the first Committee meeting that we're having of this term and I welcome all of you Members today. Please silence all your cell phone devices. You know the routine. I would like to welcome Mr. Shane Sinenci from Hana.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Morning, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Alice Lee from ---

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Good morning, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: --Central. Tamara Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Good morning, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. And, Kelly King.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Good morning. Happy New Year, everybody.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. So, today is our first Committee meeting, and I wanted to welcome my Staff members. I have Michael Hopper from Corp. Counsel.

MR. HOPPER: Good morning, Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. He's been assigned to this Committee meeting. I look forward to working with you, Michael. James Krueger, Legislative Analyst. Stacey Vinoray, my Secretary. I love your enthusiasm. Thank you for being here. And for the first item, Members, we have an overview under Council Rule 7(B), just an overview of the Department of Transportation. And with us this morning we have Marc Takamori, who is the Acting Director, soon-to-be confirmed to be director at Council meeting, and Michael Du Pont, which is a Deputy Director for Transportation. For our second item that we have coming up which is about the Maui transit oriented-development project, we have the same Department of Transportation Members who will be helping with that presentation, and in the audience we're so glad to have the full course of the participants for this to happen which is Pam Eaton from Long Range Planning, thank you for being here; Erin Wade who is Wailuku Civic

January 28, 2019

Complex and also a planner; David Yamashita from Parks also a planner; Lauren Armstrong from Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization; and from Housing, I'm so glad that you're here which is Buddy Almeida and also Linda Munsell. So, thank you for the Housing component of the second item. So, appreciate all of you being here. District Offices, do we have any testifiers in District Offices?

(Note: Chair Sugimura closed public testimony at 9:09 a.m. Then due to no objections from Councilmembers, allowed Mr. Paisner to testify at 9:10 a.m. Public testimony was then again closed at 9:15 a.m.)

MR. KRUEGER: Chair, we currently don't have any testifiers at the Molokai Office.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, so I'm going to call on them later. The items that we have today on our agenda is Multimodal Transportation 10(1) which is an overview of the department and the second item is Multi Transportation 10 Item 2 which is about the Maui transit-oriented development. Before I go into the items on our agenda, I wanted to just give a brief overview to the community of what this Committee is about because this is definitely a brand-new Committee. We never had it before, and it's been given special focus in, with this term. Multimodal Transportation Committee is comprised of all of us plus Riki Hokama is my Vice-Chair. Tamara Paltin is also a chair, a Committee Member. The duties of this Committee is regarding issues relating to traffic safety, transit, bikeways, walkways, and complete streets, issues relating to interisland transportation within the County and within the State of Hawaii, issues relating to traffic impact fees, amendments to the Parking Code, and we are responsible for operations and performance audits of the Department of Transportation and the Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization including oversight of any grants they administer as well as implementation of the General Plan objective of diversifying transportation options. You met my Committee Staff members, so you'll be seeing them at all my meetings. Appreciate all of their assistance, and I really am excited about this Committee. When you think about what we can do together for the community, is that we can help strengthen community ties through optional transportation measures besides cars and including cars, and to really build communities through housing and for rural developments and rentals and for purchase. So, this is a huge Committee, Members. I look forward to working with all of you and to see how we can help with some of our concerns and challenges that we have in Maui County. Now, I'm going to go over to start our meeting with testimony. So, do we have any testifiers at all? I don't have any. We have no testifiers today. Anyone wishing to testify please sign up. If not, Members, I'm going to close public testimony. Oh, do we have? I'm sorry.

... BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY ...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: For Lanai, Denise, do you have any testifiers there?

January 28, 2019

- MS. FERNANDEZ: Good morning, Chair. This is Denise Fernandez at the Lanai Office and there is no one waiting to testify.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mavis Oliveira-Medeiros from the Hana Office, do you have any testifiers, Mavis?
- MS. MEDEIROS: Good morning, Chair. This is Mavis from the Hana Office, there is no one here waiting to testify.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. And Molokai we haven't had connection. We have a problem with that.
- MR. KRUEGER: Yes, we have received notification from the Molokai Office that there is no one waiting to testify.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, there's no testifiers in any of the District Offices or in the Chambers. Members, at this time I'm going to close public testimony with your approvals.

... END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY ...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. I'm going to close public testimony and thank you, District Offices for being there. Today, we're going to have an overview of Department of Transportation and, Members, I want you to know that this is a big part of what this Committee is about as well as our opportunities to reach out into other departments that have ties to the Department of Transportation.

MS. VINORAY: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh.

MR. PAISNER: Did you just close? May I testify? I couldn't find parking.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I just closed public testimony.

MR. PAISNER: Does that mean that's it, or . . . (inaudible) . . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah...or, Members...Mr. Hopper, can we open public testimony?

MR. HOPPER: . . . (Inaudible). . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's up...

MR. HOPPER: (inaudible)...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Chair's discretion. That's...

January 28, 2019

MR. HOPPER: It's up to you and the body. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, yeah.

MR. HOPPER: As long as the Members are okay . . . (inaudible). . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Members, can I open public testimony?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No objection.

... BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY ...

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, thank you. Please come. Please state your name and the organization that you represent, and thank you for putting the effort in to be here. Good morning, Mr. Hokama. He's my Vice-Chair is here. Thank you.
- MR. PAISNER: My name is Jeffrey Paisner. I've testified here before. I'm a property owner in lower Nahiku and also a property owner in lower Kula on Maui. My understanding is this is the transportation meeting about roads. I've testified before, before as I've said. The specific question I have is about Lower Nahiku Road. Lower Nahiku Road has never been, the County of Maui has no legal easement to use lower Nahiku Road. This has been an issue that's been bandied about back and forth. The Council has failed to resolve anything despite numerous State Legislative proclamations asking them to do so. The bridge over the Makapipi Stream is also closed and Maui County now also, the new Councilmembers will be dealing with whether or not they're going to expend millions of dollars of funds to build the lower Nahiku Community Center on a road which has no legal easement. So, I just wanted to make sure that the current Councilmembers, the new Councilmembers are aware of this and perhaps will have the impetus and the resolve now to number one, restore access to private lands which are on the makai side of the lower Nahiku bridge which has been blocked by the County of Maui and that the County of Maui will finally take action to resolve the dispute with the State of Hawaii and determine who owns the bridge. There's only been a preliminary easement done in the last four years since the County of Maui closed the bridge. They closed the bridge that they claim they have no jurisdiction over. The bridge is a tremendous danger to tourist. The boards are rotting. I implore Councilmembers to come to Nahiku and to inspect the conditions there because both the County of Maui and the State of Hawaii are exposed to extreme liability for allowing that bridge to deteriorate the way that it is. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Excuse me. Can you say your name again?

MR. PAISNER: Jeffrey Paisner.

January 28, 2019

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Paisner. So, you know, I just want you to know that actually what you're testifying about is for the second Committee meeting that we're having at 1:30 --

MR. PAISNER: Okay.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: --which is Water and Infrastructure. So, I let you testify --
- MR. PAISNER: I appreciate. I'll come back.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- and complete your testimony, but it's really for the 1:30 meeting just to talk about infrastructure, but I don't think that item is on our agenda.

MR. PAISNER: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Lee? That's, she's the Committee Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Morning. Madam Chair, we do have this item on our agenda today under old government roads.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, it's considered an old government road?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, so 1:30.

- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, we may not specifically address Nahiku Road, but it is, it's part of what we plan to do is discern which belong to the County and which belong to the State, and we want to come up with a plan to take care of these neglected roads once and for all. So, we are going to be taking up this matter and rather than you having to stay, can you just forward his testimony to our Committee?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: I think that, is it Corp. Counsel, that's kind of an unusual situation. Is that allowed to do? Is there a way for us to do that smoothly?
- MR. HOPPER: Madam Chair, I think first of all, if this is not an agenda item in this Committee then I don't think further discussion should really take place, but I think informally if the testifier wants to submit written testimony to any committee, he would certainly have the right to do that --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. HOPPER: --or to provide oral testimony before that Committee as well, but I think the testimony today, it's not a problem to receive the testimony, but we probably shouldn't have further discussion if there's a conclusion it's not an agenda item --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, it's not.

January 28, 2019

MR. HOPPER: -- for this Committee.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So ...

- MR. PAISNER: We have supplied written testimony. It's been sent, it's been sent also to the attention of Mayor Victorino. This problem's been going on since Mayor Victorino used to be a Councilmember --
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.
- MR. PAISNER: -- and it's still not resolved.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: So what...
- MR. PAISNER: So, we have supplied written testimony --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. PAISNER: --but it is, it does relate to the County spending millions of dollars of taxpayer funds to build a --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

- MR. PAISNER: --community center off of a road that's not legal.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Mr. Paisner, thank you. So, if you want to submit written testimony what Corp. Counsel said, you can submit it directly to the next Committee, but it's not on our agenda so we cannot officially transmit your information, but I let you speak since you came all the way and, you know --

MR. PAISNER: I appreciate it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: --through the inconvenience. So, thank you very much for being here. Members, at this time I'm going to close public testimony and we're going to do the overview of the Department of Transportation.

... END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY ...

MT-10(1) OVERVIEW OF THE DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We have here Marc Takamori as well as we have Michael Du Pont who's our Deputy Director. So, Mr. Takamori, would you like to give your opening comments and educate us about your Department?

January 28, 2019

... BEGIN PRESENTATION ...

MR. TAKAMORI: Good morning, Committee Chair Sugimura and Committee Members. Thank you for having us today. Again, I am Marc Takamori. I'm the Acting Director for the Department of Transportation, and here with me is my Deputy Director Michael Du Pont, and I guess, I'll get started with the presentation.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Please proceed. Thank you.

MR. TAKAMORI: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair. So, going over for today's presentation, we're just going to go over the histories, program areas, Department goals about the Maui Bus, and the different programs that falls under our Department. So, through a proposed Charter Amendment in 2003, the Department of Transportation was created. So, in the Charter the Department was tasked in being responsible for the planning and implementation of all modes of transportation in Maui County, including those in the air, on the water, and land. The Department is also responsible for the planning and developing an efficient program to facilitate the rapid, safe, and economic movement of people and goods in Maui County and to help coordinate Maui County's transportation programs with other County departments and State and Federal agencies. So, the Department's mission is to facilitate the rapid, safe, and economical movement of people and goods in Maui County. The Department's overall goals are to mitigate the escalating traffic problems within Maui County, to provide transportation options for the residents or and for visitors to Maui County and to improve public awareness of traffic abatement measures and of transit opportunities. So, there are three program areas with many subsets. These will be identified in subsequent slides. So the County Department of Transportation contracts out our Maui Bus fixed route service to Roberts Hawaii. When we say by contract out, we go out to bid with an RFP process and we solicit responses from different agencies and they submit their proposals and a committee's put together and there's a rating committee and then a selection process is made from that committee for us to move forward with our contracts. So, that's, for our Maui Bus programs, that's what we do. We have an RFP process that's, and in the end it a contract that we go out with and so with the contract, we're, for fixed route, our service provider is Roberts Hawaii. So, the fixed route system is comprised of 14 daily routes with 18 fixed route vehicles on the road at any given time. The current concept of our fixed route system is a hub-and-spoke system. It is a system of connections arranged like a chariot wheel in which all traffic moves along spokes connected to a hub at the center. Since our head times are on an average an hour, this configuration helps riders transfer from one route onto another route at the transit hub. So, our current transit hub right now is at Queen Kaahumanu Center, and when the system first got started, that's Queen Kaahumanu Center was the hub where, that was the basis of how our system got started within Central Maui. It was from the center of Queen Kaahumanu and then with the spokes heading out. So, this graph shows the overall ridership count for the Maui Bus system. So, overall ridership counts would be, they would include fixed route, ADA paratransit and our Maui Bus commuter system. When the system first got started back in Fiscal Year 2004, we saw about 117,000 boardings. During the recession, Fiscal Year 2012, we saw our system peak to 2.7 million

January 28, 2019

boardings. This year we're anticipating around 2 million boardings and in general the ridership fluctuates. We've seen that ridership fluctuates when there's changes in the economy, in fuel prices, and in fare changes. This graph shows the passenger boardings only for the fixed route service. So, back in Fiscal Year 2007, there were 774,000 boardings and in Fiscal Year '18 there were one-point, a little over 1.7 million boardings. This graph shows the Maui Bus fixed route monthly passenger boardings over time from when the system, with the implementation of new routes from August 2006 through June 2018. And again, back in when the system started, there were 49,000 boardings back in August of 2006 and through time with the system had, I mean, adding new routes to the system there were more riders utilizing the bus service, and again you can also see the peak during the recession in Fiscal Year 2012.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair, can I just ask a quick question?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. King?

- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Mr. Takamori. Can you just like, for the general public, just quickly go over what, when you have ridership overall counts, how that's different from the fixed route? What else is included in that number?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Yeah, so again, when we say over, so Maui Bus overall counts, that includes three services, three combined services. We're adding the fixed route system, which is the large buses that are driving around, we also add the ADA Paratransit counts which are the smaller white Chevy buses that are driving around that pick-up persons with disabilities. And then our commuter service which is our service that transports people from Upcountry and from Central Maui out to Wailea and out to Kapalua, or through Lahaina out to Kapalua for people to get to work and typically those riders are people that work in the hotel industry.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you.

MR. TAKAMORI: This next slide is the ridership peak service. So, we haven't pulled up recent data for this, but as pretty much the peak service shows...so typically in urban transit areas, a peak service would be, like you have workers going to work in the morning and then you have workers riding the bus to get home in the afternoon. So, usually you'll see kind of like a peak in the morning and a peak in the afternoon, but with regards to our service this graph pretty much shows, in the morning it starts off it climbs up and it, we consider our peak service to be between 7:00 a.m. and 7:00 p.m. because it kind of just continues growing until around 7:00 p.m. and then it kind of comes back down. So, we have one peak within, in our day and which is, I guess, not typical when you compare to urban areas where they have peaks in the morning and in the afternoon.

January 28, 2019

- MR. DU PONT: So, this next slide, we do currently offer our fixed route riders app that allows them to track where their bus is. The app provides information on when the fixed route buses are expecting to arrive. Fixed route riders are able to gain access to the real time location and arrivals of the buses via the Maui Bus smart phone app as well as online at Mauibus.org. It also allows riders to be informed of delays, route detours, as well as provide our Department with feedback. This Maui Bus app was officially went live in August of 2018. With the new Maui Bus app we are able to track its usage based on the period between September 2017 to the ending of December 2018. We have seen 6,900 new registered devices. On an average we're seeing 155 active devices per day with 771 checks daily. Just a side note, 4,568 of those devices are Apple users and then 2,351 of those devices are Android users. The County of Maui contracts out our ADA paratransit service to Maui Economic Opportunity. They are a non-profit entity who also handles the County's human service transportation programs as well. The eligibility for the ADA paratransit service is based upon a person's disability and functional capabilities. In not being able to use the regular bus service. This service is an advanced reservation curb-to-curb shared service which is available within the corridors whose boundaries extend three-fourths of a mile on each side of each fixed Maui Bus route. To give you a general idea of the paratransit service area, it is the dark green shaded area around all of the routes. I don't know if you can, if you want to look at the slides. So, that green dark area, that is all of the paratransit service that we have.
- COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Question. Has there been any public asking for certain areas to be serviced outside of the green areas?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Du Pont or Mr. Takamori?
- MR. DU PONT: For paratransit or fixed route?
- COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Both.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori, maybe you can explain how the paratransit works in relationship to your fixed routes.
- MR. TAKAMORI: Alright. Thank you, Chair. Member Sinenci, so how, I guess, to answer your question, there are, you know, different communities that are asking for our services to be provided in their area. How the relationship between fixed route and the ADA paratransit services, wherever we provide a fixed route service, we also have to provide a paratransit service. So, anywhere we extend fixed route, we provide the paratransit service for persons with disabilities. So, like, I guess, part of this map again you can see the dark black lines are pretty much where our fixed routes are and then three-quarter-mile radius between or three-quarter-mile radius on either side of our fixed route service is the service area that we provide for our ADA paratransit.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

January 28, 2019

MR. DU PONT: This graph will track the Maui Bus paratransit fiscal year passenger boardings from the program's inception in Fiscal Year 2009 to last fiscal year. When the paratransit program first got started there were 11,777 boardings. Last fiscal year we saw a total of 80,142 boardings. Overall there are a little over 1,400 qualified users of this service. On-time performance was at a 93 percent for Fiscal Year 2018. As you can see the paratransit service for persons with disability has been steadily increasing with ridership. This graph tracks the Maui Bus paratransit monthly passenger boardings from July 2008 through June 2018. When the paratransit program first got started, there were 816 boardings back in July of 2008. We are now averaging around 6,500 passenger boardings a month. The County Department of Transportation contracts out our Maui Bus commuter service to Roberts Hawaii. There are four routes with most of the routes servicing the central area out to West Maui. The Maui Bus commuter service started in Fiscal Year 2007 seeing 60,205 boardings. Last fiscal year, there were 188,780 boardings. On an average monthly boardings are around 15,500. This slide will show the monthly breakdown of passenger boardings on the commuter services from Fiscal Year 2007 to Fiscal Year 2018.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Just a quick question. What is, if you were going to create a new commuter route, what would be the minimum ridership commitment you would need?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?

- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. Member King, thank you for that question. With regards to the commuter service, a lot of times when we're asked for adding additional buses for our commuter service, a lot of it has to be determined based on people that we aren't servicing at the different hotels. What's very tough with the commuter service with, when working with the hotels, is a lot of hotels, their workers start at different times. So, unless they can somehow fit with the schedule of getting to the hotels early enough for them to start it makes it a little tough. So, it's a little hard for us to say what the rider commitment needs to be, but we need to know from the hotel standpoint where if we...the hotel needs to be able to come out and say that, you know, we're working with the other hotels to kind of say, hey we're working with the other hotels and we have a commitment of our riders that if you can provide a certain time range then we're going to make certain that we support our employees to ride the bus service. And so most recently, I think, in Wailea there was a hotel that is or has been working with the other neighboring areas to figure out what types of service or what times are feasible for their workers. And so, I guess, we're still working with them to figure out if it's going to be feasible or if it's not. So, a lot of it comes down to the persistence as well as if the hotels are able to find riders from their staff.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And I guess what I'm looking for is, are you looking for 80 percent full, you know, if you could guarantee or have a commitment for 80 percent full or 70 percent...what percentage are you looking for to at least break even?

January 28, 2019

MR. TAKAMORI: Oh okay.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: If you don't have that number that's okay, but I'm just curious to see, you know, what we can, you know, what kind of a commitment you need and if we could have those hotels do, you know, promise to subsidize it if they don't get that number. I just wondered if there was a number that you needed for that commitment.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori.

MR. TAKAMORI: Chair? Thank you. We don't, I guess, I don't have that number with me, but currently how our schedules are set, we use 55 passenger motor coaches on the commuter service, and so, I think, it's the buses that are starting off early in the morning, a lot of it is, it's all first come first serve, right. So, if you can get a seat on the bus, a lot of those earlier buses leave full --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. TAKAMORI: --completely full from War Memorial Stadium. So, I guess the question becomes that we're asking within our Department is, hey if we throw on additional buses in the morning time, will that still create the demand where a lot of people still want to go out full in those buses, but then also allow additional people to come in or are people saying, I'm not going to ride the commuter service because it's first come first serve and if I don't get a seat, then I have to take the next bus which that doesn't work for me. So, that's kind of like the fine line of what we're kind looking at right now.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yeah.

- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you.
- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, you're fine with the answer? Do you want us to send a follow-up letter?
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Well yeah, I mean, you know, my main concern is if these coaches have to go out 60 or 70 percent full then can we send two of them out and so we make sure we cover everybody who wants to ride the bus, and if we don't get that threshold then maybe that's something that the hotels could get together and subsidize for us to make sure that their people get out, you know, an efficient like a ride share type of activity versus just kind of leaving some people out in the cold that don't get on the bus or having to have empty buses that don't pay for themselves. So, that was kind of my main thrust. I think they're working on it, Chair, so I just wonder if you could come up, if we, if you know, if you don't have that number now eventually you can

January 28, 2019

come up with a number so that when some of us, because I talk to the hotels a lot in South Maui. When we're talking to the hotels we know what that number is and, you know, it's part of the conversation. Thank you.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, Staff, can we, we can do a follow-up letter, yeah, as part of this presentation.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, I've seen the hotel buses go out and is, there's lines of employees waiting. So, do you also help the Maui Memorial Medical Center? I know that the employees park there, and then they get, I don't know whose shuttle it is, but they get shuttled to the hospital. Mr. Takamori?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. With regards to the hospital shuttle, that is actually under...so it used to be under State and now it's under Hawaii, the new --
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: The new organization. It's under Kaiser.
- MR. TAKAMORI: -- the new organization. Yes. So, they handle all of that.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: It's private.
- MR. TAKAMORI: Yeah.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So, not us.
- MR. TAKAMORI: Private.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. Can continue.
- MR. DU PONT: The next few slides I'm going to go through represents the different types of vehicles that you'll see in the total Maui Bus system. So, for the Maui Bus fixed route, there's four types of buses. You'll see the larger green 40-foot Access buses, which hold 41 passengers with 2 wheelchairs. You'll then see our 35-foot Easy Rider buses which hold 37 passengers and 4 wheelchairs. Then our newer Access buses which are 35-feet which holds 32 passengers with 2 wheelchairs, and then we have 4 cutaway vehicles that are 25 passengers with 2 wheelchair lifts. Sorry. On the average of the large transit buses they have an average of 441,000 miles with an average of 45,000 miles being added onto them annually. The oldest of our buses would be the green 40-foot buses. On an average those buses have over 845,000 miles. For paratransit service we do have three types of vehicles. We have the eight-passenger, four-wheelchair AeroLite Chevy vans that you'll see primarily on the road. We do have a five passenger, two wheelchair MV-1, and then we do have four Dodge Caravans that hold six passengers with two wheelchairs. For our commuter service we do utilize again Roberts Hawaii motor coaches that hold over, that hold 56 passengers and it, all of them are also ADA compliant, they can hold up to two wheelchairs.

January 28, 2019

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Ms. King?

- COUNCILMEMBER KING: I'll try to make this quicker. So, for the paratransit, are folks who are using a wheelchair, are they allowed to have someone accompany them who can qualify for riding on these paratransit?
- MR. DU PONT: They are able to. Yes.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So, that's what the, where the van comes in with the five passenger?
- MR. DU PONT: It just really depends on the service that they're asking for. The vans are more for like a personalized or harder area for the bigger vans to get into, but they are able to ride all of the vehicles.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So, do they have to have a, like a pass if you're accompanying somebody or you just whoever shows up, is okay? You have to get prequalified for that?
- MR. DU PONT: They're all qualified in advance.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh okay. Thank you.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Mr. Takamori, the paratransit contract is with MEO and we, and these vehicles then are the vehicles used by MEO. Do we purchase it or do they purchase it?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. That is a good question. So, the two services...yes, so correct, the, our paratransit contract is contracted out to MEO. With regards to the ownership of our buses, the County of Maui owns, we go out and purchase our own buses for our fixed route fleet and for our ADA paratransit systems. So, we provide those buses with the contract, but the contractors have to maintain them and the only services that we, for the commuter service we, it's a contract with Roberts and that's the only service that we rely on the contractor to provide their own service or own vehicles for the service. Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, vehicles. Thank you.

MR. TAKAMORI: Okay. So, there are approximately a little over 200 bus stops in the Maui Bus system. This shelter designs were done through community input. So, the barrel roof designs were to symbolize the ocean waves and therefore would be found in areas near the oceans. So, the, if you're looking at the slide, the upper right-hand image of the lower left hand image, those are the ones with the barrel roofs. The more standardized roof lines are found in the Central and Upcountry areas. The paint used are more resistance to graffiti and easier to maintain. Some of our bus stops do have back and side screens which provides privacy, but yet allows the natural trade winds

January 28, 2019

to pass through. The shelters are also equipped with solar lining which provides light in the late evenings and is also programmable. It, should we put it, or it's also programmable so we can set the duration of how long we want the lights to stay on. The chairs with arm rests were chosen to deter people from lying down on the chairs and taking up all the seats. And then at each of the bus stops with shelters there are bike racks, trash and recycling receptacles that are provided for the rider's convenience. All shelters are power washed once a month, and trash picked ups are done once every three days. We contract out the pressure washing and the trash pickups out. We contract that out to People Who Clean, and then the bus shelter project was done following the Maui County Bus Stop Planning and Design Services Plan prepared by KFH Group.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori, how much does it cost to build a bus stop?

- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. With regards to the cost of bus stops it really depends on the location of the bus stop. So, if it's a flat location, then you don't have to deal with like...there's certain locations of bus stops that have hills and so we have to build a retaining wall and so that adds to the cost. So, on average a single bus stop planning and design, I mean, the design and planning for the infrastructure, the concrete and then adding the shelter on top with labor, typically comes out to be a little...around \$100,000.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, thank you. Do you have any bus stops that you're planning for the future that we can possibly see in this next budget or is this too soon?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. With regards to that, we actually have two bus stops shelter projects that are currently ongoing right now. We should be seeing some activity happening. It's right, it's both of them are in Wailuku Town and they're both fronting the State building on High Street and the State and County building on Wells Street. So, we're going to be installing one shelter in each location. So, two shelters and we just had a preproduction meeting last week, and so our understanding is that they plan to be onsite this week starting the process of, I guess, improving the ground infrastructure before the shelters are installed. Shelters are actually, have arrived from Michigan and are onsite at their baseyard. So, our contractor who's doing the installation of these two shelters are Global Specialty. I think Global Specialty, is it contract...Global Specialty Company.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yeah. So, this is just the Central Maui transit. So, Central Maui transit hub as you've probably been aware in, and also in the newspaper is that we've been on October 5, 2017 we were notified by Queen Kaahumanu Center that our license to occupy agreement will not be renewed and is set to expire at the ending of January 2020.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, may I ask a question?

January 28, 2019

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Ms. Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just was wondering did we used to pay Queen Kaahumanu Center for the use of their area as a hub?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?

- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. Yes, Member Paltin. We actually pay, we have a license to occupy so we pay a dollar a year.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.
- MR. TAKAMORI: So, we've been working with HHFDC, the housing, the Hawaii Housing Finance and Development Corporation and DAGS, the Department of Accounting and General Services, and we were able to find a new location for the transit hub at the old Kahului School site off of Vevau Street and near the Kahului Public Library in Kahului next to Queen Kaahumanu Center. And, I guess, with regards to the Central Maui transit hub, we're also going to be talking about this in the next presentation, the TOD presentation coming after this presentation. The County of Maui committed 650,000 for planning and design in this year's budget and the State of Hawaii committed \$2.5 million for construction. So, this is what the transit hub may look like from the top down view. It's still under design and is subject to change. So, if you looking, if you're looking at the monitor or on your slides, we put where the different streets are. So, if you're looking at the hub, on the left-hand side is going to be Kane Street, on the right-hand side is going to be Lono Street, fronting it is going to be the Catholic Charity Senior Housing Rental Project and we're going to be off of Vevau Street. So, what's going to be happing is that when we relocate to the new transit hub site, we're going to be, our buses are going to be coming either entering the area either from Kane Street off of Queen Kaahumanu Avenue or they're going to be coming from Kamehameha Avenue off of Lono Avenue. They're going to come down Vevau Street and then turn onto, turn into our property, and then we're going to stage the buses on property, and then when they're done, then they'll turn out of the property and then they're able to then head back to Kane Street or back to Lono Avenue. So, that's, so part of the reason why we're turning onto property is that we're allowing the buses the ability to head back in the direction that they came from. If we were to be stationed on the roadside then all of buses would be forced coming from one direction versus at least dispersing where all the buses are coming from.
- MS. PALTIN: I had another question.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Paltin?
- MS. PALTIN: So, from there would they still like do a drop off at Queen Kaahumanu Center?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Member Paltin. Yes, we still are expecting to have, I guess, we still need to have that discussion with Queen Kaahumanu Center if they would still consider us having just a stop at their facility or if they're asking us to actually

January 28, 2019

relocate off site and not have a stop there. So, we don't, I don't have a final answer on that.

- MS. PALTIN: So, if they don't allow it then people just, if they want to go to the mall, they just walk over there?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. Yes, Member Paltin, they would from our transit hub, they would then have to cross the street at Kane Street. Yes.
- MS. PALTIN: Are there any considerations for safety at the new transit hub, like security or something?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?

- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. Member Paltin, we, currently right now we do pay Queen Kaahumanu Center for security. So, that's actually built into the contract. So, we pay Kaahumanu Center a dollar a year for a license to occupy the area, but we do provide funds to pay for a security guard from when our buses first arrive in the morning, to when our bus finally departs in the evening. So, we expect to continue having a security person at our transit facility once we make that move. Yes, along with, we will also have a dispatcher onsite that is somebody that will be, you know, selling passes, monthly passes, daily passes, and providing information to riders as well.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori, in relationship to that question then about safety, the part of, I think, the next presentation we're going to hear more about the transit-oriented development and how it all ties together. So, stay tuned for more regarding that. Good question. Continue.
- MR. TAKAMORI: Okay, so this is the Maui Bus operating budget. The graph depicts the total cost to operate the Maui Bus services. So, it starts in Fiscal Year 2010 up to Fiscal Year 2019, and so for the Maui Bus system, we do contracts. It's a five-year contract, or it's a one-year contract, with four one-year add-ons. So, it's a, you can go up to a total of five years and every five years then we go out to bid to solicit, I guess, new vendors, if new vendors are interested in providing service and then they can bid again. So, the last five years, or the first five years was Fiscal Year '14 through '18 and then we just started, we're in our first year of our potential five-year contract from Fiscal Year '19 to Fiscal Year 2023.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, thank you for that information. So, the one-year contract with one-year add-ons, allows us to reassess every year and we as a County contractor

January 28, 2019

we have the option of reviewing that and putting it back out to bid or how does that work? Is it just automatic?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?

- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. I guess, yeah, to answer your question, we do it because I think it's all subject to funding. So, we were told that it's always a one-year contract with additional one-year add-ons because we're only funded for that one year. And so if, so every year, I guess, what you said is you can reevaluate if the vendor or the contractor is not living up to what the criteria of the system is then or if a vendor decides to withdraw from providing, you know, the following year service then the contract can, I guess, that would be reviewed by Corporation Counsel, but it could be terminated and put out to bid again.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, but does the system also allow you to put in additional efficiencies into the next year, you know, additional requirements?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Chair?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.
- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. Yes, we have a really good working relationship with our current contractor. So, typically throughout the year if we can figure out or write up policies or, you know, make changes with regards to efficiencies, we typically make those changes within the year or within the next year. Yes.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So, you're able to have that flexibility?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Yes.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yes, Ms. Lee?
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Let's see. My understanding is that our ridership has declined steadily since 2012, and I noticed here that the operating budget has increased exponentially since that period. Is there any particular reason why?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?
- MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. Yes, you are correct. The, our ridership has been steadily decreasing from Fiscal Year 2012, and I guess, that's, it is a national trend. So, a lot of our sister county agencies are also seeing the same effects of ridership, fixed route ridership decreasing. With regards to our operating budget, we've seen an increase because we've also added different additional routes as well as we go out to

January 28, 2019

bid, the, our vendors with regards to wages and cost of doing business, those costs have increased. So they come out with their bids and their bids have increased over previous year's costs. So, that's why there's been an increase throughout the years.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair. Okay, I understand that. However, the increase is like 50 percent. So. you know, we're talking like 2012, 8 million and now the projection is 12 million for 2019. So even though you've increased the different sites it's at a premium cost. So what kinds of efficiencies are you looking at to offset these high costs?

MR. TAKAMORI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. With regards to your question, one of, I guess, one of the examples that I can provide is when MEO took over the paratransit contract back in Fiscal Year 2014, their cost per hour actually saved the County over \$800,000 from the previous vendor. So, that when we went out to bid, that came back as a cost savings. With regards to efficiencies for the paratransit system, the persons with disability system, we implemented, we worked with MEO and implemented an electronic scheduling system, reservation and scheduling system. So, what was happening under our previous vendor was that whenever a person with disability made a reservation, a lot of the buses that were sent out was manually scheduled so it wasn't quite a shared ride system. When MEO took over with this automated scheduling system it forced riders to share rides with others. And so I don't know, back in Fiscal Year 2014 there was a lot of outcry from the community with regards to this taking them longer to usual to get to their destinations, but we just had to educate the ridership that hey this is, we're still providing the service under FDA rules and guidelines and it is a shared ride system, and so that, MEO has definitely saved us a lot of money with regards to implementing that type of system.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: One last question please.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Ms. Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Mr. Takamori, what would you say is the percentage that the County subsidize per ride or the average ride?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Is it for all riders or just the paratransit?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Just the average for --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Average for everybody.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: --overall ridership, how much do we subsidize?

January 28, 2019

MR. TAKAMORI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. Member Lee, we're actually going to get there, but I can tell you right now. So, for, with regard, so what, we call it the fare box recovery rate which is basically, let's see. So, the fare box recovery rate is basically what you're getting back with regards to what the cost of the service is and so the fixed route system, the riders are paying out at least 28 percent. That's what's being, that's what we get back, 28 percent of the total cost for fixed route. For ADA paratransit we are getting back 4 percent and then the commuter service we're getting back 19 percent. So, the rest is being subsidized by the Highway Fund.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, it's a service that government provides. Thank you. Continue.

MR. TAKAMORI: Okay, so this is our funding sources. So the Department funding comes from these different areas. The General Fund, the Highway Fund, which includes the public transit fares, motor vehicle weight tax, fuel tax, and franchise tax as well as we receive funds from the FDA. So, this is the Maui Bus revenue tracking and this is all Maui Bus services combined. So, I guess, back in Fiscal Year 2010, our revenues were \$2.3 million. In Fiscal Year 2012, we saw it go up to 2.7 million and then we are now seeing it come back Fiscal Year 2018 we are seeing a 2.4, a little over \$2.4 million recovery in terms of our revenue. In 2012, we had a, that's when the \$2 daily pass Okay, so with regards to funding sources, comparing was implemented. Fiscal Year 2013, the upper left-hand graph to the Fiscal Year 2017, that is, I'm sorry, Fiscal Year '19, the lower right-hand graph, there has been a shift of using less \$2 per boarding and more people using monthly passes to ride our buses. So, for the \$2 per boarding in Fiscal Year '13 it went from 40 percent down to 33 percent and then the monthly pass holders in Fiscal Year 2013, it went from 26 percent up to 34 percent in Fiscal Year '19. And then for paratransit breakdown, we're seeing 46 percent of our riders are holding a monthly pass followed by paying \$2 per boarding and then utilizing a \$4 daily pass.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: What's the cost of a monthly pass if I may ask?

MR. TAKAMORI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. Member Sinenci, there's, it just depends on the service or the system. So, if you are riding the fixed route, you can buy a \$45 general pass. If you are a student on fixed route you can, you'll pay \$30. If you're a senior on fixed route

January 28, 2019

you pay \$25. And then there's a \$4 daily pass. If you are, oh, and if you're a persons with disability you have a \$30 pass on fixed route.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

- MR. TAKAMORI: So, this chart just breaks down or provides a general idea of how many passes we have sold within the last fiscal year for the Maui Bus, and so the most popular pass is the daily pass followed by general passes. So, yeah, so it says Fiscal Year 18, we sold 185,000, little, almost 186,000 daily passes and then general pass we sold 11,800 general passes.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. King?
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you. So, the daily pass allows you to pay \$4 and ride the bus all day long? That's what it is? Okay. Pretty good deal.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: And it happens. Mr. Takamori?
- MR. TAKAMORI: And it's a really good deal, and you can use that ... so, there's passes that are available on paratransit as well. So, for paratransit riders that's a really good deal and there's only monthly passes available, there's only a \$45 monthly pass available for commuters. No other passes available on commuters. You can pay every time you board or you buy a \$45 pass. And then this is just a breakdown for the current fiscal year for our system. So, revenues from fares, these figures are all Maui Bus services combined, so fixed route, paratransit, and commuter. So, overall comparing Fiscal Year '17 to Fiscal Year '18 we've experienced a decrease in ridership of 6.3 percent and with revenues decreasing by 2.3 percent. For this fiscal year we are expecting another decrease in ridership to be just shy of 2 million boardings and revenues at around \$2.2 million. So, again, the fare box recovery rate is computed by dividing the system's total fare revenue by its total operating expense. And so the fare box recovery rate for Fiscal Year '18 was 23 percent, and then the previous year was at 26 percent. So, this is the breakdown of each programs cost per passenger trip, its revenue generated, its revenues generated and its fare box recovery rate. So, if this is for Fiscal Year '18 and this is the one that I've, I was, I provided Member Lee with. It shows the breakdowns between fixed route, ADA paratransit, commuter, and human services transportation. Those are the, that's our primary bus service provided from our Department. As you can see, cost per passenger trip for fixed route is \$4.43 or 34 cents, paratransit was \$25.71, commuter is \$5.55, and human services transportation was \$19.29 and then the different fare box recovery rates was 23 or 28 percent, paratransit 4 percent, commuter 19 percent and human services transportation 0 percent since no fares are collected on that service and that service is a grant that's given to or provided, it's a grant to MEO to provide the service and as of right now, there's no fares that are collected for that, for the program.

January 28, 2019

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Mr. Takamori, the human services transportation are like for students or seniors that, the senior clubs that take trips? Is that what human services transportation?

MR. TAKAMORI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. I guess that, yes, you are correct and we will be talking about human services transportation in the next few slides.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next, okay. Thank you.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yes.

- MR. DU PONT: So, our Department also oversees a grant to Maui Economic Opportunity to provide human service transportation that services clients on Maui, Lanai, and Molokai. The grant for this fiscal year was \$6,380,515. Last fiscal year human service transported 6,060 individuals and had 320,364 boardings. Some of the programs that fall under the human service transportation are senior services, nutrition, rural shopping shuttle, youth trans, taking youth from school to County funded youth agencies such as Boys and Girls Club, Maui Adult Day Care, and dialysis. This graph shows the passenger boardings on human service transportation program from Fiscal Year 2007 to last fiscal year.
- MR. TAKAMORI: Our Department also oversees a grant subsidy to the State Department of Health on contracting out services for our air ambulance program. So, as you can see, there were a total of 53 trips performed in Fiscal Year '18 with majority of them being from Hana out to Maui Memorial Medical Center. This current fiscal year there were 15 trips provided with 93 percent of the trips transporting residents and 73 percent being medical related. Here's the breakdown that shows the trips taken from Fiscal Year 2018 with the 53 trips, with 53 trips and majority of them, 35 of them were from the Hana area to Maui Memorial Medical Center, followed by Lanai to Maui...oh, followed by West Maui and then followed by Lanai.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you. Mr. Takamori, what would be a non-medical related reason to take an air ambulance trip? If you've got, it says 73 percent of trips are medical related so you got 27 percent of them that are non-medical so can you just kind of give us an overview of what that would be for?

MR. TAKAMORI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

January 28, 2019

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. With regards to, so the reports that we were given by the State Department of Health, is it's broken down by if it's medical or if it's trauma. So, medical is like heart attacks and things like that. Trauma is more like they broke their leg, and, I guess, it's still medical but --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Just, yeah, sounds like it was still medical.

MR. TAKAMORI: -- no, they still, they break it out that way.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, basically, they're all somewhat --

MR. TAKAMORI: Medical.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --medical or emergency situations.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yes. Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just a question for clarification. You said there was 35 from Hana, transits from Hana. That is just on the air med? That is not like any, like the use of the fire rescues or anything like that? Is that part of it?

MR. TAKAMORI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Member Sinenci. No this is just for the air med. We don't, none of the counts come from, I guess, the Fire Department. Yeah, this is totally separate.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

MR. TAKAMORI: And this is a breakdown of the trips within this current fiscal year, 15 trips total so far up to December of 2018 and majority, nine of them from Hana area followed by Lanai, and then followed by Upcountry. And then looking forward back in December of 2018, the Department through the Mayor's Office submitted a budget amendment for our Maui Bus ADA paratransit contract. We are expecting to, we're

January 28, 2019

expecting to have enough funds through April leaving the last two months of this Fiscal Year in jeopardy with a possibility of service disruption. So, we just wanted to give the Committee, but I guess, it's just wanted to give a heads-up as the request has been transmitted the Economic Development and Budget Committee. So, when that, that will most likely be heard probably within next month or so.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. TAKAMORI: And then this is just for the public. This is our contact information. We have a website, a general e-mail, our office hours, and our address.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

... END PRESENTATION ...

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, Members, at this time I want to open it up for discussion. I'd like to start off with Mr. Hokama, our Vice-Chair.
- VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you. Are you planning to have another meeting before Budget --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: To go over.

VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: -- Session to go over additional more specific details.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, I will.

- VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: Okay. Then I would just say that I appreciate this general overview this morning. It was quite accurate. I think what we would, I would prefer though is that the Committee be at least aware of the audit we did and what was some of the audit recommendations especially regarding the obvious lines that Ms. Lee, you know, is concerned about, expenses growing, revenues decreasing, and some of the comments that the auditor provided in considerations of how we can address that. Our, you know, City and County is grappling with that issue currently also. So, again, you know, there's only so much that the subsidy can support. So, I think that audit would be helpful for the Committee's future work. Thank you.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good point. Thank you. Any other Members have questions? Ms. Paltin?
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was wondering, you know, how, well, we all have our own parking spaces but parking seems to be a problem here, and I was wondering if it's a possibility like say, if folks park at like Maehara Stadium or someplace where there's a lot of parking, and just shuttle folks into this area like during I think, 7:45 and then five o'clock or like beginning and pau hana times. Would that be a possibility ever? Especially, you know, if the work is going to be done in the municipal parking lot.

January 28, 2019

some people use that. Is that something that could be, even if say the municipal lot doesn't become the civic hub for a longer-term solution is that something that could be a possibility?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. Member Paltin, thank you for that question. It is a possibility. I know that it could come up as a discussion point in the next presentation, but or in a presentation with, when we're talking about the municipal parking lot and that redevelopment. I know that one of the items that were being looked at when I had discussions with Erin Wade, was providing a circulator shuttle system and providing the ability for people to park at War Memorial Stadium, and then having it circulate within Wailuku Town because people will be displaced at that parking lot when construction does start. So, it is a possibility and I know that it's also being considered from that project side as well.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And I had another question. Like I notice, you're talking about the buses and the air, the air med. I had to go to Honolulu a lot last year for medical things, and I noticed their Biki bike program, would that also be under your purview if like the County of Maui ever wanted to start some like bike share kind of deal?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. I think that's a very good question, and I think we'll have to work with the Department of Public Works to find out who has that purview.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Ms. King? Are you done, Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Are you done?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes, thank you very much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, thank you. Ms. King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. And thanks for the overview, I really appreciate it. One of my main peeves about our Department of Transportation is that people always get it mixed up with the State Department of Transportation so that might be good to clarify that at the beginning of the, you know, the differences between the State Department of Transportation what they do and then our

January 28, 2019

Department of Transportation which is focuses mostly on the bus system and mass transit. But I did want to just like, you know, urge you to take a look at that audit again as Councilmember Hokama said. My main thoughts after hearing the presentation is that the commuter service really should not be costing us. It really should, if it's a benefit to the hotels there should be some kind of a partnership there, and so if there's a minimum ridership which I'm guessing would be around 70 or 80 percent, that there's a guarantee there by the benefactor of that commuter service which is really the employer of those people and so maybe we can start those discussions and, you know, figure out a way that they can guarantee that the cost will be covered so that we're not out of pocket for that. Because I think that, you know, we do subsidize a lot of this system which I'm not, I'm, you know, I'm in support of because I think it's a huge public benefit, but whenever we look at, you know, what portions of it are private benefit then we should try to maybe do a little more partnership with the private entities. So, that's my main comment, and thank you very much.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Ms. Lee or Mr. Sinenci. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, just a comment. Thank you for the presentation. It was very informative and I believe our residents in East Maui have a renewed appreciation for the air med services. So, mahalo. And just to comment, I'm looking forward to when we go into the budget and looking at new ideas and ways to help to save money and to increase ridership. So, mahalo.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Mr. Sinenci. Ms. Lee, do you have any?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. Mr. Takamori, thank you for the presentation. I just have a question for clarification. When we were talking about the fixed route system and you were talking about the subsidies, the percentage of subsidies, which one required a subsidy of 96 percent, 4 percent cost?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Takamori?

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you, Chair. Member Lee, the 4 percent fare box recovery rate, that's for the ADA paratransit. So, that's the Maui Bus, you know, paratransit service that provides rides for persons with disabilities.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yeah.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Anybody else have questions?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair, can I make one more comment?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. Yes.

January 28, 2019

- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you. One of the things that keeps coming up is the well you know, when I look at the history of what's happened with the ridership over the years, you see it related largely to the drop in petroleum prices and then it goes up during, you know, ridership goes up during the recession, and I really want to urge the Department of Transportation to partner with the climate change efforts because this is a huge part of it, getting people off the road and having, you know, having multiple people in one vehicle that's polluting our earth rather than individual. So, we've been seeing a lot of reports lately about how little time we have to get onboard with this, no pun intended, but to actually seek these solutions and so and I see the multimodal transportation and the mass transit especially as going as a big part of those solutions. I just wanted to make that comment, and hopefully we can bring you folks onboard when we have those discussions going forward in this next term. Thank you.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. I'm going to ask one last question, then we'll close this section and do a recess for the next item. But I was just wondering for you buses in general, Mr. Takamori, so maybe we'll send a letter to you if you could give us history for when we have our budget discussions about the age of all the buses and how many miles and when do you think we need to replace them, and give us some details so that we can plan for the future. And I'm sure we must get grant funding from that from the Federal government. So if you could provide us those kinds of details would give us more comprehensive information. I know during the Budget Session which it also came up about the different, the contracts that we had to provide the services and the cost so we'll talk about more of that in detail because that is a big reason for why your cost increased and we did hear about it in the last Budget Session. Members, anybody else have any more questions? if not, I'm going to take a short recess, five minutes so that we can set up with the next panel for our Maui Transit-Oriented Development MT-10(2). So, thank you very much both of you for, no, I'm sorry, Mr. Hokama.

VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: ... (inaudible) ...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I'm sorry. I'd like to defer this so we can continue talking. Thank you. No objections, Members?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

ACTION: DEFER.

January 28, 2019

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, I'm going to call a short recess. ... (gavel) ...

RECESS: 10:23 a.m.

RECONVENE: 10:33 a.m.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ... (gavel)... Welcome back to the Multimodal Transportation Committee.

MT-10(2) MAUI TRANSIT-ORIENTED DEVELOPMENT)

CHAIR SUGIMURA: The second item that I have on my agenda is the Maui Transit-Oriented Development, and with us today we have a whole panel of Department representatives and this is MT, Multimodal Transportation Item 10(2) and we're going to have a presentation today. And about two weeks ago I was in Honolulu and I heard this presentation that was done by Pam Eaton, David Yamashita, and Marc Takamori that was done to the Legislature regarding the transit-oriented development and what it was about was their presentation was asking for the Legislature for \$500,000 for planning for a plan to do a multimodal connected transit-oriented development plan for us, and I wanted to have this Committee hear about it. I also wanted to have this for our Council to support bills when it came up for Committee meeting and the Legislature and the two bills are House Bill number 1457 which was introduced by Representative Troy Hashimoto on the House side asking for the \$500,000 planning money as well as Senate Bill 1471 which was introduced by Senator Gil Agaran and also asking for the support, and I was hoping that as a Council or that we could support these bills as it went through to try to ensure that we receive a portion of or all of the \$500,000 planning money and the presentation today will take us through the process of why it's important. The transit-oriented development was created because of the rail system in Honolulu and at that time, the City...the Legislature appropriated, I wanna say, \$1 million for planning for this to happen, but did not take into consideration the outer islands. It was primarily said to be for the whole State, but it was focused on the rail system in Honolulu and so the presentation that was done by those that I just mentioned was to ask for consideration from the neighbor islands for these TOD funds. Also present at the meeting were representatives from the Big Island and Kauai, but I think Maui we had our best presentation. You were very prepared for it and I was proud to be there to support you and I wanted you to present to our Council the presentation that you have and to see how we can also support this for our betterment of our community. So, at this time I would like to ask Pam Eaton maybe if you could take the lead. I should introduce who's all here first.

MS. EATON: I can do it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You can? Okay, you can introduce everyone here, Pam, and what the roles are for the different.

January 28, 2019

... BEGIN PRESENTATION ...

MS. EATON: Okay, Chair Sugimura, thank you very, very much for this opportunity. And yeah this is great timing given that this is your first Committee, and this is a terrific Committee to have. I'm very excited that transportation, multimodal transportation is combined in a Council Committee. There is a huge amount of opportunity with this. So, this effort started several months ago and I'd like to introduce the team because I think it's important for Councilmembers to know that these County departments are working very closely together and we're addressing this in a way that is really following in line with the Maui Island Plan as well as obviously when we update the community So, I'm going to start far down to the left with Buddy Almeida who's from plan. Department of Housing and Human Concerns; Nolly Yagin who is from Department of Public Works; Marc Takamori you've heard from, he's to my left; to my right is Dave Yamashita from Parks and Recreation; and Lauren Armstrong from the Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization, the Maui MPO. Unfortunately, we're missing Erin Wade, but Erin Wade who represents Maui Redevelopment has also been a really key member of this team. So, right now, what we're going to do is we're going to be giving you what we gave at the Legislative briefing, and huge amounts of thanks to Senator Agaran and Representative Troy Hashimoto. They agreed to sponsor this Legislative briefing. The reason why we had the briefing is for the last three years I've been serving as the Mayor's designee on the Hawaii Interagency Transit-Oriented Development Council, and I'm going to go through what that's about. Quite frankly it's been very oriented towards the rail even though it is supposed to give support to the neighbor islands. So, there is a sub-committee of neighbor islands and we sort of just pushed very hard to make sure that the Legislators understood that this also included the neighbor islands because I think the common misconception unfortunately is that this was only dealing with the Honolulu rail. So, that was the purpose of the informational briefing was at the opening of a Leg to let folks know that it also included support for the neighbor islands. So right now, I'm going to channel Rodney Funakoshi. He gave the first part of this presentation and again, also thanks to Office of Statewide Planning. They have been very, very supportive of the neighbor islands. So, this started, basically the Transit-Oriented Interagency Council started and was created by Act 130, and essentially what it's supposed to do is that act really created the Interagency Council, and if you read that act, you'll see that there's a very critical piece in there for us that also expands support to neighbor islands. Office of Statewide Planning is the lead State agency and essentially what this Council is based on in terms of CIP projects and planning funds is are based on smart growth and transit-orient development principles. Act 131 basically broadened the other critical State agency is the Hawaii Housing Finance Development Corporation, HHFDC, to really target mixed-use development with affordable housing and facilitating interagency partnerships with the State and County agencies. Finally Act 132 really looks at and allows that ability to finance these projects. So different types of financing structures, something that's called P3, which is essentially private-public partnerships, tax increment financing, and also opportunity zones. So, the primary responsibilities for the council is essentially facilitating the funding and also I would urge you, I think it's very well done, we had to create a strategic plan, a TOD Statewide strategic plan and what it does it that it really gets into what TOD is, what the projects

January 28, 2019

are in terms of CIP projects for each county and kind of explains some of these smart growth and transit-oriented principles. What I would like to point out since this is asked quite a bit is, there's a variety of State agencies that serve on this council. Some of the acronyms you may not be familiar with. HCDA, Hawaii Community Development Authority; Hawaii Public Housing Authority; DAGS, Department of Accounting and General Services; Department of Human Services; Personnel Support Detachment from the Navy; everybody knows DOT; DLNR; DHHL. Then there's also partner-ups which includes developers, the affordable housing advocate, and various businesses and architects. As I mentioned, the strategic plan for transit-oriented development is a really good document. It's got great information and what it has in there in the back is a listing of the CIP projects for each county and that gives you the information in terms of how the TOD Council will be supporting that each year. I think the other critical thing to know because this translates directly to the work we're doing here in Maui County is first of all, TOD projects in the Interagency Council must be on Statewide lands. So, that's how it's targeted and these particular properties must fall within at least a half a mile of a transit route which in the case of the neighbor islands, obviously, would be the bus route. So, the types of components that are very critical for these livable communities are we're looking for compact, dense, opportunity rich, affordable housing is very important, mixed-use development, walkable, pedestrian and bike friendly areas, multi-modal transportation options, and then a proximity and access to jobs, services, and the necessities of daily life. Finally, what I really want to point out in this slide is the final darker blue line and that is the plan of recommentations [sic] for the permitted interactive group. I hate that acronym. I fought but I didn't win. At any rate, what we're really asking for this year from the actual Council is there's very little funding and support that goes to Office of Statewide Planning to staff this so we're hoping that will get some more support because they really provide a lot of technical assistance and training to help us in terms of identifying these projects, creating these master plans with the neighbor island TOD planning and implementation. So, with that, I would like to go to talk about what is TOD mean in the neighbor islands and I will go to Lauren Armstrong.

MS. ARMSTRONG: Thank you, Pam. Well, my name is Lauren Armstrong. I am the Executive Director of Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization or MPO and we are Federally funded with participation from County and State as the transportation planning agency for the island of Maui. So, I'm really glad to see this team made up of different County departments looking at TOD planning because ultimately we want to see improvements that, you know, benefit our quality of life and affordability for residents here on Maui. So, even though we don't have, you know, high population density as Honolulu or that would support a rail system, there is still of lot of important planning work that can be done to make sure that we have safe walking, biking, and transit options in our communities. So, thinking about what is TOD. So, it includes housing, work, shopping, schools, and parks in a walkable environment within a half mile of transit. So that could be bus transit here on Maui. So. in communities like this, people of all incomes and abilities would be able to safely and comfortably use the transportation system to get to their daily necessities. So, why is this so important? You know we're updating our 20-year transportation plan through the MPO right now and the top concerns for people are safety, resilience, and

January 28, 2019

efficiency. So, we're dealing with increasing traffic congestion here on Maui. For example, Kaahumanu Avenue has over 50,000 vehicles daily. I think many of us have experienced the congestion during peak hours, and we know that it costs a lot of money to add lanes to our roads and to build new roads and also that if you build it, they'll come so it's really not a sustainable model to continue building additional road capacity. Rather we need to look at ways to invest in our transportation system to use it more efficiently and for multi, multiple modes. The other thing about Kaahumanu Avenue is it connects these two important centers for Maui, Wailuku and Kahului. These areas have a lot of potential to add affordable housing, and that would be consistent with our Maui Island Plan with our urban growth boundaries. So, you know, places around the world that are the best places to be for people, they really made a decision to invest in transportation infrastructure that makes it comfortable to walk and bike. So, looking up, I believe this is Wells Street in Wailuku, Main Street, okay. Main Street, you can see the civic hub of Maui. So, a lot of people come here to work, dine, go to school, attend First Fridays. Just imagine if there was more housing within walking distance of all these services. If kids could walk and bike safely to school and if you had bus transit running frequently, maybe every 15 minutes to get around, then you wouldn't have to worry about parking. So often as Pam mentioned, when people hear transit-oriented development, they think of a rail system, but actually bus TOD can function in a similar way that's at an appropriate scale for neighbor islands. You can have fixed stations along a corridor that prioritizes buses and kind of acts as a spine for sustainable land use and economic growth. This really generates interest from private investors because they can see the government's commitment to that corridor and having, you know, safe walking and biking connections to the bus stops. So, you know, ultimately, not everybody can afford to drive or is able to drive. So, from an equity standpoint, it's really important that we carry forward this initiative. So, thank you to Pam and everyone for having this presentation today.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Pam. What, so what order are the speakers? Just curious.

MS. EATON: Dave is next. Dave Yamashita.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair, can we can we ask questions?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sure, Ms. King.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. I just didn't want to get, thank you, I didn't want to get too far into it before we go, going back, but if we go back to the previous slides, I wanted to ask Ms. Armstrong if this effort is working in conjunction with or instead of the Sustainable Transportation Working Group that was a Statewide effort. We were trying to get them to come to the neighbor islands but it was started under Ford Fuchigami and also, you know, I like, I mean there's one comment about climate change but there's no mention of renewable energy so those are things that the Sustainable Transportation Working Group was working on that I didn't see in this presentation.

January 28, 2019

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Does anybody have that answer about that group? Pam, do you know?

MS. EATON: Yeah, basically the group was sort of suspended, but it sort of went into HDOT. I know over the past two years I've gone there about 20 times. They brought in the US DOT Transportation Growth for America, and we have been working on performance measures for STIP and TIP projects. Why am I not thinking of Beth's last name? Beth Osborne.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Right.

MS. EATON: So, Beth has come in and worked with that group and it sort of expanded the work in terms of bringing in State DOT staff from the State as well as the counties working specifically on performance measures, renewable energy goals, and so forth.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So, are you working with them?

MS. EATON: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Because I didn't really see any renewable energy goals.

MS. EATON: Well, we haven't finished our presentation yet.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay. So, they're coming up.

MS. EATON: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you. But this is, is that still meeting or is that group still meeting? That's the one under David Rodriguez.

MS. EATON: Right. Right. Exactly. Well, David is gone.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh.

MS. EATON: Thank God Ed Sniffen stuck in there. I don't know. I can find out, but I know it's sort of splintered off into looking on really specific goals and measures.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thanks.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Mr. Yamashita, are you next?

MS. EATON: I was wrong. I'm sorry. It's Marc Takamori who's next.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Marc, Marc Takamori.

MS. EATON: Yes.

January 28, 2019

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: This is about bus. So, this is an important element of the TOD concept right, this next section? Thank you.
- MR. TAKAMORI: Yes. Thank you. So, this with the relocation of the Maui Bus transit hub, I guess we kind of mentioned it in the previous presentation as well, this shows the existing condition at the site. So, the transit hub is going to be in the yellow square. I think in the printed, it's a little off. We fixed it on this presentation, but I think it was purple and it was a little shifted off. Yes, but it's essentially, it's where the buses are currently parked there, it's the old MEO transportation site. The mall is where the, so Queen Kaahumanu Center is to the upper-left corner of this image and then Kaahumanu, like I said previously, Kaahumanu Avenue and Kahului Beach Roads are a pretty big thoroughfare area that, you know, we have a lot of vehicle traffic and so with the relocation of the transit hub, it would allow us to continue to keep providing services to our Maui Bus riders with minimally affecting them when we do have the change over from Queen Kaahumanu Center to this new transit hub area. I guess, next slide. So, the County of Maui committed \$650,000 for the planning and design in this current fiscal year's budget and MDOT awarded the planning and design contract to Fukumoto Engineering and they had a NTP date of September 24, 2018. And the state committed \$2.5 million for construction and that currently is sitting in the CAP budget of HHFDC and the MOU and the status of the MOU between HHFDC and DAGS with the County of Maui for the use of their property has been signed and executed as of the ending of December 2018. The Maui MPO is updating their Long-Range Transportation Plan and they outreached to over 8,000 people this summer and mostly who were residents and they said that they would more likely ride the bus if and then 51 percent came said that if the bus came more often, 49 percent said if it was better bus shelters--I'm assuming better bus shelters or more bus shelters--if there were earlier and late times, faster buses, more transit maps, other and weekend services, and being in public transit we totally agree. We would like these things as well. Next slide. And then this an image of the Long Beach transit bus hub, I believe, it is the bus hub in Long Beach and this is not necessarily what our transit hub will look like, but we are taking design elements from it from we want it to be safe, we want it to be clean, we want it to be well-lit, comfortable, and shaded, and basically we want to build dignity into the transit experience. So, we will strive for this. Yes?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Bathrooms are planned to be included?

MR. TAKAMORI: Madam Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

MR. TAKAMORI: Yes, there will be restroom facilities as well as a ticketing office.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And security, right?

MR. TAKAMORI: And security, correct.

January 28, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: How about vending?

MR. TAKAMORI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Vending? Go ahead, Mr. Takamori.

MR. TAKAMORI: Thank you. I guess, we'll get to this probably in the next few slides. David probably can talk about potentially having built in like a small store, but if we were to put like a vending machine, I think, that's possible. There are spaces that we are allocating to have something like that, but from an overall picture of the site that David will talk about that. Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, Mr. Takamori, are you done or you're still...

MR. TAKAMORI: Nolly is next.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Nolly Yagin from Public Works. Thank you for being here, Nolly, and I see Rowena in the audience too. Thank you, Rowena. Mr. Yagin?
- MR. YAGIN: Good morning, Chair and Committee. I didn't actually have something prepared, but what I can talk to is the Department's role in supporting this effort. We do have a complete streets guideline as you will, that we've completed our first draft and have circulated it. What it does is, it sets aside street designs that are context sensitive which take into account needs such as pedestrians, bicycling, and whatever else needs the roadway. Landscaping as well. Safer crossings. If you take a look at this photo right here, we've worked with some of our partner community groups HEAL, Healthy Eating, Active Living, and Blue Zones Project to get some of the concerns that people have on these, on roadways such as Kane Street. And some of the concerns that they have brought up are things like not very well lit, doesn't feel safe, and more...basically that's their concern, safety and the overall feeling of safety, and so our role here is to come up with these conceptual designs. Help it to be more friendly for residents, whoever might use these roadways, and interestingly enough this leads right up to the transit hub which is planned on Vevau Street to the left. So, yeah, in short, our role is to support the design, support this project as far as street...okay, so there's a next slide. So, this is taken from our complete streets manual. Maybe a little history on our street designs. Our last official update of our standard update, standard details was back in 1984 and in 1984 all we really had was the width of the right of way and it didn't even really set aside how wide the lanes are, what's required on these streets, and so our street design manual, this is an example. It actually sets aside that we do need sidewalks, we do need to accommodate bicycle traffic. It also for a, it also sets aside the lane widths which really hasn't been done. If you notice here, if you can take a closer look, it actually says 11-foot lanes. In the past we've always pushed 12 and what that does is it accommodates larger traffic, but it also allows people to feel more at ease about higher vehicle speeds and so one of our goals is to

January 28, 2019

reduce the overall speeds of roadways while trying to maintain mobility and accommodate things like freight traffic and still accommodate the larger traffic as well.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, so before David Yamashita from Parks will take over, I just wanted to say in a future meeting we will talk about complete streets and have that presentation just so that we have a more comprehensive understanding of how this is all working together. This is so super exciting. So, David, you're next. And I also see Carla Peters in the audience and John Buck. So, thank you for listening in.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Can I just ask one question, Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Before we leave complete streets. How do you...thank you for being here because, I think, this is really important. Probably one of the most important things about transportation, but how do you decide what, where you're going to do these designs first? What the priorities are, you know, geographically?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Yagin?

- MR. YAGIN: Chair. Just to make sure, you mean, like what features are emphasized in the roadways?
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: No. No. What is the criteria, I mean, when you decide to go ahead and make a design. I mean you're not going to design every street on the island so what criteria are you using for your priorities of where you are going to address complete streets first?
- MR. YAGIN: Okay, well actually every roadway on this island is something that we want to push complete streets on. Complete streets, I guess there's always that misconception that complete streets means landscaping, bikes, sidewalks, and lanes, something that looks like this, but actually what complete streets is it's a context sensitive type of design. So, basically, if you have a roadway that needs to accommodate freight traffic, that is something we'll design for. If it needs, if people use it to ride their bicycles, that's something we'll include in the design as well. So an important part is that, complete streets is also data driven. So, when we do design, we'll need the background, we'll need more than just traffic volumes. We'll need things like, even observations and actual experiences on the road that will help us to guide the final designs. So, in short, the whole island is where we want to incorporate these complete streets elements.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Right, but there's only so much money. So, that's why I'm asking you is there, are you developing a list of criteria for what areas you're going to address first? I mean, you can't do the entire island on our budget. So, how are you going to make those decisions?
- MS. ARMSTRONG: Excuse me, Chair, can I add?

January 28, 2019

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, yes.

MS. ARMSTRONG: Or Nolly.

- MR. YAGIN: No, go ahead.
- MS. ARMSTRONG: So, at least for Federal projects the MPO is developing an evaluation framework so the part of the geographic screening for which projects would get priority includes factors such as proximity to a school, an employment center, the pavement condition because they do need to be upgraded, and so that's a tool that we can use when we're planning the sequencing of these improvements.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. That answered my question. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Oh, Mr. Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Question for Mr. Yagin. At what point, Mr. Yagin, does it have for your complete streets design that you have for future infrastructure as far as putting in if you're doing complete street reconstruction. Is there any room to anticipate future infrastructural, whether it be water piping, whatever as part of the design or even mass transit like a light rail or something?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Yagin?

- MR. YAGIN: Chair, thank you. So, for future project, for future design we will take into account what was identified in things like long-range plans. We'll consult with our partner departments such as Transportation, even some utilities, what are their future projects in the area and we'll always make sure to accommodate those somehow. So, yeah.
- COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I just wanted to ask that question because oftentimes you see Oahu and when there's a pipe main, a main break and it just kind of shuts down the, you know, a lot of the infrastructure so I'm just thinking ahead. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, Mr. Yamashita, are you next?

MR. YAMASHITA: Yes. Thank you, Chair. There are two, I guess, guiding principles that we've used in thinking about this transit corridor. One is, and it's a principle that's basic to all progressive planning and that's that transportation and land use need to be coordinated. And you should always be thinking of those two items when you think about new development. The second thing is, second principle is that transportation corridors need to be designed for both, for a variety of modes and it sounds basic, but if you look at really our roads, they are designed mainly for vehicles and that's typically how many cities across the country have developed. So, this a

January 28, 2019

whole new era where we begin to think about more than just how to get cars from one place to another, but think about really a more comprehensive approach to moving people and it could be through vehicles, but it could certainly be something else. So, with that introduction, I will also say that the transit centers, we thought about this, is part of a much larger effort in the whole area. We thought about this as part of what we call the complete community which means that you should, you could have and in the next slide we'll show this, within a half mile say you could have, well not quite yet, but you could have access to a variety of services and that's what you have complete streets, you could also have complete communities. So as we looked at the transit center, what's important at a micro scale is to not have this be a security and safety problem and it just gets at, I think, Councilwoman's Paltin's concern. So, this is just an idea to show that what you could do is to design this transit center to be part of a larger open space and you could have a convenience store or something that's right next to it so you have eyes on the space and you have a constant stream of people. The other part of this is that the HHFDC affordable housing site is right next to the transit center. So, you could design the housing so that also, it also provides eyes on the transit center. And so that's one of the concepts. Another one is to create a network of pedestrian corridors to link the transit center with other destinations. So now you're beginning to employ place principles of place making of trying to create walkable communities making it accessible for everyone regardless of ability and to create a safe environment. So, that's kind of the, one of the concepts, then now we move to the next one.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Before you leave that --

MR. YAMASHITA: Sure.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: --slide. So the housing project coming up there is now under construction, right?
- MR. YAMASHITA: No, the one that's under construction is to the left, right. I'm sorry. The Catholic Charities Senior Center Housing, right, the affordable.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right. Okay.

MR. YAMASHITA: Right. So, we step back even further and take it up to say 20,000 feet and you can see that the transit center which is kind of in the middle left, I guess, in that pink box, but it's part of, really, a larger effort. And a group of us started this last year as we started to think about the transit center and wanted to have a regional context for all of this that it's not just looking at the transit center and even the HHFDC project, but trying to maybe reimagine what could happen between, in this large area between the two malls, because it seems to be a kind of underdeveloped, unimproved piece of land, and yet it occupies such a strategic role in the whole kind of urban community in Kahului. So again, this is just an idea to think about how would we make this transit center part of a real complete community. So, you'll see a white circle and that represents a half mile from the center and you could say, you could see that within this half mile you have access to a number of services. You have a big

January 28, 2019

park to the lower left, Kahului Community Park which also has the senior housing complex, Hale Makua. So, they're going to want access to that area. You also have the two shopping malls of course, but you have a library, you have a swimming pool, you have Hoaloha Park which is to the, just towards the harbor and so you have this access to all these really great services. So, imagine if you will a community of all kinds of people, not just older people, but you could conceivably have, walk, within 20 minutes have access to all these different things, and this is, again, part of what we're looking at is complete community. And interestingly enough there was a community in this in the area between the two malls, there was a whole town. It was called, I think it was called railroad camp and there was a whole community of people that lived there and there was a reference we came across, a historical document that refers to a Mr. Ooka who had just started a store and he had this new idea for how to provide services within the store. So, there's a lot, so there's a really rich history. So, now stepping back even more, thinking about how the ReWailuku project started because Wailuku is one end of this transit corridor so, you know, we started in 2012 trying to think through what Wailuku could become and--okay next one--and since grown to include several projects. The Wailuku Civic Complex is of course one of the projects to try and maintain the importance of Wailuku as a kind of center for community life, and the courthouse expansion with the State. We've been talking to the State about how we can help insure that they stay in Wailuku and keeping the Judiciary in Wailuku is part of it and working with them on expanding the courthouse. Another, the third part of this is the redevelopment of Wells Park which we got some money to start the design for phase one. So, again, if you, you can see Kaahumanu Avenue as the kind of spine and, connector between Wailuku on the left, Kahului on the right, and what's really interesting--next slide, Pam--is when you look at the uses along the spine, it's you'll see and you can visualize this, a lot of public ownership. There are two things yeah. A lot of public ownership which means that we have control over much of the property, but there are a variety of users too. That's what's really pretty interesting. So, you have the high school. You have Keopuolani Regional Park. You have UH Maui College. You have the hospital. You have the police station. What else? You have MACC a little to the north. So, it's just a great opportunity and I don't know that there's any place else in the State where you have a situation like this, where you have two of an island's major towns really in proximity to one another and then also have all these institutional uses along the spine as well. So, it's really kind of a very unique partnership. So, what does a multimodal corridor look like? So, here are just some images. This is taken right along Kaahumanu Avenue, but these are some of the major elements. So, starting from the right going to the left, you could look at housing, or some other uses along the corridor. There would of course be a sidewalk, bikeways, and a thing about a bus rapid transit is that you do have stations that are specifically designed to create a really comfortable transit experience so people are going to want to ride the bus and it's as Marc said, it's about trying to create a transit experience that has dignity, but also is fun, it could include public art and all kinds of things, but you know, that's, this is partly what it's about. The other thing is making pedestrian connections from along the corridor into the adjacent land uses. If you drive down Kaahumanu now and you look at how the adjacent land uses respond to say pedestrians, it's not real friendly. It's, you know, there's great access for vehicles, but there are other things you can do to just make it

January 28, 2019

a lot friendlier for pedestrians who may want to get into UHMC or whatever the use is. The other thing that needs to happen is that the whole walk, the pedestrian experience needs to be comfortable. You don't see a lot of street trees. So, if you want to walk from Kahului to Wailuku, I don't think it's going to be real pleasant. So, that's part of looking at multimodal.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Ms. Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. I just need to check, with all these multi committees, where are we going with this? Are you coming up with a multiplicity of conceptual plans for people to consider or are you working this towards molding some kind of ordinance or several ordinances?

MR. YAMASHITA: Well...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go. Who wants to answer that?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's the next slide.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Next slide.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, do you mind?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, my sixth sense.

MR. YAMASHITA: It's a great segue into the next slide.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And by the way, I just want to say that you don't have to worry about providing ridership to the police station. I don't think there will be much demand for that.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Very good, Ms. Lee. Okay, here we go.

MS. EATON: Thank you. Yeah, that was a great segue. So, the 500,000 that we are requesting from the Legislature is basically to take a look at the feasibility, first of all of this transit corridor because essentially what we're doing is we're linking essential State and County services. So, ideas of the scope of what we'd be looking at in this master planning effort are the current and future transit needs, outreach and education, a huge part amount of that needs to be done because I think a lot of folks, this whole TOD concept is fairly new. There's a, as you've seen a lot of overlay in terms of the need of affordable housing and how that's linked, what a Complete Community is, what transit can provide, the importance of linking jobs to transit and so forth. We plan to come up with or look into some sort of an evaluation framework

January 28, 2019

in terms of what are the performance measures, what's successful, how can we look into this, how do we scale and look at those various things, what are the various alternatives for the corridor, what can be done, what are the preferred alternatives, and then of course, most importantly looking at an implementation and funding plan. What I did not include in this, but please know it's a part of our scope is that part of this effort, and one of the reasons why the State is pushing transit-oriented development is looking at meeting renewable energy goals right, using less energy and less fossil fuels and so forth, and also of course incorporating the impacts of climate change, particularly as you're looking in those areas down by Kahului. So, what I did want to say is that there are two Senate bills, I'm sorry a House bill and a Senate bill, before I get into this next slide. So there's Senate Bill 1471 and essentially that bill authorizes the Director of Finance to issue GO bonds to finance the planning of this with the, of the Wailuku-Kahului Transit Corridor Master Plan, and then of course that was introduced by Senator Agaran. Representative Hashimoto introduced House Bill 1457 related to transit-oriented development. This appropriates funds to the Office of Statewide Planning for the planning and development of the Wailuku-Kahului Transit Corridor Master Plan. Basically, it authorizes \$500,000 for 2019 to 2020, and then also authorizes and asks for \$500,000 for 2020 to 2021. I really only have two slide left. When I spoke with Chair Sugimura, because she saw the briefing there was also a part of this, the two other neighbor islands and that was Hawaii island and Kauai and I think what they're also asking for and their work is also really critical because they have a great dependence on affordable housing. So, they've, this slide you're looking at now, transit-oriented development on Hawaii island. This is basically the map on the right shows the Puna District which is almost the size of Oahu and they were stating that it's the fastest growing population in the state. As I'm sure many of you know, Puna has very little infrastructure. So, essentially, they are asking for planning funds and design funds to try to enhance their village cores again based on the principles of transit-oriented development. On the left is Keaau Village master plan and the goal of this project is to provide housing for those folks displaced by the 2018 Puna disaster. So, they're looking at trying to build transit-orient development and a transit hub into that area, again, a complete community in trying to link jobs, transit, and housing, and services. Kauai has built this concept into their general plan which they passed last year and so they have integrated ongoing initiatives into the long-range framework for growth management and community development. They have been a great help to us in terms of they have designed and incorporated complete streets, special planning areas, place making, foreign base codes, and new housing types. So, they've been, actually, a huge help to us and they've been a great mentor. For Kauai they have five projects that they are currently working on. They've already planned and right now they are trying to build and implement and you can see it on that map. Essentially, it's the Kauai affordable housing site in Koloa. Again, it's on a bus transit route and it's an affordable multifamily rental housing project. Pua Loke affordable housing in Lihue. Again, affordable housing, it's a multifamily housing project with planned and permanent housing for the homeless. It's in close proximity to their bus transit route. Lima Ola workforce housing site in Eleele is an affordable single family, multi-family community, also has a community center and a park in very close proximity to the bus transit. Mahelona state hospital site is in Kapaa, and that is the Department of Health and HHSC site. It's proposed for redevelopment for a

January 28, 2019

medical center, affordable housing, public services, commercial and retail on their bus transit route, and then finally the old police station. The Department of Health in Lihue is a DAGS site and it is, there is a proposal for mixed-use development with affordable housing, public services and it's right on the transit hub and near a school. So with that, we're done, and that's really the completion of our presentation.

... END PRESENTATION ...

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you. So, what I wanted to, we have Buddy Almeida here and, Members, a really important aspect of this is besides transportation that this is to also provide housing for rental and for purchase. So, another link, and I appreciate Buddy and Nolly being here because when we put this together, I was just thinking about what I saw in Honolulu which was the basics and I would love to hear from Buddy, and we also have Linda Munsell in the audience who does housing also, but if, Buddy, you could add to this --
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair? Chair?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- and I appreciate...
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Is it possible to ask a question before we leave Ms. Eaton's presentation?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sure.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, sorry about that, but I just wanted, I wanted...I appreciate the mentioning even though there's nothing in here about renewable energy and, but I am concerned about the sea level rise. You know, we made, the Council last year, last term passed a resolution that we with your help, that we adopt that, you know, the recommendations in the State plan and so it would be good to when we're looking at these, you know, and I understand this 500,000 is just for the Kahului-Wailuku corridor so it's not an overall, it's not meant to plan anything else, but when we are looking at these types of maps it would be good to see an overlay of what we're looking at for 10, 20, 30 years as far as sea level rise so that we know that we're not investing money that, you know, we're going to have to keep retreating from. So can you speak to that? because now this keeps coming up and I keep saying this, you know, can we see the overlay and I haven't seen this and I am really concerned.
- MS. EATON: Thank you for your question. Again, with the maps we use today, a lot of times when you put a lot of data layers on a map it gets too cluttered and you can't even read the map. But you question is very important in that, with looking at the Kahului area, Dave did a great job at describing, we had over the summer a wonderful workshop with many County agencies and departments, and those maps we had the overlay because of course in Kahului in the transit hub area we were looking --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Right.

January 28, 2019

- MS. EATON: --tsunami inundation areas as well as the 3.2 sea level rise zone that we've all heard about. So, we had in our planning efforts and looking at infrastructure and doing an inventory of critical assets that might be susceptible to the 3.2 climate change or sea level rise in those planning efforts we had that on the maps. Again, this effort is extremely preliminary. We are asking for the planning funds, but we have the data thank goodness and we've got basically the ICAC report that we all use so that will be incorporated absolutely into future planning and implementation efforts. Thank you though.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Is it possible that we could get a copy of that, the maps that you used that show the inundation zones?
- MS. EATON: Sure. Yeah. Absolutely.
- COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, Mr. Almeida is next, and I also see Erin Wade in the audience and I'm not too sure if you also want to make comments. Just let me know. Thank you, Mr. Almeida.
- MR. ALMEIDA: Thank you, Chair, and good morning, Committee Members. Buddy Almeida, Housing Administrator. Ms. Munsell and myself recently joined the TOD team. Our focus and contributions are in the areas of trying to find affordable housing opportunities within this Wailuku-Kahului transit corridor, opportunities to develop properties that can take advantage of all these services that they have gone over this morning. One that is identified that is right on the cusp of the half-mile radius that Mr. Yamashita touched on earlier is the UHMC dorms that I know that Mayor Victorino was looking at taking back and we're going to take a look at, you know, different development opportunities, ideally an affordable housing rental complex in this area that would be able to be a walkable, bikeable opportunity for people to live, work, you know, have the ability to get services and things of that nature. We're also looking at other properties, other possible partnerships with landowners, developers in this area that we can again partner with to try and develop affordable housing opportunities that again can take advantage of things along this corridor and can again make it a walkable, more bikeable type of community setting. So from Ms. Munsell and myself, Chair, that's our focus and what we're looking to contribute to the team. Thank you.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. You're an important element of this team. It is, the purpose of the TOD is for housing and the mobility portion so I'm glad you joined this and joined the group as well as the complete street conversation. Ms. Wade, Erin Wade is here in the audience, I wonder if you want to contribute to this because the TOD project status funding reported for the island of Maui also includes the Wailuku Civic Center redevelopment. So, you're an important, you're one of the to-do things that we need to add to this discussion. Is there a place...

January 28, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair? Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just a question for Mr. Almeida before you bring on...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, so looking at some of the housing needs along the corridor, what are your plans or just working with the Planning Department to push some of these housing projects through? Is there a strategy or a plan to do that?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Almeida?

- MR. ALMEIDA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Member Sinenci, for that question. As mentioned, the UHMC dorm site is a property that is currently owned by the County. It's leased to UH Maui College. That initially is a property that we can look at, you know, right away as far as, you know, possibly taking back the lease and developing the property into ideally an affordable rental community project. And then we also are looking at other opportunities within this corridor, you know, possibly to acquire land for development or to partner with landowners in this area to develop affordable housing opportunities and we would work with the different departments to try and expedite that.
- COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Is there a number, a targeted number that you guys want to make some of these units, some of these housing units?
- MR. ALMEIDA: The density we want to try and make as much as possible. With the dorm site we would want to maximize the density for that area. If the property is developed say under a 201H format, we can look for exemptions to density, you know, codes and requirements to where we can possibly get more units out of the project. So, we want to try and take advantage of density opportunities. Obviously in this corridor there is only certain, you know, amount of land and opportunity to develop. So, we want to make sure we get as many units in these projects as we can.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. At this time then, Ms. Wade, do you want to contribute to this as you are part of the TOD councils in the project status report.
- MS. WADE: I would love too. Thank you. Thanks for the opportunity to be here. Just regarding Wailuku Town and our analysis in looking at the transportation infrastructure, when we first started planning for the area around the Wailuku municipal parking lot, we did a traffic study and it became very evident very quickly there's already heavy congestion and there isn't adequate width on any of those roads to expand them to accommodate the level of congestion that is there even now and is likely to continue without seriously affecting the neighborhood character of Wailuku. So, instead, we started looking to what are our alternative options and those include additional regional connections which is one of the reasons we started reaching out to

January 28, 2019

Department of Transportation, Public Works, and Planning to figure out what can a long-range plan be for additional solutions to additional regional connections to the area. Looking at in town connections trying to encourage folks to make the number one priority walkable, when you're taking a trip that's just half a mile within the Wailuku area, and we have 19,000 folks working here every day during the week, that they're making that half mile trip on foot as often as they possibly can because if we continue to plan for any of our cars to have multiple parking places throughout Wailuku, we're just going to keep building more and more parking and it's not necessarily going to contribute to the housing supply or the economy in the way that we want to encourage those things. So, the walking trips and then the third is obviously multimodal. How can we get people for on those further trips using an alternative mode of transportation? So, those were the things that we were looking for Wailuku and then in partnering with the little group on this as well.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you. So, that's the, all of the presentations. Members, anybody have questions on this? Mr. Hokama?
- VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: Thank you, Chairman, for scheduling this. Appreciate the general overview of trying to have coordination. I think that is an area of improvement we all desire. We're all hoping for some successes. So, first couple of things. You know I appreciate the comments because I would agree, we need to take into account everyone's concern regarding sea level rise as it's going to impact this proposed project site. So, that's I would be in agreement with that. A couple other things though, and first is the bigger question, Chairman, and I think that is something Council is going to need to have a conversation with the new Administration and the Mayor on what is going to be the County's policy regarding shoreline. Okay. Are we going to take a compromised position in that we will retreat in certain areas that make sense and we will harden areas that make sense? So, my point is, who's made the decision for Kahului already about, what I'm hearing is, we are taking a hardening position as I hear some of the comments as it relates to this TOD perspective, okay. I don't recall that conversation whether we've made that policy decision on what, how much, and where if anything we're going to harden and protect and what we're going to allow sea level rise to do what it's going to do. So, for me, Chair, we got to have the discussion sooner than later because investment is going to be determined by our policies on capital improvements. Another thing though also is I hope we take into account some of the, I think, timing is great. I think who needs to be here though is Finance because through real property and our advancement in our 3D assessments we already have the foundation of smart planning. We have the 3D capacity to do the underlays and overlays of where the hydrants are going to be, where the manholes going to be, where we going to make the main junction boxes for traffic control and first response. We have that capacity, okay. We're going to need that Department's division to be a participant. We've already made that financial investment. We are already receiving the operational benefits of collecting those funds we should have and haven't that has paid for our investment. We are close to making these things happen, Chair. The other thing is, have we already checked with the A&Bs? They proposed that big project in Kahului Shopping Center which was to build senior housing, adjust their commercial development for a walkable community. It didn't

January 28, 2019

move forward because of lack of interest. What has changed for the State that all of this housing now is going to work? Okay. I've been around a long time. Whv wouldn't we put the transit center closer to Kamehameha Avenue and follow through with that widening to make it the four-lane road it's supposed to be and make that our smart alternative transit route instead of Kaahumanu. Is that part of the consideration of this TOD or are we already predetermined it is Kaahumanu or nothing? Kamehameha Avenue has been planned from the '60s to be four lanes. Why is it that wide? Because it was always planned to be four lanes down the road. Why aren't we talking about what is that role of that major collector road in our regional design? Because one thing for sure I would want and I'll put it on the record now, Chair, I don't need a homogenous project that Wailuku-Kahului becomes a twin city. I need our two cities to remain its own character. Wailuku is Wailuku. That's why I'm glad for the Wailuku components, and Kahului should be Kahului, but I don't need a gray of what is Kahului and what is Wailuku. I don't need a gray of what is Waikapu. I think we should honor those districts and those communities, and allow them to retain their identities. So, I hope the project takes that into account too, Chair. The other thing that I'm kind of concerned about is also, Chair, in hearing is how we're going to approach standards especially for the TOD housing and commercial developments. One thing we have to improve on that we have done really poorly overall in the State, but Maui we've screwed it up too is insufficient parking, minimal parking requirements. Okay. So, for me, with the TODs and everything else, I have no problem requiring one stall off street per bedroom.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wow.

- VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: Because if we don't address this soon Kahului, I hate to see what that could be in 25, 40 years. It's going to be ugly. Okay. 'Cause the roads won't be able to handle all those cars from those monster house lots.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Interesting discussion.
- VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: So, Chair, that is my points that I want to bring up that, I think, we need to have part of this discussion if we're going to be serious, the addition of additional appropriate divisions that make sense for us, and for you to start proposing the appropriate meetings for us to make policy decisions that Council needs to make votes on because what are we going to do with the sewer treatment plants, what are we going to do with our water lines, okay? Beach Road, airport, Kahului Harbor, we're going to need to decide, hardening or retreat. What is the smart and appropriate financial decision? Thank you.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Mr. Hokama. So, in summary Committee, what Mr. Hokama is talking about is the Esri software program that RPT real property tax has available that will probably give us some of these information asked by Ms. King as well as Mr. Hokama on sea level rise and the impacts of the streets and so if we can ask, and maybe another discussion we can get RPT to come in here. That's always and maybe that's another important discussion or another department that we need to have in here. So, hardening or retreat as, the sea level rise discussion, we can further

January 28, 2019

talk about that. I think when we had this item that came up regarding the bus hub in the last term, it was determined during that meeting that this particular area designated was not going to be affected by sea level rise, but we will continue that. Mr. Hokama?

VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: Just quickly, you know, they can check with our counterparts, my understanding is that Honolulu City and County has already made some decisions on certain areas. So, like so certain areas on the south shore, whether it be from Diamond Head to the airport, they've already made adjustments for certain projects and I would say that's between 8 to 12 inches changes of base elevation.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

- VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: Ask the engineers, ask the architects how much that's costing in price to build that extra layer to address sea level rise, and that's only 8 to 12 inches. What you'll notice is certain projects will not be happening because of that component, but it's part of the factors we deal with, Chair, okay, but it's already happening. And we need to start making decisions for our County and our businesses to do appropriate adjustments. Thank you.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. And then your other question regarding A&B and the Kahului shopping center or status, and so we can check into that to see where that is, and also...
- VICE-CHAIR HOKAMA: Well, it's just smart if we're going to invest in housing, we should know the market conditions.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Right. And then...oh yes, Pam?
- MS. EATON: I just wanted to add that with regard to Kahului, thank you, Councilmember Hokama, that we have been working with A&B. A&B's been at the table with us and they are very interested in pursuing us, but thank you for that.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: So, they are still looking at their housing project? Oh, excellent. And interesting to look at Kamehameha Avenue because as we all know, when you look at Kamehameha Avenue is that people park on the, in front of their houses so that there's this huge parking lot of, you know, or use of that land which is supposed to become a four lane one day, but that's what we see right now, but you're talking about parking standards and the impact of that in terms of this whole planning. Before I call on Ms. Lee, I just want to say that I think and maybe if, Ms. Eaton, you can confirm this, but part of the TOD as the rail project did was to look at connecting State projects together and then to do this transit in between this and that's how would qualify for this 500,000 of planning money and so if the Committee can add to that discussion or if you can get us to understand, is there a way of us qualifying for this with some of the points that you're hearing now from the Council?

January 28, 2019

MS. EATON: Thank you, Chair, for that question. In the strategic plan for transit-orient development that was created, the Maui has four projects. One of the projects is the transit hub, another one is the HHFDC property that would have affordable rental housing, another is the courthouse, Wailuku Courthouse expansion, and then a fourth one is actually in West Maui, it's the HHFDC property Villages of Leialii. So, because we have in Wailuku and Kahului area those CIP projects, we can, we are showing that through the transit corridor, we're linking the services and people to those services and critical State assets. So, it's not necessarily blurring or sprawling in between. Absolutely not because one of the things we talked about is the importance of retaining character and place making but it's trying to connect the people to those services. So, your reference to qualification, we would qualify because we're showing how using transit we would be connecting those critical State and County facilities and services.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Ms. Lee?

- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. I have a question for Pam. In looking at one of your slides, it seems that, like you used Wakea Avenue as a sort of a boundary, is that something that is sort of final or and were...and using Wakea Avenue, was it following some kind of principle that it had to, that the people within that boundary would be within so many miles of the hub of town and the schools and so forth?
- MS. EATON: That's a great question. We did do a walk audit looking at these areas, but I'm going to toss this to Dave who wants to give a more specific answer.
- MR. YAMASHITA: Right. I prepared this graphic and this was so preliminary. This was just an idea for drawing a line around an area and saying let's think about, let's focus on this area as a kind of project area and think, look at how the parts all fit together, but it's really just, I mean it's not 100 percent arbitrary, but it's just trying to find a kind of boundary that sort of makes sense, but again this is a, really a working map for this group of people who just started to think through how the transit center fit within a larger context.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Just for the Committee's information, I would like to know if we could get this to be on Granicus or available to the Committee which is the Hawaii Interagency Council for Transit-Oriented Development and this was a report back to the Legislature for this session which prompted this discussion and prompted us to ask for the \$500,000 for planning money to participate in this, but in the very back under Appendix A, it talks about the TOD project status and funding report to the Council which was reported to the Legislature and on there, the projects that are familiar to us is in Lahaina, Villages of Leialii affordable housing, HHFDC as you may know put in \$30 million along with that Front Street budget bill, but anyway the Villages of Leialii is in there. The second one is Kane Street affordable housing project. The third one is the Central Maui transit hub. And the fourth one is the Wailuku Courthouse expansion. All kind of touched upon today. The fifth one is the Wailuku Civic Center redevelopment and it's on its way. The sixth one is the Wailuku-Kahului transit corridor. So, all of the elements of which you have presented is part of the

January 28, 2019

master planning of how to make this transit, or TOD work and it's an exciting time to see this happen. I wanted to also say that the Committee, this Council reported back to the Legislature, Pam, on what you said so your voice was heard loud and clear because they actually allocated funding so that neighbor islands could actually take trips to attend the council hearings because it was made up of the neighbor islands which I'm not too sure how you made it there before but it doesn't sound like they planned for funding, but 15,000 was set aside for neighbor island travel, 69,5 to fund a new TOD program manager in the Office of Planning and 79,000 to fund and transfer the existing TOD Council, TOD coordinator position to HHFDC in Office of Planning. So, things are moving and things are happening. So, thanks for your enthusiasm for sticking through this. Members, anybody else have any more questions? Seeing none, I'm going to defer this for another meeting.

ACTION: DEFER.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Members. I appreciate all of you being here and I look, we're going to have our next meeting and we'll continue on with this discussion. This meeting is now adjourned. ... (gavel)...

ADJOURN: 11:47 a.m.

APPROVED BY:

Soik Supprund

YUKI LEI K. SUGIMURA) Chair Multimodal Transportation Committee

mt:min:190128:jg

Transcribed by: Jaydee Giron

January 28, 2019

CERTIFICATE

I, Jaydee Giron, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in

any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 19th day of February, 2019, in Kahului, Hawaii

Jaydee Giron