

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE
Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

May 20, 2021

Online Only Via BlueJeans

CONVENE: 9:00 a.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Chair
Councilmember Kelly Takaya King, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Gabe Johnson, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member (out 9:50 a.m.; in 10:30 a.m.)
Councilmember Michael J. Molina, Member (out 11:32 a.m.)
Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member (out 9:50 a.m.; in 11:00 a.m.)

EXCUSED: Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member

STAFF: Ana Lillis, Legislative Analyst
Alison Stewart, Legislative Analyst
Richard Mitchell, Legislative Attorney
Clarita Balala, Committee Secretary
Jean Pokipala, Committee Secretary

Kate Griffiths, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Gabe Johnson
Michele Del Rosario, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kelly Takaya King

Axel Beers, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kelly Takaya King
Sarah Pajimola, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez

Gina Young, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci

ADMIN.: Michael Hopper, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel

Michele McLean, Director, Department of Planning
Pamela Eaton, Planning Program Administrator, Department of Planning
Jennifer Maydan, Planning Supervisor, Department of Planning
Jaime Paa, Information and Education Specialist, Department of Planning

OTHERS: Peter Martin
Kai Nishiki
Albert Perez
Junya Nakoa
Dick Mayer
(2) additional attendees

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

PRESS: *Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.*

PSLU-1 WEST MAUI COMMUNITY PLAN (CC 21-70)

CHAIR PALTIN: . . .*(gavel)*. . . Will the Planning and Sustainable Land Use Committee meeting of Thursday, May 20, 2021, come to order. The time is now 9:00 a.m. My name is Tamara Paltin, and I'll be your Chair for today's PSLU meeting. If everyone can please silence their cell phones or any other noise-making devices, that would help. With us today we have our Committee Vice-Chair Kelly King. Aloha and sveiki from Latvia.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, sveiki to you, and aloha kakahiaka everyone. Good to be here. It seems like it's PSLU week this week.

CHAIR PALTIN: And aloha kakahiaka and sveiki to Councilmember Gabe Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Aloha. Good morning, Chair. Good morning, Councilmembers. Sveiki, I think I kind of butchered that, but I gave it a shot.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. And we have Tasha Kama excused today. We have Council Chair Alice Lee, who greeted us with the sveiki greeting.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair. Sveiki to everyone from Latvia, one of the Baltic countries. Good morning.

CHAIR PALTIN: Good morning. And sveiki and aloha kakahiaka to Councilmember Mike Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Aloha kakahiaka and sveiki to you, Madam Chair, and to my colleagues, and everyone else viewing in today, Thursday, May 20th...beautiful day.

CHAIR PALTIN: Beautiful day indeed. We just had a passing showers over here in Nāpili. It looks like maybe Member Rawlins-Fernandez might be a little bit late, and we have Councilmember Shane Sinenci. Aloha kakahiaka and sveiki from the waterfalls.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair, and aloha kakahiaka kākou mai Maui Hikina.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha kakahiaka. And last but not least, we have Councilmember Yuki Lei Sugimura. Sveiki and aloha kakahiaka.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Sveiki, everyone, and thank you for meeting last night, Chair, and holding that meeting. The Zipline people and the residents are very grateful by the way, so thank you. Sveiki and I can tell you why it was drizzling in Nāpili, because it's raining and cloudy on the West Maui Mountains here in Wailuku. So good morning, everybody.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, I thought you were going to say because we just got the ashes back. Sveiki and aloha kakahiaka to Councilmember Keani Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka, Chair and sveiki kākou.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sveiki. Okay. From Corp. Counsel, we have Deputy Corporation Counsel Michael Hopper with us today; from the Administration, Director Michele McLean, Planning Program Administrator Pam Eaton, and Senior Planner Jennifer Maydan. Committee Staff, we have Committee Secretary Clarita Balala, as well as Jean Pokipala, Legislative Attorney Richard Mitchell, and Legislative Analysts Ana Lillis and Alison Stewart. One agenda item today, and we are focusing on Appendix D specifically of West Maui Community Plan. That's the Community Plan Designations that have undergone quite a bit of change, so I wanted to schedule one day specifically for Members to get familiar with the new Community Plan Designations, and we have something very fun planned for you. Although, Board of Ethics reasons, I had to pull back on the prizes so overnighters, no cruise ship, nothing like that, it's just going to be the good job kind of prizes and bragging rights. Okay. So meeting connectivity disclaimer, the online meeting is being conducted in accordance with the Governor's most recent Emergency Proclamation on COVID-19. The proclamation partially suspends the Sunshine Law, and meetings can be conducted with Councilmembers or members of the public being physically present in the same location...without being physically present in the same location. Nothing said today or included in the agenda is intended to create obligations in excess of those required under the Sunshine Law and the Emergency Proclamation. If connectivity affecting quorum is lost, the Committee will be in recess, it will not be considered a loss of quorum unless connectivity cannot be restored within 30 minutes. If the BlueJeans connection is prematurely terminated for whatever reason, please log back in to the same link. If *Akakū* for whatever reason prematurely ceases broadcasting the meeting to Channel 53, *Akakū* will try its best to restore broadcasting, but if it's unable to do so in a reasonable amount of time, we will continue with our meeting, record it on BlueJeans, and send it to *Akakū* to be included with archive meeting videos. If connectivity of protecting quorum cannot be restored within 30 minutes, the meeting will automatically reconvene the following Tuesday at 9:00 a.m., using the same virtual connections unless the Committee announces a different date and time. Committee Staff will make good faith efforts to keep the public informed. So the Committee will only review the Community Plan Designation categories today. No parcel will have their designations affirmed or changed at this meeting; that will happen later. This meeting is to ensure that everyone fully understands the designations. Public testimony will be taken after the presentation. However, if members of the public are unable to stay until after the presentation, please identify yourself in the chat now. If you are calling in by phone and cannot stay, please unmute yourself now by pressing star four and request to testify before the presentation. Checking the chat real fast. I don't see anyone unable to stay. Okay. Councilmembers, please write down any questions you have about the presentation, and save all questions until after public testimony is taken so we don't run into any Sunshine Law violation on discussion even though it's clarifying questions, you know, sometimes we don't catch them. And Director McLean, or Ms. Eaton, or Ms. Maydan, I believe we are now ready for your presentation and we will hold questions until the end. Oops, sorry, Chair Lee, did you have a question or comment?

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Just for you. I just needed to remind you that I'm jumping off the call at about five minutes to 10:00, I should be back around 10:30.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

CHAIR PALTIN: You might lose the game, but...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Hey, that's okay. Can't win 'em all.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, you're not going to get as much points as the rest of them. Yuki Lei Sugimura as well.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Yeah, so I'm leaving the game...I'm leaving your game...I'm leaving your meeting to go to the, I think the same meeting you're speaking.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: You might not win. Okay, Director McLean, have at it.

MS. MCLEAN: Good morning. Long time no see.

CHAIR PALTIN: We missed you.

MS. MCLEAN: I will pass this off to Pam Eaton and Jen Maydan and they can...they can run the show from here. Thank you.

MS. MAYDAN: Mahalo, Michele. And aloha kakahiaka, Chair and Committee Members. Pam, did you want to say something first before I get going?

MS. EATON: Yeah, I'll just be really fast. Because the game is a lot of fun, and we want to get to it. The purpose of this is to obviously have you guys become more familiar with Community Plan Land Use Designations. And sometimes you guys get PowerPointed to death, so we were trying to do something a little more creative. And a lot of times learn by doing, learn by application might...who knows, something may stick to the wall. So we're hoping you guys can have some fun with this and other than that, just huge thank you to my Staff as usual, and Jen, just let it rip.

MS. MAYDAN: All right. Mahalo, Pam. And Members, I'm going to leave my camera off just to make sure that my Internet connection is clear and you hear my voice. So I'm going to go ahead and share my screen right now. Okay. Is that good? You can see my cover slide to the presentation?

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

CHAIR PALTIN: Yes, we can see it.

MS. MAYDAN: Great. All right. All right, mahalo. So today I have about a 20-minute presentation to walk you through the purpose of the updated designations and familiarize you with each designation, their mix of uses, and characteristics, and how they relate to areas and neighborhoods throughout Maui. And as we've mentioned, after the presentation and after testimony, we have a fun game to run you through to test your new knowledge. So before we jump into the designations, I'm going to take just a quick moment to ground us all and remind you where we are in the many layers of land use controls. You've seen this slide before, which shows the land use layers on a spectrum from general to specific. The State Land Use Districts are the broadest, the narrow three County layers. The Maui Island Plan Growth Boundaries are the broadest of the County layers, providing guidance on where to grow. Then the Community Plan Designations provide a little more specificity with the intent of guiding the type and character of future growth, you can think of it as how to grow. And finally Zoning Districts provide more detail to regulate land use and the intensity, dimensions, and location of development on a parcel of land. Zoning is one of the tools to implement the community plans. The three County land use layers work together to plan for future growth and regulate land use and development. It's important to keep in mind today, and as you review the West Maui Community Plan maps at future meetings, you are working at the level of the Community Plan Designations, not at zoning. In all of the existing community plans, there is a list of designations that are used on the maps. You are all familiar with these designations, such as single-family, multi-family, commercial, light industrial, agriculture, among others. We have developed the updated designations through a series of stakeholder meetings, design workshops, and the West Maui Community Plan Advisory Committee. And Maui Planning Commission supported their use, the use of these designations, and so they are in the draft West Maui Community Plan that you are reviewing. We are also starting the South Maui Community Plan with these designations, and hope to apply them to all community plan areas. I'm going to explain why we updated the designations, and talk about the benefits to the community. I'll walk you through the evolution from the existing designations to the new ones, and I'll give you an overview of each designation. So why did we update the Community Plan Designations? What's the purpose of the designations? The Community Plan Designations and maps guide future development and zoning decisions. The updated designations provide clarity on the role of the County Planning...of their role in the County Planning System and Land Use System, and distinguish them from zoning districts. The Zoning Code audit that was conducted by the firm Orion Planning and Design in 2018 recommends revising these designations to be more descriptive with respect to land use mix, design, density, mobility characteristics, and park and public amenities. It recommends updating the designations to more capture the character of places, and focus on the needs of people in their daily lives. We were working on the updated designations for some time prior to the zoning audit, so the audit really provided us some confirmation that we were on the right track. Making the shift from use space designations to the updated designations are what we call in the planning field place types is consistent with best planning practices, and is happening in many cities and towns, including on...in Kaua'i County. Also, the updated designations are in line with the Maui Island Plan's Directed

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

Growth Plan. The Directed Growth Plan establishes the location and general character of future development through the establishment of growth boundaries. It provides the framework for community plan updates and zoning changes. The primary objective of the Growth Plan is to ensure that our developments, towns, and neighborhoods offer a high quality of life by fostering complete, equitable, and healthy communities that meet the needs of residents. What are some of the issues with the existing designations? Why is it time to update them? The existing designations are focused solely on uses, and don't provide any guidance on actually creating communities. For example, the existing designations separate single-family and multi-family uses into two separate designations, and they segregate commercial uses away from residential neighborhoods. The result is that we end up building homogenous neighborhoods, mostly single-family neighborhoods that don't offer a variety of housing types to accommodate all families and residents. And our communities are auto dependent, and don't allow us to walk to the corner store to get a bag of groceries. Also, the existing designations are too similar to zoning districts, and are often confused with the zoning districts. And I'll take this opportunity to note that the Department is working with Orion Planning and Design to rewrite Title 19, our Zoning Code. And we in long range are working closely with this team to ensure that the updated Community Plan Designations and the Zoning Districts that come out of the rewrite process are compatible and work together to create the community as called for in our long-range plans. We have a few mixed use zoning districts right now in our zoning code, but some of the mixed uses aren't consistent with the current Community Plan Designations, creating an impediment to mixed use. Because the Title 19 rewrite will allow for mixed uses, the Community Plan Designations need to allow for it too. How will the designations address these issues? What are the benefits? They shift the focus from segregating uses to creating places that respond to the needs of our community and promote health and well-being. They provide the opportunity for a range of compatible and complimentary uses. They provide Urban Design Guidance on density, intensity, and range of uses, parks and public amenities, street connectivity, mobility, really recognizing that the design of our communities, how buildings relate to the street, that we have access to parks, that we have places to gather, really has an impact on our lives. Also recognizing the important connection between land use and transportation, how we get around our communities, ensuring that we have safe, convenient options, including walking, biking, bus, and automobile. The updated designations also provide the opportunity for and encourage neighborhoods with a range of housing types; from single-family to duplex, to multi-plex, courtyard apartments, and townhouses, as well as live-work units. This variety of housing types and sizes supports families. Those living alone, elderly, extended family, and promotes housing affordability. The updated designations also acknowledge the importance of preserving the character of existing neighborhoods and special places that communities love. The updated designations are included in the West Maui Community Plan as Appendix D. When you review the designations, first off you will notice that the updated designations provide a lot more information and flavor as compared to the designations you are used to in the existing plans. Each designation has a general description of the primary and support uses, the purpose of the designation, and important factors, such as mobility and access to parks that are important to provide in these areas. Each designation also has example images of development patterns, building types, typical street types that characterize the designation. As we go through the designations, you

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

will notice that there are a lot of similarities between them. Some designations are more similar, especially in their mix of uses, than they are different. This is very true for the four mixed use designations: Rural Village, Neighborhood Center, Small Town Center, and Urban Center/Corridor. These designations have a similar mix of residential, commercial, and public uses. Their differences, however, are in their setting, such as a rural, suburban, or urban setting, the scale and density of development, and the number of neighborhoods they serve. The similarities across designations is also because we do not have a huge spectrum of uses like other places. We don't have skyscrapers or high density apartments, or really heavy intense industrial uses. We are more modest and low-rise urban. So the purpose is really to capture the subtle differences in our urban areas and our communities. And there are...but there are some designations that are very distinctive, such as industrial and State conservation. Before we look at each designation, I'll walk you through the translation from the existing to the updated. So as we take this walk, you will notice that some designations essentially have not changed. Some have been combined or tweaked, and others are new. So on the left-hand side of the screen, you will see the existing designations that you're familiar with in the plans. They are in the adopted plans for Maui Island Communities. And then on the right are the updated designations. So just quickly walking you through the evolution. Conservation is now State Conservation. Agriculture remains Agriculture. Rural is now Rural Residential. Open Space and Park are combined into Park/Open Space. Single-Family and Multi-Family are combined into Residential. The various business designations are now represented by four mixed use designations: Rural Village, Neighborhood Center, Small Town Center, and Urban Center/Corridor. Hotel is Resort/Hotel. Light Industrial is Employment Center. Heavy Industrial is Industrial. Areas designated as Project District, whether they are currently developed or not, are assigned one or a mix of the updated designations based on their uses, density and character. The four mixed use designations are compatible with many project districts, as well as Residential, Rural Residential, Park/Open Space, and Public/Quasi Public. Throughout the process of updating the community plans and rewriting the zoning code, the Department intends to transition away from the use of project districts. The updated designations achieve the original purpose of project districts of allowing for a mix of uses and flexibility, along with providing transparency for communities, and a less complex development process. Just down at the end now Airport is Special Purpose District, and Public/Quasi Public remains Public/Quasi Public. Now we'll walk through each of the designations. Here we have two residential designations. Rural Residential is the updated version of the existing Rural Designation. The purpose of this designation is to preserve rural character and serve as a transition between agriculture uses and more urban development. These areas are characterized by large lot subdivisions and family farms. Examples of Rural Residential are the Pukalani neighborhood behind Foodland, and the Makawao neighborhood below Eddie Tam. The Residential designation replaces the existing Single-Family and Multi-Family designations. This designation encourages a range of housing types to provide mixed neighborhoods and affordability. Related and compatible uses, such as parks, schools, and other public uses, are included. Small scale neighborhood serving commercial uses can also be appropriate on a limited basis. Pedestrian, bike, and bus connections are important in these areas to promote mobility, equity, and health. There are many examples of residential areas across the island. Just a few examples are Lahainaluna

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

neighborhood, many neighborhoods in North Kihei, Kehalani in Wailuku, and the Ku‘au Bay View neighborhood in Pā‘ia. Now we move on to the mixed use designations. As I mentioned, they replace the various existing commercial and business designations. The four mixed use designations, Rural Village, Neighborhood Center, Small Town Center, and Urban Center/Corridor, have a lot of similarities as far as their mix of uses. Their differences arise in their level of density, and intensity, and location, and character. By density, I mean the amount of development in an area. How many housing units and square feet of commercial buildings, for example? Hāna Town is lower density and Kahului is higher density. Intensity is a measure of the mix of uses in an area. An area with a narrower mix of uses, like Hāna Town, is less intense, whereas an area with a larger variety of uses, like Kahului, is more intense. Rural Village is the least dense and intense mixed use designation, and Urban Center/Corridor is the most dense and intense. And lastly, these four mixed use designations are distinguished by their location and character, whether the areas are in a rural, suburban, or urban setting. So first is the Rural Village. This designation is intended to preserve the character of rural towns, and includes services that support nearby rural residential communities. Rural Villages are relatively small and include a mix of neighborhood serving commercial and Public/Quasi Public uses, and may include limited residential. Keokea near Grandma’s Café is a great example, as well as Pauwela Cannery in Ha‘ikū. Neighborhood Center is similar to Rural Village, but located in a more urban or suburban setting. Neighborhood Centers provide services that support nearby residential with pedestrian oriented commercial nodes. The shops across from Honokowai Beach Park are a great example of Neighborhood Center. Moving on to Small Town Center and Urban Center/Corridor, these are two mixed use designations that are more dense and intense than the last two. Small Town Center is similar to Neighborhood Center; however, these areas typically cover a larger area and serve more neighborhoods. A vertical mix of uses with ground floor commercial and second floor apartments and medium density housing types are encouraged. As with all of the mixed use designations, parks, schools, and other public uses are an important part of the mix, as is providing mobility options, like safe walking, biking, and bus use. Examples of Small Town Center are Pā‘ia Town and Pukalani Town Center. Urban Center/Corridor is the most dense and intense of the mixed use designations, and it is intended to create transit friendly areas with higher density commercial employment, light industrial, and residential uses. These areas are characterized by pedestrian friendly activity centers, vibrant street life, and multi-modal corridors. In Urban Center/Corridor, you might live in an apartment or a townhome. You can walk...you can take the bus to work, your kids can ride their bike to school, and your family can walk to the park or a café. Examples are Ka‘ahumanu Avenue near Lono Avenue, and Lāhainā Gateway and Cannery Mall area. It’s important to keep in mind that all of the designations apply to both developed and undeveloped areas, and the designations are intended to promote smart growth and complete communities. So you might look at Lāhainā Gateway or Ka‘ahumanu Avenue today and think they’re not...they don’t totally match the description for UCC on the screen. But over time, with infill development, redevelopment and adding more bus service, bike paths, and safe sidewalks and crossings, the areas can improve. Resort/Hotel designation updates the existing Hotel designation. These areas are typically medium to high density with a broad range of uses primarily intended to serve visitors. The resort areas of Kā‘anapali and Wailea are

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

good examples. Employment Center updates the existing Light Industrial designation. Employment Centers are intended to encourage a range of employment in light industrial uses, like light manufacturing, processing, and business incubators. These areas also include amenities that serve the employees, such as restaurants, retail, and live work spaces. Examples include the light industrial area above the Lāhainā Gateway Center and the Wailuku Industrial Area around Ho'okahi Street. The Industrial designation is the same as the existing designation, and is intended to permit intense industrial and manufacturing activities. An example is Puunene Sugar Mill. Special Purpose District designation is intended to provide for specified land uses that due to their uniqueness or incompatibility do not easily fall within one or a mix of the other community plan designations. Special Purpose District isn't intended for existing project districts. Airports are the most prominent example. The Public/Quasi Public designation is the same as the existing designation, and is intended to provide facilities for public use or benefit. You will notice that many of the uses in this designation are allowed in other designations, such as churches and schools, but this designation is typically for a planned or existing larger scale government, non-profit, or educational uses. The UHMC Campus and the Lāhainā Civic Center are great examples. Park Open/Space designation combines the existing Parks and Open Space Designations. These areas are intended to preserve and manage lands for recreational activities and Native Hawaiian traditional and customary uses while protecting sensitive areas. Examples include Lipoa Point and the Kihei Regional Park. These are the last two designations, and they are unchanged from the existing designations. The Agriculture designation promotes ag development, protects ag resources, and supports the island's ag character, economy and lifestyle. Examples include the Kula Ag Park and Kā'anapali Coffee Farms. And finally, the State Conservation designation recognizes lands within the State Conservation District, and is used to protect wilderness areas, beaches, watershed areas, and other sensitive areas. Examples include 'Āhihi-Kīna'u Natural Area Reserve and Pu'u Kukui Watershed. All right. Mahalo for bearing with me through that. I know that was a lot of information. Luckily, most of what I shared is also provided in the descriptions of each of the designations for easy reference. And so after testimony and questions, we will go into the game, but I will certainly be happy to answer any questions when the time is right. So I will stop sharing.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you so much for that whole presentation. I hope folks took notes so they can win the game. If there's no objections, I'd like to entertain public testimony at this time.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

CHAIR PALTIN: And I'll just read a little spiel. Testifiers wanting to provide video testimony should have joined the online meeting via the BlueJeans meeting link as noted on today's agenda. Testifiers wanting to provide audio testimony should have participated via phone conference by dialing 1-408-915-6290 and entering the meeting code 149341846, also noted on today's agenda. And Staff has tested the phone number this morning and it does work, but if there are any problems just let me know, and I'll put out an alternate phone number. Written testimony is encouraged by sending your comments via eComment. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes. When your name

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

is called, please unmute yourself by clicking the microphone icon or if calling by phone, please press star four to unmute yourself. If you're still testifying beyond that time, I will kindly ask you to complete your testimony. When testifying, please state your name. If you are testifying on behalf of an organization or are a paid lobbyist, please inform the Committee. Per 2.56.040, Maui County Code, a lobbyist means any person who engages himself for pay or other consideration for the purpose of attempting to influence legislative or administrative action of the County. Staff will post a link to the testifiers log in chat so testifiers will be able to see where they are on the list. However, please be mindful the use of chat during the meeting. Chat should be limited to items on the agenda and should not be used to provide testimony or chat with other testifiers. If providing testimony, please be courteous to others by muting your microphone while waiting for your turn to testify. Once you are done testifying, you will be asked to disconnect from the call. However, you are welcome to continue viewing the remainder of the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, or on mauicounty.us. Participants who wish to view the meeting only without providing testimony, please also disconnect at this time and instead view the meeting on *Akakū* Channel 53, Facebook Live, or on mauicounty.us. Only Councilmembers, Staff, and designated resource personnel will be connected to the video conference meeting once testimony concludes. All other connected to the meeting will be dropped from the meeting. And so even if you didn't ask to be signed up to testify, if you're on the meeting and you're not recognized as a Staff or a resource, you will be put on the testifying list. I remind Committee Members, Administration, and the public to please be patient with us as we continue to navigate through this online platform. And at this time, I'd like to proceed with testimony. Staff has been monitoring people joining today's meeting by phone and by video, and we'll do our best to take each person up in an orderly fashion.

. . . BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

CHAIR PALTIN: The first person I have is Lars Linder. Lars, if you would please unmute yourself, and we're ready for your three minutes. Oh, I see that...he looks like he dropped from the call. Maybe he didn't want to provide testimony. Kari Luna Nunokawa, did you want to provide testimony at this time?

MS. NUNOKAWA: No. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Thank you for answering. Next up we have Peter Martin, to be followed by Kai Nishiki. Mr. Martin, I'll go ahead and unmute you, and please begin your three minute testimony. Go ahead. You got to unmute your microphone.

MR. MARTIN: Okay. Now can you hear me?

CHAIR PALTIN: Yes, go ahead. Three minutes.

MR. MARTIN: Okay. Good morning. I wasn't actually planning...oh, there I am down in the corner. I wasn't actually planning to testify, but I didn't follow everything, but I do have a couple of things to say. One, I very much like that new thinking on the Rural and Rural Village. I think it fits really well. We don't have much rural on Maui designated,

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

and I think it fits very well on the property I own in or involved in Olowalu and Makila. So that's about all I had to say, other than I'm excited about explaining what we have planned for Olowalu and Makila, and I'm looking forward to the Council listening to our people involved. So thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you so much for your testimony today, Mr. Martin. Any questions for the testifier from the Members? Seeing none. Thank you so much, and have a good day. Next up we have Kai Nishiki. If you can unmute yourself, we're ready for your three minutes.

MS. NISHIKI: Hi. Good morning, Chair. Good morning, Committee Members. Welcome back after Budget. I guess we're back to having more fun with community plans. The...I am Kai Nishiki testifying on my own behalf. While I was involved in the CPAC process, we did discuss the new Community Plan Designations, and our group did have some trouble initially trying to match the old designations with the new, and understanding what was allowable within the new designations. And for the most part, you know, we do support being able to have mixed uses within our communities to promote better developments that help our community, but we also want to be careful to protect against uses that our community does not want. For instance, there were some issues about industrial use within some of our major little areas of town. But I do think that it is valuable to know what is allowed within those designations, and I definitely support clarifying the permitted uses because that helps everyone to understand what is allowed and desired by the community. So I would definitely support making some amendments to clarify those uses, and thank you very much.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you for your testimony today. Members, questions for the testifier. Oh, popular. We got Committee Vice-Chair King, followed by Member Sinenci with questions for Ms. Nishiki.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. Aloha, Kai. Thanks for being here, and thanks for all your hard work on the community plan. I just wondered if you had a...you had written up some of the amendments to the designations, that was one question that you could send to the Committee. And my second question is, were you given...in the CPAC, were you given any flexibility on these designations? Because it's a little concerning that they're proposing these through this one community plan, and expecting the exact same designations for every other community. Were you given...was the CPAC given any flexibility or changing these designations?

MS. NISHIKI: Well, the CPAC had the ability to change almost everything that we had wanted to within the plan. Because there was a completely new way of doing the community plan, it was a lot for us to take on initially, and just trying to get the average person to be able to understand all the terminology and everything. It was kind of challenging. So, you know, I would say perhaps that looking back, you know, armchair quarterback...we'll use the game analogy here. Looking back, we could have taken a little more time in looking at the designations, and that probably was easier to think about after we actually did the land use using those designations, and then seeing where we had challenges. So I think that there's always room to change things around so that

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

they work better for our community. Sometimes concepts are great, but when you go to implement them, they could definitely use some tweaking. And I'm so sorry, I didn't hear your first question.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, I was just wondering if you could send us your...any proposals you have for tweaking those designations.

MS. NISHIKI: Okay. Yeah, I've looked at some of the submittals that you folks have in front of you, and I think for the most part, they make sense to protect our community and make sure that it does actually have the force and effect of law, and that it is abiding by the intent, and that there aren't some unintended consequences. But yes, I'd be happy to work on that.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, great. Thank you so much.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. And aloha, Ms. Nishiki, mahalo for your testimony. Yeah, I too am still kind of questionable about some of the zoning for the designations. Is it...I'm generally supportive of mixed use, but if...are there going to be like several zones within mixed use that can be addressed? And I can ask this of the Department later, but what was your feeling about mixed use?

MS. NISHIKI: Yes. We definitely promoted the idea of mixed use, but we wanted to be cautious that mixed use didn't involve uses that we didn't want in those specific areas. So that's why I said I do think it is important to clarify what the permitted use is to better protect that for the community. And as far as zoning, because that's separate from Community Plan Designations, we did not get into a lot of those discussions about zoning because that's not really our prerogative, but it is helpful to see what zoning does work in those specific designations.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you for that.

MS. NISHIKI: But that is a little...that can get confusing when you're talking about zoning and Community Plan Designations.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Sinenci. Any further questions for the testifier? Seeing none. Thank you so much for your testimony today, Ms. Nishiki.

MS. NISHIKI: Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Next up...thank you...we have Albert Perez. There was a Molly, but I think she dropped off the call. So Albert Perez, if you can unmute yourself, we're ready for your three minutes. And I believe that's the final testifier on the list. Go ahead, we can see you.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

MR. PEREZ: Good morning, everyone. I wish I could participate in the game, but unfortunately, I cannot. Anyway, I want to go back a little bit, because I was on the Citizen's Advisory Committee for the Title 19 Review, and this is where we first learned about a new type of planning called Form-Based Codes, Form-Based Land Use Planning. So that process began and then it stopped, I think it was probably because of COVID. I don't know why it stopped, but definitely COVID had something to do with it. Anyway, during our meetings, they talked about having extensive review of this new type of Form-Based Land Use Planning, and this was going to be Countywide, but that public review did not happen. The Form-Based Code language...I next noticed similar language in the West Maui Community Plan, and as the Planning Department had stated, they intend to use the same type of land use descriptions in other community plans on Maui. But the precedent for this major change in land use planning practice is being set in West Maui without consulting with people in the other community planning areas. So I think this needs to be much more widely discussed because it's a major change. You know, I did some research on Form-Based Codes, and I found that...a couple things. One is, there are more...in actual application, they depend on the subjective application by the planner, especially when you're talking about mixed uses. They tend to hinder planning participation by the public, and they're much more difficult to enforce than traditional zoning. So for this reason, it's also more prone to litigation than traditional zoning. And according to the Sarasota Observer Newspaper, less than one percent of the cities in the U.S. have put Form-Based Codes into practice, most of them in the Southeast and California. So mixed uses are a good goal, but they're difficult to regulate without planners who are specifically trained to implement them. Property owners have expressed concern that they won't be able to predict what the planners' interpretation of the flexible mixed uses will be, and that uncertainty translates into risk, which makes it more difficult to get investors to back their projects. Citizens are similarly concerned that the planner will be subject to political pressure to approve particular projects, and that's another risk for property owners if they're not well connected politically. So...and since they're so flexible, the use descriptions would be difficult for the County and/or citizens to enforce them. I sent everyone some proposed changes to the . . . *(inaudible)*. . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . I'll just wrap up by saying I sent everyone the proposed changes, and I would ask you to review them. So we want to preserve what the Community Plan Advisory Committee tried to do, and make sure that their work is enforceable. Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Mr. Perez. Members, questions for the testifier? Committee Vice-Chair Kelly King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair...back there. So...hi, Albert. Thanks for being here. You actually reiterated one of my concerns that I had mentioned with Kai Nishiki. And in my question, you know, because it looks like the land use designations are being proposed for West Maui, then you would propose to automatically put in all the other community plans. If there's another community plan in the South Maui area that decides they don't...they want to change the designations, do you see a problem with each community plan having different community plan designations?

MR. PEREZ: I would think it should be up to that community. I certainly don't think that

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

Hāna should be subject to the same rules as South Maui, for example. I think it should be up to them. Now, for ease of Administration...

VICE-CHAIR KING: But my question was could they...could the land use designations, you know, exist as different versions in each community, or do you think they all need to be the same?

MR. PEREZ: Well, for ease of Administration, it would probably be easier for the Planning Department to become familiar with one set of designations, but one size does not fit all. You know, Upcountry is really different from West Maui, et cetera. So I think that's something that deserves a lot more discussion.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. All right. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Any further questions for this testifier? Seeing none. Thank you for your testimony today. We did have a couple more testifiers sign up. We have Junya Nakoa, followed by Dick Mayer. Mr. Nakoa, we're ready for your three minutes.

MR. NAKOA: Howzit, howzit, howzit. Eh, whacha call? Yeah, like the presentation said, you guys should be listening to the people from that district, you know, that . . . *(inaudible)*. . . you know, developed in our neighborhoods like Nāpili Bay. You know, like they nevah...you know, the certain development that was happened that they nevah come talk to the people of Nāpili, you know, about that project. So I support what this West Maui . . . *(inaudible)*. . . did--

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, Mr. Nakoa, you're kind of breaking up.

MR. NAKOA: --CPAC or whatever.

CHAIR PALTIN: Maybe...

MR. NAKOA: I gonna turn off my video.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, turn off your video and try talk.

MR. NAKOA: Okay. Yeah. Sorry, I just got off the Pali. But yeah, you know what I mean? So try listen to the community about what's gonna be built in our community, you know what I mean? Napilihau is totally different from all these udah places like dat, like Albert them was saying. And then I'll tell you guys right now, I stay pissed off with the Planning Department. So we gotta...we gotta watch them, yeah, big time. I mean, you know, if any of you guys can help us out by let's go hold them accountable because I mean, yeah. Sorry, but I stay pissed off wit them. You guys gonna hear some more from...about this tomorrow. But the community plan is what needs to be listening to. I support you guys about making da advisory group, you know, for the each community 'cause then we can...you guys gonna hear from us. You guys not gonna hear from the Planning Commission where plenty...you know, no more the people from West Maui on top that buggah, and they gonna listen to our issues. And I sorry, but you know, us

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

guys, the people, we know what we...what happening in our community, so try listen to us, and all that kine stuff. But yeah, mahalo for the Planning Committee, the West Pac, or CPAC guys, or whatevah. Awesome. Mahalo, mahalo, mahalo, and you guys keep up the good job. Keep it up, you guys. Shoots. Mahalo.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Mr. Nakoa. Members, questions for the testifier? Seeing none, thank you for your testimony.

MR. NAKOA: Have a good one.

CHAIR PALTIN: Next up we have...you too. Mr. Dick Mayer, we're ready for your three minutes.

MR. MAYER: Thank you very much. I have several points I'd like to make. The Planning Department says that they would like to use these designations in all of the other districts without giving those others districts the opportunity to vet them. I think that's really important because these may not at the present...they may not be compatible to Hāna, or Upcountry, or one of the other areas. And so I would urge you to make a caveat that this is for West Maui at this time, and as South Maui, which will be the next one goes...they may love these, they may not, but at least they should have that option on whether these are appropriate for their district. The second thing that was said by Ms. Maydan was that these things will preserve existing neighborhoods and special places that communities love. The problem is that it now combines several things together that were not combined before. In the residential area, for example, they have combined single-family and multi-family. So imagine you had a residential area, everybody loves their houses, their single-family ambiance, and all of a sudden a developer or landowner comes in and wants to put up a four-story apartment building in the middle of that residential area. That does not preserve the communities that people love. There's a letter in your...on your website from March 19th that lists the zones that go along with the Community Plan Designations. What is the status of those...that letter, and is that going to be carried forth and be implemented later on or not implemented? It should be made clear. The streetscapes and the various photos there are very misleading. They show, for example, in the industrial area a streetscape that has houses on both sides. I think that that should be made much clearer, both for developers who may be looking at that area, and the planners down the road, who may not be sitting in today's meeting, who may be having to implement this. Number six, it's unclear whether the ag designation would allow for subdivisions, ag subdivisions. They show all the pictures of beautiful farms, everything else, but in the past, we've had agricultural areas gobbled up with two acre and four acre, you know, estates and things of that sort. I do not think that's compatible, and I think they should be ruled out in the agricultural designation. And lastly, there are a bunch of...this is not directly relates to today's agenda, but it's the offshoot of it. In the maps in the plan, where they indicate the...what do you call, the various colors on the map, there are no boundary lines on those colored areas as there have been in the past community plans. So it's unclear which TMK would be within the agricultural, or within the rural, or within the industrial, et cetera, because we don't know which properties are really involved on those overall maps. . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . . *(inaudible)*. . . that has that. And lastly I urge you to move this whole section ahead of the maps so that people using the plan, the planners

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

in particular, will have the designations tied directly to the maps in the plan. Thank you very much. Sorry, lot of items.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh no, not at all. All good points. Thank you so much. Members, questions for the testifier? And at the right time too, because there's still a lot more to go with our review, so we can address those as we come to those sections. Thank you.

MR. MAYER: Thank you, and best wishes.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. That was the last testifier that I had on the list. If anyone from the public that hasn't already testified would like to provide their public testimony, now would be the time. Please unmute yourself and let us know. Seeing none. Any objections with public...closing public testimony at this time?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Good. And any objections, Members, on receiving written testimony into the record.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Perfect.

. . . END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY . . .

CHAIR PALTIN: All right. Members wishing to speak during today's meeting should say my name, raise their hand, and ask to be recognized so I may call on you. Our agenda item today is PSLU-1, West Maui Community Plan. Specifically, the Committee may discuss the Draft West Maui Community Plan Designations, definitions in Appendix D, pages 144 through 159 of the West Maui Community Plan Draft from the Planning Commission, and may recommend revisions. The Committee may receive a presentation from the Department of Planning explaining the definitions of the Community Plan Designations in Appendix D and discuss related matters. So at this time Members, if you have any questions that you had written down on the Planning's presentation, we can take that up. Did Members have any questions on the presentation for the Planning Department? Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. Yeah, I guess I had the same question that I asked Ms. Nishiki about...between the zoning and the designations.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: So I know Miss...

CHAIR PALTIN: Ms. Maydan, maybe would be able to answer your question, or Director McLean.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

MS. MCLEAN: Can you repeat the question, Councilmember Sinenci? I apologize.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, I guess, you know, the designations, and then which...it doesn't...and I get that Kai said that the plan doesn't cover the zoning, so my question is, could we include...or zoning is totally different for the Planning Department and not within this document as far as the specific zoning that can be used within the different designations.

MS. MCLEAN: If I'm understanding your question correctly, and it might be a good idea maybe at a future meeting to really talk through the relationship between community plans and zoning and how the new designations would work with existing zoning, as well as with proposed new zonings that would be more similar to these designations calling from excuses. This has long been a discussion. The testimony that Mr. Perez submitted gets right to the heart of this question, and there is certainly a feeling that the community plans should rule, but it's very important to really understand what zoning means, and when community plans do have the force and effect of law, and when they don't, when they're more of a guide. The . . . *(inaudible)*. . . that shows how the zoning and the designations work together is also a rough guide. There could very well be examples where zonings could fit with a different community plan designation, depending on a particular type of use. So it's really...it's not a particularly complex question, it's a simple question that has a lot of components that you need to understand before answering it.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Right, and I guess my concerns is, you know, just addressing any unintended consequences if we do multiple zoning within different designations. I think --

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: -- in past revisions, I believe Appendix D was in Section 3.3 within...near the maps, so I think we could see some of the...what kind of designations would be where in each area. That would...for me, it would help. So, yeah just trying to see how...what appropriate zoning to the different designations.

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah. It's...the description of the designations was originally in the main body of the plan. I'm the one who recommended that it be moved to an Appendix, in part because the plan was just getting really long. And eventually there will be more familiarity with what the designations means, so consulting those descriptions won't be needed as much as they are now. But it's really what...what the Council, what the community feels is going to make that plan useable and understandable. So wherever that needs to go, it can go. And if that table comparing the zonings and designations will be helpful in that regard, then I wouldn't...I wouldn't object to including it.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, okay.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

MS. MCLEAN: It's...we just need to be careful with the wording to make sure that it's understood that that's not absolute, that that chart would cover probably 95 or 99 percent of circumstances, but not necessarily 100 percent circumstances.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Director. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Sinenci. And just to follow up, we did have a conversation about including the zoning that fit under the Community Plan Designations. There was some hesitancy as we were going through the audit and the rewrite that what zonings are under the Community Plan Designations right now may change in the future. So that was kind of if we put it...what currently lasts in each Community Plan Designation, the corresponding zoning as it is right now, it may change in the future. So that's a decision that, when we come to our decision-making time, we should maybe discuss more thoroughly. But thank you for bringing it up and, you know, our first pass at maybe things that we want to include or not include, why and why not. I saw Committee Vice-Chair King, followed by Committee Councilmember Molina. So go ahead, Member King.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. And I'm not sure if this is for Director McLean or if Pam wants to answer, but basically to follow up on my question to the testifiers. What will be your approach if communities want different community plan designations from each other?

MS. MCLEAN: I'll give a brief response, and then let Pam or Jen jump in, because they're really the ones on the frontline with this. Currently, we do have different designations in different plans, so that's not...that's not unheard of. I would be concerned if there were modifications to the description of designations. Adding a new designation wouldn't be as much of a concern, but modifying what that means, because then that just gets confusing that it means one thing in one place, and another thing in another place. But if Pam or Jen want to comment in more detail, that would be helpful.

MS. EATON: Sure. I think one of the first things that, of course, we're going to defer to communities. We've done that extensively with West Maui, and are in the midst of doing it with South Maui, making sure that we do have that fit, and allow for what is important to the community. I just want to say I think this is really the first opportunity we've really dove into these uses and designations in terms of what they mean, so I would ask for folks to try to have an open mind and really try to understand. Like for example, when we play this game...and great idea, Councilmember Paltin, you get a point for when you see the designation, name a site, name a location. So I think once you get into this you can see, for example, how it does apply. I mean of course you're not going to do an Urban Center/Corridor in Hāna, that's ridiculous. You're going to do what fits. So to really get to your question, Councilmember King, absolutely. The whole point of these is to engage with the community, to do what works for the community, in terms of what the community wants. I'm just asking folks to take a shot at trying to understand what these do and what the opportunities they do present...

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MS. EATON: Jen, I know we don't see you, but I didn't want to leave out Jen, Councilmember King, if she wants to add something.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Well, let me just comment on what you just said because if you wanted to go ahead with pre-planned designations that would fit in every plan, there should have been an island wide conversation first with all the communities. Because right now, I see the South Maui community is being asked to accept these designations if they pass like this in the one plan without having the input of being able...and I do see some amendments that I would like to...I would like to make to these if they don't pass in the West Maui Community Plan that I think South Maui would be amenable to. And so that's my concern, is that we're not just assuming here is what West Maui did, and now we're just going to try to make every other community understand why this is the best thing for you to adopt because it may not fit in every community.

MS. EATON: Yeah. I want to address that. And that is that when we came out with these draft Community Plan Designations, and I know you know this because you attended, we had many meetings. We had many stakeholder meetings. We had meetings with special interest groups, with developers, with community associations. So we did...also, as a reminder we were in the midst of doing that all in house...I think it was Jen, myself, and I think we still had one other planner then, and we were doing the West Maui Community Plan. And so...and then meanwhile, the public and the community is getting upset because we can't crank these out fast enough. So, you know, we're trying to do what we can here...we're trying to bring us to best planning practices, and we absolutely are going to be open. And yes, we absolutely, of course, are going to listen to communities and see what amendments and changes they might want.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. And I do remember attending, but there wasn't an exchange. It was...you know, I attended, and we were told what the proposal was, and then there wasn't really a discussion, it was more just given the information. So I do...and I do remember those meetings, but I don't think, as a community, that there's a broad acceptance of the same designations across the islands. So that was my major concern. So I'm glad to hear that you're open to each community making its changes to the land use designations. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member King. And just as a follow up to that, we are working on a 2.80B, broad adoption of community plan designations, whatever that may look like, so that there is some sort of consistency, and to open it up to...as an item to the general public and not just focusing on West Maui Community Plan, but that's in the future. Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you, Madam Chair. First question is for you procedurally, are you going to have us on a time clock the rest of the meeting, or unlimited?

CHAIR PALTIN: Well, I was going to take the break about 10:30, and then begin the game after

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

our break.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. But as far as this session, the Q&A for the Department and their presentation, we have no time limit then.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, if you can just police yourself.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. All right. Thank you. Okay. First question, under the designation Rural Residential, for the Department, if you could just briefly define for me what Low Density Residential is?

CHAIR PALTIN: Department? Ms. Maydan, probably...maybe?

MS. MAYDAN: Sure. Mahalo, Member for your question. The Low Density Residential under Rural Residential would be what you're used to seeing within the existing Rural designation. So for example, in our Rural Zoning designations, it ranges from half acre to ten acre. So the examples that I gave under Rural Residential, one of them is the Pukalani neighborhood behind Pukalani Foodland, that's a rural neighborhood, and that's probably on the denser side of rural. I believe a lot of those are probably half and one acre lots. Rural Residential could get less dense than that, perhaps it could be a mix of five-acre lots and two-acre lots and ten-acre lots. So Low Density, Rural Residential is those larger lots with some family farms mixed in with some larger lot residential.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, great. Thank you. The next question is for the, I guess the Rural Village. Under that designation, will the short-term rentals, TVRs, and bed and breakfasts be allowed, you know, with this designation? And if so, why?

CHAIR PALTIN: Ms. Maydan.

MS. MAYDAN: Yeah. Thank you for your question. So in the community plan for the designations, it does not regulate the development of short-term rentals, bed and breakfasts, et cetera, that is very much a matter of zoning. The community plan does not speak to that.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, you're muted.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Sorry. And my last question is under the Employment Center designation, there's mention of all the services in there such as bikes, biking, and so forth. If these services are not available in these areas, how would they be included, and who would fund them? Would it be Government expected to fund, you know, I guess the bike paths and everything else that come under these designations?

MS. MAYDAN: That's a great question. Mahalo for that. So first off, no, it wouldn't this...putting this language within the designations does not put forth that expectation that Government will fund it. What it does as far as addressing mobility and the importance of mobility in our communities and even...and you mentioned the

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

Employment Center designation, what it does by mentioning that, mentioning the importance of mobility in the descriptions is really say that these areas are not just about uses. They are also about how we get around in these areas; that Land Use and Transportation are inherently tied together, and transportation is not just the automobile. Transportation is us walking, transportation is us biking, busing, et cetera. So it's really pulling these together and saying that as our communities develop or change, that we need to take that into consideration. So it's putting that up front by having that in the designations through our zoning code audit, mobility will become...will become part of the conversation there. So as a staff planner reviews a development application, for example, in an Employment Center area, what can be done to improve the mobility, whether it's by paths, walking paths, will be reviewed at that project. It's not a mandate that Government will do it, it's just recognizing that mobility is a very important part of creating our complete communities.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you very much for your responses. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Molina. I got Member Rawlins-Fernandez, followed by Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. And mahalo to the Planning Department for all of your hard work on amending the Community Plan Designations. I actually really like it. I like the involving to meet our communities' needs, and see them as options and tools for all our communities to choose from. I would prefer that...I would like them even more if they are connected to zoning and would prefer that we connect them to the appropriate zoning prior to implementing the recommendations from the audit, and then amending it after those audit recommendations are incorporated into Title 19. Okay. So I have two questions...three questions. Okay. One, so we talked about...or Chair Paltin talked about incorporating these community plan designations in 2.80. So when will that start? When will the Planning Department start with that?

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, is that question for me?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, no, it's for the Department. So either Ms. Maydan or Miss...oh...

MS. MCLEAN: I guess Jen and Pam aren't jumping in, I'll go ahead. Or Pam, did you want to say something? I don't know that...that we've been asked to do that. I know that the discussion has been there. That would have to be done by ordinance. We'd have to get Corp. Counsel's guidance on whether that ordinance would have to be reviewed by the Planning Commissions. It's not a Title 19 change, but is 2.80B considered a Land Use Ordinance? That I'm not sure. So it's just a matter of drafting a Bill, you know, whether we do it or Council Services Staff does it. It's not particularly complex, so...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

MS. MCLEAN: If it's decided that that is what should happen, then whoever wants to grab it and run with it first can do so.

CHAIR PALTIN: And I believe our office does have a PAF in on that, so...

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Director and Chair. I think that kind of answers my question that I had previously about what the implications of adopting these Community Plan Designations into the West Maui Community Plan, what kind of implications it would have for future community plans. So if that's the direction we're taking, then that answers that question. So my last two questions are regarding Parks and Open Space. I don't know if I see them as the same thing. And so they're being combined, and I guess what are the potential like implications of combining them, and should like true open space like be moved more to like conservation, is that like the intention? Anyone in the Planning Department.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Well, I think the conservation...

MS. MAYDAN: Mahalo, Member for your question. I'd be happy to answer that.

CHAIR PALTIN: Go ahead, Ms. Maydan.

MS. MAYDAN: Thank you. Thank you. Yeah. So combining the Park and Open Space designations. So yeah. In the existing community plan, there are two separate designations. When we started the process, we really looked at them, and we saw a lot of similarities. Of course, when you look at individual sites, there are differences. The two examples I gave, I believe, Lipoa Point and the Kihei Regional Park. Of course those are different. One is more of a natural open space, and one is more of a developed recreational park. But for the purposes and the level that we're at at the community plan, you know, we're up at the 20,000 foot level, and those uses are far more similar than they are dissimilar. And we felt that combining the uses made for a great way just to identify kind of those green spaces within our communities or on the fringes of our communities. But absolutely keep in mind that there is still zoning that applies; and we have open space zoning, and we have park zoning. And so that's where the differences really come in, where of course an urban park is going to be a park zoning designation, and a more remote open space is going to be an open space designation. And that regulates what happens on the land whether, you know, ball fields can happen, or whether it's more natural in nature. So that was our thinking with combining the designations, that it was appropriate at the level that we are at in the community plan.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Maydan. And then my last question is regarding single-family and multi-family. So I assumed they were separated for a reason, and I imagine it was likely to separate single-family from like larger apartment buildings. So if you could kind of speak to the intention behind having them separated, and then the implications of...

MS. MAYDAN: Yeah, absolutely. Thank you. So I...as far as speaking to the intention of having single-family and multi-family separated to begin with, I, of course, was not

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

around when those designations were originally put together, but I can guess that they were following...they were following the thought of zoning, which in the past has very much been to segregate uses. To segregate apartment buildings away from single-family homes, to segregate our office buildings, our commercial areas, away from our neighborhoods, that has been the old thinking of zoning, and that led into long-range planning, like community plans, to separate uses. So of course, in our planning profession, we have come to realize that that was a very big mistake. We ended up building large subdivisions, sprawl of neighborhoods that have no character, that don't promote the health of our communities, that everybody has to get in a car, everything is separated. And we are experiencing those impacts from decades and decades of development that segregated uses. So that would be the thinking of them in the past being separated, thinking that they were not compatible. But today, and it's not even that new for a couple of decades now, this has been the evolution to create more mixed complete communities and neighborhoods that allow for residential neighborhoods that have a mix of housing types and sizes. And it is absolutely a valid concern to look at our existing single-family neighborhoods and say...you know, say that there's concern with change. That's absolutely a concern, but there are also very valid benefits to appropriate infill in a single-family neighborhood of perhaps a few duplexes, or maybe a four-plex, or something that is within scale of an existing single-family neighborhood; that can have a lot of benefits as far as providing more housing options, more affordable housing options to our community members. And again here, we have to keep in mind that the community plan is not ruling everything. That there's zoning. That the community plan goes to a certain point and promotes the mixed neighborhoods, but then zoning controls. So if you have an existing single-family neighborhood, and somebody wants to propose a tall apartment building that's extremely dense, they would have to go through the zoning process, and it likely could be determined that that is inappropriate. But thank you very much for your question.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Maydan. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Member Johnson.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Councilmember Keani Rawlins-Fernandez touched on part of my question, so I just want to piggy-back off of what was just said. So I've been reading this wonderful book called *Death and Life of Great American Cities* by Jane Jacobs, and one thing she mentions about the dense, mixed use of residential areas that have that "eyes on the street," right. So does the Department recognize that single-family home zoning creates problems to low income working class and minorities by redlining, keeping mortgages out of reach, and creating oversized lots and gated communities that non-resident investors will snatch up. Is that a factor that you considered, why you guys lumped them all together? Can you expand on that, Department?

MS. MAYDAN: Mahalo, Member Johnson. Yes, and I'm going to give you one bonus point now for the game for mentioning *Death and Life of Cities* and Jane Jacobs...so bravo. Yes, absolutely. This has been part of our conversation in realizing that we really need to change our community plan designations, and almost even more importantly, changing

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

our zoning code. And so it is so exciting that this is happening in our County right now. We fully acknowledge that this is a big shift. Change is hard. We are used to the Community Plan Designations we have, and we're used to the zoning we have. But we need to also recognize that it's time to evolve, that there are many benefits to evolving to designations and zoning districts that promote more complete communities, that promote those mix of uses, and try to right some of the wrongs of the past as far as segregating neighborhoods, redlining, having a really negative impact on those in our community that really are underserved, that get pushed out of housing options. So that absolutely was a part of our conversation. Affordable housing is such an incredible challenge that I don't need to say that to you all. I know you deal with that all the time. This shift in the community plan is one step in the right direction in addressing our affordable housing problems in our County.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Well, thank you for your response, Ms. Maydan. It gives me great hope that you are taking action on that. And I'm going to take that point, and I'm going to give it right back to the Department. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Oh, so we had someone in the lead, but it's an even playing field still. Still even playing field. I had one question for the Department regarding Urban Center/Corridor, and just any thoughts as to a Transportation Corridor instead.

MS. EATON: I can take a swipe at this. So do you mean renaming it to Transportation Corridor as opposed to Urban, just the name, or the uses as well?

CHAIR PALTIN: Well, I don't want to give away any answers to the game, but I guess naming it so that the focus is there, you know.

MS. EATON: So the focus in terms of...for example, so Urban Center/Corridor, UCC really promotes...really, I think, gets to the heart of these compact interconnected communities. I think sometimes the word urban itself can be off-putting, but essentially, the whole point behind UCC is having that availability, ready availability of transit in close connectivity to housing of all types, affordable and market housing, as well as jobs, services, schools, employment...you know, employment, having that all interconnected. And a lot of times with UCC or transit or transportation corridors, they're called different things around the country, they are trying to promote...as Jen talked about that, getting rid of that auto dependency, you know, trying to promote taking transit, riding a bike, walking, getting to work. So I'm not sure if I'm addressing your question, but it's not just about transportation. It's that, of course, that's important, but it's about making sure you have these areas, mix of uses with affordable housing...more opportunities to do infill where you're connecting housing with jobs and business, that kind of thing.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, I guess it's like you said, you know, the connotation of urban like, you know, I can definitely see urban downtown Honolulu, but maybe Lāhainā, urban Lāhainā is kind of like whoa, are we there already, you know.

MS. EATON: Yeah. This...I started to do a lot of the transportation and land use planning

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

right now. And I've seen around the country they call them TOD overlays, Transit-Oriented Development Corridors. I've seen them called Transit Corridors, Transportation Corridors. It's...I think, you know, you guys need, you know, call it what you're comfortable with, but the idea is to not lose the idea behind it, and that is having that mix of available public transportation so people can, at much lower costs and getting vehicles off the road, get to school, get to their jobs, get to everyday businesses and amenities and those types of things. But I hear you, I understand what you're saying about urban and the connotation, particularly here on Maui.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. We're at our break time, and I see that Chair Lee wants to get back into the meeting. Maybe we'll give her an opportunity if she wanted to ask any questions because she usually is quick. Oh, Director McLean.

MS. MCLEAN: Thank you, Chair. I did want to make a comment to a question I believe Councilmember Molina had asked. He had asked about vacation rentals and the community plan, and Jen had commented that that's more a zoning issue, which is true. But I did want to point out, when it comes to short-term rental homes, I know there are ones that you need to get a permit for, one of the requirements is...I'll just read it from the Code, "Short-term rental homes shall conform to the character of the existing neighborhood in which they are situated. Prior to issuing a permit, the Department or applicable Planning Commission shall consider the following..." and there's a long list of things. One of those things is the applicable community plan. So if there is language in the community plan relating to short-term rental homes, or vacation rentals in general, when it comes to processing those permits, the Department, if it's an Administrative approval, or the Commission would have to consult the community plan. Thank you for letting me chime into that.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. And I think Chair Lee might need to be let back in again. I saw her in, and then she got out. But at this time, it's time for our morning break. Chair Lee, did you have any burning questions that you needed to ask before we go on our morning break? Not like you're holding us up from our break, but you know, I'm just asking.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I can hold onto questions. I can wait. Thanks.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. All right, Members, it's 10:32. Shall we come back at 10:45? All right. This meeting will be in recess until 10:45 today. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 10:32 a.m.

RECONVENE: 10:46 a.m.

CHAIR PALTIN: . . .(gavel). . . Will the Planning and Sustainable Land Use meeting of Thursday, May 20th, return to order. The time is 10:46, and I see that Chair Lee has joined us, so if you have any questions for the Department on the presentation, I have you on a timer for three minutes. Ready, set, go.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I already knew all the answers. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay, perfect. And let's see, I think, Yuki Lei Sugimura, it shows she's on, but maybe just her computer is still logged in. All right. So at this time, Department, did you want to go over the game rules? And when we practice played it, when I was on my Surface Pro, sometimes having the chat box open covered a portion of the slide. So we will be emailing to you folks the slides with the questions, but not the answers. And you know, just to keep it fair and not embarrass anybody, I'm going to hold back from playing because, you know, I want to give other people a chance. Go ahead, Ms. Eaton.

MS. EATON: I love that. I love your competitive spirit. All right. So is everybody ready? Are all you guys ready. I want to see fingers. Are fingers ready? So we're going to do a quick test. In the chat box, when I say go, because we're testing your buzzers, I want you to type the following. Okay, is everyone ready? Pam is the bomb. Ready, set, go. If anybody types that I will be so amazed. Anyway. All right. Kelly, you win a point. No, whoops, no Keani, I saw you, you got in there first. All right. All right. So everybody's ready. Get you guys nice and loose. Let's have some fun with this. I think your questions have been great so far, so I really, really appreciate the discussion we've had so far. So let's give this a roll. All right. Jaime, are you ready to drive? Cool. All right. So the purpose of today is to try to...there's been great questions and great discussions, so let's try to see where this kind of fits around the island and where we're at. I'm going to open my chat box so I can narrate and see who's winning. I think we're starting out with Councilmember Johnson getting a point for mentioning Jane Jacobs or Saint Jane, so other than that, we'll get started with the first question. All right, Jaime, go ahead. All right. So Jaime, I think you need to go back one. A little too quick. Starting with 12 of 14 Community Plan Designations, so I see the 12 on your screen, so these are the 12 we are going to be asking about. Okay, now the next slide. Which designation focuses on planned or existing larger-scale Government, nonprofit, or educational uses. We're starting off with an easy one. It focuses on planned or existing large-scaled Government, nonprofit, or educational uses. Ooh, Mike Molina got in there. Shane I think you won, you got, oh, no. Gabe, not special purposes. Shane, I think you came in first correct. Councilmember Molina, correct. Keani, correct.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Does spelling matter?

MS. EATON: Evidently not. We can get used to the alphabet soup. No, good job, you guys.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay, so we don't have to spell it correctly.

MS. EATON: No, you don't. No points for spelling or taking off. Yes, Public/Quasi Public focuses on planned or existing larger-scale Government, non-profit, or educational uses. Okay, next one.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, Pam, were we going to do the extra point if they can name...

MS. EATON: Oh, okay. Okay, sure thing. Sure thing. Can...let's see if someone can type in quick, if somebody wants to give an example of where we've got PQP in Maui County.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

Okay, Councilmember Sinenci, Wailuku Industrial, UHMC, that's a good one, UHMC. Okay. I've got...Jen, I think you're scoring, I'm not sure who's scoring. All right. Let's go on to the next question.

CHAIR PALTIN: And to clarify, Wailuku Industrial would probably be industrial, right?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah.

MS. EATON: Not necessarily.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, okay.

MS. EATON: Yeah. This is where we get into Employment Center and those types of nuances. All right. The next one, which three...okay, three designations allow manufacturing and light industrial. Which three designations of the ones you're looking at on your screen. Okay. Gabe Johnson got one. Shane has Corridor Industrial and Employment Center. Kelly, Employment Center, UCC and Industrial. I think Shane got it first. Kelly is correct. Member Molina, you got two out of three, and Keani got two. The correct answer...let's go drive to that one, is Urban Center/Corridor, Employment Center, and Industrial allow manufacturing and light industrial. Does anybody want to take one of those of uses, community plan designations, and name something on island what that might fall into as an example. Yeah, Kaahumanu could definitely certainly be Urban Corridor...UCC, as well as EC. Sugar Mill could be Industrial, excellent. So correct answer for Kelly. I don't know about Mokulele Highway. I suppose in the future it could be. Wailuku Industrial Center, yeah, that's a good one. I've got our scorers who are doing the scoring. Okay. Next question please. Okay. Which designation allows noxious industrial and many oh, look at them they're ringing in, it's going off, manufacturing uses that might not be compatible with other uses. I believe the first person that typed that in was Kelly King. Keani, Gabe, and Mike Molina all have correct answers. Obviously industrial...it would just be industrial, the industrial use. Industrial allows noxious industrial and manufacturing uses that might not be compatible with other uses. Excellent. Okay. Next question. Which two designations of the ones you're looking at allow light industrial because it is compatible with other uses like retail, restaurants, parks, and residential. What two? Kelly got that right away. Wait a minute. The Employment Center, UCC is the correct answer. Kelly, you got that. Gabe Johnson, Keani...UCC, Shane you got it. You guys got used to the alphabet soup. Molina, Alice Lee. Okay. It would be...the correct answer is Urban...UCC and Employment Center, EC. Okay. Next one please. Costco, there you go. Next question. Which designations include transit...now this is a trick question. No pressure on Councilmember Sugimura, just saying. This is a trick question. Which designations include transit and multi-modal transportation options? Which designations? Councilmember King, UCC. Councilmember Sinenci, writes corridor, public/quasi, special use, PQP. Mike Molina says EC, UCC. Keani, UCC, EC, public UCC. And the correct answer is and none of you got it, all of these designations include transit and multi-modal transportation options. All of the designations allow all these opportunities for multi-modal alternatives. Okay. And the bus and bikes and rolling and walking. All right. So now, of these uses you're looking at on your screen, we've

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

taken out industrial and we've put in ag. Okay. Which designation combines two designations from the existing community plans and provides areas for recreation, Native Hawaiian traditional and customary uses, resource protection, and flood control? King came in at Park/Open Space, Park/Open Space and Ag. Park/Open Space, Shane says, Conservation, and Councilmember Molina said Ag, Rural Village, Special Purpose District. Okay, let's put in the answers to this one. Park/Open Space, excellent. It combines two designations from the existing community plans and provides for recreation, Native Hawaiian traditional and customary uses, resource protection, and flood control. All right. I don't know if anybody...all you have to do is look at the pictures too, by the way, big hint. In terms of naming a place, if you want that extra point. Okay, Maalaea, you might have to go a little more specific. I think Councilmember King got it, Kealia Pond, and that is what that is. Okay. Let's go on to the next one. Okay. So for this one, Jen's presentation touched on scale, character, and so forth. So think about that before you answer. So looking at all these designations, which designation establishes, protects, and allows for appropriate infill of low to moderate density residential neighborhood with limited commercial uses. Kelly King came in with residential. So did Keani. So did Shane, Rural Residential. Ms. Lee, Residential. Okay, the correct answer is which designation, and that is...drumroll...a little slow transition...residential. Excellent. Residential establishes, protects, and allows for appropriate infill of low to moderate density residential neighborhoods with the limited commercial uses. Okay. Let's go on to the next question, we're going to get into this a little bit more. Which designation is medium to high density, and includes a mix of uses that primarily serve visitors? Keani nailed that one, Resort/Hotel, she came in first. Shane second. Right behind that is Mike Molina, Gabe Johnson and Alice Lee. Nice job. And the answer, of course, Resort/Hotel. And I'm showing Kā'anapali counted for the extra point. There you go. Wailea, another good one, Councilmember Sinenci. Excellent. Wi-Fi is not an excuse. You got that extra point, Councilmember Johnson. All right. Which designations encourage a similar mix of residential, commercial, and public uses, like schools and parks. Okay. We've got Councilmember Sinenci, Rural Residential. Councilmember...PQP, I think you might have meant, PQQ, I'm not sure...misspelling. There you go. PQP, Keani. Okay, I got that. Alice Lee, Special Purpose District, PQP. Mike Molina, PQP. Okay. And our correct answer is...there are several. So there's Neighborhood Center, Small Town Center, Urban Center/Corridor, and Rural Village all encourage a similar mix of residential, commercial, and public uses like schools and parks, and depending upon the particular designation, that is going to be...that's going to depend upon the character, the density, and the scale, and we're going to dive into that a little bit. So the next question, Maui Lani, Alice Lee, nice point. There you go. Kea Lani for Keani. Those one, two, three extra points. Okay. So which designation creates transit friendly areas by encouraging higher density, higher density residential and higher density commercial. So of these four, which one? Keani came in first with UCC, followed by Councilmember Sinenci, Johnson, Molina, it's only one, not two. Alice Lee and Kelly King, excellent. And the correct answer is, we actually talked about this a little bit, Urban Center/Corridor creates transit friendly areas by encouraging higher density residential and density commercial. Lower Main, maybe Kaahumanu area shopping center. Definitely Kaahumanu Ave. Actually what you're looking at is a picture of the transit-oriented development corridor for Wailuku/Kahului. Excellent. Okay. Our scorers hopefully are getting those. Main Street, excellent answer. Next

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

question. Which three designations are intended to preserve Maui's small town character? So of the four, which three are intended to preserve. Okay, three. Kelly...let's see here. Gabe Johnson, I think you've got that correct. Keani, Mike, yup, you guys, excellent. I think everybody's got it. I don't see any UCC in there, so I think all your answers are correct so far. Correct answer, Neighborhood Center, Small Town Center, and Rural Village are intended to preserve Maui's small town character. And let's see here, okay Pā'ia. Okay, Shane you got that one. Makawao Town, extra point, extra point. Keani, Makawao. There you go. Excellent. Hāna, perfect example of Rural Village. All right. Great, good job you guys. See how these apply around the island, excellent. Okay. Which designation is appropriate for a small grocery store, a church, and a park around four corners of an intersection that serve the surrounding...the surrounding rural area? Which designation? Okay. Rural Village, Rural Village, Sinenci, Molina, Keani said Small Town Center. Alice Lee picked Small Town Center, Neighborhood Center. Which one designation? Ooh, Kahakuloa, okay. Let's go to the...let's see that extra point there. The answer is Rural Village is appropriate for a small grocery store, a church, a park around four corners of an intersection that serve the surrounding rural area. Lots of good examples, you guys. Ulupalakua, excellent. Okay. Next question. Which designation of these three encourages small scale buildings with Mom and Pop shops that are walkable from a nearby neighborhood. Gabe Johnson came in with Neighborhood Center. Keani got Neighborhood Center first, I believe, and then Councilwoman, Neighborhood Center, Kelly King. Shane, Small Town. Mike Molina, Small Town Center. So which one designation that would be one? Keani also came in with Honokowai, an example. Excellent. Neighborhood Center encourages small scale buildings with Mom and Pop shops that are walkable from a nearby neighborhood. That was a good one. Excellent. Okay. Next question. Okay. Of the three which one designation is intended to preserve the character of Maui's smaller towns and allow for development of new low to medium-density mixed-use centers that serve multiple neighborhoods? So now we're looking beyond the geographic scope and range. Excellent. I think we have Kelly King came in at Neighborhood Center. Shane Sinenci, Small Town. I can also put your examples in if you like. Geographic examples. Front Street. That's great. I hope the scorers are getting these. Excellent. Waikapu, by Councilmember Sinenci. Okay. Our answer is...the correct answer of those three designations...it is Small Town Center is intended to preserve the character of Maui's smaller towns and allow for development of new to low medium-density mixed-use centers that serve multiple neighborhoods. Okay. Excellent work. Just about...I don't know what...if anybody has a score yet. Are you able to announce anything...who's leading? I'm not the scorer. All right, we'll go to the next question.

MS. MAYDAN: Okay.

MS. EATON: You got it?

MS. MAYDAN: I can give you an update if you want. Let's see here.

MS. EATON: Yeah, yeah.

MS. MAYDAN: We have a three-way tie between Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez, King,

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

and Sinenci. Three-way tie. With Councilmember Molina biting on their heels.

MS. EATON: Okay. Excellent. Next question now. We need a double daily round. Next...there we go. Which designation is for uses that are so unique...so unique that no other designation can possibly apply? Excellent. I believe Councilmember King came in first, Special Purpose District. Ag is not correct. Keani, Special Purpose, correct. Alice Lee, Gabe Johnson, and Mike Molina. And the answer is, Special Purpose District are for uses that are unique such as...as you can see...I'm not even going to say...there you go. Councilmember Sinenci, Kahului Airport. Excellent example. No other designation would apply. Kā'anapali Airport, perfect answer, Councilmember Lee. All right. Which designations allow agricultural uses and farming? Which designations, plural? County Ag, that would be one. Mike Molina, Kelly King, all came in with Ag. Ag and Open, Shane. Keani, Rural Residential. Okay. We've got some great answers here. How about some suggestions...Peahi, there you go. So Rural Residential and Ag allow for agricultural uses and farming. Great job. All right. Next question, I think we're just about coming to the end here. Which designation is intended to preserve and protect agricultural resources? Preserve and protect agricultural resources. I believe Gabe Johnson came in first with Ag, followed by Shane, Alice Lee, Keani, Ag, Ag, and Ag. And then we've got Kula Ag. Excellent.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I have a protest, I think I came in first with Ag.

MS. EATON: Oh, wait, sorry. I'm trying to...it's going so fast. I don't see you. I'm sure you did. Your buzzer...you need to check your buzzer. I know you know that.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I show...yeah, it shows me Ag right ahead of Councilmember Molina.

MS. EATON: All right. Excellent. Okay. Ag is intended to preserve and protect agricultural resources. All right, is that it? I think that might be it, and we just had a very, very key...this shows, you know, especially with you guys naming places around the islands. Jen is going to finish this off with just the key takeaways from the game, and from your answers, and from these community plan land use designations. And I don't know if you guys can announce the winner.

MS. MAYDAN: I can. I will start with that. So let's see here. Very close. So as far as the scoring I gave points, I gave a point for participation. So if you participated on each question, you got a point. If you got a right answer or a mostly right answer, you got a point, and if you gave an example, you got a point. So we have scores ranging from 31 to 35, so everyone did terrific. And let's see, we have a tie for first place, Councilmember King and Councilmember Molina with 35 points. And then we have a tie for second place with Councilmember Rawlins-Fernandez and Councilmember Sinenci. And then we have Councilmember Gabe Johnson on their heels and Chair Lee on their heels as well. Everyone did terrific. Thank you so much for playing along. That was great. So let's see here, Jaime, I just got a couple last slides for our key takeaways.

VICE-CHAIR KING: I'm sorry what was...who was the winner? I dropped off at that point. You were getting ready to announce.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

MS. MAYDAN: Our top scorers were you, Councilmember King and Mike Molina, with everyone right behind you. Okay. Key takeaways. There's a lot of takeaways, but these were just a few things we wanted to point out. So as far as residential, the residential designation, as we've said, allows for a variety of housing types, encouraging neighborhoods that have something for everyone. This promotes affordability and meets the diverse housing needs of residents. Residential uses are also allowed in almost all of the designations, also promoting the goals of housing affordability and complete communities. Next, Urban Center/Corridor, UCC provides wonderful opportunities to address transit-oriented development as one of the benefits, increasing densities for affordable housing in close proximity to homes, jobs, schools, and services, with better connectivity to transit, bike, and walking. And as we talked about as far as urban and talking about density, that's all within the appropriate scale of our Maui communities. Next, onto Rural Village, Neighborhood Center and Small Town Center, all of these designations call out the importance of preserving what we love so much about Maui. Our sense of place. Through the protection and continued respect for culture, history, and character of these various unique locations, and allowing for us to have mixed use centers that serve our various communities in different settings. And then lastly, Special Purpose District, as we've said, and as folks gave examples of in the game, airports are a great example of areas designated Special Purpose District. This district is not a dumping ground for future development that has not yet been assigned designations, nor is it meant to take the place of project districts. So mahalo, everyone, for playing along with this, and especially to Chair Paltin for coming up with the idea of trying to make this fun. And we had a great time putting this together with all of our Staff. So thank you so much for playing.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, you're muted.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. Good job, Department and Members. It looks like people have a better understanding now than maybe 8:00 this morning. At this time, I'd like to give Members an opportunity for another round of questions, and I'll start with Member Sugimura because she didn't have her first opportunity of questions. Did you have any questions on Community Plan Designations for the Department?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I just...sorry I missed most of your game and...but thank you very much for doing this to make it a fun way of learning more. I just want to announce that Bob Carroll won and Mary Trotto for the older American...yeah, for this year, so it was quite a production online. Alice and I were there. But thanks. I heard the testifiers, and I'm just curious of how...if the Department wants to just make a comment regarding what Albert Perez said in his testimony. He also called me this morning. He submitted testimony that I got in my email, but I haven't had a chance to read it yet. But I just wondered if the Department has a comment on what he said.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Director McLean.

MS. MCLEAN: Thank you, Chair. Similar to my response to Councilmember Sinenci, it might be worth having a focus discussion just on that issue of the relationship between

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

community plans and zoning. It seems like there is a consistent push for community plans to have more of...that they be...that they have the force and effect of law more than they do today, more than how the Code defines it today. We're not...we don't have any sort of ideological resistance to that, but it would be a very significant change to how the process works, and we just have to have a really thorough understanding of what that would mean in terms of individual property rights and expectations of what people are allowed to do with their property. So it's...you know, if I had to say do I support or oppose what Mr. Perez presented, I would say oppose because we haven't had that big conversation. I don't think that there is an equal understanding of what that would mean. And before entertaining those kinds of things, or I should say before changing how the current process works, we would really need to have that discussion with legal counsel to really understand what that would mean. I'm not dodging the question, it's just a really, really big question.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: No, I think it's coming...like when I got the call this morning, I was like okay, what is happening. Because I think we've gone through, you know, the process with the West Maui Community Plan, using the designations that the Department came up with. I value your experience in working with the community and understanding what the needs are. So I look forward to seeing what, you know, what the Department has to say, and of course Corp. Counsel, because I'm sure it has legal implications, right. But to just say, okay, we're going to change it like now, it's...it kind of deserves, I think, a bigger discussion. I even haven't had a chance to read his testimony because I think it came...I don't know what time this morning, but I haven't even had a chance to read it. But he did call me, and I look forward to hearing more eventually. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Sugimura. Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: So what is the Chair's intent with regard to these new designations? I'm sorry we weren't...we must have missed at least 45 minutes of today's meeting, so if you mentioned it earlier, I didn't get it. Sorry.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, no. So thank you. My intent was for the Members to become familiar with it without the pressure of the maps and those types of decisions bearing down on us, you know. Now that I feel like most Members, even if you watch the replay of this, at least have more of a rudimentary understanding of these new designations compared to what they were, it'll make our work in the next phase, which is to go over the maps and the appendix, at least we know that everybody has a rudimentary understanding. Of course, we can recommend changes to the Community Plan Designation and, you know, non-substantive, like whether they are put in Section 3 or whether they're kept in Section 5, or even maybe little bit more substantive changes, like we don't want light industrial and employment center, or whatever it is. That's just an example, not something that I'm advocating for. At least I feel like now we're coming from a place where we understand these new Community Plan Designations, and it has prepared us for the upcoming conversations. If anyone had a change that they wanted to discuss now, we can discuss it. We have about 45 minutes. You can either propose a change for discussion or, you know, that you're thinking of. We don't have to make the decision

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

today. But it can be something that Members stew on because we don't want to talk about this outside of an open meeting because that would be a violation of the Sunshine Law. But if Members have any ideas or feedback or additional questions, this would be the time. Does that answer your question?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, it does. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Sure thing. Member Johnson, did you have any feedback, additional questions, or proposals?

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. I'm satisfied. I'll yield the floor.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Member King, followed by Member Molina.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Thank you, Chair. I do have some ideas on amendments I'd like to make, but I wanted to hear from the CPAC first. She said she would send her input, and I think the fact that she didn't feel like they had a full enough discussion on this with part of the plan might lend itself to some...you know, after thinking about it, maybe her...maybe she can watch the game that we just played. So...but I thought...I thought that your intent for today was basically more educating and presenting and we weren't going to make a decision, so I'm not going to propose anything right now. But I do have another question for the Department when we go to round two, so . . . *(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, yeah, this would be your opportunity.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, okay. Okay. So I wanted to ask, it's just to follow up on the issue of zoning versus community plan, that what...maybe Director McLean could just expound a little more on what...if we're trying...are we trying to sync up the community plan with the zoning in those communities? And if we are, are we trying to...are we looking at changing zoning to match what the community plan is? Because the community has, you know, made a statement about what they want to see in their communities. And then does that entail zoning changes, and can we do that, or are we looking at changing the community plan to match the existing zoning. Because, you know...and this comes from...I'll give you an example like, you know, the area that we had in South Maui where the community plan designation was business, and it was zoned Single-Family, and then the proposal to put a wellness center, and the argument about whether or not it was a wetland came up. And so, you know, the preference there is to change the community plan. And then we had the hotel that was zoned Hotel, but designated Single-Family in the community plan, supposedly by mistake because they marched along, you know, changing all the hotels to Hotel zoning, but they forgot the last one in that strip. So just...if you could speak to...is it legal to change zoning to match the community plan or is it through the taking.

CHAIR PALTIN: Director McLean.

MS. MCLEAN: Thank you. One of the instances where community plans have the force and effect of law is with changes in zoning. You cannot change zoning in a way that's

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

inconsistent with the community. So it's supposed to be that zoning follows the community plan.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay.

MS. MCLEAN: So you have your existing zoning map with parcels zoned whatever they are zoned. The community plan comes in and says, oh, we...down the road, we think these changes should happen in these places. Some stay the same, but some are oh, that's where we see more commercial growth, that's where we want to see residential growth. And then there's the expectation or the belief that at some point, the zoning will be changed to match that. The County has rarely followed up with comprehensive zoning to follow the community plan. Ideally, that's what would happen. I don't...one of the reasons I don't think that has happened is because...like with the Maui Island Plan in particular, it's very generous in what it designated. Community plans tend to be that way too because they don't expect all that to happen at the same time. You expect it to happen over the planning period. That's not to say that we couldn't identify priority areas and follow up with comprehensive zoning in those areas that are a top priority for the community...for example, for workforce and affordable housing. But zoning should absolutely follow community plans. And with the case of that South Maui example, if that change in zoning had come in within a few years after the community plan was adopted, it might have been supported at that time, but because so much time passed, the thinking about that parcel is different. And so we have to allow for situations like that to happen. But that was the thought at the time, but with today's understanding of wetlands or whatever it may be, that's not the appropriate designation. Similarly, like the example you gave with the hotel, maybe the zoning shouldn't have been established when it was. I mean, we do have entitled land that's vacant, but looking at it today going, aw, geez, why is that zoned Hotel, it shouldn't be. So, you know, we can't expect all of our zonings and all of our community plans to be flawless for these long planning periods. So we have to allow for mistakes, but those mistakes can be learning experiences. But the bottom...the most basic answer is that zoning should follow the community plan.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. And it is legal to change zoning to match the community plan. What happens if somebody...let's say they have a business that they built because they were zoned, and then the community comes in and says, we don't want businesses in that area. You know, if you try to change the zoning, wouldn't that be considered a taking, or no.

MS. MCLEAN: Those would be case specific, but in general, if you change the zoning, let's say, from business to residential, that business would be considered a lawful nonconforming use, and it could continue. It wouldn't be able to expand, but it could continue, it could maintain its structure and so forth. But they would be...you know, they would be a little bit hamstrung. So is it a taking? You know, that's something Corp. Counsel would have to chime in on. They would still have some...you know, assuming that it's not rezoned to, you know, open space where they can't do much economically beneficial use.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Well, I'm thinking, yeah, . . .*(inaudible)*. . . appreciate that in that, especially the option of it being nonconforming use, I forgot about that. But yeah, I appreciate the attitude that zoning should follow the community plan. Thank you for that. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member King. Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Director McLean, have we increased the ag designations in West Maui since the last community plan review? And in terms of encouraging more primary ag uses versus gentleman farms, what's your thoughts on, you know, discouraging, you know, those gentleman farms in this West Maui region and trying to promote more primary ag uses. Your thoughts.

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah, thanks. I would ask Jen or Pam to comment on ag designations and what was to be changed. I do know that the CPAC and the Planning Commission followed suit with not changing the agricultural community plan designation for some of the gentleman's estates. Those were put in the rural growth boundaries in the Maui Island Plan, which would logically follow that they would be designated rural in the community plan, but the CPAC did not want that, and the Commission, the Planning Commission went along with that recommendation. In terms of promoting and incentivizing agriculture, that's a bigger question and warrants more discussion with...you know, with the agriculture community, with farmers and ranchers and, you know, water and so forth. But the community plan, I believe, is pretty strong with supporting agriculture and restricting any further gentleman's estates. Jen or Pam, can you comment in terms of community plan redesignations of agriculture?

MS. MAYDAN: Yes, absolutely. Thank you, Member Molina, for your question. So in the Draft West Maui Community Plan Update, as compared to the existing 1996 Plan, I would say the quantity of land designated Ag has decreased, not increased, but that is to accommodate projected growth. Because there are urban growth boundaries that are identified in the Maui Island Plan, and there are planned projects in the Maui Island Plan that are currently designated Ag in the 1996 West Maui Community Plan. But during this update, part of the task is to identify areas for growth, and what their type of growth should be. So it's...I mean, it's...but also, as Director McLean stated, there are policies and actions within the plan that support more primarily ag, as you stated. There are definitely policies and actions that support ag and discourage gentleman farms, but a lot of...I mean ag land, we grow by expanding our communities, and we grow by infill and densification within our communities. And the West Maui Plan speaks to both of those opportunities as far as finding opportunities to infill, but also the need to grow in some areas such as Kā'anapali 2020, Lāhainā Town South. So there is some ag land that is redesignated as Small Town Center, or Residential, et cetera.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Okay, thank you very much for your responses. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Molina. And if I can just chime in as well. The way that I see it, you know, the Ag designation is what protects ag. In Rural, there isn't the same

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

requirement to farm that Ag has. Ag has the requirement to farm; Rural, you can farm. In Rural, you can make HOA designations that limit farming; in Ag, you cannot do that. So to me, you know, if it looks like rural, but you want to protect ag, Ag would be the designation. If you change Ag to Rural, there's no protection against a homeowner association passing rules that would limit farming in some way. There's no requirement to farm, so...thus making it be open to gentleman estates. So that's kind of my interpretation. You know, I think throughout the entire County, as a policy, this is a decision that we will be faced with because of all the ag subdivisions that never underwent a public hearing, you know. There was that sliding scale requirement, and then now we have landowners that want to further subdivide, but because of the sliding scale requirements, now they have to go through an open and public process, whereas initially, with the large tracks of ag land that they own, there was no public process. So, you know, I'm sure we'll have plenty of folks saying that I can't farm because there's no water, I can't farm because there's black plastic. That's an island-wide kind of concern. And so it would be a decision we're making for the West Maui Community Plan, but ultimately, it's an island-wide policy, I think, that we'll be making as well. You know, if people in one area can't farm for whatever reason, and we say, you have to farm, whereas other people don't have to anymore, it doesn't seem fair, you know. So I think we're making decisions within the West Maui Community Plan area, but we need to look ahead and be consistent, you know, in the decisions that we do make. And thank you for the question, it was an excellent question. And if you need to check out, we all understand.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Aloha, everybody.

CHAIR PALTIN: Aloha. Anybody else, further follow ups? Member Rawlins-Fernandez.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Okay. So I think we all received Mr. Perez's proposed recommended edits, and I think they're great. So Chair, at this time you mentioned that we would discuss amendments just for discussion purposes or...okay. Okay. So I think, as Mr. Perez spoke in his testimony, it's to underscore the authority of community plans. And so in the first paragraph in Appendix D, Community Plan Designations, instead of saying our general descriptions of the types of land uses, it would say describe the land uses that the community wants to allow in a given area as it is developed over the 20-year period. And so I guess when we get to the appropriate time next month, that's an amendment that I would support us making. And we can...I can stop there for discussion if you want to, Chair, or I can continue. Because it's all the same theme, right, to empower our community plans as it's stated in our Code. And so in the second paragraph, it goes on to say that instead of just the designations are less detailed than zoning code that implements them, would say although the designations are less detailed than the zoning code that implements them, zoning districts and all development allowed in them must comply with the community plan designations on that land. Uses not specifically allowed by these community plan designations are prohibited. In the event of a conflict between the community plan designation and the zoning, the community plan shall rule. The continued lawful use of any building or premises for any trade, industrial, residential, agricultural, or other purposes for which the building or premises is used at the time this community plan

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

takes effect shall be permitted to continue, provided that such nonconforming uses shall be eliminated over time as the uses are discontinued. And then the last part is removing from this section, the designations are used to help the community...help the County review development proposals and applications primarily for change in zoning, special management area permits, County special use permits, subdivisions, changes to the zoning code and other County ordinances, and plan for future capital facility needs and infrastructure improvements, like police and fire stations, parks and water facilities and others. So I think these are great recommendations, and I would move to amend when we get to that point in time. And again, I think it makes sense for the intention of the...and spirit of the law as it was codified in the Maui County Code, and we have a process in which to amend if that time...you know, if there is a conflict, or if the community wishes to amend, and that is through the community plan amendment process. So I support these proposals. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Rawlins-Fernandez. And that's definitely...you know, we can all study that and know what's coming up in the next phase of this so members aren't caught off guard. And if they don't quite understand, they can also reach out to Mr. Perez for further clarification before we get to that point. This would probably come up during Section 5, unless we determine during Section 5 that we'd like to move Appendix D to Section 3. So I mean, we're taking up 3 and 5 together similarly to how we took up 1, 2 and 4 together. So we can have that discussion at that time, but it's good to get kind of a foreshadowing. And then if we don't understand it right now, at least we know it's coming, and we can reach out to other resources to get a better understanding. Does that conclude your turn?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes. Mahalo, Chair. And if Members would like to discuss them now, I'm open to discussing them now also. Mahalo, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: Let me get Member Sinenci first.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR PALTIN: And then we can go back. Member Sinenci, go ahead.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, I just wanted to speak in support of the changes. I think the verbiage gives more credence to public input. I do like the new designations when it comes to preserving our Maui small neighborhoods and to increase...hopefully to increase more residential housing. However, I too feel that we don't want unintended consequences like Nāpili or...you know, or maybe that retired couple that is on the urban corridor, but now is zoned for multi-family residential units that can come up right next to them. So I mean, those are the things I think we want to make sure doesn't happen with some of these new designations. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Member Sinenci. Does that conclude your turn, or you have more?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Well, I did want to address Member Molina's agriculture on page

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

157. It did say the Agricultural Community Plan Designation is intended to promote agricultural development, preserve and protect agricultural resources, and support the ag character and components of the County's economy and lifestyle. And I was thinking of maybe adding language that says encourage...if we need to expand, maybe encourage expansion in the rural residential areas that have a...that has also an ag component within it, and not necessarily within the Ag designation.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. And a follow up for the Department on that. We don't have the authority through this West Maui Community Plan to prohibit HOAs from enacting rules against farming as they're prohibited in the Ag zoning, do we? Can we have Rural...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair?

CHAIR PALTIN: ...Residential not allow HOAs to limit agricultural uses or practices? Director McLean or Pam.

MS. MCLEAN: Pam, do you want to go first, and I'll jump in if I need to.

MS. EATON: Yeah. I mean, I would say I don't know that we do have that authority if it's private property and they're HOA Rules. I mean, that's...Corp. Counsel's on the phone, they can chime in, but...

CHAIR PALTIN: I mean, I guess writing it into the Rural Residential Community Plan Designation that ag should not be limited through HOA or any other means...I guess Corp. Counsel maybe.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Chair, I have some information too from an attorney I spoke with about that issue if you want.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. I'll take Councilmember King, followed by Mr. Hopper.

VICE-CHAIR KING: Okay. Because, you know, we own some property in an agricultural area, and there was an HOA that had some things in their CC&Rs, like we can't have...I think it was goats and pigs or something like that. So anyway, I checked with an attorney on that, and they said as long as the State allows those things in a designated agricultural zone, the HOA cannot, by law, prohibit you from utilizing your ag...you know, your ag land for those purposes. If they are allowable purposes for agriculture then, you know, the HOA doesn't have that right to omit it. So that's what we were told by an attorney.

CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah. I know that for Ag zoned land, I'm asking if Rural, if we can...

VICE-CHAIR KING: Oh, for Rural.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

CHAIR PALTIN: ...use Ag as part of Rural...

VICE-CHAIR KING: I thought you said Ag.

CHAIR PALTIN: ...Rural Community Plan Designation that ag cannot be limited or prohibited in a similar way that ag cannot be limited or prohibited. So that was my question, if we can apply that same thing that you just said to the Rural Community Plan Designation. Mr. Hopper, do you know?

MR. HOPPER: Chair, for something like that, I think that would be more appropriate for the zoning that would be implemented by the plan. Because I do believe in 19.30A, we have restrictions on ag CC&Rs in our actual zoning ordinance there. So the mirror, I think, would be...I don't know where Rural Residential is going to be zoned, if it would be zoned Rural, then I suppose you could amend, I think it's 19.29, which is your Rural zoning. You would not have the same, as you're correct, I believe, State law protections, so we would want to look at the basis for what...you know, what the County purpose is for restricting private CC&Rs, which is something we generally don't do. But I do know in 19.30A that's been done, you know, it's really...through that, I know it's a pain to constantly review CC&Rs that are being recorded on the property every time someone does a subdivision, so there isn't a burden for enforcement, that's something that we do now for ag land. So, you know, that's something that can be a challenge. But if it's Rural zoned and rural...and State Rural rather than State Ag, you're correct that you don't have the same degree of protection for ag as a matter of right. So maybe something like that in a zoning we could look at. To do it in the community plan, I just don't think it would be as effective because that would apply only for discretionary permits, and so they can still record the CC&Rs. Maybe we could look and do it through zoning modeling after 19.30A, but we would want to take a closer look at that because typically, the County doesn't...does not get involved with CC&Rs, which is a private agreement among homeowners. So that would be the challenge there.

CHAIR PALTIN: Okay. Thank you. That's very informative for our thoughts going forward, I think. I think...Member Sinenci, was that all that you had for your turn?

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Yeah, it was. And it wasn't...I mean, I just proposed for expansion within rural as an alternative to what the Director said about restricting gentleman's estates within the Ag zoned areas. That was just an option for...especially with Mr. Mayer's testimony. Thank you.

CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you. I think I saw Member Sugimura had her hand up for a second round?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: I'm sorry that I missed a significant amount of your presentation and everything, but the presentation that you did today and what the Planning Department presented, which is already in the community plan, you are actually proposing to change it with this discussion?

CHAIR PALTIN: No, I was trying to feel out if anybody had some amendments that they were

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

going to propose when we go into our week-long review so that other Members would be prepared or, you know, we can kind of get a foreshadowing discussion going on. So not necessarily making any changes today, just discussing it, you know, for when the time does come that we may propose amendments that nobody's caught off guard and that, you know, people have a chance to do their research. It looks like Member Rawlins-Fernandez would like to follow up on the proposals that Mr. Perez made. It doesn't seem like the proposal he made is going to necessarily alter the community plan designations too much. It looks more like he's setting up a mechanism that would ensure that they are kind of enforced, or that they are followed a little bit more strictly. Not to say that they have, you know, the force and effect of law, but more so to give language that would allow for these to be followed. You know, I think our 1996 West Maui Community Plan said there shall be no development south of Puamana or north of the Pali, and that's what a lot of old timers fall back on. And yet we have, you know, Olowalu, Launiupoko, and all of that. So it's just a way to try and ensure that all the hard work done at the CPAC level, at the Planning Commission; and when it comes to Council, it's not just put on a shelf somewhere, like a book. But it's like a living document that we use and follow, and hopefully that our respective communities...I've used the phrase like carry it around like their Bible and, you know, refer to it, and are super familiar with it like, you know, something that you carry around in your purse maybe, or your backpack and, you know, get all excited about community plans. But I don't want to keep you guys from lunch, we can get out a little tiny bit early so I can see some of you back at 1:00. And I don't think that urban reserve thing should take too, too long, because we don't have any public testimony and, you know, it's more or less straightforward. Mr. Perez did mention what amendment he'd like to see, and I mentioned back then an amendment that I would like to see, and so it's all not too much surprises. So if there is no further discussion on Appendix D, Community Plan Designations, we can adjourn this meeting. No objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

CHAIR PALTIN: Ten minutes early. You got an hour and ten minutes for lunch. It's a gift for your guys' good participation. I returned all the round trip cruises and the trip to Spain and all of that because, you know, we don't want to get in trouble with the Board of Ethics.

VICE-CHAIR KING: We're still waiting for our pat on the back.

CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, okay. Here you guys go. Pat, pat, pat. All right. We'll see some of you back at 1:00.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thanks, Tamara.

CHAIR PALTIN: This meeting of PSLU is in adjournment...is adjourned. . . .(gavel). . .

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

May 20, 2021

ADJOURN: 11:49 a.m.

APPROVED:



TAMARA PALTIN, Chair
Planning and Sustainable Land Use Committee

pslu:min:210520:ta

Transcribed by: Terianne Arreola

**PLANNING AND SUSTAINABLE LAND USE COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui**

May 20, 2021

CERTIFICATION

I, Terianne Arreola, hereby certify that pages 1 through 42 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 21st day of June 2021, in Wailuku, Hawai'i



Terianne Arreola