

# **ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE**

**Council of the County of Maui**

## **MINUTES**

**April 13, 2020**

**Online Only via BlueJeans Link**

**CONVENE:** 9:06 a.m.

**PRESENT:** Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Chair  
Councilmember Kelly Takaya King, Vice-Chair  
Councilmember Riki Hokama, Member  
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member  
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member  
Councilmember Michael J. Molina, Member  
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Member  
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member  
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member

**STAFF:** Shelly Espeleta, Legislative Analyst  
Chester Carson, Legislative Analyst  
Lesley Milner, Legislative Analyst  
Kasie Apo Takayama, Legislative Analyst  
Yvette Bouthillier, Committee Secretary

**ADMIN.:** Michele M. Yoshimura, Budget Director, Office of the Mayor  
Wendy Nathan, Budget Specialist V, Budget Office, Office of the Mayor  
Karla H. Peters, Director, Department of Parks and Recreation  
John Buck, Deputy Director, Department of Parks and Recreation  
Lyle Kobashigawa, Grant Coordinator, Department of Parks and Recreation  
David J. Underwood, Director, Department of Personnel Services  
Cynthia M. Razo-Porter, Deputy Director, Department of Personnel Services  
Michele N. McLean, Director, Department of Planning  
Jordan Hart, Deputy Director, Department of Planning  
Mimi Desjardins, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

**OTHERS:** Darren Lerner, University of Hawaii Sea Grant College Program  
Kevin Watkins, Maui Sustainable Solutions  
George Burnette  
Barbara Halai Fernandez  
Faith Chase, Maui Family Farmer Training Network  
Jonah Lion  
Tara Owens

**PRESS:** *Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

---

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please come to order. Aloha kakahiaka kākou. It is 9:06 on April 13, 2020. A reminder for everyone to please silence your cell phones and please remain on mute unless you are ready to speak. We'll start off with introductions. `O wai ka Iku Ha`i o kēia Komike, Keani Rawlins-Fernandez. I'm the Chair of the Economic Development and Budget Committee Keani Rawlins-Fernandez, and we have with us this morning our Committee Vice-Chair Kelly King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Aloha kakahiaka. I've just got something stuck in my throat. Aloha kakahiaka, Chair and fellow Councilmembers, ready to start a new week.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka. Member Shane Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Aloha kakahiaka kākou.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Member Mike Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aloha kakahiaka, Madam Chair, from beautiful overcast Makawao. Good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka. Council Chair Alice Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . and good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, Council Chair Alice Lee. I got you. Now you're unmuted.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. You mean that was rehearsal. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: For the second time, dzień dobry, and that's for all of our Polish friends and that means good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. I don't think I can even attempt that one right now. Mahalo. Member Riki Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Member Tamara Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Aloha kakahiaka kākou from rainy Napili.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Member Yuki Lei Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Good morning from Kula.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. And Pro Temp Tasha Kama.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aloha kakahiaka, Chair, all the way from Kahului.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka. We have with us from Corporation Counsel, Deputy Corporation Counsel Mimi Desjardins.

MS. DESJARDINS: Good morning.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning. We're going to have representatives from Department of Parks and Recreation, Department of Personnel, and Department of Planning, as well as Budget Director Yoshimura, but it looks like we have Wendy filling in. I think...it looks like? Yeah. And then our Committee Staff, we have with us today, Committee Secretary Yvette Bouthillier, Legislative Analysts Shelly Espeleta, Chester Carson, Lesley Milner, and Kasie Apo Takayama. We have one item on today's agenda, EDB-1, Proposed Fiscal Year 2021 Budget for the County of Maui. We'll begin with public testimony. Oral testimony via phone or teleconference will be accepted. Testifiers wanting to provide video testimony should have joined the online meeting via the BlueJeans meeting link, [bluejeans.com/597785199](https://bluejeans.com/597785199), as today...as noted on today's agenda. Testifiers wanting to provide audio testimony should have participated via phone conference by dialing 1-408-317-9253 and entering meeting code 597 785 199 also noted on today's agenda. Written testimony is highly encouraged by sending your comments to [EDB.Committee@mauicounty.us](mailto:EDB.Committee@mauicounty.us). Oral testimony is limited to three minutes. If you're still testifying beyond that time, I'll kindly ask you to complete your testimony. When testifying, please state your first and last name. If you are testifying on behalf of a organization or are a paid lobbyist, please inform the Committee. I will post a link to the testifiers' log-in chat so testifiers will be able to see where they are on the list as I did on, at Thursday's meeting. However, please be mindful that the use of chat during the meeting, chat should be limited to the Committee's review of the FY '21 Budget and should not be used to provide testimony or to chat with other testifiers. If providing testimony, please be courteous to others by muting your microphone while waiting for your turn to testify. Participants who wish to view the meeting only without providing testimony, please view a live cablecast on *Akakū* Channel 53. You can also visit [mauicounty.us/agendas](https://mauicounty.us/agendas) to access live and archived meeting videos. For a click-here link to BlueJeans meeting and for up-to-date information on the Budget, please visit [www.mauicounty.us/2021budget](https://www.mauicounty.us/2021budget). I'll remind Committee Members, Administration, and the public to please be patient with us as we continue to navigate through this new platform, and we'll proceed with oral testimony. We have seven individuals signed up to testify. Staff has been monitoring people joining today's meeting by phone and by video, and we'll do our best to take each person up in an orderly fashion. First to testify is Darren Lerner from UH Sea Grant College Program, followed by Kevin Watkins, Maui Sustainable Solutions. If you'll please unmute yourself, Darren Lerner, you're up first. Please proceed with your testimony.

**...BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY...**

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MR. LERNER: Can you hear me?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MR. LERNER: Can you hear me okay? Okay. Thank you. Mahalo, Chair Rawlins-Fernandez and Committee Members, for the opportunity to express our appreciation for your continued support of the Hawaii Sea Grant Coastal Processes Extension Program and the Dune Management and Public Access Program in partnership with the County of Maui Planning Department. As we all manage and eventually emerge from COVID-19, we really want to emphasize the goal of sustainable economies. In Hawaii where the environment is the economy and the economy is the environment, it really cannot be understated that these Maui-based partnership programs directly contribute to both economic and environmental resilience and recovery. The Coastal Processes Extension Program is a 21-year partnership with the County of Maui to provide onsite specialized expertise and technical assistance to support resilience-focused planning, decision making and outreach on topics related to coastal hazards, coastal management, and climate change, including of course beach erosion and sea-level rise impacts. We have a host of other key program benefits, to name a few, significant leveraging capacity, over the last five years Hawaii Sea Grant has been awarded 1.5 million in grant funding that directly supports the County of Maui, and I have to put, give a shout out the Tara Owens, of course, who's online here, and she's played such a significant role in bringing in that funding. Also through public outreach and education and providing thousands of presentations and workshops through a range of organizations across the County and providing a direct link to the University enterprise through our network of extension specialists within our own university across the state and the region and across the nation. With regard to the dune management and public access program, the grant funding allows Hawaii Sea Grant to provide leadership and coordination for continuation of a longstanding and successful coastal dune restoration program that has formally been implemented by Maui volunteers. These restoration initiatives have and will continue to help design and refine the strategies and tools for conservation and restoration for Hawaii dune environments, which are critical for protecting and maintaining our beaches, protection of public infrastructure property and shoreline access as well as ecosystem services such as nesting sites for endangered seabirds. The volunteer capacity for this program is ending without new leadership; and beginning in FY '20, the County of Maui Department of Planning has established a partnership with our Sea Grant Program to coordinate the program and to continue to provide the scientific basis for implementation as well as education programming for students, volunteers, and visitors. I want to make sure to clarify the Budget request as you review them and we did submit written testimony that is more at length than what I've provided here orally. The proposed FY '21 Budget figures indicate increased budgets for both programs. This is due to a proposal for a 15-month contract rather than 12, and this is a strategy we've been honestly struggling a little bit and really need to see how we can and we believe this will work to decouple the annual renewing contract period from the start of the County fiscal year. . . .(bell rings). . . That must be my buzzer at three minutes. I want to just say that we have provided additional funding and a lot of leveraging. And in fact, we have a long history of contributing at least 100 percent or more in leverage and match to the funding provided by the County, and we certainly



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

welcome any questions or suggestions related to this work. I am going to hang on to the line here if there are questions, and thank you very much for the opportunity to submit testimony. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Lerner. Okay, so, Members, that item that Mr. Lerner was referring to is found in your Budget Narrative Program Budget on Page 460 and that is the \$148,731 item. Members, any need for clarification from our testifier? Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just was wondering if that volunteer capacity program that you were speaking of is the Bob and Lis Richardson one?

MR. LERNER: Yes, it is.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Members, any other need for clarification? Okay, seeing none, Mr. Lerner, you plan to stay on as a resource? Oh, I'm sorry. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. I was raising my hand earlier. So, I just wanted to check and see...thank you for being here, Mr. Lerner. There's the additional in my priority list also the Kihei Coastal Dune Restoration Project that is probably part of...it came out of your office as a recommendation as well, but I'm just wondering if this funding will allow you to reestablish a volunteer program that you said is ending. I think that's...

MR. LERNER: Yeah, that is very much a...yes, I agree. We all agree, and it is very much a part of what we would seek to build in the coming years as we stand up this program. As you know, the folks that have done so thus far as volunteers have done a tremendous job; and in support, Tara has been there, and so our program has been a part of this for quite some time. But absolutely, the capacity that's brought to bear from volunteers simply can't be provided by the County and by our Sea Grant Program alone, but we do intend to, not only restore if you will but build that volunteer program.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, great. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. So, Members, if I ask if you have a question and you have your hand up and I don't call on you, just unmute yourself and just say "Chair" because in gallery I don't always see all Councilmembers, especially during testimony when other people's videos are on. So, I believe what Committee Vice-Chair King also pointed out was a second line item for Dune Management and Public Shoreline Access for \$157,000. And so both, Mr. Lerner was testifying on both items.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, the additional item that I was talking about was a recommendation that came in after the Mayor's Budget from the same program, and they were...it was part of a two-part priority that I had put in for coastal management positions in Planning as well as the Kihei Sand Restoration Project, so those were additional projects I believe, unless they were, unless Mr. Lerner feels like they were part of the same thing that was already in the Budget but this request came to us. Maybe we could ask Mr. Lerner.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Lerner?

MR. LERNER: Yeah, I'm sorry. Sure, and I'm sorry. I'm not as familiar with that second piece. I can clarify certainly that the written testimony we provided and the synopsis in oral form here has been established as the Chair had mentioned. One is the Coastal Processes Extension Program and the proposed Budget is submitted at 148,731, and then the Dune Management and Public Access Program at 157,000.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Perhaps --

MR. LERNER: I don't know if...

VICE-CHAIR KING: --if Ms. Owens knows.

MR. LERNER: I know...

VICE-CHAIR KING: If Ms. Owens is...

MR. LERNER: Yeah, I think Tara is...

VICE-CHAIR KING: She can clarify, I think, on the Dune Restoration Project. This request came in from her.

MR. LERNER: Yeah.

MS. OWENS: Hi, everyone. This is Tara. Hopefully, you can hear me.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, we can hear you, but we're not taking...we're in public testimony right now. So we're going to complete public testimony and we can ask for clarification when the item comes up. Mahalo, Ms. Owens. Okay. Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Mahalo for your testimony, Mr. Lerner. I'm going to shut off your video now that you've completed your testimony, so that I can see all the Councilmembers, as many of the Councilmembers as possible in my gallery view. Okay. Mahalo for your testimony.

MR. LERNER: Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Next.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MR. LERNER: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. The next person signed up to testify is Kevin Watkins followed by George Burnette.

MR. WATKINS: Good morning, County Council.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Morning.

MR. WATKINS: So, I just start going, yeah. Like a ready, set, go for the timer, or...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, timer started already.

MR. WATKINS: Okay. I'm Kevin with Maui Sustainable Solutions and you guys may remember me from coming in and talking with you guys prior to the Coronavirus and us adapting to this new technological way of having meetings. I think a lot of you guys are familiar with what I'm talking about, but mostly it's a distributed network of alkaline refill stations for our community is extremely beneficial in many ways. With the Coronavirus currently, a lot of people, we're—I'm sure you guys have seen the statistics—we're the second hardest hit in terms of job loss across the United States, and with these distributed network of refill stations around in each of the districts around the County that's going to provide many benefits to our residential community. The first is it's going to be saving them lots of money. When you start to break down the numbers of bottled water, I don't know if you just, any of you think of your closest grocery store, gas station, and how much it is for a liter of bottled water, and when you look at how much water a human is supposed to drink per day, those numbers add up really quick when you break them into monthly, quarterly, and annual figures to the tunes of thousands of dollars annually that an individual can be spending on bottled water. We all know that plastic is a problem in our oceans. You know, I'm not going to dive too deep in that. I think we're all on the same page with that, and so having this distributed network of refill stations allows us to thoroughly, efficiently, and rapidly transition to the plastic-free infrastructure we need to help save our oceans and our reefs and curtail plastic pollution. Specifically, about the systems that my organization does, they are FloWater. That company was originally started in Kauai, founded by a startup launcher on Oahu and is now on the mainland. That's a very long story short. These systems were designed prior to the Coronavirus to be the most hygienic, efficient systems out on the market. A key component of that is. . .they have these, it's a soft-touch panel that's flat, be easily cleaned and wiped. It's a large fill area, so there's no need for bottle contact with any of the other components, it's designed for refillable use only, as opposed to the push fountains like you see at the airport right now, where they, you know, they make that arcing fountain and those are extremely unsanitary, and I haven't seen a single one of those open, nor should there be in this current crisis. There's a long list of the different design features on these that I'm happily to send over to you guys. I know that I only have a little bit of time right now, and I guess with this being the Budget Committee, we'll get into the numbers. . . .*(bell rings)*. . .

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo Mr. Watkins. We have a question from Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. So, I was just going to ask you that question. How much do these units cost, and how are you envisioning it? How big is it? I think I heard you talk about justification. Can you hear me?

MR. WATKINS: Right. Yeah, I can hear you clearly. So, the first question is cost. So normally, the units are, normally what the...what our organization does is we do a subscription model; but from talking with several people in the community, my understanding is that the County can't have an annual subscription or like rental so to speak of equipment, and so we would wholesale the units to you. So, the wholesale on the units is normally 6,500. I've talked with my higher ups in supply chain, and we can get those down to six grand a piece. And then what...so, that's just for the system itself. The systems have 6 filters inside that are \$40 a piece, I believe, and those are meant to be changed annually. Usually the first set of filters is the sediment and the pre-carbon filters, and then there's reverse osmosis, and then post-carbon, and the coconut filter in there. Those are going to come later in the year. They have a higher volume that they can go through. I think that it's something along the lines of 20,000 water bottle refills. Something akin to this size is about a 40-ounce, it's larger than a liter.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Perhaps you'd like to submit this detail to Member Sugimura in writing?

MR. WATKINS: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair?

MR. WATKINS: So, I'm...so, I guess I needed to get a little bit more of an understanding from you guys what you are looking for. So there's, the wholesaling of the units, there's the filters which you would want to buy enough for in the first bit to have, to cover your first...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're still in public testimony and not deliberating. So, if you'd like to get those details directly to Member Sugimura, that would be great. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just wanted to mention that this was one of my priority items, and we worked together to do a breakdown, and so maybe Mr. Watkins could be a resource for when we discuss the priorities. But if Member Sugimura wants to look at my priorities under Parks and Rec, the breakdown is there for what we discussed.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Mr. Watkins, would you like to serve as a resource for when this item comes up? If so, please send your contact information to [EDB.Committee@mauicounty.us](mailto:EDB.Committee@mauicounty.us).

MR. WATKINS: Okay. The same as testifying for this meeting. Yeah.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Testimony.

MR. WATKINS: Yeah, so I guess I would like—I know this is testimony, so--but let's say when I get a better understanding of how the County operates with long-term contracts. These systems are designed to last for ten years, and so, you know I envisioned that --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mr. Watkins?

MR. WATKINS: --I would be maintaining the system for that length, so I need to discuss that with you guys more, so can I just, Yuki Lei Sugimura and Tamara Paltin will be my go-to connections for that. Is that correct?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MR. WATKINS: Wonderful.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for your testimony.

MR. WATKINS: Thank you so much, County Council. Stay safe out there.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The next testifier is George Burnette followed by Barbara Halai Fernandez.

MR. BURNETTE: Can you hear me?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MR. BURNETTE: Awesome. Okay. Good morning, Council.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good morning, George.

MR. BURNETTE: My name is George Burnette. I'm a member of the Maui Nui Marine Resource Council but testifying as an individual. Unfortunately, the funding for the Maui Nui Marine Resource Council is currently not in the proposed Budget, so I'm asking the Council to reinstate the funding in 2021 to the level of \$225,000 that was in the 2020 level. This funding is needed to support important programs for healthy coral reefs, clean ocean water, and abundant native fish. Our current projects include ocean water quality monitoring at 41 locations in South and West Maui through our Hui O Ka Wai Ola program, also our oyster project to improve ocean water quality in Mā'alaea Bay. Another program we're implementing our Pohakea Stormwater Management program, which includes work to suppress wildfires in Pohakea Watershed across from Mā'alaea Bay. County funding is particularly important for this project because it will help match a two-year grant we have from the National Fish and Wildlife Foundation. This is helping us put Maui residents to work to install fire breaks in that watershed. Preventing fires will also help the erosion that results and subsequent

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

inundation of sediment into Mā`alaea Bay when it rains. Also, important right now ongoing studies of those corals that are most resilient to climate change and adverse conditions in Mā`alaea and Olowalu, and finally, our community education programs including our monthly speaker series at the Maui Ocean Center. So, I urge the Council to support our Maui Nui Marine Resource Council. I suggest using some of the monies designated for the Maui Visitors Bureau for this purpose. I support significant defunding of the Maui Visitors Bureau. I believe the need to address the declining health of our surrounding oceans and reefs is more important in the long run than attempting to attract yet more tourists here. I also support increased funding to support local farmers and decrease our dependence on imported food. Thank you for the opportunity to testify. I think you guys are amazing. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Burnette. Members, any clarifying questions? Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Burnette, for being there. I almost didn't recognize you because of your haircut. Nice haircut. But so I, you know, you know that the refunding of Maui Nui Marine Resource Council is one of my priority items, and so --

MR. BURNETTE: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --is there somebody...would it...is there somebody else that's testifying? I mean, I wanted to ask you to be a resource, and I didn't know if it was you or somebody else.

MR. BURNETTE: I would be glad to be a resource, but I'm not really in the management of the Council, and we do have some testifiers. I don't know if they're going to be oral testifiers today, but I know we have at least a handful of other testifiers that would be better qualified than I am, but as far as I know, I'm not going anywhere today, so.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, if we need you, if we don't find one of the...I hate to use that word better qualified because you've been doing so much...

MR. BURNETTE: No, that's fine.

VICE-CHAIR KING: But anyway, Chair, I just wanted to make sure that we had a resource from that organization and whether it's Mr. Burnette or somebody else he recommends. We'll see how the testimony unfolds.

MR. BURNETTE: Well, if you need a resource, I know I could get you one very quickly.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Great. Thank you.

MR. BURNETTE: Mahalo.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Committee Vice-Chair King. Members, any other need for questions? Seeing none, mahalo for your testimony this morning, Mr. Burnette.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: One last question from Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Mr. Burnette, for being here. Okay, I've got the koofa thing going on, so I'll just speak. It looks like I proviso'd Maui Nui Network *[sic]* in Friday's under Environmental Protections. However, the 225 took us over the 1.9 that was allotted for Environmental Protection, so we still have to kind of look if we're going to increase that to include Maui Nui Marine Network *[sic]*. Thank you.

MR. BURNETTE: Member Sinenci, you broke up so I couldn't gather that; but if you said you're looking to increase our funds, we like that.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair? Just quick, real quickly, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, sorry about that. I just realized this was something that we already went over in our previous meeting with the Office of the Mayor, so we won't...I just want to make sure that Mr. Burnette knew that we didn't need the resource here today. When we get down to decision making, we might need that, but yeah, and the proposal was to reinstate the 225 out of the existing funds, so thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Seeing no other hands raising for questions, we will thank you for your testimony today, Mr. Burnette.

MR. BURNETTE: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Next to testify is Barbara Halai Fernandez, followed by Faith Chase, Maui Family Farmer Training Network. Ms. Fernandez? Barbara Fernandez? Okay, we'll come back to Ms. Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, I think she was on the phone and she was muted. It might be the 264 number.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Fernandez?

MS. FERNANDEZ: Yes. I'm on the phone, not the video presentation. I'm not high tech.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, it's your turn to testify.

MS. FERNANDEZ: Okay, good. Aloha from Waiakoa, Kula.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha.

MS. FERNANDEZ: I'm looking down on our farm and our animals. Chair and Members, I'm very proud of you. I'm Barbara Halai Fernandez, and I wish to give testimony regarding the Parks Department, and it also crosses over to Public Works now and their Budget. I'm a member of our County Arborist Committee and Vice President of the non-profit Maui Green & Beautiful. Parks Director, Karla Peters and her staff have done an excellent job and they're always available meeting or returning calls. A concern that we have is we need an additional County Arborist. Tim, our new Arborist, is a wonderful arborist. Our committee and Maui Green & Beautiful see so much sliding by Uncle Ernest Rezents as we all know. He is full of knowledge and compiled the excellent Maui County Planting Plan. Here's the deal, another arborist needs to be making sure that all the rules and guidelines are enforced. Better yet, nothing goes through the planning unit like it used to. It also used to go planning unit and then the Arborist Committee. So much is in writing but not enforced such as tree planting in the parking lots, street trees in subdivisions. So, funding a new arborist especially if trees are removed or damaged, there's no enforcement to properly replant at this point. This is a large part of people who get in touch with us through Maui Green & Beautiful because their compliance to follow the rules are not taken to move forward. So, please consider an additional arborist. And a comment about our community love parks. We all would have loved to been able to spend reflection or spiritual time in a park for Good Friday and/or Easter, but we as community, you as Council, and the Police all followed the rules that Mayor Victorino set up. All I want to say is shame on him for breaking the rules. You saw in the newspaper nobody under trees much closer than six-feet, windows open. So, let's just think about our parks and trees to need to keep Maui a beautiful and cooling place and consider this arborist, a second arborist coming in to help enforce the rules. Thank you and have a fun day.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Fernandez. Okay, we have a question from Member Paltin.

MS. FERNANDEZ: Yes?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Fernandez, for your testimony. I was wondering when you're talking about a second arborist, Parks already used to have an arborist but it got moved to the Public Works. So, you're saying instead of bringing back the arborist from Public Works you want to just add on another arborist?



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MS. FERNANDEZ: That's correct because you are correct in what you said. The arborist was part of the Parks Department and now he's Public Works. So, yes, we are requesting and it would be part of Public Works, I assume. I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you don't want Parks to have their own arborist and Public Works to have their own arborist, you want Public Works to have two arborists?

MS. FERNANDEZ: Yes, I believe that would be correct because the Department...Tim is now part of Public Works, so I am saying the two arborists. Our other counties have multiple, you know, like O`ahu has 12 arborists and Kaua'i has 4 arborists and stuff. So, our concern is that there's just no enforcement being done and an arborist, a second arborist on board would help do that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then, I had thought that when I read the details that the position under Public Works wasn't an arborist anymore. It was like an arboriculturist or something like that. Is there a difference in the two or is the arborist a lower position and it would be okay to have that and then have the other one be the arbor...shucks, I can't remember what it's called but it wasn't an arborist.

MS. FERNANDEZ: That's an excellent question. Of course because of the situation with the Coronavirus our meeting is not meeting, so Chris Reynolds is our Chair at the Arborist Committee. I would like to ask him because we didn't discuss what you're saying. That's something I would need to let you know. I would...I'm assuming that it would be two arborists on the same thing position. It wouldn't be like an assistant or something. It would be two actual arborists.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, I think Public Works is up tomorrow, so if you can get back to us tomorrow that'd be awesome. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

MS. FERNANDEZ: Oh, that would be, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Members, any other need for clarifying questions? Seeing none, we'll thank Ms. Fernandez for joining us this morning and providing testimony. Mahalo, Ms. Fernandez.

MS. FERNANDEZ: Could I say one thing though? Could you please tell me how I could contact her on exactly what she was asking me about her question or if she would like to repeat that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Me? Tamara?

MS. FERNANDEZ: Yes, could you repeat your question please?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: If...what is the difference between an arborist and arboriculturist, and my e-mail is tamara.paltin@mauicounty.us.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MS. FERNANDEZ: Oh, great. Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Mahalo, Ms. Fernandez. Okay, next to testify is Faith Chase, followed by phone number 775-247-4680. Ms. Chase?

MS. CHASE: Good morning, Council. Good morning, Committee. My comments are in regards to the Parks and Recreation Department. This is a new idea. I don't know what it looks like, but I would encourage the Parks Department to consider a position that is a liaison to the unsheltered and those living in their cars. In the past two weeks, my. . .or actually the past month, my research has found that the Housing and Human Concerns doesn't have the bandwidth to get the on-the-ground sort of temperature of things going on and all the bruddahs who are managing the parks who don't want to go on record are very empathetic, have really good ideas about workforce development, like almost employing some of the people who don't have places to be for part-time landscaping, really good ideas but nobody wants to go on record. So, if the Parks and Recreation Department consider a position that is a liaison to the houseless, the unsheltered that would be really advantageous because quite frankly nobody is that in-between. You're not supposed to do sweeps, what they call compassionate response unless there's a bed at shelters and there's a lot of. . .that a lot of that is going on unfortunately, and nobody is the voice of these people. So, this is just me making a stretch because, like I said, the other departments can't encompass this. So, if...I will put this in writing, and I understand that Public Works is tomorrow. I don't know if this is not the best day to give testimony, but I'll share it with the related departments. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Chase. Members, any need for questions? Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you very much, Madam Chair. Just for clarification--good morning, Faith--you mentioned a liaison like maybe someone who's a Park Ranger or Park Service Officer as a link or connection between the County and the homeless.

MS. CHASE: Yes, that would be great. I just...liaison I'm using loosely 'cause I'm not sure what that position looks like, but when I went to a meeting with the Department of Housing and Human Concerns about a month ago, I asked the two administrators, their name escapes me right now, but Lori's administrative heads, I said I just have to ask you are you...do you feel overwhelmed, are you busy, you know, do you need...and the answer was no. And if the Department of Housing and Human Concerns is not feeling busy then another department needs to hāpai this kuleana is my opinion. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, thank you. It's a good suggestion. Thank you, Madam Chair.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, seeing no other hands raising for questions, we'll thank Ms. Chase for her testimony this morning. Mahalo, Ms. Chase.

MS. CHASE: A hui hou.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And our last testifier for today is phone number 775-247-4680. Phone number 775-247-4680, it's your turn to testify. I've unmuted you, if you can please proceed.

MR. LION: Mahalo. Aloha, Chair, Committee, Council, and all participants, really the most gratitude. Mahalo for all the testimony. This is Jonah Lion. I am calling in support of Kevin Watkins, who testified earlier as well as all the participants. I would like to share what is very present in the arena of water and that resource and how the filtered water and slow water movement, how much of an impact and positive impact it can have on a community. Normally, I feel and experience the water itself and the healing qualities that it has for our own bodies but also with that the, what it does in transforming our, the `āina and protecting of our most important natural resource is water, our oceans, and our streams. As you know, I spend a lot of time in nature on this island and on the beaches, on the land and hikes, and while I'm doing this I pick up a lot of plastic and do my duty to leave it better than I found it and always carrying around a reusable water bottle and to be able to have the opportunity to refill water bottles with this water technology, this structured technology, not only refills my body, but I feel very connected and like I'm doing my civic responsibility to clean up the `āina and to maintain that and to sustain that. And this is a truly sustainable movement and system and process that will make a drastic impact. You know, imagining that they all of our plastic no longer, you know, our single-use plastics no longer being here, and we're seeing that initiative happening all over the place in large cities on the mainland and other countries banning single-use plastics and we're doing a wonderful job here in Hawai'i of moving towards that and that this is a next step in that right direction. And we also have wonderful technology that is available to us to as we pick up the plastics that are already out there, which I think is a whole other initiative that we can bring volunteer participation and even potentially funding our cleanup and with the industry of tourism where we are currently in this lockout and with the Coronavirus that we can activate our island and our people to clean up our island, clean up our homes. And this I think can all be put into a wonderful teamwork and working together as a `ohana and . . .(inaudible). . . . .(bell rings). . . And so, I hear that that's my time. I just wanted to show up in full support of everything that's shared here, and how we can save...do our part and leaving it better than we found it and regenerating with sustainable...sustain a movement. And . . .(inaudible). . . Mahalo, a hui hou.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Lion. Members, any need for clarifying his testimony? Okay, seeing none, we'll thank you so much for your testimony this morning.

MR. LION: Thank you. Mahalo and aloha.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Okay, Members, that was our last, the last person signed up to testify. I'll do a quick call for anyone who is online and I did not call and would like to provide testimony. Anyone wishing to testify, please unmute yourself now and you may proceed. Okay. Okay, hearing none, if there are no objections, Members, I will now close oral testimony.

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. Okay, and I have a list of people we've received written testimony from in the past five days. So, this list is from April 9 after 7:30 a.m. to April 13 as of 7:30 a.m. It's about five pages long. I will do my best to not repeat the testimony that we received in prior meetings. Okay. Okay. Funding for farming, Pah Pray, we received seven testimony, Pah Pray, Mikala Minn from Mahele Farm; Autumn Ness submitting photos of Uncle Walter Ritte's homestead in Molokai; four, Lehn Huff, Vice-President, Grow Some Good Board; five, Laura Ramirez; six, Amy Stephens; seven, Kristina Mekdeci. Three testimony for Maui Visitors Bureau, Toni Marie Davis, Executive Director of Activities & Attractions Association of Hawaii, Inc.; two, Brian Kashima, Island Landscaping; three, Serene Gunnison. Two testimony regarding Maui County Farm Bureau, and we received testimony from them before. One Ocean Safety Officer, Jon Kaneshina. Fifty-two testimony regarding Halau Ke'alaokamaile Cultural Resource Center from John Fitzpatrick; Torrey Ho-Ching; Kaimanamālie Brummel; Kepa Hewahea; Jim Hammett, Chief Executive Officer of Regenerative Farming Community; 6, Stacey Eaton; 7, Shawna and Hailey Chang; 8, Ku'ulei Alcomindras-Palakiko; 9, Erika-Lei Kekahuna, Kamaile Kekahuna, Lei Reichel; 10, Ka'apuni Aiwohi; 11, Ashley Nishijo Tells; 12, Jasmine Turley; 13, Mahealani Naauao; 14, Lance Winston; 15, Puakea Nogelmeier; 16, Nestor Ugale, Jr.; 17, A. U'ilani Tanigawa Lum; 18, Scott Hinau; 19, Marie Elena Juario; 20, Anna Pu; 21, B.J. Ott; 22, Daryl Fujiwara; 23, Elaine Nelson; 24, Catherine Redmond; 25, Nancy Jaqua Dein; 26, Lia Uhrin; 27, Kyoko Amds; 28, Kalo DeLeon; 29, Tori Hulali Silva; 30, Cody Pata; 31, Ellen Naho'olewa; 32, Charmaine Chun Kalanui; 33, Emily Kāne or Kane--not sure--34, Alma Weinstein; 35, Cherissa Henohea Kāne; 36, Lyndra Okamoto; 37, Jane Dellaport; 38, Chris Goodwin-Blume; 39, Kahiau Snyder; 40, Darcel Gilbert; 41, Lilyana Koa; 42, Kim Tong; 43, Kahiwa Vendiola; 44, Kanoa, Kassie and Nanea Haake; 45, Debbie Willis; 46, Chanel Souza; 47, Becki Victorine; 48, Janiesse Palafox; 49, Jordan Tabura; 50, Claire Paishon; 51, Michelle Cabalse; 52, Ian Aquino. One testimony for the Nisei Veterans Memorial Center that we received before. Thirty-two testimony regarding the FAM program many of which we received prior. Of the new testimony are from Margo Cristein, Ashley Clark, Elizabeth Barretto, Bo Petty, Nakoto Crumbo, Scott Crawford, Kerry Beane, Sheila and Monica Marrow, and Miguel Marier. One testimony regarding Hui F Road in Napili from Margi Calder. Five testimony in regarding acquisition of Mapulehu, Moloka'i, 1.2 million Open Space Fund; one, Cheryl Corbiell; two, William Butch Hasse; three, Noa Emmett Auwae Aluli; four, Shae Kamaka'ala, Director, Island Protection; five, Richard Cooke, President, Maui Land Trust [sic]; six, Davianna Pōmaika'i McGregor. Ten testimony regarding Common Ground Collective from Ananda Stone, Chair, Common Ground Collective; two, Edward Alohi; three, Farron Cabral; four, Nicolas Timpone; five, Louise Ross; six, Krista Woodward; seven, Alex Pinto; eight, Havilah Mills; nine, Harriet Witt, board

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

member, Hawaii Farmers Union United; and ten, Maile Davis. Sixteen testimony regarding Maui Nui Marine Resource Council; 1, Sulara James; 2, Lynn Britton, President and Co-founder, Mā`alaea Village Association; 3, Arnie Koss; 4, Nancy Jaqua Dein; 5, Anne Rillero; 6, Meredith Beeson, Administrative Assistant of MNMRC; 7, Andrew Fox; 8, Phillip Milne; 9, Carolee and Ralph Jones; 10, Michelle Griffoul; 11, Rick Woodford; 12, Kerry Beane; 13, Rob Weltman; 14, Robin Newbold, Chair of MNMRC; 15, Lyndon Ibele; 16, Pat Lindquist, President, Napili Bay and Beach Foundation, Inc. One testimony regarding funding for County's water conservation program putting water refill stations in each district from Paula Alcoseba. One regarding funding priorities from Mary Whispering Wind. Three regarding Maui School Garden Network; one, Rachael Holton; two, Bradley Mason; three, Lehn Huff, Vice President of Grow Some Good Board. Two testimony regarding Maui AIDS Foundation; Joyce Spirko, Director of Lab & Prevention Services, Maui AIDS Foundation; and two, Jill Bauss. Three testimony regarding funding for agriculture and food distribution; one unique testimony from Faith Tuipulotu. One testimony in regards to Moloka`i-Lāna`i Soil and Water Conservation District, continued support of program funding for deer management plan for Moloka`i, and junk car removal from the board of directors of...from their board of directors. Four testimony regarding Pā`ia Youth and Cultural Center from, one, Kai Carrozzino; two, Maya Carrozzino; three, Kristen Fitzpatrick; four, Pete Jalbert. One testimony regarding the cultural liaison position in the County from Noelani Ahia. Three testimony regarding Maui Soil and Water Conservation Districts; one, Leo Tomita; two, Kimo Falconer; and three, Sam Aruch. One testimony regarding information on COVID from Toni Marie Davis. One testimony regarding road improvements from Joseph Eichenbaum, comments on back up road plan from Lāhainā to Kahului. Eight testimony in support of the Planning Departments FY '21 Budget for UH Sea Grant Coastal Extension Program and Dune Management and Public Access Program; from one, Darren Lerner; two, Douglas Luther; three, Pat Lindquist; four, Melissa Iwamoto; five, Tara Owens; six, Rob Weltman; seven, Susan White, Executive Director of Pā`ia Youth and Cultural Center; eight, Peter Cannon. One testimony regarding Hawaii Farmers Union from Bob Shaffer, Soil Culture Consulting Services LLC. One testimony regarding Maui School Garden Network from Jadda Miller. One testimony regarding Maui Nui Botanical Garden from Tamara Sherrill, Executive Director of Maui Nui Botanical Gardens. One testimony regarding Maui Economic Development Board from Robin Pierce. One testimony regarding or in support of OED funding for Maui County non-profits from Susan Byrne-Wickey. And last nine testimony regarding budget priorities from one, Karen Comcowich; two, Koa Hewahewa; three, Cara Flores; four, Toni Marie Davis; five, Debbie Larkin; six, Aram Armstrong; seven, Keolamau Tengan from Ka`ehu, community liaison; eight, that's a repeat; and nine, Paige De Ponte. Okay, any objections to receiving the written testimony into record?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Members.

**. . .END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .**

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

**ITEM 1:                    PROPOSED FISCAL YEAR 2021 BUDGET FOR THE COUNTY  
                                 OF MAUI (CC 20-56 and CC 20-114)**

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, we have one item on today's agenda Proposed Fiscal Year 2021 Budget for the County of Maui. We are on day five of department reviews continuing with Department of Parks and Recreation, Department of Personnel Services, and Department of Planning. Receive written...receive responses for your individual inquiries for those departments as well as introduce and seek comment from departments on your priority proposals. Again mahalo, Members, for being flexible with our Budget discussions as we continue to look for more efficient ways to carry out our work. As we already agreed upon and implemented we will allow opening comments from department but forego receiving PowerPoint presentations in order to allow more time for Q and A and instead department's with PowerPoints will e-mail them to the EDB Committee Members for their own review. We'll continue with doing the two rounds of five-minute questions and today's schedule we'll be taking up Parks and Rec, and we're right on time from about 10:00 to noon and we'll continue after lunch, if necessary. We will then take up Department of Personnel Services and end with the Department of Planning. We have with us from Department of Parks and Recreation Director Karla Peters and Deputy Director John Buck. And let's see, we also have on online monitoring Lyle Kobishigawa, Kobashigawa, sorry, Grant Coordinator for Parks Office. Okay, Director Peters, if you'd like to begin with some opening remarks.

**DEPARTMENT OF PARKS AND RECREATION**

MS. PETERS: Good morning, Chair. Good morning, Committee. Thank you for having us here today. We'd like to answer all of your questions. We did receive the questions in writing and we look forward to being able to have a discussion on our Parks Department Budget. And at this time, I'd like to just let Deputy Director John Buck give any comments.

MR. BUCK: Yes, I hope everybody's staying safe and practicing...I know we're practicing social but we're here to answer your questions, and we thank you ahead of time for your continued support of our Department.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Director and Deputy Director. We will put five minutes on the clock. Committee Vice-Chair King, are you ready? And then we'll go with Pro Temp Kama, and then work our way left.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you so much. Yes, I'm ready.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Thank you for being here. Thank you for being here, Karla, and...Ms. Peters and Mr. Buck. And so the first question I had and I sent it in writing, but I kind of wanted to get, be, have a little bit of a dialogue if possible. But the baseyard that you've got proposed only has 30,000 in it for initial design, and usually when I've

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

seen these types of projects come through, and I know you're working with Public Works, but it's been a six-year plan. And I know you...we've talked to your office, it's been that you told us it's going to be about 1 and...1.2 million for design and construction will cost around 5 million, but we only saw 30,000 in the project proposal. So, could you speak to that, what we need to do to get the actual numbers in there so that we know what we're gonna be spending down the line?

MS. PETERS: Chair? Thank you. Thank you, Member King. So, we did put in \$30,000 for this year in our CIP Budget for a feasibility study. So, we want to make sure that the site that we're looking at is feasible and can accommodate the other departments. So, we were in a discussion with the Department of Public Work and possibly DEM and just wanted to make sure that before we proceed with the initial site that we had talked about that we would better look and ensure that these sites were able to accommodate the uses as well as the infrastructure costs would not be as great. And, you know, we all know that most of the area in South Maui is blue rock, so we would have to encounter that. In preliminary study, it was shown that that's where the biggest cost would be. So, what we wanted to do is take a better look at it, just a quick study to see if that is the area where we should be looking at, or if there is another area that we could possibly move towards.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you for that. And are you folks taking the lead on this then or are you...is there money in the Public Works Department Budget for this as well?

MS. PETERS: Chair? So, thank you for that question, Member King. Yes, we will be leading this part of it and coordinating with the other departments as well as the Administration on how to best move forward.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. And then my other question on that issue is is there a possibility when you get into designing it of adding, you know, one of our Council...my colleagues on the Council proposed district offices in South Maui and Upcountry and if we could put it in...if we could build that into...at the baseyard that you guys are looking at it would save us a lot of money in the long run, plus I think the parking is already there. So, is that a possibility that you could add that into your when you're scoping it out?

MS. PETERS: So, yes, we could look at that as well.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. And then another question I had was on Hale Pi'ilani Park because we had some concerns. A testifier yesterday that was worried that that was going to be a private park just for Kaiwahine Village, but I think that park...I just want to get confirmation, that's a public park isn't it?

MS. PETERS: Correct. Yes, Hale Pi'ilani is in our inventory, and we do maintain that park. I am working with the Kaiwahine developers so that we can...there needs to be access from the project to the park. Right now it's cut off, and as well as they're looking at giving a donation for the playground. So, we are working on that two items with them.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you. And then the next question I had was on the parking lot, the South Maui, the beach parks parking lot item, which is on 713 of the Program Budget, and I just wanted to make sure that because it's resurfacing that we're not looking at resurfacing the beach parks with asphalt, because I think our community has come out in strong opposition to asphalt for environmental reasons and had requested that when we're paving anything near the ocean that we do gravel or that for resurfacing that we do gravel, because it absorbs rather than encouraging runoff into the ocean.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member King. So, we are looking at incorporating low-impact development in both of those two parking lots. Right now, that it...they are in design and we have our consultants working on incorporating those types of components to the project.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, we're addressing the runoff issue then and the environmental issues?

MS. PETERS: Absolutely, and that's a standard now moving forward with all of our parking lot projects that we do have a consultant look into that low-impact development on all of them.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. I have one more question, but I think my time is going to get run out, so I'll just pose it and if someone else wants to follow up. But I just wanted to kind of get your thoughts on the idea of having a liaison for the homeless at the parks, and do we have somebody already doing that, or is it a good idea to have a designated person?

MS. PETERS: Currently right now, we do not have a liaison. We have our Parks...we have our Park's security officers out there doing education and enforcement. We best believe that that would be handled out of the Department of Housing and Human Concerns as we work directly in coordination with all of the other agencies on the unsheltered issues.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. All right. Thank you. I'll yield for now, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you the Department for being here this morning. I just have a just a, probably a far-reaching question, but I feel like over the next 12 months that the situation we're in today is probably the same situation we're gonna be in, maybe not as...maybe a little bit more bleak maybe, but when you did your budget were you looking at everything being nice and good the way it was before, or have you thought about that what if things don't get better? What if things do get worse when you plan your...when you plan this budget, and does it even...does it look...I mean, are we planning same as you did last year? Are we looking forward that maybe the next 12 months may bring us things that we are not looking forward to or not knowing, and how can we plan for the unknown? I think what I'm trying to ask you is have you



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

planning...in this budget, are you planning for the unknown? And I'm not even sure if you can answer that 'cause I'm trying to answer that myself. Thank you.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Member Kama. That's a very important question for us right now. So, when we first did our budget we were not in this pandemic. What we did was we tried to look at, especially in our equipment. So, our equipment we did a thorough assessment of all of our equipment and our vehicles. Went and got all of the reports from the Department of Public Works for the motor vehicle repairs and labor and realized that a lot of our vehicles in our replacement plan they are...the cost to repair exceed the value, so we inserted that as part of our heavy equipment and budget, our C Account budget. We also looked and had assessments of all of our scoreboards and field paint machines and we're trying to get everything on a replacement schedule so we can plan better and look forward to each fiscal year of what we will be requesting for. Additionally, what we do as far as the equipment right now is we're bidding them out as fleet, so we put all vehicles into one bid, hoping to get a better price per vehicle as well as all the equipment goes all into one bid. So just, you know, to summarize and answer your question, we, at the point that we did the budget it was very robust, we were not in this pandemic, and we are...we have recommendations on types of areas where we could be for some items.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Members, I was gonna try something different today. I was going to track your extra time, and if you would like to use that extra time when your next five minutes comes up I'll just put it on and if you would like to use it you can. Okay. All right, I see a lot of nodding heads, so we'll do that. Okay, so, Member Pro Temp Kama, you had 2 minutes and 11 seconds. Okay, Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Nice to see everybody. I hope you all had a nice Easter with your family. Parks Department, thank you very much for opening up the three restrooms during this pandemic time. I'm curious to see what kind of usage you're getting and, you know, just kind of feedback on that. But going to this, I'm sure Member Hokama's gonna ask you about the 5 percent cutback, and I'll look forward to that discussion. Connected to that, I was wondering if the Department was looking at any hiring freezes for positions of expansion or vacant positions of not hiring now as we're in this pandemic COVID-19 mode and these would be for non-essential. So, have you had a chance to think about those positions that you possibly could wait on hiring until we kind of know where we are with this COVID-19 is my first question?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Sugimura. Yes, so we are looking at all of our vacant positions and ensuring that the hiring is done for essential positions. Those that we are looking at wanting to continue to fill vacancies are our Parks security officers as well as our supervisory personnel. So, we had a lot of movement within the Parks Department within the last six months, we had positions where people have got promoted to other departments, transferred to other departments, or we've had our retirement of our supervisor, so what we want to do is ensure that we can get that supervisory personnel

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

filled and then as well as our Parks security officers. The other positions right now we have put them on hold.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And will you send us the list of those positions? And if it's in the Budget so we know that it will be not an expense for in this fiscal year, if you could. And then I also looked at your CIP and on the same line of trying to secure cash, so I'm kind of asking, you know, departments that have CIP this similar questions. So, your CIP, CBS-1117, I was wondering if, for that project, you could use, change it to bond funding, and I think the total amount for the 5-year period is 2.5 million, but I was just wondering if you could look at that. For CIP 2329, and this is for the Waiakoa Gym, thank you very much for doing that, I was wondering if you're gonna put any photovoltaic panels in it, or did you think that it was not necessary, or did you look at that? I noticed that you did that for the Velma McWayne Community Center.

MS. PETERS: Yeah, thank you, Members Sugimura. So for the CBS-1117, the Countywide Parks ADA improvements, that request in Fiscal Year 2021 is \$250,000 and that's to get us started on the design once we get the ADA Transition Plan. We should be receiving that final plan at the beginning of next month.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, excuse me, sorry. I didn't mean...for that one I wanted to suggest that you use grant funding. I apologize for that. The Waiakoa is the one I was wondering about that.

MS. PETERS: Okay, so for the Waiakoa Gym, right now, we don't currently have any plans for the photovoltaic, but we can definitely look at it. What we were trying to incorporate as much as possible, what that gym really needed was ADA accessibility as well as some major improvement.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And the 1.6 million, can you look at possibly using bond funds for that?

MS. PETERS: Yes, we can possibly look at that. I'll check with the Budget Office on that.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. And for CBS-1143, Kepaniwai Heritage grounds for fiscal year, for this current fiscal year is 150,000, and I was just curious if all of the...I know we heard from the Filipino community and some of the others and wondering if this would be helping with all of the restoration after that 100-year flood, or where are we on that?

MS. PETERS: Member Sugimura, this year's appropriation request was for the build of the Hawaiian Hale. So in Fiscal Year '19, there was grant funding to Lo'iloa. They were unable to utilize the grant funding and requested that the County or Department take on the construction of that Hawaiian Hale.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Very good. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, Member Paltin?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Department, for being here. My first question is about the CORA, Ocean Recreational Activity Fund, if you know the current balance, and then about the CORA study if you think that we should postpone it due to the downturn in activity and the situation.

MS. PETERS: We are willing to defer that study being that as a budget or this request was proposed during...or before the pandemic. So, it would make more sense just to have it deferred, and then as far as the budget that's currently in that account...

MR. BUCK: Four hundred ninety-four thousand two hundred and eight dollars.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. And then summer is almost coming up, and I know there's so much uncertainty. Do you have any plans for the PALS program or deadlines that you need to make a decision by?

MS. PETERS: So, right now the PALS hiring as well as registration has been suspended. We're also doing DOE site...our request has been rescinded as well for use of DOE sites for the program. So, what we may do and what we're looking at doing is following with the DOE and what they have recommended through CDC guidelines is opening back up four weeks after there have been no confirmed cases.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, your...you guys are going to submit to us like say we have to make cuts what your top cuts would be?

MS. PETERS: Correct. So, one of the questions on our communication with our 5 percent reduction in our budget, and yes we will be highlighting those priorities.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. And then I think maybe a couple of other testifiers, maybe someone else mentioned it, but the Parks security officers, can they also...do they have any, like, training that deals with how to assist homelessness or any capabilities to assist in that area, and can their training be done remotely?

MS. PETERS: Thank you for that question, Member Paltin. The Parks security officers, they educate and enforce and their training is more on the enforcing and education of the...our Maui County Code 13.04A as wells as our Parks and Administrative Rules. I believe that a position, our liaison would be better served in the Department of Housing and Human Concerns that can more...that's more in their skill set and we can definitely assist with what we've been doing. So, we all work together, all of these departments in coming together with a plan going out, and the Homeless Division, they work hand in hand with our enforcement.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. And then one of the testifiers spoke up about a arborist as well, and I was wondering having had the arborist in Parks before and then moving it completely to Public Works. Would it be more beneficial to have all the arborists in one department, or do you think Parks should have its own arborist?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Paltin. Yes, so a couple years back the arboriculturist was moved to Public Works as it was identified about 70 percent of that position work was dealing with street trees and both reviewed the projects, development projects, so it was better identified and housed in the Department of Public Works. Having a second arboriculturist or arborist, whichever the membership wants, we would then think it would be better in Department of Public Works. Then that, the current position, our Tim Griffith, he's an excellent arboriculturist. They could work hand in hand along with the Department of Public Works has surveyors. They have more of those types of positions that can better assist the arboriculturist, and we work directly hand in hand with him. I think for my, our staff with training, trimming, he goes out and inspects areas of concern and he sits,. we still staff the Arborist Committee, so he sits on that Committee as well and provides us with whatever information we need.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Briefly, can you...the recreation staff that interacts with the public, what are they doing during the stay home at work order?

MS. PETERS: I can turn that over to Deputy.

MR. BUCK: Basically, they're been reassigned to do things like inventories, update the inventories...make sure they're top shape before we go back. A lot of them have been reassigned to things like assisting with the food drives, you know, assisting with the various projects that are going on. They've also been reassigned to answer phones. They've been going out to monitor the parks to make sure there's no additional vandalism. They're doing counts of the number of people in the parks like along the beaches just to give us a second eyes as far as what's going on in the beaches. So, they've been pretty busy, and they've been reassigned a lot of other duties, and it's been a...answers to the Committee, questions that the Committee had asked for.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, I appreciated Ms. Paltin's question, 'cause I've been receiving those questions from our community, our public also about who is being furloughed at home with pay versus those who've been furloughed with no pay from the private sector. So, I don't know about my colleagues, but I get that question a lot. For today, Chair, I just wanted to say that I've met with both directors of the departments that is under the purview of Healthy Families, and I am going...taking notes and listening to all my colleagues' comments today as we review Parks and Recs, and I've already met with the directors, and I am, be coming up with my adjustments in my communication to you very shortly. So, thank you very much, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. And then Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hi. Thank you, Madam Chair. And I'm gonna say a few words, but I would like to ask Member Hokama to just add to it, and I...and please don't use that as his time but as my time. Okay, I've been doing some research over the weekend and

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

talking to various people and the future doesn't look all that bright. And what I used to do as Chair back in the day and working with the Administration, I always had and tried to have a good relationship with the Administration, and what I did to save time I would ask the departments what are your priorities. And we reached the point where they trusted me and they told me, and then conversely what are projects you can do without, what are projects that you can wait one year to take on. So, I really would like Karla to think about that because we're all in this together and at some point you need to trust us that if there are things that you know that can wait, we need to know that, because we don't want to delete things that you really need. So, that's one point. The other point is the hotel association laid off, what, approximately 20,000 people, 25,000 people. I checked with a representative over the weekend, and I asked how many do you expect to hire back and when? And the answer was, we will hire back as we receive tourists. So, in other words, if they receive 1,000 tourists they're only gonna hire back enough people to handle 1,000 people, not 20,000 workers, maybe 1,000 workers. My next question was when do you think you'll be back to where you were pre-COVID-19? And they said, 18 months to 2 years if everything goes okay, because they're expecting, as we have also heard, they're expecting a flare up. So, as things get better, there will be a flare up. Probably more on the mainland than Hawaii because we don't have seasons. Thank God. So, we don't have a fall, and we don't have a winter. So, these to me are important parameters to consider in making our decisions, and it would be so helpful if the departments would let us know, you know, what you need, what don't you need, and for all of us to prioritize in the same direction. In other words, you know, Karla, and you know, John, that what you think the outcome of all of what's happening is gonna be it's gonna be we're gonna have a bigger homeless problem, a bigger houseless problem, people losing their homes, so that's kind of where we should be looking at as a priority, you know, and not worry about this little program and that little program because that can wait. What we need to think about, you know, are bread and butter issues, life and death issues. So, you know, I bring that to you not to depress you but to give you a reality check that all of us have to have, and I wish I had this conversation with all of the Members, but I just found this out over the weekend. And the reason why I was gonna ask Mr. Hokama to add is because he has close ties with the Legislature, which is a big benefit for us and over the weekend more and more I keep hearing about the Legislature not convening. So, Mr. Hokama, I don't know if you have anything to add, but you probably do because of your connections with the Legislature. Can you share with us what you know about a possibility of what's coming up with the State Government?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you very much, Chair Lee. And again, thank you, Chair Rawlins-Fernandez. Again, everything is very fluid. We all know, understand that the circumstances are always changing, but I can tell you this morning that the President, the Senate, the Speaker of the House, the Governor through his office continue to have regular discussions on whether or not the Legislature will be reconvening for this session. Okay. They, by law, they've already passed the biennium budget last year, so technically they don't really have to go back into session. Usually they go in like we do for the adjustments to collective bargaining contracts and other essential required documents, but at this time the Legislature is considering whether or not they can reconvene by May 1<sup>st</sup> as a possibility to finish up what they would like to do or the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

decision is not to go back to session, which more than likely because of their continued adjustments to their general revenue stream, you know, the reality is, people, there will be basically no grant in aids from the State this year, none. They don't...they have no money. It's a sad situation and for us we're gonna need to adjustment our cash accordingly to maintain the liquidity since we cannot print money like the Federal Government. So, that's where we are, and again I just share this that it's a fluid situation, and if it changes I'll be happy to share that with Chair Lee and the rest of the Members. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee and Member Hokama. So, for the other Members' benefit or FYI, Chair Lee did run out of her five minutes and Member Hokama had four minutes left, so I took the time out of Member Hokama's four minutes, although I know Chair Lee asked not to but yeah, and Member Hokama's giving me the A-okay sign. To add to that, really quickly, we, Staff and I met with a Cornell professor over the weekend to discuss funding opportunities from the Federal Government, and I'm waiting to hear back from Finance Director Teruya on his thoughts on what the Federal Government is trying to do to help municipalities with better funding opportunities. So, I'll get back to the Committee on that. That...the article actually Professor Hockett transmitted information on that, and I had staff post that to Granicus. So, if you'd like to read more into the municipalities liquidity program...Municipal Liquidity Facilities Program then that's also on Granicus for your edification.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Also for your information, I, over the weekend, requested a PAF so that staff will compile and summarize all Federal, State, and County programs in an easy-to-read format, and as soon as I get that I will share that with you, and hopefully we can share that with the public.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Perfect. Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay. Next is Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you very much, Madam Chair. Before you start the clock, quick question. I appreciate your flexibility this morning. You've been, being flexible as we move along during this process. Any chance you're gonna let us buy back any of our unused minutes that can be used for other departments? Nah, I just kidding, just kidding. I appreciate your flexibility. Okay, you can go ahead and start the clock on me right now. For the Department, good morning, Director Peters and Director Buck. With regards to Budget Details, Page 12-7, Index Code 915019A, the four E/P security officers. Given the COVID-19 situation with tourism, what is the current need for the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

four additional security officers, and will these officers be assigned to a specific district? And if so, what would be the locations and...okay, that's my first question.

MR. BUCK: Councilmember Molina, it's in our written comments as far as the answer to that.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. All right. For those who may be viewing, can you just give an overview, quick overview?

MR. BUCK: Yeah. Not...the Parks security officers not only do what was related to the tourism and everything else. But then they are also educating the general public as far as the overall rules and everything else. And as it was said earlier that with the economy happening it's going to probably be more of the houseless and probably more people who are not working will be using our facilities, which would put a real...put more demand on the park security officers to go out and educate the people, because their first priority is to educate and, you know, the proper use of the park and follow the rules. But then at the same time, if they don't follow the rules after we redo the education they do decide to follow the rules. With the downturn in tourism, there will probably more people in the parks using the facilities, and we would need to have those additional officers to provide a safe environment for those people who are using the facilities. But, yeah, the people, you know, those who are not working who'd like to have a safe place to, you know, relax and not have to have additional stress, that's the need for the additional security officers. Except for the expansion positions this year for 2020, none of the expansion positions this year was assigned to Kalama Park. The other security officers are put on a rotation basis to cover all of the districts.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Mr. Buck, that's good, Mr. Buck. Thank you. I'm on the clock, so appreciate the responses. Next questions relate to the Details, Page 12-11, regarding the towing request, the 50,000 for removal of abandoned vehicles from County parks. One, will this be a Countywide effort, or is this for specific parks? And can you provide me an estimate of how much funding you would require to remove abandoned vehicles from the Hamakualoa open space property? I participated in a recent cleanup with the Sierra Club out there, and man, no lie, that's...you're gonna open up a used car parking lot out there, there's a lot of stuff out there. Your response, please.

MR. BUCK: The towing contract is for we do work with the abandoned vehicle, but the towing contract is for basically all the parks throughout the Maui County, island of Maui. They are more for the vehicles that pose a safety hazard in the park, or that block access gates, but we, at the same time, we try to, with other vehicles, we try to work with abandoned vehicles. I do not...unless Karla has, I don't really have a cost estimate for Hamakua but maybe Karla has it.

MS. PETERS: Hi, thank you, Member Molina. So, I think a better estimate could be given once we are able to assess how many vehicles are out there, because it's a charge per tow, per storage, and so what we would have to do is get the accurate count of the vehicles, and then we could then work with the Department of Environmental Management abandoned vehicle program as well as utilizing our funding.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, thank you. And why it's important because it kind of ties into the park --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Molina, hold on, Member Molina. Okay. Please proceed.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It was on mute. It got muted, so let me...I'm gonna give you back some time. Okay, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, okay. All right. And my last question for this round is the regarding the Budget Details, Page 12-14, related to the Tom Morrow Equestrian area or arena. There's currently no funding for this facility. Is the County no longer contributing to the arena, and does the County or the Parks Department play any role in the administration or functioning or funding of this facility?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Hold on, Administration. I think you also got muted. Okay, please...will you mind restarting again to, in response to Member Molina?

MS. PETERS: Okay, thank you, Member Molina. So, as far as the Tom Morrow Equestrian Arena, they haven't received any funding since 2016 when they were given a grant for some infrastructure improvements. Currently, right now they have a lease, the Tom Morrow Equestrian Arena is the lessee for that property, and then they manage and maintain and we do not provide funding for that.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, and then with whatever few seconds I have left. Any update on the improvements for the Pā`ia Community Center, and how long you anticipate the improvements will take?

MS. PETERS: For the Pā`ia Community Center, we'll be going into design, once our permitting is completed it would be about an eight-month process for construction once we get our permits and contract.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. All right. Thank you very much. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair, and thank you, Director Peters, specifically for keeping some of our County parks bathrooms open at the residents' request. As you know, our Hāna Beach Park is currently closed and the Helene Hall septic system and what is our anticipated timelines with the completion of the project?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Sinenci. So, right now, what we're trying to do is do a remedial fix on the aerobic treatment units that are currently out there so that we can get the restrooms open. The Department of Environmental Management, we are



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

working with them, they are working on that design for the permanent solution, and then once that comes into play we can request for funding for the construction. So, we're trying to do a remedial fix on the ATUs and then that'll be...we can then open up those restrooms.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: All right. Thank you. Are you looking at a summer or early fall completion?

MS. PETERS: Sorry, Member Sinenci, you came in broken.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just your anticipated time of completion.

MS. PETERS: For, so, for the six of the units, we're looking at probably three to four months, and then for the design I would have to follow up with the Department of Environment Management to see where they're at, and then we can then request for construction funding for the permanent solution.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, thank you. And then can you provide any updates on the civic center renovation, Hāna Civic Center?

MS. PETERS: So, in our Fiscal Year '21, we are asking for funding to start the implementation project for the Old Hāna School renovation based on the assessment that was completed by the consultant.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

MS. PETERS: Sorry, we can't hear you again.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay. Thank you for that report. And then my last question was for goal number 1, item 2 on Page 414, it says to create an efficient and effective permitting process with a high level of customer satisfaction. And so, my question is, is the current permitting process efficient and effective, and is there anything that can be done to streamline the process as it relates to some of our annual events, specifically in Hāna?

MR. BUCK: Thank you, Councilmember Sinenci. The staff has been working internally and externally to determine ways to improve the overall efficiency and effectiveness of current permit process. Some of the key items is external have been improved communication timelines. And in regards to your question about as far as special events like in Hāna, the staff has been meeting on a weekly basis, and one of the goals or one of the processes that they established is that when there is a special event, after the special event they'll be getting together with the permittee for the annual event within 30 days in conclusion of that, so to start the process for next year. So, we are working on improving it. We know that's been a concern, and we've been meeting on a weekly basis to try to streamline a lot of those items.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, thank you, Mr. Buck, for that update. That's all for now, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. You have 30 seconds left. Okay. Most of my questions were already answered. And I guess, Director, in looking at, you know, the proposed CIPs, some of them are over a million dollars, and I guess it's something perhaps that you would send to the Committee at a later time and perhaps work with Member Hokama on. But are some of these CIPs able to wait a year?

MS. PETERS: Yes, thank you, Chair. We are able to defer some of these projects. When we went in for budgeting, we did look at projects that were shovel ready. So, I guess it would just be determinate on the Committee and to see what you folks think. And our Committee Chair Hokama in working with him on those projects that we may want to have a stimulus to the economy since they are shovel ready, that's something that we could look at as well. If it the project would be ready to go, we could get people out there working when this is all said and done.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Okay, yeah, so I guess those were all my questions. I'll look forward to your written response to some of the questions that we submitted to the Department.

MS. PETERS: Thank you. We have those ready for you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, and I'll go back to Committee Vice-Chair King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'll follow up on as far as for Parks, I wanted to follow up on the baseyard because I kind of wondered why it would take only 30,000 and a whole year to determine whether this site would work, and if you were able to determine more quickly than the entire fiscal year would you...how much would you need in that to go into design and engineering? Because I noticed when the last year when we approved for this year the baseyard for the Central Maui Regional Sports Complex that maintenance baseyard that that was 1.7 million was put into for this year for the entire thing. So, I have a little bit of concern about because I know this baseyard is meant to save us money in the long run from having to bring equipment both on Public Works side and Parks side into South Maui from other baseyards. So, can you just explain to me why it takes so long to do the initial siting?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member King. So, for the Central Maui Regional Sports Complex baseyard that was already in a design. We requested for funding for current Fiscal '20 for construction. So, the design, we did a design plan for three baseyards and that's one of them. As far as the South Maui site, we may be able to expedite the feasibility study and be able to work and get all the requirements for the other agencies who want to be part of the consolidated baseyard, and then we could then come in with a better funding, budget amendment to better identify what the costs would be for the actual layout and infrastructure that we would need.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, great, thank you. That, yeah...I didn't realize that you put the design for the other one into something else previously, but it had nothing for, in that particular item for this...for . . . *(inaudible)*. . . other than the 1.7 million, and so anyway I just, that's my biggest concern. But also, Chair, just to use up my last couple of minutes I want to thank Chair Lee for putting that PAF to look at all of the Federal monies that...I've been talking about this since the first, the stimulus package passed, and we have been trying to get from our congressional delegation exactly what is coming to Hawaii. But it keeps changing as we all know, and we have additional stimulus packages since then, and we have different responses from the State, so hoping that the Administration can work with OCS on that review as well to look at what is coming in, what is available to each department, and what, how you would apply that to your priorities. But appreciate these...appreciate the back and forth, you know, and my only comment would be that I wish we could get some more of this priority information out before we get to Budget, because we're always limited before budget on what we can talk about as far as going forward and at some point there's got to be bigger, I think, collaboration so that we can talk to you about what your upcoming priorities are before we get to this point and we don't have to necessarily double up on these meetings. And that's the part that's frustrating for me is, you know, after the budget's already done then getting to that point where we hear from you and we've put our priorities in. So anyway, I'm hoping that we can really distill it down to what are the priorities for the communities, because, you know, obviously in South Maui we have the homeless issue too and we need the departments to be working together. So, we're just struggling to find out, to figure out which departments would take the lead on certain things and we're, you know, you guys have that information. So, I would support the idea of, you know, you, of the departments giving us their priorities, but I also know that, you know, that you're taking direction from the Mayor so the Mayor has to have that input. Thank you, Chair. I appreciate the opportunity.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, I just want to ask these questions and real quick and real fast. So, my first question is just a yes and a no. So, do you think that this pandemic will last more than 12 months? Yes or no?

MS. PETERS: I would say yes, but again everything's fluid, sorry.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay.

MS. PETERS: I would say yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So...okay, thank you. So, do you think that things in 12 months will be same as today, worse than today, or better than today?

MS. PETERS: I would not want to guess.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. So, then my next question is and would've been is does your budget reflect your thoughts about what's going to be coming down 12 months

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

from today? That's what would've been my next question to you. That what are our priorities? Do we all have our eyes on the same priorities? I mean, I'm looking at 12 months not being the same as today. In my head, I think it might be a little bit more worse than today. So, are we planning for the worse that's we think might be coming, or are we planning for the best that we don't know going come or not going come? So, that's just my question because as I deliberate about what's important to us and what's important to our people, our people are suffering today, we need to have access for them today and that's where my head is at. So, thank you for your honesty. Thank you for responding and probably of course and it's very difficult to answer even for all of us, but I'm happy nonetheless that the discussion's still out there on the table. So, thank you, Director. Thank you, Chair.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Kama.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Okay, Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. I just wanted to thank Chair Lee for bringing up the discussion. It's definitely important that all of us know that this pandemic and tying into what Pro Temp Kama just said. This pandemic and its impact is gonna affect many, many lives, and families, homeless, as well as those that are no longer working as the hotels have closed. So, we have big decisions on our plate, and I think I'm...I think we're, for myself, it would not be a good time to start a new program or to do something that would add expenses to the budget but to look at where we can cut back. And I appreciate the Parks Department, and I think Member Hokama is sort of thinking about the same thing. I look forward to receiving his recommendations that is gonna come forward. I just want to say one thing on the CIP 1117 and it's on ADA. I have some grants that I wanted to send to the Parks Department to possibly, you know, go after. You have Lyle Kobashigawa on the line and he's your grants administrator. Is that right, Department?

MS. PETERS: Yes, he's our Grants Coordinator.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Very good. So, could I send you some possible grants that we could go after to help us maybe defray --

MS. PETERS: Yes, absolutely. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --some of the costs, yeah. Thank you. That's it. That's it, Chair.

MS. PETERS: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Paltin?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Department. As far as, you know, hard topics, this one is a hard topic for me, I don't enjoy to bring it up but, you know, I was looking over our water delivery charges and I found out that that's not drinking water. And, you know, for West Maui we've gone from like 500,000 to 700,000 and, you know, I know we're a drier area than the rest of the island but being that we're looking at tight times ahead and I know that jumping castle water slides have an exemption. What would it take to pass on the cost of doing that in our County parks to the companies that do that for a profit, because we can't continue to afford to allow that, and is that an administrative rule change or is it something that you need the Council to help with?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Paltin. So, that's something that we could look into as far as when our concession admin rules are completed as a concession program, so vendors would have to bid on an RFP that would allow only certain vendors to be able to rent those types of bouncy castles or those with, that contain water. Currently, right now, we do not allow them within the parks. It was a hard thing to try and figure out as far as the permit . . . *(inaudible)* . . . so people wanting to permit out. It's just the water cost is the, these, the water we see is left on from the time they start the party at 8 o'clock 'til they leave at 7:00 p.m. that night. So, we saw that happening in this past summer. It was a very hot, dry summer and there were a lot of these within the parks. So, I think that would be best served as a concession where then the vendors would bid on them and we would then get that money directly back into our Special Revolving Fund for the Parks Department that could then offset the water cost.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, until the concession plan is done, what is the plan for the water slides?

MS. PETERS: Currently, right now, we are recommending that they do not use them. So, we started a water conservation project in working with the Water Department and just seeing that there is a water...there's a shortage of water everywhere and water is such a precious resource, so we have our committee coming out with messaging. We're gonna be posting that throughout the parks. Also we're...we will have our park security officers to educate our party or our community and just let them know that, you know, we, although that you can have those bouncy castles in the park without the water, we encourage to not have these water slides because again they run throughout the course of the day, they also cause a safety hazard because it then erodes part of the parks and people can walk through.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Vendors as well, the water slide vendors so that it's not the point where people come to the park, they paid their water slide person and they're ready to party and then the Parks officer is like, no, you cannot do it, you're in my kid's fifth birthday or whatever. Are you proactively reaching out to the people that are doing that business?

MS. PETERS: So currently, right now, we have not reached out to them. It's been pretty much a word of mouth from all of our constituents that call in and ask these types of questions as well as our permit holders. So, there are a permit holders who rent areas that are

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

permitted that ask about 'em and then we then advise them that we'd like to not include that in the park due to the water use as well as safety hazards.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And what about like keying of the outlets, do you think that is a conservation method that you would pursue?

MS. PETERS: So, we did do that after...so, in June at the end of Fiscal Year '19, when we saw such a high use of water and we did an analysis over the other parts of the other fiscal years and saw that huge spike. We had our park districts go through and then put either key it and drop it down into a bell box just so that those areas that we saw where the water spigots were heavily used and exposed, they were locked or dropped down.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Department. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No questions for the Department, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Council Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Karla, first of all, I want to thank you and the Department for your work at Kanahā by the sewer treatment plant. I know you're doing a good job because when Tasha and I spoke to the homeless down there, they knew you by your first name and that's always a good sign, and they were very grateful, very grateful for you, Housing and Human Concerns, and Public Works. You probably noticed, Karla, that today's homeless is a little bit different. That they're a little bit more responsible. They actually have rules down there. There's a curfew that people follow. Everybody shares in the pickup of the rubbish and everybody shares in the cleanup of the trash and shares in the use of the food, I meant. So, as time goes on and if things get worse where people, you know, need to find more shelter, I'm hoping that you will continue to help them as you have been, because like I said, today's homeless is much more responsible. We shouldn't treat them like abandoned vehicles. They are human beings. And I'm hoping that when we start dealing with those who might lose their homes, so the other type of homeless, I'm hoping that the Federal and State governments and the banking institutions will step up for those people, and then we would be sort of like the backup. So, you know, I'm hoping that this is the way things unfold, but in the meantime we may be needing to ask you to use maybe small portions of certain parks, you know, to take care of the homeless during this, the duration of the crisis. And one of the homeless guys did tell me that, you know, thank you for the County bringing in those sanitizing, you know, the hand washing machines and the showers, because they're afraid of getting the virus too. So, I just wanted to say thank you, give you a shout-out to your Department. Thank you.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair Lee. We appreciate it. We appreciate your support, and we will be working with all of the other agencies, hopefully, to monitor and see what we need to do.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you very much, Madam Chair. For the Department, again with regards to the restrooms for Ha'ikū, any update, any chance that can be expedited 'cause whenever I go out to the community association meetings I'm constantly asked that question now? What's the latest on that?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Molina. So, right now, it's currently in design. We are requesting the additional funding in this coming Fiscal Year '21 Budget for the wastewater system. Our consultant has identified with such a large use that it's gonna be getting out there that we need to upsize that. So, we will go in for permitting. We did put the consultant on task and expedite that design process. We will then go out for permitting and then we will follow up with all of the review agencies to ensure we can get that expedited and then that project would go out to bid and get constructed.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, thank you. And then for the lower Pā'ia parking lot, any details on that project, and will this project result in more stalls for Pā'ia?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Molina. So, the project right now, the current area there is no identified parking and people just park the way they see fit. So, what we are gonna do is be able to create a more safer environment in which we probably can get about 55 stalls, we'll have ADA stalls as well as ADA access to the park. So, it's a little bit scary right now, there are people, you know you've seen them on wheelchairs or people mobility impaired and there's no way for them to get into the park safely with all the way people are just parking out there. So, it'll be a more uniform area as well as ADA accessible.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, thank you. That'll be much appreciated by the community. And lastly, with regards to the War Memorial Gym improvements, Members, Page 725 of the public...Budget Overview. The proposal is roughly \$11 million for the entire project. Any chance because of the situation that we're in right now that funding for this project could be spread out over a couple of years to lessen the burden on debt ratios, and is it anticipated that you folks are gonna raise the building because of the current state of repair, and realistically how the completion of this project 18 months in the times that we're in? Anyway, if you could give us some comments as far as your target completion date of this project, and I know it's a major one.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Molina. So, funding required for this project would increase if it was spread out over several years. So, what happens is the overall construction, if we were to require the contractor to phase it they would have to mobilize each time, so that increases the cost. Also, our community what we found is once they shut down a facility they want it done. You know, they don't want to come...we open it back up and then we have to shut it again. So, our goal is go in one time, we impact the community for a little bit, they're gonna...we can have overflow for the gym now at South Maui because we have our new South Maui Gym so that's a plus and then, yeah, get the work

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

done. The current scope does call for replacement of a portion of the building that's attached to the gym; however, it might change because what we're trying to do is incorporate into the design and enhance hurricane protection areas, so that it is a shelter once it's completed. So, that really may change the design of it a bit, but we are currently in design and it is anticipated that we can get this project done within that 18-month window.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, great, all right. Thank you very much for your responses, Director Peters and also Director Buck. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just wanted to show my appreciation for the Members turns about the budget especially when addressing the pandemic and looking at the long term going a year and even perhaps 18 months. I also appreciate, you know, your input about bringing in some economists like the Cornell professor, I feel like as we go through this project, I almost need some input from economists to kind of share some of the future forecasts when the sitting on a lot of these items. So, I'm appreciative of that. My question for the Director is on Page 436 under machinery and equipment, there's a large increase of upwards of over 2.1 million, and I was wondering if what accounts for the increase and if some of 'em, some of the needed items can be deferred.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Sinenci. Yes, so we did put in for replacements and new equipment. We will give our priority in our written response as to what is absolutely necessary in looking at the pandemic and the overall outcome of the budget.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, thank you, Director. And, Chair, that's all I have for now. But again, my appreciation to the Department for being so flexible during these times. Mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci.

MS. PETERS: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And I guess with my last five minutes, I'll just also express my appreciation, Director, to you and your Department echoing Council Chair Lee's sentiments of, you know, really trying to help our community, everyone in our community during this crisis. I really appreciate your, you know, going in person and meeting with our community members and working with everyone who is trying their best to serve and to survive during this time. So, that's all. Mahalo, Director, to you and your Department. And we'll look forward to receiving in written response your priorities, so that we can make the appropriate reductions where possible.

MS. PETERS: Thank you. Thank you, Chair. Yes, and I'd just like to thank, you know, all of our workers. Without our team, you know, our Department would not be where it is today. We do have everyone working, so we came up with response plans on how to deal with the COVID-19, and we have staff...we have some staff who can telework,



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

teleworking, but 90 percent of our staff is on the ground, they're out there working hard. And I want to thank all of them and their supervisors, because they make...their dedication to the community is what really helps our Department.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Absolutely. When we had our drive-thru testing and screening, they were critical in making sure that the lines flowed nicely, and it went really smoothly, so you know, my hat's off to your workers.

MS. PETERS: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, we have six priority proposals starting with Member Paltin. So, I'll put four minutes on the clock. Member Paltin had two proposals, and I guess we'll go to Member Molina. Member Paltin might be on a call right now. Member Molina, you had two proposals --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --. . .*(inaudible)*. . .

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh okay. Madam Chair, you want me to do my two of 'em back to back or pause? Two one time?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, all right, here we go. My first proposal is in Parks Administration, Page 12-11, Details. The current Mayor's appropriation for the towing is 50,000. My proposal is to increase that appropriation to 100,000. Purpose is to remove abandoned vehicles from the Hamakualoa Open Space Preserve. Now, I know this would typically be in the DEM budget but Parks has a towing charge line item that seemed appropriate for this County open space, and the community has been participating in numerous volunteer cleanups, which I mentioned earlier that I was a part of, and the area certainly a dumping ground for trash and abandoned vehicles. So therefore, to assist the community with the cleanup, I believe it's necessary to remove the many abandoned vehicles that are out there and the Parks Department is moving forward on a cultural and historical assessment of the area, which everybody really appreciates, so the efforts to develop a master plan of the area is moving forward and discussions are occurring to allow Mālama Maui Nui right of entry is moving forward as well. So, to help with this process and claiming the open space, the residents have desired for the removal of the abandoned vehicles to enhance their community cleanup efforts. Okay, and then my second priority request relates to the Kalakupua Playground at Giggle Hill on a Countywide park playground improvements request for a new item of \$15,000. The appropriation is for a slide and climbing deck for the playground. Ha'ikū Community Association has adopted this playground and has dedicated hundreds of hours towards improving and maintaining the park, and one of the last items of the improvement the community would like to make to the park is to add the slide, and a proposed appropriation is for replacement slide manufactured by Landscape Structures incorporated and is identified as a Cloudburst Slide, and the community has done a lot

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

of work on this park and without asking too much from the County. So therefore, to help contribute this important effort, I would ask the County to purchase the slide the community has requested, and the estimate for the cost of the slide was provided to our office by the Ha'ikū Community Association. So, there are my two priority requests, Madam Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay. Members, we'll go with one question, one follow-up, starting with Committee Vice-Chair King, and we'll go to Pro Temp Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you, Chair. I guess my question is on the abandoned vehicle issue we, you know, the abandoned vehicle funding is through EP&S, and so is there reason that they couldn't handle this under their current funding, Mr. Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: You know, as far as in discussion with DEM, didn't have a lot of time to discuss that particularly with DEM, but we thought we'd tie it into Parks doing that master plan out there. And since there was already a line item from Parks for the towing, we thought we'd maybe add it, add an additional 100,000 to the 50,000 that was put in.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, that would be--a follow-up, Chair--that would hiring private towers to do this work instead of using our County, whatever our County is already...I mean, we have...I thought we had a system of abandoned vehicle removal already that was pretty well funded.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I don't really know that answer. Whatever it takes whether it's done through, you know, the folks that we already have contracted out or using someone else. I'm just kind of looking at the estimate of the additional cost it would take to remove the abandoned vehicles from the Hamakualoa area.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, maybe can we get a response from the Director, maybe?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Director?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member King and Member Molina. So, I believe that we would want to work with the Department of Environment Management on this, maybe where it fits more towards their abandoned vehicle program. Our current appropriation is requested for use for those vehicles that block access or they cause a...or end up being in the park where they cause some safety issues. Those vehicles are at Hamakualoa are clearly abandoned, so we may want to reach out to DEM and get better clarification and then look to see where the money would be best fit.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you, Chair. That's all the questions I have.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Pro Temp Kama?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I have no questions for Member Molina. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, thank you. Yeah, I understand what Member King is talking about in terms of the DEM funding with Tamara Falkner.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Farnsworth?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Farnsworth.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Farnsworth. Anyway, so maybe we can ask there to see what kind of funding they have. On your slide for the Giggle Hill playground, are you speaking that it should be part your 140,000 district pot, or are you talking about separately?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: This would be a separate request, 15,000.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah. So, you...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: But wherever it fits, I mean, if it's more appropriate to come out of my whatever in my parks assessment district amount, so be it, but again I just put it out there. As you know, as you know in your district you made a big plea for a playground, so I certainly agree with you on the importance of having our playgrounds and improving our existing playgrounds. So, that's basically my spiel and the community association has been asking for it, and they put in a lot of voluntary hours to help upkeep that park as well.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, I'm sorry. I don't mean to say they don't deserve it. I was just wondering what pot of money you're gonna get it from, so that's all. Thank you. I think you answered, yeah, you said wherever, so.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. No questions on the Giggle Hill. Just...is...sorry. Is Hamakualoa Open Space Preserve part of the Parks Department?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah...yeah. Yeah, you want me to answer that or you would you like Parks? But it does come under their jurisdiction, they're working on the master plan with the community.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: It's part of that open space we just purchased, that Lot 6.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, all the open space that we purchase goes under the Parks Department?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: For that area, I believe so. But you might want to ask...maybe Parks can verify that.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Paltin. No, not all open space goes under the Parks Department. For Hamakualoa it did, and so right now we're doing a cultural study of the parcel. We're also working with the Maui, Hamakualoa, Maui on getting the right of entry, so that they do a great job in helping us clean it up.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But the area across from Mile Marker 13.5 that doesn't belong to the Parks?

MS. PETERS: I would have to go and follow up on that. Are you talking about Ukumehame?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah.

MS. PETERS: Okay, I would have to go look at that exact area. There is...there's some parks parts and some is EO'd from the State.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay, 'cause it seems like we're dealing with a similar type of issue of these County-owned properties that are filled with abandoned vehicles, and I think that we should address them maybe Countywide or but we just don't know how, you know.

MS. PETERS: So, I believe that area where all that abandoned vehicles are that is State. They went in a couple of times already, removed and then as fast as they removed 'em they find more there.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, it's my understanding the biggest portion is County. There is a small State portion and there's a small private portion, so that's the problem with the multiple ownership.

MS. PETERS: Yeah, we can go look into that for you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, thanks, Chair. No, I can appreciate Mr. Molina's concern. That was the concern when Council considered purchasing the land. And we had at that point in time two members, I think it was Cochran and Guzman who volunteered to help develop a management plan for the land we acquired. But it just proves to me that we need a land management component, and I think it's smart the Mayor's asking for that 'cause, yeah, Parks, Environmental Management, we got too many overlapping departments with nobody really being in charge. So, I like Mr. Molina's support for that.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

My only question for the other one for Mr. Molina is you looking for a grant, Mr. Molina, to a specific manufacturer for your slide, or you want just a regular County procurement and that's the type of slide you want to consider?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you for the question, Member Hokama. Basically, I was initially looking for it out of Parks CIP, any park assessment funds, but if there's an opportunity for a grant, that's great. I was given the recommendations for this type of slide by the community association who've been doing a lot of volunteer work to help us upkeep that park, and so that's, you know, that was my approach with this proposal, Mr. Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, oh, okay. Thanks. I just wanted to know which method you were preferring. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, you know, for me that, you know, either way whichever works best. The main thing is we can assist the community with getting that slide out there. Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, I'm supportive of Member Molina's ask for added towing charges. I know it's not for rural communities like myself but just speaking from remote areas, you know, we do have and I wanted to bring up with the Director that we, I believe, the parks has some old vehicles, it's always hard to tow them from the remote areas. So, I think it should...I support hiring private towers. This is a great time to be on the road because there's hardly any traffic right now, so I would support immediacy when it comes to towing vehicles. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hello, Chair? Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Did you skip me?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I did. I'm sorry. I always forget that you sit in my seat.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I feel like an abandoned vehicle.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's a good thing we're putting money into the budget for it. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, thank you. So, what I would like to say is I fully support Member Molina. The more money we put toward removing abandoned vehicles the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

better. They're all over this island. And then, of course, I support the funding for the playground equipment. That's all I have to say. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, and, yeah, I don't have any questions, Member Molina, supportive. Okay, and the next priority item is from Member Sinenci. Turn on your mic.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Pa`ani Mai Park..

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, thank you. So, Members, the Pa`ani Mai Park is one of the three parks that we have in Hāna and with the closure of the beach park that we just have this one of two parks that are open right now. The Pa`ani Mai Park is situated right off the highway, so it doesn't have any large parking to access the bathroom, and so the Pa`ani Mai Park project has been in, ongoing for the last ten years. And so, we're looking to acquire putting an access from the bottom Uakea Road and pave the road and provide handicap parking at the bathroom side. So, this would be the next step in implementing the master plan, the design, survey, et cetera. Thank you, Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Committee Vice-Chair King, question?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Are we doing...Chair, are we doing two rounds on that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Two rounds on what?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, I'm sorry. I thought we were still on Mr. Molina's item.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, Member Sinenci proposed his priority item, which was regarding Pa`ani Mai Park.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, okay. Yeah, that, no, I support it. I don't have any questions about that. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Okay, Members, let's see, we'll go to Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. No questions. I think this is a good proposal. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member...Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I support. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. No abandoned vehicle. Got you. Okay, Member Hokama?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: My only question for my colleague is this is enough to do all those requirements, Mr. Sinenci, access or any acquisition, the paving, and the handicap requirements with the design and survey, that's enough money? How big you looking at?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: It might be just part of it, and I don't know if the Director is aware of the project. If I can defer to Director Peters about the Pa`ani Mai access road?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Director?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you.

MS. PETERS: Chair, thank you, Member Sinenci. So, in last year we met with Hāna Ranch, and so we need to acquire that parcel from them in order to get the road, that roadway that we're proposing from Uakea Road to the park site including two drainage easements. So, we have a consultant who has already done that portion of the design. What we would have to go back in and just relook and make sure everything once we get the land acquisition from Hāna Ranch that everything is still the same that we don't have to do any other type of surveying, and then we should be ready to put that project out to bid. We did present to the community and like Member Sinenci said this has been a ten year long project. So, in...this was in about three or four years ago when we looked at that option of the access road. It was about \$981,000 for the construction. So, we would have to take in the inflation factor, get a new probable cost estimate from the consultant. The 250, I believe, would get us to the point where we could get the project out to bid once we can secure the land acquisition and finalize the drawing.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, Director, when you send out to bid this is enough to get the land acquisition? How much does it take to get the land 'cause until you get the land we not doing the project? So, what does Mr. Sinenci need...what do we need to give Mr. Sinenci enough money to buy the land?

MS. PETERS: We are still in discussions with Hāna Ranch and have not gotten that information.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Oh but they're making us wait ten years. So, 250 can buy the land?

MS. PETERS: That I would not be able to answer. Again, I would have to follow up with Mr. Lammers of Hāna Ranch or Bio-Logical Capital is who we met with last year to look at that being able to provide us with that access.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. Well, if you can give Mr. Sinenci a good estimate, so we can plug in the right number for your acquisition that would help us. Thank you.

MS. PETERS: Thank you. Yes, thank you, Mr. Hokama, we will.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No questions. I support Member Sinenci.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member...Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I have no questions for Mr. Sinenci.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo. I don't have any questions either. I'm supportive. Okay, Member Paltin, you have two priority proposals.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I don't know if we wanted to get the resource if anybody had questions for the water refill station priority, but I can just go over the two priorities right now, if you'd like?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, please.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. So, my first priority is for each district to have at least one water refill station. It didn't really matter to me what the brand was just that we have one, and it, I felt like it flowed along in line with Member Sinenci's ordinance that he passed regarding plastics. It's a really good way to, you know, start to train folks to bring their own water bottle and, you know, our civic station...our civic center social halls are heavily used when we're not in pandemics for, you know, one year baby parties, graduations, and all sorts of family events, and you know, there's so much people that buy cases and cases of water, and so that's, you know, how much we can cut down on plastics and help out families in their expenses. We did the math and I think it's broken down here on my priority sheet, Page 13, and I put 10 even though there's 9 of our districts so somebody can have an extra one. And I just think that's the direction we're going to. Hopefully, you know, it can also serve a lot of our social halls and those places can be sort of a resiliency hub place so it would have water. For my next item is Shiraishi Pool. I had an opportunity to utilize that pool as Sakamoto was shut down for that length of time, and it's such a beautiful pool. It's used by many of our ADA persons, and it's used for therapy. It's the County's oldest only saltwater pool, and it was a big concern to a lot of the users, you know, some of them are allergic to chlorine and whatnot that when the pool breaks there's no plans to fix it, and it's not financially feasible to fix the pool. And so, you know, when Member Hokama brought up the opportunity zone funding and that this pool is within that district area a lot of folks got excited about the possibility of if not rehabilitating the pool, recreating the pool to, you know, the same dimensions, same saltwater pool, and whatnot. The lifeguards there really take great care of it and, you know, so many people from the neighborhood can just walk right there with the Catholic Charities senior building coming up just down the street. It's very centrally located for a lot of people to make use of, and get exercise, rehab, and therapy, and that's my proposals. Questions?



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. We also have Mr. Watkins still on if anyone has questions for him regarding Member Paltin's proposal. Okay. Start with Committee Vice-Chair King, and then to Pro Temp Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for the proposals, Councilmember Paltin. I'm really excited about the water refill stations. I just wondered if you were planning to have amount, this amount, or amount similar put in as a grant request or an RFP so we could get the responses from the different companies that do this, or if this was going to be a direct proposal to give to the company, the one company that came and presented.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For me?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I would leave it to the Department of Parks and Recreation of how they would like to pursue it.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. And so, because I was just thinking if it's gonna be an RFP, it probably needs to be a little bit larger number rounded off or something and then just let people put their proposals in, but I'm glad you've been working to, you know, give us all the details of what that is, because you're right, it does dovetail nicely into the thing where, the ban on single-use plastic that we're trying to do. And we haven't addressed bottles in that ban, so this is gonna help with the reduction of the plastic water bottles, so that was my only concern about that. And then my only comment on the other one is the opportunity zoning, zone is not a fund, it's a tax credit given to people who invest, so this would have to be something worked out with trying to bring investors in for the tax credit that they could get for investing in opportunity zones that are low, it's low, for low-income areas. But I support that, the upkeep of this pool, and so whatever renovation, however it has to get done. It might be something that the County has...the County...does the County own this right now? Okay, so if it's a County facility, it might be something that the County has to get involved in directly, but I just wanted to comment that that, that the opportunity zone...you know, I've been to some of the workshops as Mr. Hokama has as well and it's not that they give out money, the government gives out money for these types of things, it's they give tax credits to people who invest in low-income areas. That's all. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I have no questions for Member Paltin. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Sugimura?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I have a...I like the proposal, Tamara, about the pool, and I wonder what the Department has to say. Are you not planning on renovating it or fixing it if it...

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Member Sugimura. So, we did a assessment of our aquatic facilities, and in 2019 the consultant came up with an opinion of probable cost. So, they said that it would probably be...I'm sorry, was it...it was 2017, \$1.3 million for the, it's not reconstruction, but we would rehabilitate the pool and the surrounding areas so would be the restrooms and the office and the building. It would be that entire complex.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, you are planning on taking this up in a future fiscal year?

MS. PETERS: As far as what the assessment said it was to reassess to see if it made sense to keep the pool in, online but, you know, like Councilmember Paltin had mentioned it is the only saltwater pool on island, so it may be advantageous for us to relook at that as well as the other pools that are nearby and see maybe taking one of them offline, or recreating into some other type of aquatic facility. Just because right now we have a little...we have a hard time getting pool guards, so we were looking at trying to maybe have our pools spaced out a little further. Although, you know, again this was all just a discussion that was made with our consultants, it did have some public meetings, of course, nobody wants to decommission any pool on island.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Hokama, then Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yeah, no, I'm happy to consider Ms. Paltin's request. Swimming pools are very expensive items, we know that. It's a high expense for us, but again we need to consider facilities and how we gonna make the community have the benefit during this different normal, normalcy. My one question for the Department is I don't see this really as a CIP regarding refilling stations or water flow refill stations. I don't know why you couldn't look at your R&M Budget currently and just consider this an upgrade to the current water fountains that we currently have at the facilities and put that attachment for the water bottle refill. We have it at our senior centers already, just like how airports did it, their conversions of water fountains. It's not a big expensive thing to do, and it doesn't take rocket science. So, my thing is I don't know why we cannot do this immediately and look at our R&M Budget of the Department and see if that fits the current needs. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama.

MS. PETERS: Thank you. We can look at that as well.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I support and I certainly support trying to find more economical ways to make this happen. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Member Molina, and then Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you, Madam Chair. I like both proposals, especially the water refill proposal. I am seeing a lot of it, that type of education or mindset change on our kids in the schools, so which is where we have to start, so I think it's a very good way to reduce the amount of plastic bottle usage and to encourage more drinking of water. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I'm supportive as well. Good proposals. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, I guess I just have one question. I'm generally supportive. For the water refill stations, I know there's some discussion about how we would make that work, but and I know that we have one testifier that consistently comes before us pitching FloWater. I guess my question probably would be for the Director on how procurement for that would work? I don't think we can name the agency that we would purchase the equipment from. I could be wrong.

MS. PETERS: So, we would put together an invitation for bids and included in that would be the specification, so if it's the desire to have a particular type of water filling station, we would put that in the specifications, and then those qualified within put in their bids, and then the low bid would get, be contract. Currently right now, we purchase our water filling stations from the local plumbing company here. In fact, we just installed one at the civic center about a month ago.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Okay, so that's it. Oh, okay. And that...so, mahalo, Member Paltin. I have one priority proposal and that is for the renovation and maintenance of the Kilohana Recreational Center on Moloka'i for...it says 120,000, but I would need to correct that. It's for 250,000. And it's important because it's the only community public facility on the East End or east of Kaunakakai Town. And it's...it also serves as a staging site for emergency services during natural disasters. It hasn't been renovated or upgraded for over 20 years. And Kilohana School along with various community members and organizations use the center to offer free educational and cultural workshops to the community. And, yeah, so those were all the reasons that I'm proposing this today. Mahalo. And then Director, did you want to comment on the proposal, and then I'll go to Committee Vice-Chair King?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. So, I...the only recommendation I would have would that...we would include that as a CIP project, and then would the 250 be for design or for the actual improvement?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The actual improvement.

MS. PETERS: Oh no, sorry. That was the question, was the...were your intentions that the 250,000 be for the design of the improvement?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is your question because it's not enough for the actual improvement?

MS. PETERS: We would have to go get an assessment to see what needs to be done. So, I can...we can look at it and include in our response.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Director.

MS. PETERS: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Wow, are we timing our questions?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: My proposal.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, oh, your proposal.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And I didn't turn it off.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, I forgot.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well anyway, it was...it's a good proposal. I support community facilities and especially as we get into with the Climate Action and Resilience Committee into the...looking at resilience hubs, we need these facilities in every community. We need like centers where people can start planning where their resiliency hubs are gonna be used. So, I'm supportive, although I had that same question was whether this was gonna be enough so but the Department's gonna be looking at it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, and then we'll go to Member Sinenci, and then Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I'm supportive. I know the area of Mana'e, East Moloka'i, and I can see where the community has to always drive into Kaunakakai to get anything, so especially for emergency purposes, so maika'i loa kākou.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. I appreciate it. The proposals, no questions at this time. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Nothing. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No, I like this idea, and yeah, Chair, I would ask that you consider designing construction for flexibility. My one question is is this right next to that proposed lot we were considering purchasing for Fire Department --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: --by the school?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It also serves as a...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Great. Then I would say in the next proposed round from Congress for state and county governments part of the response for shelters and emergencies is this type of consideration, Chair. So, we might be able to get some Federal support for this project. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No questions. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Sounds like a good project, Keani. No questions. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I have no questions, Chair, but I think Member Hokama had a great idea, so we should pursue it. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Okay. Okay, Members, those were all the priority proposals, and we are pau with Parks. Any last questions or comments before we thank Director and Deputy Director for coming? Okay. Mahalo, Director Peters and Deputy Director Buck, for joining us today. Oh, Member Paltin?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, I just was wondering if they did select a cultural assessment consultant for the Hamakualoa property.

MS. PETERS: Can you repeat the question?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I was wondering if you folks have selected a cultural assessment consultant for the Hamakualoa property.

MS. PETERS: Yes, we did. I would just have to get you that information, and I don't have the consultant firm's name with me.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay. Mahalo, Director Peters and Deputy Director Buck, for joining us today.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. Can I ask a quick question? Would we be able to get all of these questions from today's meeting in writing, so we can accurately respond back as well as we'll send our questions that you sent initially?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, we'll address that today. Mahalo, Director.

MS. PETERS: Thank you. Thank you all. Stay safe.

\*\*\*\*\*

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members. Mahalo. Okay, we are ahead of schedule. Good job, Members. So, next we have Department of Personnel Services followed by Planning. And we're scheduled to continue with Parks at 1:30 after lunch, but we can...we'll be going straight to Department of Personnel Services, and if Members would like we can take a hour-and-a-half lunch break. Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Reward. It's a reward --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes, yes, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --for everyone's hard work.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Quick before you change your mind.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, it's almost 12 o'clock and we'll return at 1:30, and --

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --we'll just double check with Budget Director Yoshimura to see if Department of Personnel Services will be able to join us at 1:30. It's about an hour before we had asked them to join us.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, I just sent them an e-mail to be ready at 1:30.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, great. Okay, mahalo, Budget Director Yoshimura. Member Molina, did you have a question?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, no, Madam Chair. I was just stretching, ready to get up and start my lunch. No questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. If there aren't any additional questions or comments we'll take lunch for today. So, we'll recess until 1:30 p.m. So, the...it's 11:56 and we'll reconvene at 1:30 p.m. today. The Economic Development and Budget Committee is now in recess. . . .*(gavel)*. . .

RECESS: 11:56 a.m.  
RECONVENE: 1:32 p.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please return to order. It is 1:30 on April 13. And we are now going to be meeting with Department of Personnel Services. We have with us Director David Underwood and Deputy Director Cynthia Razo-Porter. Aloha. Okay. Director Underwood, would you like to start off with some opening remarks?

**DEPARTMENT OF PERSONNEL SERVICES**

MR. UNDERWOOD: Yeah, I was gonna ask your pleasure, Chair,, I can give a couple...maybe just an outline of the changes in our priorities if that would help the Committee, that might answer some of the questions that you have and save time for other questions if that's acceptable to you. Okay?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Mahalo.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Members of the Committee. Just a quick intro. We're Department of Personnel Services, the central HR department for the County. We currently have an authorized strength of 18 positions. Our budget is about \$1.8 million. All of our positions are permanent County-funded positions. There's no grant funds, no special funds, no LTAs. We currently have two vacancies both under active current recruitment. In terms of the requested changes for our budget this year, I'll kind of go down the list in priority order. Our first ask was the addition of two human

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

resource specialist trainee positions. That's a total of \$58,280 in salary costs plus additional 4,000 in equipment. And I would note that some of that 58,000 would be recouped through savings over our current...so it's actually a net of 31,000. We're also proposing additional \$20,000 for additional e-learning content, additional \$20,000 for leadership development training, an additional \$3,200 to increase employee recognition program. The other significant changes that I think some of the Committee Members noticed were we did make changes to some of our program goals. We anticipate a large increase in number of training courses offered, and training class attendance, and a large increase in the number of personnel transactions processed. So, I'll kind of go through those real quick and kind of give you some background why we anticipate that and why we're making those asks. Our first priority is, of course, the two additional human resource trainee positions, and we do ask typically for trainee positions and that is because public sector human resources is very specialized. We operate under very specific laws, we have different compliance requirements, we have different labor relations legal framework. So, it's very difficult to recruit somebody at a fully experienced level to come in just because there's very few of them in the State. So, typically we prefer to recruit at a training level, it gives us a good broad base to choose from, and then we'll train about in what we need them to know. That would increase our funding for our E/P count from 18 to 20. From a little bit of history, we used to have 20 authorized FTE. We lost two in the last economic downturn. Since that time, we have focused on automation and trying to streamline operations as much as possible. So, since, I mean '11, 2010, 2011, we have now all of our recruiting is now online, applications are online, certifications in Department are all electronic, a lot of our personnel transactions are now electronic online, our learning classroom signups, administration is all electronic online, our internal work assignment and collaboration is all internal online. So, that was our focus, because we wanted to be able to make sure we tried everything we did, could do, before we asked for additional positions. 'Cause we recognize that additional positions are an ongoing cost, and it is a substantial financial commitment. So, we have done all that, and we still do need those positions to deliver services. A lot of our services are just delivered with . people talking to people, people coaching people, people training people, and so we can't get away from a certain amount of human contact and human effort that is actually needed. We do usually include some of our staffing benchmarks in our budget, and we do that so you kind of get an idea of how we compare to organizations across the country. The three big HR staffing metrics that organizations across the country tend to use are how many HR employees you have per 100 in FTE. The nationwide average on that varies from about 1.5 to 2.5 depending on who's doing the polling and how they calculate it. We have 0.7 at this point, so we're about half the national average, a little under. Another benchmark that you see quite a bit is the HR budget as a percentage of your total budget. Nationwide that averages about 1.5 percent. We are about 0.3 percent of the County budget. So, we are...our budget is very much in arrears. of the national average. Another metric that you'll typically see is the HR budget as a per capita cost per FTE and that's a common one. National average is about \$1,800 per employee is your typical HR budget. Our budget is about \$700. Again, we just include those benchmarks, so you kind of...I hope get a sense of we're not asking willy-nilly, we're, we are very constraint in our staffing, it constrains our ability to deliver services to departments and unfortunately sometimes becomes a bottleneck for those departments, and we hope to



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

avoid that. So, that's our ask for the ad staff. Our ask for e-learning content would be to provide the ability to provide some tech to employees. And this is...this ties into the large increases in our anticipated number of classes offered and employees that have been trained. Last year, we rolled out the learning module in Workday and that gave us the capability that we never had before, which is to actually deliver e-learning content. Previously, all we did was classroom training, which is good. People have to leave the worksite to have to come into a classroom. There's only so many classrooms, there's only so many chairs. E-learning allows us to deliver learning to the employee wherever they may be at, their desk, their house, their phone, whatever it might be. So, we're looking to leverage that. It's kind of the modern way of learning. It's the new generation, that's how they learn, they go to YouTube, they look stuff up. So, we want to leverage that and try to improve our workforce. The other category of learning that we're trying to ramp up is our leadership development. We do have a supervisory training academy that we run new supervisors through. One of the things that we really want to try to do is instill in new supervisors, in new managers what it really means to be a leader, and what it takes to be a leader, and what that entails. A lot of times we promote from within, we promote the best worker. And so, we have a lot of supervisors that come up that don't necessarily come from a management background but have, you know, an emphasis in those soft skills, those leadership skills. So, this would give them, I think, a leg up in assuming those roles. The other change would be to add \$3,200 for employee recognition events. We are actually we ramped up last year with additional event in Hāna to recognize those employees out there, and this would be to add a holiday event, some sort of holiday recognition that would kind of be, recognize employees efforts around the holidays. The other page in our proposal that several Committee Members picked up on was we are anticipating a very large inquiries in the number of personnel transactions processed, and there were several Committee Members had questions on that. That is primarily due to differences in the way that our current HR system tracks transactions versus the way the old system did. The old system would merely track a hire, for example. The new system actually breaks that down into five or six different micro transactions. It's the hire, it's getting the compensation, it's updating the social security number, it's their benefits, it's not significant additional work it just tracked at a much more granular level. So, that's the majority of it is because that, it's not huge increase in the workflow. It looks like going from, you know, 20,000 to 150,000 transactions it may be extreme but it's not as bad as it looks. So, that's basically the changes in our budget, and I hope that would help expedite the process and answer people's questions. I know that was a lot of questions we had in your written request. So, with that, Chair, I'll be happy to answer any other questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director Underwood. We'll start with Committee Vice-Chair King. You have five minutes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And then let me...before I start the timer, I'll just let Director and Deputy Director know that the Members each have five minutes, so if you could be

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

as concise in responding to their questions as possible. I know they would really appreciate it. Mahalo. Okay, Member, Committee Vice-Chair?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you for being here, Department, Mr. Underwood. It's good to see you. My first question is, you know, you were talking about the benchmarks that you're using for the similar departments in other municipalities and we're below the nationwide benchmarks for personnel and budget, but are there different categories of benchmarks for rural communities versus urban communities or are you just doing it out of per capita, straight per capita basis when you make those comparisons?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member King. That's a good question. We're kind of considering by the surveys we have available to us. Those are...those surveys were from the Society for Human Resource Professionals, which has about 20,000 member companies across the nation. And the other one is from The Bureau of National Affairs. Neither of those breaks out rural versus urban, unfortunately.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, 'cause it would be good to compare, you know, us to other urban communities, not just on a straight per capita basis. And then the other question I had was if you're...it looks like you're planning to go to more e-learning, e-training types of...are you planning to do any distance working like we're doing now during this lockdown having people work from home, or just it's just for the training and those kinds of programs?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you. Thank you, Member King. Yes, e-learning is gonna be an important component of our learning and development program. Whether remote work takes off will really depend on the operations of that particular department, I don't know...the current remote work regimen was kind of dropped upon us in very little notice. I think most departments are kind of adjusting to it as they can and as they see fit. So, I think most of them will be probably evaluating it as we come out of this, but I don't know whether we're gonna find it useful and productive or not. It'll probably vary by department.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. But you're part of that, your Department will be part of that evaluation?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay, great. No further questions at this time, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Two minutes and 30 seconds. Okay. We'll go with Member Sinenci, and then Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. And mahalo, Mr. Underwood. I...sorry, my internet's going in and out today, and I didn't catch the part about a coming out and doing a holiday with Hāna personnel members. Can you repeat that?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you. Thank you. Good question. We did add a employer recognition luncheon in Hāna, so we did come out and do that last year. We are requesting additional funds. It was identified that maybe some sort of holiday recognition might be a good idea to encourage employees and engage employees. I don't know that it would be onsite in Hāna. It might be some sort of remote recognition, but just something to kind of give the employees a little atta-boy around the holidays.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, great. Thank you. I appreciate that. And then I just had some questions on Page 444 of the Budget. It just looks like there's an increase in the number of training courses, significant ones. So, my question was where you gonna move to more online training, or is this a feasible, realistic goal for the Department?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you. Very good question. We plan to continue our in-person training. We know learners learn differently. Some learners like in-person training, some learners like computer-based training. So, we're adding the e-learning computer based training portion of it. We added about 7,500 classes for managers in the latter part of this year, and then what we want to do is actually roll that out to all employees. There's training in computers, there's training in time management, project management, stress, personal finance. There's a huge variety of training that we have the opportunity to make available to them, and so this would be...that would be how we would achieve the increase in learning outcomes, yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, great. Thank you for that explanation. That's all questions for now, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Two minutes and 20 seconds. Member Molina, ready to go?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Ready to go. Mr. Underwood already answered the question I had related to the expansion for the human resource specialist positions. The 20,000 for leadership development training, I totally support. In relation to that, Mr. Director, is this something that our sister counties have also implemented in their personnel departments as well, or do we need to do any more in this area? Can you tell us where we stand in comparison?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Molina. The neighbor counties as you can imagine vary quite a bit. The bigger county, City and County of Honolulu, of course, they have a ton more resources than we do. I don't know that Hawai'i County or Kaua'i County has a an equivalent supervisory training academy like we do. We do have a formalized curriculum I think that's about 15 different classes that the supervisors take. This would be to bolster those classes. It would be in-person training here at the County. We wouldn't be sending employees for training, and we would use a local, either Maui or probably Oahu based leadership training coach or mentor, I guess, teacher would be a good way to do it. It has to be somebody that can establish a rapport and kind of being authenticity and is a good cultural match with the audience to kind of motivate them in a soft skill like this. That's what we'd be looking for.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Well, thank you very much. I appreciate the Department moving in this direction. Thank you, Mr. Director. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Three minutes and 20 seconds left. Chair Lee, ready?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. Hello, Dave and Cynthia. We've known each other for a little while, while I was on the Civil Service Commission. I know that of all the departments in the County DPS is one of the smallest departments. So, I'd hate to ask you to cut your budget by 5 percent, because I don't know what we would do with the \$2.50 extra. I really have no questions for this group, because, you know, they do a very good job, very efficient job, and they don't have CIP, and they don't have a lot of extra money. So, there's no questions for me. Thank you.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Four minutes and five seconds left. Okay, Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you. Director, thanks. I just get couple things right now and again to adjust for the pandemic. One of the things that I get right now is very impatient like many people. So, what additional flexibility may you need, or how can we help you reduce the time it takes to get job descriptions and job classifications done to meet the flexibility we need for this new workforce to address the changing work environment?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Hokama. The biggest impact on that, honestly, would be to add the staff. You know, we have only so many staff to handle those requests. A brand new job, you know, for the County is a bit time consuming, because it does have to fit in the Statewide civil service system, so it's not just us that has to work on it, it's all the jurisdictions. But the more prep work we can do ahead, especially if we have the staff that can kind of consult with the department ahead of time, gauge their expectations, get them to, kind of, realize better, I guess, better express exactly what they need, so we have a better way of explaining it to the other jurisdictions. All of that helps and all of that, but all of that is staff time, all of that is staff time working with the department, all of that is staff time, you know, working ahead, planning, being proactive, which is a challenge for us at this point to be honest.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. No, I get it about the backbone required to implement the improvements we asking. So, I don't have a problem with that, Director. You just need to tell me what we need. Under emergency situation like this and on emergency hiring, do you have some flexibility to hire instead of wait 'til the other jurisdictions agree because we may not want this position down the road? So, under emergency temporary, you know, we may need employees to do on-the-job training, right, so instead of just driving a truck maybe they got to learn how to drive a drone or work a robotic piece of equipment because now the job has changed enough because of distancing and everything else. They gonna have to be cross trained to do other types

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

of work for the basic job. The job has changed sufficiently that you need this flexibility. So, that's what I need to know. What do you need from us to make you do it and without taking us one year to make it happen?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Member Hokama, that's an excellent question, and the ultimate answer, I think, is legislative. I think not necessarily something within our control because most of that is controlled by Chapter 76, not County ordinance. I think we're...we have flexibility especially in a pandemic and emergency, and we have been working with departments and unions things like changing work schedules, changing work locations, reallocating employees, moving them around to do other things. We have that flexibility under the emergency proclamation under Governor's suspension of Chapter 89, so that has been very helpful. We've been able to do a lot of reallocating of employees under those guises. If it's a short-term position, say less than six months, we have quite a bit of flexibility because we can exempt it from civil service. So, those, it would be the ones where it's a longer term position, civil service position, that we will start hitting those roadblocks most likely. I'm sorry if that's not a good answer but.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Well, Dave, I'm just trying to find ways to get the bodies in the position that we need that will make a difference in this changing times, because we got to do it differently. So, I'm just looking at what we got to do. Thanks. Thank you.

MR. UNDERWOOD: As always, thank you. Thank you, Member Hokama. I appreciate it and rest assured we are looking as well.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Okay. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Director, for being here. My first question is the supervisor training that you're speaking about is that strictly only for civil service employees?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Member Paltin, no, that's open to all County employees.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. So, you just put out like a e-mail for whoever's interested?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Yeah, there's a quarterly announcement training flyer that we put out which has all the classes coming up for that particular quarter, and then we'll typically advertise it as part of that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you. And then, so do you have plans to carry on recruitments during the lockdown, or are you waiting until that is over?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Paltin. That's a good question. We are continuing to recruit, as I said all of our recruitment activity is taking place online, so candidates can still apply, we can still screen. The only place where we're have a little bit of a bottleneck right now is in the testing, because people need to be physically present for that. We are still continuing with that, but it's a much more measured effort where we

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

try and make sure the public and our staff are safe. So, testing in much smaller groups to maintain social distancing. We're prioritizing Police dispatchers, public safety positions, that's kind of where we're at now.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And do you...are you creating any strategies on how to best fill, you know, like the kind of engineering positions and things that may have been laid off from the hotels, 'cause we always seem to have a hard time to fill those types of positions. So, are you putting together any strategies to go after those types of positions that require more specialized training that we chronically have a hard time to fill?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Paltin. That will kind of depend, I guess. We...it can kind of go one of two ways. We can either kind of seize this opportunity as the job market has basically done a 180 and there's a lot more people available now, so we could put on a full court press, try to fill as many positions that we can, or at least the critical ones. That's also kind of a financial commitment, so it depends on which way the Administration wants to go. If they give us the okay to fill many as we can, we will fill as many as we can, we'll probably have County job fairs, we might do other kind of stuff. They may say, you know, hold off on filling as many positions as you can 'cause it's an uncertain financial situation. So, at this point, we're kind of waiting for guidance from the Administration and see how the budget comes out. But if departments request us and recruit, we'll recruit, there's no stopping that.

MS. RAZO-PORTER: We're continuing to recruit.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so, I mean I'm not...for me, I'm making the distinction between and not judging anybody's jobs or anything, but like recreation leader, yeah, we probably wouldn't need that because they have to work with groups gathered, but engineers, I've heard that they're usually hard to find. So, I mean, are you allowed to make that distinction on your own or you need that from the Administration? I mean, public safety is considered essential, Public Works, Environmental Management, they're still working. Can you make that determination for yourself which vacancies are a higher priority or you need to wait for the Administration? Like I wouldn't really be recruiting Summer PALS right now, but you know, you know what I mean?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Yeah, understood, Member Paltin. That...there is...the Mayor did impose a hiring freeze or restriction. Obviously, public safety and anything necessary to respond to COVID are exempt. Anything outside of that does have to get additional approval from Mayor and Managing Director. So, we're looking to them to see what they're allowing to fill at this point.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And then the Workday, is that 100 percent complete finished, the program rollout?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Paltin. It is all 100 percent up and running and rolled out. The latest modules that we rolled out performance management, performance reviews, talent management, those were rolled out in January. It was not rolled out as a big bang; everybody has to do it day one. It was rolled out as a tools to

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

help managers manage their employees, and we would go in and train departments to use it as they came onboard and were ready to use it. So, we did train one department, and then we got hit with COVID. So, it is up and running, it is there, it's 100 percent rolled out. It's not as ubiquitous as we would like it shall we say. It's not as in as much use as we would like it. We'd still like to work with departments to get, to use it more, which is on our road map once we get a little bit of breathing room.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. My time's up.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. Nice seeing you. I wanted to just kind of simple question, in your Countywide organization in the program booklet you talk about that part of your goals are for affordable, healthy, and thriving community. And I was just wondering, so in your all of your online or your training, do you have health and wellness classes?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Sugimura. There are a number of personal care, there's a number of stress management, there's number of financial management, so it's not specific to health and wellness. It's more of a business skills and personal skills kind of training, but there are some that would cross over to that arena.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay, so that's kind of included in your, the cost for the training. And then the Budget Department gave us information early April about premium pay reports, and I noticed that for Fiscal Year 2021, you're asking for 13,000, I think that's the total, but yet in previous years you used a little bit more. So, is this gonna be enough? It was just like right now as of March 31<sup>st</sup>, we're at 15,209. And then I just wondered, you know, what you anticipate for this new fiscal year, whether the 13,000 is gonna be enough with your slim staff and aggressive training programs?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Excellent question. I think it will be enough. Our normal spend was typically running around 9 to \$10,000 per year. Two years ago, that was ramped up quite a lot because we were implementing Workday. Last year, we returned it back to a more normal amount of 13,000, because the Workday roll out was supposed to have been completed by June 30<sup>th</sup>, it actually rolled over and went to about January. So, that's why overtime is more this year than we had anticipated, but it was because of the roll out of that program, which we don't anticipate to continue.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. That makes sense, so you have it under control for Workday. Thank you.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Two minutes and 30 seconds left. Pro Temp Kama?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Underwood and Ms. Porter, for being here. I just had a question. You know with the high unemployment applications that have been going into DLNR...DLIR system, they've had lots of issues with that, because I think a lot of it was probably the server and the capacity was more than it could bear. So, in my head, I'm thinking that we have this many people unemployed, do we expect maybe more people applying for jobs that we have open now because they are on unemployment, or do you expect that to happen?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Kama. Yes. I would almost guarantee that that will happen.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, do you think we're prepared...is your Department prepared to handle that onslaught if it shifts from the unemployment to wanting to look for job in Personnel?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Kama. Typically what we see in a boom economy is we have...we're recruiting, a lot of recruitments but less applicant. If the job market is tight, we're recruiting just like everybody else. So, we have a lot of recruitments we're running and not very many applicants per recruitment. In a bust economy that tends to flip. We don't have as many recruitments going on, 'cause we're not looking to fill as many positions, but we have more applicants per recruitment. So, I think we'll have more applicants per recruitment, maybe more applicants overall, but I think we should be able to handle it.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. And then my last question is on Page 446, Equivalent Personnel Summary by position, you have human resources specialist trainee. Can you tell me what that person will be doing?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Kama. That is exactly what it sounds like, that is somebody who we would hire and we would teach them the basics of...it's a professional position so somebody coming in with a degree but not necessarily experienced in human resources or public sector human resources. So, we would be focusing on training them up to perform the work that we need them to perform through a combination of formal online training, on-the-job training, and various reading materials, stuff like that.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Mr. Underwood. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. You have three minutes left over. Okay. My question is kind of similar to Pro Temp Kama's question regarding the ability to handle the amount of applications we potentially would get and I hope to get. And your response to Pro Temp Kama was that you can handle the heavy load of applications that will be coming our way potentially. So, in this last year, I've been pushing really hard to get an animal control officer position filled for Moloka'i. We still don't have an animal control officer hired yet, and when I ran into the person who was the...made it all the way to being hired, he withdrew because it was taking too long for him to be hired. And I guess I would be concerned about the same thing happening when we have this opportunity of getting a lot of qualified applicants for a lot of positions that we've



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

been wanting to fill and that the turnaround time on hiring them would be too slow that we would lose a lot of qualified people to join us. So, is there...are there any assurances that you can give us as the Director that, you know, we won't move too slow to take advantage of all of those potential applicants?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Chair. I can certainly give you our assurance we'll move as fast as we can. Again, we are limited by the amount of resources that we have. Also, I would recognize that, you know, it's time to fill is an important metric. It's not always us, you know, there's a lot of different irons in the fire, especially in a public safety department like Police or Fire that have a lot of hoops to jump through in order to get hired. So, there's opportunities to, I think, streamline that in a lot of places, not just our Department, but we will definitely be cranking as fast as we possibly can.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that response, Director. So, you mentioned streamlining other departments as well. As the Personnel Department, are there, you know, tips and, I guess, advice and recommendations on how they, like, would Personnel provide recommendations to other departments to help them streamline so that those departments can help Personnel to help everyone to kind of, you know, get the ball moving faster?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Yes, yes, Chair. That's how we prefer it to happen. We like to be consultative. There are...as I said, and it wasn't to throw anybody under the bus, there are departments that have very specific requirements like I said. You know one of the things that makes it difficult to hire say a Police Officer is it takes a long time 'cause there's a lot of background checks, there's psychological checks, there's polygraph, there's a lot of hoops that you have to jump through for very good reason, and so I wasn't mean to say that was inefficient or that shouldn't happen. I'm just, you know, I wanted to point out that there's many reasons that these things can take a while. But we're always welcome and, you know, we hope departments will come to us and work collaboratively so we can leverage their experience to know what they need and they can kind of leverage our experience to know how to best kind of ask those questions themselves.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Director. So, I guess, I heard a lot of hopes. That your Department would hope that departments would want to, you know, consult with the Personnel and those departments, you know. So, I don't know...like instead of hoping, is there something a little more concrete that could happen?

MS. RAZO-PORTER: The one-stop recruiting, I mean...

MR. UNDERWOOD: There's...it's a balancing act, I would say that. I mean, one it's a balancing act between them having the flexibility to kind of design a process, a selection process that works for them versus us trying to kind of tell them what to do. You know, you're gonna get probably pluses and minuses either way. I think if I had my way it would be great that they would have, you know, we would have one process that everybody agrees on before it happens, but some departments are more independent than others. Some departments have very good staff and very standard stuff they like to do. Others recruit

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

very rarely and will look for a lot more guidance, so it kind of depends on the department. We try to encourage that each department has an assigned specialist that is their partner. So, we have a single lead and a backup with each department to try to encourage those types of relationships, that's how we like to work, we like to have them collaborate, but with staff change, staff turnover in departments and in DPS it's sometimes that we have to reestablish those relationships on a periodic basis. So, it's not perfect, but again, you know, I hope it will be better. I hate to say hope but I...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. My time is up. Committee Vice-Chair King, are you ready?

VICE-CHAIR KING: I am. Thank you, Chair. So, Mr. Underwood, just to follow up on that last comment you made. Could any of the training personnel, the training positions that you're asking for, could those be utilized to help train the departments on streamlining the hiring process so that it could go faster?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member King. The trainee positions are for, would be an add to staff for us that would eventually move up to those types of positions. Probably for the consulting positions with those departments a lot more senior staff that have experience and have seen what works, what doesn't work. Sit down with the department and try and go through, you know, hey, this is what works, what doesn't work. We do offer a series of classes for departmental personnel people, the people that are usually kind of administering this process, we call it our DPO Academy. Some of those classes are...one of those classes is on how to best to fill positions, it talks about how to do interviewing, and stuff like that. So, we do have resources for them. They're not completely on their own. But we would, you know, beef that up if we could.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay, I think that would be improving to try to streamline, if someone's using the same correct process, that'll be good. Also wanted to ask you if when we started the whole Workday project, the...I think one of the goals of that was to save money and become more efficient, so have you noticed any savings of money or resources, personnel, or hours from now that we've implemented it? 'Cause everything seems to constantly be expanding, at one point I thought we would be noticing some savings.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member King. I think there probably are, but they're not as obvious as...or we might be looking in the wrong place. I think we tend to look for, you know, as like has my staff seen, you know, a reduction in hours, no it hasn't. But that's because when you automate a system typically what you're doing is making it easier for the masses and harder for a few admin, and actually we have, we have the admin side. So, you know, I know employees are all doing their timesheets, you know, online, so they can do 'em online, they can do 'em from home, they can do it from whenever. I know the time rules that calculate things like temporary assignments that's all been automated. So, I think they are some pretty impressive time and labor savings. I think they just very distributed, so it's not as obvious as it might be.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. I just was curious because I thought that was one of the goals and I wasn't exactly sure where that, you know, where the time and money was supposed to be saved, but every department seems to be requesting additional personnel, so it doesn't seem like it's really saved us in...I'm not sure what areas that we're looking in, you know. It'd be good to see where we actually did have savings and, you know, there's a reason we replaced our old process with this new process and it hasn't fulfilled all the promises that, you know, all the time and expenses went into it. So, do you have a report like that coming?

MR. UNDERWOOD: I'm not aware if there's gonna be a benchmarking report or not. I'll have to check.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, 'cause it'll be good to get some kind of evaluation of the program. And then my last question is just wondering if when you go through these hires it kind of sparked when one of the Councilmembers said something about hiring people who are out of work and maybe you saw this the last time we had the recession is that people that come to, that come to fill empty positions and then leave as soon as when the economy gets better and they get hired back or you know. I mean, I know that back in the days of Maui Contractors Association that the Mayor back then used to come to the contractor association meetings and complain that the private sector was always taking professionals from the County government, and so we're having a hard time keeping engineers was one of them. You know, we were having a hard time...we hired good engineers and then they go and they leave for the private sector. So, is there a few...what...did that happen last time we had the recession, and are we aware of that potentially happening again? So that we don't spend a lot time hiring people who are then gonna turn around and leave, because, you know, during the last recession my company saw people applying for clerical positions who had PhDs and then, you know, they're not gonna stay obviously beyond, you know, when things get better.

MR. UNDERWOOD: That's an excellent question. What we typically...in a...I guess my answer is it will probably depend on how long and how severe the recession is. When we typically see when times are good, people chase the money. When times are bad, people chase the security. So, that's where we score when we recruit our brand is security, job security. So, if it's a fairly deep recession and it lasts awhile, people are still probably gonna be sensitive to the security argument for quite some time. I, you know...it puts that, you know, okay you make slightly less at the County but, hey, I still got a job. It kind of puts things in perspective. So, we didn't see a huge exodus last time, and I wouldn't expect a huge exodus unless this is truly a blip.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, great answer. All right, thank you so much for answering those questions. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: . . .*(inaudible)*. . . Hold on. Sorry, I just muted the...

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, thank you. So, my question for Mr. Underwood was that our office had proposed an expansion position in the Mayor's Office, a cultural liaison to help with acting as a resource to the other departments on issues related to Hawaiian cultural preservation and oversights of culturally sensitive issues, and I know we have the archaeologist position in the manager's office. But what will it take to head a position in the Mayor's Office?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Sinenci. The Mayor's Office is a, not subject to E/P limitations. The Mayor's Office is strictly governed by budget, so they could add however many positions their budget allows. So, it's strictly a budgetary question on their side.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, great. Thank you for that explanation, appreciate that. That's all for now, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Sorry about that delay, Madam Chair. No, I have no more questions for both directors. I appreciate their responses. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. David, one of the programs that you manage is the program, assistance program, well, not program assistance, but anyway, it's employee assistance program whereby our employees have access to programs with regard to substance abuse and all...social problems. Have you seen a rise in cases of, let's say, domestic violence, or anxiety, depression, any of those kinds of issues with our employee assistance program?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Lee. That's an excellent question. I have not gotten this quarter's report yet. I would anticipate there will be. So, much to the effect that one of the things that we did in response to this pandemic was we actually purchased additional EAP visits for all employees. Previously, it was employees had six visits per year for themselves or their family members. We know there's gonna be a lot of anxiety. We know there's gonna be financial stress. So, we're upping that to nine visits per year for every employee and their family. So, we did anticipate that being an issue, and we've actually upped that resource for them for that very reason.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you very much. And if you need help in that area, please feel free to come back to the Council.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you very much.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: That's all I have, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Member Hokama?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. For the Director, just two questions. And the first one is what you can share with us in this venue, Director, but is there anything you could tell us regarding current status of anything to do with collective bargaining agreements?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Mr. Hokama.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: It's all on hold, are you folks having talks?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Chair Hokama. All of the outstanding negotiations for the '19 to '21 contract period are pretty much completed. We've reached agreements with all of the HGEA units with the exception of Bargaining Unit 14. Their arbitration decision should be issued next week. All of the cost items are, of course, pending at the Legislature, so we have no idea of what's going to happen there. All the other units are in contract through June 30<sup>th</sup> of 2021. Negotiations for the success agreements for all contracts will start probably this July, June, July that we...nobody's had time to even broach the subject with anybody at this point.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. Well, yeah, thank you for that comment there, Director. I appreciate that. My second question is some of the things that's within contract, so are we using this current time, especially with the administrative adjustments, making corrections to comp time or paid leaves and working it down so that something more reasonable numbers per employee or for areas that we need to address? Have you folks been making any administrative adjustments that those are things that need to work off first if they're considered nonessential employees or whatnot?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Yeah, I hope I understand the question. There are circumstances where employees who may be out of work because maybe they're sick or they're in quarantine or their significant other is in quarantine or, you know, and so there are circumstances where employees have been removed from the workplace and they would be, you know, using their leave balances for that, so that would be bringing down the leave banks. There's not a general directive to bring down these banks or otherwise restrict overtime that I'm aware of. I think the overriding directive right now is just giving the departments the operational flexibility they need to address the COVID rather than cost contain it. I haven't seen that being a priority at this point.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. Well, thank you for that response, Director. Thank you, Chair.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member Paltin? Yeah, oh, there. You have to unmute yourself. Okay, there you go.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Director. So, continuing on from the Workday question. When everybody comes back to work and it's kind of normal, do you have more work on your end to do with the Workday situation?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Paltin. It would be assisting the departments in bringing it up, typically assisting them in using it to better manage their staff. Mostly training and assistance in rolling it out, not really assistant, not so much in setting up or making changes to the program.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And that's not something that you could do remotely?

MR. UNDERWOOD: It is to a certain extent. We could do it remotely since it's mostly training. So, it could be something that is done during the current crisis, I guess we will call it. It just depends on, you know, whether the departments can spare their managers for training. It's more a time constraint at this point, I think.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. And does Personnel contract the workers' comp carrier?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Member Paltin, no, that's done through our Risk Management.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay, thank you. And then, you know, if you could walk us through the recruitment process. Does everyone that meets the minimum qualifications get a chance to take the written test?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Member Paltin, yes, they do.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then what...if there is a chance to do a remake, what would qualify people for a remake?

MR. UNDERWOOD: By remake as you mean like a makeup test?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, sorry, makeup test.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Okay. It typically depends on how desperate we are for staff, for a candidate. Typically, things that would, you know, automatically qualify you is if it's a medical reason and if you have nonrefundable travel plans, stuff like that, we'll try and work around. Sometimes if there's...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, it's not a baseline, hard criteria, it just depends on if you have enough recruitment applications or not?

MR. UNDERWOOD: We try to be as flexible as possible, you know, to get enough candidates for the department to make a selection.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Just asking because that last one had some folks unable to make the makeup or make the original test because they had to work and, you know, if applicants are not willing to call in sick for work, to me, that's the kind of applicants we want. We want folks that aren't willing to call in sick to their jobs. So, I was wondering

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

if that is a standard reason that if a makeup test is being given that they could be allowed to get in on the makeup test date.

MR. UNDERWOOD: It's typically not a standard reason, but like I said, in that case we did wind up making an exception. So, it depends on the need of the testing, really. We try to balance test security. The more times we give a test, the more opportunities there is for answers to go awry and people to talk to somebody else. So, we try to minimize the number of tests that we give. So, it's a bit of a balancing act.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. No more...no further questions. Thank you, Chair and Director.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, just I wanted to send my appreciation to Geri Onaga, who does your, I think she does your employee recognition from your Department. And I went to this year's employee recognition at the Binhi At Ani and just to hear about the fabulous employees that got recognized, right, Tasha Kama was there, I think Tamara Paltin there, and some of you. I wish there was a way that we could advertise how special these employees are over and beyond that night. I was really impressed from all the different departments, and Kathy Collins did a really great job doing the emcee work. But I just wanted to say how grateful we are that we have these people who go over and beyond the call of duty and, you know, who really care about their job, and I hope that there's a way that we can advertise it more than just announcing that night or giving them their awards, and I know there's some monetary recognition too. But I don't think it's ever enough, so thank you very much. Is there...does it get advertised beyond that night?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Sugimura. There is a plaque that's posted, it's advertised in the *High Street Journal*. I think we used to put it in the newspaper, I don't know if it still is or not, but I think it did make it in the newspaper. I would absolutely second your observation. We do have some absolutely amazing employees, and they don't get recognized enough, you know.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah. I'm glad you do that though. And please thank Geri. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, my question, Mr. Underwood, is are there certain jobs that when the applicant comes and goes through the process that they're able to be processed faster than other types of job applicants or applications? I heard that Fire and Police sometimes take longer 'cause of the background checks that are incurred. But are there other occupations that when you put out a call and the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

recruitment is and then people respond that the process to getting them hired is faster in some ways?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you, Member Kama. It kind of depends on the job and it depends on the hiring department. Some jobs have a, basically you just sign up, you know, until our, what we call unskilled labor jobs, ground keepers, laborers. There's no test for that. You just sign up and you're on the list. Others have a written test to them, so it might be...that'll add a couple of weeks. Some might also have a written and a performance test. If you want to be an Ocean Safety Officer, you will have swim, run, paddle a board, so that adds a little bit of time. So, those are the general permutations that you'll see on our side. Once we get that list and give it to the departments, the departments will go through their own selection process. They'll winnow down, what's down to their eventual selectee. Like I said, that might involve a background check, that might involve come in and do a demonstration, ask them to take a, do a writing sample, so it kind of depends on the hiring department as well. So, there is some variation and it kind of depends on the job and where...what they're getting hired for.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. So, it means...so to make...it sounds like the applicants applies through Personnel and then Personnel says okay, you passed the test, you meet the minimal, now we're gonna pass you over to the department from which you will be maybe working from, or is there a process when it gets there?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Member Kama, yes, there's...once we give the test, and say we have 100 people that want to be a clerk, any department that has an opening will ask us for a list and we'll give them say maybe ten names, and then they'll go through their selection process to figure out which of those ten they're actually gonna bring onboard.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Is there any time where people's names stays on that list forever and ever and ever and ever?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Member Kama, not forever, ever, ever. Normally, our lists are good for one year. Occasionally we'll extend them if it's still a good list, there's a lot of names on it, but typically it's good for one year.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, someone could potentially be on the list for a whole year and not get any employment from any of the departments, like say if it's a clerk or something?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Member Kama, that is possible, depending on how well they scored on the test.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: How well they scored. They passed the test, they got a score, that should've put them in another ranking, correct, so that they are eligible? So, what does that mean when it gets to the departments?

MR. UNDERWOOD: What will happen is when the department...say we have our 100 people on the list, the department asks us for names to hire from, we'll give them the top 10



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

scores, so they'll get the top 10 people. They'll make a selection from there. The other ones stay on the list. So, the next department asks...has a vacancy, they ask for a list, it'll be those, the other nine plus another one, it goes down. So, if a candidate takes it, passes the exams, scores high, odds are they will get interviewed, I don't know if they'll get selected, that's up to them, but they'll probably get interviewed. If it's a large list and there's not that many openings and they didn't score very high, it's possible they wouldn't get interviewed.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. And so, my...and my last question is you have 18 employees currently according to the paperwork. You want to...you need, you're looking for one more, two more, and then are all of your employees essential, or are they working from home, or are they at the office?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Oh, thank you, Member Kama. All of our employees are working. Our office is open. We keep it staffed with a skeleton crew. So, if a department has a question or if you need to get a hold of somebody you could still call us, come by the office. We're not open to the public, but we are open to the County that everyone who's not currently...and we staff that skeleton crew on a rotational basis. So, anyone who's not currently working in the office is working from home.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Last and final, has the Personnel Department ever gotten audited?

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you for the question. Not to my knowledge.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Okay, Members, I don't have any additional questions. All my questions were asked. And we don't have any priority proposals for Personnel, so unless there are any more questions or comments, we can thank them for coming. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just was checking; we're still waiting on the written responses?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Oh, okay. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So far, we only received written responses from Planning Department and they're next.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Those guys are good planners, they plan ahead.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Thank you so much, Director and Deputy Director, for joining us today.

MR. UNDERWOOD: Thank you very much, Chair. Thank you, Members of the Committee. Thank you for all your support.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

\*\*\*\*\*

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members, it's 2:41, we can take a quick recess while we let the Department of Planning set up. We are ahead of schedule. Good job, Members. So, I think...oh, no, we're like right on time, 2:45, we're expecting Department of Planning to join us at 2:45 and it's 2:42. So, I think we're okay. So, we'll just take a quick ten-minute break, is that okay?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, no objections. I just wanted to say, you know, to congratulate you on this new process, because it seems to be working great.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, thank you. Thank you to all the Staff behind the scenes. They're really working super hard to make it seem like it's effortless, but it's not.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I like the way it's been kind of morphing, and so we've been able to make adjustments on the fly, so thank you to the Staff for that, because I think we've kind of centered on a process that works really well, which is obvious from being on time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King, and mahalo to all the Members for continuing to remain flexible during this process. So, we'll take a quick 10-minute break, so please be back in your chairs at 2:55. Sounds good, perfect. Okay. It's 2:43 and we will reconvene at 2:55. The Economic Development and Budget Committee is now in recess. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 2:43 p.m.  
RECONVENE: 2:58 p.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .(gavel). . . Economic Development and Budget Committee will return to order. It is 2:58 p.m. on April 13, and we are now on our last department for today, Department of Planning. And we have with us from Department of Planning, Director Michele McLean and Deputy Director Jordan Hart.

MS. MCLEAN: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Director McLean, mahalo for being the first department to provide us written responses to our questions. We really appreciate that. Member Paltin made a comment about how great of planners you all were. So, I'll invite you to provide opening comments before we get started with questions.

**DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING**

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MS. MCLEAN: Okay. Thank you, Chair. And thank you for considering our requested FY '21 Budget. Our budget is relatively straightforward. We have only one program. We're not funded by user fees, and we have just two grant-funded components, the Coastal Zone Management Grant and the Certified Local Government Grant. Our general funded budget is proposed to be \$7,045,556. A slight reduction from FY '20, about 69 percent of this or about 4.8 million is proposed for personnel, 28 percent or just over 2 million is operations, and 3 percent is equipment. The main changes from FY '20 are the addition of 6 expansion positions and the related office rent, renovations, office equipment and furnishings needed to support these positions. In FY '20, we had \$910,000 in professional services that we had requested plus another \$315,000 that Council added for a total of 1.225 million. Almost all of these have been contracted or are in the process of being contracted. And for FY '21, we simply don't have the capacity to manage much more since these projects will be initiated over the next few months and will continue for a year or longer. So, we requested only 430,000 for professional services, mostly for continuing existing contracts and for fixing up additional office space for the expansion positions. Also in FY '20, we added a second UH Sea Grant Extension agent, that contract is ending now for the dune restoration coordinator project. In FY '21, we propose to continue this contract along with the existing extension agent Tara Owens and to add 3 months of funding for each of these to align the funding with the Federal cycle. So, in FY '22, the funding would return to a 12-month cycle. That summarizes the notable changes from FY '20. You have our written response to your questions and we'd be happy to answer any additional questions you may have. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Okay, Members, we'll start with our first round of questions, starting with Committee Vice-Chair King. You ready?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yes, I'm ready. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Please proceed.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you for being here, Director McLean, and I apologize if I have questions that you already sent answers into, but I think they're important for the community to hear the answers, and I actually haven't read through the all the answers at this point because they go through a process of going through my Council e-mail first. So, my first one is about if you can update us on where we are at with the South Maui Community Plan review. Was that one of the contracts that you put out already?

MS. MCLEAN: Yes. So, we are in the process of contracting for that right now.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, and that's going to...is that gonna expedite the South Maui Community Plan review?

MS. MCLEAN: It will allow us to have that going while we are finishing West Maui, 'cause West Maui is just about concluded with the CPAC but it still has to go to Commission and Council. The...having a contract for South Maui will take a lot of the early work that

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

our staff would typically do and have that contracted out. So, yes, so it will move that along faster than if we didn't have that contract.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay, great. Thank you for that. I really appreciate moving that along, although I don't know when we're going to be able to do stakeholder meetings, because we're all supposed to stay so far apart right now, but hopefully that will happen soon or by distance. So, and then the other question I had...well, first of all, I want to congratulate you on, you know, having a actual reduction even with those expansion positions, but I wanted to ask you about the...in the Budget Program, on Page 454, on the building permit reviews, which is like everybody's big issue with trying to get housing done. Can you just explain for Fiscal Year '19, your goals of percentage of building permits reviewed within 30 days? In Fiscal Year '19, you have 35 percent that you completed and this estimate for this year's up to 100 percent, which is great but then your estimate for next year goes back down to 75 percent. So, can you just speak to that, like is there a different...is there...are the permits not coming in or coming in or what's going on with the those percentages?

MS. MCLEAN: Well, there are a couple of reasons for us not achieving 100 percent, and one of those reasons is because we had started receiving more building permits than we used to get. DSA has chart of which permits go to which departments and they decided to send virtually every building permit to us and in the past we didn't get a rebuilding permit, so we were getting much greater volume than we had before. We do aspire to 100 percent, and so that's why that was the goal for this current fiscal year, but we have to be realistic and so we wanted to have a more achievable goal, which is why we went for 75 percent for FY '21.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Okay, great. Is that your...was that your estimate for this current year then, is it more like 75 percent 'cause I know the 100 percent was the goal?

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah, 75 percent is probably more realistic.

VICE-CHAIR KING: For this year, this current year. Okay, I really, you know, I just want to tell you that I really appreciate you setting higher goals every year, because I think even if you don't reach the total number that your pushes are harder every time your goal is higher. So, you know, going from 35 percent actual '19 to aspiring to 100 percent I thought was, I really appreciate that I just wanted to say even though you don't reach it, because a lot of times there's external reasons why you can't reach your goals, but I think it's always good to...and I don't really...I don't...I try not to ding anybody for not reaching their goals but at least setting high goals, so I do appreciate that. Let's see, the other thing I wanted...I wondered if you could explain the need for, because this is gonna come up, but the need for the...I have this written down. For two more coastal management planners that we've put in there, you know, I put in as a priority and they weren't in there originally, but if you could just explain the partnership you have with Hawaii Sea Grant for this program, and why we these additional positions are crucial?

MS. MCLEAN: Okay, well those are different things, although we work very closely with Sea Grant. The, two of the expansion positions are planners in our Current Division but

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

only one of those is proposed to be dedicated to the shoreline team. And the reason for that expansion position need is because as you all know just as well as I do we're facing more and more situations of coastal erosion, sea level rise, emergency permits. So, our existing shoreline team is just overloaded with a bunch of those. So, we wanted to add just one more coastal zone planner.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MS. MCLEAN: Then UH Sea Grant that's a contract, and we put that out in FY '20 thinking that could be a grant to a volunteer organization or a new nonprofit that might be formed to take over the work that the Richardsons having been doing for so long. But there really wasn't an individual organization who seemed capable of taking that on, and so we did have a dialogue with Sea Grant, and so we're going to put the current year's contract for another extension agent, and we do want to extend that in FY '21, and that person is more focused on dune restoration and more of the proactive, preventive shoreline planning that we like to see but don't always have someone to take the lead on. So, one is a contract and one is an employee.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you. My time is up. Second round. Thanks. Thanks, Michele.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, and then we'll go to Pro Temp Kama, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Chair, I don't have any questions at this time. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Nice to see you, Michele and Jordan. I just wanted to...if you could just give a, kind of a brief on what's happening with the IAL as well as the TOD grants. I see you found the funds then.

MS. MCLEAN: We have, RFPs have been posted for both, so those are open right now. I don't know the status if we've received bids yet. We don't find out until the conclusion of the process. Jordan has been lead on getting the companion State funding released from the Governor's Office, so that's well underway too. So, once the RFP closes and we get the bids, we expect to have the funds released from the Governor's Office so that we can contract.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, and I guess I was glad to see that Kelly put that amount for the planner for the shoreline erosion problem that we've been having around actually the whole island. So, I look forward to, I guess, seeing that happen and I support that, because I've been to all of those community meetings and hearing especially Mā'alaea Village Community Association where that was specifically asked for by one of the planners and a huge need as we see our shorelines eroding. So, thank you for taking care of so many people. Thank you. That's it, Chair.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I received the responses, and I'm satisfied with the answers, and I'm stoked to have them. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Hi. Thank you, Chair. For our Director and Deputy, again I know we all adjusting to the pandemic, so my question for the two of you this afternoon is more about what would you like...what resources would you like to see from us, because one area of planning that I think on the short-term we looking to for advice is how we're going to plan to take care short-term emergency housing, and what does the Planning Department do regarding processing and assisting us in getting those shelters up quickly, timely for resident benefits?

MS. MCLEAN: Councilmember Hokama, you're audio is a little bit garbled here, but I think you were asking what's needed to expedite permitting for shelters. Is that what you asked?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Yes, during crisis.

MS. MCLEAN: Okay. Under the emergency proclamations, I believe that the permitting requirements have been loosened considerably. So, should there be a need to construct shelters, we would check with the Mayor's Office and Corp. Counsel on what permit requirements have to be followed, and then my understanding is that it's pretty limited at least on the Planning Department side, kind of like the 201H process where, you know, we don't have to worry about zoning and land use designations. I believe building codes would still have to be followed for basic health and safety, and we would have to check FEMA flood and SMA, but I think those processes would be considerably expedited under the emergency proclamation. That's my understanding anyway.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay. Why I'm asking you this because for me this is like our initial run, the dry run. I expect this thing may be a recurrence. I want to be really prepared and ready for round two, because right now what we doing is reacting. I would like us to get into a planning mentality than a reactionary mentality, so that's why I'm asking you about what you need from us to get this emergency housing squared away from Planning perspective. The next one I'm gonna ask you is because the Feds are throwing a lot of dollars under infrastructure for the County and the State, we would ask that you recommend projects that would qualify for those Federal dollars regarding the shoreline area that you would recommend as a planner and infrastructure that would qualify for those Federal dollars, disaster dollars. If it's time to look at the road, if it's time to connect it with the sanitation and the sewer system, we need you folks to help give guidance in those planning type of projects. Is that something you could assist us with?

MS. MCLEAN: Certainly and working with the infrastructure agencies with State DOT, with County Water, County Wastewater, absolutely.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, because I think Ms. Sugimura with her regional perspective for transportation and our other infrastructure departments could be of great benefit, so I appreciate that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Member...Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. I was gonna ask the similar questions of you, Director. I'm glad Mr. Hokama started the conversation because we know that and we've talked about this, talked about possible places to drive in and park and then moving up from there to shelters and then moving up from there perhaps tiny homes or demonstration or experimental projects. Now, Mr. Hokama asked you about infrastructure and processes, you know, expediting processes, et cetera. My question was more along the lines since your Department is already, well pretty much familiar with the entire County in terms of properties. Where would you recommend that we could build fairly easily, quickly in terms of, let's say, the tiny homes or, you know, sheltered areas? Okay, we know not Makena, but you know more than us where to start building or discussing either buying or leasing or condemning property. All of these things would be available to us and we really need your help in identifying these locations. And secondly, very quickly, we've talked about the possibility of creating a revolving fund for you, and I know you weren't too excited about it but this is always a way to create a fund for things that do come up throughout the year, like we created the revolving fund for DSA and the permits and whenever they needed additional bodies that was the place to go to. In your case, perhaps the revolving fund could start with penalties, you know, short-term rentals, because even though they're not supposed to be operating, some of 'em will. So, short-term rentals, any kind of infractions, land use infractions where we are able to penalize people those funds could possibly start to build your revolving fund for the needs that you have that come up that perhaps are unexpected. So, any comments? You probably have 30 seconds.

MS. MCLEAN: To answer your question about where we can build easily and quickly, those would be central locations that are either already served by adequate infrastructure or that where the infrastructure can easily be upgraded to serve the development. In terms of...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Director? Director? Director?

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And if you could jot down a few exact locations that'll be helpful.

MS. MCLEAN: Okay, we can do that and we can do that in writing.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: And then the revolving fund?

MS. MCLEAN: Oh, shoot. I thought we were out of time. I'd be a little bit concerned with that being funded by fines, because I wouldn't want there to be the perception that we're

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

conducting enforcement in order to pay for staff. The purpose of our enforcement is to get compliance, a lot of times you have to have the carrot and the stick, but I would be concerned about the public perception that our enforcement is there to be a money maker, so that we can...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. How about just having a revolving fund?

MS. MCLEAN: I'm not familiar enough with it on how that would work and do employees get laid off if the fund doesn't have the money year after year to pay for them, but I don't want to get too far off track. I know there are time limits, but we did just recently complete an update of the fee study, so in terms of the permit fee structure being adjusted to move toward cost recovery, that's where I think we...it would be more reasonable to have that incorporated into our personnel rather than...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you. Thank you. How many seconds do I have left?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Fourteen.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Whoa.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Good job.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. We have Member Molina next.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Good afternoon, Director McLean and Director Hart. First question with regards to the six E/Ps you're requesting, if you haven't touched upon it already just a brief description as far as what they're gonna be doing and what divisions the E/Ps will be with?

MS. MCLEAN: Okay, two of the positions are for the Long Range Division, that would be a planner and GIS analyst, and that would be to support having two community plans running at the same time. Then we have an additional plans examiner in our Zoning Administration and Enforcement Division, and that's to, back to Councilmember King's question about our success in reviewing building permits within the 30-day timeframe. We're not meeting the goal that's set out for us so having an additional staff person to help handle the workload there. Two of the positions are planners with our Current Planning Division. One will be part of the shoreline team, the other would be an entry level planner, Planner I, to assist with the smaller kinds of permits and also contemplating the MAPPS system being put into effect at some point and that person would be able, would be assigned to assist the public with submitting applications by MAPPS. And then the last position is an administrative planning officer position also in the Current Division, which would alleviate a lot of the workload of the division chief to be able to manage all the boards and commissions that we staff, so that the division chief could be more involved with supervising and mentoring the planners.



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Great, thank you, and thank you again for being one of the first departments to respond to written requests, 'cause I got one for you now. Sorry about that. Just if you could provide us a list of employee turnover in each of your divisions, specifically number of employees that have voluntarily or have been terminated within the last 12 months per division and also the number of current vacancies of each of your divisions.

MS. MCLEAN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Do you need me to repeat that?

MS. MCLEAN: No.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, great, and with whatever time I have left, just on your increases for historic funding, Budget Details, Page 14-9, are the increases being requested because of previous fiscal years higher or can you identify any specific needs with how you'll be using these additional funds?

MS. MCLEAN: Those are in the categories of office supplies, copier supplies, other services, and printing and binding. The office and copier supplies, those are self-explanatory. The other services, that's for the documents that we have in storage. We don't pay for storage, but we pay every time we need to retrieve something and they deliver it to us, and that has been high because we have been undertaking a project to scan all of those files, so that we don't need the hard copy storage anymore. But FY '21 should be the last year that we have to do that, because by the end of FY '21 they should all be scanned.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, and then quickly, I have a request, a priority request for 300,000 for staffing for both the, hopefully, future Ha'ikū-Pā'ia Advisory and Kihei Advisory Committees. I put in 300,000, is that a number that you're comfortable with 300,000, or can we do it with less?

MS. MCLEAN: It's still...back to some of the questions that I asked before, it's still not clear to me what authority if any those are going to have, and what their duties are gonna be if they're comparable to Hāna Advisory Committee, then that's probably sufficient. But without knowing exactly, you know, what the requirements are going to be because there are a lot of things thrown out in committee, so that's probably a safe number. I'll just say that that's probably a safe number for now.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you very much for your responses, Director. I'm done with this round, Madam Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Eight seconds to spare. Member Sinenci, you ready?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair, and thank you, Director. I appreciate the answers as well, mahalo. My first question was, you know, speaking about streamlining

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

residential construction permits. What are some of the, you know, the practices that the Department has adopted to help streamline the process? I know we have a Habitat for Humanity project coming up, and I was wondering do those get put to the top of the stack, Director?

MS. MCLEAN: There is a prioritization requirement in the County Code for certain types of affordable housing projects, so if it meets that standard in Chapter 2.97, then yes, it would go to the top of the pile. There...we have been working with the Department of Public Works between the two of us to figure out other solutions. One thing that we've requested and we're still working with them on that when we get a building permit application, we tend to look at the entire property to see, to make sure that everything on the property is in compliance but that can slow things down. So, we've asked that there be a disclaimer on the building permit itself that says this permit is only for the building that the permit applies to, that it doesn't give approval to everything else that's on the property. So, that would...we would speed up our reviews considerably if we could get that disclaimer language put on the application or put on the permit.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, great, thank you, and then my second question was the six expansion positions and thank you for explaining all of 'em, but I was just wondering, you know, with kind of development slowing down, would you need...is there a priority of certain, which positions if you had to choose of the six positions?

MS. MCLEAN: Well...right. The shoreline planner I think is still needed, because the ocean hasn't stopped rising because of the Coronavirus, and I...there really hasn't been talk to this point about the community plan process slowing down, and based on Councilmember King's questions I think we still want to go ahead with South Maui, so I think those two positions would be needed as well. Perhaps the plans examiner and the other planner in the Current Division maybe those can wait to see how things turn around. I would say those would be lower priority at this point.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, great. Thank you, Director. And then my last question was can you provide the update? I know you mentioned briefly about the IAL funds and the fee study. Is that the update that you gave?

MS. MCLEAN: Well, the IAL study there is a contract out or, excuse me, an RFP out for that, so once we get those bids back and we get the funds released from the Governor then we can issue that contract. For the fee study, we did retain a few months ago the same firm that did the original study and they have updated it. We haven't transmitted it to Council yet 'cause we've been back and forth with them making sure that the I's are dotted and T's are crossed, and the Mayor also needs to review it, but that has been, the number has been updated and we will do the transmitting to the Council, so that's been done.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay. Is it possible to see the IAL RFP?

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah, it's posted, so it's on the procurement website, but we can send you the link, so that you can access it.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, great. Thank you, Director. Thank you, Chair. That's all for now.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay. I have a few questions. Mahalo again for responding to our questions in writing. So, question 12, regarding the \$200,000 ADA shoreline access grant talks about what the criteria would look like. I was wondering if you would be able to provide more detail on geographically what areas would benefit from this.

MS. MCLEAN: That's a great question. If you don't mind, I can respond to that in writing. I want to check with the shoreline team. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure, mahalo. Okay, and then for equipment, mahalo for replacing our old vehicle with a new hybrid SUV on Moloka'i. The old vehicle, will it shipped back to Maui when the replacement comes in?

MS. MCLEAN: I do not know. I can find that out too.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, mahalo for that, and I really appreciate you providing the areas that could be reduced, the 5 percent reduction, that will make it a lot easier for all of us during decisions week and that for Members and the public's benefit is on question 16a. Okay, and then I wanted to follow up on questions that Chair Lee was asking regarding identifying areas for shelters and unsheltered individuals, et cetera. And in speaking with Ms. Lisa Darcy, she shared with us that there was a report that the Planning Department worked on back in maybe 2015. Do you know what report she was referring to?

MS. MCLEAN: Not offhand.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. She said that you were really helpful in putting that report together, so I guess I can try to follow up with you later after the meeting.

MS. MCLEAN: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, those are all my questions. Mahalo, Director. Okay. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. I just checked with my staff, and we hadn't gotten the written responses, so they just got 'em just now. I apologize if this is on there, the question. Yeah. So, Director, on the South Maui Advisory Committee and the Hā'iku-Pā'ia Advisory Committee that has been proposed by myself and Member Molina, my office was given a figure of 200,000 for that, and I think his office was given a figure of 300,000. Do you have a...do you want to give us a final figure on that, and then my other question related to that is is it possible that that could also be supported by one of these six expansion positions that have been requested?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MS. MCLEAN: The 200,000 figure, I think that was in response to a question that would, that was only what the annual salaries would be. It wasn't relating to additional associated expenses such as they would need office space, office rent, we'd need to renovate the offices, it'd probably...there could be overtime. I know that there was talk at one point about the meetings being at certain times or on certain days, so the \$200,000 figure was just an estimate for salaries only, not for related expenses that are needed for, to support any staff person. And again as I said before, it's not clear to me exactly what the responsibilities of those advisory committees are going to be, so that will have a bearing on what staff can support it. So, 200,000 I think is fine for salaries and that was for 3 positions, that was for a supervising planner, a mid-level planner, and a secretary, and then they would be...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, would that...would those positions and also support Hāna because, you know, my thought was that the job descriptions would be the same as, the duties would be the same as what Hāna Advisory Committee has been using so far, and, you know, possibly might be more regular 'cause I know that they don't necessarily meet every month and these two might, but we're trying to replicate what's happening out in Hāna with their advisory committee.

MS. MCLEAN: Well, so far the ordinance that have been drafted make it quite different from Hāna, and the applications that go to Hāna are those assignments they don't all go to one planner. It depends on the kind of application, so with a...like a bed and breakfast or short-term rental home, we have a handful of planners that do those applications, but if it's a Change in Zoning or SMA major, then we have more senior planners handling those, and I would imagine that would be the same for Pā'ia-Ha'ikū and for South Maui.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MS. MCLEAN: It wouldn't be the same planner but having additional planners would offset the workload from some of the others.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Well, that was my thought was that maybe we didn't need totally full-time positions and maybe we can share with some new E/Ps. And then the only other question I had was have we had since we've been in this crisis for a couple of months, have we had any through your, in your Department permit withdrawals as far as...do...have there been considerable permit withdrawals as far as short-term rentals and bed and breakfast? 'Cause I know I've talked to people and it's anecdotal in the community that know people that are changing their short-term rentals back to long term for residents, because they just don't see a future in this for the next year or so. I just wondered if you've had any permit withdrawals.

MS. MCLEAN: Not that I'm aware of, because if someone has a permit and let's say it's good for another three years that doesn't mean they have to do short-term rental, so they could say I'm gonna find a lease with someone for six months or a year and when that's over go back to doing it. So, they wouldn't have to withdraw. I haven't heard that we've had anybody withdraw.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. So, we...but we wouldn't know if people switched over to...is there a way to find out if they switched over just so we could see if we're gaining on residential rentals?

MS. MCLEAN: Not without contacting them all individually.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MS. MCLEAN: We'd have...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you.

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you, Director, I appreciate that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So, thank you, Ms. McLean, and for Deputy Director Hart. I just have a couple of questions that I asked of the Parks Department earlier, and I just want to get some sense of what your thoughts may be. So, the first question is a yes or no question, and then the next question is multiple choice, and then the last question you can give me an answer if you have one. So, the first question is do you think Maui will be back to normal in about 12 months?

MS. MCLEAN: I don't know. I'd like to say yes, but I really don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. Do you think that maybe things will be the same, better, or worse than they are today?

MS. MCLEAN: I think better.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay. Is there a contingency plan if things go in an entirely different direction than what you're planning for today?

MS. MCLEAN: We don't have a formalized plan. My thoughts on it are that I don't think there is a long-term tolerance for where we are right now, and I think that if the pandemic persists that we will develop modifications to the safety measures that we're taking that allow us to creep back towards normal in some way. I don't think socially people will tolerate it for 12 months, and I don't think our economy can tolerate it for much longer at all. So, that's my suspicion for what it's worth.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: It's worth, it's worth it. So, is it, just for my own clarification, is it almost reacting to what will happen to us as opposed to taking a more proactive role to what might happen?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MS. MCLEAN: I think for the next several weeks it will continue to be more reactive, and then if we have a picture that okay we don't see this curving anytime soon then we can shift to being more proactive and figuring out how to get, how to move back to normalcy but in a very safe way.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you very much, Department, for being here. I don't really have questions for you, just a lot of gratitude. I really appreciate you answering the questions beforehand and keep up your good work and thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Based on Ms. Kama's question, I was wondering if you could give us a status update of I know that you were doing rolling show up to work dates and stay home, and I was wondering if you could like kind of tell us what is working and what isn't, and if any of them could be carried on into the future after the stay at home work order ends.

MS. MCLEAN: Thank for the question. We have a handful of employees who we consider to be high risk, and so they are working from home every day, coming into the office after hours to drop off work or to pick up new assignments. The rest of the staff is essentially separated into groups of three, so they'll work in the office one day and then work from home two days, and the...when they're in the office, you know, again, they can print out things that they've been working on, they can route things for signature, and they can pick up new assignments to take home. And with very few exceptions, everyone has been really productive. In terms of that lasting after the crisis is over on the one hand I think it could, because people have been very responsible giving their supervisors detailed information of the things that they've been working on. On the other hand, I wonder if that level of production is because they feel a responsibility to contribute what they can during this crisis. I don't know if that incentive would be sustainable for the long term but certainly it's possible, and there are plenty of places that do that as a regular thing, maybe we'll be getting there. I don't know. We'll have to see how this holds up.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And can you also give us an update on the boards and commissions? I had heard is it tomorrow that the Planning Commission is gonna do a test run?

MS. MCLEAN: Yes. Yeah, we're gonna do test runs for all of our boards and commissions, if we can during the month of April and then starting with their regular meeting dates in May trying to get back to a regular schedule. There may be some items that we would normally schedule but we'll hold back because they're...they have a lot of public interest or they're controversial and we just don't think that the BlueJeans format is adequate

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

for public input, but we are gonna try to get back to business in May with trials runs this month.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. I don't know if I have too much time left, but I might copy Member Molina and Member King about my...talking about my priority item right now, and in our update before Budget you had said that it might be about \$10,000 to contract to get a list of all the short-term rentals. And I did have some correspondence with Finance, they said that there's about 11,000 units paying taxes as short-term rentals lawfully, lawful short-term rental units. And just wondering is that still the same amount, 10,000?

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah, that's a guess. But I think, yeah, that's...you would put 25,000 on your priority so somewhere in there.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Is it is under than the rest of the money would just go back to the General Fund?

MS. MCLEAN: If we don't spend it, yeah, it would be Carryover/Savings.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, and then the idea was to, that one of that guy at that meeting that you had right before all of this happened had said if we embed a County logo and issue that to all the lawful short-term rental units that would bring it, if they people click on it, it would bring it to the County website and that would be another way to show that this is a lawful short-term rental, because right now a lot of people seem to think only permitted rentals are legal when there's only like 200 permits but there's 11,000 legal rentals. So, I mean, in that way it could be like an ID number, but it's a logo that's embedded and if...it's a County logo that's embedded and if somebody fraudulently tries to recreate it that that's copyright infringement. Any thoughts on that?

MS. MCLEAN: Wow. No, I don't know if...because the enforcement that we do is based on ads, it's based on what we can find on hosting platforms, so I don't know that the hosting platforms would have a place for that kind of embedded logo. They'd be looking for some sort of permit number or registration number, so I think having the registration number would be helpful, and I don't know what's happening with the State Leg but there are more bills in the Leg that call for the hosting platforms to list numbers, so that would go hand in hand with that. So, in terms of a logo, I really don't have any expertise in that area, so I don't know.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you.

MR. HART: I would just say that it's really critical that the hosting platforms participate and show any or allow any of the permit holders or authorized unit owners to show their authorization. That's been the real challenge is getting those to be consistently on the listings.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you. That can be my two minutes for my priority as well.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. Mine is again for the Department it's maybe a little bit more of asking them to maybe start planning on how they'll adjust, Chair. So, Director, for you and the Deputy, I don't have a problem supporting you with giving you some financial resources, especially in the consideration of the zoning chapter rewrite of how we might want to use that opportunity to help us refocus the drivers of our economy, and maybe make land use and zoning a part of our tools to help shift our drivers to something more sensible, more reliable, and more sustainable. And so, I'm looking at making diversified ag and energy, healthcare, education, culture, and construction to take over the role of the visitor industry. So, what we need from you is your ideas on how we can plan with the workforce, the housing to manage the growth and start shifting our...everything to adjust the role of the visitor industry from number one to something more accessory and more complementary to the residents' needs than everything else complementing the visitor needs. Any comments, please?

MS. MCLEAN: We'd love to. If you could repeat, you said diversified ag, energy, healthcare, and--what...there were one or two other industries--construction.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Education, healthcare, and construction. I think that can help us still have a growing resident community base not be so dependent on development and speculation, bring more reasonable assessments back to real property, and keep our people home. I think that's doable, and we should use this opportunity to start adjusting those drivers particularly now that we know we are too dependent on the visitor. We cannot function like this anymore.

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah. This is really an opportunity to reset our economy.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: So, is there something you need in this budget from us that could help kick start this type of energy or movement?

MS. MCLEAN: Let me think about...

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: You know, we talk about...you know, this pandemic may come back in 12 months, so I want to be ready in 12 months than keep talking about it.

MS. MCLEAN: Right. Let me give that some thought and we can respond in writing.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Okay, thank you, Director. That's it, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hi, Madam Chair, Madam Director, I think we're all kind of trying to move in that new direction, yeah. And of course, everybody has ideas but solutions is



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

what we're really after, and I think Mr. Hokama had some great ideas, but if I were wanting to start a new business on Maui and invest heavily in the economy, I'd like to know if there's gonna be housing for my employees, and at the rate we're going we have the reputation of being one of the worst places in the world for moving housing projects forward. And I know last year or last term that you guys had some kind of system where you put the affordable projects at the top with some kind of pink card or something like that. And number one, did that work, and number two, if it doesn't what will it take to work to expedite projects? I mean, I hear that we have this one project, the one across Foodland in Kahului who needs a CO and they can't get one. This is an affordable housing project for old people, I mean, you know. Can you comment on all of that, please? Thank you.

MS. MCLEAN: Well, I can comment specifically on Kahului Lani that we have signed off on the CO. I don't know what the holdup is for whatever department has not but we have. The pink sheet, the pink cover sheet, that's something that Housing is supposed to administer because it's when there's an affordable housing project that meets the standards in Chapter 2.97, they oversee that, they're supposed to be the ones involved with the pink sheet or the prioritization going out. There has not been that many that have gotten that prioritization. When they do come in, they are on the top of the pile, and we do review them promptly, but there hasn't, simply hasn't been that many of them. So, the system as far as I know does work, it just hasn't been used that much, unfortunately.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Do you know if the Housing Division actually checks and monitors all of the departments or they just assume?

MS. MCLEAN: The ones that go through the 2.97 process has to go through them, so they are aware of it. They're just the point is there just have not been that many since that process was put in place, there hasn't been that many 100 percent affordable or 201Hs that have gone through. And there just haven't been that many that would qualify for that process.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, well what about the one that you signed the CO off on? That's not one of those kinds of projects?

MS. MCLEAN: I don't remember if that...I think it did because that went through pretty quickly. I don't know what's the hold up on the CO. I don't know. I remember being asked about it, and I checked and we had signed off so that's...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. I've...Michele, I've dealt with you for like 25 years and you strike me as the type of person if I'm an applicant and I don't have my application right you don't keep sending me back 'til I get it right, you help me. I mean, isn't that what the County customer service is all about? How do we instill that in every department?

MS. MCLEAN: Take a frying pan to the side of their head. We have done customer service training and we have more customer service training waiting in the wind. I try to convey to people that you have to imagine that that applicant is your uncle or your little sister

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

coming in. You know, you're not gonna tell them no, go figure it out. You're gonna say, oh, no, that's not right, this is what you have to do. But we have people lie to our faces regularly, it gets really hard sometimes to maintain that helpful attitude when people are disrespectful to you and when they lie to you. That's what our job is, and we have to overcome that, but we need to just keep doing the training until we feel like it really has resonated with everybody.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yes, thank you very much, Madam Chair. Just have one question regarding the in Details, Page 14-11, on the request for rentals, the 75,000. Location of the rentals, will they be...are these rentals being used for One Main Plaza, and if not, what location, and if this appropriation is not approved, does this have any impact on the six E/Ps you're requesting as far as housing them?

MS. MCLEAN: The additional rent would be for additional office space in One Main Plaza, and if we can't get that then I don't know that we would recruit for those positions, because we...our office, we are maxed out already, so we don't have space to put people. So, we wouldn't be able to hire them if we don't have more space for them.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, very good. Thank you. That's all I have for now, Madam Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I just had a quick question for the Director, just the 23.8 percent increase in other costs from 1,055,690 in Fiscal Year 2020 up to 1,306,731. Page 453.

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah. Other costs, that includes the increase in rent, I believe, and the UH Sea Grant positions.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay.

MS. MCLEAN: So, there's the increase in rent and then the increase in the Sea Grant positions to adjust them to the Federal budget cycle, so that's the main reason for that increase.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay, thank you for that clarification, Director. That's all, Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, and I don't have any additional questions. Okay, so we have seven priority proposals, one from Member Paltin, four from Committee Vice-Chair King, and two from Member Molina. Member Paltin, she already kind of pitched her priority proposal, but if you'd like to

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

speak to it, Member Paltin, and then we'll get comments from the Department, and then I'll ask if any Members have questions.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, basically you know, there's so much confusion when people talk about short-term rental permits and they're discounting the fact that there's only about 200-something short-term rental permits but 11,000 lawful short-term rental units, and there's confusion too, a lot of people think that if they don't have that permit number they're not lawful. So, you know, and we don't know all the things, so it's just, you know, to help us get a handle on the true number of lawful short-term rental and where they are and have that list available for folks that want to know is a short-term rental unit lawful or not. And in the Director's pre-budget presentation, she said that they could get a contract to register, give all those folks numbers for about 10 grand, and then that extra 15 was the embedded logo idea, but we can just start with the registration number and take it from there. That's it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. So, are you saying to reduce your priority proposal to 10,000?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes, I mean, whatever it would cost for the contract.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo Member Paltin. Director McLean?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess, sorry, not to exceed 25,000.

MS. MCLEAN: I think this is something that is worth doing. I think it would be helpful in a lot of ways, so we'd be glad for this to be included in our budget.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. So, not to exceed 25,000 or not to exceed 10,000?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I would say not to exceed 25,000 with any excess from the contract returning to the Carryover/Savings or returning . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, we'll go to Member Sinenci for one question, one follow-up, and then Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No questions, Chair, supportive. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, Madam Chair, I appreciate the proposal, no questions at this time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Support, thank you.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No questions, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No questions, Chair. I support this measure.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Okay. I think everyone is supportive and no questions. Okay, and then next is Committee Vice-Chair King with four priority proposals. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you, Chair. I didn't get asked, but I didn't have any questions on the last one either.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, sorry.

VICE-CHAIR KING: That's okay. So, starting with my first one is similar to Councilmember Molina's and this is for the funding for South Maui Advisory Committee and the Ha'ikū-Pā'ia Advisory Committee. So, I think when we get to the decision making, I guess I'm hearing from the Department that they really needed 300,000, not the 200,000 that we put in, but I still think that we should analyze this for hours served on the Hāna Advisory so that we...I don't know, 'cause it doesn't seem like we need full-time people for couple meetings a month, but that's what that one is about. And this is I think some of the things that we need to realize that we need to have in these in the districts are these meetings not just for reviewing some of the permit issues but also some of the issues that have been coming up in this Committee meeting about things like CPAC appointments that they could help with, the Charter Commission appointments, the, even the issues like the water station refills in each district, where should those go to be most effective, but all those things are district centric, and so that's my proposal on that. It outlines the staff that the Department told us they need. The next one is the cost of two additional planners, and the two additional planners are for the Mā'alaea coastal erosion study. This came up in the Mā'alaea...the association meeting and I think some other Councilmembers, as Councilmember Sugimura said were there, but it's an ongoing issue with shoreline erosion and the failing sea walls and so this is a study that was supported by the Department that will help us I think gain knowledge not only of this particular region but of what's happening along the shoreline all in South Maui. The next one is the 175,000 for...I'm sorry, wait. That was the coastal zone management positions, and then the 175,000 is for the actual study to address coastal erosion in that area. The other position, the two positions were actually a position or a written question that we, my office, gave to the Department and then the answer they can explain in the detail on those two positions. And then the last one is the South Maui Dune Management and this is monies for restoring the dunes that are

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

getting really messed up in South Maui and sand is moving all over the place, so the money would be used for supplies and services. And we actually have Tara Owens on the meeting as well in case you need to ask her questions since this item came directly from her recommendations. Those are my four proposals, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Department, any comments?

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah, thank you. Again with the advisory committees, until we know what their duties are gonna be it's hard to say what the staffing responsibilities will be, so it is sort of a moving target. I apologize for that, but I'm trying to give you accurate answers, and we don't know enough about what these committees are going to do for me to be able to tell you, but I think the three positions, the \$200,000 for the funding for the three positions is accurate. There will be a one-time cost for equipment for them to buy their office furniture and office equipment, but then there would be ongoing rent for their share. So, that's why the amounts differ a little bit. On the two planners, I want to be sure just on the sheet here under sub-object character type where it has 106801, that's the number of the CZM grant that we get from the State, and I don't believe the State has any additional funding for additional positions. So, while this position or these positions would support, would be part of the shoreline team, there's no indication that there is State funding for them. So, they can just be put under the General Fund budget, they shouldn't be put under the CZM grant. I think one additional shoreline...we've already requested one additional shoreline planner. I don't know that we need two. I mean, we'd be happy to take two, but we put forward what we believe the staffing needs are and that would include one more shoreline planner. For the Mā`alaea erosion study, I think that's a good amount. Then the 50,000 for the South Maui Dune Management, I think that's a good amount too.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you, Director. So, the two additional planners, we can change that to one additional planner?

MS. MCLEAN: That could be changed to one additional planner, but we've already put in for it, so I don't know if...how your process is working if you need to have...if this underscores what we've requested or because we've requested it and it doesn't have to show here, but we...one of the planners, one the expansion positions that we requested is gonna be for a shoreline planner.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, we can...so, the request here that's outside of what's already in the budget can be changed to one additional shoreline planner --

MS. MCLEAN: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KING: --instead of two. Okay, 'cause at the time my office contacted your office they said they needed two, but we didn't get the message that one of 'em was put in, so we can change this request, our request to the one, so that's fine. And we didn't put an amount in because we figure we needed to get that amount from your office, but we can get that, we don't have to discuss that now.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

MS. MCLEAN: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Director. Okay, questions, Members. We'll start with Pro Temp Kama, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I don't have any questions. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No questions. The one that I wondered about was the planner, but I did see that we already have one in the budget, so this would have been over and beyond, but thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. So, my question, I guess, would be for Member King and Member Molina when we had discussed this item I think PSLU-43, -44 Director McLean sent out specific questions to the working groups, the community associations, and I had tried to ask them to respond to the questions and that would've helped her to get the accurate numbers. And so, I don't know if, what happened, but it seems like she never got responses to her questions, and I was just wondering do you think it's possible to get responses to the questions and for them to be on the same page before decisions week?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, I don't...I'll answer that. I don't remember seeing that list of questions. Did you send it to the Committee as well, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: She sent it to the Committee, I believe, it's probably in EDB in the pre-budget part of it, but maybe she can resend it specifically to you and Member Molina. I'm pretty sure that in my conversations with the working groups they had seen them, they just haven't provided her the response, unless I don't know...Director McLean, it sounds like you haven't gotten a response to your questions yet.

MS. MCLEAN: That's right. I haven't gotten them. I thought that would be discussion in Committee with the resource people that Councilmember King and Councilmember Molina had identified previously, but you know, the way things are now however we can get that information would be helpful.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Director, do you think you could send it to me and Councilmember Molina again and then we can try to get that, those answers. I know that Councilmember Molina has been working with community leaders and doesn't actually have a working group that's meeting right now. We've got one in South Maui, but they haven't obviously been meeting face-to-face, but you know, we can go back to those respective groups and get those answers to your questions. I think we can get them before decision making week. Councilmember Molina, do you have a...

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, I'll do my best to do outreach to the, our community association to see what kind of responses we can provide or input.

MS. MCLEAN: Okay, yeah. I'll forward that letter to both of your offices.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you. That's excellent.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And for...I don't have any questions on the other ones except maybe just a clarification to Director McLean. Were you saying that one coastal zone planner was enough and that you had already asked for it or one in addition to the one that you asked for? Just clarifying.

MS. MCLEAN: Well, we did ask for an additional shoreline planner, and so if Councilmember King feels that two are needed, then we would need one additional, so.

VICE-CHAIR KING: And you actually...yeah, actually our request for two came from discussion with the Planning Department needing two, and then we didn't realize you were already putting one in, so I think I'm confused now too, because we're...if you don't need any addition, we can eliminate this one, but we were told that there were two planners needed for coastal zone management, and then I didn't realize one of them had already been asked for in your six E/P expansion.

MS. MCLEAN: I think the request for two additional shoreline planners came from our existing shoreline team who feel very overworked. I will stand behind the request that we put in for one additional planner, but we would certainly welcome another shoreline planner, so I will leave that to the Council to decide.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Do you want, Ms. Paltin, do you want to hear from Ms. Owens, Tara Owens, who's on the call?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King and Members, . . . *(inaudible)*. . . waiting to be called upon by the Chair that would be appreciated. Mahalo. Okay, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The next one is the study and I just was wondering when you create the study, the other, the second E/P shoreline planner will have things to do before the study is created? Like it's not just...

MS. MCLEAN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you. I'm good.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Member Hokama?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, Member Molina...oh, sorry, skipped Chair Lee again.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No questions, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. Member Molina, and my apologies, I should have asked if you would want to present your priority item since it's similar to or the same as Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair, no apologies necessary. If I could just go delve right into that proposal to just add a few more things that haven't been talked about. Again, this, the intent was to have both our districts have these planning advisory committees, and I can understand where Director McLean is coming from with the \$300,000 because input that I've gotten from my community is there's been some folks that want these advisory groups to take on responsibilities like SMA authority and also relieving the Planning Commission of some of the responsibilities like approving or disapproving permits for bed and breakfasts and vacation rentals. So, yes, it is a moving target, so which is why I can see Director McLean's proposal for 300,000 as a potentially good starting figure with this. So, you know again, I think it's helpful to have the funding available in anticipation of the adoption of this ordinance, which I'm confident that the proposed bill will pass within the Fiscal Year 2021, and therefore the funding will be necessary to implement these committees. And, Madam Chair, can I go on to my second proposal?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We'll just keep at that one and then I'll see if...

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, okay. We're staying on that one. Okay. Just thought I...you know why, I wanted to throw mine in so just in case I get the abandoned vehicle syndrome like Member Lee.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No abandoned vehicles here.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: All right. Just teasing. Thank you. I'll wait for my turn. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sinenci, if you have a question for Committee Vice-Chair King or Member Molina for this priority proposal because it's basically the same thing?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No questions at this time, Chair. I appreciate the collaboration with the Department. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, and then I have one question, Director. So, for either the 300 or the 200, I understand the 300 amount is



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

to include for space and equipment and getting the additional staff set up and going. So, the \$300,000 amount is for 12 months?

MS. MCLEAN: It...the 300,000 would be for 12 months, but we're obviously not gonna have all three positions filled and offices rented starting July 1<sup>st</sup>, so yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. That's good information for us to know so that we can reduce it appropriately because we know that it's not going to start on July 1<sup>st</sup>, so we would have to make a determination on when it would start. Do you have an idea of at what point it would be needed, the funds?

MS. MCLEAN: Well, honestly it wouldn't be needed until the ordinance is adopted and those advisory committees are created, and I don't know when that's gonna be. For the expansion positions that we requested, I believe the salaries are for eight months or nine months. Do you know?

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Eight months.

MS. MCLEAN: Eight months. So, the...you know, to keep it consistent it could be that, but actually I mean, I...in the letter which I'll forward to Councilmember Molina and Councilmember King, we asked that the bill be reviewed by the Planning Commission, so that the Planning Commission could also offer comments. I don't know if that's contemplated. It had been discussed previously, but that would delay it even longer, so it could be fewer months than eight months for the salaries. The equipment and all that that's gonna be a one-time cost, so that's gonna be...that doesn't need to be reduced, but then the rent could also be reduced by the same percentage that the salaries are reduced.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. I guess, do you have an idea of where you would put additional staff?

MS. MCLEAN: Well, we have talked to the landlord's representative at One Main Plaza, and there is an office suite on the third floor that would accommodate the six expansion positions. I don't know if three more could fit in there. I'd have to...we'd have to look pretty carefully at that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. And then...oh, go ahead.

MS. MCLEAN: No, no, no. Yeah, I don't have anything else to add on that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo. And then my last question is for Member Molina or Committee Vice-Chair King regarding the breakdown of that amount, or I don't know if maybe Director would have this information, exactly what, how much out of the 300 is for salary, how much out of the 300,000 is for space, and how much out of the 300,000 is for equipment?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair, I yield to the Director.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, I did get...we did get from the Department that the 200,000, that figure that they gave us was for 3 positions, a supervisor planner, one staff planner, and one board secretary, so that the extra is for the other costs.

MS. MCLEAN: I can give you, in writing I can give you more of a breakdown for those.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great. Mahalo, Director. Okay, and we have one last priority proposal for...from Member Molina. Okay, no abandoned vehicle.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, you're too kind. Anyway, my request relates to Detail 14-10 under professional services. This is a, an increase in appropriation by 250,000 for professional services, so it would go from 430,000 to 680,000, and this is related to because of numerous calls we've received over the last year for the lack of responsiveness to inquiries about permit status kind of dovetails into the conversation Member Lee had with Director McLean. This is basically a proposal to, again, review the length of the permit process because of the concerns expressed by the community, and the Mayor said that customer service is a high priority, yet, you know, we continue to receive calls about this related to possibly members of the Planning staff, and I don't know what the...cannot exactly pinpoint the problem, but the purpose of this line item is to provide funding for contracting for an assessment of this permit process and enhancing customer service. And, you know, Madam Chair, it should be looked at potentially as an audit for assessing the permit process and customer service. Now, my understanding is the new tech process that IT has been working on may go a long towards helping, but the plan still require human review and therefore, you know, we should focus, in my opinion, on making that effort efficient and user friendly. And I do want to know, Director McLean and Director Hart have been very responsive to our request on behalf of the constituents, but at the same time it does trouble me that we have to bother the Director and Deputy Director with the inquiries from the constituents when a lot of these problems should be taken care of by the Department personnel and/or the Mayor's Office, which serves as an intermediary between the Mayor and the Department and complaints from the constituents, so that's basically one of the major reasons. And I'm hoping that this is looked at as a helpful tool and not something to point fingers at, but it's a helpful tool to improve our services as it relates to expediting the permit process and our customer services. So, you know, I'm hopeful that the Mayor and Administration is truly interested, which I believe they are, to make the changes to achieve this goal, so we don't get inundated with these constant complaints from the community, and it's been over a number of, you know, years, and it's something that's not old, but in particularly this past year it seemed to increase at least from my office with the calls made to us. So, that's my spiel on that, Madam Chair. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Director McLean, any comments on Member Molina's proposal?

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah, Jordan and I were chatting back and forth here. I didn't really have the impression that there are constant complaints, and, you know, I'm a little bit surprised that this is seemed to be so problematic that it warrants a study. I'm sorry if that is the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

case and, you know, getting additional staff will help. A lot of times the Planning Department is thought to be responsible for delays in “permitting” and if that’s building permits there are often many other departments involved. Certainly, there are times when we have issues with a building permit, but like Council Chair Lee was asking about the CO for Kahului Lani, we had signed off on that. So, the public perception is that, oh, Planning is so slow, but we don’t administer COs and on that one we signed off. So, I don’t know, I, absolutely we need to do the best job that we can and we need to have good customer service, but I don’t...my...I wasn’t aware that there was that kind of perception and that this kind of study was needed. It was a little bit of a surprise to me.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King, and then Member...Pro Temp Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KING: No questions, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: No questions, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thanks, Chair. So, I just wanted to clarify then, you don’t think this is necessary, to the Director?

MS. MCLEAN: I said I was surprised to find that this was wanted. I wasn’t aware that the concerns about the permit said the Planning Department processes were to the point that a study on how to improve the process needed to be commissioned. That was a surprise. Certainly, we can do better. We can always do better. I just I didn’t know that it rose to the level of needing audit.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, you don’t...you think you can do better without this?

MS. MCLEAN: I...you know, part of me would be interested to see what kind of findings they might make, but this, you know, I don’t know. Do you have anything to say?

MR. HART: My only comment is that, you know, I really think that we have a difficult framework. Our land use planning guidance system is complicated. I mean, we’re talking about adding another layer to it right now just in this meeting, so I mean, I think that our individual performance is a relevant issue, but I also think that we share a portion of burden with the framework of how our approvals are required to be administered and that makes...I mean, coming out of the private sector, that’s a whole layer of complication, it’s not just dealing with the individual that you’re trying to work

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

with on an application. It's making it through the entire process from start to finish. Those are my comments.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And to clarify that additional layer that you're talking about was you said we're talking about...

MR. HART: Yeah, it's the other committees, right, that's what I'm talking about. I mean we're...what I'm trying to say is we have a very complicated situation and, you know, we're not sufficiently content that it involves enough involvement with the community and review, so we're continuing to talk about how we can treat that. So, what I'm just trying to say is that that's an already complicated process that we operate, and that I think has a lot to do with how easy or quickly any application makes it through the Planning Department is all of the steps that you have to accomplish.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you, and sorry, just one more. Is this gonna be...I mean, isn't this kind of what the Title 19 update or rewrite is supposed to address is this, I mean, isn't that kind of the professional services that we're paying for with the Title 19 rewrite?

MS. MCLEAN: To a degree. I mean it will hopefully result in a framework where fewer permits are needed to do things, but it's not going to change how we process permits. So, if the thinking is that we're not fast enough or that our customer service isn't sufficient the Title 19 rewrite isn't going to change that, but if it's, you know, the system is too cumbersome and there are permits required for too many things that it will in a small way address that.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, thank you very much.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: No questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Chair Lee? Okay, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you. Okay, this time I do have some comments. I believe, I firmly believe, Ms. McLean, that one way to expedite the process for your Department and any department and every department is to have more training, because a study will show you and tell you the exact same things that we all know. It's taking too long, okay. Training on the other hand because I've been a director I know what this is like. I have dealt with my fellow departments and they can be as slow as molasses and the reason for that is because everybody has their opinions, their own opinions of how things should be. Training helps to teach people about consistency, about interpreting the law and being consistent and never mind about your opinion

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

because I...and I'll give you an example. We used to have what's called a grants review committee, and this grants review committee would, you know, was supposed to take away the politics of deciding which entity would get what grant. Well, what happens is they all have their own biases and that's a fact. So, one of my grants managers said, you know, I don't know why we have this grants review committee, you know, they're not doing us any good, they're not doing the community any good. And I said, oh, stop one second, if you want to do that, you have to run for Council, and I was being facetious but it's the truth. If you want to create policy, run for Council. So, the people who are in Administration need to understand the difference with the roles. One is administration and implementation and the other one is creating policy and they have to know why they have their roles, and their roles are important but they have to keep their personal opinions out of the workplace, and if they had more training, this would be the answer. So, in this case, Mr. Molina, I firmly believe that another study wouldn't necessarily help but more training will. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I appreciate the conversation. I would support maybe an assessment evaluation tool, maybe by an outside independent contractor just to, you know, that way it's outside of the Department and maybe it's something that constituents can fill out or go online and then...and the Department receives some kind of report, but good conversations. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, my question to Member Molina is how did you arrive at the \$250,000 amount?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: It was a figure that we kind of just threw out there matching it with typical studies. It may be more or less, but in general, Madam Chair, let me just say that the calls we get are from people who...well not only want to see how their permits can be expedited but there's people in the building community and some want to remain anonymous 'cause for whatever reasons they just fear maybe possible retaliation by personnel, and but that's just the thoughts that's been shared with my office. I assume none of the other Councilmembers have people complaining about the permit process, maybe it's just me. I don't know, but the bottom line is, I don't know if a study has already been done previously. If it has, fine, let's take a look at that, but if it hasn't, well...I'm like you, I'm not too fond of doing multiple studies, but if one is warranted in this area, then maybe this is what we need to delve deeply, and not only just Department. I'm sure there's...and I agree with the Director that there may be other departments that have a role in holding up our permit processes, but you know, time is money for a lot of people and especially for our citizens who need approvals for their permits to get their improvements done on their house and especially right now with people out of work a lot of people are working on their homes. So, I don't know if there's been an uptick in the request for permits to make improvements to people's homes. This is why I think it validates the, you know, taking a deeper look at this and whether it be through a study or whatnot, but I throw this out there for consideration and behalf of citizens who have these concerns. Thank you.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I hope that answers your question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Kind of, but it's okay, you can take my opportunity to respond to other Members' concerns and questions. So, it sounds like your goal is to expedite the permitting process, but it also says to enhance customer service. So, you would like, when you say customer service, you're meaning one-on-one treatment of employee to residents?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, and how they deal with the general public. I mean, I guess that could tie into the training that Director McLean has been talking about, but again, maybe to improve interactions, and I've had constituents tell me the Department personnel tell, say they've been told go call your Councilmembers, okay. And instead of working within the Department or maybe get assistance from the Director some will just tell the citizens that, go call the Councilmembers, and I know this because I also worked in the Mayor's Office and we served as liaisons to the public for the Mayor, the former Administration, and I was told that by the constituent, they said go call the Councilmember, and on occasion some Councilmembers would call me as an executive assistant. So, again, I don't know what the disconnect is so that's why I'm hoping maybe through a study that we can get a firmer grasp on this thing and whatever it costs, but again it's up to us if we want to continue going in this direction. To me, if we don't show any foresight into doing something about it, then it's just status quo. And well, if the Director can fix it without a study then God bless us all, but if not, if the problem persists, then what? At least we have a study to validate our concerns on behalf of our citizens who are simply getting frustrated with the delays. So anyway, I think I've said enough, and I'll save my comments for when we get into final decision making. Thank you. And I appreciate all the comments on this.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, Members, those were all the priority proposals. Yeah.

MS. MCLEAN: Chair, can I make one suggestion?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, Director McLean, please proceed.

MS. MCLEAN: I just wanted to note and this is very minor but if we're working with an applicant and we're telling them that they cannot do what they're asking to do or they have a building permit for something that we can't sign off on and we're explaining that to them and they're not happy with it because we're administering the law, we might say you need to talk to the Council about changing the law. So, we don't say go run to the Council if you're not happy with the job I'm doing. If you don't like the law that we're administering, you can talk to the Council about changing the law. I just wanted to qualify if staff has told people to talk to your Councilmember it could be because a change in the law is needed for them to do what they've asked to do, if that helps the discussion at all.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director.

MS. MCLEAN: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right, Members, if there aren't any last comments or questions, I'll thank the Planning Department for joining us today.

MR. HART: Thank you.

MS. MCLEAN: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Director and Deputy Director, for being with us.

\*\*\*\*\*

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members, so that was our last department for today. Good job, we made it before 5:00 p.m. Lots of applause. So, we do need to discuss the range of rates reso that needs to be posted tomorrow. So, if Members wouldn't mind taking a quick break, and then we'll get that ready and set up for everyone. It's 4:43, so let me make sure that it's okay if we come back at 5:00, Members?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: To do what again?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The range of rates for RPT needs to be posted tomorrow. So, I wanted to at least have a discussion on that so that we know what it is that we're posting for tomorrow for the real property tax rates and range. Oh, okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We have to give it to the Clerk's tonight for posting tomorrow.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King, followed by Member Sugimura.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Is that posted on Granicus? I don't have Granicus in front of me, so do you have a proposal already posted for the range?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, it's not posted. That's why we're gonna take a...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so you're going to give it to us when we reconvene at 5:00?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. All right. Thanks.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, you're gonna have that meeting for this, we post tonight and have the meeting next week.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: regular day of posting on a deadline.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: I'm good with your same format as last year, Chair. I thought you had enough flexibility. So, I'm good if you're gonna post the same thing.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'm good with that too.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Well, it's not just the rates, yeah. It's the tiers. We have a new system this year, so if we want to just, you know discuss the range of rates and the range of tiers, you know, the valuations that we'll be posting. Okay. All right.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can you...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Back at 5:00?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay. Are you posting what the Mayor is proposing?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's what we're gonna discuss when we reconvene.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Give us a hint.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I'm ready for you to break.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. So, we'll recess 'til 5:00. All right, great. No objections, it's 4:46, and we'll reconvene at 5:00 p.m. The Economic Development and Budget Committee is now in recess. . . .(gavel). . .



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

RECESS: 4:46 p.m.  
RECONVENE: 5:14 p.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Economic Development and Budget Committee please return to order. It's 5:14 on April 13. And we're taking up the last order of the day which is discussion on the range of rates and rate proposal of tier valuations for posting tomorrow. Okay, so what has been distributed to the Members is a comparison of what was proposed by the Mayor which is tiering Non-Owner Occupied classification and Short-Term Rental classification. The Non-Owner Occupied tier is Tier 1, less than 800,000 at \$5.60 per thousand, Tier 2 is \$800,001 to 1.5 million at \$6.20, and Tier 3 is above, more than 1.5 million which would be at a rate of \$6.50. And what was proposed for the tiers in the Short-Term Rental classification was Tier 1 less than 900,000 at a rate of \$10.75, and Tier 2 more than 900,000 at a rate of \$11 per thousand. And so, we did pass the law to allow for three of the classifications to be tiered, which is the Owner-Occupied...I'm sorry, four, Owner-Occupied, Non-Owner Occupied, Short-Term Rental, Commercial, and Industrial, or five, five classifications can be tiered. And so, we can discuss what the Mayor has proposed. I've used the same...I've proposed using the same range for the Owner-Occupied classification, less than 800,000 for Tier 1, and the range of rates for that would be between \$1.66 to \$2.61. Tier 2, \$800,001 to 1.5 million and the range of rates would be between \$1.66 to 2.61, and 1.5...more than 1.5 million at 1.66 to \$3.95. And to also tier the Commercial classification at the same amount, the first two tiers between \$5.60 to \$6.29, and the last tier at \$5.60 to \$8.39 per thousand. And so, we can discuss the range and the valuations for posting tomorrow, and whatever range we post today...I'm sorry, decide on today for posting tomorrow, will be the range that we lock ourselves into, and then at the next public hearing we'll have decide on...decided upon what rate to propose and that will be the next, the second public hearing that will happen. Okay, so I'll call on one Member at a time, and we'll start with Committee Vice-Chair King, and then we'll go to Pro Temp Kama, and then we'll work our way left on feedback and, you know, discussion on what to post tomorrow. Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Just to kind of reiterate, so if we lock ourselves in for the Homeowner section then we are basically for Tier 1 and Tier 2 agreeing that we will lower the rates to 2.61 at the highest. The rate would not be...we could not go up to the 2.90, that's the current rate?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah. So, the Mayor proposed a rate of \$2.61 for all 3 tiers.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If you want to...if the Committee would like to have it go all the way up to \$2.90, we can.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so I'm just kind of trying to ascertain that we're...if we propose...if we agree on this range that you proposed, then we're agreeing that we are lowering the Homeowners tax, keeping the Residential tax for the first tier at least at the \$5.60 from

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

the current year, and then we have options of raising on the Short-Term Rental tiers? So, I'm still...I don't have a comment. I just wanted to clarify those things and I'm still looking through it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, if we want to...so, it's the range, so lowest would be 1.66 and the highest would be 2.61, if we want to increase it to 2.90 we can, and we're proposing...I'm proposing that we also...so, the Non-Owner Occupied is what the Mayor proposed, and I used the first two tiers as the maximum threshold for the first two tiers and then increased the Tier 3 to, from 6.50 to 6.70 to give us more range.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, right. Okay. So, and can you just...just for our listeners just explain the difference between Homeowner and Residential as well?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Homeowner or Residential...oh, Residential is no longer a classification, it's Non-Owner Occupied and Owner-Occupied.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. So, the names on the far left at the old names and the names that we're dealing with are the ones in column D?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can I interrupt one second?

VICE-CHAIR KING: I don't have any more questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I think it would be helpful to the Members if those of us who want to change numbers could find out, like, at...hopefully we have somebody from Finance there who can say well if we change the number to X, what would the consequence be? You know, 'cause right now we're just shooting in the dark, so do we have somebody from Finance there, and then I won't interrupt anymore?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All we're doing is range.

VICE-CHAIR KING: We're just setting the range.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We're not choosing what the rates are gonna be. We're just saying...

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, we're just saying that we're gonna stay within this range of this minimum and this maximum, so that's what I was kind of trying to clarify. So, if we put 2.61 as the maximum, we cannot go above that. We're locking ourselves into a reduction in the Homeowner category, but we still have...

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Why would we...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, we still have the range of everything below that, so.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: But why would we want to do that for the multimillion dollar homes?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If you want to increase the maximum threshold, Chair Lee, we can. That's why we're discussing it now.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I just wanted to clarify in my mind what we are looking at and that we, you know, what we're locking ourselves into if we go along with the Mayor's rates. So, I'm gonna...until I like hear everybody I'll reserve my opinion right now. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, I'm gonna take two questions from each Member. Sorry, I didn't say that from the beginning. Okay, Member Sugimura...oh, sorry, Pro Temp Kama, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Point of information.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: In response to Member Lee, I just wanted to remind her that Finance did say that the assessed values went up from January 1<sup>st</sup>, so it's even though the rate is dropping the amount being collected is more. So, just when she said she wanted input from Finance that's just reminding her.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. I think I would be more open to just hearing what the discussion is on the floor by the different Members, and I just think that the rates on the range should be higher than the Mayor's, it gives us more flexibility to make some determinations in the future as we go.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Pro Temp Kama. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: This is important for us to understand. COVID-19 is a big cloud amongst us, and I understand that this is our revenue generator and it's from the, you know, last year. But today, we have all these empty hotels and we have a big problem of unemployed fellow citizens as well as empty hotels, and I wonder the Hotel rate which is Mayor's proposing 9.37 and it was \$11 per thousand, you know, for us when we did the 2020 Budget. But the hotels are empty and how do you, you know, justify charging them a high rate when they don't have income? So, I just want to say

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

that. For all of these tiers, I think when we had our last hearing for, I forget the bill numbers, but when we're talking about RPT, the loud...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura? Okay. We'll come back to Member Sugimura. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Two questions, right, or comments? So, --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --we're only utilizing two tiers for the Short-Term Rental. Is there a reason? Is it like there's not that many...there's not that big a range in Short-Term Rental, or are we just keeping it simple?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That was just what the Mayor had proposed. If we want to propose something different, we can.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And so...okay. I guess my second question is...and I don't think it would be for you, Chair, because...but when we're talking about hotels rates, hotels, timeshares, they all don't have people in them and we actually...or the Mayor actually did shut down Airbnb and STRHs, but that doesn't...so I mean, they're all in the same category that way, but that doesn't mean that we don't need to improve the roads and make the fixes and do the other things while the hotels are empty. So, you know, I know Member Hokama said it was good that we separated Timeshare and Short-Term Rental, but I kind of feel like they're in the same category still yet. So, I don't know if that's a question, but I don't see the difference necessarily between hotels, timeshares, and short-term rentals except for maybe that hotels are a little bit more compliant with shutting it down. There's still word of short-term rentals and timeshare people coming in. There's still word of, you know, short-term rental getting into arguments with people about not refunding their money for travelling during Coronavirus. So, yeah, maybe hotels do deserve a bigger break than the timeshare and short-term rental, because they've been more willing to work with us here for the bigger picture. Other than that, I mean, they're all having hard impacts and but short-term rental is the that we shut down or the Mayor, the County shut down. So, I don't know how that plays into things. I don't know if the Mayor ordered the hotels to shut down or they just shut down voluntarily. So, I don't know how that plays into everything.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Hokama?

COUNCILMEMBER HOKAMA: Thank you, Chair. I'm viewing it from this perspective, Chair, you know, what we discuss here for RPT is for next year's budget. We basically collected this year's revenues that the Finance Director should be certifying shortly. So, for me on the rates, on the ranges, I prefer you consider for us, Chair, a reasonable amount whatever it be, \$1 less than the Mayor's proposed rate and I don't have a problem looking at least \$1 above the Mayor's rate in all categories. And again, I think we should maintain, one, maximum flexibility, two, we're gonna need some good data to make some assumptions and to adjust certain tax categories that we feel needs some

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

temporary relief or support, and then recalculate once we understand the total General Fund requirements how we'd like to collect it, so I would ask for that consideration of maximum range and flexibility for us to continue to listen to the departments and community of their budget requests. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Hokama. And the certification will be presented on April 17. Okay, let's see. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you, Madam Chair. I support your proposal. I see that...first of all, I cannot understand why there would be only rate for all three categories. I can see the same rate for the first two categories but not the multimillion dollar homes. So, if you guys want to give the millionaires, multimillionaires a break, well, I would suggest what Mr. Hokama just suggested add \$1, okay. So, instead of \$2.61 per thousand that you add \$3.61 per thousand, but you already have that covered in your range. You're talking about homeowners now, homeowners. So, I think that what you have there is very good, and it certainly gives everybody options for discussion. So, are we only talking about the homeowners as we go down, or are you talking about all of them, the, down the list? Huh? I can't hear you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sorry, I didn't unmute myself. So, yeah, I guess we can take it one classification at a time so starting with the Owner-Occupied. I think everyone kind of just gave some comments overall, but we can start with Owner-Occupied and see if anyone wants to change what was proposed.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, just to remind everybody this is, to me, an overly generous proposal and not really realistic, because it really doesn't...it's not equitable, okay. But again, you can just add a dollar to the third tier and that'll be fine, if that's what the body wanted. But to show you an example, okay, a house that pays...that...let's say valued at 500,000 last year, assessment value 500,000 minus the \$200,000 exemption for a net assessment of 300,000, and then you change that from \$2.90 per thousand to 2.61 per thousand, that's a different of \$87. That's \$87, okay. So, we're not gouging anybody and I think people like me can afford \$87,000 [sic], the same rate as last year. Okay, so please keep in mind, you know, before everybody starts throwing around figures, why don't you write down, you know, some specific examples using your own house. And you can tell how much more, how much less a house would cost. And mine would cost \$87 less. I think people like me can afford \$87. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, so we'll...Member Molina, if you don't mind sticking to the Owner-Occupied classification, but if you want to share your thoughts on all of it since I didn't limit the previous Councilmembers you're welcome to as well.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Well, thank you, Madam Chair. First of all, I just want to get clarification, I thought I heard Member Lee say she could afford 87,000 and then she said \$87. Eight-seven dollars, right? Okay. Okay, all right. Madam Chair, I'm general, kind of open to your proposal put it out there as is. Now, my understanding we can adjust accordingly after right? This is just the first time we put this out, and

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

then if there's considerable concern out there about what's being proposed as far as the ranges we have that flexibility to adjust when we do have a second hearing. Am I correct?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The range that we propose we're locked in, so --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --we're locked in the range, so we can't go lower than what we proposed and we can't go higher than the range that we --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --put on the reso today.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Anything in between and but just not above or below, right, yeah, yeah, so I'm okay, just put it out there as is and I appreciate the work you and Member Lee and Member Kama did on the TIG that explored this tier structure system. So, I'm just open, put it out there. I think we can, for me, we can have a more lengthy discussion about the pros and cons of the rates for the hotels and residents at another time, but I'll just say that I'm open to adjustments with, that may differ from what the Mayor has proposed but something that's as much as possible equitable. So, to me, I support the direction you want to take this as far as the ranges go. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, and Member Paltin was also on the TIG. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Sorry, Member Paltin, sorry for the omission. Thank you for your hard work too. My bad.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, so I just had a general question and I'll just throw it out there. Is there some kind of executive order or emergency proclamation that would either cease real property taxes or suspend them?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: No, so once we...so we're just saying once it, we're putting it in. Okay, so yeah, I like the suggestions from other Councilmembers. I think we want to for those in the second tier maybe bring it back up to last year's rates just for the flexibility of course. And then for the Tier 3, possibly of adding the extra dollar for more...increasing that just for our case. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Sinenci. Okay, so we're...we'll just get consensus or any proposed amendments on the first classification, which is the Owner-Occupied classification. And so, that's a similar valuation of less than 800,000,

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

800,000 to 1.5 million, 1.5 million above, for the Tier 1, 2, and 3. And ranges for Tier 1 and 2 would be \$1.66 to \$2.61 and Tier 3 at \$1.66 to \$3.95.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And that's \$1.05 above the current rate.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. I thought I heard a couple of Councilmembers saying that we should put it up to the range of last year just to give...so we're not locked in, but I like the, I like Member Sinenci's idea of putting the second tier up to 2.90 just for the flexibility. It doesn't mean that we're gonna end up there but that would give us that flexibility, so I thought that was a good idea.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Are you saying Tier 1 to go to 2.90?

VICE-CHAIR KING: No, Tier 2. Tier 2. I think Tamara's got her two fingers up.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Members, any objections to increasing the range in Tier 2 from 2.61 to 2.90?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Chair's recommendation?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I mean, that's fine. I'm open to it. Mahalo, Chair Lee.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Since Alice, since Chair Lee has the \$87 to put in there.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah, I'm so filthy rich, yeah. Go ahead. Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so for the Owner-Occupied Tier 1 rate range is \$1.66 to \$2.61, Tier 2 is \$1.66 to \$2.90, and Tier 3, \$1.66 to \$3.95. Okay. The next classification is Non-Owner Occupied and for Tier 1 the range is \$4.24 to 5.60, for Tier 2, \$4.24 to \$6.20, and Tier 3, \$4.24 to \$6.70, and you see the Mayor's proposed rates are 5.60, 6.20, and 6.50, and the similar classification from last year it was \$5.60. Now everything would be a little higher.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair? Madam Chair, can you keep the chart on the screen, 'cause mine is really...my numbers are really small. Okay, thank you. All the time, yeah, all the time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I'll leave it up. I just...I can't really see you to call on you that's all when I'm sharing my screen.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Even if we wave.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: That's okay, we call on you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think if it's...if you wave like this I'll be able to see you.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. Okay. Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So...okay. So, I guess I'll start with consensus, and if not raise your hand, and I'll call on you for proposed amendments.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci, and then Committee Vice-Chair King, and then Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. I would propose, again, just for flexibility that Tier 2 go up to 6.70 and maybe Tier 3 up to 7.20.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, that's Member Sinenci proposal. Yeah, is that correct, Member Sinenci, is that what you said?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yes, thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, and then Committee Vice-Chair King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. You know, I support those higher rates. What I was hoping to get for this session was, and I don't know if it's too late or if we can still discuss it later on, but what I was hoping to get...I thought she was talking to me when she said later. Okay, thank you. So, what I was hoping to get for this session was landlord's credit for people who rent to long-term to residents and then that would make sense to put up the non-owner occupants [sic], you know, rates to higher and then give a credit if you're renting it to somebody who lives here versus using it as a short-term, but I don't know if it's too late to do that in this Budget Session. Does...it has to be done ahead of time?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, it has to be done ahead of time.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, yeah, I guess, you know, not knowing who the Non-Owner Occupied, who's living in there I would...I'm comfortable with the proposal that Mr. Sinenci made, but I would hope that we could kind of find a way to make it easy for...so that people don't get the rents, don't have high taxes passed on to them if they're residents, I guess, is my main concern, but other than that, I support the ranges.



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Member Paltin? Again, just to reiterate, that's the work of our Tax Reform TIG II, which is to establish a credit system for long-term renters. Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. So, my proposal was if we're looking for flexibility, I would just go \$1 below the Mayor and \$1 above the Mayor, so it would be like 4.60 to 6.60, 5.20 to 7.20, 5.50 to 7.50, and then we got plenty of room to play, I think.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And just a dollar below?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Dollar below, dollar above, choke room to play. So, it would be 4.60 to 6.60 for the lowest tier, and 5.20 to 7.20. That way it's not really like we're locking our self into something...4.60 to 6.60 on the lowest, yeah, 5.20 to 7.20 on the highest for the second tier, and that would be my proposal.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I like that.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'll second that.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Concur.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Wow, you guys are so kind.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, you are the mathematician on this Council.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so just a reminder that if we lock ourselves in at this, as the lowest rate then we can't go down.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, if you would like to go lower in the rate, I'm open to it as well. You want to make the second tier 4.60 as the lowest or you want to go back to 4.40?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, maybe 4.40, just give us even more flexibility.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: More flexibility doesn't hurt.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, shucks. I think I changed the wrong one. Okay. Okay, any other proposed amendments? I didn't see anyone's hands go up. Okay. Consensus on what is on the...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right, okay. We'll leave it at that. Okay, and then for Short-Term Rental Tier 1 and Tier 2 is what the Mayor proposed. Any amendments, proposed amendments to this? Member Paltin? Oh, I sorry. I just see movement

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

because you guys are really tiny in the box. I can't really see. Okay, Chair Lee? Chair Lee, and then Committee Vice-Chair King.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Do you have in front of you the current rates? Just so we know.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, it's right here.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Short-Term Rental was \$10.75. So, the current rate is \$10.75 per thousand. Chair Lee, did you have a proposed amendment?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Not really.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Committee Vice-Chair King, and then Member Paltin.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you. Are you done, Alice?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, I am. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KING: So, I was concerned because I know earlier you talked about that we could add a third tier on here if we wanted to, but if we don't propose a range then we don't have that flexibility, is that correct?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, that's correct.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so do we want to...I'm just asking a question for the Council, do we want to propose a third tier on here just so we have that flexibility? If we propose a third tier, we can still...and we decide we don't want it we can still make it the same as the second tier, but if we don't have a proposed tier then we don't have any flexibility to go above that, those two categories. So, I guess I would maybe --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You want to propose something?

VICE-CHAIR KING: --like to propose so we add a third category of over 2 million and then add the rate on for \$11 up to, same thing, 11 up to 16.41. And if anybody wants to change that number for the third tier we should change it now because I think we...are we locked into the number for the third tier, like if we decide we want to change it to over 3 million, can we do that in the deliberations, or does that get locked in that tier?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That's gonna get locked in as well.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. So, you know, I'm open to other Councilmembers' ideas of what that third number should be in that tier.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR KING: 'Cause now we're talking about hotels, so that could be...we could push that to 5 million and then put that category of anything worth 5 million goes higher.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: We're talk...we're still on short-term rentals, right?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We passed hotels.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So, my proposal would be for Tier 1 to be the same range as it was for Fiscal Year '20, which was 8.28 through 16.41. Yeah. Just because, you know, we're not expecting that many guests.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is there any objection to keeping the range valuation consistent with the Owner-Occupied and Non-Owner Occupied?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can you repeat that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is there any objections to keeping the ranges consistent?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No, the only thing, I do like the little bit higher valuation to 2 million as opposed to 1.5, but I'm okay with 800,000 and below but not, you know, it's not a breaking point if nobody else agrees. I'm okay with it, but I think, you know, in terms of short-term rentals, maybe 2 mil, but just throwing it out there for consideration. But if it's easier for all the tiers to be the same, I'm okay with that as well.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think it might be easier for Finance.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm not being very helpful, sorry. I'll stop talking.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any objection?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: To what? Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. To . . . *(inaudible)*. . . the range to making the valuation, the tiers of the valuation...

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The same all across the board.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: No objection.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Good.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any objections to...would...any other proposed amendments to the STR classification? Okay, consensus?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, the last...oh, Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, I was gonna say consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay. So, the last is the Commercial classification, and we kept consistent with the valuation range for the tiers and the current rate is \$7.39, and the Mayor proposed \$6.29. Any proposed amendments?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I would want to go a dollar higher on the second tier.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Any other amendments?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, I don't have an amendment but this is where I got cut off when my power went out. So, if I could just continue that when we had the last meeting with Council --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: --and just talking about these tiers this is where we had all the testimony from the business people saying that Commercial to have tiers would be detrimental 'cause they would pass it on to the small business owner, you know, in a strip mall. They had all kind of different examples. So, I just want to say that if we're gonna entertain tiers for this, then that will be contrary to the overwhelming testimony I remember that we had and I'm sure you did too for this one tier, the Commercial.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So, not necessarily, the Mayor has proposed a flat rate of \$6.29. We can consider something lower.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Correct, but not with the tiers, right. That was the Commercial, they didn't appreciate having for their rate to be tiered. It was just a flat rate for Commercial.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: If the Members want to keep it at a flat rate, we can keep it at a flat rate.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I think they've got different valuations. That it's...we're following.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, we just following the different valuations of the Commercial tiers, some of them are worth I guess more than others.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right. So, the property value. The property value --

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --is less than 800,000 could be at a lower rate.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: That would be the equity issue.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any proposals?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you. Can you real quickly show what the rate was before again over to the other side of the...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's 7.39.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. So, he dropped it a \$1.10?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Yeah, I think...I don't have a problem...I mean I think I don't have a problem with the tiers because I think in the end if we decide to we could flatten it and make it all the same, make each tier the same. That's the way of...but we're not...we don't have any flexibility, if we keep the first tier 5.60 to 6.29 we can't go above 6.29. I think if we decide to flatten it we can't go above that for any of them. Is that correct? That would have to be the rate.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, if we have one rate, we could just have a range. For tier...for the proposed Tier 1 we couldn't go above 6.29.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: We can make it higher, --

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --but if we go...and if we go with no tiers we could just have a range for...and all Commercial properties would be the same.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, I like the flexibility of doing the range, and I do, I understand that we may get, you know, some testimony on that, but I like the flexibility on having the

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

range, but I think we should do what we did on the other ones and make the high end a, you know, on the lower one make the high end a dollar more just to give us that flexibility. Unless we want to...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Where? Where are you proposing?

VICE-CHAIR KING: On the Tier 1. So, Tier 1 and Tier 2 have the same flexible rate range.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You want it all to be 7?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Seven twenty-nine, yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Any other proposed amendments? And again, you know, we could propose this and it could all be the same.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Just a reminder to Members.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right. My thought was if we decide to go a little above the 6.29 for all of them we would need that flexibility in Tier 1. So, if we decide to go to 6.49 or something like that, we wouldn't have the ability in the previous proposal, so that was just my thought, gives us the flexibility.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Members, any other proposals to amend?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sinenci?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Just for flexibility sake, Commercialized Residential we couldn't go any higher than the Mayor's, just saying if other Members had input on that one.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Five sixty, just for flexibility for the last Commercialized Residential

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Five.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I put 5.60, you said, right?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, and that's the bed and breakfasts. There's about 40 of them.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And the current rate is 4.60.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: For me, --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: --I would...thank you. Sorry. I would leave what you had because you know like how you said there's 40 of 'em, they're all residents to run a B&B and they're probably feeling stressed out with this COVID thing. We don't want all 40 of them to come and testify like freaked out, but that's just me. Like, you know, in the scope of short-term rentals and bed and breakfasts, we haven't had any complaints about bed and breakfasts like how we've had about short-term rentals, and you know. So, we know it's all like our residents, they're owner-occupied that are running this B&Bs, people like B&Bs, they're probably freaking out along with all of the rest of us that lost...well, I didn't lose my job but my husband lost his job, but you know, people, all the people that lost their job, they're probably freaking out a little bit. I think while I agree it's nice to have the range, I think they would really freak if we put it that high, but you know, that's just me. My chair at home is not as cushiony as my chair at work, and that's a lot of testimony to sit through.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Excellent point.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, so are we gonna leave that, or do you want to reduce it?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: I can withdraw.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so do you want to keep it at 4.60?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, leave 'em at 4.60.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, we also have the other classifications that do not have tiers, that's Apartment, Hotel and Resort, Time Share, Agriculture, Conservation, so I'll take them one at a time. Apartment, Apartment is currently at \$6.31, and the Mayor proposed reducing it to \$5.55, and we could do a range that gives us broader flexibility at \$5 to \$7.45. Any proposal to amend that?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I like your range.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I like to just if you could remind me is CPRs held within apartments?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, I'm pretty sure. I'll give you an 80 percent yes.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yeah, okay, I'm good with that range.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Any other proposals? If not, I'll ask for...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You know the Non-Owner Occupied Tier 3?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I think that's a little too low. I think a number like 9.20 would be probably more in line with what's equitable.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Any objections, Members?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member Chair Lee. Okay, we'll go to the next classification Hotel and Resort. The current rate is at \$11. The Mayor proposed \$9.37, and the posted range could be \$9.37 to \$16.41. Any proposals to amend? Okay, seeing none, consensus?

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. The next is Timeshare. Timeshare is currently at \$14.40. The Mayor kept it \$14.40, and...or proposed to keep it at \$14.40, and the range that we could post is \$14.40 to \$16.41.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great, and the next classification is Agricultural. Agricultural is currently at \$5.94. The Mayor proposed to keep it at \$5.94, and we could post a range of \$4.66 to...I don't know if you want to add a dollar but \$5.94.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right. Okay, and Conservation is currently at \$6.43. The Mayor proposed to keep it at \$6.43, and we could post a range of \$4.80 to \$6.43.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Members. Okay, and then we discussed Commercialized Residential, and I believe we got consensus. Consensus on Commercialized Residential?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. So, please take a look at column H, G and H again and see if there's...if that's what you would like to lock us into one last time.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Do you need a vote or just consensus?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I was gonna give Members an opportunity to look at it one last time, and then I'll ask for consensus. If we propose to increase the Tier 3 in Non-Owner Occupied, do we want to consider increasing Tier 2 threshold a little higher too?

VICE-CHAIR KING: I would support that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Personally, not me because that's a lot of where...a lot of our residents don't own and they rent and without the long-term rental I think we could be adding an undue stressor to a lot of folks that lost their job and now might be losing their house because their landlord is gonna up the rent because they gotta...their bills, maybe they lost their job, and whatnot, but you know, I could be wrong.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Chair?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: There's a lot of folks in Lahaina rent.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King, followed by Member Molina.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, I just...if this is Non-Owner Occupied it couldn't be bed and breakfast because don't bed and breakfast have to be owner-occupied?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Just wanted to verify that. 'Cause I thought that was the concern that Member Paltin had that these might be bed and breakfast units.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: No. Long-term rentals and my concern was that they would pass the cost on to the renters and then the renters that may have lost their jobs can't afford it, but you know, just throwing that out there. If...it's just a range, so I mean, there's that as well, but trying not to stress stressed-out people more.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thanks.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you, Madam Chair. Just wanted to echo Member Paltin's concerns 'cause especially where she lives you have a lot of long-term renters and expensive properties, and I guess to use another term that probably means the same as Member Paltin said unintended consequences, yeah, if we were to maybe expand the range. So, yeah, we don't want to do anything more to potentially stress people and landlord passing on a cost down to their renters. So yeah, I'm kind of along the same lines with Member Paltin on this category. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, the Hotel rate, are we done with....can I talk about Hotel rate?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure. So, okay, since...so it sounds like there's no other proposals to amend any of the other classifications or tiers within the classifications, so we'll leave what we have right now, and Member Sugimura lost...had a power outage right in the middle of expressing some of her thoughts earlier, so okay. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So, on Hotel just because of what we're looking at with all the hotels that are closed and it's gonna take them a while to gear back up, and we know that when we come back up we all would like to see the visitor industry to be different than what we...than what it was before COVID, but it's gonna take a while. So, this 9.37 rate that the Mayor's proposing I wonder if the Members would entertain that rate to go down to 9, so start from 9 and then take it to, what is it, 16.41 is the high side.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I would commit to that if we take away their 3.5 mil.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: That's not on the table, right, that's different but.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: It's only a range.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: It's just a range, Chair.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Any other amendments to Hotel and Resort?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, thank you. You know, I'm comfortable with keeping it at what it was. The bottom in that what it was the year before, because we've always had the lowest hotel tax rates in the State anyway and getting us up to 11 I thought was a huge accomplishment because it's been at such a snail's crawl every year, but I also want to...I also think that we need to take a look at what their getting in the stimulus package, because these, are a lot of these are multinational corporations or going to be void by what the Federal government is giving to all the large corporations. So, I think we need to take a look at what help they're already getting from the Federal government before we give away our tax dollars, and I also want to say that, you know, I don't...the tax...we're already gonna lose out on the TAT because of the rooms. The tax is a different issue, and I've talked to the Budget Chair on the City and County Council who they're getting lobbied to have lower taxes and those guys are saying we don't want it either, we don't want to lower the taxes because for so long they've taken so many tax dollars, I mean, so many dollars out of the State, and you know, these companies that don't own, you know, unless we had some way of telling who's local or not, I know there's some locally owned hotels, but most of the ones that are gonna be affected by this have been for years taking large amounts of revenue out of the State because they're not owned locally. They're owned by a corporation on the mainland that, you know, runs these large chains. So, I don't want to give that away and I don't want to give false hope that we're going to lower down to \$9 either. So, anyway that's just my opinion of what's going on with the hotel.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Madam Chair? Madam Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So, Member King is right. You know, we're not gonna probably get much from the TAT if anything at all.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: We're not getting anything from the rent-a-car fees, and lord knows what else we're not gonna get from the State. So, I don't know why we didn't but we should have tiered the hotels because there are some hotels that, you know, are small and then you got the Grand Wailea, you know, and the really big ones, so that's something that we need to do at some point. We need to separate the various hotels because the little ones shouldn't pay an exuberant fee but the big ones should. So, food for thought for the next round.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: TIG II. Okay. Any other...Member Paltin?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: What Chair Lee was just saying though the rate is the same, they'll pay a lesser amount 'cause the value is less as well, I mean, right? I mean, it's not as great as tiers but it's still, they're not gonna all be paying the same flat rate. It's based on their valuation, but I hear what you're saying. Yours probably would've gave us a little bit more flexibility, but they're not going to be paying the same tax because the valuation is higher.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, and then just a reminder that 140 hotels fall onto Hotel/Resort, and a lot of other ones actually fall into short-term rentals, and I think some of the larger ones actually fall into short-term rentals because they have . . . *(inaudible)*. . . but okay. So, I hear Members expressing a desire not to reduce it to \$9 at the lowest threshold and to keep it at \$9.37.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Status quo, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And status quo is actually \$11. So, the Mayor proposed to reduce it from \$11 to \$9.37.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. The current proposed range is fine, what was originally posted.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay. Okay, any other questions or comments? Okay, seeing lots of shaking heads. Member Paltin, are you raising your hand?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: My question wasn't about the rates. It was is this the time we also discuss the minimum tax?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Why don't we get through the chart first?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I don't...okay, I don't think we have to post the minimum tax but let me double check with Staff.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I'm good as far as...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Consensus on the chart?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBERS: Consensus.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So, when we post the reso tomorrow it won't, of course, look like this. It's not gonna be a spreadsheet, it's going to be a resolution and the ranges will be these ranges with these proposed valuation tiers, okay.

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

VICE-CHAIR KING: Good job.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, good job, everyone. Let me save that. Okay, saved. Okay, and then I'll send that to Staff to transmit to the Clerk's Office for our public hearing. Okay, and then I'm waiting to hear from Staff on if we are required to post minimum tax but go ahead, Member Paltin. You can make your comments.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And then the...the homeowners exemption, I guess, is this time?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, homeowners exemption needed to have been amended before they sent out the notifications in March. So, if we're going to amend it, we needed to amend it before then, because otherwise we would have to resend the notification to everyone. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Same question on the circuit breaker, we get asked about, e-mails about are we going to look at the circuit breaker. So, is that the same situation then that we would have to have addressed that before March?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I will double check with Director Teruya. When they came before us, it didn't seem like it was the same situation because he mentioned that the circuit breaker reso --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: It's submitted.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: --it was sent to my Committee and it was something that we could still consider, but I'll double check to see if that would also require the notifications to be resent to everyone.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. Yeah, we wouldn't, that would be a lot.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, yes. Okay, and so Staff said that we do not need to post minimum tax, so we can have that discussion at a later time. Oh, okay, they...Staff said that they just transmitted the circuit breaker amendment, and if Staff is listening if that's something that would be required for us to have to resend out the notifications to all property owners? That wasn't something that was clear. And if Staff doesn't know, then I'll...we can double check with Director Teruya to find out.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Thank you. So, Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member Sugimura?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: So, can you resend to us the final document that you just transmitted or that we just approved for the ranges?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, and then the Clerk's Office will be posting the reso. Okay. Okay, it's 6:23.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Chair?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, Member Molina?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Sorry, I know you had a conversation regarding the homeowners exemptions. I recall we sent a bill to propose adjusting the homeowners exemption to Committee. What is the status of that? What is your intention how we're gonna move forward on it, discuss it this session?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, for the homeowners exemption?

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yes. There was a bill that we sent; I believe it was last year.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I think if we wanted to have increased it we would've need to have done that before they sent out the notifications in March, because it was part of the notifications. So, if we amend that now, we would have to resend all the notifications.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: So, basically so we missed out, we had to have heard it before March then, yeah. I'm trying to recall when we sent it to you for consideration, so I'll check back with Staff for the details but just wanted to make you aware and the Members know we did send a proposal to increase the exemptions if I recall, and it was sent last year. I'll provide the Committee the exact dates and we can discuss that later. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Yeah, so Director Teruya said any homeowner reduction...oh, any home exemption reduction would not have been applicable for this upcoming tax year, so the Mayor proposed a reduce, to reduce the rate to make it effective July 2020. Okay. Member...Pro Temp Kama?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: So, Chair, so if we did miss the date to be able to increase the homeowners exemption we still have an opportunity next time, right?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: When it comes to your Committee?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah, so we have time.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For next fiscal year, but not for this fiscal year.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes, next fiscal year. Okay, we have time. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Committee Vice-Chair King? And just to let everyone know the TIG, in the TIG, just a reminder that we did discuss it and what the Department had recommended to us was that we can either look at the homeowner exemption or we can play with the rates and provide a tiered tax scheme and we would basically achieve the same thing. And so, the TIG had recommended the tiered tax scheme and we would be saving a lot of our residents money that way. Okay, Committee Vice-Chair King?

VICE-CHAIR KING: Yeah, thank you. I was just gonna mention the TIG and to say that if we can reconvene the TIG after Budget is over, then we can, maybe the TIG can make a recommendation on which way to go on that as well as the other tax credit.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so we discussed what the TIG's unfinished business was and that's providing a credit to properties that are non-owner occupied with long-term rentals renters in it, and the way that that...the reason it didn't work out is because of the process for property owners to let the Department know that they have a long-term tenant on their property, just the way that the deadlines all worked out it wasn't going to allow for enough time for the Department to be able to process that and for property owners to submit the necessary paperwork to prove that they have a long-term tenant on the property.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so will there be time like if we reconvene the TIG after the Budget Session is over will there be time to get that done before the next Budget Session?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, I'm gonna take a break after Budget. I'm not going to immediately reconvene the TIG 'cause I need a break after this.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But we will reconvene after that break.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, yeah. I know and I know you had, and I remember you had pretty strict deadlines of when you had to get stuff done before the following Budget Session and the RPT was all part of that. So, I know you have those deadlines. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Committee Vice-Chair King. Okay, Members, any other comments or questions on anything that we discussed? If not, we can adjourn. Okay, lots of nodding heads. Member Paltin?

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sorry, just...so we're setting the rates for a public hearing and we're gonna have the public hearing online at night?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. And...okay, all right.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Pro Temp Kama? Oh, I'm sorry, Member Paltin?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Were we gonna do the at night one for the districts as well or that's just out?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: For the districts?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Like we didn't go to South Maui at night. Are we gonna...or it's all into this public hearing at night or?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, the nighttime district meetings were cancelled.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, so just pau?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But this hearing is online at night?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I think so. Let me get clarification from Staff on if it will be at night, but by having our remote meetings, I think it like increased accessibility and a lot of people are at home anyway and not at work. And so, you know, whether it's in the day or at night a lot more people are available to participate. But if Staff is listening, if you could confirm if the public hearing--okay can sign you on --will be at night. And then I'll take Pro Temp Kama's question and then I'll get back to you on that.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: My question was so if we do have an evening meeting, does that still mean that we're meeting during the day too?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm sorry, are you talking about the public hearing? Is that the same question that Member Paltin just asked?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yes, we began with the evening meetings, so my question was if we have an evening meeting, does that mean we still meet during the day irregardless if it's just a public hearing or what? So, we have an evening are we still having to meet at the day too? That's the question.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Usually. Yeah, so the public hearing is set for 6:00 p.m. on the 29<sup>th</sup>, and then we have a meeting on 9 o'clock in the morning on the next day.



**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: But during the day of the 29<sup>th</sup>, are we meeting? That's what I'm asking. So, do we have a meeting during the day and then we break and then come back for a 6 o'clock meeting is what I'm asking.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes, and that's what we've normally done, and I believe that you all have the stamina for. Member Sugimura?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: The dates that we have is April 17<sup>th</sup> we're gonna have Scott Teruya giving us the certification numbers for RPT.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, at 1:00 p.m.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: At 1:00 p.m. and then that night April 29<sup>th</sup> that public hearing 6 o'clock or something is gonna be a night public hearing regarding these rates. Is that correct? Chair Lee, is that correct? Who sets it?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, it's correct. Just think of it this way, our lives belong to Keani for the next several weeks, so don't ask questions.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I rarely ask questions.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Any other questions? Oh, Chair Lee, you're so good. Don't ask questions, there are no questions. Okay, good, so tomorrow we have Department of Police, Department of Prosecuting Attorney, and Department of Public Works. Okay, so since there are no more questions or comments, I will adjourn the meeting. Objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS: No objections.

**ACTION: DEFER pending further discussion.**

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great, lots of cheering. Okay, it's 6:34 on April 13<sup>th</sup> and the Economic Development and Budget Committee is now adjourned. . . .(gavel). . .

ADJOURN: 6:34 p.m.

APPROVED:



---

KEANI N.W. RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ, Chair  
Economic Development and Budget Committee

edb:min:200413:mb

Transcribed by: Michelle Balala

**ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT AND BUDGET COMMITTEE MINUTES**  
**Council of the County of Maui**

**April 13, 2020**

---

CERTIFICATE

I, Michelle Balala, hereby certify that the foregoing represents to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 26<sup>th</sup> day of May, 2020, in Kihei, Hawaii

  
\_\_\_\_\_

Michelle Balala