AFFORDABLE HOUSING COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

September 4, 2019

Council Chamber, 8th Floor

- **CONVENE:** 1:31 p.m.
- **PRESENT:** VOTING MEMBERS:

Councilmember Tasha Kama, Chair
Councilmember Michael J. Molina, Vice-Chair (in at 1:38 p.m.)
Councilmember Alice Lee (out at 3:49 p.m., in at 4:05 p.m.)
Councilmember Keani N. W. Rawlins-Fernandez (in at 1:38 p.m., in at 3:45 p.m., out at 4:29 p.m.)
Councilmember Riki Hokama (out at 3:00 p.m., in at 4:07 p.m.)
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura

NON-VOTING MEMBERS: Councilmember Tamara Paltin (out at 3:26 p.m.)

STAFF: Alison Stewart, Legislative Analyst Stacey Vinoray, Committee Secretary

> Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge) Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

 ADMIN.: Linda R. Munsell, Deputy Director, Department of Housing and Human Concerns
 Mimi DesJardins, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

Seated in gallery:

Michele McLean, Planning Director, Department of Planning Paul Haake, Fire Captain, Department of Fire and Public Safety Oliver Vaas, Fire Fighter IV, Department of Fire and Public Safety Shane Yoshida, Police Officer III, Department of Police Corey Tom, Police Officer III, Department of Police

Greg Brown, Greg Brown Development Tom Schnell, PBR Hawaii

OTHERS: Christopher Richardson Alberta De Jetley

September 4, 2019

	Lori Sablas
	Joan Martin
	Linda Garcia
	Cindy Lester Ke`eaumoku Kapu, Kuleana Kuikahi, LLC
	Valerie Lester
	P. Denise La Costa
	Gordon Firestein
	Trisha Higashi
	Augustine Hosino III
	Mavrick Kigimanang
	Revatua Kemiche
	Mark Marolf
	Rose Valle
	Stephen Webb
	Fran Mitsumura
	Shyloh Stafford-Jones
	Van Fischer
	George Brown
	Conrad Oandasan
	Aaron Coon
	Erwin Fagaragan Tam Plaal humu Badrimusz, Encouting Consultant, Ca Maui, Inc.
	Tom Blackburn-Rodriguez, Executive Consultant, Go Maui, Inc. Jade Wilson
	Michael Williams, President, Maui Tomorrow
	Kenneth Ginsberg
	Basho Elliot
	Randy Mulcoy
	Sasha Taylor
	Marilyn Montaigne
	Kimokeo Kapahulehua
	Kimo Kinimaka
	Julia Alos
	Brian Klingbail
	Kosei Nagata
	Dallas Castillon
	Mark Deakos
	Mapuana Samonte
	Additional attendees (32)
PRESS:	AkakuMaui County Community Television, Inc.

ITEM AH-1(3): INDEPENDENT DEVELOPMENT OF THE MAKILA FARMS PROJECT (LAHAINA) (MISC)

September 4, 2019

CHAIR KAMA: ... (gavel). . . The meeting of the Affordable Housing Committee shall now come to order. Today is September 4, 2019 at 1:31 p.m. in the afternoon. Please, if you would all please silence whatever noisemaking devices you may have. My name is Tasha Kama, and I'm the Chair of the Affordable Housing Committee. With us today, we have Member Shane Sinenci. Aloha, Shane.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Member Alice Lee, good afternoon.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair, as they say in Japan, konnichiwa.

CHAIR KAMA: Konnichiwa. Also, Mr. Riki Hokama, good afternoon.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Good afternoon.

- CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. And also with us is Non-Voting Member Tamara Paltin, good afternoon.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha, Chair.
- CHAIR KAMA: And Ms. Yuki Lei Sugimura.
- COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good afternoon.
- CHAIR KAMA: Aloha. Thank you for coming and thank you for being here. And today also, we have not here with us and a Non-Voting Member is our Chair Kelly King. And I assume that Mr. Molina and Ms. Rawlins-Fernandez will be with us shortly. So, with us, we also have the Department of Housing and Human Concerns, Ms. Linda Munsell. Good afternoon.
- MS. MUNSELL: Good afternoon, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: And with us from Corp. Counsel, we have Mimi DesJardins. Aloha.

MS. DesJARDINS: Aloha.

CHAIR KAMA: And we have our Committee Staff, Stacey Vinoray, our Secretary; and Alison Stewart, our Legislative Analyst. And then we have our project developers here, Mr. Greg Brown from Greg Brown Development. Aloha. Thank you for being here.

MR. BROWN: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: And Mr. Tom Schnell from PBR Hawaii. So, I'd like to welcome all of you to today's meeting of the Affordable Housing Committee. And there is only one item on our agenda for today, AH-1(3), the Affordable Housing Projects, Chapter 201H, Hawaii Revised Statutes, Independent Development of the Makila Farms Project in Lahaina.

September 4, 2019

Since I believe that many of us will be able to benefit from hearing about the proposed Makila Farms Project, prior to the start of public testimony, I will be inviting the project proponents to make a presentation to the Committee. And I ask that the Committee Members would avoid asking any questions and hold on to them until after public testimony today. Also, I'm going to also allow the public to testify. And if you haven't already signed up, please do so now. It is my intent to take all the public testimonies right after our presentation. And after the presentations are done, I will close testimony, and then if there is time for the Council to deliberate. If it runs a little late, then we'll just close public testimony and we will reconvene at a recessed date to deliberate. So, Mr. Brown and Mr. Schnell, would you like to present your project to us right now?

MR. BROWN: Yes.

CHAIR KAMA: Then please do so. Thank you.

... BEGIN PRESENTATION...

- MR. SCHNELL: Good afternoon, Chair Kama. Thank you for having us at your Affordable Housing Committee.
- CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.
- MR. SCHNELL: Good afternoon, Councilmembers.
- CHAIR KAMA: Good afternoon.
- MR. SCHNELL: Thank you for coming, and thank you for this opportunity to allow us to share our ideas and thoughts about Makila Farms. It's a workforce housing project in Launiupoko. With me today is Greg Brown who is the landowner and the developer. We're going to run the presentation where we're going to kind of tag-team. So, we've divided up the areas where we're going to talk about. So, I'll start out. So, Makila Farms is our opening slide. I wanted to...I just want...I wanted to go over our project team with you a little bit. I don't need to go through everything. I've already introduced Greg Brown, and Greg will be speaking soon. I'm Tom Schnell. I'm with PBR Hawaii. We're a land planning firm based in Honolulu but we do work on all islands. We've been in...based in Hawaii for over 50 years, or actually it's 50 years this year, sorry. Warren S. Unemori, Darren Unemori is our Maui project engineer, civil engineer. Tom Nance, water resource management, is our hydrologist, who's one of the most respected hydrologist in the State. Our local traffic engineer was the office of Austin Tsutsumi. And then without going through everybody, also we have an agricultural agronomist consultant that I'll be talking about our agricultural plan that I've provided to the Councilmembers, and it's part of our presentation. And I think I'll leave it at that. Oh, just to orientate you a little bit about the background and location, I'm going to hand it over to Greg. He's going to talk a little bit about Brown Development and his idea and vision for the property.

September 4, 2019

- MR. BROWN: Good afternoon, Chair. Thank you, Councilmembers. My name is Greg Brown, and my company is Brown Development. We've been building homes and selling them on Maui since 2003, as well as on Lanai and the Big Island. My family has also been very supportive of agriculture in Hawaii. We live on and operate a cattle ranch with my wife and my children on the Big Island. We provided therapeutic horseback riding to disabled children on Maui. On Lanai, we re-established the 4-H club and set up a community farm with horses, cows, sheep, goats, pigs, and chickens, and taught many families and children in the community how to interact with farm animals and ride horses. And we're actively involved with the Keiki Rodeo on the Big Island. And, you know, you'll see numerous testimonies from West Side businesses and homeowners, I believe there's over a 100 letters of support the last week for the project for myself and for my business. My mission with my business has always been to have the highest standards of construction, to ask my employees to have high personal standards, and to have that translate to our homes and to the service we provide to our customers once they get in our homes. And I believe that we've done that, and I think we can do that with this project. My vision for this project is to put people on the land. It's to put working people on agricultural land, to give workforce buyers a choice that they don't have to live in a multi-family setting on a tiny lot. I want to put kids on agricultural land. When kids grow up on ag land, they lean...learn the meaning of work. They learn lifelong lessons and values working on and maintaining their property with their family. West Maui in Hawaii has turned into a place where only very wealthy people can live on agricultural land. It's a big problem. Look at Kapalua, Plantation Estates, Honolua Ridge, no farms, no ag, 5 to Kaanapali with the coffee farms, that's a wonderful coffee \$15 million homes. operation but a home in there is 4 to \$6 million. If you want to live in Launiupoko, first farm dwellings go for \$3 million to \$11 million. Makila Farms can change this. It can put working people and families on agricultural land. We're going to build market homes on this land too. But these market homes are going to be a part of this workforce community. They're not going to be 3 to \$11 million homes. They're going to be homes similar to lead design that are slightly larger with upgraded features that will hopefully sell to Maui's professionals such as our managers, our entrepreneurs, our doctors, and nurses who are also getting priced out of ag land and would also like to put their families on the land. I think with that, I'll turn it back over to Tom.
- MR. SCHNELL: So, I'm going to go through some orientation and some slides about County zoning and designations. I'll try to get through this quickly. You may be familiar with some of this. But the location is in Launiupoko, the areas outlined in the black dots there. It's 325-acre agricultural lot. It's a little bit bigger. So, total is about 76 acres. This is a photo of the property. The property is on the left on this screen, or on my left looking at it. If you see the road--maybe I can do this, no, oh--this road is newly put in. This is an extension of Punakea Street. Let me go back. The Bypass Highway is over here. It was I think completed 18 months ago or so. There's an underpass from Punakea Street under the Bypass Highway. This all is the Makila Farms area. I wanted to show a mauka view too. So, the property is here. I wanted to point out that there are existing agricultural subdivisions in the area. And with a little bit of irrigation, the land becomes green. And we'll talk about greening up Makila Farms

September 4, 2019

also. This is just another shot. This is Haniu Street that runs along the top of the property. So, the property is on the left side here. On the Maui Island Plan, this entire area is within the Rural Growth area, Rural Growth Boundary. I thought that was significant to follow the Maui Island Plan. On the West Maui Community Plan, the designation is Agriculture. The County zoning of the property is also Agriculture. And the State Land Use District Boundary for this area is Agriculture District also. I want to note that we're not asking for exemptions from any of these land use The property will remain in Agriculture, and it will follow the designations. requirements of all of the Agricultural Districts. And when I get into the exemptions, we do need one exception to allow lot widths less than 200 feet that's required under Ag zoning to allow some of the workforce homes, but I'll get into that specifics of that. We also would be asking for an exemption to subdivide these 25 lots into 2-acre lots. So, that would be two exemptions we would be asking for. But we're not asking for an exemption to the Ag zoning overall, and the land will remain in Ag. Also, we would be conforming with the Ag Development Zoning District or standards. So, the road widths, all of the infrastructure requirements would be as required under the Ag Zoning Ordinance. Let me get into a little more easier area. The overview, Greg and I have been working on this project for a couple years now. So, I'm familiar with this. There are a total of 76 acres, approximately, we're proposing 19 workforce homes. That's about 56 percent of the total homes. They're all two-acre lots. All the workforce homes would be built in one phase by Brown Development. Greg has experience in building out homes, and he can build these out quickly. There would be 15 market-rate lots. So, that's about 44 percent of the project. Also, 2-acre-plus lots, those would be built out either by Greg or individual homeowners over a period of time, but probably not all in one phase. We're consistent with the purpose and intent of Chapter 201H, HRS, which is the affordable housing law in the Hawaii Revised Statutes that allows a fast process for approval of affordable housing projects. We're also consistent with the purpose and intent of Chapter 2.96, which is the County of Maui's affordable housing requirement. We do have some changes we'd like to propose that are, increase the affordability greater than what was required under 2.96. And we have been working with the Department of Housing and Human Concerns regarding the processing of the application. This is our concept plan. So, if you can see here, the lots in this area that are in letters would be the market-rate lots. The lots that are provided with numbers are the workforce housing lots. So, I was...getting back to the lot width, these lots on the bottom area here, they're all 2 acres but the lot The Zoning Code on the Ag District requires width is about a 115 or 120 feet. 200-foot-wide lots. So, while they're two acres, they're a little bit narrower so we can fit more workforce housing units in. In compliance with the Maui Island Plan, over 80 percent of the area will be open space, greenbelt areas, ag areas, and setbacks, including if we go back here, this area here is a 500-foot buffer here that's in this hatched area from the Lahaina Bypass Highway, which is required under the Maui Island Plan. This will be home...owned by the homeowners but it's a no-build area where folks can't build, and I'll get into the ag plan for that in a minute. There will be no short-term rental homes, bed and breakfast operations, or transient vacation rentals. Those will be deed restrictions. So, even for the market-rate units, we...will not be allowed to, if you apply for a permit, the Planning Department will know there's No further subdivision of the lot is allowed under a deed restriction on these.

September 4, 2019

That's the Ag Zoning Ordinance. Chapter 19.30A. And there is an existing mauka-makai trail on the property. It's an easement, and we'll respect that easement. So, I wanted to go back to the concept plan, and then I wanted to quickly move to the And, Councilmembers, we provided you handouts of this. ag farm plan. We've recently brought an agricultural agronomist consultant. He's here today, and he's taught us a lot about how we can make this productive farmland. So, going back this way, these will be the concept plan as planned, and this is an overlay. So, the dark green bubble areas you see would be agriculture areas that would be designated for cattle ranching on the bottom, and then we're proposing a cultural resource cultivation area on the top. And the idea is that these would be easements over the land. So, the folks would still own the land but these groups would be able to use that land for group cultivation for large cultivation. When talking to lots of folks, we heard concerns that people with a two-acre lot may not be able to maintain a two-acre lot and keep it green and put in the infrastructure. So, these operations would do that, and it would maintain the ag operation and have a better, greater area for consolidated ag use. We also heard from the Fire Department that if homeowners don't maintain their property and it's dry brush, there's greater risk for fire. So, this provides what I've learned is called defensible space, where there's a wide green area between some of the homes. I think I went over most of these things but just to talk about the ag easement benefits, it ensures ag uses on the land. It lessens large-lot maintenance for the workforce homeowners. It still provides space for small-scale homeowner farms and gardens. So, even the area where they do build their home, it's still about 30,000 square feet. So, folks can still have their own garden or small farm operation. I've learned also that through this process and on...of the ag plan, there would be a process to regenerate the soil, to bring the soil back to productivity. And we talked about the decrease in fire hazard. Let's talk about affordability. So, just some numbers and statistics. The medium sales price...median sales price in Lahaina year-to-date, 2019, it was \$750,000 for a single-family home. And I know maybe even August was even higher, maybe about 850, but this is the year-to-date average. A condo was 518,000. We're proposing workforce homes to buyers earning between 50 and a 100 percent of the median income. Chapter 2.96 requires 80 to 140 percent of the median income. So, we're significantly bringing down that price range. The way to read the numbers here on the first...let's just take the first line for example, a one-bed, one-bath, for somebody that would be earning 40 percent or sorry, 50 percent on the median income, somebody making approximately \$42,000 a year, the starting price would be a \$161,000. This was for the home and the two-acre lot. And just going across the line there, it depends on your income level, the price that would...the house would be...that you would pay. So, if you were making a 100 percent of the median income, the same house would cost 323 'cause it's a graduated scale according to what buyers can afford. I wanted to let Greg talk about the bottom point, which is a significant point.

MR. BROWN: Yes. So, we're going to let the lottery winner choose the size of the home that they can afford. For example, if somebody in the 40 percent or in the 50 percent income making 41,000 draws a ticket, and if they're single, say they're a single teacher, and they can't afford a three or four-bedroom home and they want a one-bedroom home, we'll build them a one-bedroom home for a 161,000. And all of

September 4, 2019

these plans we're using have been architecturally designed to be added on to easily. So, let someone get their foot in the door, and as their family grows, they can turn the one-bedroom into a three-bedroom or four-bedroom. So, it creates a lot of flexibility. You know, back when we started this, we heard from a lot of workforce buyers saying all developers build three and four-bedroom homes 'cause they can sell them for more, and we can't get a home anyway. So, we're trying to fill that need and build to the workforce.

MR. SCHNELL: So, we wanted to work out what it would cost and give you an example of what a typical payment would be. So, we've worked with mortgage lenders, and we worked with somebody that provided us an example. So, just to run down this thing, obviously, what I've highlighted on the bottom is the main point. So, this is based on a model of somebody making 40 percent or 50 percent of the median income, excuse me. The total monthly payment if they bought a one-bedroom home would be about \$1,360, all the way up to if they bought a four-bedroom home would be about 1,900. This includes all of the miscellaneous costs. So, it includes down...there would be a down payment of about 3 percent. So, that's about \$5,000 principal and interest, mortgage insurance, property insurance or property tax, homeowner's insurance. We factored in HOA dues, about 235,000, it could be less, we're estimating the fees now, So, combined you're talking about \$1,300 for a and also monthly water bill. one-bedroom on a two-acre lot. If you're in the 50 percent range, obviously, it would go up if you're in the higher ranges. This is an example of a one-bedroom home. They're modest homes, but as Greg said, they're designed to be expanded on. So, if you start out with a one-bedroom home and your family grows, you can add a second bedroom or a second bathroom or even a third or fourth bedroom or bathroom. This is a model of a three-bedroom home. So, you can see the main element under the roof, under the top, it's kind of ... remain the same, and it just gets larger on the sides. So, who can buy? So, we did try to follow 2.96 with some modifications to make things more affordable. But you must be a Maui County resident to be able to buy a home here. You must be qualified buyer. So, there'll be a waitlist. And on that waitlist, qualified buyers are qualified, and I believe there's a process to establish their income, and if they're qualified to buy. Once they're qualified, there's a lottery held. We only have 19 workforce homes. So, I think there would be more than 19 families that would be willing to enter the lottery. And the lottery is run by an independent So, it's not Brown Development. We're looking for volunteers from third party. Councilmembers or maybe the Mayor would want to do it, or we'll find a disinterested or unbiased third party. An important thing too I wanted to note, so what we are changing or asking for a change from 2.96 is deed restrictions to maintain So, under the 2.96, the Affordable Housing Ordinance, there's a affordability. graduated scale. So, I think it's like on average is the buyer has to stay in the home for about ten years. If they sell the home within ten years, there's a shared appreciation formula, and it...and I think there's also a level for five-year ownership too. We're proposing to make these homes affordable for a 30-year period, meaning they must be owner-occupied by an affordable workforce buyer for a period of 30 years. Now, if they sell the home within 30 years, they must be sold to another eligible workforce buyer. And we're sensitive to appreciation and, you know, we're not trying to create a situation where somebody buys a \$200,000 home and can sell for a

September 4, 2019

million dollars five or ten years later, that we want to keep them on...in the land or on the house or sell it to another workforce buyer. But we are providing that there could be a 3 percent appreciation per year. So, the person that does sell the home would get some equity back and maybe be able to cover the cost of the improvements they may have put in the property. Infrastructure is a big deal, and I know there might be quite a few questions on infrastructure as we get into questions and answers, but let me get through the infrastructure section and give you a brief overview. So, the access will be toward...will be these two new roads here. This would be one access road, this would be another access road. They're designed and constructed to Ag District street So, it's not a gated community on the market or There's no gates. standards. workforce homes. Talk a little bit about fire safety. This is our fire safety diagram. These roads actually provide access for the Fire Department. These are existing roads. We've checked these roads in the cul-de-sacs, and the turnarounds are big enough for a fire truck, ladder truck, to turn around. We've put a midway hammerhead in here so the truck could turn around midway if need be. The areas with the circles are the new fire hydrants. We're proposing fire hydrants every 350 feet. The County standard is every 500 feet. So, we're spacing the hydrants a little bit closer, and more hydrants.

- MR. BROWN: You know, one more thing I want to point out is that with the added farming, keeping the land irrigated was a request from the Fire Department if we could do that. That's one of the reasons we did decide to implement the farming is to keep the 500-foot greenbelt wet and the halau resource center, that's up above the lots 13 to 19 will also be irrigated. So, it really creates two good farm breaks and keeps, you know, a large portion of the land green and will hopefully help prevent fire. We also learned a lot about defensible spaces from the Fire Department, planning on putting the homes that we put on the land with larger setbacks to prevent them from catching fire from flames of neighboring properties. So, evacuation routes, you know, I lived up here for ten years when they first opened the subdivision, and I've heard people say there's only one way in and one way out, and that's just not true. There's five ways in and out here. And we're proposing to add one more. If you see route number five in red, this would be another access, which would be a direct route. We're going to request from the DOT with gates that the Fire Department could access directly into Makila Farms to let the Fire Department in, to let residents out in the event of a emergency. This is a...one of the evacuation routes. A couple of them go over these paved bike and walking paths. And I'll turn it back over to Tom.
- MR. SCHNELL: Okay. So, for the drainage, we've worked with Warren S. Unemori Engineering, and they've engineered the drainage basins to exceed County requirements. There's large drainage basins down at the bottom near the highway. These basins are designed to catch and retain a great amount of runoff including runoff from the mauka areas that comes down through the property existing.
- MR. BROWN: So, this is what's currently going on up there. If you can see, there's 3 large gulches or waterways that come through from up mauka across a 116 acres above us, which is currently, the...one of the Makila subdivisions above us that's half built-out. It runs through their property across our property. It runs under the Bypass and it goes into the ocean right now. Anybody who has been up there after a large rain, you

September 4, 2019

see how brown all the brown water turns, and this is what it will stay like if there's only three 25-acre lots. If we build Makila Farms, we're going to build these oversized retention basins at the bottom that are bigger than required by County standards to not only catch our water but to catch all the brown water from all the properties above us. So, it will retain 60 percent more water from going in the ocean than it...than currently does when it rains.

MR. SCHNELL: A little bit about the Launiupoko Aquifer, the aquifer that this area overlies is the Launiupoko Aquifer. According to the Commission on Water Resource Management, the aquifer has a sustainable yield of 7 million gallons per day. The existing water use from the aquifer is .4 million gallons per day or 400,000 gallons per day. This is 5.7 percent of the existing sustainable yield. So, in other words, there's a remaining sustainable yield in this aquifer of 6.61 million gallons per day. The source for drinking water for Makila Farms will be from high-level groundwater wells that pump from the Launiupoko Aquifer. There are three wells owned and operated by the Launiupoko Water Company currently. It's a Public Utilities Commission-regulated company. The three wells have a capacity of approximately 800,000 gallons per day. Current use average is about 200.00 gallons per day, meaning that the wells have the capacity, excess capacity of 600,000 gallons per day. Our expected potable water use that has been calculated based on engineering studies is about 29,430 thousand [sic] gallons per day. Point being that there's plenty of capacity within the existing drinking water potable system to supply drinking water for Makila Farms. And then an important note too. Maui has a requirement called "Show Me the Water," that's the loose name for it, I guess, or the common name, it's Chapter 14.12.040, Maui County Code. The requirement is that written verification from the Director of the Department of Water Supply be obtained that there's a long-term, reliable supply of water before any subdivision plans can be approved. So, other words, even if the Council passes out the 201H application, when we go to submit our subdivision plan, if we cannot show a long-term, reliable source of water, the subdivision plans cannot be approved, and the project would stop at that point. I'd also wanted to mention irrigation water or non-potable water. So, most of these developments and around this area are...obtain water from the Launiupoko Irrigation Company, separate from the water company. We are not planning to use any water from the Launiupoko Irrigation Company, and we wouldn't, use no water from Kauaula Stream. Makila Farms will drill its own non-potable well and provide its own tank distribution system specifically for Makila Farms. So, Greg also owns this property up here, and that's the location of the new well. We have applied for a permit for the new well. We have not drilled or tested the well but our hydrologist, based on other wells in the area, has a high chance or probability this will be a good, reliable source of potable water.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: ... (inaudible)...

MR. SCHNELL: Oh, sorry, non-potable water, excuse me. I'm a little bit nervous today, sorry. I don't normally face the audience and everybody, to sit...a refreshing change though to be able to look at everybody. Thank you. Wastewater systems, we're talking about an advanced type of individual wastewater system. It's called an Anaerobic Treatment Unit, ATU. ATUs provide for a higher quality of treatment than just a

September 4, 2019

standard septic system. It's a multi-stage treatment process. In this process, solids and organics are settled out, and then they're returned for re-digestion. It's different than a septic system. This can reduce solids by as much as 70 to 90 percent compared to a septic system. And it provides a substantial reduction in nitrogen and other pollutants from...in the discharge. The State Department of Health has approved ATUs and specifically the models we are considering for use in the State of Hawaii. Access of Makila Farms--let me move to this slide--the main access would be through Kai Hele Ku Street down here, and Haniu Street this way, and it would feed into our new roads that we're providing here. This is the Punakea Street that's already put in. We held a public meeting last month. On August 14th, we published a notice in The Maui News. We got a really good response from that. We had about 70 people come to the meeting. I know folks from Kihei came to the meeting and not just Lahaina area. So, people did see the notice and came to the meeting. And we did send letters to all of the property owners within 500 feet of Makila Farms, which is a requirement if you did a Change in Zoning application. So, we followed those We've had previous meetings in the past with neighbors during the standards. planning of the previous project, Makila Kai. And we had it at the Lahaina Methodist Church, which was a nice setting. This is the picture. This is before the meeting, and it shows the people gathered. Over 70 people attended, that's per the people that signed in on the sign-in sheets. At one point in the meeting I asked folks who is here because they're interested in an affordable home, and I would say at least 50 people, if not more, raised their hands, and there were a lot of questions about affordability and how they could get on the lottery and get on the waitlist. Other consultation we've had, there was a draft 201H application prepared. It was sent to all County departments in November 2018. We've had meetings with most Councilmembers over a period of time. I've just put February to August this year, but we've had multiple meetings with multiple Councilmembers. We've had a all agency meeting that was on July 29th where all the department heads were invited to come and ask questions of us. And then we've had individual meetings recently with the Fire Department, the Department of Public Works, the Planning Department, the Department of Housing and Human Concerns, and we also gave a presentation to the Go Maui Board of Directors last week. Timeline, so I mentioned all workforce homes will be built out as soon as...all approvals are received. All workforce homes built in one phase. Workforce homes scheduled to be completed by 2021. Greg will build them as soon as he can. And the market-rate homes built out maybe five or six at a time over a period of time. I'm going to move past this slide. If you have it on your screens, you can see it, but I want to hand it back to Greg to wrap it up.

MR. BROWN: Yeah, in conclusion, we just want to go over some points again. First, that the drinking or potable water source is coming from the Launiupoko Aquifer. It has a capacity of 7 million gallons a day. There's only 5.7 percent of that being used currently. There's plenty of drinking water for this project and all the projects around it. Irrigation water, we're providing our own well, pump, tank, and distribution system, and our own irrigation water meters. We are not part of any other irrigation system up there. We will comply with "Show Me the Water," improve our well, and provide that information to the Department of Water to prove we have a reliable source of water prior to receiving subdivision approval. When you hear surrounding residents

September 4, 2019

talk about a lack of water, this has nothing to do with Makila Farms. And unfortunately, they are having a problem with their irrigation service but it has nothing to do with us. We're developing our own irrigation, non-potable source. The roads, the Bypass Highway has greatly improved regional traffic flows. Access egress, there's multiple emergency evacuation routes as we talked about. Wastewater, we're using an advance ATU system that's significantly better than any septic tanks. Drainage, we're going to improve drainage conditions to safeguard the ocean water quality. Farming, we're going to implement farming and probably actually have one of the real farms in Launiupoko. Affordability, we're going to be selling all workforce homes to qualified buyers earning 50 to a 100 percent of the median income, affordable for 30 years, and hopefully, putting some of our people on the land. So, I want to just thank you all for hearing our presentation. Thank you, Chair.

MR. SCHNELL: Thank you all very much. We could talk much longer and we have a lot more information but I wanted to keep the presentation brief. And I'm interested to hear what folks will be testifying about. Thank you very much.

... END OF PRESENTATION...

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you for your presentation. Before we continue, I'd like to acknowledge Councilmember, my Vice-Chair, Mike Molina. Thank you for coming in.

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: Aloha, Madam Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Sorry you had to wait so long for the ---

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: Sorry --

CHAIR KAMA: --acknowledgement.

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: -- for being late.

CHAIR KAMA: And also our Vice-Chair Keani Rawlins-Fernandez, thank you for being here.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: So, we're going to go ahead and sign up...what's that?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: ... (inaudible)...

CHAIR KAMA: Yes. But before we take our public testimonies, we're going to be able to take a break so we can get these people on the phone. So, recess. ... (gavel)...

September 4, 2019

RECESS: 2:09 p.m.

RECONVENE: 2:15 p.m.

CHAIR KAMA: ... (gavel)... The Affordable Housing Committee of September 4th will now reconvene. We're now going to go to public testimony. And we have no testimonies on Molokai, and the Hana Office is closed, but we do have two testifiers on the island of Lanai. So, we're going to go to Lanai and talk to Denise. Good afternoon, Denise.

... BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY...

- MS. FERNANDEZ: Aloha, Chair. This is Denise Fernandez at the Lanai Office, and we have two testifiers. The first person to testify is Christopher Richardson.
- MR. RICHARDSON: Aloha, Councilmembers. I am Christopher Richardson, a resident of Lanai. Thank you for this opportunity to testify today for this project. I included an e-mail of my testimonial and I sent that in. But today, I just wanted to speak more freely about this project. I just watched the same presentation that you saw, and I believe that you understand that this type of project is very useful for the island, and it has a very impressive vision. The question is can the developer make this vision come to life? And so, that's what I'm going to testify for having known the landowner and developer for quite a long time here on Lanai. I've known him professionally and I've known him personally that I can testify in full confidence that this project should go forward. Greg succeeded over here in Lanai in developing several developments that were of the highest quality and were done on time. Developing on Lanai is a little more difficult than other places because it's an extra step to get workers and get equipment. And so, some people have tried to develop here and not really pulled it off but Greg did several exceptional developments, and they all were top of the line and turned out on time and beautifully finished. In addition to that, Greg made Lanai his home and he became a very admirable part of the community. His family and his wife, they established an activity for children here. He purchased several animals and built out a space, an agricultural space for children to attend 4-H. Every week, my daughter was able to ... (inaudible)... people, dozens of people participated in this, and it was a terrific activity for kids to get firsthand experience of...get their hands around animals and how to operate ranching life. So, Greg runs an organized household. He runs, you know, a family that is, you know, can be admired. I believe that he has all the integrity to...that when he puts this vision forth, he really cares about the people and really wants this to happen. And professionally, what he has built shows that he can do this project, do it right with all the due diligence and all the expertise that it requires. Thank you very much.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Is your second testifier there, Denise?

MS. FERNANDEZ: Thank you, Chair. Our next testifier and last testifier is Alberta De Jetley.

September 4, 2019

MS. De JETLEY: Aloha, Chair, and thank you very much for allowing --

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

- MS. De JETLEY: --us this opportunity to testify before you. What I've noticed is it has become almost impossible for our Maui County, born-and-raised residents, to have a home of their own. We have watched as other affordable and workforce housing projects have been turned down leaving our younger residents unable to even dream of having a home of their own. Greg Brown's Makila Kai workforce housing project proposed for Launiupoko will allow our younger families to have a home of their own and space to raise a sustainable garden to feed their families and to enjoy a more rural lifestyle. When his own family lived on Lanai, Greg and his wife, Julie, shared their knowledge with our community children and started a 4-H project at Koele. Our children were introduced to chickens, goats, a huge-but-friendly hog, rabbits, and horses. They supported the program with their own funds and provided us all with an opportunity to be around farm animals that we would never have had a chance to experience otherwise. Makila Kai will be a chance for Maui children to grow up in a very special community. Greg Brown is well-known for the quality of homes he has built for the rich. Please approve his request and let him develop this project for our island working-class families. The children who will grow up in this community will thank you for supporting it. ... (inaudible)...
- MS. FERNANDEZ: That was our last testifier here.
- CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Denise. So, Alison, do you want to call our testifiers in the Chambers?
- MS. STEWART: Yes, Madam Chair, our first testifier in the Chamber is Lori Sablas, testifying on behalf of herself, to be followed by Joan Martin.
- MS. SABLAS: Aloha awakea, Chair Kama, Members of the Affordable Housing Committee. My name is Lori Sablas, and I had submitted a written testimony but I was able to change my schedule and be here. Why? Because it's important that you hear the voice of the people. 'Cause part of my testimony today is going to share with you the results of an affordable...West Maui affordable housing survey that we conducted, and I think it's important that you hear from the people themselves. Also, I know Mr. Brown personally, and he had asked me if I would support him. And I'd like to be an example of people who were born and raised here on the island who care about the island to have the courage to come up and speak our heart to you the decision-makers, because it's important that you hear all sides of the...of your community. So, let me begin my testimony again. I am writing to...I am here in support of Makila Farms. We are all in agreement that affordable housing is in dire Congratulations to all of you for making that maikai decision to have a need. committee designated for this very important issue. But now, it's time to take action. You have before you a project that in my opinion satisfies the criteria for fast-track housing. Don't delay. Take action. Make affordable housing a reality while you are

September 4, 2019

still in office, what a novelty. You have spent hours and hours on this one issue. As the Hawaiian says, too much waha nui, talk, talk, talk, no action. It's vour opportunity now to take action. And again, I wanted to be here to share with you the final analysis of the West Maui Workforce Housing Survey that was undertaken by the Maui Economic Development Board, and it is online. I trust that you will go and, you know, see the survey itself. But what I wanted to do is really give you the final analysis of the survey. It's a groundsroots [sic] effort. I took the initiative to call a meeting with all HR directors that I knew on the West Side because they are the mamas of all our employees, and we met over a period of time to talk about what needs of the employees are. So, anyway, real fast I'm going to give you, we received 361 completed survey, 361 people took the time to fill out the survey. Fifty...56 percent are employed in the visitor industry, 13 in the public sector, which includes teachers, fire, police, local government, et cetera. Almost two-thirds of the respondents have lived on Maui at least 15 years, and 19 are lifetime residents wanting a home on Maui, 42 percent live in a multiple-generation home. Okay. My time is up but I...my final point that I would like to make again is that again, 19 percent are lifetime residents who responded, furthermore, 84 percent of the respondents who currently rent reported that if affordable homes were available, they would like to buy one. You, each one of you, have the opportunity to make this happen for them. I thank you for your time. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Ms. Stewart?

MS. STEWART: Our next testifier is Joan Martin, to be followed by Linda Garcia.

MS. MARTIN: Good afternoon, Chair and County Councilmembers. My name is Joan Martin. I live in Kihei, and I'm testifying today as an individual citizen in support of Makila Farms project. I've been concerned about the need for affordable housing in Maui County for the past 15 years. For many years, I was in the Maui Nui Housing Task Force and had the opportunity to learn what a complex issue housing can be. While there are numerous details to debate, the real issue is that hardworking people here in Maui County want to stay here to be close to their families, and the market has priced them out of the opportunity to buy their own homes. It seems like every week, we hear the heartbreaking news of a friend or family member moving back to the mainland or moving to the mainland, they had grown up here. And many times it's because they can't buy their own homes. Rents are also increasing at the same time. I've seen a lot of projects proposed over the last few years, and I believe that Makila Farms has more to offer our community than most. The proposed workforce homes start at a \$161,000. A \$161,000, that is truly affordable. I haven't seen another project that provides home for single workers or that has the ability to add additional bedrooms and bathrooms as families grow and their needs change. The homes will be affordable for 30 years. People won't be able to buy, flip the homes, and pocket the profits. The homes are on two-acre lots. This will provide people with room for children to play and space for neighbors to get together and nurture a community. The development will have its own well, fire hydrants placed every 350 feet, and multiple existing emergency routes. These are all important for a well-planned neighborhood. But please keep in mind, what you have the opportunity to do here

September 4, 2019

today, and that is to keep families near each other, give children the chance to know and love their grandparents, and siblings the ability to stay close throughout their lives. I hesitate to make predictions but in this case, I guarantee the people you put into homes today will come back and thank you for many years, not just with their words but with their hearts. Respectfully, I ask you to support the Makila Farms project. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: Our next testifier is Linda Garcia, to be...testifying on behalf of herself, to be followed by Cindy Lester.
- MS. GARCIA: Aloha, Chair Kama and County Councilmembers. I am a 40-year West Maui resident. I'm writing...I'm here in support of Makila Farms. It's greatly needed especially on the West Side. In 2005, I was able to purchase a condo through the workhouse housing program, which I still live in today. Had I not had that opportunity, I probably would have had to have left Maui as its rents and housing has gotten too unaffordable for a single person. I've had a chance to look over the changes that Brown Development has made, and I believe he's made enough changes as far as septic, egress, fire, water, and affordability. Maui, especially the West Side, has no affordable homes for rent or purchase. Most people here are struggling just to pay the rent that...for their two-bedroom condo for almost \$3,000 a month. To be able to purchase a home on 2 acres would truly be a blessing for at least 19 people. I have a son and three grandsons that were all born and raised here. And without the workforce housing program, they'll never be able to purchase anything here. ľm requesting that you approve this project. It's greatly needed, and I ask for your support on it. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: Our next testifier is Cindy Lester, testifying on behalf of herself, to be followed by Ke'eaumoku Kapu.
- MS. C. LESTER: Aloha, Chair Kama and Councilmembers --

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MS. C. LESTER: --present. Mahalo for attending today and thank you. My name is Cindy Lester, and I am in full support of the affordable housing project workforce development, Makila Farms. I have followed this project for the past couple of years and have seen the changes. And this final plan, I feel covers all the issues that have come before, water, septic, roads, drainage, all have been included in this new plan. I would hope that the neighborhood would welcome this plan. Affordable ownership should be available to more Maui residents, as they are the backbone to our tourist industry. I am a resident of Maui for over 40 years and have seen this island expand. We do not have enough affordable housing to help the local residents remain here. I have seen friends and family move off island. They just can't afford housing. In 1986,

September 4, 2019

I rented a studio in Kihei for 300. Today, it goes for 1,800, the same studio. The rental market is so small as the amount of people trying for these rentals far exceed the availability. I was a proud to be a part of the Self Help Hawaii program in 2001, which was an affordable program where 45 families were able to move into 3 and 4-bedroom homes in Kihei. We had to work hard to build these homes. But now, 18 years later, I am still in the home along with my child and my grandson. So, putting the stipulations on this home is a big thing 'cause it keeps the people here, and they don't sell it and turn it around in three years and sell it for millions. Maui needs to open its mind to more affordable housing projects. Makila Farms will give 19 lucky families the opportunity to live/farm their own property. There is pride in homeownership. Some of us just need that chance. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Chair?

CHAIR KAMA: Oh yes, Miss...Member Sugimura? Could you please come back, Ms. Lester?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Sorry --

MS. C. LESTER: Oh.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- I just have a question --

MS. C. LESTER: . . . (inaudible). . .

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --if you could.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I'm sorry.

MS. C. LESTER: Yes, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you for sharing the information about you were...you're on the Self Help project area in Kihei.

MS. C. LESTER: Correct.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And was this Habitat? Was it a Habitat --

MS. C. LESTER: No, it's --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --kind of project?

MS. C. LESTER: --different. It's 45 families, split up into 3 phases. We took 13 families in each phase. We built 13 homes. Every weekend, we had neighborhoods, you know, volunteers, everybody that can help us. You had to mandatory put in 40 hours apiece. So, not only did you have to work your 40 hours, you had to, you know, your

September 4, 2019

regular job, then do that. But after a year, the home was yours, and nobody moves in till they're all done. It's a neighborhood. Three-quarters of those people still live here today, same neighborhood. Our kids, and now our grandkids are hanging out. It's just we need it, we need it, whether it's, you know, the workforce development, the Self Help, whatever, we need more affordable homes for this island.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thanks --

MS. C. LESTER: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- for sharing your story.

- MS. STEWART: Our next testifier is Ke`eaumoku Kapu, testifying on behalf of Kuleana Kuikahi, to be followed by Valerie Lester.
- MR. KAPU: Aloha, Chair Kama and Members of the Committee. Ke eaumoku Kapu, I'm from Lahaina. I'm one of the kuleanas that live mauka of this project area. A lot of times we come in front of you, the fear of the inadequacies of what's happening without water on our lands, on our access, all these things. And a lot of those things will basically we infringe upon basically by whatever happens within that area, and I've come to you many times to share this. It's funny, I stand here and I see a lot of people in support of this project. Me and my family had been doing our due diligence by attending the West Maui Community Plan, and I hardly see anybody that supports this project even come to the West Maui Community Plan to even give recommendations on where affordable homes should be. We've looked at the topographical map, went and did our due diligence for months to figure out where would be the best places to fix...put all these kinds of things. And most definitely, we're not against affordable homes. All we're saying is it's in the wrong place. And I mean you look at the writings on the wall, this is only going to set an example for other things that really is going to be detrimental to the whole existence of why the community plan basically was put together. If this Makila project gets through, they will establish a precedent that will render all of Maui County's community plans All lands between Launiupoko and Olowalu will be at risk of being toothless. urbanized. In fact, land anywhere on Maui will be at risk. You know, I read the agenda and automatically, I...something triggers in my heart that says that the Committee is in receipt of a Miscellaneous Communication dated August 26, 2019. What does that mean? Did they resubmit the application for the 201H, triggering the 45-day window again? You know, that's the kind of stuff, us kuleanas, we don't understand especially when you have community meetings that are rendered. Mv family is still healing. We don't even have the time to even sit down at the table to even figure out where we're going to be in the next five years because of our lives have been detrimentally triggered by one fire that wiped out my whole family up there. You know, when you start talking about 343, the Hawaii rules on tradition, culture, and religion, you're looking at 'em. The kuleana that live up there that was received lands from the time of the crown but nobody sees the importance of those kind of things. That's one of the most important things we got to figure out, the longevity of the kuleanas that still exists within those valleys, where do we fit in this society today.

September 4, 2019

So, I come to you today, Councilmembers, to say I am not in support of this, that they need to figure something...some other place. And when he received these properties, he knew exactly what he was getting into. Make him follow the law.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MR. KAPU: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Mr. Kapu?

- CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I'm sorry, Mr. Kapu, could you please come back for a question from Ms. Paltin?
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Kapu, for being here. I was...my question was as a resident of Kauaula Valley and having watched the presentation, how do you feel about the additional fire exits? Are they, in your experience as a valley resident, are they free and clear at all times in case there's a fire in the middle of the night or at any time in which it could be unexpected?
- MR. KAPU: For the access, I have a lot of concerns especially for the Hokiokio Access Road, that's a private area. And just recently, they put boulders in front of a gate instead of just locking the gate and trying to work out some kind of solution with the kuleanas in there, especially me, I got to cross the river just in case if there's a fire that's coming from Lahainaluna from the north side. So, I'm totally cut-off if the fire was to happen below any place down on the bottom of the valley, it will cut off my two accesses. The only access we, living in the valley, we'd be forced to use would be the one that they showed on the picture, which is the Hokiokio exit. We used to use that before. But now all of a sudden, they put boulders in front of the gate. So, times for us living in kuleanas, we're not subject to what you call 'em, the public utilities. So, being that we don't have public utilities in the valley, you guys not recommend that it'll require to even do anything to help us out because we don't have public utilities that support the kuleanas living in the valley. That's why it's different for us. People got to understand, our lives are detrimental because we don't have no support from the County, well enough the State. We're land-locked.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was wondering too if the other exits that were in the presentation, if you have experience with those being free and unfettered access?
- MR. KAPU: For my family that lives, the Palakiko's, and the Dizon that lives...that use those accesses changed, I say maybe about four or five times. So, there is no...not definitely yet on what going to be established that route that the family is going to...are going to use, but that's not the route that they're talking about. That's a different route. Our route is below Hokiokio. Well, actually, yeah, Piilani Highway, there's a route that goes, and it goes through underpass. But that one is not definite yet on whether or not that's going to be the traditional access route for kuleanas. So, there's alternatives

September 4, 2019

that the kuleanas are forced to use. But like I said, it's not definite. For me that live on the other side, on the north side of the river, I have established an access through Kamehameha Schools. But if there's a fire on that end, I'm cut off, which the only access I can use is where the Aquatic Center is. That's my other alternative access. But if it...the fire starts from the bottom, I'm cut off on two sides, and I don't have an alternative. So, that's why when I talked about our concerns, our...it's really limited for us because we don't have public utilities in the area, and the County is not required to do anything about it. So, last that I'll say is the community plan was supposed to be a solution. We worked on that for years. Now, all of a sudden, you get this coming up, and we address the access points in the community plan especially for kuleanas that live in Kahoma, Kanaha, Kauaula. Two accesses, one was through the Department of Transportation. They built me one tunnel that went cost \$4 million so they don't cut off my access. The family is still determined. So, that's why when you look at this, make sure you look at every rock and stone to make sure that our issues are addressed.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

- MR. KAPU: Thank you. Mahalo.
- CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Ms. Stewart?
- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Valerie Lester, testifying on behalf of herself, to be followed by P. Denise La Costa.
- MS. V. LESTER: Good afternoon, Council...good afternoon, Chair and Council, Maui County Council. Being born and raised here on Maui, I...I've always wanted to own a home of my own and raise a family and give back to the community. But due to the price of the market, I now have to leave, and so I can be able to own a home. My prayer is that something as amazing as Makakila [sic] Farms would be available to the people of Maui to get a chance to own something of their own, to grow with a home and create something beautiful with family. My family was able to participate in the Self Help Housing in 2001. And at the opportunity...and without that opportunity, I don't think we would ever be able to own a home of our own. I'm truly grateful. Unfortunately, there isn't enough affordable homes here on Maui to support local people. I am requesting for approval for this situation. Thanks, guys.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is P. Denise La Costa, testifying on behalf of herself, to be followed by Gordon Firestein.
- MS. La COSTA: Aloha, Chair Kama. Mahalo all of you, Committee Members and Councilmembers. I'm P. Denise La Costa, I am a Planning Commissioner, but I'm speaking for myself and not for the commission. I also am a resident of Launiupoko. And contrary to what Mr. Brown said, not everyone who lives at Launiupoko was wealthy. I happen to live in a very modest manufactured home. So, I couldn't afford

September 4, 2019

one of the homes that he happened to build up there, and the largest percentage of homes built up in Launiupoko were built by Mr. Brown. So, I just wanted to clarify that for public testimony. I have three major concerns. Number one, the evacuation routes. Living through the fire last year was one of the most terrifying things that has ever happened to me. The evacuation route shown on the map is where the fire was closest. So, I have a concern that if this project is approved, there has got to be different evacuation ingress and egress. It's just not...it's...it...I think that it's going to be very dangerous if a fire happens on the north side. But I see firemen here and they know much more than I. The second thing is I want to reiterate about CPAC. I do attend the CPAC meetings. And the reason that they were established is to let people know, let the community know exactly what all of the people in separate communities want. We have an Island Plan. We have West Maui, South Maui, Paia, East County. And I don't think that it is correct or pono to have decisions made on projects like this without the CPAC process being completed. It is currently a six-month process. It is nearing...it's about a third of the way through, and I think it is only fair after all of the hundreds of hours of testimony and people showing up and the representatives of the County giving us information that that should be established to show what the majority of the people in the West Maui want before anything else is approved. We do need affordable housing. There isn't a person in here who would disagree with that. But if we need...I think that this project should have a bigger percentage if that is truly what Mr. Brown's bottom line is. Nineteen homes is a wonderful thing but it should be closer to 29 so more people can have the opportunity to build a home. Thank you. Or live in a home, excuse me.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Yes, Mr. Sinenci?

- COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Mister...Ms. La Costa. So, are you in support of this project or do you oppose?
- MS. La COSTA: I have strong feelings that it is a good project but again, I have concerns about where it is. I lived through the fire and it was horrific. They've mitigated the water. They've mitigated the sewage system. They...the traffic is still going to be a problem with Kai Hele Ku and Haniu and Punakea because it's bad now as everyone knows. I think the project would be great if it were infill because I don't see that the irrigation and the water that he's talking about, it's going to get worse and worse, I live there, and even the potable water is getting worse because it's getting hotter and the sources are drying up. So, thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Gordon Firestein, testifying on behalf of himself, to be followed by Trisha Higashi.
- MR. FIRESTEIN: Aloha, Councilmembers. Gordon Firestein from Launiupoko. I came prepared with remarks that I'm going to discard, partly based on the presentation of the proposal. You know, it's obvious as P. Denise said, there are a lot of attractive aspects of this project, and I'm impressed with the work that the developers have done

September 4, 2019

to answer a lot of the concerns. However, I'm still here to urge you to reject it at this time. I'm...I could echo almost word-for-word the testimony that the previous two speakers, what P. Denise said about if only we could take this project and locate it in a better place, that would be fantastic. And I think what Ke'eaumoku has said, the concerns of the kuleana families really have to be taken seriously. And it does...if this project is approved, it would completely undercut the community update process that is underway. There have been community workshops as part of that process where people have expressed their ideas about what should happen with this particular location, and it's clear that dense development is not wanted in that area, and that affordable housing, any development at all should be in infill spaces. With regard to fire, internal to the project, I'm very impressed with the thinking that's gone into it. But there's still a huge problem, the location again it's projecting a peninsula of development into an area of fallow fields, and we know what the risks are with fallow fields. And so, on three sides, it's surrounded by very high-risk of fire, and with the cul-de-sac road, in which all of the affordable houses are located and about half of the market-rate houses, that's a cul-de-sac. If the fire is on the north side, all of those people are stuck. There's no way out. So, those are the basic concerns, wrong place, wrong time, really attractive project, it's just not what we need at this time. So, and I hope you'll reject it and I hope we'll be able to find a way to build more affordable housing in accordance with the wishes of the community plan. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I...thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Firestein, for being here.

MR. FIRESTEIN: Yes.

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was wondering about your fire comments. Do you make those with any type of authority for the Launiupoko area?
- MR. FIRESTEIN: Yes, thank you for asking. I was one of the cofounders of the Launiupoko Firewise Committee. And we've been working for several years wracking our brains, trying to figure out how to deal with this problem. It's a huge problem for the existing development, as you know. I was one of many who evacuated in the middle of the night during the Hurricane Lane fire. It's a trauma that you don't get over very quickly. And frankly, even coming to a meeting like this on the other side, I make a calculation how windy is it, how hot is it, how dry is it, can I afford to be on this side at a time like that? So, we've done everything we can think of, and we're continuing to look for solutions to this problem of large, untended lots. We haven't come up with a solution. It's a very pressing problem. We had what is probably an arson fire within our neighborhood. We were lucky it wasn't a windy day so it didn't spread. I would really be concerned about people living in this development sticking into, you know, the wild land area, yeah. Thank you.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so, can you get behind any exemptions to the Fire Code on this project?

September 4, 2019

MR. FIRESTEIN: Exemptions to the Fire Code, no, definitely not. And in fact, I think one of the biggest problems that we face is that the existing Fire Code is simply not enforced. Large, unmanaged fields of vegetative fuel is really the responsibility of the landowner. It's a tough problem. I recognize that. It's expensive to deal with keeping that fuel down. There's no visible effort to do that by any large landowners that I'm aware of, and there's nothing in this proposal that addresses the threat from outside of the project itself.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

- CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Wait, wait.
- CHAIR KAMA: I'm sorry, Ms. Lee?
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hi. I was just wondering where you live in Launiupoko, are there vacation rentals?
- MR. FIRESTEIN: Yes, quite a few, legal and illegal.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, how many would you say altogether?

- MR. FIRESTEIN: It's...I mean the legal permitted ones, meaning you could look up, I don't have that number offhand. The illegal ones are very difficult to identify but there are quite a few. It was actually an issue during the Hurricane Lane fire. When we evacuated, at first, we went to the Bypass thinking that we were safe. And while we were on the side of the road, we saw that there was a car with a number of people standing around it. So, we went to talk to them. They were renting in an illegal vacation rental. The owner had given them no information or guidance as to what to do in the case of an emergency or an evacuation.
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Could you...you say quite a few, what's quite a few, roughly?
- MR. FIRESTEIN: Oh, quite a few illegal vacation --
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah ---
- MR. FIRESTEIN: --rental?
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: --like 50, 60?

MR. FIRESTEIN: I would guess easily there are 50 up there.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Fifty, in addition to how many homes, or just regular homes without vacation rentals?

September 4, 2019

MR. FIRESTEIN: Oh, I think there're on the order of 240 properties up there --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And then --

MR. FIRESTEIN: --altogether.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- about 60 have vacation rentals?

MR. FIRESTEIN: Again, that's a guess.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

MR. FIRESTEIN: I mean if anybody knew, hopefully there would be some enforcement of that.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Thank you.

MR. FIRESTEIN: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Trisha Higashi, testifying on behalf of herself, to be followed by Augustine Hosino III.
- MS. HIGASHI: Thank you, Chairman Kama and Councilmembers. I appreciate the time to be able to testify in full support of Makila Farms. I'm born and raised on Maui. I...sorry, it's emotional for me because there's no more of an important issue than housing, and the time is now, and you cannot delay. I'm born and raised on Maui. I attended the University of Hawaii. I earned my Master's Degree in Speech Pathology. I have faithfully dedicated over ten years to the children of Hawaii through my work with the Department of Education. There are two issues that make it difficult for the working middle-class such as myself. The first issue is we're being priced out of the market. And you heard everybody else say the cost of housing is so expensive. I can only afford to live here because I live with my mom and my son. I'm a single mother. Affording a home is not my reality. I can't even afford to rent, let alone save a down payment for some place. The second issue is the cost of food. It has to be shipped here so it's very expensive. I like that the Makila Farms offers that it's ag land and that you can have a garden of your own to kind of subsidize that cost of food. And hey, if you're able to grow more, you can sell something that can also support the local economy and the local people. As a speech pathologist, there's a critical shortage. In Lahaina, there's more contracted employees that are from the mainland than there are State employees. Those contracted people can't even afford to rent. They have to leave. So, there's a high turnover. My services are greatly needed on that side. If I could afford to live on that side, I would live on that side, but I cannot. The developer is drilling his own ag water that's non-potable. So, that will be made available to support the agriculture and sustain it using the water that he's going to be drilling.

September 4, 2019

The project helps protect from fires by implementing farms. It's usable land. Now, it's not just dry, fallow land, and it's adding more hydrants than is needed, have advance septic systems, it's very well-thought-out project, to have large buffers that are catching runoff from properties above that may damage the shorelines. They're the first workforce to offer large ag lots. If we do not allow our workforce to live on ag lots, we are sending the message that only the wealthy, luxury homeowners can live on agriculture land. The developer has agreed to sell homes between the 50 and 100 percent income range and build smaller homes that would make it more affordable to get your foot in the door with real estate. I urge you to approve the project. It has been well thought out and there's a dire need for it. The time is now. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Augustine Hosino III, testifying on behalf of himself, to be followed by Mavrick Kigimanary [sic].
- MR. HOSINO III: Good afternoon, Chair and Councilmen. My name is Augustine Hosino III. I'm from Makawao. I support the Makila Farms project. I feel that these workforce homes will give us local people a way to own a home and at an affordable price, yeah, and I've been looking in the market for homes. I'd recently moved back from Las Vegas. I was there for 15 years. I got...I'm back here because of Greg, and he gave me a job. Without that, I wouldn't be able to come back. I got to bring my wife and my daughter back. And, you know, my family is all from Makawao, Upcountry. I just...I don't see myself owning a home here. I've looked, I can't afford it. I feel like I make pretty good money here but I still just can't...it's too much. My dad moved away. He lives in Texas. He's probably going to die there, I mean but he's happy. But I mean, you know, I mean we don't have...a lot of people moving away, and I just feel that, you know--this is stuff I didn't even write, and now I'm just talking--but, you know, that's kind of...but I just hope that, you know, there's things above what I know, I just came here to just support it, and say that I support it. So, I hope you guys can pass it and this could be the future for Hawaii's housing hopefully. That's all I have to say. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Mavrick Kigimanary [sic], testifying on behalf of himself, to be followed by Revalva [sic] Kemiche.
- MR. KIGIMANANG: Aloha, Chairman Kama. Aloha, Councilmembers. My name is Mavrick Kigimanang, and I come from Wailuku, Paukukalo. My name is Mavrick Kigimanang, and I have worked in the construction industry for five years, and this is the first project I have seen that is affordable for families like me. I can qualify for this project, and I would like to live on this agriculture land. My girlfriend and I live with my family, and we have recently had a baby, and it would be great if we could have a two-bedroom home. This will be perfect for my first home with my own family. We will be able to grow our own crops, and I'll be able to teach my son how to live off the

September 4, 2019

land. This project will change my family for generations and give us a future on this island especially if my family keeps growing. It will also help me because right now, we live in Wailuku and I have to drive to the West Side every day. Right now, I only see luxury homes on that properties, and it would be great to see more locals up there experiencing the land too. I support the Makila Farms project and believe it would be a great project to pass. Thank you, everyone. Aloha.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Revalva [sic] Kemiche, testifying on behalf of himself, to be followed by Mark Marolf.
- MR. KEMICHE: Aloha, everybody. My name is Revatua, and I'm here to supporting the Makila Farm project because I think it's a good opportunity for all of us and the family, the Hawaiian family to have a...their own land over there, and a future, something to give to the keikis, you know. And I heard about all the issues too, and I think all the issues was resolved. So, yeah, I think it's a good project for our future. So, mahalo. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Mark Marolf, testifying on behalf of himself, to be followed by Rose Valle.
- MR. MAROLF: Good afternoon, Chair and Councilmembers. My name is Mark Marolf. I would like to voice my support for the proposed Makila Farms housing project. We're all aware of the lack of affordable housing here on Maui. My hope is that the workforce...that this workforce home project will be approved and others will follow to help mitigate the problem. This development is well-thought-out with large lots, a walking trail, single-story homes that protect the view, and it will be one of the better neighborhoods in Maui. The 500-foot setback in...from the Bypass, and then the addition of over a dozen fire hydrants, and three ways to exit has addressed all the safety concerns of the community. These homes are priced reasonably and are geared for families who plan to be part of the community. There are restrictions for home sales for 30 years. This is a long-term commitment for those whose roots run deep here and a terrific opportunity. Financial security is achieved for the entire family and possibly for generations to follow by owning a home versus renting. The local working class families of Maui deserve this opportunity to live in good homes in a safe neighborhood with a great location. And I work with several of the men and women who come here and testify today and who do not have an opportunity to own a home. And I want to lend my support for them and hopefully, this project gets approved and they can see the American dream. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Rose Valle, testifying on behalf of herself, to be followed by Stephen Webb.

September 4, 2019

MS. VALLE: Good afternoon, Chair, Councilmembers. I'm here to speak in support of Makila Farms. I'm no expert on any of this but I've listened to Greg Brown's proposal for Makila Farms, and I've reviewed the exhibits put together by the experts, and it seems to me they have implemented solutions to each of the issues previously presented in opposition including the drilling of a new well to provide water without taking away from existing homes, fire hydrant spaced closer than current requirements, and the emergency exit routes. Other improvements include the two retention basins, which will help eliminate or at the very least, greatly reduce the runoff of pesticides into the ocean during heavy rains. The 2-acre lots and 30-year ownership rule make Makila Farms a great solution for truly affordable housing on Maui. For these reasons, I'm in support of Makila Farms. Thank you.

MS. STEWART: The next --

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: --testifier is Stephen Webb, testifying on behalf of himself, to be followed by Fran Mitsumura.
- MR. WEBB: Good afternoon, Chair, Councilmembers. My name is Stephen Webb, and I am here to speak in favor of Makila Farms. I was born and raised on Maui as were my four siblings, and I consider it a blessing and a privilege. This is a wonderful place to grow up and I'd like an opportunity to extend that blessing to my future children. I'm going to get married in about a month. And unless an affordable housing project like Makila Farms goes through, myself and my future wife will definitely have to leave the island. I can't make enough here. She can't make enough here. Even with our combined efforts, we can't own a...we just can't own a home. And it's a reality for a lot of people my age on this island and around the world currently. So, I think it's a good start. Yeah, that's all I have to say about that. Thank you very much.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Fran Mitsumura, testifying on behalf of herself, to be followed by Shyloh Stafford-Jones.
- MS. MITSUMURA: Aloha, Chair Kama and Councilmembers, and Committee Members. I appreciate the opportunity to speak with you today. I have been on Maui for 40 years. I am currently the branch manager of First Hawaiian Mortgage in Lahaina. I've been prequalifying buyers here on Maui for 38 years. I'm speaking in favor, as an individual, of this project because I see the finances of people that live here full-time, and have lived forever. And I see what they pay in rent. I see how many families have to live in each home, and this project is amazing and would be a gift. It was really interesting when I moved here, the problem was is people wouldn't rent to me and my fiancé even though he was born and raised here because we weren't married. Obviously, the...that doesn't happen now but what does happen is you have young and not-so-young singles and couples that can't afford to buy a home because you

September 4, 2019

have to qualify for a median price range of 700,000 or a condo with a large monthly maintenance fee. I have been fortunate to be one of the lenders that is prequalifying buyers for the workforce housing projects. And I'm amazed at the volume of applicants that have applied with me, and more amazed that over 80 percent of them qualify for the price range of Makila Farms. This price range that the developers are offering is unprecedented. It's unheard of in this day and age. I've met with hundreds of potential buyers who have been waiting for these opportunities, and I am only one of the lenders that is doing the prequalifications. These buyers are hardworking folks who deserve to own a home, to raise a family with space around them in a neighborhood with their peers. The amount of rents that they pay is just...it's more than what you saw on the chart for one, two, three, four-bedroom homes. The excitement is contagious with these buyers, and it's refreshing. It reminds me when I bought my first home at Hale Piilani in Kihei in 1985, which was a first-time-homebuyer-type subdivision. Everyone should be able to purchase a home but not everyone can qualify for 700,000. I do respect all of the concerns. My father was a fireman his entire career. So, I definitely understand that. But I do ask that you approve this project and others like it. It's a gift to these buyers, a gift to the community. As an employer in Lahaina, we ask that you help keep these hardworking folks in Lahaina to help alleviate the traffic that bottlenecks on the new Bypass going to Central and South Maui. Thank you for listening and for your time.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Shyloh Stafford-Jones, to be followed by Van Fischer.

MR. STAFFORD-JONES: Good afternoon, everybody. My name is Shyloh Stafford-Jones. I'm originally from Missouri. I'm the agronomist that's working with Greg to develop the crop plan for this Makila Farm. I grew up in Missouri on a family farm there. So, I kind of know the importance of getting local people and on a small farms, and, you know, to experience that experience, I guess. It's kind of good to grow up working hard and learning how to work hard. For the past three-and-a-half years, I've lived in Maui or four years. The past three-and-a-half years, I've lived on Maui and I worked for HC&S, and then A&B as a diversified ag manager. So, I have a lot of experience with growing crops in a lot of harsh climates across the plantation. The farm plan that we kind of have been working on incorporates the greenbelt to be a pasture for cattle. And all those species of crops, we've...we're kind of looking at will be a good crops to encourage soil infiltration for runoff and rainwater, to break up soil compaction from years of being fallow and driven across. And also, you know, a lot of the crops will help tie up any of the nitrates that leach from the upper parts of the hill down and anything else. And then by keeping it green and keeping cattle on there, moving back and forth in a rotation, it will keep a...well, it will keep all the grass...it will eventually encourage the natural grass to come back and keep it green so that it won't burn in the future. And then, so a lot of good things like that. That's very much all I got, I guess, for now. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

September 4, 2019

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Van Fischer, to be followed by George Brown.

MR. FISCHER: Good afternoon, Chair and Councilmembers. Thank you for the opportunity to speak for you or speak with you today. My name is Van Fischer and I live in Lahaina. I'm a real estate agent, and together with Buz Moffett of Moffett Properties, we are the agents that will be handling the sale of the workforce homes and the market-rate homes in this community. Obviously, I'm here to speak in support of this project. I've worked with Greg for a number of years on this. And the amount of work, and thought, and dedication he has put into this project is amazing. We came back as Makila...came in as Makila Kai, were rejected, and he came back and spent years fine-tuning, and then fixing and addressing all the issues that were brought up, and I really feel like they've addressed all of the concerns. I certainly share the concern about fire but this isn't a fire. The fire situation isn't something that specific to Launiupoko. I live just below the West Maui Airport. And the fire above Kaanapali, I can see that fire coming over the hill. It was scary. But are you going to ban Pulelehua, the workforce project below the airport because there's fallow fields? No. Are you going to stop Puukolii Village up there, Kaanapali 2020, 'cause it's surrounded by fallow fields? No. You have to build these projects. The way to get rid of the fire danger is to plant these fields. We have the coffee farms. We have the chocolate trees. We have to encourage the owners of the ag land to develop those lands so they're not fire danger. Anyway, you have fire professionals here, and I would really sincerely ask you to turn to the fire professionals and ask them if they support this development, because if they do, I do. So, with regard to the people that are interested in Makila Farms, over 400 people have contacted us in the last 30 days to sign up to be notified when applications were available. Those 400 people would probably love to be here but they're working because they can't take time off to come here. So, I feel like I'm speaking on their behalf. People want to live in rural settings if at all possible. I consider myself a affordable housing advocate. I go to the CPAC I encourage where affordable housing should be developed, where meetings. We can't all be forced to live on little multifamily should be developed. 3,000-square-foot lots in town. It's heartbreaking. Kahoma Village, the townhouses down there, I sold one the other day, and the people took it as a last resort. I said are you sure you want to buy in here, a 900-square-foot townhouse on a 3.000-square-foot lot for \$400,000. They're like, what other choice do we have? None. We need to give them that other choice. Okay. If anybody has the right to live up on the hill in Launiupoko, it's the workforce people. And it's not just the firemen, the police, it's everybody else. It's the cook in the kitchen. It's the housekeeping people. It's everybody. They're all workforce people. So, I encourage you to support this application. I forgot like five other things I wanted to say 'cause I'm just...I just, man, it's just these people are so emotional, and this is their life, they want to live on the West Side, and they don't want to be crammed into little lots in town. So, please support this project. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is George Brown, to be followed by Conrad Oandasan.

September 4, 2019

MR. BROWN: I find it kind of interesting that the last testifier talked about how there are going to be these big lots and all of that kind of thing, and they supported that. But the same developer was here earlier some months ago or last year, and he wanted small stuff. Anyway, that's kind of interesting. Another interesting thing about it is that he is asking the Council to once again circumvent the County Chapter 19.30A, and particularly 19.30A.040, which is limitations on housing, which at this point the West Maui Land developed that area. And there is no more housing available according to that stipulation. Particularly, it says no lot or portion thereof, which is in Agricultural District, shall be further subdivided beyond the maximum number, and the maximum number was given to West Maui Land when they did that subdivision. However, another interesting thing is that Mr. Brown is saying that for his development, the people that buy are not going to be allowed to do that 19.30A-040 [sic]. So, in one hand, he's asking for it, in the other hand is saying, no, nobody else can do it. Now as far as the water goes, they talk about the Launiupoko Aquifer, and they seemingly say well, we're going to do our ag water over here and that over there, this and that, the other thing. It's all coming out from the same place. All those wells are going down the same place. Right now, we...I don't know if you've seen it but Launiupoko Irrigation Company puts this out. They have a nice sign last couple months talking about this. And right now, level 4, we're cut down 4...by 40 percent. Actually, then instead of having seven days of water, we have three days of water. As a farmer, you need water. You need to, you know, how are you going to raise your crops when you have three days of water when you maybe need seven days? Anyway, that's basically what I have to say. I'm not a...I'm not opposed to affordable housing. I'm opposed to it in the...in that place. I'm opposed [sic] to it in the right place. There is private and public acreage of 650 in Lahaina right now, and you can use that. Use your time to go out there and do that rather than this little thing out there, 19. Thank you.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Do you have a question?

CHAIR KAMA: Question, sir. Yes --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Go first.

CHAIR KAMA: --Ms. Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, so, what did you say, there's 650 what?

MR. BROWN: Six hundred and --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I didn't hear you.

MR. BROWN: --fifty acres. The State has around 500 acres right by the Civic Center. And Hawaiian Homes has 50 acres, and I'm not counting the 50-55 acres of Hawaiian Homes. But the State Housing Authority has 519 acres I think, and then there's a private developer named Peter Martin, has about 200 acres right above the swimming pool, 180 over there and about 20 or 30 across the stream. But that's --

September 4, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, I'm glad ...

- MR. BROWN: --all underneath the Bypass. And that area has two wells, A pump and B pump, Old Pioneer Mill. I used to be...work for Pioneer Mill, and that was one of my jobs.
- COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, you're saying you don't want the development in this location but there are other properties that you're designating that you think are better, is that what you're saying?
- MR. BROWN: Absolutely. If the State already has 500 acres that they bought it for housing, why not go to the State and, you know, kukakuka, get together.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. BROWN: Talk to them about that.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good, because...

MR. BROWN: Go to Peter Martin. Talk with him. Ask Greg Brown to go to Peter Martin and say let's do it together, here, we can put 600 houses over there, we can put --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. BROWN: --2,000 over there, we --

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MR. BROWN: --3,000 houses.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Ms. Paltin?

- COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Those projects are slated to be built. So, I'm glad you support it. Thank you.
- MR. BROWN: I didn't support it. I'm --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Well...

MR. BROWN: --against this. I'm against affordable...I'm for affordable housing, against this project.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No, I'm talking about the other property, the --

September 4, 2019

MR. BROWN: Oh, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --650 --

MR. BROWN: Yeah ---

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- acres you're --

MR. BROWN: --definitely --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --talking about.

MR. BROWN: --definitely for that, definitely for that.

CHAIR KAMA: We're going to --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: --let Ms. Paltin ask you a question.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: A couple question.

CHAIR KAMA: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, I just was wondering, you know, that picture that you showed with the...

MR. BROWN: Yeah.

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The...I...my understanding is the elevation that that water has to go to is much higher, and that's the problem, whereas the well that he's drilling, the water isn't going to the high elevation. So, it's not going to be as much of a problem. I mean if you worked in water just was wondering about that, like pump, I thought the problem with the Launiupoko Irrigation getting their water was not a source issue but a pumping to the elevation, which it was needed issue.
- MR. BROWN: Oh, it's a source issue and part of it because the stream flows have been cut back. CWRM is saying that they want the water to go down to the ocean. In the old days in plantation days, we kept it all high. Now, as far as the pumping up that you're talking about, if I'm understanding you correctly, there is a new well that they're pumping up. I don't know why they're doing it. I don't know why they just put it in a...down below. The...and they could...they have to have some water up there but there's a lot of water that could stay down below as...so, I was really confused as why they need to pump that up. Now, in terms of Mr. Brown's water, he's going to put it on a lot right next to my house. His house is right next to my house that he's going to, I think if I'm correct. There'll be no issue there in terms of how much the PSI you might need; however, what the issue is that well is in the same aquifer as all these

September 4, 2019

other wells. And as Makila gets developed more, Mr. Brown said there's 50 percent is developed in Makila, I'm not sure if that's correct or not, but let's take 50 percent. What happens to the other 50 percent when right now, we're supposed to be cutting back 40 percent? What happens when there's the other 50 percent, we cut back to 20 percent?

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But he said or they said the sustainable yield of the aquifer is 7 million gallons a day. And from what I understand, the Launiupoko Irrigation Company is nothing to do with this project.
- MR. BROWN: Yeah, it...well, the Irrigation Company doesn't but the Water Company does if I understood --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah ---

MR. BROWN: --that correctly.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --Water --

MR. BROWN: But...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- Company is the potable --

MR. BROWN: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- and the Irrigation Company is the non-potable.

- MR. BROWN: Right. And the Irrigation Company is needing to drill more wells in order to get that water out because they're being cut off by the Launiupoko and Kauaula Streams, the stream flows are being diverted back down to the ocean through the loi and stuff like that. And so, they're going to be sucking out of the same area. So, I was just saying is that because they say, oh, this well is over here but it's in the same aquifer. It's all the same. So, the same...more straws in the same drinking...
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But do you dispute that the aquifer yield is 7 million gallons a day?

MR. BROWN: That I'm not an expert on that. You've heard testimony, that I don't know.

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: 'Cause that's a lot. I mean we approved Waikapu Country Town, and that's a 3-million-gallon-a-day yield and 1,488 homes. So, I mean it seems like 7 million gallons a day would be sufficient.
- MR. BROWN: Well, it's not sufficient right now for us in our area right now. Now, if he drills the wells, and it's there, and you see that deal, and it's up to you. But then you go back to the law, as Kapu says, follow the law, the 19.30A-040 [*sic*], no more house...no more lots over there. Do you follow the law or not?

September 4, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sorry, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh yeah, I'm sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sorry, Mr. Brown, I have a question.

MR. BROWN: Yes, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MR. BROWN: Sorry. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your testimony. I just...so you mentioned Maui County Code 19.30A.040?

MR. BROWN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Would you mind explaining that a little more? I heard you mentioning it to --

MR. BROWN: Well ---

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --Member Paltin.

- MR. BROWN: --I did send it to the Committee. But basically, it talks about implementing Chapter 205. It talks about promoting agriculture development. It talks about preserving and protecting agricultural resources, and it supports agriculture character of the community's economy and lifestyle. And the .040 area, it's limitations on subdivision. And basically, what that says if a properties have been brought in to the County already and they've been subdivided under this rule, then there cannot be any more lots. That's the 19.30A-040 [sic]. And there's...it talks about the Director of Public Works shall determine the maximum number of lots and that can be created based upon the provisions and standards set forth in the, you know, 19-30A.030 [sic]. And the subdivider shall allocate the maximum number of lots. It goes on to continue to say once it's done, it's done. You can't have any more. I'd be happy to send this off to the Committee again but I did this about two days ago.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. So, when you said once it's done, it's done, meaning that this was previously one large property, and then it was subdivided into three properties?

September 4, 2019

MR. BROWN: No, no, no, no, no, this is...these three properties are a part of what West Maui Land did years ago in the 1998 to 2000-2002. And so, they went in with this large piece of property they bought from Pioneer Mill and they said okay, we want to subdivide this, we want to do this. And so, there's a sliding scale. You can have so many small lots, so many medium lots, so many large lots. But once you do all that, it's done, no more lots. It's not just these three. These three are a part of that larger subdivision that was done by West Maui Land roughly 20 years ago.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that explanation, Mr. Brown.

MR. BROWN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Mr. Sinenci?

- COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Mr. Brown. So, you're saying that...do you know if that original subdivision was recorded at the Bureau of Conveyances?
- MR. BROWN: I don't know for sure that it was but I presume it was because of the nature of the subdivisions at that time. I've had some property that I did want to subdivide, and I went in and they said, well, you've have to record it and you can get 7 lots rather than 20 lots. So, that's a...that's...that is a question that I don't know, and I probably should have found out before I testified.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

MR. BROWN: You're welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Chair is going to call for a recess till 3:40. Recess. ... (gavel)...

RECESS: 3:30 p.m.

RECONVENE: 3:44 p.m.

CHAIR KAMA: ... (gavel). . . The Affordable Housing Committee of September 4, 2019 will now reconvene at 3:44 p.m. Ms. Stewart, will you please call the next testifier?

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Conrad Oandasan, to be followed by Aaron Coon.

MR. OANDASAN: Aloha, Councilmembers. My name is Conrad Oandasan. I'm here to support the Makila Kai Farm...Makila Farms project. I've watched it from the beginning, and I've heard all the issues from the people in the valley, also the residents from Launiupoko. I worked up there for over 12 years. This project, the developer's addressed...has addressed all its issues, and he's made it a more

September 4, 2019

environmental and safer community, and it will be sustainable for everybody. And I think it will be a good project for people like me to afford a home for my family, maybe one day we could also live on that mountain and down the hill of Launiupoko. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Aaron Coon, to be followed by Mary Ann Fagaragan.
- MR. COON: Aloha, Chair. Council, aloha. My name is Aaron Coon and I've lived in Maui for over 14 years now, and I've learned a lot of things along the way, and gone through many changes also. But one thing that I have learned is that cleanliness and organization is something that makes daily chores feel more like a day at the beach, and that's why I'm in favor of the Makila Farms project. On paper, this project looks amazing. The size of the lots, two acres, with no-build areas within each property, giving it a clean look, and plenty of space for families to interact and do chores. You know, I've started a family. I've got two boys. One is a week old and the other is five, and, you know, I'm trying to get them to feel comfortable doing chores, you know. And feeling comfortable and safe and secure makes our day at the beach, you know, very And the Makila Farm development, it looks like it will give you that eniovable. serenity, you know. There are evacuation routes in case there ever was an emergency, or if a fire, there's five firebreak roads within the development, and fire hydrants are 150 feet closer than County requirements. I think that's a pretty good security there. The project is planning on develop...drilling its own non-potable wells to feed the hydrants and the irrigation lines. By zoning standards, Makila Farms passes to be an agricultural development. When I found that out, they gave me hope. So, I started doing a little research, and knowing that septic and drainage on the West Side of the island can be pretty stinky at times, and that makes this development look very good. The aerobic treatment units, the ATUs, they give an extra edge over the conventional And the oversized water retention basins, they exceed County sewage tanks. requirements. These basins will decrease the downstream flooding into the ocean so, which is a good thing for people who would like to enjoy the beach. And the runoff, the runoff is going to build in these basins, and then they're going to feed the upper lots, the upper properties, which makes a more enjoyable day at the beach. The plan to me looks clean. It looks organized. And Brown Development is giving a good chance for small families who on an average day, salary, a chance to own their own home through Makila Farms, and therefore, I'm in favor of the development. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Yes, Ms. Paltin, you have a question?

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair, and thank you, Mr. Coon, for your testimony. I just was wondering about the source for the fire hydrants, you...how did you know it was non-potable?
- MR. COON: That, I believe that when you take...that's something that I came up within my own.

September 4, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh...

MR. COON: Well, yes, because the wells that, the non-potable wells...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. That might not be --

MR. COON: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --accurate --

MR. COON: So, that's not --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --information.

MR. COON: --true. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thanks. That's...

MR. COON: I apologize --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just was --

MR. COON: --for --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --confused.

MR. COON: --giving incorrect...yeah, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, could I...

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, Ms. Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Just before you leave. So, I met him during the break, and I just want to thank you for being here to testify. I didn't realize you have a brand-new baby. But you're building your home, and I like that idea about non-potable for fire hydrants, but thanks for that idea.

MR. COON: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MR. COON: There might be a fire safety with non-potable with the gases in the ground to have something to try to do with putting out fire 'cause I don't know, but thank you. Aloha.

September 4, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Mary Ann Fagaragan --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: ... (inaudible). .. work.

- MS. STEWART: --to be followed by Erwin Fagaragan. ... (inaudible)... The next testifier is Erwin Fagaragan, to be followed by Tom Blackburn-Rodriguez.
- MR. FAGARAGAN: Hi, my name is Erwin Fagaragan. I've lived in Maui for 33 years. I was raised in Oahu. I've seen Oahu grow where there's no housing anymore, you know. And I've lived on Maui for 33 years. I'm renting right now. My wife is renting. You know, we can't afford a home. We...she work two jobs for since she got out of high school, and we still can't afford a home, you know. We appreciate when that ... we've applied for the Makila home before. It didn't pass. And we're trying to get it...we did the County course that they get...told us to take. We paid for it and took the course to qualify but it was, you know, dropped, I guess. So, we got...we didn't get no notice. But, you know, we're looking for affordable home for the locals. We can't afford 700,000, 500,000, you know what I mean. It's hard. We both work. I work and she works two jobs. I've seen her work from drive from Kahului to Lahaina two times a day just to make ends meet. They say 500,000 is cheap, not for us, and we work...she works two jobs and I work one job. My son had to move away 'cause he looks at us working real hard to just make ends meet. I want my son to come back. I get grandkids that moved away 'cause I can't sustain them over here. That's why I approve this Makila homes. Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Tom Blackburn-Rodriguez, testifying on behalf of Go Maui, Incorporated, to be followed by Jade Wilson.
- MR. BLACKBURN-RODRIGUEZ: Madam Chair, Members of the Committee, it is an honor to follow the gentleman who just testified. My name is Tom Blackburn-Rodriguez. I reside in Kihei, and I'm testifying on behalf of Go Maui, a nonprofit organization focused on housing, jobs, and water issues affecting Maui County. For more information, please go to our website at *gomauiinc.org*. Go Maui is in strong support of the Makila Farms project as proposed by Mr. Greg Brown. While we believe there may be adjustments to the project's agricultural potential, it remains a rare affordable housing project. First, the 19 workforce homes on 2-acre lots will be offered to households who are earning between 50 and 100 percent of the area median income. The workforce homes would be built first and the market-priced homes would be sold over a number of years. Workforce homes will be built with specifications requested By that, I mean that if all a young couple needed was a by the household. one-bedroom, one-bath as a starter home, then that would be what would be built with a potential for add-ons included in the structure. At a 4 percent interest rate, that home could potentially sell for \$161,700. You should write that down. Third,

September 4, 2019

homes will have 30 years deed restriction, specifying any resale must be done to qualifying households, keeping the home in the affordable housing pool. Fourth, five individual roads access the project and provide for a significant exit capacity in event of an emergency. Fifth, no water will come from the streams. The project's water needs will be served by a well that the project will drill and freely dedicate to the homeowners association at no cost to them, and also by a private PUC-regulated water company on the West Side. In conclusion, I would like to thank you for the work of the Committee. You are at the center of Maui's greatest need, the eye of the storm if you will, and it will not go away. We support you. We believe you will make the best decision for the community. And in closing, I would just like to say, the larger issue before you, before us in the community is the issue of hope. If we take away hope from hardworking, taxpaying two-and-three-job working families, if we tell them at the end of the day, there is nothing for you, what kind of society will we build for our future here on Maui? We cannot strip the people from the land and expect the culture to survive. They must be able to go back to the land and live in affordable, truly affordable homes. We cannot kill that hope. Thank you very much. We respectfully ask for your support of the project, and thank you again for your dedicated service to the community. Aloha.

CHAIR KAMA: Ms. Paltin?

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Blackburn-Rodriguez, for being here and thank you for your commitment to affordable housing. I was wondering if you had any concerns about financing.
- MR. BLACKBURN-RODRIGUEZ: Well, my understanding is that Mr. Brown has been working with a number of folks in that field that do mortgages. They have been working diligently in order to have a process by where people could qualify, and then be able to actually afford to pay the mortgage. Interestingly enough, I look at the mortgage rates and I see that some of those mortgage payments are less than what I pay for in rent.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, yeah, yeah. I...sorry, to clarify, I meant like the upfront financing of the development part, not the financing of the purchasers.
- MR. BLACKBURN-RODRIGUEZ: I apologize for misunderstanding but could you clarify the question?
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like if there's enough financing to see the development of the 19 affordables to be done at one time prior to the selling of the market values?
- MR. BLACKBURN-RODRIGUEZ: In my view, there is sufficient funding to finance the 19 homes in my conversations with Mr. Brown and his presentation, and it was a rigorous presentation before Go Maui. We understood that that capacity existed but I will defer to the developer for the details.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MR. BLACKBURN-RODRIGUEZ: Thank you very much. Mahalo.

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Jade Wilson, to be followed by Michael Williams.

MR. WILSON: Aloha --

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MR. WILSON: --Chairman Kama, Committee. I'm...I've lived in Maui for about 25 years. I've lived in Lahaina for about 12 years, and I never once dreamed of owning a home, nor could I ever afford it. I work two jobs, seven days a week. My wife doesn't work. She's a stay-at-home mom. My...I have a ... we have a eight-year old son, goes to school every day. I drop him off, pick him up like everybody else. The thought of owning a home will be a dream come true. So, that's why I really support the Makila Farms. It is right down the road from where I live, you know, 15 minutes away. And not only me, there's a lot of people in Lahaina who live in community housing. A lot of people in my community all work two jobs just to get by. And even then, it's hard because, you know, we have rent, bills, car payments, car insurance, you know. And so, all of that all builds up. Fortunately for me, I drive a moped. So, I only have to worry about that. But I drive...I get up every morning at 5:00 in the morning, I leave my house at 5:30 just to get to work in Kaanapali at 6:00. I don't get home until nine o'clock at night. I see my son, I see my family three days a week. And so, I'll just try to look into my son's eyes and say, tell my son what day I'm going to work. So, with this housing project, maybe I don't have to work so much, you know. I mean I can actually go outside in my yard, play with my son, you know, spend time with my family more. Thank you for your time and patience. Aloha.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Michael Williams, on behalf of Maui Tomorrow Foundation, to be followed by Kenneth Ginsberg.
- MR. WILLIAMS: Aloha, Chair Kama, and --

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MR. WILLIAMS: --aloha, Councilmembers. I'm Michael Williams, President of Maui Tomorrow Foundation. I'm also chair of its affordable housing committee. I've been working hard for a couple years on how to create affordable housing here on Maui. We, as an organization, are very much in favor of development of affordable housing. I'm also on the board of Stand Up Maui, which is the successor this year to FACE Maui, that's been a long time housing advocacy group here. Stand Up Maui has not had an opportunity to review this particular project but I know they will...they endorse one of the other points I'm going to make in just a moment. But Maui Tomorrow is

September 4, 2019

opposed to this project because we believe it's being presented to the wrong body. It should be presented to the West Maui Community Plan Advisory Committee. We believe the current community plan is not consistent with this plan because...this proposal...because the current community plan calls for enforcement of the current Ag Zoning laws, which does not allow multiple two-acre subdivisions. If the West Maui Community Plan Advisory Committee decides they want to allow multiple two-acre Ag subdivisions, in six months you'll know that, and then you can approve this project. The problem I think that this Council faces is that this Administration has not come up with a comprehensive plan. We were all sorely disappointed last month when we got the results of what we thought was the Administration's long-term work to produce a comprehensive plan. So, what Stand Up Maui and Maui Tomorrow are currently working on is a detailed request for proposal we want to submit to this Committee to consider to purchase a comprehensive affordable housing plan. Over the next year, I think that you can easily...it may cost half a million dollars but I think you can easily fund it with money this year out of the Affordable Housing Fund, half of it, and money out of the Affordable Housing Fund next year for half of it. Target it to be finished by the end of next year, by the end of 2020. So, that in 2021, if you have successfully created a separate housing department or a housing authority as your Committee may decide to do, you will have a comprehensive plan ready for that department to implement. That's what needs to happen. You need 9,000 homes, not just 19. And when I say comprehensive plan, what I mean is a map that shows where the houses are going to go, where the roads are going to go, a schedule for each year, a...when the infrastructure is going to be built, a schedule for a house going to be financed, all that kind of detail, and we're going to have that to present to you hopefully by the end of this month. Thank you.

- CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Thank you.
- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Kenneth Ginsberg, to be followed by Basho Elliot.
- MR. GINSBERG: Good afternoon, Chair, Council.
- CHAIR KAMA: Good afternoon.
- MR. GINSBERG: My name is Kenneth Ginsberg. I'm a former resident of Lahaina. My grandparents and parents moved here in 1968 and opened two restaurants in Lahaina. I attended Lahainaluna High School. After high school, I worked as a tile setter in the Masons Union, and eventually started my own business on Maui working on many homes in Lahaina and around the island. In the early '80s, we all moved away from Lahaina due to affordability. My extended family and many former residents were forced to move to Kahului and beyond being priced out of Lahaina to live and survive. Too many islanders take residence in towns far from where they work and battle hours of traffic to and from Lahaina. And I'm in support of Makila Farms in Lahaina. It would be a perfect workforce housing and market-value price housing development point to relieve the traffic and congestion going to and from work. I was fortunate to work on some of the workforce housing in Kaanapali, and just to see the people move in is a joy, like they're so happy. You know, some of them

September 4, 2019

are I see firefighters, lifeguard, nurses, and hotel industry people moving in, and they're just happy. And those are just really small lots, and they're just so joyful to be there. And we need both the market-value and the affordable housing so communities could live together. That's what I have. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: Madam Chair, we have ten more testifiers signed up in the Chambers. The next testifier is Basho Elliot --
- MR. ELLIOT: Thank you --
- MS. STEWART: --to be followed by --
- MR. ELLIOT: --Councilmembers.
- MS. STEWART: --Randy Mulcoy.
- MR. ELLIOT: My name is Basho Elliot. I've been on Maui for 30 years-plus. I've been in the construction industry since I was 15 years old. I've heard a lot of testimony today, both relevant and irrelevant to our situation. I think that it looks to me that they've done their homework in the last four years trying to figure this out. And with the fire issue, I don't think that you can control the fire no matter where it is and how many fire hydrants you have or how many streets you have. If they're going to add more access and more fire hydrants, I think that's nothing but a plus. I think that I heard some testimony that some of the people that live up the hill in Launiupoko, no matter where you want this property built, as long as it's not down below them, it probably will be okay. I think that's, you know, biased in my opinion. I do think that for the price I've never heard in...since I've been trying to buy a house, that a \$161,000 for a house for somebody that's low-income, the struggles to make ends meet, I think that's like a no-brainer. It's very hard to get to a point where you can buy a house. I've tried many times. I...for me, I don't qualify for this. But I think for people that are young and working their butts off trying to get ahead in life, that this opportunity only comes by even if it's only 19 people, it's better than 0. And I think that this is an important issue, this low-income workforce housing situation. If you can pass this, that would be great, and then I hope there's many more to come. I am in support of this project. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Real quick.

CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I'm sorry, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, a question for you.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: What is your intention for today's meeting?

CHAIR KAMA: The intention is to...well, at that time we took the break, I thought we only had ten but I think people have signed up. But so now, we have what?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Nine.

CHAIR KAMA: Nine. We have nine left. I want to hear all nine before we recess for next week. But, Members, if you need to leave, as long as I have a bare minimum quorum, I think we're okay to hear testimony. But if you need to leave to get on a flight, by all means please do so.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You'll have quorum without me, yeah.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. Mahalo.

- CHAIR KAMA: So, if you want to leave, you got to all leave now because if not, the last four guys, that's it. Okay. So, Keani is the first to leave. So, whenever you need to leave, Keani. Thank you. Yes?
- MR. MULCOY: Hi, my name is Randy Mulcoy. I'm ... (inaudible)... But I've lived in Napilihau for 30 years, and I was lucky enough to get a house back then when it was real cheap. And this is a good opportunity for low-income people to buy a house, and this could open up the window for more low-income housing. And so, hopefully, it all pans out but that's about all I got to say. Aloha.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Sasha Taylor, to be followed by Marilyn Montaigne.
- MS. TAYLOR: Hello, Madam Chair and Committee Members. Thank you for your time today, and thank you for all that you do. I've been living on Maui for 20 years. I'm a graduate of Maui High School and also University of Hawaii. My family lives Upcountry. I live on the West Side. I work on the West Side. And I recently got married. I'm very excited about...this is my 20-year anniversary of living in Hawaii, and I just love it and I love my little babies. I have a two-year old and a five-month

September 4, 2019

old, and they're beautiful, and the best thing that could happen for us would be a home, not later but now. We need this now. I think most of what the testimony that has been given so far today, I think the one thing it's really missing is a sense of urgency. For the guy who just said from the Maui Tomorrow, we need 19,000 homes, yes, we need 19,000 homes, but we don't need them later. There's all these reservations and nuances. Something is going to stop it from there, something is going to stop from there, but ultimately, County Members, I urge you, please think about this seriously. We don't need it later, we need it now. Rent is high. It's out of control. We can't control it. We need a place to live. I need a place to raise my babies. I don't want to go to the mainland. There are so many other people I know that want to buy a house. Please make this a possibility for us. We need this and we need it now, not yesterday. We need to start with 19. This is a great project. And from there, we need to move on even further and create more projects. And for all the people who live in the area and don't want it for certain reservations, this and that, guess what, they got up the ladder, and then they pulled it up behind them, and that's not fair. Is that the kind of committee we want? Are these the kind of decisions we want made here? I voted for you. I hope you represent me. I hope this Committee represents the majority of people that aren't here to speak on this. Please pass this now.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Marilyn Montaigne, to be followed by Kimokeo Kapahulehua.
- MS. MONTAIGNE: Aloha, and thank you so much for your time and for being here and letting us give our testimony. I am in support of the Makila housing project. Affordable housing is very precious to all of us. We all need a home. I have three generations in my household, a 90-year-old mom, a son, and myself, and that a house is out of our reach right now with the prices at 700,000. We live in a 700-square-foot condo for 2,700 a month in West Maui. I work in the tourism industry at a resort and I have a very kind manager that let me off to come today to speak to you. So, please consider this, to approve it, and not only this project but other projects that would be beneficial for those that need a home. And thank you so much for your time.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Kimokeo Kapahulehua, to be followed by Kimo Kinimaka.
- MR. KAPAHULEHUA: Aloha, Chair Tasha Kama and Councilmembers --

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MR. KAPAHULEHUA: --and Committee Members, and really thank you for giving us this opportunity to look at the Makila Farms project. I'm for the project and for many of reasons. Speakers before you was my son-in-law. His name was Jade Wilson. He

September 4, 2019

lives at Lahaina Surf. He pays \$1,400. He researched the median income of what he can afford, and with his two job, he makes \$52,000. So, he's a good client for that, and he came before you to testify for his son and his wahine here. His son is...had been detected leukemia four years ago, and doing really well, and he wants this house for this son and he wants...his son is born and raised in Lahaina and want to have a home for his son in Lahaina. But more than that, I go back 2001, with the lady that spoke earlier that we had Meadowlands and affordable housing project, and we also worked and helped those guys to, like she said that they need to have 40 hours so we worked with that. But just before you right now, you have an affordable housing project that is affordable for all the workforce housing people that come before you. And you had my son-in-law here who is, work for Stewart's like a banquet, and he's be able to afford that, you know. So, it's really important that you look at what we have and look at the developer himself and how he has managed to do the greenbelt for the fire protection, having the hydrogen [sic], 350 feet. Well, I'm very, very...we're all sad what happened in Lahaina. For us guys in South Maui, which where I live, we just recently had fire and evacuated everybody. And so, a few of our families and friends did face the tragedy of having the possibility of having their home taken away. So, I would encourage you again, like the speaker before me, please do not wait. Let's support this, and we thank you so much for listening to all of us this afternoon, coming here like you do, supporting affordable houses. So, thank you very much. Mahalo. Appreciate that.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Kimo Kinimaka, to be followed by Julia Alos.
- MR. KINIMAKA: Aloha, County Council. Thank you for having me. Thank you. It seems like I've been here before. Anyway, my name is Kimo Kinimaka. I stand in support of Greg Brown, a personal friend of his for 25 years. I taught his kids how to surf, nothing but a genuine man. And I think maybe not 9,000 homes but 19 is a start. Let's do this, right? I think what the whole thing is what it comes down to, this Launiupoko, is money. The people with money don't want to live by people who don't have money. That's what I think it all comes down to. 'Cause I like started thinking about money and if I bought a lot for \$4 million, and I was a Kardashian, would I want, the Hookanokano's and the Kinimika's, no. They will park their cars in the street. They would...you know. So, yeah, of course, you guys don't want it, but this This is not a joking matter. I have five kids, three live in the has to happen. mainland. I want to cry, but I'm more angry and adamant about this, and nothing is being done. There's a lot of talk, and talk is cheap. It's time for action. It's time for you guys to take action. Please make this happen. When I was growing up, I got out of high school, those of us that grew up over here, you never had to worry about where you're going to live. You're going to work Burger King, make \$5 an hour, you pay \$300 a month. Look where we are now. This is a tragedy. We're losing our children. We're losing our culture. We, as people of aloha, we welcome all these malihini. When we looked upon those hills in Launiupoko when were kids, right, wow, someday there'll be big, beautiful...I'd like one. Well, now it's not even an opportunity, it's...you can't even fathom the thought. It cannot be obtained. I support this. I have three

September 4, 2019

minutes. Hold on, I got stuff. When I used to drive past there, up the mountain, only had the Aquino family, the Biga family, and the Palakiko's, never have people without breath. But now, they run the place. Sorry, you guys, I know you haole, but, you know, this isn't Beverly Hills, this is Hawaii. And my question to the people up there that are opposing this project, how would you feel if the King and the Queen said to you no, beat it. You don't belong here. This is our place. We just need a place to help preserve our culture, and it is your responsibility to provide this. So, we all know it's more than that, so please--sorry, I pressed the button, whoa, whoa--please pass this bill and good luck to the 19 winners of this lottery. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Maikai. Mahalo. Mr. Kinimaka, we have a question for you.

MR. KINIMAKA: Yes . . . (inaudible). . .

CHAIR KAMA: Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks, Chair. Thank you, Kimo, for being here. I just was --

MR. KINIMAKA: Thank you...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --wondering --

MR. KINIMAKA: Thank you --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --did you --

MR. KINIMAKA: --Ms. Paltin.

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --check in with the Aquino's, the Biga's, and the Palakiko's on how they feel about this development?
- MR. KINIMAKA: You know, I haven't spoken to them. You know, like this is Maui. Everybody lives on social media. We don't even get to see anybody. We just find out where they were and what they're doing. I really don't know, Tamara. Thank you --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

MR. KINIMAKA: --for asking. But, you know...and I know that they're mixed on this whole thing. But I'm sure like if they said, hey, you know what, we're going to build a route for you guys, so you guys can get out of there too, we're going to figure out a way that if your water is being disrupted anyway, that we...we'll be pono and we don't do it. 'Cause no matter what we got to do, we got to look at ourselves at the end of the day, and we got to try to be pono and do the right thing. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MR. KINIMAKA: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Julia Alos, to be followed by Brian Klingbail.

MS. ALOS: Aloha, good afternoon, Chair Kama and the County Council.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

My name is Julia Alos, and I support Makila Farms workforce housing MS. ALOS: development. The developer's bold vision on the community concept, design, and offerings have been carefully deliberated after community/Council concerns arose from the Makila Kai project. Makila Farms has obviated these issues and it's hopeful this new housing opportunity could ultimately become a reality for the qualifying 50 percent to 100 percent of AMI's for Maui's area median income range. Makila Farms could genuinely be...could be a genuinely unprecedented coup for the Maui's West Side residents. Enhancements include addressing and further mitigating the risk of fire; irrigating areas around the neighborhood; demonstrable egresses, five for evacuating ease; installing more hydrants than required; abating brown runoff into the sea with its retention basins; ensuring sufficient potable and non-potable resources; and negating use of streams; use of the ATU, anaerobic treatment units, that will treat wastewater naturally unlike cesspools and septic systems, and protect our valuable Makila Farm has built guardrails to protect and maintain in water resources. perpetuity affordable...affordability for the growing segment of residents currently living out of this equation for the American dream to own a house they can call home on a 2-acre minimum parcel for 30 years. The quality of life for perspective Makila Farms residents would restore a sense of financial security for some families and a small step towards stemming this hopelessness so many have today. Perhaps, this development, if approved, will spur a calling for more developers to embark on this endeavor to retain workforce residents and the future here on Maui and around the The County has a responsibility to ante up its inventory levels by making State. affordable homeownership an attainable right and a goal many should have and not a privilege for just a few. The neighborhood will naturally lend itself an opportunity to farm together with your family and neighbors and promote interest in sustainability and self-sufficiency as a welcome and healthy alternative lifestyle as another plus. I see co-op farming, crop swapping, tip sharing, a good way to get to know your neighbor to learn how to work together to make good use of your land. Maybe this will grow future farmers for Maui, which we need. The lack of affordable home-owning The supply has patently failed the options has been a crisis here for decades. residents of Hawaii, Statewide, and in our country at large. Maui...Makila Farms is clearly a solution. The constraints of this issue represent a lack of congruency with the Maui County General Plan as stated, when adequate or appropriate housing is unattainable to a large portion of the population, it negatively impacts the entire community and decreases overall quality of life for everyone. To many residents, this...they fall in this category. Status quo is clearly untenable and unacceptable. It overshadows a decent quality of life for too many residents working just to survive. Contrary, Makila Farms would reduce commute, travel time, replace it with newfound

September 4, 2019

quality time with families, afford families an opportunity to enjoy a prideful ownership of a place that they can call home. The County and State needs reliefs such as this and we cannot rely on major developers to build huge projects. They take too long to complete. They rattle residents and are addressing the urgency of the need, which is now, not a decade from now. It's doubtful anything close to Makila Farms offering will be heard by this County Council or even future sitting County Councilmembers again, and I hope hundreds of residents...I hope...it is my hope that hundreds of residents will make...you will help Makila Farms make it the winningest victory for these deserving, hardworking West Maui residents. It's a step in the right direction and I hope you will pass this development. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. ALOS: Question? Thank you.

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Brian Klingbail, to be followed by Kosei Nagata.

MR. KLINGBAIL: Aloha.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MR. KLINGBAIL: Good afternoon, Chair Kama, ladies and gentlemen of the Council. My name is Brian Klingbail, and I thank you for the opportunity and time to address you here today. First of all, I'd like to commend you for your efforts in bringing affordable housing to Maui. I hope that this forum continues and we see more of these opportunities in the near future. Affordable housing is deeply rooted into the psyche of modern society. There's a reason homeownership has been coined the American Home affordability is more than a personal aspiration. dream. It correlates to economic diversity and many factors that directly affect the community's overall economic vitality. The Maui community is about much more than tourism and luxury real estate. And largely, I think that's why we're here today. Housing costs are a major factor in a typical family's household budget. Exceeding one's affordability can lead to things like having less money to pay for food, utilities, transportation to work and...to and from work, excuse me, health, and childcare expenditures, as well as a reduction in savings for emergencies, retirement, as well as opportunistic pursuits such as higher education, or funding for small businesses. All these factors can and often do lead to a lesser quality of life. It is for this reason and many others like it that I am here to provide my full support for the proposed Makila Farms development. Having grown up in Wisconsin, I'm used to seeing a landscape scattered with farms. These farms typically belong to hardworking individuals that are nowhere close to top earners in their communities. Oftentimes, these people fall into what we'd consider 50 to 80 percent of the AMI, very similar to what is going to be tailored to with this development. Luxury homes are absent from these properties. Oftentimes, you'll see multiple generations who work in the same farm. It is here where traditions are shared and passed down. There is a tremendous sense of pride in what they do. Children that grew up on these farms gain a deep appreciation for the outdoors and the land they farm. Neighbors are often tight-knit. Families often raise self-reliant

September 4, 2019

children that rarely spend time on the couch with their eyes are glued to various machines. That's unfortunate because in today's society, that's becoming more common. Makila Farms appears to be a one-of-a-kind opportunity for local lower AMI families to be able to own and live on a large parcel of ag land. To me, this doesn't seem like something that should be simply a privilege of the few. It also appears to me that we've been presented here with a well-thought-out solution that would create a well-needed increase in homeownership. If approved, Makila Farms could provide real viable, affordable housing on plots of land previously unheard of on Maui. This comes at a time when housing is desperately needed. When you vote, please hold the importance of affordability and sustainability in the highest regard. Thank you for your time. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Brian Klingbail, to be followed by Kosei Nagata.
- MR. NAGATA: I'm actually Kosei.
- MS. STEWART: Oh, sorry.
- MR. KLINGBAIL: ... (inaudible)...
- MS. STEWART: Sorry about that, Brian.
- MR. NAGATA: Aloha, Chair. Aloha, Council. My name is Kosei Nagata. I have lived on Maui since 2015, and I have been commuting to work from Kula to Lahaina, five days a week. I'm on the road an average of three hours a day, precious time that is taken from my family. If the Makila project is approved, I would like the opportunity to apply for one of the lots so that my commute is not...it is not so strenuous. I ask that you please consider this project, as it will provide affordable homes to long-term residents. I had a colleague who had raised and lived in Lahaina her entire life. Recently, she had to uproot her family and move to the mainland because homes are unaffordable and unattainable, many on the West Side. My former colleague informed me that she just bought a four-bedroom house for a little over \$250,000. I was really happy that she was able to purchase a home but know she would have loved to stay on Maui if provided with the same opportunity. If Makila Farms is approved and moves forward, many families will be able to make their dreams come true. I know Greg Brown to be honest and trustworthy. His work reflects his pride and integrity to do the job right. I support Makila Farms and Brown Development to start the project, and I recommend that the County of Maui approves the Makila project. Thank you for your time.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Dallas Castillon, to be followed by Mark Dearkos...Deakos.

September 4, 2019

MS. CASTILLON: Aloha, Chairman and Members. My name is Dallas Castillon, and I'm here to support the Makila Farms affordable housing. I was born and raised here on the island of Maui. I've seen many of my friends, families move off island due to the high cost of living here even though they were raised here as well. To be able to live here, you have to basically be living with family. There's four or five families in one house. And so, I'm here to show my support for this project.

- MS. STEWART: The next testifier is Mark Deakos, to be followed by Mapuana Samonte.
- MR. DEAKOS: Thank you, Chair, Councilmembers. It looks like you're burning out the ohana protectors, yeah, the aina protectors. Mark Deakos, West Maui resident of 23 years, marine biologist. And I first want to thank the Planning...County Planning for their outreach in West Maui. I've done a lot of work there. I remember my first meeting there. It's about 12 people around the table, angry, not trusting the process for the community plan. The County reassured us that every voice was important, was critical to the process. And I asked them about 201H, and they said, yeah, maybe not 201H, you know, that can bypass the process. So, of course, here we are, 201H, 201H, 201H. So, there goes the community plan. You guys even asked Pam Eaton, how's it going over there? Do they support these Launiupoko projects? She said no, they don't support them. That's on record. So, today is really not about what West Maui community wants. It's about what the developer wants, and if he can get enough votes today to bypass the community plan, and of course, in violation of the segmentation rule. But what if you had a community project that came to you that had all the energy from the homes made onsite, so no power lines that could spark, cause fires; all the water captured on site; compostable toilets that use no chemicals, no water; restoring native ecosystem, food for us, community gardens, so tenants can have access to healthy foods; located near work, school, and necessities, so that there is also living affordably, okay, with minimal utility cost, no need for a car for every member to have a car; and all at the same cost as traditional building. What if you had to approve a project like that? And the testifiers that were in favor of it weren't just the ones lottery...on the lottery ticket but the ones protecting the water, the ones concerned about water quality, the ones concerned about traffic, the ones, you know, you could have all of them supporting these projects. And they're doing these all across these sustainable, affordable, in-perpetuity communities all across the United States with groups like the International Living Future Institute, for which I'm in training as their ambassador. So, I'm asking you to please shelve this project. Ask Mr. Brown, ask Mr. Martin, to join me on September 19th, there's a workshop in Oregon. We're going to learn together how to do these projects properly, restorative projects, and we'll come back and tell you all about that, how we can address all of the concerns in the community. And they can even...they're willing to actually come here and do a workshop for you guys so we learn how to do restorative, not low impact, not less unsustainable projects, which you keep getting. And it's a tough to get everyone on board, but we can do this work with Maui Tomorrow's plan and really start regenerating and healing West Maui. Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

- MS. STEWART: Our final testifier signed up in the Chambers is Mapuano...Mapuana Samonte.
- MS. SAMONTE: Aloha kakou.

CHAIR KAMA: Aloha.

MS. SAMONTE: My name is Mapuana Samonte, and I'm a small business owner and kumu hula. Mahalo for the opportunity to enter my testimony today in support of the Makila Farms residential workforce housing project. I was born and raised in the town of Lahaina. I was a renting-resident there for more than 32 years. Currently, I reside here in Wailuku due to the lack of inventory and the fair cost of rental housing. I was forced to move to Central Maui for the past five years since then because it is substantially more affordable for me. I am the sole provider for my family. I have a unique situation that I would like to share as a person of part-Hawaiian ancestry, and I would like to speak on the behalf of those that do not qualify for the 50 percent blood quantum to acquire DHHL or Hawaiian Home Lands. Two years ago, my elderly mother of 86 years of age, who was 48.5 percent Hawaiian, unfortunately passed away on the list, the waiting list. That was our chance for our affordable homeownership as a family. And she was on that list since 1982, and the laws have not changed in favor for our Hawaiians that...part-Hawaiians that still wait. So, Makila Farms is a chance for some of the Lahaina families that have been there for generations, you know, to have an affordable home. So, I am for the project, and I hope that you consider passing it. Mahalo.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. STEWART: There are no more testifiers signed up in the Chambers, Chair.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. So, Members, brief recess. ... (gavel)...

RECESS: 4:38 p.m.

RECONVENE: 4:40 p.m.

CHAIR KAMA: ... (gavel). . . The Affordable Housing Committee of September 4th will now reconvene. Okay. So, now, I'd like to be able to close public testimony without objection.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Public testimony is now closed.

... END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY...

September 4, 2019

- CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So, Members, we are going to reconvene our Housing meeting on September 10th at 9:00 a.m. So, September 10th, that's a Tuesday, right? Okay. So, next week Tuesday, September 10th, 9:00 a.m. in the morning. Yes, Mr. Molina?
- VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: Yeah, thank you, Madam Chair. Just for the record, we closed testimony as well for our Office...Council Services Offices as well in Molokai, Lanai? That's included in your closing of public testimony?

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: Yeah, okay. I was just double-checking on what --

CHAIR KAMA: Does all public...

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: --...(inaudible)...

CHAIR KAMA: Do I need to say that --

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: Yeah, I just want to make --

CHAIR KAMA: --neighbor islands --

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: --sure it was clear.

CHAIR KAMA: --are closed too?

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: Yeah, yeah ---

CHAIR KAMA: I ---

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: --yeah.

CHAIR KAMA: --assumed they went home at four o'clock.

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: Yeah, yeah, maybe, maybe. You'll never know but just want --

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR MOLINA: --...(inaudible)...

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Mr. Molina. That's what a good Chair does. He keeps your Chair alive and well and working. Yes, so, we're going to reconvene our Affordable Housing Committee. So, what's going to happen is that our presenters will come back, and we'll have time to deliberate at that moment. But until then, I have no questions. Mimi, do you have something you want to say?

September 4, 2019

MS. DesJARDINS : No, I just want to make sure that you're going to recess today.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, I'm going to recess today's meeting at 4:41 p.m. till September --

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: ... (inaudible). .. --

CHAIR KAMA: --10th.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --...(inaudible)...

CHAIR KAMA: Yes, Mr. Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Chair, if we have some questions we know you...we'd like to pose, you want it in advance 'cause mine would deal with Public Works.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay.

CHAIR KAMA: Yes. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, thank you for that guidance.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. So, if you have questions in advance by ... yes, Mr. Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Right, thank you, Chair. One of the testifiers had mentioned the, I believe it was 13...19.30A.040, and I --

CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: --was wondering if that was...that could be kind of clarified on by the next meeting.

CHAIR KAMA: Sure. Mimi, can you...

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. She shall get that for us. Any other questions or comments or anything else, Members? Yes, Ms. Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I might have some questions for hydrology and ATU.

CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So, the presenters will bring their...you're going to bring all your guys here that day? Okay. So...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And Fire.

September 4, 2019

CHAIR KAMA: Fire will be here that day. They told me they'll be here. Anyone else want to invite anybody else to this party? You may come, yes, by all means. Thank you. Okay. So, if the Members have nothing more, I'd like to recess this meeting. Meeting recessed. ... (gavel)...

RECESSED: 4:43 p.m.

APPROVED:

TASHA KAMA, Chair Affordable Housing Committee

ah:min:190904:acqp

Transcribed by: Ann Carmel Q. Pugh

September 4, 2019

CERTIFICATE

I, Ann Carmel Q. Pugh, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the

best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 17th day of September, 2019, in Kihei, Hawaii

AFERIA

Ann Carmel Q. Pugh