INFRASTRUCTURE AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

June 7, 2021

Online Only Via BlueJeans

- **CONVENE:** 9:02 a.m.
- PRESENT: VOTING MEMBERS: Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Chair (out 11:03 a.m.) Councilmember Tasha Kama, Vice-Chair Councilmember Alice L. Lee Councilmember Michael J. Molina Councilmember Tamara Paltin Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez (in 9:30 a.m.; out 11:18 a.m.)
- **EXCUSED:** VOTING MEMBERS: Councilmember Kelly Takaya King
- **STAFF:** Laksmi Abraham, Legislative Analyst Lesley Milner, Legislative Analyst Wilton Leauanae, Legislative Analyst Shelly Espeleta, Supervising Legislative Analyst Richard Mitchell, Legislative Attorney David Raatz, Supervising Legislative Attorney Clarita Balala, Committee Secretary Lenora Dineen, Council Services Assistant Clerk

Evan Dust, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Tasha Kama Davideane Kama-Sickels, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Tasha Kama Axel Beers, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kelly Takaya King Ellen McKinley, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kelly Takaya King Sarah Pajimola, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kelly Takaya King Rawlins-Fernandez

ADMIN.: Jennifer M. Oana, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the Corporation Counsel Lauren Armstrong, Executive Director, Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization Rowena Dagdag-Andaya, Director, Department of Public Works Michele McLean, Director, Department of Planning Michael Du Pont, Deputy Director, Department of Transportation

OTHERS: Daniel Kostelec (IT-25(4)) Nick Drance (IT-54) Mike Moran (IT-25(4), IT-54, and IT-1(2))

June 7, 2021

Albert Perez (IT-54) Junya Nakoa (IT-1(2)) Bruce U'u Paul Brewbaker, Principal and Economist, TZ Economics (IT-54) Cecil Morton, President, SpeediShuttle (IT-1(2)) Roni Gonsalves, General Manager, Polynesian Adventure Tours (IT-1(2)) Kelisa Paleafei, General Manager, Roberts Hawai'i (IT-1(2)) Bud Pikrone, Wailea Community Association (IT-1(2)) (4) additional attendees

PRESS: Akakū: Maui Community Television, Inc.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: ... (gavel). . . Good morning, everybody. Welcome to the Infrastructure Transportation Committee. It's all nice to see you...I better hang up *Akakū*. Thank you. My name is Yuki Lei Sugimura. I'm the Chair of this Committee. I'd like to welcome Tasha Kama, who is my Vice-Chair.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Aloha. Good morning.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Good morning. Oh, got to get the greeting from Alice Lee. I didn't see it in chat. Good morning, Chair Lee.
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Well, okay. It is in chat, and it's --
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: I don't see it.
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: -- an Arabic greeting, hala wallah. Hala wallah bing bang...no, hala wallah. Okay, everybody.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Hala wallah. Hala wallah. Okay. Okay. Hala wallah. That's a kind of cute greeting for a Monday morning. So thank you very much, Chair. Next we have Mike Molina from Molo...sorry, Moloka'i...from Makawao.
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: That was close, not bad. Good morning, Chair. Aloha and hala wallah to you and everyone joining us in on this Monday, June 7th. Aloha.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: I like that. Hala wallah to you. Tamara Paltin with your rainbow, good morning.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Hala wallah bing bang. Aloha kakahiaka.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: That's what it certainly sounds like. Did Keani make it? She's...yeah, just a few minutes late, she said. So we'll see her shortly, and Kelly King. So welcome everybody. Welcome to this meeting on June 7th. It is now 9:03 a.m. I've looked forward to this meeting. Non-Voting Members are Shane Sinenci and Gabe Johnson. They're welcome to join this meeting. From the Corporation Counsel, we have Jen Oana.

June 7, 2021

Thank you for being here, Jen. And...hi, Jen. And from Department of Transportation, for the third item on the agenda, we have Michael Du Pont, and I'm not sure if Marc Takamori will also be on the call, but Marc and Michael from Department of Transportation. For the second item, Department of Public Works, Rowena Dagdag-Andaya, Jordan Molina, Ty Takeno of Civil Engineering...oh, was also invited. Department of Public...Department of Planning is Michele McLean. MPO. Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization, is Lauren Armstrong, the Executive Director. And other representatives: we have Paul Brewbaker, who will be speaking on the moratorium item from TZ Economics; on the third item, Bud Pikrone, Wailea Community Association, Daniel [sic] Morton from SpeediShuttle, and I think he...just read that he just started another transportation called Holoholo, I think...Roni Gonsalves from Polynesian Adventure; and Kelisa Paleafei from Roberts Hawai'i. Staff members, thank you for putting this together; Laks Abraham, Lesley Milner, Clarita Balala, and Richard Mitchell, our Legislative Attorney. Going back, I think that...I don't think I'm going to have Ty Takeno, Civil Engineering on this item today. I think it was...he was on for our Lāhainā Flood Control, and I'm not...I don't think we need to have a civil engineer for any of our items that we're discussing today, but I could be wrong. Today this meeting is...this online meeting is being conducted in accordance with the Governor's most recent emergency proclamation on COVID-19. Please see the last page of the agenda for information on meeting connectivity. Thank you, Members, for attending this meeting. We have three items on the agenda: IT-25(4), which is Vision Zero Action Plan for Department of Transportation Contracts, C7001 Toole Design Group LLC, this is a MPO item; IT-54, Moratorium on Building Permits for Visitor Accommodations; IT-1(2), Airport Shuttles, and it really is...as I corrected in the Chair's Council meeting, it's airport shuttles and buses we call our routes. Do we have testifiers today, Laks? Laks?

- MS. ABRAHAM: Good morning. Yes. Our first testifier is Daniel Kostelec, followed by Nick Drance.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So we do have testifiers.
- MS. ABRAHAM: Yes.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: But let me go through this then. So testifiers wanting to provide video testimony should join the online meeting via BlueJeans, which they already did. Testifiers wanting to provide audio testimony can also dial 408-915-6290, and enter meeting code 886 005 668, also noted on today's agenda. Written testimony is highly encouraged with eComment link listed for...on today's agenda, on mauicounty.us/agendas. Individuals are free to provide testimony via eComment on as many agenda items as they would like. Instructions on how to submit testimony via eComment can also be found on mauicounty.us-ecomments. So moving on to oral Oral testimony is limited to three minutes per item. testimony. You are still testifying...if you are still testifying beyond that time, I will kindly ask you to complete your testimony. When testifying, please state your name. If you are testifying on behalf of an organization or a paid lobbyist, please inform the Committee. Please be mindful of the use of chat during the meeting. Chat should not be used to provide testimony or chat with other testifiers. If you are here to provide testimony, please be courteous to

June 7, 2021

others by turning off your video and muting your microphone while waiting for your turn to testify. Once you are done testifying, you will be asked to disconnect from the call. However, you are welcome to continue to view the remainder of the meeting on $Akak\bar{u}$ Channel 53, Facebook Live, or on mauicounty.us. Participants who wish to view the meeting only without providing testimony may also disconnect at this time, and instead view the meeting on $Akak\bar{u}$ 53, Facebook Live, or on mauicounty.us. Let's see. Only Councilmembers, Staff, and designated resource personnel will be connected to the video conference meeting once testimony concludes. I remind Council...Committee Members, Administration, and public to please be patient as we...if we run into any technology issues. So now we'll proceed with public testimony.

MS. ABRAHAM: Our first testifier this morning is Daniel Kostelec, followed by Nick Drance. Daniel, please unmute yourself and proceed with your testimony.

... BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY ...

MR. KOSTELEC: Okay. Am I unmuted? Can you hear me?

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: We can hear you.
- MR. KOSTELEC: Oh, very good. This is my first opportunity to interface on...with the...your Committee, or actually any Committee in Maui Government. I wanted to come to you today to encourage and support the Vision Zero Plan and its implementation. My wife and I moved from Santa Cruz, California to Kihei in January 2020, and the overall experience here have...for us has been wonderful, and especially with the advantage of the shutdown, and how that had affected travel and pedestrian safety. I was a career bicycle commuter to government work on Monterey Bay during my career, and I rode all year round, and found it to be a really important part of my mental and physical health over the years. And I ride here now, and I'm pleasantly surprised at the amount of infrastructure that we do have in place for bike and pedestrian safety. And I'm very much encouraged and happy to see that things like this Vision Zero Plan are moving forward to continue that policy of encouraging more safety and more use of nonautomobile transportation in our community. I think Maui is very well set up for bicycle commuting with its mild weather and topography. And my town of Santa Cruz, California was also quite similar in the climate overall and topography. And we learned there from...during my career that it can be done. We can make major increases in people utilizing these alternate transportation methods if there are the will and political will of the community in adopting tools similar to this Vision Zero Plan. Just a brief aside that in the city of Santa Cruz, earlier in my career, in the year 2000, they had a bicycle commute rate of 4.6 percent. With the kind of programs similar to Vision Zero and other things, and the support of our Public Works Department and City Council, we were able to improve that by 2010 to 8.4 percent. And then, at the end of 2017, we had reached 13.3 percent of all workers in the city commuting by bicycle, which put us just behind City of Davis, which is at the top of the peak. My point is simply that if we can take and provide the safety elements, people will ride. And with the encouragement these days, with the...I noticed during the pandemic the amount of e-bikes...the amount

June 7, 2021

of e-bikes has just exploded and opened up a whole new demographic of people who may have never thought they could ride five miles on a bicycle to come to realize this is something they can do, and can enjoy. So in closing, I just want to say I appreciate everything the Committee's doing. I truly support this effort. And now, as a permanent resident here, and a bicycle rider, I am offering my experience and time in any way possible to the MMPO in their efforts to expand these programs.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

- MR. KOSTELEC: And I look forward to meeting all of you and working with all of you at some time in the future. Thank you.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you for sharing your experience and giving us hope that this can be done in the future. Anyone have questions? Tamara Paltin.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Kostelec. I just was wondering, how did you folks get those data percentages? Was it a survey, or...like how did you get those numbers?
- MR. KOSTELEC: Those survey numbers are done...they were done over those--gosh, what is that--20 years. During Bike to Work Month, they would take surveys of...we had a very active Bike to Work Day, where there was encouragement and enticements to fill out the survey forms, and then collected for the whole month, so we had a good database of that. And then we were also drawing on census data that was...dealt with that. And then the figures were peer reviewed by the National Bicycle League. And when they...you know, they have programs for awarding cities and counties for their efforts, and they're very strict on auditing those measurements. But it was a...for me, having a career of riding, I just anecdotally saw it over the 20 years.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Was it the --

- MR. KOSTELEC: You know, I would be one of five people in 1920. By the time I retired in 2019, there were like four dozen people I would pass on the same ride, that 20 years ago there were only five. So --
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And was the survey just for government workers, or for the entire city, all the workers?
- MR. KOSTELEC: All the workers. It wasn't just city employees. Santa Cruz was able to get very proactive, and they had a City Council that had some bicycle riders on it. And Santa Fe, New Mexico also went...did that way, had a Mayor was a avid bicycle rider, and their numbers came up. So the political leadership is absolutely vital. But no, it was throughout our community. And the community in central Santa Cruz County is about, oh, 100,000 people, and it's basically flat. It's very similar to here. And the more we put in complete bike lanes, where there wasn't spots where lanes were missing, and really did keep up the striping maintenance on existing type two lanes, it just kept encouraging --

June 7, 2021

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Mr. Kostelec...Mr. Kostelec, you are enthusiastically heard, and I'm sure MPO is going to get in touch with you. So you can call my office and leave us your contact information. My office is 270-7939, if you don't mind.

MR. KOSTELEC: Okay.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

MR. KOSTELEC: That was 720?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: 270-7939.

MR. KOSTELEC: 7229 [sic]. Yes, I definitely will.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

MR. KOSTELEC: And my wife is also going to appreciate having me doing things out of the house. That will be an advantage too. But I truly believe in this --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. KOSTELEC: -- and I know we can make more progress.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much.

MR. KOSTELEC: Thank you.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Okay, Laks, next testifier.
- MS. ABRAHAM: Our next testifier is Nick Drance, followed by Mike Moran. Mr. Drance, please unmute yourself and proceed with your testimony.
- MR. DRANCE: Aloha, Chair. Tasha, aloha. Tasha, my sister, it was so good to see you. It's been so long, and I wish you all aloha this morning, this Monday morning.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Right back at you, Nick.

MR. DRANCE: You guys have been working so quickly, so fast. This Council has done more in the last few years than ever before. You are history-making. I'm so grateful, and so proud of all that you have accomplished. On this subject, I submitted my written testimony without ad-libbing like I am now. It's more concise. Chair, I wish to say that, in the most heartfelt way, this particular subject is more personal to me than most anything ever in my life before. As far as infrastructure goes, infrastructure concerns presuppose, first and foremost, the health and welfare of the island, and that's the point that I focus on. And the health and welfare of the island is a long-term financial consideration. There's long-term and short-term financial investments, and I feel like

June 7, 2021

taking care of the island is a long-term consideration, and infrastructure is subservient to that need. So I ask you to look at my written testimony. And this subject about further development on the island, the bottom line is that financially, increasing the amount of development on the island is going in the direction of unsustainability. And financially, in the long term, it's just, you know, not appropriate. But there's an emotional side of it, which relates to my love of the island and what it represents to me. So I wish that you'll look at my written testimony. Oops. Chair, I lost you there for a second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So you're testifying on the moratorium bill, right?

MR. DRANCE: I am.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

MR. DRANCE: IT-24 [sic].

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

MR. DRANCE: Well --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, I'm sorry. I thought you were done.

MR. DRANCE: Thank you. Well, that's okay.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So that was on the moratorium item, IT-54. Members, do you have any questions for Mr. Drance? Seeing none. Thank you very much. Nice seeing you.
- MR. DRANCE: Thanks, then.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next testifier.

- MS. ABRAHAM: Our next testifier is Mike Moran. Mike Moran, please unmute yourself and proceed with your testimony.
- MR. MORAN: Good morning, Committee Chair Sugimura and Committee Members. Excuse me, Mike Moran for the Kīhei Community Association. Please excuse the frog in my throat -- and I used this line once before, some of you veterans will remember -- fear not, it is not a Coqui frog, it's a bullfrog. So I wish to testify on all three items this morning, and I'll try and be brief on all of them. The first is IT-54 on the moratorium. We realize you're not taking action on it this morning, but we're very anxious to hear this panel that you assembled, and particularly Mr. Paul Brewbaker. And we've read many of his documents over the years. And over the weekend, I re-read one that he published on Valentine's Day on...of 2019. And it may be worthy, not that you guys have spare time to read other documents, but it was called Creating a New Cause for Hawai'i Tourism. Now again, this was before anybody thought of a pandemic, but we thought that he hit on a lot of excellent points which still apply today. So we're very

June 7, 2021

interested to see if he's repeating these same points, or has changed his perspective, but we look forward to hearing that panel, and we think that's a very good thing to bring in a group. Moving on, making a juxtaposition between the two, I believe you said Bud Pikrone is also on that committee, and that leads me to this next item, IT-1(2) Airport Shuttles. And I remember just a conversation...it was...might have been off the record conversation, with him several years ago with...you know, between the KCA and the Wailea Community Association, talking about the traffic issues and the rental car issues. And we talked about, wouldn't it be wonderful if there were a way to transport the visitors that arrive at the airport--we were only talking South Maui--but that would bring the visitors by mass transportation so they didn't rent a car and drive down through the Wailea area. And it would eliminate many rental cars. Some people would settle into their resort and had no need for a rental car. And then they could take the shuttle back. So that would be one aspect. Another would be some that would not want to stay here all the time. Well, then they could rent a vehicle in South Maui, and that would still help. They wouldn't have to be driving back and forth to the airport. It would lessen rental cars. Now, I don't remember...we didn't, you know, make a record of it. My guess was this was a good ten years ago . . .(*timer sounds*). . . Okay, well --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Sorry.

- MR. MORAN: I'm on my second item, right?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Yes.

MR. MORAN: Okay. So --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Let me restart your clock. Go ahead.

MR. MORAN: Thank you. So we still advocate for some kind of a shuttle system, whether it be the...you know, something through the Maui Bus or through a private entity. We have often advocated that the resorts might provide a shuttle service. We know the Maui Coast Hotel does provide some sort of a service, a shuttle service, for their customers. So you know, they're a much smaller entity, but gee, if they're doing that, why aren't the much larger entities doing it in Wailea? And we only speak for South Maui, but we think it would also apply to West Maui. But we think this is an excellent thing to explore, some sort of a shuttle service to help reduce the number of rental cars on the island. So we're very interested in hearing that topic, and even though my friend, Bud, won't be on that part, but may...he may recall that conversation. And the last item, which is your first item, is IT-25(4) on Vision Zero. We certainly support this. I mean, this is something that KCA has been advocating at least this entire century, and probably going back before. We often use that term, a walkable, bikeable community. And again, it relates to that reducing the number of motor vehicles. One commercial entity that rented and sold bicycles used to sell t-shirts that said, one less car. The concept was this person riding this bike would be in a car otherwise if he wasn't riding a bike. And we feel that often applies. It can't always...you know, a bike can't take the place of a car or a truck all the time. If it's a family going--well yeah, that would be great if the whole family was on bicycles--but if they're going to...big heavy shopping or

June 7, 2021

something, yes, there's still a place for the motor vehicle. But every time we make it safer...and we have that first gentleman that testified talk about...talked about contiguous sidewalks and contiguous bike lanes and bike paths. And that's what we lack so much--again, speaking for South Maui--that we're still fighting after decades and decades to just have South Kihei road have a contiguous sidewalk. So the stereotype picture is mom pushing the stroller, having to go out onto the road off the sidewalk, and here comes the Maui bus or the trash truck or something else down. We need contiguous sidewalks to encourage people to walk. And we get the same response from parents: Why don't you let your kid . . . (timer sounds). . . go to school on his bicycle? It's not safe. That's what the parents...we'd love it. We wouldn't have to drive them back and forth. But it's not safe. If we can get a safe way. So that brings us back to our old faithful North-South Collector Road. If we had that; boy, that would open up all the schools to allow kids and teachers and staff to bicycle there. But we see that's far in the distance, probably a good two decades away. So we hope that this plan is not one of those plans that gets approved, and people say, great plan, and we put it up on the shelf. We need that implementation, guys, we all know it. We need that implementation. There's no sense in doing a plan unless we're going to find a way to implement it. Thank you very much for the --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

- MR. MORAN: -- opportunity to testify on all three. Aloha.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. Any questions for Mr. Moran? Oh, Tasha Kama.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So Mike, you know, I wanted to just clarify what you're talking about in terms of the...having the resorts provide maybe shuttle service from their hotel to the airport and then back, and then the tourists can do whatever they want to do at the hotel. So my question is, you know, on O'ahu, they do that, right. They have...if you...have you ever caught the bus and...a shuttle from the airport to maybe the Ala Moana or the Beachcomber Hotel, whatever. But they provide that roundtrip. Was that something that you're talking about, providing that, where they take you wherever, one bus and just does this round of loop around the hotels like that?
- MR. MORAN: Yeah, well...of course, our environment is so much different. Honestly, I try and avoid going to O'ahu as much as possible. But yes, I mean they have...need a much greater mass transit, and they have a much greater transit. But yes, something along the line...as I said, we see the Maui Coast Hotel doing that. They have done that for several years. It doesn't get all there, but they use it a lot for their repeat visitors. They get the...a lot of the airline crews, and that's what they'll do. And I have no affiliation with the hotel, but I just look at a good community member. They do that, and then they provide free bicycles as well, as another entity...another way to, you know, reduce the use of motor vehicles. So I think it's mostly to bring in...if they could expand...if it just took them back and forth, that would be wonderful. If it could expand and say, yes, take them around to commercial entities --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

June 7, 2021

- MR. MORAN: -- I don't know if that will be viable, I guess. But I gave you a long...a very long answer to a short question, Councilmember.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Mr. Moran. Thank you, Tasha Kama. Anybody else have questions for Mr. Moran? None. Thank you very much for always being here.
- MR. MORAN: Mahalo.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Next testifier.
- MS. ABRAHAM: Our next testifier is Bruce U'u, followed by Albert Perez. Mr. U'u, please unmute yourself and proceed with your testimony.
- MR. U'U: Hello. Aloha. Good morning.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Morning.

- MR. U'U: Can you guys hear me? Good morning. Oh, I just came in to listen, sorry. I never mean to testify. So I just...good morning to everybody. My name is Bruce U'u. I'm not going testify. I just here for open my ear and hopefully learn something. I wish you guys a beautiful day. Aloha.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Nicely done. Thank you, Bruce. Next testifier.
- MS. ABRAHAM: Our next testifier is Mr. Albert Perez. Mr. Perez, please unmute yourself and proceed with your testimony.
- MR. PEREZ: Good morning, Councilmembers. Nice to see your smiling faces. Same thing here. You know, I thought that this matter, IT-54, was already forwarded to the Council, but I'm interested to see what information we're going to hear from the Administration and from Mr. Brewbaker. So I'm basically just here to listen. There's a lot of support for the moratorium, overwhelming support. And I'll just summarize by saying that we have existing hotels that will handle the amount of people that want to come here right now. It's not going to affect existing hotel jobs. And we need to redirect our construction efforts toward affordable housing. So with that, I will conclude. Mahalo.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Any questions for Mr. Perez? Seeing none. Thank you. Thank you very much for being here. And I see Keani joined the meeting. Thank you, Keani. Welcome.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha kakahiaka, Chair. Chair, you're muted.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Next testifier, please.

June 7, 2021

- MS. ABRAHAM: Our next testifier is Junya Nakoa. Mr. Nakoa, please unmute yourself and proceed with your testimony.
- MR. NAKOA: Oh, howzit. Yeah, saw you all guys. I don't know if we're ready for talk. But talking about the, you know, shuttle, the airport shuttle stuff, the straight to the Lāhainā hotels. I know the Westin, they get some kind of shuttle that they take people from the Westin to Lahaina downtown, or in between all the other Westin Hotels, yeah. If we get all the Lāhainā hotels for do some kind of stuff, because when I was working as a bell/valet at one of the hotels, us guys, we knew when all the flights was coming in, yeah. So we had to get ready, we make sure we staff good enough for wen get all the flights for come in. So the hotels should take initiative to know when all the flights coming in and know when they guests going check in li' dat. So they can arrange the shuttle from the airport to their hotel. And then try talk story with the rental cars here on West Maui, where they can just rent for one day, when they like go holoholo someplace else other than in Kā'anapali. You know, and...'cause I know, like the Westin, they take 'em even to Lāhainā, you know, so they can cruise the Front Street li' But we just got to be more proactive and try get these guys...'cause they're dat. benefiting from all these tourists coming to the hotels. Like they said, it's...it was packed for how many weeks. I called and called, and they packed again, all the way to September. So if they making all this money off these guests, and they like they guests, and you know what, it will only benefit the hotel if they can keep their guests on their property, you know, eating at their restaurant, using their pool activities, using all the activities that they get, like you know, the Maui Jim's activity booths. You know, and like Kā'anapali, get plenty options for them to stay in Kā'anapali and you know, dudes, I get it nobody like hear this part, like one bubble, where they can just stay in Kā'anapali, and if you like go cruise, holoholo, one day you go rent one car. No need do the whole rent a car the whole damn time. And then, you know, just make 'em positive. We all got to get together, the people and the...and the hotels, and you guys. You know, we all work together, we're going to kick some ass on this. We're going to teach these tourists that Maui's badass. And no come...no come screw 'em up. We teach you guys how for take care the 'āina and the culture. Yeah, so that's it, but we all get...we all get together. We can control these tourists and educate them. And that's all I get for say for now, but I like learn about the stuff you guys going talk about today. Mahalo.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Any questions for Junya Nakoa? Seeing none. Thank you very much.
- MR. NAKOA: You guys have a good one.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: You too. Next testifier.
- MS. ABRAHAM: We have no other testifiers on the testifier log.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, very good. So Members, at this time then, with your permission, I'd like to close public testimony, and to admit any written testimony into our records.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

June 7, 2021

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you. Thank you.

... END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY ...

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So at...we have three items on the agenda, and . . .(*timer sounds*). . . oops, oops. Sorry about that.

IT-25(4) VISION ZERO ACTION PLAN FOR DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION (CONTRACT C7001; TOOLE DESIGN GROUP LLC) (MISC, CC 21-239)

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: The first item is about Vision Zero and IT-25(4), Vision Zero Action Plan for Department of Transportation. And it's referencing a contract for Toole Design Group, as well as "ADOPTING THE VISION ZERO MAUI ACTION PLAN TO ELIMINATE TRAFFIC FATALITIES AND SERIOUS INJURIES BY" 2024...I'm sorry, "2040". The purpose of the proposed resolution is to adopt the Vision Zero Action Plan as a guide to transportation program improvements that provide safety on Maui roads. We're going to receive a testimony...a presentation from Lauren Armstrong, Maui Metropolitan Planning Organization, regarding the Vision Zero Action Plan and related matters. We're going to also consider adoption of the proposed resolution needed at this time then. Lauren Armstrong, are you present?
- MS. ARMSTRONG: Good morning.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.
- MS. ARMSTRONG: Good morning, Committee Chair Sugimura, and good morning, Committee Members.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.
- MS. ARMSTRONG: I'm Lauren Armstrong, Executive Director with Maui MPO. Nice to see you all this Monday morning. So as you know, Maui MPO does transportation planning for the Island of Maui. Our Hele Mai Maui Plan, which we finished in 2019, put a real emphasis on safety. And that was based on Federal requirements, but also on feedback we heard from many of our Maui residents. So I just wanted to thank Committee Chair Sugimura for also serving as the MPO Policy Board Chair, and for the MPO members who have supported using Federal funds to come up with the Vision Zero Action Plan. Next slide. So just as a bit of background, Vision Zero is an international movement to end traffic deaths and serious injuries. And in doing so, we're aiming to create a more healthy and equitable transportation system. So after Maui adopts the Vision Zero Plan, we can join this growing list of cities and counties across the country who have taken this approach to safety. Next. So in 2019, Hawai'i State legislation directed the agencies to adopt Vision Zero policies. And as you know, the County Council passed a resolution

June 7, 2021

urging the Mayor to form an advisory group that would create the Vision Zero Action Plan with safety recommendations for Maui. Next. So the Vision Zero Action Plan process we started in March of 2020, and we spent several months gathering public input and data, and really to inform the Vision Zero Plan. And in March of 2021, the MPO Policy Board adopted the plan, and sent to the Mayor and Council for consideration. Next. So the advisory group really guided the Vision Zero Action Plan process, and they identified ways that we can all work together on safety issues. The group included police, engineers, planners, public health professionals, fire department, prosecutors, drivers' education, as well as many of our bicycle and pedestrian advocates, and our community leaders. So folks from Mothers Against Drunk Driving, AARP...just a really well-rounded group of people that have contributed to the plan. Public engagement throughout the process included meetings with focus groups. We wanted to make sure we reached people that weren't engaging with the traditional online methods. And so, you know, in addition to our online survey, we had hundreds of responses from people about, what were the key issues for them, what locations on Maui are they most concerned about. And we reached probably 10,000 people on social media using boosted ads, and really felt that we had a pretty strong public engagement piece. As far as what we heard from folks, people are really concerned about speeding and impaired driving. They also want to see Vision Zero promoting a culture of safety to address those issues, and also see more safe streets, more sidewalks, safe crossings, safe places to bike. And you know, the goals and themes of the plan are really framed around these issues. Next. So in addition to people's lived experiences, the Vision Zero team analyzed crash data from 2014 to 2018. Every year during that period, an average of 17 people lose their lives on Maui's roads, and more than 70 people are seriously injured in crashes. So these are life-changing for the families. Of the 86 fatal crashes on Maui's roads, the main factors include impairment from alcohol or drugs, or both, eating distraction, and red light running. Of all the red light running crashes, which are about a quarter of fatalities, most of them were alcohol related. So losing young people on the road is a tragic reality. Victims between 20 and 29 years were overrepresented in the fatal collisions. And so we know that this is an area that we really need to address as a community. Many of the pedestrian fatalities occurred in these dark purple equity areas. So this is from the Hele Mai Maui Plan, and these are areas where residents are more likely to rely on transportation other than a personal vehicle. These could be our kupuna, our kids walking to school, or people with disabilities. So this is a really important part of Vision Zero is that, you know, everyone deserves to be able to get around safely, and the way we design our streets can play a really important role in that. So there are many different actions that we can take. One is how we engineer the roads. And so I'm just going to highlight a couple of Maui projects that include safety features that lower vehicle speeds, provide space for walking, and really provide safe connections to our bus system. So the Pi'ikea roundabout, I'm sure everyone's familiar with, but this opened in 2012, one of our first roundabouts on a public road. And it was designed to accommodate larger vehicles, but also fostering lower speeds, which really cuts down on the number of fatal and serious crashes. Our North Shore Greenway is a really great example, begins near Kanahā Beach Park, and now, thanks to the work of Department of Public Works, runs all the way up to Baldwin Beach Park. Plans are in progress to continue the path farther north, so having a really connected system for bicyclists. The Papa Avenue quick build that was completed in

June 7, 2021

March of this year, this shows some of our complete streets principles, things like backup angle parking, buffered bike lanes, and these really beautiful artistic bulb outs, where it really slows down the vehicles. We've collected data to show that that has happened, and it makes the crossings a lot safer for pedestrians. So we think, you know, doing more of this work is really important for safety. So just to orient you to the plan, which all of you should have received a copy, based on the data and the public input, our Vision Zero Advisory Group created seven goals to achieve the zero fatality goal. And at this point, we'd like to share a brief video to let you meet some of the Advisory Group members and hear in their words what are the important actions of the plan.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ... (inaudible). .. hear. Lauren, I can't hear the video.

- MS. ARMSTRONG: Yeah, it seems like we might be having some audio issues. Let's try to give it one more minute. It might be just the connection. Hmm, okay. Well, fortunately, the video is available on the Maui MPO website, and this is what we've shared on social media. It's a really nice way for community members to get more familiar with the plan, think about ways they might want to get involved. And so, you know, we have in this video our Police Department, our State Department of Health, different people who were involved with the plan. And so that, along with our executive summary, I think it's a really nice way to not have to read a whole long plan, but get the flavor of what are these actions, what would I personally like to work on and, you know, what is the MPO planning. So as far as next steps for the Vision Zero Plan, we are, you know, asking Council to adopt the resolution, to adopt the plan. And I'm really excited to share that we're going to be working on one of the actions in the near term, and this is a speed mitigation campaign. This will be working on PSAs with our Police Department and some really talented local media producers, and just really spreading the message of slow down, take care of each other. And you know, that'll hopefully be the first of many of these actions that we can work on together. So our advisory group will continue to meet annually to track the progress on Vision Zero, check in on the actions, and make sure that we're implementing. So thank you very much for your time, and we encourage you to review the full plan at mauimpo.org. Thank you.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much, Lauren. Anybody have questions for Lauren Armstrong? Tamara Paltin. She's also a MPO member, on the policy board. Tamara Paltin.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. I'm not sure if the screenshare was going to continue, or...either way. I guess my question was, you know, for the past few years, I identified areas in my community that have kind of dangerous pedestrian crossing. And I tried to put monies in the budget, and some got those little paddles and stuff, but not all of the areas. There was like a fatality, I believe, in Lāhainā, maybe near Dickenson. And also, the area by Times is really dark with the trees going over it for people to cross the street. And it's still pretty bad...Keawe Street is still pretty bad. And I just was wondering like what more can be done? Like I identified these areas, I think, in the 2019 budget, and it's still...like nothing happened. So...and then...and also, too, like you know, there was a fatality, I believe, last weekend, of a Lahainaluna graduate. There was a big car

June 7, 2021

accident this weekend as well, I think in Kīhei. And so we're making all these...this effort, and we're trying, and I'm not in any way saying that we shouldn't, but how do...how do we take those things into account?

MS. ARMSTRONG: Thank you for the comments and the question. I think that's a really great point. Just continuing to build our database of these hotspot areas and looking systematically, you know, working with the Departments and seeing how we can address the areas, how we can assign a priority to them. And we are kind of working on that through the MPO in terms of, you know, what are the criteria? Is it the crash history? Is it the proximity to a school or residential area? There's a lot of different ways to prioritize, but I think Vision Zero gives a good focus to that. It grounds us in the data, and I'd be happy to sit down with you and kind of crosswalk what areas were identified by your office, as well as what was identified by community members in Vision Zero, so we can make sure that those are all up to date. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay, cool. Thank you.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So *Akakū*, can you see everybody? I have...I can't see the Committee. Are we having a problem?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Chair, I can see it on the television, as well as my computer.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It might be your system.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Can I --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. All right. So main thing then. Anybody else? You're going to have to tell me because I have this really minute view of what's going on in my Committee.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Member Molina has his hand up.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, Mister...Reverend...Reverend Molina...Mike Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. You got all kind titles for me this morning.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah, yeah, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair. Good morning, Ms. Armstrong. I guess it was one of the goals for the Vision Action Plan that's labeled, create safe speeds. Can you just briefly tell us on how speeds are going to be enforced

June 7, 2021

in the long term, and have speed tables presented a more long-term and cost-effective option, rather than police enforcement? Can you comment on that, please?

- MS. ARMSTRONG: Sure. Thank you, Member Molina. So I think part of this action to create a speed management program would be working...you know, having Public Works and Police Department work together on identifying, you know, what are the priority areas to do enforcement, and then how does that integrate with our infrastructure planning, right? So I think...I know that the State Department of Transportation is making a big push to install speed tables at areas of concern, and that can certainly, you know, be one thing to bring speeds down, especially by town centers, you know, when you're coming from a State highway, entering a town, to really get folks to slow down. There are a lot of other solutions besides just speed tables. So things like narrowing the roadway, doing more of that reverse angle parking, anything that gives drivers a visual cue that, okay, it's time to slow down. That, along with our education campaign, I think can really help address this issue. You know, this really has come to be one of the top concerns, especially...during the pandemic, less people on the roads, more speeding. It kind of got to be a...more of an issue.
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, thank you for that, Ms. Armstrong. It's quite timely with this presentation because, you know, I live in Makawao, and we have a speed table that is just eroded on Makawao Avenue near Makani Road. And I've asked the Department to...you know, over the last year or so, to rebuild that. And I've witnessed several near misses, people just ripping down Makawao Avenue and folks go on Makani trying to make that left turn, there's a couple of near misses. So I think speed tables are certainly very essential to slow people down. So...and I'm just putting it out there. I hope Public Works is listening because I just hate to have some accident happen, and then Government reacts. You know, we should be proactive, make the improvements now, and not wait for a tragedy to happen. So anyway, thank you for your responses, Ms. Armstrong. Thank you, Madam Chair.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Mr. Molina. Are you talking about your four-way stop? Is that the speed --
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No, no. No, this is in Makawao, Madam Chair.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: ... (inaudible)...
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Makani Road, yeah, that...people who make that left onto Makawao Avenue. And sometimes...luckily we do have some courteous drivers that slow down and allow that vehicle to make that left turn, but you don't always have a lot of courteous drivers. And people this morning I witnessed were just speeding on Makawao Avenue, and I witnessed a couple of near misses that occurred. So anyway, we just need to start really stepping up the maintenance of our speed tables, and that is...certainly will be a factor in slowing people down.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you. I see Rowena Dagdag from Public Works would like to comment.

June 7, 2021

- MS. DAGDAG-ANDAYA: Thank you, Chair. And sorry, my audio wasn't working either earlier. The...couple things. The speed tables, yeah, we'll...I can have Staff take a look at the request to build it back up again. I know we've had a number of projects in the past, especially there was one in West Maui in front of King Kamehameha III, where we had to rebuild the speed table. So I'll have Staff take a look and give me an update on where that project is at. A lot of times these projects take a long time to get funded, go through the process of procurement, and then have a consultant on board or have the Department prepare the plan, and then go out to bid and construct. That takes a very...a long...it is kind of a long and tedious process. And one of the things that we're starting to do now are those quick build projects that Lauren had presented earlier in her PowerPoint. And that helps us understand as to what a specific project could do or what...the potential of what a future project could do in terms of speed...reducing speeds or making the intersection a lot more safer for pedestrians, motorists, and bicyclists as well. So we're looking at using more of those quick build techniques in order to make improvements in our roads. I think what Vision Zero does as well is it brings together Police, Fire Department, and Public Works, and even the Prosecutor's Office, to identify these...what the issues are, and what we can do together in order to solve these issues. Before it was, you know, Public Works kind of just doing their own...or working on their own, but now there's that collaboration with all the other Departments. And you know, there's a requirement in the plan where the Departments would work together and meet annually, or as needed, in order to address issues. Sometimes speed tables are not always the answer. We do get a lot of complaints from the public about the installation of speed bumps, especially when they're in succession. So what we want to also be able to do is look at other alternatives like bulb outs, or narrowing intersections or roadways, or creating more...not obstructions, but just visual cues in the road, like those paddles, to slow people down. We have started, or we started creating a policy for those paddles. We call them the Michigan stops, and so that should be...that's where we kind of take a look at, okay, what data do we use in order to determine where these paddles would be most appropriate, how they would be constructed. Would they be constructed on a 36-foot right of way versus a 45-foot? Do we also include medians? So we have a policy that we're about to complete for the use of those paddles, as well as those flashing lights. So there's a lot of things in the Vision Zero Plan that kind of kick started us into, you know, creating additional policies and guidelines for, when it comes to making our roads safer.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Rowena. Members, I'm going to take a quick recess just so that I can get in and out of this meeting because I see a blank...a black screen right now. And I was just notified by Staff that Paul Brewbaker has joined our meeting, and he's on a limited time frame. So I'm going to...I'm going to call a recess, two minutes, just to let me get in and out of my computer, and then come back and see if I can see all of you because right now, I only can see myself. ... (gavel)...

RECESS: 9:59 a.m.

RECONVENE: 10:01 a.m.

June 7, 2021

CHAIR SUGIMURA: ... (gavel)... This meeting is now called back to order. Thank you very much for letting me log back on. I can see...I can see the gallery view now. So Alice Lee, I can't see you. Tasha Kama, I can't see you. So maybe you could put your video on. Keani, thanks for being here, Mike Molina...I know Tamara was here.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: My camera's on, Chair.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, your camera's on? I can't see you. I only can hear you.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Can anybody else see me?
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I can see you. Chair, I can see Pro Temp Kama and Member Paltin, and their videos are also showing on *Akakū*.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So it's just mine. Something's up. So help me along here, Members. So at this time, anybody have other questions for Lauren Armstrong or the Department, Public Works? Okay. I...anybody have...I...I'm going to assume none, then, since I can't see everybody. So at this time, I'd like to recommend adoption of the resolution adopting the Vision Zero Action Plan to eliminate traffic fatalities and serious injuries by 2040. And as I said, the purpose of the proposed resolution is to adopt the Vision...Maui Action Plan as a guide to transportation program improvements that provide safety on Maui roads.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So moved.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you, Keani. Is there a second?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Second.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, so Tamara Paltin for the second. So Members, any discussion on this item? Seeing none. All in favor say "aye". Aye.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED AYE.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, opposed. So again, I'm going to...Tasha, are you voting yes?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yes, I did. I voted yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I can't...I can't see you, so ---

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Oh, I'm sorry. I said yes too.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So at this time then --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Lee is also on. I can see Chair Lee's video.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

June 7, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And I saw everyone raise their hands.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay, good. So --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But you need to say it for the record.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So you all raised your hands, but...who's not in the meeting yet is Kelly King. So I don't see Kelly King here. So that's six ayes, one excused, and motion carries.

VOTE:	AYES:	Chair Sugimura, Vice-Chair Kama, and Councilmembers Lee, Molina, Paltin, and Rawlins- Fernandez.
	NOES:	None.
	ABSTAIN:	None.
	ABSENT:	None.
	EXC.:	Councilmember King.

MOTION CARRIED.

ACTION: Recommending ADOPTION of resolution.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you very much. So this will go to full Council for approval. Thank you very much, Lauren. Keep up your good work. It sounds like you have community support to keep this going, and thank you...thank you, Lauren. Appreciate your hard work on this. And MPO members are Tamara Paltin, myself, and Shane Sinenci, and we will all help you achieve this. So appreciate your help. Thank you.

IT-54 MORATORIUM ON BUILDING PERMITS FOR VISITOR ACCOMMODATIONS (MISC)

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Now moving on to the next item, we have with us Paul Brewbaker. And Members, this is Item number 2 on the agenda, Moratorium on Building Permits for Visitor Accommodations, IT-54. Again this is only a discussion, subject matter item. We do not have the bill in this Committee, as you know. The community may not know, but the bill is in the...Kelly King's Committee, which is the CARE Committee, and --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Point of order. The bill is no longer in the CARE Committee. The bill is with Council.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: What about your bill? Your bill is there too?

June 7, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, that's...so that's a different bill.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: My bill is in CARE Committee, but Member King's bill is in the Council because we passed it out.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So both the bills are under the CARE Item IT-54. So Kelly King's bill, as I was corrected, is...building permits for visitor accommodations is already reported out, and Tamara...Keani's bill is in there. I left the meeting and...before it was ended, and I think there were amendments you were going to do to that bill before it went to Council. Was that the final --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Yeah, so that version of the bill will remain in the CARE Committee, and I will submit a new version of the bill to the Council for referral to the Maui Planning Commission.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay, because you put in Title 19. Okay. So Members, we're going...we're talking about visitor accommodations and moratorium today, and we have Paul Brewbaker here from TZ--what is the name of your company, sorry about that--Economics, I think. But thank you, Paul, for being here. And I also have Rowena Dagdag-Andaya, as well as Michele McLean from Planning, just to answer questions if answers do...questions do come up relative to their Departments. So Mr. Brewbaker. You...can you turn on your video?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair, I can see Mr. Brewbaker. He's just muted.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, you can? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: You're muted. Mr. Brewbaker.

MR. BREWBAKER: The video is really slow.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay.

MR. BREWBAKER: If I turn off the video and then...sorry, you'll just have to listen to me.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Thank you.

- MR. BREWBAKER: And you won't be able to see my facial expressions. But I'm in a...in a room...I'm over at a Toyota dealership where the connection is a little slow, and I --
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. I saw you were wearing a mask. So thank you very much for being --

June 7, 2021

MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah, I don't want to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

MR. BREWBAKER: Oh, well, I just...I don't want to be rude and speak really loudly, so I have my mouth covered here.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, okay. As you get a car --

MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah, what's...so what questions do you have?

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: So we wanted you to just talk about what impact a moratorium would have on the visitor industry for economy, as you're a TZ, you know, the economist. And I just wanted you to give us an overview of your thoughts on, you know, the pandemic, and everything that would affect --
- MR. BREWBAKER: Sure. Okay. Well, let me frame that--pardon me--let me frame that by providing a little background on this conversation. I've done some work in the last couple years for resort owners on Maui, and also for a resort developer here on O'ahu, where I am. And I don't actually do that much corporate work in the...in tourism, per se, mostly airlines, and then a little in the lodging industry, but more of that more recently. So I am more familiar with it now than I would've been a few years ago. And...so these, both of these clients and others now, kind of a hui, had come to me about a month or two ago and asked me about...if I would do some additional research on the impact . . . *(inaudible)*. . . basically the consequence of the moratorium in lodging development for the Maui economy. And I agreed to do that to inform their advocacy, whatever that would have been. I mean, it doesn't change...you know, my research would say whatever it's going to say, whether they like it or not. And then the timing got really thrown off because I was about to sign a contract to do that work, then...I don't know. Something happened over at the Council. The bill moved more quickly And then I was contacted by Congress member...sorry, than people expected. Councilmember Sugimura's office, to participate in this hearing. And I said, well, I haven't done the work, and I can't...you know, I wouldn't have appeared in a public hearing as a lobbyist at any rate, as a representative. So I'm just going to have to do it on my own behalf, such as that is. I'm not even a Maui resident. And then the worst part is...so then, I didn't get the contract to do the work because then, if I'm going to just do my own opinion, nobody wants to hire me. So it was like a weird Catch-22, which is kind of like I'm here getting my third safety inspection in a year because I can't get them to align with my appointment with the City that...it's just...this last year has been crazy with nothing like lining up and syncing. And of course, you're seeing that all in the supply chain disruptions and whatnot, this wacky thing that's going on with single family home prices in Maui County. I've done a lot of work, actually, for Lāna'i and Moloka'i, not so much for Maui lately, on that subject, just in the last six months. Here's my...in a nutshell, after having described how disruptive, essentially, the last 12 months has been, here's my concern about the idea of a moratorium at this time, and then more generally. My concern about the concept of a moratorium in general is honestly, I don't understand the point. So right now, it's...the idea of not allowing

June 7, 2021

developers or builders to . . . (inaudible). . . plan to do. And in particular, the one I worked on, by the way, a year and a half ago was a big one, you know, it was a substantial number, a substantial increment to an existing resort lodging footprint. And that's important because it's already a resort, it's already a lodging, you know, it's already at lodging capacity, and...but they were talking about increasing their capacity by maybe 15 to 20 percent. So you know, a material augmentation within the existing footprint. And the question that was arising in that case was, why was this so much trouble. It's already a resort, it's...there's already, you know, a lodging facility in the resort. And like I say, that was a year and a half ago. And I finished my work in December of 2018, I want to say, or...no, '19. And then of course, you know, pandemic came, and here it is a year and a half later, and last time I talked to those guys, they were all, yeah, we're talking to some people about night marches or something like that. I don't know what's hanging them up. So my point is the ... stopping a project that's already underway...and trust me, I...you know, as a consultant . . . *(inaudible)*. . . money into this project, they were hoping when the pandemic happened and all of the sudden they had to stop, their idea was this is great, we have to shut down for six months, perfect time to do construction. But for whatever reason, they weren't able to advance the project. And as I say, I don't...I don't know what the reasons are, because my work was done, but at this juncture, my understanding is it hasn't advanced. So now that we're in recovery mode, it seems particularly . . . *(inaudible)*. . . that one would want to stop economic activity from occurring, which was already going to occur, for example, or which might be about to occur now that the consequences of vaccination, in terms of mitigation of, you know, the spread of COVID-19 and whatnot, are starting to bear fruit, and that we can see a path...we can see a path now to a relatively robust summer travel season for the domestic market segment. You know, we'll probably...you know, the 80 percent of the market, so to speak, which is, you know, domestic travel will probably running...be running at full capacity within a couple weeks. I just flew back from the mainland on Saturday, and I was upgraded, which means there were empty seats...in first class, at any rate. But you can tell that there...just from the tenor of activity in the airport--I departed from Denver and Los Angeles--you can tell from the tenor of activity that people are, you know, back on the road again. So having shut that part of Maui's economy off for six months almost in entirety, and then during the subsequent six or more months in...for...in a very...and gradual recovery that is now getting...gaining traction. To shut down, you know, asset allocation decisions that lodging property owners and whatnot are inclined...in which they're inclined to engage at this particular moment when we're just getting things back on a roll, it doesn't...it seems out of sync to me to have that happen at this particular moment. That's just the timing question. And you all know the...you know the magnitudes of what we're talking about if you...if you...and I can't refer to the specifics, but in round numbers, the way these things work is if you're...let's say you're going to undertake a \$200 million renovation, roughly, you know, 40 to 45 percent of which outlay comprises imported building materials and whatnot, the remaining 55 percent, let's say, 60 percent, which is what, 120 million. So you would, you know, rule of thumb, like double that. So you get a 200...let's say a \$250 million impact from that project. And that...the more the project has local content, as opposed to imported content, which is a big factor, you know, with construction because so many of the materials are sourced, you know, from outside the State. But, So for example, if you're...if you're engaged in renovation, and most new yeah.

June 7, 2021

construction in Hawai'i nowadays is actually additions and alterations. It's not actually new building. So we mostly rebuild existing buildings. But to the extent that you have a content, those multiplier consequences are even...are more robust because the import content is diminished as a result. And that's one aspect of what we're seeing. But again, you know, after you account for the . . . *(inaudible)*. . . what you're talking about in terms of economic . . . (inaudible). . . I looked at the numbers. Maui . . . (inaudible). . . from about 80,000--I think it's 82,000--at the end of 2019 to 62,000 as of the last published month, which was April. And that...and the new number...the new enumerations will be this week, and from...well, I take that back. Maybe I'm citing the May number. But the surveys are done in the first full week in the month. So you've gone from 80,000 to 60,000 jobs in Maui County, and most of those on Maui Island. And it seems like a really odd time, when you're trying to retrieve those jobs, to be suspending capital formation in any sector of the economy, not to mention the principal export. And arguably, what, 35, 40 percent of value added in Maui, which, you know, in the...in the tourism sector. The more general issue I would add is I...I'm not...it's not clear to me...like did something happen that all of a sudden people woke up one day and realized that...I don't know, that they have to stop . . . (inaudible). . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, Mr. Brewbaker, we...we're --

- MR. BREWBAKER: -- something that's inherently...yeah.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: You're going in and out.
- MR. BREWBAKER: Oh, I'm sorry.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead, go ahead.
- MR. BREWBAKER: It's probably the link. I'm just saying, in the...in...in the bigger picture, sort of, forget the moment for a second and think about a moratorium in the general context. The question would be: What is it about your ability to manage capital formation in Maui County that leads decision-makers to feel they can't reach a decision, so they just have to suspend for...I mean, I am not aware of what the time table we're talking about here is, but is it a suspension of indeterminate length, or...I mean, what exactly is going on? So again, if the planning process can't . . . *(inaudible)*. . . itself up with the . . . *(inaudible)*. . . productive to pass a capital formation . . . *(inaudible)*. . . in the planning process. So I would...you know, it seems to me, if you were...if you...if it's perceived that there's a problem, then the problem should be solved, but, you know, adding to or changing the character of a lodging...of the stock of capital comprising Maui's lodging inventory does not seem to me to be inherently problematic. If the moratorium is designed to facilitate a planning obstacle of some sort, or the decision-making...or decision-makers' inability to, you know, get a sense of what's going on and where they're going . . .*(inaudible)*. . .

CHAIR SUGIMURA: So Mr. Brewbaker...so the hotel industry --

MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah.

June 7, 2021

CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- which is part of this discussion that we're having, what is your...what has been our history with hotels on Maui...we're talking about Maui Island --

MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- possible moratorium for two years is what this body is looking at, and establishing a possible Temporary Investigative Group, or a TIG, to, you know, look at the influx of visitors and the impact that it has on our island and our economy. So what is the history that you know?
- MR. BREWBAKER: Say that...or I --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, so --

- MR. BREWBAKER: -- I didn't get the focus of the question. My bad, yeah.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So I guess we're looking at...the bill that we were proposed is basically to look at a Temporary Investigative Group to be put together to look at the impact of the visitor industry, or the visitors to our island. And thus, you know, pausing new --
- MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah, and that...that's not --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

MR. BREWBAKER: Sorry. That's not known now, or that can't...that investigation can't occur while an industry is actively operating? I mean, does somebody have to shut down for two years in order for research to be undertaken? That...that's the question I'm completely hung up on.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. So ---

MR. BREWBAKER: I can tell you what my impression of, you know, the state of tourism in Maui is right now, which is --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Go ahead.

MR. BREWBAKER: I mean, it just got beat down for a year, so what were you guys doing for the last year? Evidently, not investigating. But if you even just look at the numbers alone, the inventory...you know, we...unfortunately, I don't have the Maui Island inventory, you know, back historically. But in the last 30 years, the inventory Countywide has only grown from, you know, I want to say 19,000 units, 22,000 units. That's for the whole County. And then if you look at Maui County in the...you know, the pre-COVID enumerations, of the 22,000 units, 21,294 were on Maui County. So I'm pretty sure that, you know, 90...19,000 30 years ago and 22,000 today is a fair characterization of Maui Island itself because, to my knowledge, Moloka'i and Lāna'i

June 7, 2021

have fewer units...lodging units today than they did 30 years ago. I mean, the Sheraton's gone on Moloka'i. And so the footprint hasn't actually changed in 30...I mean, not materially from 19 to...I mean, 19 to 22,000 units over . . .(*inaudible*). . . does that even count? And then today, all of the growth in the lodging inventory are comprised vacation rental units, which is sort of the democratization of lodging, right, because these are individual investors, primarily, who are...right, they're not the Marriotts or the Hiltons, they're not global lodging brands. So in fact, the global...the footprint, the actual physical lodging inventory under management by the global lodging brands, global corporations, has diminished, you know, absolutely. And all of the growth, not just all of the gross increase...well, is it gross or net? Anyway, I mean, they're 5,700, 5,900 . . . (*inaudible*). . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Can't hear you.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes, Council --

MR. BREWBAKER: That's the majority, right? It's the connection. So I'm just saying --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: How long...how long were you planning to let Mr. Brewbaker just continue speaking? Like, are we going to let him speak continually?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes. So we're going to go --

- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: -- probably until 10:30. So we're almost there. Mr. Brewbaker, do you have anything else that you would like to tell us about this subject matter?
- MR. BREWBAKER: Well, the main thing...the main point here is the capacity, right, the actual carrying capacity, as people love to talk about...the actual carrying capacity is the lodging inventory. And what I'm saying is that the lodging inventory hasn't materially changed in 30 years. And such that it has, it's...all of the increase is in vacation rentals, is in, you know, independently...mostly independently owned and operated and small investor owned and operated lodging units, which are more integrated into, you know, resort areas and neighborhoods and so on. The . . .(*inaudible*). . . has evolved such as it has over the last 30 years. If you look...we're talking about a moratorium on lodging construction. So if you...if the question is how has that changed in 30 years, the answer is not very much. And to the extent that it involves everything except vacation rental units, that is, to the extent it involves apartment hotels, condominium hotels, hotels, timeshare, and other, you know, non-vacation rental units, as enumerated in the Visitor Planning Inventory of the Hawai'i Tourism Authority, in all those other categories, apartment hotels, condo hotels, hotels, and timeshares, those numbers...that capacity, the lodging...numbers of lodging units in those formats has declined absolutely over the

June 7, 2021

last 30 years. So if there's a question of growth, seems to be the question would be about negative growth, that is decline, and it...why...again, I...it's not clear to me why you need a moratorium, a cessation in capital formation in the lodging sector when it's declining absolutely for periods of decades or more, three decades.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Okay. Thank you, Mr. Brewbaker. I'm going to ask the Members if they might have questions for you. I saw Tamara Paltin had her hand up earlier.
- MR. BREWBAKER: Who?
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: One of the Councilmembers. Tamara Paltin, do you have a question for Mr. Brewbaker?
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I did. And I just wanted to continue my disclosure that I'm recused at least until the 9th on the visitor industry discussion. But I did have a question in regards to Mr. Brewbaker's presentation and economists from the information that...or lack of information that he was presenting. I just was wondering if economists...I mean, generally speaking, my impression is that they analyze data of past events, and try to use it to predict the future. And I just was wondering, in the field of economists, do...is there measures set in place to take into effect things like quality of life?
- MR. BREWBAKER: Yes.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Or is it strictly like, you know, data, capital...because, you know, just when you were saying you're not living on Maui, the quality of life, I think, is a factor within the last 30 years of people forever in gridlock traffic much worse than 30 years ago; no spots on the beach, much worse than 30 years ago, and those types of things. When you gave your presentation and you weren't aware of what has changed, it's the quality of life for our local people. And not only is it the...it's the visitors that come and purchase housing that locals can't afford and then...you know, so then...and they're coming in with cash, buying property sight unseen, paying more than the asking price. And even during the pandemic, like when we're seeing them be able to do all these things that locals are told not to, or can't do, or are getting cited by police for doing. So I just was wondering, how does the industry of economists take into effect the quality of life for the residents in their calculations of the data? That's my question.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Mr. Brewbaker, did you hear that?

- MR. BREWBAKER: I did. I'm still not sure I understand the question. Do you have a measure of quality of life in mind that...I mean, right, we...as you observed, we tend to do quantitative analytics because it's objective, rather than subjective. And so if you have a measure of quality of life with which can be associated, you know, measurable economic phenomena, we can certainly --
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess...so like...so some measurable things would be like, you know, residents being able to afford a house and children and work only one job, maybe.

June 7, 2021

Or I mean, that's kind of like a economic thing. I'd say, majority of my community cannot do that, and so that leads to a poor quality of life. Because if you're working two to three jobs, both parents in a two-parent home, when do you get to spend quality time with your children? When do you get to rest and recharge? When do you get to enjoy the things that Maui is known for? Because you're always working, and when you're not working, you're trying to find childcare or take care of your kids. Is that qualitative enough for you, or data enough?

- MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah, I mean, you just described life in America, as far as I can tell. Let me kind of do a lightning round response to this --
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, my son just moved to Buffalo, and he only works one job. He has a house and two kids, and it's not...he knows, Maui versus Buffalo, the quality of life in Buffalo seems to be much better. Although they can't go swim at the beach and languish --
- MR. BREWBAKER: Winter. I mean, I lived in the upper Midwest for seven or eight years. I can tell you, he'll be shoveling snow for a lot of the year. Look, it...when it comes to subjective measures of the sort to which you allude, there are ways to, you know, get at answers to the question, but the problem comes with the subjectivity itself. There's a number of concerns that, as I say, I think in a kind of a lightning round format, I can help you guys think about how to get to policy postures which could improve people's perception of the quality of life. So let me just go through the list that you enumerated. You talked about people working more than one job. We...you know, in economics, I think there's a tendency to celebrate that because a generation or two ago, it was possible for women to work, and now it is. So we don't...I...it's not clear that, you know, that two working persons in a married couple household, for example, is a bad thing, reduces the quality of life. It creates issues, as you suggested, with childcare and...but these are familiar with, you know, working people everywhere.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Well, I wasn't saying two working people in a household, I'm saying two working people in a household, each of them having two to three jobs. I'm trying to say like one job should be enough.
- MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah, well, you just described my life. I mean, my --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: One job should be enough.

MR. BREWBAKER: I know, but...yeah. I don't know. I mean, I taught at UH for 20, 25 years. That was a second job, so --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Do you have children, Mr. --

MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah, I have three children. They're grown up. But that's not the point.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay.

June 7, 2021

- MR. BREWBAKER: What the...in...in each of the areas that you identified . . .*(inaudible)*. . . you talked about housing . . .*(inaudible)*. . . recreation, opportunity, and each of those areas of...that are problematic in the community have solutions that are, you know, unique to each of those areas. If there's not enough housing, you build more housing. If there...I mean, I...I'm familiar with the data. There are more registered motor vehicles in Maui County than there are human beings in Maui County, but that's because...I mean, that's...you can just look that number up. That was not true when I was a kid. In fact I think it's about three times as high...I think there were three persons per vehicle when I was a kid, which by the way was like 60 years ago. So that changed, but not because of tourism, it's because everybody has a car. I don't understand it. You know, I go to. . .*(inaudible)*. . .
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I guess the difference is when the tourists weren't here, we didn't have traffic --
- MR. BREWBAKER: -- ridiculous. Yeah, but you didn't have...I know, but people were poor. If we...you don't have tourism, you're --
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: So Mr. Brewbaker --
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: The opposite of the argument that people aren't coming back to work because unemployment is paying too much.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: So Mr. Brewbaker and Tamara...Tamara, I'm going to stop this conversation.
- MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah, no. That's...okay. I'll just summarize.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Go ahead.

MR. BREWBAKER: Congestion has problems. You guys were talking about them in a previous session . . .(*inaudible*). . . is, you know, paying to drive when it's congested so you could do road pricing. And an increase in recreational...I mean, how many parks, public parks, County parks and State parks and national parks, for that matter, have been created in the last 10, 20, or 30 years, or...you know, where I live, it's pretty much the same as it was when I was a kid. So...and then housing, as I mentioned. You can just, you can build more housing. It's not like Maui doesn't have room for it. So in each of those cases is --

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: But people can't afford it is the problem.

MR. BREWBAKER: -- the problem isn't inadequate. . .

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: You can build all the housing you want, but no one can afford it.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. So thank you.

June 7, 2021

MR. BREWBAKER: I'm going around in circles.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: I'm...Tamara, I'm going to go to the next Councilmember and see if we have more time. But I'm going to limit this to two minutes per Councilmember for Mr. Brewbaker. Anybody? Nobody has questions? Okay, Mr. Molina. Mr. Molina.
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you very much, Madam Chair. Good morning, Mr. Brewbaker. Thank you for sharing your thoughts on this matter. So my question is just more simplified. I guess...remembering a concept from economics, the opportunity cost, what in your mind would a hotel moratorium...is there an opportunity cost there by, you know, slowing down the building permit process? And what cost do you see as far as the rest of the economy, in terms of small businesses? Do you...would you...could you see a significant drop off or, with the way the visitor industry is, you know, booming, do...will you see a significant, major impact to the economy or, yeah, it would be minimal?
- MR. BREWBAKER: Absolutely a significant deleterious impact, a negative impact on jobs and incomes and people's perception of their wellbeing as a consequence. The...it's interesting that you framed the question in the context of slowing down building permits. That's already happened. I mean, you can just see in the data that the County issues fewer, or in terms of the cost dollar value of construction authorized by building permit, less is built today than in the past. So whatever process has evolved in terms of the issuance of building permits as part of the process of acquiring the entitlement to build, it has already slown [*sic*] down...slowed down. But now you ask what would the opportunity cost be of a cessation in a particular area. Well, you...the opportunity cost would be...you know, you can look up, say over the last ten years, what was built...the value of what was built, what was authorized to be built in the lodging space. And I'm going to guess for Maui, it's several hundred million dollars per year, maybe not quite that much. But the opportunity cost would be foregoing, you know, that economic activity.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you. . . . (inaudible). . .

MR. BREWBAKER: Look it up. I mean, I don't have those data, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. I kind of asked that question because while, you know, one can see with the expansion of hotel...adding more accommodations...could slow that aspect down, but with the housing industry, you know, related businesses, you know, building supply stores. I...for me, I'm just guessing that it may not have as much of an impact because the housing sector is booming and, you know, building supplies are in demand. So that's sort of my nexus for that question, but...yeah.

MR. BREWBAKER: I understand, yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you.

MR. BREWBAKER: I do know...I do know...I personally know developers who have given up

June 7, 2021

on building on Maui. So you know, that, as an opportunity cost, people just go away. They say well, it's not worth it.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you, Mr. Brewbaker. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you very much. Tasha Kama, do you have a question?

- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Yes, I do. So Mr. Brewbaker, as an economist, what do you see as a potential harm of a moratorium on two years?
- MR. BREWBAKER: A good way to think of it is if a year ago, let's say March of 2020, five quarters ago, we were having this conversation, and the question to the Council was: Should we have a moratorium on tourism for six months? Would people be better off if we didn't have tourism for six months or eight months, until October 15th? Let's just not have tourism for six or eight months. Would people be better off? Would the economy be as large? Would there be as many people employed? And of course, we actually conducted that experiment. The answer is no, people were not better off. And however bad they perceived themselves to be off in February or March of 2020, they...the only people who were better off a year later are the people who put a really high value on not having as many people from other places around at the beach and, you know, things that were raised in an earlier Council question. But of course, the calculus for you, as a Council, is whether that benefit for the people who perceive themselves to be better off was worth the 20,000, right, the one out of four job holders on Maui that today are no longer employed. Now, that's a huge...that's something on a large scale...we're talking about a moratorium in lodging construction...is on a relatively small scale. But the signs, right, positive or negative, are the same. If you tell somebody they can't engage in an economic activity for an interval like two years, your problem is, those guys are out of business for two years. Then the next problem is, will they ever come back, which is why for Councilmembers...Councilmember Molina's question, I suggest that it's worth thinking about, you know, sort of these knock on...think about what does that do to the reputation as a host or for physical capital formation, for construction in general. And I can tell you that in the housing space...you know, I've worked with people who've kind of given up. I have, as I mentioned earlier, worked with some people in the lodging space. Telling them to just stop for two years could have the same consequence.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you very much, Member Kama.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Madam Chair.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Anybody else have a question? Keani Rawlins-Fernandez. Okay. I'll put the timer on.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. I actually have a bunch of questions. Aloha, Mr. Brewbaker. Mahalo for being with us today.
- MR. BREWBAKER: You hung up...or did I hang up? I think I hung up.

June 7, 2021

CHAIR SUGIMURA: No, we can hear you.

- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I can hear. Chair, will you restart my time? Thank you. Okay. So I have a lot of questions.
- MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah. Okay. Let's do lightning round.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. So the first I wanted to point out is you wanted to use the example of the pandemic as an example of not having tourism and see if that experiment works. The flaw in that is everything was shut down. It wasn't just tourism. The difference between shutting down tourism and this moratorium is that this moratorium would allow for tourism at its current rate to continue with the number of accommodations. So it wouldn't be the same --
- MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah. Yeah, let me...let me respond to the . . . (inaudible). . .

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure, go ahead.

- MR. BREWBAKER: -- not the whole economy shut down. I didn't shut down. I continued to work. My wife continued to work at home. So a portion of the economy shut down --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I mean, that's good for you, and like we continued to work, and so there were the fortunate few. But for a lot of --
- MR. BREWBAKER: No. No, no. No, no. It's not few. It's the majority of the economy kept working. So the reason I used the analogy is that...I understand that the moratorium is not talking about shutting down the entire economy, but we didn't shut down the entire economy in the last year either. We shut down the tourism part of the economy. And related, you know --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Restaurants.

- MR. BREWBAKER: --food services, performing arts, you know, places where there were biological risks. But that was still not the majority of the economy. So the point of the analogy was that even if you shut down only -- and I'm doing air quotes because I'm not on video here -- even if you only shut down two hundred million, let's say. You can look it up. Ask the building department, on average, over the last decade -- you're the Council -- ask how much in lodging related building permit issuance occurred. And to that extent, that economic activity will not occur. That's the point. And you want to...if you turn off the light switch . . .(*timer sounds*). . . and you want an analogy, last year was the analogy.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: This...what I...what I'm saying is this moratorium wouldn't stop tourism. It would just hold it at where it's at now.

June 7, 2021

- MR. BREWBAKER: I didn't...I didn't say it would stop tourism. I said it would stop construction of lodging. Your objective is to shut down several hundred million dollars' worth of economic activity for a year.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It's not to shut down --
- MR. BREWBAKER: It...you shut down building, right. I can't build what I'm going to build.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: It would pause it.
- MR. BREWBAKER: For two years. I mean, you...tourism was paused for six months, and it...and it --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: That is...and the other thing that you assumed is we weren't doing anything. And I...and I think that's a really arrogant statement to make, because a lot of us were...we were doing a lot, which is why we came up with these bills. And so I just...I find it pretty incredible for you to come here and say that to this Council, when we have --
- MR. BREWBAKER: Well, if it takes you...if it takes...if it takes you two years to understand...or how...I mean, I don't know exactly what it is you're trying to understand, but if it takes you two years of a moratorium to do whatever investigation is necessary for you to come to an understanding of whatever it is the question you're trying to answer, then surely you could have undertaken that investigation a year ago, and you'd only be a year away from the answer. I'd understand...I mean, that was my point.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Two years or when...whenever the TIG completes its report. So it doesn't necessarily need to take two years. And there would've been --
- MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah, but what were...what were they doing for the last year? I mean, why can't they just do it while everybody --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Well, there's rules that came out of it, right. And so in your analysis, like Member Paltin said, you haven't factored in the residents' quality of life, the cost of housing, the amount that we subsidize the tourism industry. All of these things are not factored in to your conclusions that you've come here with no data, no data. You're telling us --
- MR. BREWBAKER: That's...okay, that's just...that's just false.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Wait. I'm not going to have you arguing with our guest.
- MR. BREWBAKER: And if you want to ... if you want the data, I --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: But you didn't come here with any data. That's a fact.

June 7, 2021

MR. BREWBAKER: Ask me. Okay.

- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Chair Sugimura, did he bring any data? He didn't come here and present any data. I wanted to see numbers. Show me numbers that it hasn't been growing.
- MR. BREWBAKER: What numbers? What numbers do you want to see, and I will send them to you.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Tamara...I'm sorry, Keani. Keani, calm down.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All the numbers to give evidence. You haven't provided any evidence in all of what you stated.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Keani, calm down. I'm not going to have...I'm not going to have this kind of discussion. So if you can put it in writing, then I can ask --
- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: You're muted. Okay.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Oh, sorry. Thanks. I'm going to ask...I'm going to stop this discussion. Keani, you can just send the Committee in writing what data you're looking for, and we can ask Mr. Brewbaker. So thank you very much. I'm going to go to the next Member. Ms. Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yes.

- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Mr. Brewbaker, I was wondering, moving off the subject a little bit, just a tad, since I think we all can agree that there...Maui in particular has over-relied on the visitor industry. And for a good reason, because it started in the '60s, and we needed an economic driver. So we understand the reason why it was...started years ago. But unfortunately, we became too over, you know, depend on this industry. Do you have any suggestions as far as what you've seen and through your travels, what you've read, what other industries could provide a potential to assist us, not to...not to delete or, you know, or cause any problems with the visitor industry, but to make it a more balanced kind of economic situation for Maui County. Do you have any ideas along those lines?
- MR. BREWBAKER: Sure. The problem is that we're talking about a small...what in economics would be called a small open economy. So it's...you know, its size measured by population or income or goods is relatively small. And what you find in...and then, of course, it's geographically isolated, so you don't have the spatial connectivity that you find in most continental land masses and in small regional economies that are located in those...in those areas. Nevertheless, even in those areas...I'll give you an example. There...I think there's 180,000 people, maybe not 200,000 people, living on Maui. That's about the size of the population of Madison, Wisconsin when I lived there 40 years ago.

June 7, 2021

And a small open economy that was home to the state capitol, as well as to the state's largest public higher educational institution. And the city was dominated by those three...those two activities plus one more, that is to say, the university, higher education; state government, as the capitol; and the Oscar Mayer wiener factory, right. That was sort of the third leg of that stool. And I haven't really been in touch. My impression is that it hasn't changed in the last four decades, materially, that the university as a node for the development of and emergence of new economic activity has been successful. And so that's, you know, one...to your question, Councilmember, that's, you know, one path to an answer, if there are other areas of economic activity that can be nurtured. And what we find in this...in the arc of the last generation, last 30 or 40 years, is that knowledge intensive and knowledge based economic activity tends to have been more successful in America in the modern era than, you know, the physical production of goods. Example would be sugar cane...sugar and molasses refining that even with the nexus of agricultural and processing industry --

- COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay. Mr. Brewbaker, how about the...how about the health field, healthcare?
- MR. BREWBAKER: Well, there you have a problem of smallness, right? The small...to go back to my analogy, the University of Wisconsin Hospital is a massive facility in a community not materially differently sized from Maui's community, but because it has an educational center, and they have this endowment from the development of Warfarin, which just created huge amounts of money. So the point is that an investment in that case was plowed back into University of Wisconsin hospitals, which allowed it to become a major node of economic activity. And this is really, in the way of an answer to your question, the...you know, the way to think about it. If such nodes can be created, and Maui's attempted many over the years...the Research and Technology Park was a initiative of the...of the 30 or 40...30 years as of the 1980s, as I recall. And other kinds of things...I know that the new owners of the old A&B lands of HC&S are attempting a number of agricultural initiatives. The point here is that it's actually quite common, perfectly understandable, why very small numbers, or a single node of economic activity, come to dominate a small open economy. The aspiration to be more multidimensional is widely heard. The same conversations we're having are happening in Dane County, Wisconsin. But the reality is that if every small place . . . (inaudible). . . and then trades with each other, which . . . (inaudible). . . then you don't have to do everything. You have the luxury of trying things out, while the one or few things that you do really well gives you the luxury of taking...you know, of chancing. But...so the...so the way I would reframe your question is: given that we have the luxury of single export, tourism related business services, being as large as it is, that gives us the opportunity to try other things out. And I think the trick, in terms of fulfilling your aspiration as a leader . . . (inaudible). . . those other economic activities to, you know, take a shot, which ultimately is why a moratorium on one of these emerging activities is so fraught with risk. Let me be specific about this. Firstly, all of the evolution of lodging in the last five years has essentially been--and I would assert the quantification question earlier--has been absolutely and uniquely dominated by the availability of hosting apps, and by what's called securitization in financial economics. That is to say, all of the growth as I enumerated earlier in the lodging inventory...more than all of the growth...there have been 3,000

June 7, 2021

more units...lodging units built on Maui, roughly. But there...but 5,000 vacation rentals have appeared over the same, you know, 30 years. So...and most of that's happened in the last five or ten years, and the reason is because of hosting apps. Hosting apps reduce the barrier to entry for the investor, and they reduce the search and matching cost for the traveler with more heterogeneous preferences, which include, you know, people from O'ahu that are going over to spend time with the family, but not everybody can fit into the house. And that flexibility, the optionality that's inherent, both in the technology, the apps themselves, and in the securitization itself, the ability to use a real estate asset, a house, for something other than permanent habitation, or in conjunction with habitation.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The timer. The timer. The timer. Have we completely forgotten about a timer?

MR. BREWBAKER: Well --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Timer? Timer?

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. I got it. Okay.

MR. BREWBAKER: You get my point, that if --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I do. Thank you.

MR. BREWBAKER: -- that stopping that process would be extraordinarily costly.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you...thank you, Mr. Brewbaker. Anybody else have questions for him? If not, I'm going to close this out. Mr. Molina, did you have a question?
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah, Madam Chair. Actually, you know, this has been a very stimulating conversation to say the least. I don't know what Mr. Brewbaker's time limit is, but --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I don't know if he'd permit at least one more round, maybe a one minute or something for the Members.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay. Anybody --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Well, of course, it's contingent upon your time, of course, Mr. Brewbaker.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah.

June 7, 2021

MR. BREWBAKER: Let me pose it this way, because we should do this with a better connection. It doesn't have to be everybody. Not everybody seems to be interested in what I have to say. And Councilmember Molina, if you guys can put together some actual more...you know, put your questions down in writing, and then I can prepare a little bit more. We could do this informally. We don't...I mean, as far as I'm concerned, it doesn't have to be in a public forum. And we could come back to this, you know what I mean? I mean, I personally would set up the Zoom, and we could have the conversation.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair, if I could just ask Mr. Brewbaker one thing, just maybe could do on his own.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: Yeah. Okay.

- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Back in 1990, Maui County enacted a hotel moratorium. And I guess at that time, there was a proliferation of hotels being built; and at that time, it was a bit overwhelming for many members of the community. And there was some external factors with the global economy, if I recall, it was the Persian Gulf War. There was a downturn globally. If you could kind of look back at that. I mean, since that moratorium was enacted, I think it lasted about maybe two years, then apparently, I would guess, Maui County bounced back. And of course, Chair Lee was part of that Council. So if you could kind of, you know, look into that and share your thoughts, because we obviously did bounce back from that moratorium. So I'm just curious to get your perspective on it. So that would be my request.
- MR. BREWBAKER: Well, just to...sure. Just to...in round numbers, just to give you a feel of what was happening then, Maui went, in 1980, from about 9,700 housing...I mean lodging units to 1992, I cited earlier, 19,290 units. So Maui County's inventory...lodging inventory more than doubled from about just under 10,000 to almost 20,000 in that decade. And in that moment, the moratorium that you described came actually at the turning point. It was the peak of the cycle and, of course, the economy state-wide, but in Maui as well, throughout the 1990s languished. It went through a period of long...a long period of economic stagnation, which, you know, culminated with the Asian financial crisis in the late 1990s and Governor Cayetano's appeal to a economic revitalization task force for policy reforms that could help restart economic activity. So the moratorium actually happened, as you say, at the time of the Persian Gulf War, at the peak of a much...a very different investment and economic cycle from the one that we experienced in the most recent decade, in which the inventory didn't change materially, and all of which comprised vacation rental proliferation, at the expense of more traditional lodging format. So it's a very...it's a very different moment in time. But I'd be happy to flesh that out. I mean, it's --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We'll send that to you.

June 7, 2021

MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah. Happy to --

CHAIR SUGIMURA: We'll send that to you as a question then. That's a good one.

MR. BREWBAKER: Happy to look at it.

- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Members, I'm going to ask: does anybody have another question for a minute? If not, I'm going to ask us to compile some questions for him, and we'll send it to him and get it back to this Committee. Ms. Keani Rawlins.
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. One question. Mahalo, Mr. Brewbaker. So the question is, when we've had the construction unions before us, I asked the question: at what point do we stop? Do we just continue to construct new tourist accommodations endlessly? And none of the unions were able to answer that question. Do you have a response for that question?
- MR. BREWBAKER: I don't understand the question. To me, that's kind of like asking at what point do you...do people stop making --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You're saying...okay. You said that we shouldn't...we shouldn't stop the construction industry for two years.
- MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah. I don't think it makes any sense to stop construction for two years to do a --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. All right.

MR. BREWBAKER: -- to do a study.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I'm going to ask my...I'm going to ask my question...I'm going to ask my question, and then you can respond. Okay.

MR. BREWBAKER: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Thank you. Okay. So at what point does it end? It can't grow forever. So at what point does it come to an end?

MR. BREWBAKER: I don't understand the question. Why can it not?

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Grow forever?

MR. BREWBAKER: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So you want to cover the island with hotels and tourist accommodations? Got it. Okay. Mahalo.

MR. BREWBAKER: No. I mean, a lot of ... a lot ... don't put words in my mouth, now. A lot of

June 7, 2021

the construction that goes on is...as I mentioned this earlier, a majority of construction that occurs today in Hawai'i is additions and alterations, so it's actually renovation. You're saying we should stop all of that.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. But on Maui...on Maui...on Maui, there will be more than just that. So at what point does it stop? Does it just continue on forever? And that's what we're trying to figure out for Maui.

MR. BREWBAKER: No. It's just...it's --

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Maui doesn't want to look like O'ahu.

- MR. BREWBAKER: It sounds to me like you don't even have a reason for stopping construction. You say that the reason is to go study something, but you can go study it. You could have studied it for the last 30 years. You certainly could have studied it for the last year. But you don't --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And we can study it now, as Member Paltin stated. We can study it now --

MR. BREWBAKER: And you should be studying it in an ongoing way.

COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And we are studying it.

MR. BREWBAKER: I've been studying it for an...for my entire career.

- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: So I'll speak, and then you can respond to my question. Please don't speak over me. I wish our Chair would control our resource personnel a little better so that it doesn't turn into a heated argument.
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: Keani, I'm not going to...I'm not going to accept you to be impolite to Mr. Brewbaker. He's trying to answer. You're both getting emotional. So I'm going to stop this round of questions. If you can submit your question to me, and I can submit it to Mr. Brewbaker. All the Members...I'm going to...at this time --
- COUNCILMEMBER RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: ... (inaudible)...
- CHAIR SUGIMURA: --I'm going to stop this, and I am going to close this item, as...and I'm going to take a recess. I'm going to close this item, and we're going to go on to the...to the next item on my agenda, Members. So at this time I'm going to defer this item, IT-54, Moratorium on Building Permits for Visitor Accommodations.

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

CHAIR SUGIMURA: And I'm going to take a short recess. When we come back, Tasha Kama's going to take over this meeting. I have a...I have a trip planned. I'm going to be going off island, so I'm going to...I'm going to turn this meeting over to Tasha. Thank you very

June 7, 2021

much, Members. At this time, my meeting is now in recess. . . . (gavel). . .

RECESS: 11:03 a.m.

RECONVENE: 11:18 a.m.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: ... (gavel). . . The IT Committee will now reconvene. It is now 11:18 a.m. in the morning, and welcome back, Members. I see Member...Chair Lee. I see Member Paltin and Member Molina. And so we do have a quorum to begin. My name is Tasha Kama, and I am the Vice-Chair of the IT Committee.

IT-1(2) AIRPORT SHUTTLES (Rule 7(B))

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And so today, we're going to be talking about IT-1(2), Airport Shuttles. So our Chair had agendized this item because she wants to be able to start a discussion related to airport shuttles and other alternative modes of transportation, including the Maui Bus route and other public transportation options to and from the Kahului Airport. Deputy Director Michael Du Pont will be providing a presentation, and Mr. Bud Pikrone of the Wailea Community Association has also joined us to share an additional perspective from the local community. So...and also, if there are no objections, I would like to designate Mr. Pikrone as a resource personnel, in accordance with the Rules of the Council 18(G).

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you very, very much. And I would like to now begin our presentation with our Deputy Director Mr. Michael...go ahead, Michael.
- MR. DU PONT: Good morning, Vice-Chair Kama and Councilmembers. Thank you for having us this morning. So the plan today is I'll go through our presentation, and then I do have key resource people from the airport shuttle industry. So I do have with me Mr. Cecil Morton, which is the President from SpeediShuttle; I do have Kelisa Paleafei, which is the General Manager with Roberts Hawai'i; and also Roni Gonsalves, who is also the General Manager for Polynesian Adventure Tours.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MR. DU PONT: So If I could go ahead and have my presentation up, we can go ahead and get started.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Absolutely. Did you give your presentation to our Staff?

MR. DU PONT: I did.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Staff, do we have the presentation from Mr. Du Pont?

June 7, 2021

MS. ABRAHAM: We do have it.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. He's ready for it.

MS. ABRAHAM: One moment, please.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. MILNER: Chair, the computer's being slow. We'll have it up in just a moment.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Michael, when you said your presentation was short, what is short? Okay, here we go.

MR. DU PONT: Extremely short.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. More short now. Okay. Go ahead.

MR. DU PONT: Can I have the next slide, please. Okay. So we were asked to present a brief overview on the transportation, airport shuttle, or routes for Maui Bus from OGG, Kahului Airport. So what's currently at Kahului Airport? We do have our public transportation, which again, is the Maui Bus fixed route service. We do have Kahului Airport contracted service for on-demand service available via SpeediShuttle, which they do pre-arranged or walkup service with no reservations needed. You also have prearranged bus service bookings with Roberts Hawai'i, Polynesian Adventure Tours, VIP Trans, or Akina Tours and Transportation. Also with that, you do have taxi service, which is also provided by Holoholo Taxi, which is a subsidiary of SpeediShuttle. Then you do have your Uber, Lyft, and now you have Ride Holoholo Transportation, again, which is a subsidiary of SpeediShuttle. Next slide, please. For the Maui Bus, we do have two routes that currently service Kahului Airport. Again, that is number 35, the Haiku Islander, and the number 40, which is the Upcountry Islander. Both routes will pick up at the airport and take you to the Queen Ka'ahumanu Shopping Center, which right now is our main hub. And from there, you'll be able to transfer onto your other routes, such as the Lāhainā Islander or the Kīhei Islander, to go to your prospective location. You're able to bring on one medium sized bag, which is allowed on the bus. It has to fit on your lap, or in between your legs, or underneath the seat in front of you. \$4 will cover the entire trip from the airport to the hotel, and that's transfers included. For Maui Bus stats for the month of May, the Ha'ikū Islander, we had 569 boardings from Kahului Airport, and 574 alightings getting off at Kahului Airport. For Upcountry Islander, we had 430 boardings at the airport and 592 alightings at the airport. At this plan [sic], the Department has no plans on creating a route specifically for the airport. Some of our factors are funding. What route would it follow or have and the timing? Who would we target, are we targeting residents or targeting visitors? Next slide, please. What we have done to increase ridership: we're doing marketing via social media, a lot of community meetings, creating a more reliable system for our residents, reviewing current routes and stops. We do have larger buses on high-demand routes, such as the West Maui Islander, Lāhainā Islander, and the Kīhei Islander. For our total ridership for the month of May 2021, last month, we've picked up almost to pre-pandemic levels.

June 7, 2021

So West Maui Islander's up there at 24,162 for the entire month; Lāhainā Islander 9,293; and Kīhei Islander at 9,728 [*sic*]. Next slide, please.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Was that 9,000 or 19,000?

MR. DU PONT: For which one?

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Kīhei.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Kīhei.

MR. DU PONT: Oh, Kīhei Islander was 9,293...sorry 19,728 for Kīhei Islander.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

MR. DU PONT: You're welcome. Next slide. So I just put a little graph in here to show from the time the pandemic hit in March 2020, we were at about 103,000 boardings a day...well, a month, sorry. And you can see that it dropped drastically, and slowly picked up through the year, and now we're...now we're, last month, at 91,000. So we're climbing back up to pre-pandemic levels, so far. So again, what we're working on is trying to partner with all of the hotels to promote the Maui Bus, also trying to work with MVB to promote our bus system on their website, because right now, MVB has all the other transportation companies except the Maui Bus on their website. Next slide, please. So for the on-demand shuttle service, this is by SpeediShuttle. And again, we do have Cecil Morton, the President of SpeediShuttle online, and if he wants to talk about his company, he can. But they do have the walkup service contracted from the airport. You can walk up to their counter, book a shuttle right there, and then go to your hotel. So I do have some pricings that I got off of their company website. I think it might have...some of the pricing has changed, but you can see that to go from Maui to Lāhainā...to the Kā'anapali area, it's \$35.45 and higher per person; to Kīhei it's about \$22; and then to Kahana, Nāpili, Kapalua, it's about \$47...I mean \$44.70. And again, they do have the Holoholo Taxi. So some of the stats that they've sent to me for the month of May: they've had 627 rides to the South, and that's passenger rides...trips, I should say, and then 527 to the West. So I guess, what we're trying to figure out is, you know, we can...we can do whatever our...whatever we can to provide shuttle service to take residents or visitors to the hotels, but do we want...are we going to compete with the private side, or are we going to make our own system? You know, there's systems in place already. So I wanted to introduce them to the body, and we can go ahead and start with questions.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Members, questions for Mr. Du Pont? Oh, but wait, Mr. Du Pont.

MR. DU PONT: Yes.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Did you want any of your people to share information, or do you want to just wait until Members might have questions, and refer to them at that time?

June 7, 2021

MR. DU PONT: Yes, so ...

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MR. DU PONT: I guess if you guys have questions for those specific agencies.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

MR. DU PONT: Or you know, if you want to hear a short minute or two from each of them, then you can...we can go ahead and do that too. It's just what the Council wants to see.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Mr. Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Thank you, Madam Chair. Just a question about process.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Yeah.

- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Is it your intention, because we're closing on 12:00, you're going to put us all on a time limit?
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I hate putting you guys on a time limit because, you know, I think you folks are mature and well-grounded adults and...but yes, Mr. Molina, if you want that, I can give you all two minutes per round. And we can go two rounds, I think, because there's only four of you that I can see. So I think we're good with that if it's okay.
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Actually, I was hoping...I was hoping for three, but it's your call, Chair. So I'll stick with two, so --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you.

- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Okay. So I think...Mr. Du Pont, how many people do you have with you today?
- MR. DU PONT: So I do have three. Cecil Morton just text me. He's having issues trying to connect in.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay.

- MR. DU PONT: And I do have Roni Gonsalves and Kelisa Paleafei. So I do have Roni Gonsalves that would like to say a few words, if that's okay.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So let's have the two of them say a few words, a minute each, and then we'll have the Council [*sic*] ask questions. Okay.

MR. DU PONT: Thank you.

June 7, 2021

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Go ahead, Roni.

MS. GONSALVES: Aloha. I'm Roni with Poly Ad. And in listening to the beginning conversation before Michael's presentation, I think that we first need to know whether we're going to limit rent-a-cars, and whether hotel services are needed. I have spoken to our owners and our COOs, and Polynesian Adventure would be more than happy to begin structuring a hotel resort service on our motor coaches at specific target times. Some of the challenges, as you may or may not know, is loading up to Airbnbs or VRBOs, and we truly don't want to intrude in that. And perhaps Cecil and the smaller equipment could do that. But we run motor coaches that could easily load up for a south resort and run the gamut of the various hotels and resorts there. We can run a motor coach also to the West and have target times for that that would relieve some of the pressure off of the demand that you currently have. This is something that we have begun on Kaua'i already, just starting up today actually. It's called the Aloha Shuttle for Polynesian Adventure because they too are impacted as well. And we are working with SpeediShuttle because they can handle the smaller condos and so forth, where the motor coaches would really not be feasible. But I did want to put that out there, that we're here as part of the solution. I did hear earlier--I forget the gentleman's name--but he said that hotels run their own shuttles and at the Westin. Those are very targeted shuttles. The Westin runs a shuttle that services their sales for their ownership services and their guests, specifically. They run into Lāhainā, but there are shuttle services currently to do that already in place. For the hotel arrivals and departures, I think that's doable, working with the DOT, Michael and Marc, as well as airports, you know, we could specify specific times, as we have called the Aloha Shuttle on Kaua'i. And really the impact times for airplanes, not running it all day from 6:00 in the morning to, you know, 10:00 at night, but really targeting the impact time, which is 10:00 to 2:00 at the airport on arrivals and departures, and 6:00 to 9:00 on arrivals and departures. We know this because we move a lot of the large incentive groups, and having all those airplanes land at the same time has been an ongoing concern. That's what builds the traffic to Lāhainā. A lot of us may or may not realize that that's the reason we have traffic --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Yes, yes.

MS. GONSALVES: And I know I just ran over my meeting, but that's what I have.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. Thank you, Roni.

MS. GONSALVES: You're welcome.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Michael, who is the second person that you wanted to give a minute to?

MR. DU PONT: I do have Cecil Morton. I see that he's --

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Cecil. Okay.

June 7, 2021

- MR. DU PONT: -- finally been able to join on.
- MR. MORTON: Good morning.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Good morning.
- MR. MORTON: I was able to get on on the video earlier, just before the break, and then when I tried to get back on, it would not connect. So here I am on audio.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Okay.
- MR. MORTON: Thank you for the invitation.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So you have a minute to share with us what you...what you all do.
- MR. MORTON: SpeediShuttle is one of our services. We've been in business...founded on Maui 21 years ago. We provide on demand and pre-arranged airport transfer service. We currently have the concession at OGG, the Maui Airport, for shuttle service. We also manage the taxi concession at the OGG Airport under the brand Holoholo Taxi. You may have seen in Saturday's newspaper, *The Maui News*, we also wrote about a new service that has the same technology as Uber and Lyft, called Holoholo, not to be confused with the taxi concession at the airport. And everyone's familiar with Uber and Lyft. It's purchasing on demand and/or pre-arranged service in the palm of your hand.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you so very much. So at this time, I'm going to ask our Members if they have questions for either you, Michael, or the resource people that we have. Members, do we have any questions for our guests who are here today? Ms. Tamara Paltin, yes, please.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Du Pont and our resources. I just was wondering, you know, how does SpeediShuttle get their word out, because I haven't...I didn't know, you know, that they had \$35 from the airport to the West Side, 45 to the upper West Side. And I do kind of sporadically check the Maui Bound page, and I'm always seeing folks like, my car got cancelled, I need a ride, and it seems like those folks don't know either. And I know that the Mayor does have a tourism advisory group. It seems...and then I know that...and the last time that Mr. Du Pont came up, he said that, you know, the Upcountry and Makawao were chosen for residents to get to the airport, but we have residents and tourists on the West Side, that, you know...and got to pay 35 to 40 dollars, as opposed to \$4. I mean, not sure how the Makawao and Upcountry was chosen, and not West and South Maui. So those are my two questions. How --
- MR. MORTON: I don't understand...this is Cecil Morton. I don't understand the question.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: It probably wasn't for you. I know one was for Michael Du Pont, and the other was SpeediShuttle. Are you SpeediShuttle?

June 7, 2021

MR. MORTON: I am, yes.

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: So I guess the SpeediShuttle question would be like how are you getting the word out to the masses about the SpeediShuttle?
- MR. MORTON: Well, if you go to any...yeah, if you go to any search engine, Google, Yahoo, and you put in the question, how do I get airport transportation on Maui, you'll see us on the first page of every search engine.
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Okay. Thank you.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Michael, did you have something to add to that for Ms. Paltin?
- MR. DU PONT: Yes. Thank you, Councilmember. So I just wanted to answer the question in regards to Makawao and Ha'ikū. So that...from when the Department first started, 2005, 2006, that was the normal routing. So operationally, coming from Upcountry, you know, it make...it made sense to go to the airport on the way to the hub because you're passing by it. But coming from Kīhei and Lāhainā, operationally, it...you know, you would have to pass the hub and backtrack and, you know, already the routes are one hour, you know. So it would...it would have to make the route hour and a half, hour forty-five minutes to go to the airport and then turn around and go back to the hub. So operationally it doesn't make...it doesn't make sense to do that. I'm sorry if it --
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you. That makes sense that you would have to backtrack. Thank you. That concludes my minutes.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Ms. Paltin. I just had...if I could interject for a minute, Members. You know, when you go to O'ahu and you need to call a shuttle or you need to call...on the wall, you just go and you dial a number and it connects you to people. That's how you know if you a ride, if you go to a particular hotel, this particular company will take you to the hotel. If you just want to get dropped off someplace else, they will take you. If you're going to go to...and a whole bunch of you guys are going together to different hotels, you can do that too. But there's always that communication on the wall. Does our airport have something like that, or is that something, Michael, that you think that we could think about?
- MR. DU PONT: Yeah. So...thank you, Councilmember. So the airport, they...before they had the concession with SpeediShuttle, they did have a phone that you could call the different companies, and SpeediShuttle was one of them. But now that the company does have a desk within the baggage claim area, you're able to see, you know, airport shuttle, go to your hotel, and you're able to walk up straight to that and get on the vehicle. So I know the airport went away from the phone, but you do have visibility from SpeediShuttle, because they are, again, the contracted company to be there. So...but that's, I guess, how residents or visitors would be able to see. I don't know if Cecil would like to share something about that.

June 7, 2021

MR. MORTON: Sure. I guess...I'm hesitating my response, Michael, only because I'm visualizing the airport and the customer base. And typically, experienced customers who travel know that there are options at airports if they don't make pre-arranged service. And they know that they can rent a car, they can take a taxi, they can take...they can go with Uber, Lyft, and now Holoholo, and...or a shuttle service that may be available in the baggage claim area. So sometimes it...the point of the telephone bank is a lot of airports across the country, around the world, there are hotels by the airport that have shuttle services, so they would have a phone bank, and you could pick it up, and you would be going to those hotels. Well, in Maui, I believe the only hotel...there's two hotels that have shuttle service. I'm not sure if they're active today during this recovery period, but that would be the Maui Beach, I believe, and the Marriott just outside...across from the Costco.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: All right.

- MR. MORTON: So that being said, you know, we're very unique on Maui. Hotels don't offer services of transferring their guests to and from the airport, and they rely on the guests finding their own transportation.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Thank you. Thank you, Cecil. Mr. Molina.
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you very much, Madam Chair. If I could ask our presenters to try and be as brief as you can because we are on time limits with your responses. First question's for Director Du Pont. Does the DOT have a maximum cap on how many cars can be rented out daily?
- MR. DU PONT: Thank you for that question, Councilmember Molina. That would be State DOT. Our Department does not have --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: State DOT?

- MR. DU PONT: Yes.
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. But do...but do they have...are you aware if the State DOT has a cap on rental cars?
- MR. DU PONT: We're not aware of that, and that's almost...you know, every time we try to talk about rental car caps, it's almost like top secret. So --
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you. Okay. Now for our shuttle resources. You know, there's been talk about the Maui Bus basically competing with you at the airport for taking passengers from the airport. What is your selling point to customers, the advantages of using a shuttle versus a bus? If any of you would like to answer that, or feel comfortable answering in light of the DOT Director here, who is available to hear your responses, but...any thoughts?

June 7, 2021

MS. GONSALVES: How they find it --

- MR. DU PONT: So that...Roni or Kelisa or Cecil, if you guys want to answer that real briefly, please.
- MS. GONSALVES: If I could, I think there are definite services...differences. When you move in a smaller group, it becomes a bit more what we call exclusive. However, the ease of stepping onto a motor coach, air conditioned, comfortable, getting you to your hotel in a reasonable amount of time with all of your luggage. I'll be very honest, luggage is sometimes an impact to loading a variety of Ubers or taxis, and I've seen more people strap things on roofs, which then goes back to safety on the road. So our motor coaches are able and capable of holding over 80 bags per motor coach. That's why I suggested that we could limit to the resort only, because for example, we would start off Royal Lāhainā, Sheraton, Kā'anapali Beach, Westin, Marriot, and Hyatt. And it would be that kind of round drop off. And then we would sweep back around for departures, or start on a departure to the airport, and then do a pickup for arrivals. That's usually the pattern of that. But it's comfortable, they're relaxing. It's almost like an airplane. So at any time that you folks haven't been on a beautiful motor coach, you're welcome to come to my basevard and see the category of buses that we offer. Their seats recline, they have foot rests, they're just very comfortable. So what I wanted to make sure is that our message is heard, that we don't currently operate airport shuttle service. That's a service that is done by others. But in the need of supply and demand at this time, as I mentioned, we would love to be part of the solution to provide the service, to at least get our visitors, which we refer to as guests, from the airport to their resort, and then from their resort back to the airport.
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you for your responses. And I...just a quick mention. I was at Marco's restaurant in Kahului the other day, and I saw tourists coming in with their bags.
- MS. GONSALVES: Yeah.
- COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: I guess it must be because of the extreme cost of rental cars or no other types of transportation for them. But I'm seeing that frequently. I'm seeing people walking around with their suitcases just like they just got off the airplane. So anyway...but thank you so much for your responses. Thank you, Madam Chair.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: I see...Members, I see that Mr. Pikrone has his video on. So if we could, I'd like to give him a minute, and then we'll continue our questions with Chair Lee. And then we'll go another round of questions, Members. Mr. Pikrone.
- MR. PIKRONE: Thank you. You've touched on just about everything that's been touched on in the past through the resorts here. You know that...as you mentioned, shuttles and that exist now, but obviously it's not impacting the number of rental cars on the road. We still have a lot of rental cars. But I think we need to start with changing the mindset of the traveler. That's the key here. Because you're not going to convince newlyweds to forgo their Mustang convertible for a shuttle or a bus, that's going to be the tough thing.

June 7, 2021

It's...so you got to convince people they don't need, necessarily, a car to enjoy a resort area. They can come, and the hotels, you know, are going to love it if they stay on property. So that's a positive. But then again, we've always promoted the idea that Maui is made up of small towns and people...that people need to visit. You know, Makawao, Pā'ia, Wailuku, Lāhainā, Kīhei. And if...that's going to be the tough thing. They're going to want a car. Now, a lot of hotels...I kind of use the Hotel Wailea here where our office is as a kind of microcosm. I get to watch, and every day we've got taxis, Ubers, SpeediShuttles, coming in here and dropping people off. And then, we'll get...they rent out these small convertible cars here. And almost every day, we have a couple that's going to rent that car for a half day to a day to get around. But then again, there's a dozen or so Mustang convertibles in the parking lot that we know are rental cars. So again, it's...depends on the people, but we need to get that out to the people. We talked about, in the Committee some time ago--boy, it's been a while--the bus service between resorts and the airport. And it was talked about that one of the issues is well, you've got condos like in Wailea, you've got timeshare in the West side. What about those people? Because they're going to want to stop at Costco, and so how do you accommodate them? And there...we actually had conversations about building that into the route, to stop at...but it was like okay, you want to go shop at Costco, I want to get to my room, you know. So it's...again, it's a mindset of people. And then when you've got people here paying the luxury prices that they're paying right now, and have been, and spending the...money all over the island, they're going to be very particular, you know. They want to do what they want when they want, using their own vehicle. And that's what happened here some years ago. We had a shuttle that would go between the properties and the golf course and that, and that disappeared because the guests wanted instant gratification. They wanted that car to pick them up and take them to the restaurant or to the golf course or whatever. They wanted that instantly. And so they gave way to having individual shuttles or cars that...which take people around the resort area. We still do that today, but we are in conversation of trying to start up another shuttle because we've expanded here. And there are hotels, like I mentioned, Hotel Wailea and the Residence Inn, that have free shuttles that take you to the beach, so you're not driving to the beach. They take you to the shopping center. They take you to the restaurants and that. So that exists, but they...we've been talking about having a shuttle for the entire resort that would pick up people in the condos or in the homes and take you to these other locations, like a beach and like shopping and that, to eliminate some of the traffic on the road. That's in conversation now. I don't know where it's going to go. It's very expensive to do. We may want to partner with somebody on that. But I still think that when we're talking about airport shuttles or alternative transportation, we have to start with the customer. How do we convince the customer that that's the way to go to keep this island as kind and nice and just, you know, not sitting in traffic?

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Absolutely.

MR. PIKRONE: So that's going to be our challenge.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. So at this time, I think I'm going to ask Chair Lee if she has any questions for any one of our resource people.

June 7, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: No, Madam Chair. Thank you.

- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Okay. Very good. Ms. Paltin, do you have any other questions for our resource people?
- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Sure. Thank you so much, Mr. Pikrone. I was about to ask that Costco question. And to...further into the conversation, maybe...I don't know like how many scheduled pickups and drop-offs or incoming jumbo jets there are, but would it be a possibility to, say, you know, make a stop at Costco, and whoever wants to get off gets off, but they won't re-board that same bus? They might catch the next bus that comes and drops off. And part of the service would be ensuring that their luggage gets to their room while they're shopping at Costco. So it's not...so the bus driver would drop off...maybe not everybody wants to go shop at Costco, just send dad or mom or something, and then everybody else can get on with their vacation. And the other followup question I had as to the client and their desires, you know, we're...Chair Sugimura and myself did visit 'Ahihi-Kina'u and drove by Makena, where they're instituting the pay parking. And so like, you know, it's not that necessarily people want to go on these shuttles, but do they want to get stuck in traffic? Do they want to pay for parking if they can find parking? And these types of things, where it's not us changing their minds, that it's just circumstance of carrying capacity of our roads, our beaches, and whatnot. So those are my two questions, and thank you so much for bringing those issues up. And I see Ms. Gonsalves, so if she wanted to chime in too, I'm not opposed.
- MR. PIKRONE: Well, I just...I just want to add and...yeah, I think it's an educational thing. That's what I mean by changing the mindset of the people. It's getting them to understand what's best for them and their trip here, when they come here, that they don't have to worry about being in traffic, they're helping eliminate traffic so they can get to where they want a lot easier. As far as multiple buses or trips for Costco runs, we could never figure that out when we thought...discussed that in the Committee. It was just, how do you...how do you do that? How do you have...we were kidding each other. Okay, Bud, you want to go to Costco and go shopping and, you know, Jill back here says no, I just...let me get my family to the hotel room. And then, how do you...how do you do that? I mean, if there's...the difference in time between the buses too. You know, you could have somebody get the family...the rest of the family and the luggage, or the luggage, get to Lāhainā, and then...kind of following, and then how long is it going to be before the rest of the family shows up, you know. So that's...it's a conversation to be had, maybe, but that's what I find a little bit troubling, is that one. I don't know how you do it.
- MS. GONSALVES: Yeah. As a transportation company, that is a troubling subject. And let me just say that when we move guests with luggage, the luggage must move with the guests because of the liability of personal belongings. So I mean, in the...in the...and I say this with all due respect, in the real world, people have to move with their bags. What we could offer, you know...and I'm one--I'll be honest, and Michael knows this--I'm one that will think way outside the box to see what we could do. And I am quite amazed that at any time, no one's come to the transportation companies to get us

June 7, 2021

involved with these conversations prior to meetings like this, okay. Because there aren't many of us, but we move a lot of people. But I am amazed that we were never included in these conversations prior to now, all right. So again, my job...I always say to our owners, you guys sell the dream, I schedule the nightmare to make those dreams come true. I use that a lot. But I will say that our job right now, because the demand is so great, is to find a solution immediately to get our guests from the airport to the hotel, or vice versa, from the hotel and resorts to the airport. As I mentioned in the beginning, if you allow the big motors, such as mine, which are luxury coaches, which you're welcome to come and see, move . . . (timer sounds). . . the big groups within the resort and allow the smaller groups that would be Costco shoppers and so forth move with your smaller sprinter-sized vehicles. That may be something that could be worked on. You could move two different sprinters at a timeline, one going shopping, one going direct. If they're going direct, then you put them on the bus and then we're going direct. If they're going to condos, that's the only time they're going to go shopping at Costco. When they're going into a resort, that's a different visitor type, and they don't have a refrigerator big enough for Costco items. So we do want them to create that experience in the resort and spend their money there. We went off on a subject that is also a hot topic for me, is tours. Once they get to the resort, what do they do? So we've had caps on our capacity of equipment, which was 50 percent when we first opened. That meant I had a motor coach that could seat 56 people, but I could only travel 28. However, in meeting with Mayor Victorino, we have recently, as of May 5th, been able to increase that to 75 percent. Whether the industry knows it or not, we've already moved incentive groups where I've had 49 runs in a day getting these large incentive groups from point A to point B, the water activities, diner runs, et cetera, and we had to double down on the amount of equipment because of these restrictions. That's not the best thing. So we did go back to the Mayor, aware that we have cleaning protocols, just like every establishment, the guidelines would be followed, and now we're at 75 percent.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Ms. --

- MS. GONSALVES: Our tours...we at Poly Ad offer Hāna, sunrise, Haleakalā, Haleakalā, 'Ĩao. These combinations, we're sold out until the end of July. And part of that...I mean, there's...these are multi-faceted. We have the equipment, but now with unemployment, nobody wants to work until September.
- VICE-CHAIR KAMA: So Ms. Gonsalves, I'd like to...I'd like to put a stop right now because we're on a time clock.

MS. GONSALVES: Yep.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Chair Lee is going to need to leave, and me too, and we're going to lose quorum. But I wanted to get to Mr. Molina's last questions, if he had any. Mr. Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Madam Chair, no. I have no further questions. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: We are...yes, Ms. Paltin.

June 7, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: I just wanted to respond to Ms. Gonsalves.

MS. GONSALVES: Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: And I'm so sorry that nobody's invited you into the conversation before this, but I'm not sure that we're the decision makers in airport transportation. A lot of it has to do with the State.

MS. GONSALVES: Right.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: And while I'd love to continue the dialogue and brainstorming, I just wanted to ensure that you were aware that we don't make many of the decisions in terms of the airport, and it's more so the State folks. And I'm sorry that the State or the airlines don't consult with you folks more. But I mean, I'm certain Chair Sugimura would be willing to continue the dialogue. But I didn't want any false expectations --

MS. GONSALVES: Yeah.

- COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: -- or to raise your hopes that we're in charge of the airport. We're just the County, so that's...
- MS. GONSALVES: I appreciate that. But you know, being inclusive in a variety of discussions would be helpful in the overall view.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: All right.

COUNCILMEMBER PALTIN: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you.

MS. GONSALVES: Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you, Ms. Paltin, for clarifying that too, for Ms. Gonsalves. And yes, you're absolutely correct, we're the County. But you know, I think the County is a lot more collaborative when it comes to being inclusive, especially when it comes to the people of our County. And everybody who lives here is part of who we are, and therefore, we want to always include them into this discussion. So Members, if there are no questions, we certainly are going to continue this discussion. Again, I'm very sure about that. We'll probably have Ms. King back with us also. So if there are no...if there are no objections, Members, I'd like to be able to thank Mr. Du Pont and the resources that came with us today, and invite them back again for a better and a longer discussion, and a more inclusive one too. And if there's anybody else out there that we may have missed, want to be able to do that. And we certainly have the opportunity to call any one of these resources individually and talk to them about other things that we may not have covered today. So thank you so very much for coming today, Mr. Du Pont, and Roni, and Mr. Pikrone, and Cecil with SpeediShuttle. Now that we know you're all our there, it's going to be helpful because, you know, this past month, we couldn't find rental

June 7, 2021

cars for my family that came from the mainland. And we were all double upping, and switching, and playing leap frog with everybody's spare cars, you know. So thank you so very much for sharing that with us. So at this point, I'd like to be able to defer this particular item, and come back at another time. And without further ado, Members, I would like to be able to adjourn this meeting.

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

VICE-CHAIR KAMA: Thank you. This meeting is now adjourned at 12:00 p.m. Thank you, everyone. Thank you, Members. Thank you, Pikrone. Thank you, Roni. Have a great afternoon. Don't forget come back for Affordable Housing this afternoon. Aloha, everyone. ... (gavel)...

ADJOURN: 12:00 p.m.

APPROVED:

Sug mula SUGIMURA, Chair

Infrastructure and Transportation Committee

it:min:210607:bc

Transcribed by: Brenda Clark

June 7, 2021

CERTIFICATION

I, Brenda Clark, hereby certify that pages 1 through 53 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 13th day of July 2021, in Wailuku, Hawai'i

Buch Clot

Brenda Clark