

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

September 17, 2019

Council Chamber

CONVENE: 1:34 p.m.

PRESENT: VOTING MEMBERS:

Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Chair
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Kelly T. King
Councilmember Alice L. Lee (left at 2:12 p.m.)
Councilmember Michael J. Molina
Councilmember Tamara Paltin
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura

STAFF: Kasie Apo Takayama, Legislative Analyst
Nicole Siegel, Committee Secretary

Zhantell Lindo, Council Aide, Molokai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)
Denise Fernandez, Council Aide, Lanai Council Office (via telephone conference bridge)

Don Atay, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci
Gina Flammer, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci

ADMIN.: Jennifer Oana, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel
Tamara Farnsworth, Environmental Protection and Sustainability Division Chief, Department of Environmental Management
Makale`a Ane, Environmental Coordinator, Office of the Mayor

OTHERS: Joshua Stanbro, Chief Resilience Officer and Executive Director, City and County of Honolulu Office of Climate Change, Sustainability, and Resiliency
Michelle Kauhane, Senior Vice President of Community Grants & Investments, Hawaii Community Foundation

Rob Parsons
Kristin Baja
Others (2)

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

PRESS: *Akaku: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

CHAIR SINENCI: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Aloha mai kakou.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Aloha.

CHAIR SINENCI: Will the Environmental, Agricultural, and Cultural Preservation Committee meeting of September 17, 2019 please come to order? It is 1:34 p.m. on a Tuesday. I'm Shane Sinenci, your Committee Chair. And before we go on, may I please ask that everyone silence all cell phones and noise-making devices, please? Mahalo. We'll do some quick introductions. Starting on my right, your left, Vice-Chair Tasha Kama. Aloha.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: And Ms. Yuki Lei Sugimura, welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thanks for being here. From west side, Tamara Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha auinala, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha auinala. And from Wailuku, we have Member Alice Lee. Welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, thank you, Chair. Hola.

CHAIR SINENCI: Hola. Qué pasó? From Makawao, we have Mr. Michael Molina. Aloha.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Hey, aloha, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha. I...now, I call him the conductor.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh.

CHAIR SINENCI: Yeah. And finally, Chair King, welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Well, buongiorno.

CHAIR SINENCI: Buongiorno. Okay. From the Department of Corporation Counsel, we have Ms. Jennifer Oana. Welcome.

MS. OANA: Good afternoon, Chair.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

CHAIR SINENCI: Good afternoon. And community resource person, Joshua Stanbro.

MR. STANBRO: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha. Thanks for being here. Josh is the Chief Resilience Officer and Executive Director of the City and County of Honolulu, Office of Climate Change, Sustainability, and Resiliency. So, welcome today.

MR. STANBRO: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: For our Staff, we have Ms. Kasie Apo Takayama.

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Ms. Nicole Siegel, Committee Secretary. And then on our District Offices, we have Denise Fernandez; Zhanterell Lindo in our Molokai District Office; and the Hana Office is closed today. So, Members, we have one item today, Establishing an Agency to Address Climate Change, Sustainability, and Resiliency. And this was a continuation of our cancelled meeting from September 3rd. So, if there's no objections, we'd like to start with testimony. For individuals testifying in the Chamber, please sign up at the desk just outside the Chamber door. If testifying from one of the remote testimony sites, please sign up with District Office Staff. Testimony will be limited to the item on the agenda today. Pursuant to the Rules of the Council, each testifier will be allowed to testify for up to three minutes. When testifying, please state your name, the name of any organization you may be representing, and pursuant to the Rules of the Council, if you are a paid lobbyist. We have established a connection to the Council District Offices. So, Ms. Apo Takayama, would you like to call the next testifier? The first testifier?

. . .BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Chair, the first person to testify is Rob Parsons.

MR. PARSONS: Aloha, Chair and Members. My name is Rob Parsons. I'm a long-time Maui resident. I'm grateful to Chair Sinenci and Members here today for your consideration of establishing an agency, department, or office to directly address the urgency of climate action and sustainability. I urge you to take swift action to put forth a preferred option for directing County resources, staff, and funding for this purpose. In a way, I wish there were more people here today, but it's...sometimes it seems that we're far more busy putting out fires than looking at long-range and really important issues such as the one we have before us today. This discussion is not new. I helped Mayor Arakawa draft a resolution for the 2011 Charter Commission to address environmental protection and sustainability. Member Sugimura was one of those on the Commission who considered that resolution, which ultimately was passed on the 2012 ballot, where 20, or I'm sorry, 66 percent of voters supported it. However, the

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

department tasked with addressing these issues dragged their feet and progress has been extremely slow. With that in mind, I propose we drop the term climate change. This is not a spectator sport where we read the headlines of hurricanes, heat waves, and melting glaciers, and throw up our arms in despair. Instead, let's embrace the term climate action. We need bold actions to counter the urgency at hand. Take note of the Climate Strike actions happening this Friday with a Fridays for Future student gathering here at Kalana O Maui in the morning and a rally at UHMC in the afternoon, which is one of thousands happening around the globe. Next week, the United Nations is conducting an Emergency Climate Summit. Yesterday, the temperature at Kahului Airport tied an all-time record high of 97 degrees. The heat is on, and we need action. I'm happy to welcome my friend and colleague, Josh Stanbro, here today. As Chief Resilience Officer for the City and County's Office of Climate Change, Sustainability, and Resilience, he has championed efforts, initiatives, and outreach that have helped Honolulu hit the ground running after their voters passed a ballot measure to create their office in 2016. We have a lot to learn from them. We don't need to reinvent the wheel. With regards to the options before you on this agenda item, my personal experience is that one or two point persons in the Mayor's Office addressing these issues and goals may be a good start, but is insufficient in the long-term. Case in point is Fort Collins, Colorado, with a similar population to Maui, with a sustainability services focus that has upwards of 15 staff employees. The department head is Jackie Kozak Thiel, who is the...who was Hawaii's first Sustainability Coordinator under Governor Abercrombie, and led efforts through Hawaii Green Growth to establish the Aloha+ Challenge. And I'll finish up here. While there may be different opinions among Committee Members on how to expediently set and reach sustainability, resilience, and climate action goals, I hope there will be no delay in sending forth a credible option to establish the structure for our County government to show leadership in this time of vital need. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Mr. Parsons. Members, do you have any questions? Chair King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for being here, Rob. And I'm going to address this from your previous experience working in the previous Administration as our Environmental Coordinator, because I support the idea. I'm just a little bit confused about how this fits in with our Environmental Protection and Sustainability Office, which I think during most of your tenure didn't, you know, existed in name only. It was never...the funds were never appropriated, or if they were, they weren't expended, and there was never a...an office head named until I think 2018 was it? They came in at the last minute and...and so, how does this differ or how does it work with that office?

MR. PARSONS: Well, I think that's a really important question, and thank you for asking. I think that Mr. Stanbro's presentation will shed some light on the complete structure and focus that that office has taken. And I understand that we don't want to put forth a Charter amendment that's going to be duplicative, that will do the same kinds of things that they're tasked with. Their office was created in the Department of Environmental Management pursuant to the Charter amendment but it didn't say

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

create an office, create a department. So, that's something that you as a Committee and as a Council I think can hone in on how you want to formulate this so that it will be poised for success, because we don't want to duplicate what happened before when we had ample opportunity but we just didn't have the direction to move it forward, frankly.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And, you know, from my understanding, the EP&S program right now is really only about abandoned vehicles and...

MR. PARSONS: And recycling.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Not even recycling, it's really removing because we're not doing any recycling on the island, we're just shipping it off to somewhere.

MR. PARSONS: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: And now, we're in big trouble because China doesn't want our --

MR. PARSONS: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --recyclables anymore. So...

MR. PARSONS: Right. And we've covered that previously in this --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, is that...

MR. PARSONS: --Committee, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Does that kind of stuff still need a place in DEM or is that something that can fold into this other program?

MR. PARSONS: Well, the Charter amendment, that was the impetus for creating that office, said that the powers, duties, and functions of the Director of the Department of Environmental Management shall include environmental protection, sustainability. And during the Charter Commission process, the language which originally was in the Charter...question which wound up on the ballot was somewhat diluted. When originally submitted, the Mayor and I had defined sustainability a little more, and I think there's a opportunity to do that by looking at what other jurisdictions have done. Fort Collins is a great one. They're, you know, they're about a 150,000 population, and I can give you the flow chart from that if it helps in your discussion.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. PARSONS: I can...

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you. And then my last question to you is where do you think this office should reside, this...is it best under the Office of the Mayor or putting it into a department, or creating a new department, a standalone department?

MR. PARSONS: My feeling is that this is important enough to create a standalone department. If you need the community to weigh in on that, you could send it forth as a ballot measure; however, that would take an additional year plus implementation time after --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Right.

MR. PARSONS: --that. And I think we need to do something now.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. PARSONS: So, in the short-term, we do have a couple of point people. One of them is here in the audience, and the one that you referred to in Environmental Management told me that she has a meeting and she'll attend as soon as she's pau with her 1:30 meeting. So, you can get that kind of feedback from them on what's currently being done. But as I said in my testimony, I strongly believe that a couple people...this was a model that we've had under the Arakawa Administration, Environmental Coordinator, Energy Coordinator, Agriculture Coordinator, and then Recycling Coordinator, but it hasn't been cohesive.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Right.

MR. PARSONS: And so, I think should a department of, you know, mirroring what's been done in Honolulu be created, I think that sets us up for success, and cohesively being able to address these topics, which have a lot of things in common. They're not standalone topics, need to have an office working together.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you.

MR. PARSONS: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thanks for --

MR. PARSONS: --thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --being here. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Ms. Sugimura --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

CHAIR SINENCI: --you have a question for the testifier?

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. Thanks for being here. Nice to see you.

MR. PARSONS: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, when you were working and created that communication with us at the Charter Commission, what position were you holding?

MR. PARSONS: I was an Executive Assistant to the Mayor for Environmental Concerns at that time.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, you weren't with the...and you ended up going to OED...

MR. PARSONS: I did in 2013, I went over to OED, still doing the same work, and overseeing the environmental grants, yeah, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

MR. PARSONS: And at the same time, because we had no Sustainability Coordinator, I was embracing those issues working with State and ultimately Federal, I should say national groups that are addressing sustainability.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, I think you became kind of the voice during the Arakawa Administration. Nice to see you here. And I was just curious, I believe that the discussion will be, and I'm glad that...to see Josh Stanbro here 'cause he did present to us last term when we were trying to establish the Charter amendment --

MR. PARSONS: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --and for which I know that you supported. It's...so, do you have a...you're basically saying do something now, the Charter amendment would be during November's election. So, you're seeing a urgency to do something now and the structure right now?

MR. PARSONS: Right. As a reminder, Josh was here I think at the end of May last year, and I believe it was at your Committee that was hearing this. And that being an election year, it could have gone on the ballot at that time. So --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, it --

MR. PARSONS: --we could have --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --didn't pass.

MR. PARSONS: --dealt with it...

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: It didn't pass --

MR. PARSONS: Right --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --out of my --

MR. PARSONS: --but --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --Committee.

MR. PARSONS: --it only missed passing by one vote --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Right.

MR. PARSONS: --and that was because it was a bare quorum. So, it had 80 percent support. And so, here we are again with some new faces and new voices. And I think in the short-term, we want to ask the Administration to do as much as they possibly can with the staff they have while we're waiting for the opportunity to devote more staff, resources, and funding to this ultimately.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. I hope we'll hear from the OED staff over here --

MR. PARSONS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --just to see how it all fits together. But thank you.

MR. PARSONS: Yeah. Thank you very much.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Ms. Sugimura. Any others? Thank you, Mr. Parsons --

MR. PARSONS: Thank you, Chair and Members.

CHAIR SINENCI: --for being here. Ms. Apo Takayama?

MS. APO TAKAYAMA: Chair, the next testifier is Kristin Baja.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Thank you. And the Chair would just like to recognize our Non-Voting Members today, Mr. Riki Hokama and Ms. Keani Rawlins-Fernandez, if they so choose to join us, they're welcome.

MS. BAJA: Good afternoon. Thank you all for having me and I appreciate the opportunity to testify. My name is Kristin Baja. I am the Climate Resilience Officer with the Urban Sustainability Directors Network. It's a network of local governments that work together collaboratively on climate resilience, greenhouse gas emission reductions, and

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

equity. I'm actually here in Hawaii to be working with all four counties to help move into proactive action around climate change, and I work with all 215 members within our network. And one of the biggest things that we have found is that actually developing a climate resilience office or having a climate change office does help move from our reactive stance around climate change into a more proactive stance. It allows us to start taking action quicker, and it allows us to do so in a collaborative manner. And it's nice to see that Josh is here because I think it offers a great opportunity to be able to work with other islands to come together collaboratively around this work. Additionally, I just wanted to mention that it does provide that opportunity to think about humans and the human-centered approach. And as we think about climate and climate change, how people are impacted first and worst. So, there's a real opportunity with this office to actually integrate equity and think about social cohesion and community adaptive capacity as a real massive component. And I would also mention that this is a real opportunity for this office to provide collaboration internally and also externally with external partners. Climate change is part of everybody's job. It impacts us all. And so, I just wanted to get up and mention that we are seeing success with this model across the rest of the country and especially in the continent, and to note that it's not just Fort Collins but there are several other local governments that really have actively been working in this space, doing a great a job. And that's one of the reasons I'm here and able to work. In fact, I'm going to be running a session in about ten minutes upstairs to do more of that proactive action on some really community-driven processes. So, just wanted to state that I think this would be an excellent opportunity.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo. Thank you. Ms. Paltin has a question for you.

MS. BAJA: Please.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Ms. Baja, for coming and your testimony and all the work that you're doing in Hawaii. I was thinking that the reason we never really got past the Charter amendment and funding the job is we didn't have such a vision of what that person would do. And I was wondering if we were to establish this, can we work together with you and become like a 216th member network?

MS. BAJA: It...it's actually is part...so, Maui County is already part of the USDN membership. And so, you actually, through your Office of Economic Development, have an excellent opportunity to already engaged with our network and have access to other job descriptions, other structures of offices, and other examples, both within Hawaii and outside of the State. So, certainly, we're here to support because Maui County is a member of USDN, and we would happily support that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Thank you. Mr. Molina, you have a question?

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you, Chair. And good morning, Miss...or I should say good afternoon, Ms. Baja.

MS. BAJA: Good afternoon.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: You know, you've mentioned like in, I guess Fort Collins in Colorado as did Mr. Parsons, can you cite an example of the successes they've had in Fort Collins or other municipalities in the country?

MS. BAJA: Oh, yeah, there are so many I could list them for the rest of the afternoon. But Fort Collins has certainly done a good job thinking about how again that shift into a more proactive scope and looking at these synergies between reducing greenhouse gas emissions but also trying to really bring together other proactive action around resilience, and putting those two things together synergistically with equity as a lens. So, thinking about people first and what are people's needs in the everyday, and then having those needs be met and sort of the focal point for all the other work that they're doing. What that's allowed them to do is start asking different questions instead of how do we get people to ride buses more, it's what is the barrier for people riding buses, and how do we create a safe and enjoyable space for people to ride buses. In doing that, how do we make them faster, and that will actually help us reduce emissions, get people using public transit more, and then also thinking about the other uses for those buses. So, I can go on a long list of great things that are happening but it's really working at more synergistic work between reducing carbon, thinking about enhancing community resilience, and also thinking about the human-centered approach.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: So, more of an aggressive educational approach out to the community and networking, and bringing private entities and non-profit entities into the decision-making --

MS. BAJA: Absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --. . .*(inaudible)*. . . --

MS. BAJA: Yeah, we're --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --. . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. BAJA: --looking at bringing a lot of other partners in. What's really strategic about a climate office is that it allows us to really be partnering more with external organizations, external partners, bringing in resources, funding from some of those external partners, and having that sort of be a more full-time position and opportunity, but making sure that that's again coming from the community level and that it's really brought together on the community needs. And that's often our disconnect is that if we don't have somebody doing that and showing everybody within other departments how that can be done, we miss out on those opportunities.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you --

MS. BAJA: You're welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Mr. Molina. Chair King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. Thank you. Good to see you again.

MS. BAJA: Good to see you as well.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: That was...that Game of Extremes was fun yesterday. So, you touched on what my...one of my questions, which was about funding, about the funding opportunities. If we create this office, does that give us more access to Federal funding? Or is it related more to, I mean taking the actions we need to take versus creating an office?

MS. BAJA: So, I think there's a both/and with that. I certainly think if you have an office, it does open you up to having more access to funding from a lot of bigger organizations and foundations that are actually looking to support. So, we've seen an example of actually with Honolulu, how they were able to get a...get setup was through the 100 Resilient Cities process, and that was from an external partner and group. But we've also seen other offices get setup without that sort of structure, and they've had access to additional funding. We're seeing resilience and climate change really come up in some of our other partner organizations. And so, there is funding that's coming down the pipeline for communities that are being proactive through the Federal BRIC program that isn't quite released yet. There are also just opportunities to think outside of Federal funding sources, and I think we're seeing more of those floating around in sort of national foundations. I don't have an extensive list in front of me 'cause to be honest with you, I was not quite prepared for this, but I am very happy to share them with you in the future.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. That's really helpful 'cause we're just...we're trying to figure out how to...I think from my point of view having been here last term, the reason why that didn't...that probably didn't get that last vote, which was somebody else's, but it was trying to figure how to fold this or how to integrate this idea of this office into what we already have, which was the Environmental Protection and Sustainability Office, which we had funded at a pretty high level. I think it was like \$7 million. And so, to create another office, it was going to be, you know, I don't know how many million, but we didn't have a good plan for how to integrate those two and get them focused on what we're, you know, the end goal. But the other, I want to follow up on Councilmember Molina's question on Fort Collins and other communities, do you actually have like...I understand that the questions are changing and the attitude is changing, but the real results like did they increase their ridership, their

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

bus ridership, you know, did those end result, if we have information that shows, you know, what the real results are, that's really helpful to us because that's one of our big problems right now is increasing bus ridership. And, you know, we're trying to change the vernacular and look at things differently, but, you know, we'd like to see other communities that have actually, you know, made these changes but also shown the real results.

MS. BAJA: Yeah, certainly. One of the benefits of the network and being a member of the network is it's actually a way to share all of that information and share the promising practices that may work well one place, that we can use as an example, and then alter to be utilized wherever you are. So, here in Maui County, I think certain things would apply and be very applicable, and there are good resources to look at within the network. Some may not translate. Fort Collins is also in the middle of the Intermountain West and is not as prone to flooding as you all are. But there are examples across all of our 215 local governments, and we do have both counties and cities, and different forms of government, and there's a lot of examples out there and things that have been successful. One of the biggest things I've been doing here is actually talking about strategic relocations, strategies, and policies and practice, different ideas for incorporating and integrating into existing plans. We're about to go upstairs and have a meeting about resilience hubs with communities as copartners and leaders. So, certainly, there are a lot of things happening within the network, there are examples and you have access to all of those as being a member.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you. And ironically, I would love to be in your meeting but I...we're here talking about it here. But I do have a staff member who's going to be participating.

MS. BAJA: Excellent.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So --

MS. BAJA: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --thank you.

MS. BAJA: --I'd love to stay here too but I apologize, I cannot.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you, Kristin.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Ms. Baja, for being --

MS. BAJA: Thank you very much.

CHAIR SINENCI: --here. I just wanted to add, you know, I pick up Uncle Don on the way here. So, we carpool here. But it's really amazing 'cause when we get a...we see most of the cars we pass have only one person in their cars. So, I mean I don't see a lot of

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

carpooling beside the buses or anything like that. But it's amazing when you look and see how many cars, there's just one driver and...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair, I'm really glad you said that because I mentioned that yesterday in our afternoon session of Game of Extremes. And I have the same experience, you know, and I was saying that for me who, you know, and I've haven't driven on petroleum on the island of Maui since the year 2000, but when I drive around, you're right, it's like nine out of ten vehicles have one person in them.

MS. BAJA: It's a really great opportunity for a climate office to make a huge difference while making sure it's well integrated with your Economic --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah.

MS. BAJA: --Development Office 'cause there are --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: We just want to make --

MS. BAJA: --massive --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --sure --

MS. BAJA: --synergies.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --it's going to make that difference. So --

MS. BAJA: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --yeah --

MS. BAJA: --absolutely.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --thank you so much for your assistance.

MS. BAJA: Thank you very much.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Mahalo for your testimony. Is there anyone else in the Chambers who would like to testify? Seeing none, can we go out to our District Offices? Ms. Denise Fernandez in our Lanai District Office, any testifiers?

MS. FERNANDEZ: Aloha, Chair. This is Denise Fernandez at the Lanai Office and there are no testifiers.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo. Ms. Zhantell Lindo at our Molokai District Office?

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

MS. LINDO: Aloha, Chair. This is Zhan at the Molokai District Office and there are no testifiers.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you very much. So, Members, seeing there are no other individuals wishing to testify, without objection, I will close public testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

. . .END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

EACP-26 ESTABLISHING AN AGENCY TO ADDRESS CLIMATE CHANGE,
SUSTAINABILITY, AND RESILIENCY (CC 19-177)

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you. Again, Members, so, this one item, EACP-26, and so, my intention today for this item is just to give the floor to our guest, Dr. Josh Stanbro, for being here. We're lucky to have you today, Mr. Stanbro. He has joined us from the City and County of Honolulu's Office of Climate Change, Sustainability, and Resiliency, and has prepared a presentation to educate us on the process and the history of establishing an agency to address climate change. He will also speak to the progress and the challenges of the City and County of Honolulu's respective office. In addition to his role at the City and County of Honolulu's office, Director Josh Stanbro has also previously served as the Environmental and Sustainability Program Director for the Hawaii Community Foundation and headed The Trust for Public Lands Hawaii office where he has worked with local communities to permanently protect over 25,000 acres, and has dedicated over \$200 million in land conservation funds. This being said, Director Stanbro has a vast background in this topic and the matter as a whole. So, Members, if there are no objections, I'd like to designate Director Stanbro as a resource person pursuant to 18(A) of the Rules of the Council.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you. So, Director Stanbro, you may proceed with your presentation.

MR. STANBRO: Is it okay if I stand over there or here?

CHAIR SINENCI: Sure, wherever you want to stand.

MR. STANBRO: I feel a little better standing up.

CHAIR SINENCI: And I just wanted to add, you know, he took some time out of his busy schedule, flew over from Oahu to be here. Last time he came on September 3rd, and he was gracious about cancelling and rescheduling our meeting. So, after his presentation, I'll open the floor to questions for our resource person and take any general comments on the resolutions as posted.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

MR. STANBRO: I got...yeah, it works. Okay. Aloha, Chair and --

CHAIR SINENCI: Aloha.

MR. STANBRO: --Members of the Committee. It's really an honor, and I appreciate the invitation to come. I know that obviously every island is different. Every county is different. And, you know, I'm happy to talk about sort of our experience and what we can offer up. But I know that, you know, some of it may fit, and some of it may not because of the uniqueness of each space. I think Chair gave me a promotion. I don't want people walking out thinking I'm a doctor 'cause I'm not. I wasn't able to have the patience to stay that long in school. But I do, and like a doctor, we've been analyzing this problem of climate change and trying to figure out sort of what the path is forward, and I hope that we can offer up some thoughts to help you as you think through it. I was madly taking notes. So, I'm going to skip a little few pieces before I jump into the conversation. Mr. Parsons talked about sort of what's in a name and talked about climate action instead of climate change. And one of the things we've struggled with is our terrible acronym, CCSR. So, I was working the numbers on his suggestion, and it would be climate action, resilience, and sustainability, which is CARS. So, I'm not sure if that's exactly what you want to go for but I like the intent. So, climate change is a profound challenge. The few...the testifiers, you know, before talk about how it impacts all the different departments, how it impacts every sector, and we need to work not only across the islands and between counties, we need to work across parties, we need to work between councils and mayors in all the counties, we need to work from county to State, and across sectors. And so, I really applaud this Committee and the leadership here to think about how to set this up potentially in the most effective way to work across those sectors 'cause it is very complex work, sort of works its way into multiple different parties. So, I want to, you know, commend Council. I also want to commend the Administration. And from what I gather, there's actually a movement afoot to begin getting a running start at this and helping organize a...an effort or an office that would sort of get the ball moving, if this does potentially go to the voters and establish it as a full embedded in Charter efforts. So, I think there's synergy it seems like happening between parties, and that's not something that had necessarily happened on Oahu. So, I think your County has a chance to get a faster start at this even though, you know, it's later in the game. You might be able to ramp up more quickly. And I also want to just highlight a couple elements about why this is important. I think it was touched on by a couple of the speakers. But...and the office that we have, the Office of Climate Change, Sustainability and Resiliency, is really a platform to work on policy. And policy is different than working on projects and, you know, planting trees, and keeping roads paved, and all that sort of thing. We try to work across all the departments to work on what the right policies should be to adopt, and that's that foresight of sort of looking down the road or over the horizon to adopt policies that avoid wasting money or, you know, lack of durability on infrastructure. You can also focus on partnerships. Baja, it was kind of funny to hear everybody call her Ms. Baja 'cause she goes by Baja, that's her first name [sic]. So, I kept thinking we're in grade school, you know, like when you like hey, Ms. Baja, you're calling her her first name [sic]. But, you know, she was

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

mentioning these partnerships, and there are potentials with national funders. There's potential with local funders as well. The Hawaii Community Foundation, where I did use to work, I just had breakfast the other day with their, you know, sort of strategic partnerships person, and one of their four priorities going forward is going to be climate resilience. So, they're going to be hiring somebody to work with other entities across the State on this. Having an office that's dedicated to these issues around climate resilience, allows you to have a one-to-one relationship where you can cultivate and work with that partnership with the State's largest foundation to try to leverage support. It also sends a signal to other cities, counties, the State, that your jurisdiction is taking a lead on this issue. We are still, the office in Honolulu, is still the only office in the entire nation on a municipal level that has the words climate change in the title. That gets attention when we talk to funders, when we talk to partners, when we talk to technical providers that are thinking about doing some pro bono work with us because they want to be associated with a forward-leaning jurisdiction. And I think you have an opportunity to do that as well. And then finally, it's a really important pipeline we've discovered over the last two-and-a-half years of our existence for youth into public service. We turn down dozens of folks who are either in school or just coming out of school that want to do internships in the office for free. They just want to be working on the issue of climate change. They recognize it as the challenge of humanity, the challenge of our time, and whether it's UH, Yale, Harvard, Columbia, we get bombarded with folks who are looking to work in an office that's focused on climate change. And then a lot of those folks have actually sort of stuck with the program and with the internships that we've built, and the VISTA programs, and the VISTA positions we've built. And we think we're going to catch a fair amount of them going into an aging workforce at our county. I'm not sure what your demographics look like. Ours in City and County of Honolulu is aging out rapidly. So, whether it's Department of Facilities [sic] Maintenance, Department of Environment [sic], and elsewhere, we need new, bright, smart, passionate folks, and it's been a good pipeline for that. So, what I'm planning to do, and please interject, cut me off if it's time, but what I would...was planning to do with the presentation is do a quick introduction to our office, how it got started; talk about some of the unique work that we've been able to focus on over the last two-and-a-half years of our existence; introduce the Resilience Strategy that we've developed, which I handed out a quick summary for each of the Councilmembers--and I'm sorry, I skipped the Chair. Kasie, can you...and then identify a couple of the resilience actions that are in here to give you a flavor for what was developed up from the community from the grassroots that we put into the Resilience Strategy; and then offer some thoughts about what we would have done differently looking in the rearview mirror now and where we're at. So, with that, let me get started.

. . .BEGIN PRESENTATION. . .

MR. STANBRO: So, the first piece is just a bit of history. So, we were established by voters in 2016 in the election. You'll remember that that was also the year that our national election was decided. And so, we had sort of interesting bookend of national policy

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

going in one direction, and then this exciting sort of opening at the local government level to go in a completely other direction. It passed by a large majority. And the idea for the Climate Change Office was actually polled and we're not, you know, what's the saying, good cities...like good cities copy, great cities steal, I think it is something like that. We just stole the model for our city basically from New York and New York State, which had...we kind of hybridized the two, and to take the best of the state and the city models from New York when...and this was UH Law School, looked around the country at the request of the Charter Commission in 2016 and said, what would be the best way to tackle climate change for our municipality? And this was the answer they came up with was this hybrid model out of New York, put that to the voters, and it was passed with a large majority. So, there was a lot of work that went in to, you know, what would be the most effective way and the location of the office and the design. And we can talk a little bit about why Honolulu at least settled on this model. And this was something that, you know, there was a 150 proposed charter amendments. This was one of the 20 that was selected and passed. So, the charter really lays out sort of six areas where the office is meant to focus on. I don't have my glasses on so I can't see them but I think you can. Essentially, you know, really the main thrust is working to, you know, work with communities to help build resilience; making sure that we're collaborating with other entities so that's that partnership angle where we're working with the State, with the Feds, with private foundations and others; and then, you know, the big one really is just making sure that we're focusing on reducing climate emissions...carbon emissions, and then preparing for the impacts. And just sort of from a policy angle, doing that day in and day out. The other one is basically staffing the Climate Change Commission. So, in our case, the charter vote was to also establish a standalone commission; five experts, nominated by the mayor, approved by council; that advise the mayor, council, and department heads on the latest climate science, what to do, and their policy recommendations. And that's been really helpful because they're small and nimble with five folks, experts on the subject, and they're not pulling any punches. There's no sort of mix of folks on there and political, you know, or business sort of things that are working across purposes. It's just the science and just their best advice. So, structure of our office now, we have an executive director, we have a deputy director. And we now have eight other staff in the office. We have energy program manager; climate and equity manager, has been our latest hire; and you can see the other ones up there. But what we've really tried to do is ramp up quickly with the help of private foundations, and the help of a supportive council, and a budget process to make sure that we have the tools in our toolbox to really think through policy writ large across several different platforms. We've also been able to augment our staff with AmeriCorps VISTA's, which is an amazing program, fully...almost fully-funded by the Federal government that allows us to get year-long fellows. It's like an internal peace corps, and essentially allow some of these young, bright folks coming out of school to work for a year on a project or a set of projects for our office, build up some skills within government, and then translate that into the job sector. I don't think we need to spend too much time on this, but I think there was a question earlier about sort of how do you ramp up the outreach and the community education. And so, we spent the first year straight going out to every single neighborhood board, going to every rotary we could, anybody that would have

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

us, we would go talk about what the climate office and the resilience office is and what the dynamics are around climate change. And we found that, you know, being able to focus on how you message things was really helpful because instead of showing...we started out with a bunch of graphs and like numbers going up and down, and parts per million, and all this stuff, and it wasn't landing until one...in fact, somebody from our Resilience Steering Committee, Barry Choy, who's with...he's our military liaison on the Steering Committee who sort of help leading our efforts from the outside said, you know, I heard this example about how we describe climate change in ways people can understand. And since then, we've just been, you know, using the image of a parked car. And if you park your car at, I don't know, Foodland or KTA, or whatever island you're on, you can talk about whatever, you know, grocery store it is, and you leave it for an hour and you come out, you know how hot it is inside that car. And that's exactly what's happening with the earth. You got a transparent atmosphere, which is a windshield. Light can get in. Heat can't get out. And we ask people, if you walked past the car in a big, open, hot parking lot and there was a toddler inside, windows all rolled up, what would you do? You break the window, right? You'd break it in a heartbeat. And that's not what's happening in terms of policy, in terms of change, in the pace of change that we need. And so, you know, we try to talk about in ways people can understand why the office is important, why it's important to think about these things, and work on them. And, you know, all that heat causes headaches for municipalities. That's a tripling of extreme weather catastrophes over the past 30 years I think...40 years. And those are costs that are being borne by taxpayers. When we have the rain bomb, obviously, Kauai was...bore the brunt of it. But on Oahu, we had \$28 million in damage from the rain bomb. That rain bomb is directly attributable to extra heat in the atmosphere, which could hold extra water and dump it. So, that bar chart goes into costs that are being borne by municipalities. And that's one of the reasons for the office being so important is because you've got this sort of gap between what's insured, what isn't insured, and a lot of that damage is going to fall on municipal budgets. So, again, this is that proactive part of being able to sort of try to do things that hedge and relieve the financial burden that's going to come if we're just looking through a rearview mirror rather than looking out the front windshield of what's coming at us in terms of climate impacts. You know, these are the kind of images that we use when we talk to folks about how lucky we have been, and how we're not lucky to be...not likely to be this lucky in the future. This is 2015, all the hurricane, tropical storm activity that somehow magically avoided our island, but we're not going to be that lucky. And we're looking at the example of the Bahamas now, obviously, and what...how bad it can be, and why we should have systems in place looking forward to...whether resilience hubs, which Baja was just headed upstairs to talk about, catastrophe bonds, other innovative mechanisms that our office has been able to look into for Honolulu. This is just, you know, a reminder that we have a lot of commitments out there, and I'm not sure what the County of Maui has done in terms of commitments. Obviously, we each kind of track our own, but then there's the State commitments. Commitments are great that help sort of align. It's a good north star. But in terms of actually making things happen, it takes focus, it takes resources, and it takes policy. And that's what we really...we kind of think of ourselves as the not very sexy like guys down in the coal, you know, machine below

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

decks in a big steamer because the commitments could be made from the top deck but then to, you know, make them happen takes a lot of research, a lot of talking across different departments, making sure you're not having unintended consequences, and then rolling out policy, and that's what we've tried to do. And, you know, part of what our mandate is, under the Charter Commission, to develop an Annual Sustainability Report for the city, which we've never had before. Again, I'm not sure if that's something that Maui has done on a regular basis. That really helps keep us accountable. When we go out and talk to communities and we say, here's all the goals, here's what we're trying to do, the first thing that they answer back was we want to see, did bus ridership rise, you know, did these things happen that you thought would happen. And we've been pretty candid about, you know, we have theories, we have the USDN network to look at other cities' examples, but we will be honest when things don't work. We are facing an unprecedented challenge. This is...these are cases of first impression. So, sometimes we're going to throw stuff at the wall, some is going to work, some is not, but it's important that we track that and be honest and transparent about that. And then the Resilience Strategy, which you have an executive summary, I'll talk a little bit more. This is really, you know, sort of the catch-all bucket. So, aside from the bread-and-butter resilience work, we've gotten involved on waste stream with our Department of Environment [sic]. We've gotten involved with our Budget and Fiscal Services. As you all may know, and I'm sure it's been brought up, Moody's, S&P, the bond rating agencies are now asking for disclosure around what each municipality is doing on climate. And they reserve the right to modify a bond rating based on, you know, whether you're acknowledging that risk, and whether you're doing something proactive about it. So, now the Budget and Fiscal Services of our city asks our office to write that bond disclaimer language every time we go out for bond offering. We've gone out a couple times in the last two years. We refresh that language every time because we want to show the raters, we actually are being serious and taking...in fact, and the very first thing we introduced in that bond section is that we have an Office of Climate Change, Sustainability, and Resiliency, which to their ears is okay, these guys at least are cognizant on it and they're thinking about it. That's going to help us preserve our ability to borrow money at a lower rate for going forward. Obviously, grant opportunities, we've been really lucky and we sort of paddled into the wave at just the right time in terms of the 2016 election and the startup of the office with the Rockefeller Foundation funding the Resilient Strategy...the Resilient Cities. Bloomberg Philanthropies picked Honolulu as one of 25 cities to invest in. But there are more and more of these opportunities coming out because of the Federal void. Because the Federal government is not investing in these, private philanthropy is turning to local government and saying, how can we help, how can we partner with local government? And then the one that I've...I really want to focus on for a moment is the collaboration piece. We honestly believe that a rising tide lifts all boats, and the more that the four counties can work together and kind of manage up to the State level, we can really drive a conversation, and we can fill some pukas that the State has left. The State again is one of those entities that's...it's good at making commitments. They're sort of a high-level policy goals-oriented, but in terms of where do the fleets get purchased, where are the materials that, you know, concrete that can absorb carbon, where's that consumed,

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

that's at the city level. All of these are at the City and County level. So, by partnering together, and the sustainability coordinators from each county, we were actually the last to the table, and we just feel terrible about that. For many, many, many years, Maui, Kauai, and Hawaii Island, Hawaii County, had sustainability coordinators and Oahu never had. And so, it was very difficult for a network to come together. And when our office was finally created, we were able to finally knit that cloth all the way through with all four counties, and we've taken off and we've been really closely collaborating. And I think an example is having Baja out here. You know, this is...just last week, we were all here with a bunch of planners at the planning conference. You guys were great hosts. But that visit from Baja came from an idea from Hawaii County and some content they developed. Hawaii or Kauai County's Sustainability Coordinator, writing up the grant and chasing it to ground, and getting money to actually host the meeting and the gathering. Our office put up the match to make sure that Baja was able to come fly out and, you know, her time is free, but the travel cost, and then Maui served as the host and the site host. And so, all four counties pitched in a little bit to make something happen that actually impacted all of the Department of Planning. You know, she delivered the keynote at the planning conference. So, that's the kind of magic that can come. You know, it's one plus one plus one and plus one doesn't equal four, it equals sort of ten, right, because we can actually leverage a lot more by working together. I talked a little bit about the Climate Change Commission. You know, we can have a discussion about whether this is something that really needs to be replicated multiple times. We thought it was important, or at least I can say the Charter Commission thought it was important to put that in front of the voters because the State Climate Change Commission is larger and a little bit more unwieldy. They thought that a different model might be helpful at the City and County level. Obviously, you know, these folks are the top-tier minds around climate science and deliver us white papers on a regular basis. We share those out with all the other sustainability coordinators. They're on our website. You know, this may be something that needs to be replicated at each county level, it may not, but we'd be open to having that conversation. But they have taken their mantle and their charge very seriously, and they've put out really great work and help. We can talk about their work, but essentially, you know, they're white papers around financial risk, climate, the sea level rise, you know, giving the latest science for the actual geography that you're working on rather than national data that sometimes can be a little bit opaque for us. You know, one of the things about having an office that is focused on this, and we are housed in the mayor's office as a policy shop that works across multiple departments, is, you know, the executive branch can do things including issue directives. And Mayor Caldwell issued a directive focused on climate change and essentially said to all departments, in every instance of decision-making, we want you to consider the white papers and the recommendations coming out of the commission and take those seriously, and make sure that you're factoring in the economics, the long-term economics around climate. That's made a big difference. We've actually had examples of rail going back, changing their specs, raising up their platform heights. Department of Environment [sic] in their wastewater treatment plant at Sand Island going back, changing their freeboard up to 16 feet to try to ensure that their new investments there are as durable as possible over time. And

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

then Board of Water Supply was already engaged on a climate adaptation plan for their infrastructure but went back and added some elements because of mayor's directive. And that's the kind of thing that, you know, can affect multiple departments coming out of one policy office. Again, this is sort of a new area for us. CDP is the disclosure body. This is what we point to in the bond offerings. For the first time ever last year, the City and County of Honolulu disclosed what our emissions are and what we're doing about them. Right now, I think it's HECO and City and County of Honolulu are the only two entities in the US or in Hawaii that are disclosing to CDP, and that's really the major area where everybody is being requested to. That's the kind of thing that we would encourage our sister agencies at each of the county, if they have the bandwidth and the capacity to do that and get on the record. I talked about the different partnerships. USDN, Baja is, you know, a staffer at the best bang for the buck. I encourage you. I know OED probably will come here with their budget, and they've got a little line item for USDN. Ours is \$5,600 a year, I think we pay as a membership to be part of the network. It's the best 5,600 bucks we've ever spent on anything. It plugs you into the sort of a spine into the, you know, the cerebral cortex of 215 cities and counties that are across the continent that are wrestling with the same issues as we do, and basically, being able to take all their work and not have to do it yourself. I think we've talked a bit about sort of this climate issue. The resilience piece is something that communities actually have been doing for a long, long time. This is not like we're suddenly the inventors of this. But this idea about, as you look into the 21st Century, how do we continue to survive, adapt and thrive when we've got even bigger stresses and shocks coming our way? We often use the example of Hilo. I'm sure there's others, but, you know, you think about the first hit from the tsunami. Everybody built back right in the same spot. Second hit from the tsunami in the '60s, after the '40s one, let's get the political will together. Let's figure out how to, you know, have everybody pitch in a little bit and do what Baja called strategic relocation rather than managed retreat, yeah. So, you know, Hilo did a strategic relocation and we saw when the hurricane came, what a year and a half ago, remember the images of Hilo with the gas station underwater and the one car, but then the rest was just all ball fields, and that was all where Hilo was. They would have been flooded a third time. But they weren't because, you know, there was thought put into how do you recover from long-term from these shocks and stresses. And that's the kind of thing that our office is, you know, we're developing a long-term recovery strategy for the island so that in the event--and I'll knock on wood 'cause I don't want it to happen--but in the event that something big does happen, that instead of building right back where things are, you can take that opportunity, those Federal dollars, the in-pouring of support from outside, and try to reposition so that you're stronger for the next time. Okay. So, quickly, I'll just touch on the Resilience Strategy. As I mentioned, we were really aggressive about going out to the community. We're a brand-new office. So, we wanted to let people know who we were, but also answer any questions from folks, and at the same time, gather the community's knowledge and wisdom about what they wanted to see, what they were worried about resilient and in terms of resilience, and then actually tell us where do you think the City and the County is stumbling, and what are the places that we need to do better. And so, out of all those meetings, we had over 3,000 people we talked to in person

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

to...met with 200 groups. We basically pulled together, you know, these priorities, and this was directly from surveys that we did on sort of smart phones, in-person with folks, and meetings like this with a presentation. And those are the ones that rise to the surface, right? And so, once we had those in hand, we started working on, okay, here's the four areas that we want to make sure we address in our Resilience Strategy, making sure that the long-term cost of living is kept in check so people don't have to move off island; making sure that we're prepared for natural disaster; making sure that we're addressing climate challenges. So, those three are the negatives, right? We're addressing negatives, weakness on island. The fourth one was actually a strength, and we thought it was really, really important to make sure that we weren't just talking about how weak we were, but actually taking a strength of community cohesion 'cause we have the...Rockefeller was pretty strident about this. They had done 99 cities around the world, and they said at least on Oahu--and you guys are probably stronger 'cause rural islands tend to be stronger I think--they said that it was the most social cohesion and sort of neighborliness they had seen in any city, and that is the number one tool of resilience. So, if you look at Hurricane Katrina, Sandy, Fukushima, the neighborhoods that bounced back fastest are the neighborhoods where they know each other the best, and they actually come jump in each other and have trust. And it didn't matter about infrastructure, it didn't matter about riches, it mattered about how well people know each other. And so, that was what we really wanted to focus on is making sure we didn't lose that asset that we built up. We had about a 100 different community leaders that worked for 3 months on each of those different 4 areas, and they came up with recommendations to get to 44 actions. So, you'll see the 44 actions in the summary. And just a couple examples, because sometimes people don't think about how these broader issues tie into climate resilience, our number two action in there was actually addressing the vacation rentals issue. And the reason was is because of that community cohesion piece. We were having neighborhoods being hollowed out because people were buying whole homes, renting them out. People didn't know their neighbors. They distrusted who was next to them. They were irritated with who is next to them. And there was going to be an issue if we did get hit by something, you have all these people in the neighborhood who don't have resources. They don't have freezers full of stuff. They don't have extended family to rely on. And knowing the sort of nature of people in Hawaii, instead, you'd be burdened with not only taking care of your own family but taking care of somebody from Iowa next to you, right? And so, this was the sort of social cohesion element where this became a climate resilience issue for real, and we wanted to make sure that it was addressed. The other thing is this was something that our Department of Planning and Permitting had been working on for over a decade, and it hadn't gotten the sort of bump and the lift and the support to get across the line 'cause it was a very difficult political issue. And so, what we were able to do is the community identified it as a priority, the department had identified it as a priority, and we were able to put it onto this platform, this pedestal, with the Resilience Strategy to say, hey, this is really important for a bunch of different reasons. And luckily, we're not going to claim credit 'cause it wasn't us that did it, DPP did it for years and years, but it passed the month after mayor dedicated his entire State of the City to the climate resilience issue and to the Resilience Strategy. So, we're really

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

happy about that. Just a couple more examples that oftentimes fly under the radar, because oftentimes people just focus on, you know, we got to eliminate cars or carbon emissions or whatever else, building codes. Again, not sexy. This is the number 1 way that we can reduce emissions on island though is making sure our buildings are built now so the...for the next 50 years, as they're on-island, they're actually more efficient, using less energy and ready and plugged-in for the EV vehicle revolution that's coming. So, we're struggling right now with different sectors to make sure we can get across the line for a third reading at council, to make sure that our energy codes are some of the most progressive in the nation. Another example, design guidelines, which is essentially in...short of demanding that other folks take on some really potentially onerous requirements around, you know, elevating building pads or looking out, you know, building outside of flooding areas, and that kind of thing. San Francisco and New York took a leadership-by-example position, and they essentially said we're going to design our...we're going to create our own design guidelines for ourselves, for our city infrastructure that we build, because we know we're going to be around for the long run. We don't want to put money into something that's not going to be good and durable for, you know, decades and decades to come. We're not just developing, and then leaving the community. So, the funny example about this is in San Francisco. They were...San Francisco was building a fire station or a fire department building next to the San Francisco Giants stadium area. And San Francisco Giants were going to be developing something as well, and they started looking at the guys building next to them, they're like, why are you bringing in all these fill, why are you going up so high? They handed them the guidelines. They said this is what we have to do at the city. Internally, this is our playbook for making sure that we're climate resilient. Giants looked at that. They're not a fly-by-night entity. Either they know they're going to be around for the long run, and lo and behold, they changed their building specs to mimic what San Francisco is doing. And so, that's sort of the power to persuade and lead by example that we're hoping to foster through our office's work. And then you guys are familiar with this. We...we're a little bit behind. I know I think the University of Maui [sic] is, you know, use these ESPC, the sort of this private contractor agreements to get off of, you know, as much as possible be energy-sovereign, energy self-sufficient. We're going to be trying to do this from the city side, as well as one of ours. And then I'll just...I threw all this in there because it's funny, I just read today, you know, the little scooters, the little e-scooters. So, practically zero carbon output, you know. In cities all across the nation, they're sweeping the nation. In Austin, they have 400,00 scooter rides a day now. And I just read today that Mercedes is introducing these little e-scooters. So, if the other ones weren't fancy enough for you, now, there's a Mercedes one out there. But it shows you the durability of some of these ideas like people want convenience. They also want low carbon, ways to get around. And so, this is part of what our office helps work on. We're working in...hand-in-hand with the Department of Transportation Services to reach out to USDN and others . . . (inaudible). . . what is the right approach to this? We don't want it to be lawlessness. We can't have these things flooding the streets, and being in the way of, you know, people in wheelchairs, on sidewalks and stuff, but there's a way to do it that we can actually capture all the good of it, and try to avoid the worst. I'm going to skip over these 'cause I know that time is precious for you

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

guys. I think the closing piece for us is that oftentimes we get asked, you know, is it worth, is it worth it to have this office, is it duplicative, is it...it costs money, you know, we don't see the immediate results, we have cost of living issues to worry about, affordable housing and homelessness, these things are top of mind. The reality is that solving the climate conundrum actually has all of these other amazing benefits. We basically drifted so far away from where we were, you know, whether it's 200 years ago, a 100 years ago, even 30 years ago in terms of ag self-sufficiency, and the way people got around, and the way they carpooled, and the way they shared resources, that there was a whole lot of benefits that came with that sort of lifestyle that we forgot about a little bit, and one of them is community cohesion. You know, when you ride with somebody else and carpool, you actually get to know the person better, and you build bonds. My dad carpooled for years--I'm from California--with a die-hard Republican, and he had his mind opened up to some things in these long hour-long rides that he would do with . . .(inaudible). . . And I think there's something about what we've lost as a community that can be regained if we weave the climate solutions back and across all of the departments. And so, just to close, a couple lessons learned from our side, if we were to go back to the drawing board and set this all up again, is really in our charter amendment, it articulated there shall be an Office of Climate Change, Sustainability, and Resiliency and an Executive Director, essentially. It would sure have been nice to have, you know, an Executive Director and sufficient staff, to make this go because we did encounter a fair amount of headwinds in the early going with some councilmembers who said look, the charter just says one person, that should be sufficient, and it's not. I mean it's pretty clearly not. And so, making sure that there's a sort of ability to be flexible and adapt and grow as needed. And also, an important point that Baja made earlier about equity, equity sometimes when we go especially on Bishop Street, we talk about equity to folks, about equity in climate, and they're like, oh, investment, how...you know, it's a financial performance thing, how much equity are you putting in to this solution, right? No, no, no, it's not equity in that sense. It's equity because the most vulnerable communities, the lowest-income communities are going to be hit first and worst by climate issues. You can imagine lower building, you know, quality, leakier homes, no AC. You know, whether it's a storm or it's a heat wave, or it's flooding, oftentimes, those folks are going to be in the way of it. And so, we really wished there had been more language in our charter that had said, there needs to be an equity component to the work that the office does, not only because it would be great guidance, but because there's a lot of funding that's available to help leverage the office's work, that if we had that in our organic document, we would probably get a more serious look from some foundations like Kresge and others. And then finally, there was this issue of sort of how do you work with other departments. In this way, you guys might be a little bit ahead of us because of the way that you've got this two-step, and I don't know enough about it, but, you know, in the Environment Department, our weakness and what we're going to try to advance because Mayor Caldwell is very...is dedicated to seeing our work embedded in the administration and ongoing, is to try to put a resilience sort of liaison or resilience-focused person in each department that we can work with out of the mayor's office in a policy discussion, and make sure that the lessons that we're learning get back to their...the departments, and they can pick up on the wires what's

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

happening in those departments. We caught several projects that if only they had gotten to us a little bit earlier, we would have been able to give them the sea level rise information or give them the flood information to help design it before it got hard and fast on the paper. And so, having one of these liaisons or somebody in each department that's actually sort of tasked with the resilience issues would be hugely helpful for us. So, mahalo. That's what I can offer up now.

. . .END OF PRESENTATION. . .

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Director. Members, so...thank you for that presentation. So, we're going to open up the floor for questions for Mr. Stanbro. I did want to take the liberty to ask a couple first ones. So, Director Stanbro, the State has adopted I believe it was the UN's Sustainable Goals, are they planning or have they since looked at funding potential impact areas like State harbors?

MR. STANBRO: So, I know...I don't follow what happens over here obviously, but I know that DOT, Harbors Division, at the State level is doing a plan right now for the Honolulu Harbor, and trying to make sure that they are going to armor up and raise the area around the harbor, sort of the wall in anticipation of sea level rise. They were able to come to us directly and basically asked what numbers are you using, where did you get them, what is...what are your infrastructure agencies using so that there can be some consistency. 'Cause the last thing you want is to have harbors raised by three feet, but then, you know, our DTS guys, who are doing street levels around there, are actually raising it by four feet, and then you have drainage issues and everything else. And so, that is one of the benefits of having a go-to entity because we have been working actually with harbors in Honolulu on how to make sure that there's consistent, coordinated activity around the, at least on the armoring issue for the harbor.

CHAIR SINENCI: All right. Thank you. And then, is the Honolulu City and County addressing other coastal areas potentially impacted by sea level rise and possibly looking at changing the zoning of these areas or SMA boundaries, moving SMA boundaries?

MR. STANBRO: Boy, that's a zinger --

CHAIR SINENCI: Loaded.

MR. STANBRO: --question. So, I know just from the quick listen in last week at the planning conference that Kauai has actually, in their community plan for west side, is looking at down-zoning some of the coastal properties. That's the first example I've heard anywhere in the State of that happening. We have not, as you may be able to appreciate, we developed our coastline a lot earlier than the neighbor islands. We're right up on the edge. Our setbacks are still quite antiquated compared to the progressive setback laws of Maui, and Kauai, and even Big Island. Our Planning

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

Department dreams of having the same setback requirements that you all have. So, we are in the process...to answer the question, we are definitely in the process of trying to revise our setbacks. There's a working group with Sea Grant and our Department of Planning and Permitting, and our office, to try to frame that up hopefully for introduction to council next year to try to get off of our 40 feet, and get something more flexible like what you all have established.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Thank you, Director. Members, any questions for the Director?
Chair King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. So, I was kind of going through, I'm going to ask my questions 'cause --

MR. STANBRO: ____.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --I was writing them down as you were doing your presentation, but thank you for being here, Josh, and for your --

MR. STANBRO: No, thank you for the --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --presentation.

MR. STANBRO: --invitation.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: And you do keep it very well updated 'cause I've seen it before, a couple times, and I...it's good to see the updates. My first question was on the Urban Sustainability Directors Network. Because we heard from Baja that we're all members, that we're already all members, but how is it, I mean we're rural, and this is for urban areas. So, do you feel like everything just translates over to, you know, Kauai, Maui, and Big Island who are rural areas?

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, so, I think the name is a misnomer. The way that USDN got started was there were five or six sustainability coordinators from five or six cities that were trying to figure out how to do their job. This was like over a decade ago, and they were kind of brand new, and they didn't know exactly what they're doing. And they wrote a grant to a local foundation to say can you just give us some money to, you know, fly in together once in a while, swap best practices, whatever, and it really worked. And so, what they did is that just kept mushrooming and leveraging, and leveraging. So, when they...when Baja says there's 215 entities, it's not just cities, it's counties as well. So, there's rural counties in there, there's cities, there's small cities, there's big urban metropolises. So, the advantage of it is that you go in to the network, and it's a big online, like a wonderland of all kinds of different policy solutions and white papers and studies and everything else. And you can find somebody that is close to where you're at, whether it's population size, whether it's the actual issue. 'Cause you may have a city that has the exact same struggle around like a waste issue as a rural area that may not match other cities, and you can find that on there. What the real

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

limitation of it is once you have entry to it, and all four counties are members, the real limitation is do you have enough bandwidth to really mine that information, and then reach out and contact those peers, and those other places to get the nuance and the lessons learned. 'Cause oftentimes, it takes a phone call. You guys know how.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Is it categorized like, you know, in...so that it will be easy to find, or, you know, do we just --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --have to --

MR. STANBRO: --so --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --start kind of...

MR. STANBRO: --the magic is the, you know, you can do it a number of different ways. You can slice and dice it across, you know, whether by population or by type of project, or by outcome, but you can also just put a kahea out to the whole network.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh.

MR. STANBRO: So, there's a way to just say we're working on a single-use plastic ban, does anybody have any information about loopholes, or what worked or what didn't? And then folks, the most active users on there, will actually say oh hey, I'm in whatever, Philadelphia or I'm in, you know, Marin County, and here's what we did, here's how we had to amend it two years later 'cause we had this completely unknown element, and here's the text of what we did for ours so that you can start from that as opposed to start _____. So --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. That's --

MR. STANBRO: --yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --great.

MR. STANBRO: --it's --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah --

MR. STANBRO: --pretty --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --that's --

MR. STANBRO: --versatile.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --great to know. So, I mean especially for our research, I'm looking at our research division. And then my next question is when you were talking about messaging in community and how you had to change your message to make...did you guys use any of the Climate Reality messaging? I mean is that...how closely related is...‘cause we have some people in our community that --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --gone to that training, and actually, we're trying to get them to bring that training over here because I don't know how relevant it is. So, does that help you in your...

MR. STANBRO: It...it's...so, my wife actually did one of the...she was in like the fourth cohort of the Climate Reality trainings many years ago.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Wow.

MR. STANBRO: So, my original slides that I used when we were going out and doing outreach, we kind of cockroach'd all of her Climate Reality slides. Some of them super helpful, some of them not so much. It's going to be the same here. Some of them are going to really resonate with folks on Maui and some are not. It really just takes times going out and doing them, and seeing what people like perk up, and they ask questions about, and where people seems to just sort of glass over.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Well, that's good to know because I, you know, we had somebody actually in OCS who went to the training, which then...and then left us a month or so after. And actually, I was going to tell you too that last slide that you show, I used to use that in my --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --slide show when I would do presentations too like from ten years ago.

MR. STANBRO: The go-to.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: It's a good slide.

MR. STANBRO: It's a standard.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: What's your current office budget for your office with all --

MR. STANBRO: One --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --the...

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

MR. STANBRO: --point two four --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. STANBRO: --million.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: And that's with the eight employees or...

MR. STANBRO: So, that includes...so, some of our staff are actually grant-funded. So, that's --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh.

MR. STANBRO: --not going to be in there.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. STANBRO: We have an embedded staff from our Bloomberg Philanthropy partnership. We have a grant for our climate and equity person from the Hawaii Community Foundation, or at least partly through them. And then one other I think, oh, our Hazard Mitigation and Long-Term Recovery officer, which is a crazy long name, but actually hits at two different really critical climate resilience elements, and that is going to be funded in part from Federal post-hazard mitigation dollars. So, you know, when a disaster hits, there's a source of money that comes in afterwards to the counties. And so, we're using some of those funds to pay for the position, kind of prime the pump and get him to be able to pull down grants from FEMA, and then go and ask council to go ahead and fill...backfill that position...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And then those eight people, the eight positions that you showed us, are those the...are those...do those people actually act as liaisons in the departments as well?

MR. STANBRO: No, so they don't. So...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So, there's another layer of...

MR. STANBRO: Well, we would like to have. We don't have right now. Currently, what we do is we have a what's called a city resilience team. So, we have the directors or the deputy director of the most impacted departments that we work with, so the Facilities [*sic*] Maintenance and ENV and Parks, and several others. We have like eight corporation counsel, BFS. So, those directors get together on a monthly basis and we try to swap notes. Obviously, those folks are very busy, and it's difficult to maintain consistency in terms of them coming, and then get back to working. So, what would be better is if we had a dedicated person in each of those departments that came to these meetings, found out what the latest was, and then went back into their departments, and we're regularly working on it. So, we don't have --

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. STANBRO: --that right now --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. STANBRO: --at all.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: But you're...I mean I think one of the differences is your initiative came from your mayor, who oversees the departments. And in the past, our initiative for the EP&S program came from the voters --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --and then the Mayor never established that office, and then when...by the time we did get that established, the department wasn't interested in working closely with that office. So, it remains...it almost is like a silo within a silo. So, I'm trying to figure out how to get that interaction to work is --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --really...

MR. STANBRO: --no, I think that's a real concern, and that would be a concern for me about the model that was earlier talked about in terms of having your own department because this is not a one-department issue, this is a all across the entire municipality issue, and all the departments. And so, I think there's real merit in adopting what New York and what, you know, we researched it or our Charter Commission researched it. Being in the cabinet of the mayor and being able to have those discussions with the other department directors, and being treated as a peer is hugely helpful to move the mission and to have those peer-to-peer conversations about how do you change things within your department given all the nuance and all the things --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I mean so --

MR. STANBRO: --that we found.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --that works with your office, that...so, you're in the cabinet?

MR. STANBRO: Yeah. So, by definition --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

MR. STANBRO: --I think it's in charter. If it's not, it should be. That would be another lesson learned, that the Chief Resilience Officer or the Executive Director of the office is, you know, is a member of mayor's cabinet. And I think...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. I thought that we have a descriptive, in our Charter, of what the cabinet...who's on the cabinet. . . .(inaudible). . .

MR. STANBRO: Yeah. So, it may be just, you know, as a expected thing. I mean I do think from what I've heard over the last few weeks that there is a commitment from the current Administration to take this on, and try to, you know, move it as a Administration priority across the departments that wasn't there in the past Administration.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And then my last question is what levels...you talked about levels of sea level rise that you're using, what levels are you using?

MR. STANBRO: So, the...I can speak for the Climate Change Commission because that's what we go off of, whatever they say is sort of our gospel that we use.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. STANBRO: Their projection is for three feet of sea level rise, minimum, by the end of the century, 2100. For critical infrastructure that you don't ever want to move, plan on six feet by the end of...it could be as high as six feet by the end of the century. And additionally, they say there will be nuisance flooding, which they define as flooding probably on the order of once every month at that three-foot sea level rise by mid-century. So, they don't put a date on it. They don't say 2050, but they say sort of midway between now and when we get to the end of the century. If you're building in an area that's at that three-foot rise area, you're going to be getting your feet wet every month. So, before we get to the time where it's water all the time like in a bathtub at three feet, there's going to be run-up, there's going to be these big events that...king tides, that kind of thing that are going to affect your infrastructure in those --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. STANBRO: --areas.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. That's all my questions. Thank you.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, thanks.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Chair King. Mr. Molina, you had --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, just a couple --

CHAIR SINENCI: --questions?

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --of questions.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you, Chairman. And good afternoon, Mr. Stanbro. Thank you --

MR. STANBRO: And good afternoon.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --for the very interesting presentation. Just following up on some of the questions that Chair King had with regards to your office, do you see it more feasible operating as an office, out of the, say the mayor's office versus a department at this point?

MR. STANBRO: I do.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: I think because of the nature of the work that crosses multiple departments, I think there's a natural sort of instinct when you're in one department for other departments to be like oh, that's your kuleana.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: And to work across departments, it helps to be in a less-defined area or in...I don't want to say higher, but it does help to be in the mayor's office because then you're able to sort of go to whatever department you need to around a certain policy objective, and you're coming from the mayor's office, and you're again, a peer in a cabinet situation. When you're in your own department, they tend to think...we already get that a fair amount that oh, it's a climate change thing, go talk to Josh. And oftentimes, what we do, we say, it's a climate change thing, we're happy to talk with you about it, but this is your kuleana just as much as it's ours, you know. I mean if you're Parks and you're planting trees in an area where saltwater level is going under the soil and starting to kill roots, like Parks has got to think this through. It's not just us that's going to come up with a plan around that. We can help. So, I do think that being in the mayor's office...now, there are downsides to it and we, and, you know, we should be open about that. I mean Mayor Caldwell has struggled with, you know, he really wants the office to ensure a long sort of, you know, a durable presence that would, ideally that would be civil service sort of like these are jobs that are described somewhere, and they are going to be...now, anything in the mayor's office tends to be appointee. So, that is one of the calls that the Charter Commission made originally, and we think they made the right call that having the flexibility of being in the mayor's office, and also being able to be at that level is worth the downside of the potential for another administration to come in and just sort of do away with it.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. And looking at Maui County, you mentioned to Chair King, you currently have eight personnel, operating with a budget of 1.2 million. Looking at Maui County, the size of our population versus yours, what would you say would be a good amount of personnel for Maui County's interest? You know, we have Molokai and Lanai to serve. Just grabbing numbers out of the sky, how many personnel would you recommend out of the Mayor's Office would work I guess to get the message out effectively here?

MR. STANBRO: I would hate to venture a guess around that because your guys' situation has got to be far more, I mean it's unique, right? So, is it less 'cause you have less population, or is it more 'cause you got three islands or four islands that you're, you know, working across? You may have completely different populations that need...have different needs. You're more spread out. I just, you know, you guys would know your situation better. I, you know, I can tell you that from our experience, having an office that had these nodes of expertise, whether it's around energy, or long-term recovery, or coastal issues helps to have that expertise, and then to work out across the departments. And so, there's a certain level of just sheer numbers that you need to have that in-house expertise. But whether, you know, you really need 20 people or you need 5 or 6 is dependent on what you expect, you know, in terms of the office's performance I think.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. And then one of my last questions or two, Chair, you know, I like the idea that some of the employees are getting grants to pay for their salaries.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Any types of grants or revenues that you currently receive that maybe before this office was established that was not able to get, based on the creation of this if where it didn't exist before, anything new that came in with the existence of this Office of Climate Change --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, absolutely --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --and Sustainability?

MR. STANBRO: --and I don't want to make representations that the same, you know, opportunities might be available for an office coming along now. Like I said, we, you know, as we started, there was the series of opportunities that came across our, you know, sort of radar that worked out really well. But I can say absolutely, all of the grant funds that we've got, and we've probably got, you know, we have just about matched one-to-one in terms of outside dollars to that 1.2 committed dollars. And a lot of those dollars that we use from the grants are for special projects for research, for developing policy, that kind of thing. So, I would caveat my earlier answer to Chair King around, our budget is 1.2, but that's the City and County dollars that are dedicated to just make the office go. We've been able to take those monies and

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

leverage them one-to-one without outside dollars that we spend on other projects. So, we probably have a outsized impact for the amount of the dollars that the City and County have dedicated to us. But a prime example of some of these FEMA dollars, and that was because, you know, our DEM and other agencies are so stretched that going after researching, creating the relationships, a lot of the stuff is relationships. So, even having the time for Chris, our Long-Term Recovery guy, to go up to San Francisco and meet at the regional level with FEMA, and say, hey, how's the program changing, what are you looking for in applications, you know, what was wrong with our last application that we didn't get tied in, that kind of time, and the ability to build a relationship is what I think has resulted in success later. And some of the departments are busy, you know, filling potholes or they're trying to, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --put their fingers in dikes. They don't have the ability to do that, and I think that's part of the reason that we've been successful.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Great. And my last question, Chair...Mr. Stanbro, it relates to this document that was given to us, the Oahu Resilience Strategy. And something near and dear to everybody's heart, the issue of affordable housing and --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: --reducing additional cost. So, with your Office of Climate Change, I know you mentioned I guess building code regulations, looking at that, making adjustments to that, and making building more cost-efficient to save money. Anything else, you know, I also like the fact that one of the issues here is returning illegal vacation rental units to local housing.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: So, quite timely. Any additional thoughts on that how establishing this office can help us here on Maui?

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, no, so I think the discussion that we've tried to foster around long-term affordability is one that hasn't won the day often in the past. So, you know, we've...right now, we are just having this discussion about the energy codes, and there is definitely a higher cost upfront to putting say, you know, solar water heating on a roof on a home. There's a lower cost to doing on-demand gas water heaters, right? So, from the person building that house to develop and sell, the incentive is to go for the lower-cost option obviously, 'cause that's dollars in your pocket. But for the person living in that home for 30 years, they will save almost \$10,000 if the higher-cost option is adopted upfront. So, we've crunched numbers. We've run data. We've like had national experts come and like do side-by-side analysis, and taken that to our councilmembers to say, look, the numbers really bear out that although there's a, you know, affordability argument against, if we're talking about, you know, dollars

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

in people's pockets for the long run, it's actually better, it lowers the cost of living for people to be able to stay on-island. And I think having that level of, you know, time and ability to source data, to go to partners, to have it be analyzed, to get third-party analysis and bring that to the decision makers without, you know, having it just play out in terms of a public forum, where people are testifying against each other, is really helpful. And that's part of what we've prided ourselves on is doing the backend work on the data and the policy analysis, and delivering up and say, you guys make the call, but here's the way we see it around. If we're going to be more climate resilient and we're going to lower the cost of living over the long-term, here's the policy that matches those two up. That's not always going to happen. Sometimes it's going to be climate resilient, yes, but affordability, no. And we've...we're going to leave those till later. We think we're going to get there eventually 'cause we're going have to just because of the way the crisis is unfolding, but right now, we're just going for ones that are win-wins.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. All right. Thank you very much, Mr. Stanbro.

MR. STANBRO: Thanks.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Mr. Molina, for your line of questioning. Members, we've reached the midpoint of our meeting. So, we're...if you don't mind --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

CHAIR SINENCI: --Josh, we're going to take a ten-minute break, and then we'll continue questioning when we get back. I know you have a plane to catch later, but we should --

MR. STANBRO: I'm good.

CHAIR SINENCI: --just finishing up with some questions. So...

MR. STANBRO: I also have a...the full Resilient Strategy here. We didn't print that many 'cause we're trying to save paper, but I'd be happy to share them around with the Councilmembers if, during the break, you'd like to look at the full...

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Thank you.

MR. STANBRO: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: The EACP meeting is now in recess. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

RECESS: 3:03 p.m.

RECONVENE: 3:17 p.m.

CHAIR SINENCI: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Environmental, Agricultural, and Cultural Preservation Committee please come back to order? It is 3:17, September 17th, on a Tuesday afternoon. So, Members, we're just going to continue with some more questioning for Director Stanbro. Member Paltin, you had some questions for Director Stanbro? Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Director Stanbro, for being here. My question was, you know, with climate change and the resilience, and stuff like that, what happens when like about the equity issue and affordability housing, like how do you provide for that? Like what I kind of noticed was in Hawaii Island, Maui, wherever it is, like the places that are zoned to be developed into homes and things like that are usually way out of price so it makes it an unequal affordability situation. And so, these 201H projects end up coming in a place where there is like zero walkability, and it's not close to schools and transportation and things like that, but at the same time, it's an equity issue 'cause we need affordable homes. So, how...has City and County of Honolulu run into that through this Climate Change Office and how have they addressed it there?

MR. STANBRO: Yeah. Thanks, Councilmember Paltin. So, we haven't...the office hasn't taken a leadership role in terms of sort of siting and the long-term like where housings develop. We've been more focused on, you know, the building codes, and how houses are built so that they are more affordable to live in. We have a section in our Department of Planning and Permitting called the transient...Transit Oriented Development group, and they have really taken a lead on how do we maximize sort of building occupancy and, you know, higher-rise buildings and more density in the areas that are either along the rail line or closest to the bus hubs and service hubs. And I think they've had some success. I mean we've got...we...for many years, we took a hiatus, the City and County of Honolulu, from actually having a housing development sort of department, at the same time that we were approved by charter in 2016, the Department of Land Management was approved by charter. So, separate agency, separate entity that was new to the City and County of Honolulu. And they've focused almost all their time on buying and rehabbing derelict buildings to create more affordable housing for folks on island, and then partnering with developers on city-owned land that are in good spots that are going to be more serviced by some of the transit. And so, I think I might...I think we have 1,300 units now that Department of Land Management manages and, you know, keeps in affordable housing stock, and then I think they've got partnerships basically with either vacant lots or buildings to rehab for another 900 units that they're going to be trying to execute over the next couple years. So, you know, it's...that's a drop in the bucket compared to, you know, all the housing units on the island, but it does make a huge difference in terms of having those, you know, 50 percent and below AMI, 60 percent and below AMI units there, and that they are in places where people can actually access transportation and

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

not bleed money to try to pay for gas and drive around. The climate resilience element is different. Now, that's where we would work with TOD if they were looking to site a project. You know, if it's in a flood zone or if it's in a sea level rise exposure area, we want to make that they are either elevating or setting back, and trying to site it so that that housing would be available to folks for a long term and it's not going to be exposed immediately to natural hazard. The other thing that they are doing is for the first time ever, they're going to do a--God, I don't...what's the name--it's not composite housing, but it's prefab I think, where you actually bring in the elements of the...of a...it's a multi-rise. I think it's three story but you're going to pre...you like with panels and slab, put it together. I would suspect that there's probably some advantage to that. If there is some sort of natural disaster damage, you can just replace some of the elements and the panels, as opposed to having damage that you have to go in and pull everything out 'cause it's all integrated.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, thanks.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Member Paltin. Ms. Sugimura, you have any questions for Josh?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, I just...I...I'm so glad to see you back here --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, thanks --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --and...

MR. STANBRO: --for having me back.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: I appreciate it and thanks for inviting us out the last year to --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah --

MR. STANBRO: --discuss --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --that was --

MR. STANBRO: --this.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --a awesome presentation. And we almost got that Charter amendment through but for various --

MR. STANBRO: I know.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --reasons, right, which you --

MR. STANBRO: Close --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --know.

MR. STANBRO: --only counts in horseshoes and hand grenades is what --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah --

MR. STANBRO: --they say --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --yeah, yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --right? So...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I'm sure that you're working with our departments, I'm hearing with OED. I would love to learn more about funding sources because I think that really helps in terms of moving big pictures forward. And one of the...one of them that you mentioned is Federal BRIC, is that what you said, program?

MR. STANBRO: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: The --

MR. STANBRO: --Baja --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --Federal...

MR. STANBRO: --mentioned BRIC. But I can talk a little bit about --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yes, yes.

MR. STANBRO: --'cause we've been tracking it.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Could you just little bit?

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, so, lo and behold, I showed the slide about the catastrophes, weather, you know, extreme weather tripling over the last 30 years. You can imagine what that's doing to FEMA's bank account. So, they're essentially underwater when it comes to all of these payouts on all of these hurricanes, disasters, flooding. So, what they're coming to the realization pretty quickly is that we can't keep this model of paying after the fact. We need to do some preventative stuff now. The...I mean there's plenty of economic research out there and studies and everything that confirm for every \$1 that you spend on resilience, you save \$6 in terms of avoided cost after an event. So, they've finally sort of gotten the message on that. And this BRIC program

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

is essentially taking a bunch of the money that they would have reserved for payout after disaster to rebuild, and they're pushing it and frontloading it so that municipalities that are ready and prepared to accept funds can bring those in for hazard mitigation. That's the reason that we went out and got grant funding to hire this Hazard Mitigation and Long-Term Recovery position so that Chris can just focus all of his time on preparing us to have a very robust hazard mitigation plan. We did that as soon as we heard. So, another benefit of having an office that's focused on these things is we sort of have our fingers on the wires all the time whether it's USDN or other networks, they'll say hey, just heads-up, this thing is moving through Congress, you know. So, we'll hear about BRIC up...12 months before BRIC actually gets signed by President, right? And so, if it sounds like it's going to make it, we can prepare ahead of time to go to departments, pull together all the projects that would qualify for some of these funds, what are the things that are in our CIP budget that instead of using county funds for, City and County funds, we could put into the BRIC line. And those funds, I mean true to form, USDN was right again. I mean they told us these things were going to happen. It went from \$90 million two years ago or last year, 250 million nationally this year, and they expected to go to 500 million next year.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Wow.

MR. STANBRO: So, what we're trying to do is get out in front of that. Kauai has been very good. It's always good to have a little bit of healthy competition, right? So, when you go to these, you know, hazard mitigation meetings, where they figure out like what are the applications, what's across the state, and what's going to go in. Kauai has been super good about their Department of Emergency Management preparing those applications, having those relationships, and they've outcompeted all of the other three counties combined. They get like six grants and everybody else gets one. We're trying to change those odds. We're trying to, you know, make sure that we're competitive as well. But that's where those grant funds, and you can see that opportunity growing, going to be doubling again next year. We want to make sure that our departments are prepped, and we're not scrambling every time an announcement comes up and calling people the last minute, you know, hey, can you give me a project, just anything, throw it in. We want to have those curated and developed ahead of time, have all the metrics there, have all the costs associated so that as soon as the opportunity comes, we just put it in, and then start working with the staff of FEMA to say how can we make this better.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Excellent and exciting. And I like hearing that you did code changes.

MR. STANBRO: Trying.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: So...

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Or you're almost --

MR. STANBRO: Not yet.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --there.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah. So, we...the...in the Resilience Strategy, the...you know, one of the actions was update all of our codes 'cause we'd actually fallen behind. We were really out of compliance, 2006, we're operating on some codes that are 2006 right now. So, the first one that we worked with Department of Planning and Permitting to update and get across the line was the 2015 Electrical Code. That went through council, got approved, got signed by mayor. So, electric is done. We're now working on energy codes, and we're having a little bit more difficult time to work with some of the stakeholders to ensure that our progressive sort of vision around what we want, in terms of energy efficiency, gets through, but we've gone through two hearings, and we fully expect to get through a third, and mayor will...is supportive and will sign off on that. After that code, there's plumbing yet to come. There's huge water savings. There's, you know, I saw Michelle is here from the Community Foundation, and they have a freshwater initiative that really identify plumbing codes as something where a lot of water security can be gained. So, we will be working with our Department of Planning and Permitting again to make it as green as possible, and then deliver that to council, and then through mayor, and then building codes. And that's where the resilience piece comes in. That's where, you know, what are the size of the hurricane tie-down straps, you know, what are the dimensional lumber sizes, like how do we make our buildings as resilient as possible in the face of the hurricane threats that we're facing increasingly. The best example of this is a really good one. If you want to go read up on it, it was Florida. Hurricane Andrew hit the same time as Iniki, same year as I recall. And while we didn't respond as quickly as we probably could have, Florida did. Immediately, they said, you know, our housing just got wiped out by Andrew. We're going to put much more stringent building codes and make sure that our houses are built to last. But the building industry pushed back, up in the Panhandle, up in the northern part of the state, and they said hey, look, we never get hurricanes up here. This is just cost that's going to be out of pocket for people. It's...we can't afford this kind of thing. It going to drive up the cost of housing. So, exempt part of the state from these new codes that don't get hit by hurricanes. They did, and that was a faithful decision because as you know, the hurricanes have been moving further and further up and getting more erratic as they come through the Caribbean. And the one--I forget the name of it--but one came up through the Panhandle, destroyed like hundreds of millions of dollars of fighter jet aircrafts that were on the runways, but then completely wiped out that Tallahassee and other areas. Those were all homes that were not built to the same Andrew codes specs in the south. And you saw it just completely wiped out. So, it works. There's tons of proof about how a few hundred more dollars, in terms of the building and the strapping in the beginning, can actually leave people with roofs over their heads in an event.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: One last question. So, tied --

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

CHAIR SINENCI: Go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --to that and the success of moving code changes, who did you network within...on the community side to support you so that it can get the votes you needed? Or what did you do in terms of reaching out to the community?

MR. STANBRO: So, we tried to do a different model, and because we have a little bit more, you know, capacity as an office dedicated to the policy side, we held almost 50 meetings with different stakeholders, and in the end, had met with over a 100 individuals from all across the spectrum. So, we didn't necessarily just go to folks that we thought would be allied. We actually went to all the folks that we thought would be adversely impacted as well and would likely be against it, but we went to them early. So, we started our outreach back in January of this year and spent six months holding meeting after meeting after meeting. We'd go to their office if we needed to, to talk to, you know, folks like, you know, the Building Industry Association, or to D.R. Horton, or to, you know, these different entities as well as Blue Planet Foundation, and the U.S. Green Building Code [sic] Council, and, you know, all of these different folks to say here's what we're thinking about presenting because we want to change the trajectory around our emissions on island and lower the cost of living. Tell us what you think. We got a lot of feedback. And so, we tried to change some of the amendments in the code to help reflect those diversity of opinions. You know, in some cases, we had to make a policy call from the administration side that we know we want to be pretty aggressive about this, and that's not going to make everybody happy. In other places, we were able to kind of come to a meeting ground around jealousies, of one of the things that was just like, you know, the jealousy industry was like why are you picking on us because we're actually, you know, working with trade winds. And we're like, you're right, that's an oversight, we can make that work. And so, we were able to work through some of those issues that weren't resolved at the State Building Code Council through all of that outreach. Not everyone can be happy in the end, but I think that people feel like they were at least approached and transparent, and we were transparent on how we developed it and why.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Excellent. Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you. Pro Tem Kama, you have...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, I just have a few questions, Josh, and yes --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, sure.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: --thank you for being here and thank you for taking on such a forward-thinking issue. Because I think not only you have to think forward, you have to actually move today as if you are there, right? So, you all had a...you had a ballot

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

question on your charter, I mean on your...at your election, right, in 2016? So, does that mean that you're three years old today? Not today, but it...this 2019.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: You're three --

MR. STANBRO: Well...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: --years old.

MR. STANBRO: So, the...it passed on, I forget, what was it, November 6, I think, 2016. So, that was the formal sort of this was approved by the voters, and then it got certified towards the end of the year, and some people --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

MR. STANBRO: --celebrate that as the birthday. But then it took a while to actually get staff and go through the process.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: So, I wasn't hired until May 1, 2017. So, some people say that was the actual creation of the office. So, there's multiple stages along the way. What I'm encouraged about is that it sounds like there's some interest from the Administration here to actually get that process started and maybe put something in budget, reconsolidate, create something so that there is an actual movement around --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --getting a --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --running start. So, if it does, if you guys do decide to send it to the voters, there would be, you know, it would be a formal embedding of what has already gotten some baby steps underway, which would be better than we had it, yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, do you think that for our County, that a formal embeddation [sic] would be better, or do you think it could actually be done just from the Mayor's Office himself?

MR. STANBRO: I definitely think formal is better.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Yeah.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

MR. STANBRO: The ability that we have to go back to departments and remind them, this is in charter, that's --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --the constitution --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah, yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --helps --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MR. STANBRO: --a lot. And, you know, and the other thing is it helps with the funders. So, if you're trying to create these partnerships --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --elsewhere, and you say hey, you might be trying to award this to Boulder or Austin, or somebody else, do those guys have it in their charter? Do you know that this is going to be around --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

MR. STANBRO: --for years and years to --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

MR. STANBRO: --come because it can't be taken away? They tend to value that.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, I noticed that your vote that was taken, you had 266,000 people actually voted in that particular initiative, and that half of them, a little more than half, voted yes and half voted no I guess. When I look at the numbers, they're pretty...they're not really that close but they're close enough to think that people were thinking about that. So, was there a magic number that you all were going for, or you just were going for majority?

MR. STANBRO: So, I wasn't involved in the actual, you know, charter amendment and the election. Yeah, I came along later as a staff for the office. But I know that, I think the numbers broke down, I don't know, I have my slide up there, but I think it was, you know, 51, 52 percent voted yes, 37, 38 percent --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, there.

MR. STANBRO: --voted no, and then a lot of people left it blank because there's a lot of folks that just are like I don't know --

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --on this one, right?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: So, when you do charter amendments, some people leave it out. So, the actual yes-no difference was, you know, 16 percent or --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah --

MR. STANBRO: --something --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: --it's small.

MR. STANBRO: --which is, yeah, pretty --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: It was small.

MR. STANBRO: --big.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, how much community outreach do you know was done to ensure that you would get the response that you guys got?

MR. STANBRO: You mean on the vote?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. STANBRO: Again, I wasn't involved but I watched 'cause I was --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --interested. I was working at the Community Foundation at that time on sustainability issues. So, I was kind of watching what was happening. I think that it was not...there was not a coordinated campaign. There was maybe a couple op-eds in the paper about people that were like hey, this is a really good thing, we should have this. I think there were some nonprofits that, you know, put together a list of recommendations for how to vote in an election, and they had recommend vote yes on charter number seven, but there wasn't a coordinated effort. Again, this is a position where you guys would actually be in a much stronger position than us, coming into this with full knowledge and being able to push it out, you know, earlier, if it's something that you would like to put to the voters.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, it says in your PowerPoint that you have 16 total staff, 7 of which are regular city staff and 3 are grant-funded, 16 from office...in your office VISTA, and 9 of citywide VISTA. Oh, so is your 16 plus the 7 and the 3, or is it total 16?

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, so it's seven --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Plus.

MR. STANBRO: --city-paid staff, three more that are grant --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Grant.

MR. STANBRO: --funded. So, that's our ten basic staff in the office, and then we have six, I think --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: VISTA.

MR. STANBRO: --VISTAs --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah --

MR. STANBRO: --which are --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: --in the office.

MR. STANBRO: --year-long fellows that are mostly paid for 80 percent, 90 percent paid for by the Feds, and then we match a little bit.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

MR. STANBRO: So, in total, our hui in the office is, you know, around 16, and then we have 3 interns that we carry all the time. So, we always have one intern from UH, one from HPU, and then one that's a floater from other places that are like I said, you know, really wanting to work with the office. And so, we carry them. It's kind of one of those things, it's a lot of work to have an intern 'cause you're always training somebody up --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --new, but it's --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --really worth it 'cause when they catch fire and they want to contribute, they come back.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So, my final question is in the event that this Council does say yes, let's go do this, and I'm hoping that they will 'cause I'm saying let's go do this, would you be able to come back and help us to be able to do community outreach and help us to assist us to be able to get our voters to be able to participate in this initiative?

MR. STANBRO: I would...

CHAIR SINENCI: You'll be our poster child.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, I was going to say I would love to say yes. I haven't been in government long enough to know what I can and can't do in terms of, you know, another jurisdiction, and whether that's electioneering or whatever else. I mean I will say, you know, this is really, really, really important to us. It's really important to the State having a strong, vibrant network that is embedded and works really well together. We have a great relationship. I'm looking back at Makale`a now. You know, amongst the four counties, and we work really closely together, having a permanence and a durability to each of those four offices, and, you know, is something that we would celebrate, and I think would help our efforts on our island as well. So, if it comes to it, I would take vacation time to come over and have talk stories and do whatever it took to help share the story, at least just speak from our experience --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --and not necessarily sell --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --something --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

MR. STANBRO: --but just --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right.

MR. STANBRO: --answer --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

MR. STANBRO: --questions, yeah --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes.

MR. STANBRO: --I'd be happy to.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Josh. Thank you, Chair.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo, Pro Tem Kama. Chair King, you had another question?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. I just wanted to follow up on a couple things. One is the idea of it's in the charter and so it's law. In 2012, we...the Council, the then Council passed the Charter amendment that created the EP&S program, the Environmental Protection and Sustainability --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --and that was not instituted till 2018. So, I'm not sure that the Charter has that much, you know, demand on it. And --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --unfortunately, I think it should, but that, you know, putting it in the Charter doesn't mean that it's going to happen quick...more quickly. And I think I...we have one Councilmember who has a proposed ordinance, which would probably help get it into, the office created earlier. But, you know, I...that's just the reality. I've, you know, and I've noticed other things that are in the Charter --

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --that haven't been done. So, I think we can move in that direction but it's really going to take the commitment of the voters, you know, electing someone who the...a Council and a Mayor who really believe in it and who are going to enact it. The other thing I wanted to ask you about is what if anything is your office doing about the idea of taxing renewables for transportation? Is there any interaction with the DOT? 'Cause I know they're trying to, you know, we just enacted fees and taxes for biodiesel and electric vehicles over here, and I know that the State is trying to pass the, what do they call it, the mileage, the...

MR. STANBRO: Oh yeah, the road usage fee...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, the road...miles traveled or something that the fact that you...the idea that you would pay per mile traveled, and there seems to be a lack of understanding of the value of renewables to...holistically. So, we're trying to, you know, in some instances, silo the use of the road versus the overall benefits. So, are you having any effect on that level of thinking?

MR. STANBRO: So, all we are able to do at the city level, as I understand it delegated from State, is to effect the gas tax, our portion of the gas tax. We have, you know, Mayor Caldwell has tried to increase the gas tax a couple times. That has not been successful at council. One of the things that he was interested in doing is figuring out a way to raise gas tax, and then take the proceeds from those and be able to offset some of the cost and barriers for lower-income communities to get renewable

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

lower-cost cars. 'Cause once you're in an electric vehicle, you're actually out-of-pocket less money. It's about half as much to maintain, own, and operate. So, it's about addressing that upfront barrier. We haven't figured out how to do that yet. But to the larger question I think that you might be asking is, when State does things that are going to adversely impact our sustainability and climate resilience efforts at the county level, that's where having a robust network can really help. So, we have at the last two Sessions for the State Legislature, we've tried to organize the four counties' sustainability offices and the mayors by default, 'cause we'll go to our own mayors and advocate to have them adopt, you know, positions on bills at the State level that would show four-county opposition to a bad bill or four-county support for something that would help push and advance our efforts. And I think the road usage fee would be potentially one of those things where if we are able to develop a cogent, good argument amongst the four counties to say hey, we think, you know, just abandoning a gas tax, and then putting the weight on all of the folks that are the early adopters on the things that we want to incentivize and see is not the right path. There's got to be a way to do this while preserving an incentive to having people adopt. And so, that's where it would play --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MR. STANBRO: --out is through --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: And that's --

MR. STANBRO: --the --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --where you can do that --

MR. STANBRO: --Legislative...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --at the...at your county level as well because you do have a county road tax, and you folks have not, I don't think you have put any fees on to electric vehicles --

MR. STANBRO: We have not.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --or renewable fuels.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. 'Cause that's one of the, I think the issues that we struggle with over here. And just speaking from myself as part of a company that looks at it holistically because we process, as part of the whole process, we're processing grease trap material and keeping it out the landfill. We continue to do that on Oahu because there's been support over there. We're going to stop doing that over here, and as of October 1st unfortunately, is going back in the landfill. And it's horrifying to me but

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

it's that lack of having that office to think in that holistic manner of how does...how do all these pieces affect the greater issue that we're dealing with. I mean this is the preeminent issue I think of our community and of our State and of our country. And if we don't start looking at things holistically and see how the...how they interact and interconnect and where the synergy is, we're going to be missing out, and, you know, 'cause I'm seeing that already starting to happen in some areas.

MR. STANBRO: Yeah, I don't know the details of the policy here on this island, but I do know, you know, our city municipal fleets utilize a percentage of biodiesel in our fleets, and that's part of Mayor Caldwell's commitment around, you know, trying to move towards more renewables is maintaining that program. I think we...20 percent is --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Right.

MR. STANBRO: --biofuel.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah. Okay. Thank you.

MR. STANBRO: Thanks.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Members, any more questions for Director Stanbro? Oh, Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, you know, we have members from OED that Josh has been referencing. I wonder if they want to just give us a brief update of what they're doing 'cause I think they communicate a lot. I would love --

CHAIR SINENCI: Members --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --if you have --

CHAIR SINENCI: --if there are --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --time --

CHAIR SINENCI: --no objections --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --if you don't mind?

CHAIR SINENCI: --would you want to invite some of our guests down?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah. There's Tamara and Makale`a.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Director. Do you guys want to have Makale`a?

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, Hawaii Community Foundation. Oh, Hawaii Community Foundation is here too.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. Can you please state your name for the record?

MS. ANE: Aloha. O Chana Makale`a kou inoa. Noho Mililani mai au no Kahului, Maui. No au hana o Environmental Coordinator of Maui County. My name is Chana Makale`a Dudoit Ane. I'm originally from Mililani, Oahu, and currently reside in Kahului, Maui, and I'm your Environmental Coordinator in Office of Economic Development. Go ahead.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Aloha. My name is Tamara Farnsworth, and I work with the Department of Environmental Management, Office of Environmental Protection and Sustainability Division.

CHAIR SINENCI: Member Sugimura, you have any questions --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah --

CHAIR SINENCI: --for...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --so, I just wonder if they want to just give us a brief, you know, if the Members would allow of what they're working on, 'cause I know that they've been working hard on, you know, different projects. So, just kind of how this fits in together with what Josh Stanbro is talking about maybe.

MS. ANE: Oh, that list is very, very, very long. And we, Alex de Roode actually, as Baja was mentioning, they're both upstairs doing a resiliency workshop. And we also sent a transmittal, the Mayor sent a transmittal on September 13th, with kind of a smaller list of all the different initiatives that we're currently working on and that he has mandated. So, some of them are energy audits; the Maui County Resiliency Strategy, where we mimic what Josh and his team has done, but focusing on what Maui County residents would like. Their program is really robust and took a lot of funding and partnerships. And hopefully, with their guidance, we can pare it down and really use...we've worked with looking at kind of keeping their template and keeping the feel the same so that it...we can leverage each other's efforts, but then really be Maui specific. We would also like to do a climate action plan, where with...in conjunction with the Resiliency Strategy, it's going to look at our emissions. We just did a draft Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventory Report, with the help of the City and County. So, that's going to look at where our emissions are as a County, and then target different BMPs that we can put into place to reduce our emissions, and then that...so, that would be in conjunction with the Resiliency Strategy, but then really doing our energy audit, look at what the County's emissions are, and create BMPs within the County and where we can reduce the emissions, reduce energy, do savings, energy savings, and save the County some funding. I think I have tons more to go. I'm all in line with the code updates, like that has been my initiative from day one like I want to

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

get all of the codes updated and exactly for what Josh has been saying. It's a triple bottom line. It helps everybody out. It helps the environment. It helps the County funding. So, if we could take that up, I would love it.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, great.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo.

MS. FARNSWORTH: Okay. Well, that was a lot. So, we're a...our office is currently focused mostly on landfill diversion programs and moving our County towards zero waste. And we're more not directly working on climate change per se, although we do work in partnership with Makale'a and her office quite a bit. And we, I think work to inform each other on what we're doing. And of course, as I think, you know, we are still working on getting our staff to develop more overall environmental and sustainability programming beyond landfill diversion this year. And so, I think that will be...have a lot more to say in this area in the next upcoming couple years.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Great.

MS. ANE: One more thing, I'd be remiss if I wouldn't...if I was...if I miss this opportunity to say that the Mayor has really...since he has to come into office, he said that he's wanted, as you guys have also indicated that you...he wanted to set up a Resiliency Office, a Climate Change Office, and we've been working on steps to develop the scope of that office and see how we can be proactive and be able to put it into the Budget, maybe do a Budget amendment, and move over energy and environment, maybe as eventually, but there are some Charter changes that need to be done with that. But to be proactive, create this office underneath the Mayor's Office, if that's the direction that we're going to go. And so, that we wouldn't have the holdup of the whole EP&S and the history of trying...getting those Charter amendments held up at the Mayor's Office, and creating a...an actual position within the County. So, if we can do that, in conjunction with your Charter amendment, then once that's voted on by our community, then just going...getting going and really hopefully catching up to those guys in City and County.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good example.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Chair --

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: --I have a question for Corp. Counsel.

CHAIR SINENCI: Chair King?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you. The Office of Economic Development was created under the Mayor, and that was not a Charter change, and I don't even believe that's

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

an ordinance. So, couldn't the Mayor, if he wanted to, just create an Office of Climate Action and Resiliency?

MS. OANA: You know, Chair King, I'm not sure about that. I'd have to look into that.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Could you? Because my understanding is that, creating an office is under the purview of the Mayor. If we wanted to put it in Charter as a division or department, then we're...what we're saying is we're mandating it. But if the Mayor really wants to do it, can you...yeah, I would be interested in getting a legal opinion because I think he has the freedom to...he's created the Office of, you know, not this Mayor but other...previous Mayor has created the Office of Economic Development. That's just something that kind of perpetuates. But there's nothing in the Charter that created that Office. So, I think he can...I think if he really is that excited about doing it, he could do it this week.

MS. ANE: If I...oh.

CHAIR SINENCI: Go ahead.

MS. ANE: If I may address the...that question, to my understanding and to Mayor's understanding, that's actually how it may work. And that we would do a Budget amendment to, and he would just say I'm going to create this office and allocate the budgets already allotted to our positions to that office, and then I think the resolution that may...has been drafted by Sinenci, Councilmember Sinenci, would address the Office of Economic Development, as well as the climate change to really put that into our Charter and solidify both of those offices to my understanding.

CHAIR SINENCI: Those were one of the resos that are --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

CHAIR SINENCI: --listed on Granicus.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I would actually caution you against putting the Office of Economic Development into Charter because that really restricts, if a future Mayor wants to come in and change that around, and pull...cause some of those positions, I don't believe personally that belong in that office like the Agriculture Coordinator and the Energy Coordinator. So, I think what we wouldn't want to do is mandate anything that restricts a reorganization that could happen easily without a Charter amendment. So, you might want to think about that. I do believe we need this Office of Sustainability and Resiliency, and maybe we need to get it into ordinance or Charter to get it better funded. But I think creating the office is something that the Mayor...is under the Mayor's purview to do anytime.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Thank you, Chair King. Mahalo. Any other questions?

MS. ANE: Thank you. Aloha.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo for being here.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, Chair, there's also in the audience somebody from Hawaii Community Foundation, and she's made it an effort to be here, and I just wonder if she also might have some --

CHAIR SINENCI: Yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --you know --

CHAIR SINENCI: --hele mai.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --big contributions.

CHAIR SINENCI: We're open.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Thanks, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, yeah. Two...Chair, just to let you know, two of us have to leave by 4:00, so.

CHAIR SINENCI: Oh, okay. And then, okay, well, this will be --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: We'll still --

CHAIR SINENCI: --our...

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --have...

MS. KAUHANE: I'll be done well before 4:00. I came here really to meet Makale`a to --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Oh.

MS. KAUHANE: --understand all the work that your County is doing. But I will share with you from Hawaii Community Foundation. My name is Michelle Kauhane. I'm our Senior VP over Community Grants and Investment at the Foundation. One of four primary focus areas that we're going into, one you know of already, we're very interested in helping to bring folks together around housing affordability. The second is climate resiliency; mental health; and community engagement. In line with climate resiliency, one of the things that we've been working on with each of the counties that

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

really started with Hawaii County, following the lava situation and recovery, is that we're trying to get into an MOU, which...with each of the counties so that we can create at the Community Foundation a community resiliency fund for exactly what Josh was talking about earlier. We'd rather put the dollar upfront today than having to cost \$6 after the disaster. And so, really trying to create MOUs with each of the counties to start that fund to be your partner, and matching what you put in there so that we can start doing grant making to support communities out front, and then be a conduit when there is an emergency that you direct how we galvanize the nonprofit sector and the business sector to make contributions in the event of an emergency so that we can act quickly because we know that sometimes procurement makes it difficult to turn on the dime. And so, those are the things that I think are most pertinent to this conversation. Thank you for the time. I...like I said, I really came to meet Makale'a and to get to know the work that your Office of OED is doing. Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, thank you.

CHAIR SINENCI: Mahalo for being here. Thank you. Okay. Thank you, Members. And I know we're...we...we're going to be losing some of our Members. So, thank you again for your questions. You know, ultimately, my goal is to figure out where this body envisions the office to be housed and how we envision this office to operate. I felt it was important to allow Director Stanbro to present on the pros and cons of his office, as it was established and as it currently exists. This would allow us some insight on the methods they utilize and that we can follow, and those that he agrees that needs improvement. I would like to mention that while we do have three draft Charter amendment resolutions posted for consideration, I hope to include two more options on the next EACP Committee agenda. One more Charter amendment proposal for this entity to be housed under the Managing Director's Office, another Legislative proposal to create an agency transmitted to the Committee by Member Sugimura--thank you for doing that--that I would like posted and discussed as well. So, for these reasons, if you have any general comments, I'm open to hearing them. But if this body is agreeable to the idea, I would like to hold off on discussion of these proposed Charter amendments until the next EACP Committee meeting.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR SINENCI: No objections? And since we will have so many options on the floor during the future meeting, I would like to ask the Members to review those documents, keeping in mind that we envision...what we envision for our own office to address climate change, sustainability, and resiliency, and to be ready with our notes, comments, and suggestions on the proposed legislation before the next meeting. So, more specifically, I'd prefer that the Members be ready to take a vote on the next one or two proposals next time. But again, so, since I plan to continue this discussion at a future EACP meeting, Members, if there are no objections, I'd like to defer this item.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui
September 17, 2019

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS. (Excused: ALL)

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

CHAIR SINENCI: Okay. So, the item has been deferred. You know, one last thing before we go ahead and adjourn this meeting, we did have a resolution that's going to be coming up on Friday, September 20th, and it's the Youth-Led Global Climate Strike, and they'll be downstairs this Friday from 9:00 a.m. to 1:00 p.m. And so, we wanted to invite those Members that wanted to come down and maybe take a picture with them between maybe 8:30 and 8:45, down at the courtyard. They'll be down at the courtyard. And you can find more information online on the Global Climate Strike by some of the students. So, with that, if there are no other questions or comments, this concludes today's EACP Committee meeting. Thank you to the Members and Ms. Oana. Thank you very much, Director Stanbro, for your time, knowledge, and for flying out to be with us today. We look forward to further collaborating with you on this topic in the near future. So, with that, this September 17th meeting of the Environmental, Agricultural, and Cultural Preservation Committee is now adjourned. Mahalo. . . .(gavel). . .

ADJOURN: 3:58 p.m.

APPROVED:



SHANE M. SINENCI, Chair
Environmental, Agricultural, and Cultural
Preservation Committee

eacp:min:190917:acqp

Transcribed by: Ann Carmel Q. Pugh

**ENVIRONMENTAL, AGRICULTURAL, AND CULTURAL PRESERVATION COMMITTEE
MINUTES**

Council of the County of Maui

September 17, 2019

CERTIFICATE

I, Ann Carmel Q. Pugh, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 24th day of September, 2019, in Kihei, Hawaii

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Ann Carmel Q. Pugh", is written over a horizontal line.

Ann Carmel Q. Pugh