

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE

Council of the County of Maui

MINUTES

November 17, 2021

Online Only via BlueJeans

CONVENE: 1:33 p.m.

PRESENT: Councilmember Keani N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez, Chair
Councilmember Tamara Paltin, Vice-Chair
Councilmember Gabe Johnson, Member
Councilmember Tasha Kama, Member
Councilmember Kelly Takaya King, Member
Councilmember Alice L. Lee, Member (out 4:26 p.m.)
Councilmember Michael J. Molina, Member
Councilmember Shane M. Sinenci, Member
Councilmember Yuki Lei K. Sugimura, Member (in 1:58 p.m.)

STAFF: Lesley Milner, Legislative Analyst
Alison Stewart, Legislative Analyst
Jerry Paredes, Legislative Analyst
Richard Mitchell, Legislative Attorney
Clarita Balala, Committee Secretary
Kristeena Locke, Council Services Assistant Clerk

Kate Griffiths, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Gabe Johnson
Evan Dust, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Tasha Kama
Davideane Sickels, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Tasha Kama
Lois Whitney, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Tasha Kama
Axel Beers, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kelly Takaya King
Ellen McKinley, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Kelly Takaya King
Sarah Freistat Pajimola, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Keani
N.W. Rawlins-Fernandez
Jordan Helle, Executive Assistant to Councilmember Yuki Lei K.
Sugimura

ADMIN.: Michele McLean, Director, Department of Planning (BFED-105)
Michele M. Yoshimura, Budget Director, Office of the Mayor (BFED-85)
Scott Teruya, Director, Department of Finance (BFED-33, BFED-85)
May-Anne Alibin, Deputy Director, Department of Finance (BFED-33,
BFED-85)
Karla Peters, Director, Department of Parks and Recreation (BFED-33)
Rowena Dagdag-Andaya, Director, Department of Public works
(BFED-33)

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

Kristina Toshikiyo, Deputy Corporation Counsel, Department of the
Corporation Counsel

OTHERS: Anmarie Mabutt (BFED-85, BFED-105)
Junya Nakoa (BFED-33)

Courtney Ramos, Matrix Consulting Group (BFED-105)
Peter Landon, 'Āhihi-Kīna'u Reserve Manager, Hawaii Department of
Land and Natural Resources (BFED-33)
Julie Dixon, President, Dixon Resources Unlimited (BFED-33)
(2) additional attendees

PRESS: Akaku: Maui Community Television, Inc.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha 'auinalā kākou. Kanakolu kūmākolu minuke I ka hala o ka hola ekahi ma umikamahiku o Nowemapa i ka makahiki 'elua kaukani 'iwakāluakumakahi. E 'olu'olu mai e ho'omalū ke Komike Mo'ohelu Kāla a me ho'omohala waiwai. 'O wau ka luna ho'omalū o keia Komike o Keani Rawlins-Fernandez. It was 1:33 on November 17th, 2021. Will the Budget, Finance, and Economic Development Committee please come to order. I'm your Chair, Keani Rawlins-Fernandez. I keia lā, me ko kākou, ēia hope luna ho'omalū Tamara Paltin. In our chat (*audio interference*) Estonia today. Te'ē...[tay-~ray]. Okay. I guess I'll go with...I'll to Chair Lee first, and then we'll go back to Member Paltin. Aloha, Council Chair Lee, with the Estonian greeting for us.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yes, you did it very well, te'ē. And Madam Chair, I am here alone in my office at home. And I want to wish everybody a happy Monday. Feels like a Monday instead of hump day. That's all I've got.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo and te'ē. And that...does that mean good afternoon or hello?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It means hello. Nowadays, do you notice I'm just speaking...instead of changing from good morning to the afternoon, I'll just pick a more generic greeting.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Te'ē.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: It's time consuming.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. And aloha, Member Paltin. Te'ē.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Te'ē, a me aloha 'auinalā kākou, mai ka West Maui District Office here at Malu 'Ulu o Lele. I'm here with my aide, Angela, who's more than six feet away from me. Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Next, we have Councilmember Shane Sinenci. Teʻe.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Hey, teʻe, Chair. And aloha ‘auinalā, mai Maui Hikina. I’m here at the Hāna Cultural Center with both my EAs, Dawn Lono and Gina Young, and we’re equally distanced.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. And Member Mike Molina, teʻe.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, and teʻe, Madam Chair, and my colleagues, and everyone else viewing in on our Budget and Finance meeting today. For the record, I’m transmitting out of my residence here in Makawao, and over in the kitchen is my wife, but she’s still well...far...far away from me. More than six feet, and she’s putting together all the ingredients, ready for a fantastic dinner she’s going to make for me tonight, I hope. But anyway, aloha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You are a lucky man, Member Molina. Aloha. Councilmember Kelly King, teʻe.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Teʻe, and aloha, everyone. I’m in my room in South Maui, at...with nobody else around at this point. I don’t know if he’ll walk by at some point, but I’m alone right now.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Member Gabe Johnson, teʻe.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Teʻe to you, Chair, and teʻe to the fellow Councilmembers. I am home alone on the Island of Lānaʻi, and we have a nice, light drizzle. But boy, this island needs it. We have a drought, and our deer are suffering. So luckily...you probably hear the chickens in the background, but luckily the drizzle is bringing us back to life here.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ue kalani ola ka honua.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Eō.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Much-needed rain, for sure. I just received the text from Member Sugimura, and she said that she will be a little late, but she’s...she’s on her way. And Pro Tem Tasha Kama, teʻe.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Aloha ‘auinalā, Chair, and teʻe to all of my fellow colleagues. Looking forward to a great meeting today. And I am at home, alone in my workspace. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Tem Kama. The GREAT meeting was yesterday. Just kidding, it’s the BFED meeting. . . .*(laughing)*. . . Sorry, it’s a joke. Okay, and for the record, I am at the Molokaʻi District Office by myself on this side of the office.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

Okay, from Corporation Counsel, we have Deputy Corporation Counsel Kristina Toshikiyo, teʻe.

MS. TOSHIKIYO: Teʻe, Committee Chair and Committee Members. Aloha, it's a beautiful day.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. It is a beautiful day. Hot, but beautiful. And then let's see, just in case...and then I will introduce the Administration when the items come up, and our outside resource personnel. And Committee Staff, we have Committee Secretary Clarita Balala, teʻe.

MS. BALALA: Teʻe, Chair and Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for filling in for Ms. Bouthillier. Our Budget Committee Analyst Lesley Milner, teʻe.

MS. MILNER: Aloha, Chair. Teʻe, Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Legislative Analyst Alison Stewart, teʻe.

MS. STEWART: Teʻe, Chair, Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Legislative Attorney Richard E. Mitchell, teʻe.

MR. MITCHELL: Aloha and teʻe, Chair and Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And Council Services Assistant Clerk Kristeena Locke, teʻe. This online meeting is being conducted in accordance with the Governor's most recent emergency proclamation on COVID-19. Please see the last page of the agenda for information on meeting connectivity. We have three items on today's agenda; BFED-105 Permit Application Fees Cost Recovery Study; BFED-33 Reserved Residential Parking and Tourist Parking Fees in Public Beach Access Parking Areas; BFED-85 Legislation and Discussion on the Effect of the Coronavirus Pandemic Rules, CARES Act, and Related Issues. Okay, before we begin testimony, I just received word that there may have been an error in posting. Ms. Milner, for BFED-105, the error in posting would require us to defer?

MS. MILNER: You can still receive the presentation today, Chair, but the preference is that you defer the item after that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so we would receive the presentation, but we wouldn't be able to ask questions?

MS. MILNER: We think it would be okay if you ask questions, because the notice is sufficient for what the item is. The only issue is the item number has the wrong Committee acronym. So that's why we would prefer that you defer instead of file, so that we can post it correctly before it is filed, if that is what the body chooses to do.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Got it. Mahalo for that clarification. Okay, we used EDB instead of BFED. Okay. And I do believe we have testimony, so I will proceed with the instructions of testimony. Oral testimony via phone or video conference will be accepted. Please note that if you are signed in, you are on the list to testify, even if you did not request to testify. Please let Staff know in the chat if you are signed on and do not intend to testify. Testifiers wanting to provide video testimony, please join by going to the BlueJeans meeting link noted on today's agenda. Testifiers wanting to provide audio testimony, please join by calling the number and entering the meeting code also noted on today's agenda. The Committee intends to keep the same meeting link and phone number for all BFED Committee meetings this term for the ease and convenience of the Members and the public. Written testimony is highly encouraged. Instructions on how to submit testimony can be found at mauicounty.us/testify. Oral testimony is limited to...wait, did I say that? Yeah. Oral testimony is limited to three minutes per item. When testifying, please state your first and last name. If you are testifying on behalf of an...of an organization, or are a paid lobbyist, please inform the Committee. Staff has posted the link to the testifiers log in the chat, so that testifiers will be able to see where they are on the list. Please be mindful of the use of chat during the meeting. Chat should not be used to provide testimony or chat with Councilmembers or other testifiers. And if providing testimony, please be courteous to others by muting your microphone and video while waiting your turn to testify. And we'll proceed with...we have three individuals signed up to testify. First is Anmarie Mabutt, followed by Brendan Kennedy. Aloha. Oh...

. . .BEGIN PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

MS. MABUTT: Can you hear me?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, now we can hear you. Okay, please proceed.

MS. MABUTT: Thank you. Good afternoon. I'm here today to speak to Item-105 and Item-85. I'll start with EDB or BFED-105. I wanted to first say mahalo for passing the legislation back in 2019 to mandate that this study be done. I'm very familiar with cost of recovery information for municipal fees, and it is very helpful, powerful information to have when you assess decisions as they regard fees, in particular. And as you know from the study, and from the prior study that was done in 2009 by Matrix Consulting, approximately 80 percent of these application, permit, and renovation fees have been subsidized by the County, and I believe this should change. If the Council is truly committed to sustainable tourism and combating over-tourism, this is definitely a tool within your shed to help that effort. These...this isn't...I've seen prior minutes discussing this issue before by the Council, and they emphasize how this is a philosophical decision; how much, if any, cost recovery to charge...to base these fees on. And these are development fees, these are not charging a family or a child to swim at a public pool. These are fees that should be borne by the people who are applying for these services. And I would fully support you charging as close to full cost of recovery as possible, as soon as possible. This...a new fee schedule based on

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

cost recovery appears from the legislation you passed to be about a year and a half late in having this new fee schedule. And that's on the Planning Department, it appears from the language, to present it to you, but nothing's happened. This study was done in March 2020, and per the legislation, there was supposed to be a new fee schedule proposed three months later. So we're well, well past that, and I think it's well overdue. The...the Councils...not you necessarily, but past Councils have discussed this issue a long time ago. The first study was '09, and nothing's happened, and the same amount, 80 percent or more, is being subsidized by general funds, instead of the developers, the hotel resort operators, and the individual property owners who are paying these fees, and making use of this application and permitting process. And one last comment on this item. The one person who testified against cost recovery at the last meeting is an Airbnb...a vacation rental property owner. And I looked up their rates. If they're fully booked out, they're making over \$3,000 a week. And do the math all the way out, that's, you know, over \$150,000 a year, and I don't think that's very much to ask these people to pay another \$2,000 to \$4,000 to cover the costs associated with the fee...to cover the fees associated with the costs in processing their applications, and permits, and renewals.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Mabutt.

MS. MABUTT: Should I just go ahead on the next one?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I can see if Members have any questions on this item, and then I'll give you another three minutes for the next item. Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. And yeah, I'm not sure if this was the...the study that was given to us, the cost recovery study. I know our office did propose a permit...25 percent for some of the...the building permits. So we can check on that date. I believe that was two or three years ago that we proposed that during the Budget. Wanted to add that. Thank you.

MS. MABUTT: Yes, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo, Member Sinenci. Seeing no other questions, I'll put three minutes on the clock for the next item. Please proceed, Ms. Mabutt.

MS. MABUTT: Thank you. This is much...more brief. I just wanted to say thank you for putting this on the agenda today. And I also wanted to say mahalo for the questions that you've asked recently in the correspondence to the Mayor and the Budget Director. There's a number of item...expenditure items with CARES Act that I think should have some follow up done. So thank you for asking the questions. I would just hope that you follow through on getting answers. I know last year, when the CARES Act money was originally appropriated and approved, there were some good questions asked too, and some important concerns raised, and then just nothing kind of happened after that. And also, with...I don't know if it'll be applicable for ARPA, but I know Councilmember King had asked last year about a CARES Act dashboard, which is really helpful not only to the Council, but to any member of the public who's

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

interested in understanding how this money is spent. And the other counties, I believe all of them, have some sort of dashboard available to the public. And I know when you first asked about it, there was a...a response from the Administration about some software or whatever. You don't really need software for this. A human could go and calculate this and put together a pie chart. Just something would be helpful that show...that the public could go to, and see the breakdown as to how these funds were spent. And just going forward, I would hope that there's an extensive discussion of how the ARPA funds are spent. As far as I know, I haven't seen any discussion or approval of any expenditures on the ARPA funds. So hopefully those funds will be used well. I'm sure we still have the pandemic to deal with going forward through the winter and through next year, so just thank you for your efforts to follow through on the CARES Act, and hopefully, please just make sure to give your input and hold the Administration accountable for how they spend the ARPA funds. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, mahalo Ms. Mabutt. I see a question from Member King. Member King, please proceed.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you, Chair. Aloha, Ms. Mabutt. So when you're talking about the other counties having dashboards, are you talking about the other three counties in our State, or...

MS. MABUTT: Yes.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I mean, I know that there's a number of...okay. So was there one in particular that you found the most useful?

MS. MABUTT: You know, offhand, I cannot remember. I know O'ahu was...was very helpful, for sure. They had an entire kind of website, oneoahu.org, but I believe that's where their dashboard was. And I...I remember that being very helpful and...and informative. As far as the others...offhand, I can't say, but I think I definitely remember the Big Island also having some very helpful information as far as fund breakdown and how the various CARES Act funds were allocated.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you. I appreciate you following this issue, because I do think it's a real concern that that hasn't been done yet. Thank you.

MS. MABUTT: Again, thank you for following up. So I don't see anything in the file today, but hopefully you'll get a response to the questions you asked.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member King. Okay. Seeing no other questions, I'll thank you for your...or did you want to testify on the third item?

MS. MABUTT: Oh, no, I'm good. That was enough. Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right. Mahalo for your testimony today. Aloha. Okay, and our second and last testifier is Junya Nakoa.

MR. NAKOA: Eh, howzit? Yessah. Yeah, I seen the public parking thing you guys had as one of the agenda stuff, I don't know what number it is, but kinda funny how, you know, the great round project, a couple you Councilmembers went ask me, what's the solution you looking for? And one of them was for knock down that damn building, that hotel, and put one public parking over there with bathrooms, yeah, for the da kine. So that's why I like talk about, 'em, yeah? You know, so we can use dat money, you know, charge the tourists that park on the side of the road illegally and block local residents in Nāpili. Charge the tourists choke money. I no care what, charge 'em. Charge 'em, and then use that money to pay for the park...for build the park. And then the residents can go over there and park over there for free, but us, yeah, we no goin' park that far, we goin' park more close. But if they like park, they can park for free, and you know, it's a couple of times you guys done bring up, oh, how we going monitor that? If they driving, they gotta have a license. So if they get one local license, they local buggahs. If they get the mainland license, they tourists. So that's how you guys can charge 'em. And like da kine, you know, we can collect the money on dat. So just to let you know, and maybe you guys don't know...don't know this, but they went put one stop order...Public Works go put a stop order on dat damn house for the inspection. So maybe we can put one public parking over there, one public...one public bathroom. You know, that kine stuff. So that's a solution, so go fix the problem. But make that guy all jam up and we can charge money for the tourist for parking. Us locals, we park over there for free. Okay, mahalo.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Nakoa. Question? Okay, seeing no questions, well, thank you for your testimony today.

MR. NAKOA: Yessah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, I invite anyone on who would like to provide testimony to unmute at this time. I do see a number on. Ms. Milner, do you know if that's a resource for the Committee?

MS. MILNER: Chair, I believe that Julie Dixon is online on the computer and via the phone.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. I think you texted me that. All right. Hearing no one intending to testify, if there are no objections, Members, we will close public testimony and accept written testimony into the record. Any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Awesome. Mahalo, Members.

. . .END OF PUBLIC TESTIMONY. . .

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

ITEM 105: PERMIT APPLICATION FEE COST RECOVERY STUDY (CC 20-453)

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Okay, so first item on today's agenda, which was listed as EDB-105, but it's BFED-105, Permit Application Fee Cost Recovery Study. As Member Sinenci kind of mentioned during testimony, in Fiscal Year 2020 Budget, the Council provided funding for the Department of Planning to update the 2009 Fee Study and Cost Recovery Analysis, which evaluated the Department's actual cost for processing permit applications. The Planning Director and Matrix Consulting Group are here with us today to provide a presentation on the results of the study. If there are no objections, I would like to designate Ms. Courtney Ramos of Matrix Consulting Group as a resource person in accordance with Rule 18(A) of the Rules of the Council. Are there any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. Okay, so I will first invite Planning Director Michele McLean to provide any opening comments. Teʻe, Director McLean.

MS. MCLEAN: Teʻe, Chair and Committee Members. Thank you so much for scheduling this item. As one of the testifiers mentioned, we did transmit it to the Council in 2020, but with COVID-19 economic impacts, and also just concerns projecting into the future about the...the County's economic condition, Council wisely waited to discuss this item. So it's been just a little over a year, so that's not too much delay. And as you said, we...the Planning Department did receive funds for this in the FY'20 budget. We hired the same firm that had done the original study, so they were able to just update it. Today, Courtney Ramos is with us, and she will give an overview of the methodology that went into preparing the study. And then after that, I'm going to, if it's okay with the Chair and the Committee, just pull up the document itself and jump through about five different pages that highlight the thrust of the report. So with no delay, if I could have Courtney come on, and then share her screen to give her presentation? Courtney, can you join us?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director McLean. Before the presentation starts, I just wanted to quickly welcome Councilmember Yuki Lei Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you, Chair. Sorry I'm tardy. Looking forward to this meeting. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. And your location, and if you have anyone with you?

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Ah, yes. So I'm in the County building, and I'm the only one in the office. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Okay, and now we have Ms. Courtney Ramos. Aloha.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

MS. RAMOS: Aloha. Thank you all for this opportunity this afternoon. I'm going to attempt to share my screen.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, we see it.

MS. RAMOS: Okay, let me see if I can...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, okay, I think you need to go to the display settings, it's showing the presenter view.

MS. RAMOS: Yes. Okay, I think we might be good.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I have faith in you.

MS. RAMOS: I tried this earlier. Should be Screen 1. Aha.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Perfect.

MS. RAMOS: Okay, fantastic. Well, again, aloha everyone. My name is Courtney Ramos. I am here representing Matrix Consulting Group, and I wanted to talk to you today to really just give you an overview of the Planning Department Cost of Service User Fee study that we did conduct. A really quick overview of kind of like why you would do this and...and the steps associated with this. So what this cost of service study does, is it documents fee-related services, and service level assumptions associated with processing applications, issuing permits, and...and allowing approvals for various different planning activities. The general steps that we took to conduct this study: We first started by cataloging...cataloging existing and potential fees for service, so kind of what was on the...on the fee schedule as it was, making sure that if there needed to be changes, that we...that we made changes to those, whether it was how...how it was worded, or talking about the structure of that, which we'll get into a little bit later. But really kind of making sure that that...that structure really reflects the services that you're providing, and how you're providing the services. Then we worked with Planning Staff to determine time estimates by position for each service that was being provided, that was covered during the study. And so when we talk about establishing time estimates, you know, we wanted to look at desired service levels. We wanted to look at realistically how much time was being provided. We didn't want to say, you know, the easiest time, you know the...the least amount of time to process this application. We also didn't want to look at the most complex application in that particular category. We wanted to look at what is an average amount of time that it should take, from start to finish, to process an application to issue a permit. And then finally, we looked at allocating overhead costs. So we didn't want to just take a look at costs associated with the salary and benefits of the staff who are hands on for that, but also making sure that we accounted for any Admin. staff or supervisory staff within the department, who were supporting those staff, scheduling and doing things like that, as well as any Countywide overhead. You know, things like HR, payroll, services such as that that also, again, support those staff who are providing the service. So there's two main benefits of doing a study like this. I think first and

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

foremost, it's really ensuring compliance with State and local law. And in Hawai'i, we know there is HRS Section 25-1.5, where it talks about what...when a charge qualifies as a fee for service, as opposed to being a tax or some other type of...of charge. And in order to be a fee, it has to apply to the direct beneficiary of a particular service, it has to be allocated directly to defraying the costs associated with providing those services, and it also has to be reasonably proportionate to the benefit received for that service. And so obviously, these planning applications, they're specific to the people who are coming in and applying for those applications. These costs go into offsetting, you know, planning costs, the Department costs. That revenue gets coded back to them. And obviously this study, what it does is it helps justify and show that the cost that is being charged is reasonably proportionate to the service that's being provided. Additionally, it kind of aligns with GFOA best practices. And when they talk about cost of service and how often you should do this, that you should calculate the full cost of providing services. Because what it does is it provides you a basis, it gives you an understanding. If you do nothing else with this study, at least you will have understood what it is costing you fully, from the County's perspective, to provide these services. Best practices also include adopting formal policies regarding cost recovery. Again, just documenting why we're doing something so that current...current constituents, current members, as well as future decision makers, understand why we've made the decisions we've made to charge the fees that we've chosen to charge. And then ideally, you would do a study like this, you know, every five years or so, given that amount of time with technologies changing, with the way that staffing and services are provided, it just allows you to kind of update what those assumptions are; make sure that you're still in alignment, both with your cost recovery goals, as well...as well as with the cost of service. So a couple of things, I...I...I talked about taking a look at the...the fee structure, and that was one of the biggest things that...that we looked at through this study, and some of the ways in which planning fees are applied. There's about four of them. One is...is a flat fee, and that's when we set this fee for...for an application, and...and that's it. It doesn't matter who comes in and asks for the application for that particular application, that's the fee that they're going to pay, and it's...it's flat. Those types of fees are associated with bed and breakfasts, short-term rentals, and historic district applications. There's also evaluation-based fees. Those tend to vary depending on the valuation of the proposed project. So a project with a smaller valuation, meaning the size of that project is probably going to be smaller, it would pay a lower fee versus if the project valuation was very significant, it would pay a much higher fee. And typically right now, those fees range between about 670 to almost 5,000. There's also some location-based fees, and right now, those vary based on where the application, or the location of that application is. So even though the application, the services being provided generally are the same, depending on the location, such as Maui or Moloka'i or Lana'i, those...those fees will be different. And finally, the length of the approval. There are some...some services that look at how long the application of the permit is good for, and taking a look. So something like a year, or two years, or three years, and so depending on that, you would pay a different fee. So kind of based on those things, and in...in talking with Staff and talking about how long it takes them to provide the services that they're providing, and talking about the different types of applications that come in, we...we recommended some modifications to the fee schedule. And

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

those modifications include, where possible, and where appropriate, to eliminate the use of project valuations to calculate planning permit fees. This will ensure that the process is more dependent on the actual application or that process in general, and rather less about the size of that project, and value of that project, especially because sometimes you can be valued less, but can actually be more complex or more complicated. To convert the location subcategories for shoreline setback variances and Special Management Area use permits, to be based on the type of decision or the approval required. So whether it can be administratively approved, if it has to go to the Planning Commission, or to the full Council, that that should be the driver of effort, not where the project is located. Eliminating multi-year permit approvals and renewals for the bed and breakfast and the short-term rental home permits. In talking with Staff, it was determined that really, those approvals should happen annually, so we shouldn't...we shouldn't put out there that we can, you know, have two, three, four, or five-year permits, when really what we should be doing is having singular annual permits for those services. And all of these modifications, what they do, is they help allow applicants to better understand the services the Planning...the Planning Department is providing, as well as what the fees for that service are. Especially when we don't have flat fees, if we're using valuation and location, sometimes it can be hard to understand what the fees are that might apply to my particular project are. So this really helps kind of streamline the schedule, and make it more clear and...and understandable for...for the public. So the assumptions that were used from a cost perspective for this analysis, when we looked at determining the cost of service, we looked at Fiscal Year '19/'20 budgeted staffing, and Fiscal Year '19/'20 budgeted expenditures. And for the revenue impacts, in order to kind of adjust for the peaks and valleys and swings in workload from year to year, we used a four-year average. So we use 2016, 2017, 2018, and 2019 as our average years to determine workload and associated revenue. And so what that did, is it shows us that when we look at fee-related costs...so again, for the fees that we looked at associated with planning services, and compared that to the revenue that would have been generated based on the four-year average workload, the planning services are being subsidized by approximately \$1 million annually. This results in...in a cost recovery percentage of about 17 percent, whereas typically we would see something more in the line of between 50 and 80 percent for planning services. And it's important to note that any time we have a subsidy, that the County is incurring the cost. And...and when there is that subsidy, the General Fund is usually the one who is paying for that subsidy, they're offsetting that...that money and that cost. And that's then money that can't be used for other services or other needs within the community. So to kind of finish up my little presentation here and...and open it up to questions, but I think now that the County has this information and has this report, there are...there are four key takeaways that...that I hope that you guys take into consideration and look into implementing. And the first of that is to kind of establish a cost recovery goal. Determine where you think planning services should be, whether it's at the current 17 percent, whether it should be at 50 percent, 80 percent or 100 percent, and kind of identify what that goal is, either from a Department level, or by fee categories, by fee types. What that will do, again, is it allows decision makers in the future to understand why we set fees the way we did, and understand why we might have lower cost recovery levels. But also, there might be reasons that we have today for setting

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

those fees lower that might not exist in the future. So by documenting those...that reasoning, it allows future decision makers to...to change those decisions, should those circumstances change. Also outlined timelines for achieving these cost recovery goals. This doesn't have to happen immediately, so we don't have to rip the Band-Aid off. We can take some time to get to where we'd like to be. So really kind of establishing how long you want to take to get there, you know, whether that's two years, three years, four years. When would you like to achieve that goal that you've set? Thirdly, adopting an automatic increase mechanism, so it's...it's great that we...if we set this cost recovery goal and we identify when we want to get there, but the other thing that we need to do is we need to make sure that annually, we're increasing our fees, that...so that they are at least maintaining or keeping pace with changes in our costs annually. So something like a...a COLA or an MOU increase, so that we can make sure that if we set it at 50 percent cost recovery, that we don't just leave that fee the same for the next four or five years. Because ultimately then, in four years, you will not be at 50 percent cost recovery, you'll be less than 50 percent cost recovery. So this automatic increase mechanism will allow you to at least maintain the cost recovery level that you have set. And finally, determine when those fee increases should be implemented; whether they should be the beginning of the year, beginning of the fiscal year, kind of set a timeline. One, this allows, obviously, the public and the developers to understand when those fees would be hitting their projects, and gives everyone a chance to...to implement the fee structure and the fees, not only in the system, but within the Department, so everybody is on the same page. And so with that, I will turn it back over and...and I'm happy to answer any questions that the Committee might have.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Ramos. And then, if you can...there we go. Perfect. Okay, Members, I'll put three minutes on the clock, and we can do multiple rounds. And I see Council Chair Lee, eager with questions. Chair Lee?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. Well...I...I'm not muted. Thank you, Courtney, for the presentation. I think a lot of it was based on reason and common sense, and I think, you know, I...I appreciate your recommendations. There was one that I wasn't sure of that was practical, and that was making the B&B and the short-term rentals annual permits. One, it's, to me, harder on the Staff to do annual permits, as opposed to biannual, you know, every two years, let's say, as a minimum. So hard on the Staff, and secondly, I would think the B&B person...operators and short-term rental operators would have difficulty planning their year if they're not sure, at the end of the...the year, they're going to be renewed. So did you choose annual for any particular reason?

MS. RAMOS: So we...in conjunction with Staff, and talking about kind of the approvals that should be happening, and how often that should happen, that was the opinion of the Staff at the time. I don't know if...obviously, this...it's been a year and a half. There have, I'm sure, been some significant changes in the way that things have been done. But at the time when we conducted the study, that was the opinion of the Staff, was that really we should be doing these, and updating these annually, so that we make

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

sure that everybody is in compliance with...with the rules and regulations in association...in association with the County Code.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, thank you. I...I think a lot of the compliance issues come up because the compliance...I mean, departments check into these...these permits on...on...as they are complained...you know, they're complaint-driven, not necessarily...I don't think we have the staff to go and check everybody for compliance for every single permit. I mean, you're talking thousands of permits, yeah? Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair. Okay, and then before...I see Pro Tem Kama, but before I call them Pro Tem Kama, for the public's benefit, I think it might be helpful to kind of see what some of the current permit fees are, and how much it...the administrative cost is for each fee that Matrix researched. And then...so I'll share my screen. Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Oh.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Can you see it okay? Oh, no? Still too small? Okay, how's that? Is that better?

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Better.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so these are the cost per unit. So these permits require a public hearing, and so here are some examples of those permits that require a public hearing; change of zoning, and so the cost for that permit is \$688, and the administrative work involved...and Ms. Ramos, just correct me if I'm misstating it, is \$8,561, for a deficit of \$7,873. Conditional use permit is also \$688, for a deficit of 5,227. I'll...I'll just kind of...well, and I can share this in the chat after.

MS. RAMOS: I...I would just note also that the 688 is actually the minimum fee, because a lot of those where you see the 688, those are the ones that are valuation based. So again, the...the kind of the maximum fee would be the 4,950, so almost 5,000. So obviously other projects might have a...a lower subsidy, but almost in...in almost every single case there...there would be a subsidy.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that additional information. So we have subdivision, so as Ms. Ramos said, it's not necessarily 688, but if...if it...if it was 688, then the deficit, 6,971. And then I'll go down to show some examples of...oh, that's a big one. So major hotel renovation building could include new units. The cost 688, and then the Administrative cost to handle that would be 10,642, for a deficit of 9,954. And then I will go down to the permits that do not require a public hearing. And so you will see a incline. So the shoreline setback approval permit, 688.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: SMA.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, these are not SMA. These are the shoreline setback approval and determination. So it's...it's a lot closer, it's only 211 deficit. A \$4 deficit here, and I imagine it's because there's less administration involved, because these don't require hearings.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Can we get a breakdown of the costs?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: What do...what do you mean, Chair?

MS. MCLEAN: Chair, that was something that I was going to cover when we get there, so...

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Okay, good. Good.

MS. MCLEAN: We can jump to that now if you want to, or if...if there are questions for Courtney and the presentation, or however you want to proceed, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director McLean. I'm sorry if I jumped the gun. Perhaps we can start with...we can go to Director McLean for her portion of the presentation, and then I'll open it up for questions.

MS. MCLEAN: Okay. Thanks, Chair. I'll just go ahead and share my screen.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Please do.

MS. MCLEAN: And are you seeing that?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. MCLEAN: Okay, so this is the...the document that we sent to you. And Chair, you were just going over some of the earlier tables with various costs. And there's the first one that you went through, the public hearing fees, and...and someone mentioned SMAs. So those are...those are permits that require a public hearing. So those were listed there, you can see the deficit for those. And then nonpublic hearing items, these are the bed and breakfast and short-term rental homes. You can see, again, the actual cost and the deficit. Then other administrative fees...or excuse me, other administrative permits and...and reviews that we do, those are listed as well. So we don't need to go through those individually. But now coming up on the...these were the numbers that Courtney showed in her presentation, of how those...the deficit adds up. A roughly \$1 million, where we're recouping only about 17 percent. And now to address Chair Lee's question.

CHAIR LEE: *(Audio interference)*

MS. MCLEAN: So here's the question in where these costs come from. So there are four different categories that factor into it. First is direct Staff. So that, of course, should be included. The...the number of hours it takes for Staff, and how much time it takes to work on each application. It's also proposed to add departmental overhead, so

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

office supplies, office rent, and other costs related to just our basic office operations. Then additionally, administrative support, so beyond the planner that processes the permit, there is secretarial support, there's the deputy director and myself, who help manage the Staff, supervisors who review their work. And then lastly, general County overhead, which helps support all of the departments and their functions. So these are broken down. And here's that first list that...that the Chair showed, the public hearings, with each of the costs for each of those four categories, and those are highlighted in the yellow box. And that's where the total cost came from. And so in the tables that follow this, it has different tables with using all four of these categories, or only using three of them, or only using two of them. So whatever the Council feels is appropriate to include can be included because those are all broken down by category. Does that make sense? So that's broken down for all of them. So this is similar to what our budget looks like. The fees are listed similar to the order that they are in our...in the budget, and separated out with all those costs. So then in the second one is Attachment B. So whatever number is decided, whatever...whichever of those four categories you want included, it's recommended that the cost recovery be phased in over a five-year period. So starting with 30 percent in the first year, increasing by 10 percent each year, until ultimately we achieve 70 percent. And one of the reasons that we wouldn't be going for 100 percent, and we...actually, the public meetings that we had on this reflected this, is that a lot of the procedures that we follow have a public component. They allow for public testimony, they allow for public notification. We actually had just general members of the public coming in and saying, we benefit from these processes by having public hearings, by having all these steps, by being able to testify at Planning Commission, at Council. So 100 percent of the cost shouldn't be paid by the applicant. Some of that should be subsidized because it provides a public benefit. So if...if that's the...the philosophy that's followed, it's recommended to aim for about 70 percent of cost recovery over a five-year stretch. And with that, I will stop sharing my screen.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director McLean. Okay, we'll go to Pro Tem Kama for questions.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. So I think one of the first questions I wanted to ask is, why are we looking at a five-year recovery, and what...what criteria could we use to get as close to the 70 or 80 percent, or whatever we decide we want to get close to, in the shortest amount of time? Maybe that's what I'm asking.

MS. MCLEAN: I believe that's completely up to the Council to decide. If you want to jump ahead and go to 70 percent right away, that...that's your prerogative. That's a really big change, but you guys have done a lot of really big things, so it...it's...it's really your prerogative.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Okay, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Tem Kama. Okay, I did see Member King's hand, but before I call on Member King, I know Member Sinenci is going to have to

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

leave at 2:30. I forgot to ask if he wanted to ask any questions before he has to leave, but I'm not seeing him at the moment.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: His...his virtual background, that's all.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: He went down the road.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: He walked down the road. He went down the road already.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, so we'll go to Member King, and if Member Sinenci pops back on, then I'll go to him before. I...I saw Member Paltin, and Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you Chair. So thanks for that report. That was...this was a really good thing to see and...and also breaking it down was helpful. One question I had for the...and you could probably answer this, Michele. There were acronyms that were used like COLA and CPI. Just tell me what those are, real quickly?

MS. MCLEAN: COLA is a cost of living adjustment, and CPI is consumer price index.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay, that's easy enough to understand. And then my other question is, I like the recommendation. I don't think there's enough testimony time to...in one day or one meeting to jump up to 70 percent right away, because I think we will be inundated. But I like the idea of phasing it in. What I was going to ask you is on the...on the costs, though, the public hearing costs were...seemed pretty high. And if we went to a virtual public hearings, we...couldn't we cut that cost way down having virtual public hearings?

MS. MCLEAN: No. The...the...the physical aspect of the public hearing doesn't really involve the cost. Applications that require a public hearing, we have to post notice in the newspaper, we have to make sure that the applicant does his neighbor...does their neighbor notification, and then it's doing the staff report for the Planning Commission, presenting to the Planning Commission, coordinating --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I figured *(audio interference)* that.

MS. MCLEAN: So --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So it's not really --

MS. MCLEAN: -- *(audio interference)*

COUNCILMEMBER KING: -- it's not that much time, as far as the personnel that has to show up for the public hearing and the rank of whatever you would *(audio interference)* --

MS. MCLEAN: Correct.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And then the other question I had is, I know that you have varying costs depending on how much...how ready the application is when it comes in. So how would you assimilate those varying costs? Would you...would you...if we...say if we were trying to get to 30 percent cost recovery, would you wait until you got to the end of it to see how many times that person had come back in and take someone's time up...you know, the direct staff, and then whatever the total cost would be, you would charge them 30 percent of that?

MS. MCLEAN: No. What...what's proposed is...so what Matrix did was look at the average cost for all of these...for all these different types of permits over this long period of time. So it would be a flat fee for each of those types of permits, whether they came in complete and were "easy," whether they came in incomplete and required a lot of work, they would all get assessed the same fee. Each...each kind of permit would get assessed the same fee.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, because I thought what we were looking at was the minimum charge, and she was saying that that 688 was the minimum charge, but there were actually varying charges, depending on, I guess, what they were doing. But I thought at...I...I remember at one time having that conversation about how to charge people for the real time, because some people come in like every other day, because they have problems, and you wanted to encourage people to be as ready as possible. . . .(timer sounds). . .

MS. MCLEAN: Right. The...the variation right now depends on the project value. So the...the budget schedule right now, if it's a public hearing item, the...for most public hearing items, there's a minimum fee, and then it increases with the project value, with a maximum. So it's being proposed to take that away because the value of the project doesn't really have a bearing on how...you know, what the cost is to process that application. So that's what the variation is now, not on how long it takes. It's just the value of the project.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, but the length of time it takes to process, so the number of times they come in, really affects the cost of that project, doesn't it? And --

MS. MCLEAN: And...and that's covered in that average cost.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay. Okay. Was that my timing? That was...okay. That was a very soothing sound. . . .(laughing). . . Okay, thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: You're welcome. Okay. Member Paltin, followed by Member Molina, and Member Johnson.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Ramos. I just was wondering, I'm not sure if you saw Mr. Croly's testimony the previous time this was posted, but he was saying something about, you know, the revenue that a bed and breakfast or a short-term rental home brings into the County in terms of TAT or property taxes

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

should be factored in the cost of the permit. And I just was wondering your response to that. Not saying I agree, but how would you respond to that guy?

MS. RAMOS: I did not see that comment, so I'm not sure that I quite understand exactly what the proposal would be. I'm assuming that it...it's saying that if I...if I, as a...as a short-term rental or as a...as a bed and breakfast, I'm contributing, right? Because people are paying taxes to...to stay, right? And so therefore...I'm assuming...this is what I'm assuming that their thing was, and then therefore, my fee should be reduced, because I am contributing to...to sales tax, or you know, VAT tax, or whatever that is.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: I think that was the *(audio interference)*, yeah.

MS. RAMOS: Okay. So based on that, you know, I kind of have two minds, because I...I do...I do believe that there is...there is that contribution. But I think that really the...what the purpose of permitting the B&Bs and the Airbnbs, and the, you know, whatever we're calling them these days, that there's regulations that we're trying to make sure that they're keeping up, and that's more of a regulatory purpose. And that that's kind of what that fee that they're paying annually goes to, to make sure that...that they're complying with planning rules and regulations that we aren't, you know, being rowdy, we're not infringing on our neighbors, we're not having that kind of an impact, and that the taxes that are being paid by the...by those who are visiting, are going to offset other services; roads, you know; parking; public restrooms; police and fire services; and those types of things.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Great.

MS. RAMOS: So that's kind of how I would look at it, but...

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Leads me to my next question. You know, a lot...I don't know if you've driven around our neighborhoods or what, but a lot of improvements, and other things are not permitted. But we run a complaint-based enforcement system. And so I guess my concern is, you know, raising it up to 70 percent or whatever the percentage is when there's already so much scofflaw, like drive through any neighborhood and you see so much stuff that's not, like, legal in terms of zoning and enforcement. Would raising it just encourage more of that? Or I mean . . .*(timer sounds)*. . .

MS. RAMOS: I...I...I'll give my opinion, but I'm sure Michele might have...might have her own as well, but, you know, I...I would look at it and say, I don't think it encourages other things, but I would say if the General Fund is subsidizing those costs by \$1 million right now, that's \$1 million that you don't have to fix potholes, to, you know, pay for other services that could go to improving the community in a variety of different ways. So that's kind of...I...I don't think it creates...I...I don't think it enhances the problem. I do think there is the potential that it could help fund offsets for those problems.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay, I'll save my rest of my questions for my next turn.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Director McLean, did you want to add on before I go to the next Councilmember?

MS. MCLEAN: Yeah, thank you. The...the first part of the question, what about, you know, TAT and GET that gets generated, I would say that all other kinds of projects have...create benefits too. You know, new residential subdivisions create housing units. Commercial projects generate GET, you know, so other projects have...have benefits too. And these permits, for the most part, are new entitlements. They're not really for actions that we see going on that aren't permitted. So I don't think that the...that the cost of the permit is what keeps people from doing things without permits. I think it's either they don't...they want to do something that they know they can't get permits for, or they don't want to go through the hassle. I don't think it's the cost that keeps them from coming in.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Okay, Member Molina, followed Member Johnson, and then Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Mahalo, Madam Chair. And aloha, Ms. Ramos, and thank you for your overview. And appreciate you mentioning the fact about to factor in, or the...the rationale to have a cost increase could include general inflationary costs. And I think that's typically around two percent a year. As part of your analysis, was also the cost of union contract increases factored in as well, as part of your rationale for these increases?

MS. RAMOS: So the...the study takes a snapshot in time. So like I said, it was based on '19/'20 budget...budgeted expenditures. And the reason that we would say to...to develop an increase factor, and we kind of leave it open, is so that you can account for things like union contracts and negotiations. So obviously, something more along the line of a cost of living adjustment or MOU increases...if we know every year employees are going to get a 2 percent raise, you know, something like that, then that's really what we should tie our...our annual increases to, so that we can make sure that we're at least, again, kind of staying where we wanted to be at. The percentages for year to year was just a way to increase the fee gradually, to get to the cost recovery level that was being proposed. Obviously, you know, you can choose any cost recovery level that you'd like, and any amount of time to get there, but that was just an example of how to get there.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: And also, should we consider the cost of supplies and equipment? I guess when the study was done, we...we weren't in our current shipping dilemma that we're in right now. So, you know, everything is going up. So I guess that could also be a good rationale for...or justification for cost increases; would you agree?

MS. RAMOS: Absolutely. And like I said, I think it's one of those things where you want to look at it and see...you know, and obviously being...being on an island, you know, your...your inflationary factor is going to be different than somebody on the mainland. You know, where 2 or 3 percent might make sense for, you know, California or

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

Florida, or New York or something like that, it might need to be different, given the fluctuations of how you see, not just salary and benefits, but also services and supplies impacting your budgets.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, and...and finally, I'm not sure if your analysis took into consideration, as far as, like, having a senior staff member review permits versus, say, a novice...a new...new employee, was there any cost differential if you did that analysis? Because, you know, having a senior staff member review the permits, that could likely expedite the permit process, and possibly there would be some cost savings. Was...was there any analysis done in that area?

MS. RAMOS: So when we determined the cost of service, what we did was we looked at who generally should be reviewing those applications. So if it was something that was more administrative and could be done by, like, a junior planner, so to speak, we would use that time estimate and that cost per hour, versus if it was a much more high level, you know, it's going public hearing, you're going to have senior planners, senior level staff involved, then we would use their time in that. But we did blend, and we made sure that we accounted for the fact that, you know, obviously there are some projects where anybody could work on it, in which case what we did is we blended the rate. So we made sure that we accounted for the fact that anybody could be working on it. But in certain situations, we said this can be done by junior level staff, so we peg...we pegged the price, the cost, at...at junior level staff, versus other projects where it required senior level staff, we used senior level staff rates.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, great. All right. Thank you very much for your responses. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, Member Johnson, followed by Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Thank you, Chair. Thank you for that great presentation, Ms. Ramos. So my question is about the one slide you were...you were talking about how valuate...valuation-based permits were kind of counterproductive. And it's...but it seems to me like that's the biggest ticket on the...on the item, and when we're in the biggest hole, why wouldn't we want to put those rates a little higher, so...so we could get us out of that hole? Like, it seems like you're...they're balancing too, and then you're saying, but the one that brings the biggest money back is not the one we want...we like.

MS. RAMOS: So right now, for the...for planning fees, and I'm only going to talk about planning fees, because there are other permits, I think, associated with building that are valuation-based. So I want to be real clear that we're just talking about the planning applications. But a lot of times, the value of the project is not indicative of the level of service that's being required to process an application. As an example, you could have...another way to look at it too, in...in other jurisdictions that we've seen is...is the size. So it's done per acre or per lot. But I could have an acre of land, and I could be doing something on the whole acre, or I could be doing something on just a

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

tiny little piece of that land. And the same thing is kind of true with the valuation, is that it's not always indicative of the level of effort or the issues that the planning staff are having to review, and to comment on, and to provide direction on. And so that's why we were saying to move away from the valuation of the project, and more about the specific application type. What is it that is being requested? What kind of approval is being requested? And what kind of conditions are we going to have to put on that, rather than saying just because you are a more high-dollar-value project, you would pay more for that service.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. All right. Thank you for that. I guess the next question is, either one of you folks can try it...on it. Why did you bifurcate the two, between public hearing and nonpublic hearing? Is it...is it...when I had just heard from the line of questioning from Councilmember King, is that public hearings don't make it more expensive necessarily. So why did you switch the two? Is it just...I...I'd like for you guys to answer that.

MS. RAMOS: So I...you can certainly answer too, Michele, but I believe that the difference is, it's Staff effort. If something has to go to a public hearing, staff have to prepare more reports, more packets, more information for the Committee, Commission and...and Councilmembers, so there's more effort involved if something has to go to a public hearing, versus if it can be administratively approved, there's less staff time, less effort that's involved in it. So that's why there's that differentiation between those types of permits.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Are there permits that don't require a public hearing that are...have a lot of staff time? . . .*(timer sounds)*. . .

MS. RAMOS: Yes, but I think that report, I mean, depending on what those...those particular things are, which is why there's depending on the permit, there...so there could be some permits that are no public hearing, but that could have a full cost similar to something that would be a public hearing, right? So there could be something that is maybe it's easy to kind of process, but it takes a lot of, you know, public input and public inquiry, and...and other higher level approvals, versus something else that might take more time from a research perspective, or back and forth with the applicant, but that doesn't meet that requirement. So depending on the application type, along with the approval level required, that's how we determine the...the time associated with that, and thereby, the cost.

COUNCILMEMBER JOHNSON: Okay. All right. Thank you. My time's up. Thank you so much. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Johnson. Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. This is so interesting, and thank you for putting this together. I think I heard you say it was ready a year and a half ago, and you were just waiting; is that right? You were waiting to present it? So thank you, Chair, for bringing this up. And I can tell we're going to hear about this during the

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

Budget session. I hope we do. My question is that I think you've made a clear statement that we are 17 percent versus, you know, doing a higher percentage of cost recovery over a period of time makes sense, and for obvious reasons, right, that we all, you know, understand clearly. What kind of rollout have you done with other...on...on this? Like will there be, besides this meeting, public input or discussions before it gets implemented?

MS. MCLEAN: We had done that before we transmitted this.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh.

MS. MCLEAN: We...we held a public meeting that was before COVID. And then also, when the original fee study was done, there was also a...a...there were also public meetings conducted at that time.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Oh, that's good. And you did Countywide, and it was explained. Major understanding or no major questions that we should be aware of?

MS. MCLEAN: Well, you know, I...I don't want to overstate the...the...the public meetings that were held. You know, we did a press release, we...you know, we sent out emails notifying people, and whoever showed up, showed up. And that was...we did also reach out to consultant groups, you know, the larger consulting firms.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: And in general, Michele, there was an understanding as to the...the rationale behind it, and it was...of...of course, nobody wants to pay more, but it was received and --

MS. MCLEAN: Right.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: -- understood. Okay.

MS. MCLEAN: Right. And as I mentioned before, one of the...to me, the more interesting takeaways was that members of the public who weren't involved in development or permitting said that there is a public benefit to these processes. And so there is justification for some level of subsidy...of some level of subsidization because of the public process that...that goes along with most of these permits.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. And I guess that you did it Maui, Moloka'i, and Lāna'i? There was ample time for everybody to get a feel for this? Or was --

MS. MCLEAN: But again, I...I don't want to overstate that. You know, I...I am sure there are many people who didn't hear about this, and who weren't . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . aware of the public meetings that we held, but I...I don't feel like...well, let me...let me jump ahead. It does seem like the Council, this time, is receptive to this concept, which means that we would likely put it in our FY'23 budget.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

MS. MCLEAN: I'm not sure at what level and so forth, that's still to be determined. But if we were going to go in that direction, then I would feel like it would be appropriate to issue a press release, and to get the word out, so that people were aware before the budget process begins.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you very much. Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Michele.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. And yeah, it was transmitted about a year ago, but as you are well aware, there is a little thing called the pandemic that we are trying to deal with. And if you'll also recall, we did make adjustments to the permit fees in this budget session. Mahalo. Okay, would someone like a round two for questions? Okay. Member Paltin, followed by Council Chair Lee. Member Paltin.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Ms. Ramos. I just was wondering, I didn't see anything in the document about after-the-fact permits, and I was wondering if you could make a comment on using the fees to discourage things that we...we have enough of, or promote things we don't have enough of, or things like that. Like we don't have enough single-family housing or housing. And your thoughts about, like, keeping those, like, maybe at a 50-percent level or, as we just enacted, a two-year moratorium on hotels, so raising that up to, like, the 90-percent level or, you know, like after-the-fact permits as penalties, you pay double or something, because you didn't do the permit? Just wondering your thoughts on those things.

MS. RAMOS: So from the...so the study just looked at what is the cost of the service. I think what you're referring to, are policy decisions that are up to the County to determine how they want to incentivize specific actions. So if we've done work without a permit, you know, within whatever your Code allows you, if you have that leeway, and that threshold to be two times, three times, I've seen some jurisdictions that are five or ten times the actual permit fee. You know, it depends on how big of a stick you want to wave for those particular things. I think if we're trying to incentivize things, you know, I...I think that...that that is a great idea, and you certainly can, you know, as you move forward in this process, decide...you know, if we're trying to discourage hotels, you know, that...that applications that would typically be relevant to those types of development, that rather than stopping at 70 percent, even though there might be some sort of public benefit, that we do. We set those at 100 percent cost recovery. But that is definitely one of those areas where I think it's important for you guys to document, to codify the reasons behind those policies, because what...what you feel today, and the things you're trying to incentivize or disincentivize today, might not be what you really want to incentivize or disincentivize three, four, five years from now. So that, again, as you kind of make these decisions, to kind of outline why you've made those decisions, so that future decision makers can look back and clearly understand why we've chosen to set something at 100 percent, or at 20 percent, or whatever that level is.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: So even to the extent of, like, achieving LEED gold standards or something, would pay...we could, as a policy, you pay 10 percent of the cost, or a living building standard, no permitting fees in terms of incentives and things like that?

MS. RAMOS: I think...again, I think those are...those are policy decisions that the Council would need to make. But yes, I think...I mean, those are very common, not just the type of building, but where we're building, if we want to promote growth in a certain area, or...or disincentivize growth in a certain area, fees are a way that you can do that. It is a tool in your...in your tool belt that you can utilize.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: I...I tried to do that with the SMA area, raise it up real high, but it...it didn't get the vote, and now we got all kind of building in the shoreline area. But I tried to do that, like, my first year. It didn't pass.

MS. RAMOS: Maybe this is your year.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thanks. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Council Chair Lee.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Thank you. I have a question for Director McLean. Michele, we have always been advised by Corp. Counsel that we can raise tax rates and not tie it to cost, but we cannot raise fees without tying it to a cost. So that's why...that's why you can't raise fees in the hotel district, and not in another district because you want to discourage some type of building, or encourage some type of building. Is that your understanding?

MS. MCLEAN: Oh, I...I agree that fees...it...increases to fees need to be tied to cost, and that's the purpose of the study. Whether you need to apply the same cost percentage across the board, or whether you can apply 100 percent to hotels and 10 percent to affordable housing, I...I don't know that there...you know, that's something Corp. Counsel can say --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Right.

MS. MCLEAN: -- because it would be --

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I think we need an opinion on this.

MS. MCLEAN: -- tied to cost.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: I'm not opposed to raising the fees, especially since there's such a disparity of, you know, cost versus what's actually being charged. I think the idea of phasing in the increases makes sense. But what concerns me somewhat is the fact that...or maybe I'm wrong. Are you planning to give better, faster service as a result? Not you personally, but the Department.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

MS. MCLEAN: We're always trying to give better, faster service.

COUNCILMEMBER LEE: Yeah. You know why, Michele, in 30 years, nobody ever called me to complain about the fast service they're getting from the County. So it would be...be nice to have a relationship between the increase in rates, fees, and...and the increase in the efficiency of...f how we serve our customers. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Chair Lee. Okay, I see Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: You know, that made me think about...Chair Lee's question, about the MAPPS program, and I...I'm so...soon, I'm told that we're going to have a presentation and it'll get rolled out. I'm waiting for...we sent a letter to Sandy Baz about what kind of community outreach that was done before it gets...so...so we can have that information when he does a presentation, so I'm still waiting. But what...how would the MAPPS program affect this, or will it?

MS. MCLEAN: We're...honestly, we're waiting to see. There will definitely be efficiencies with that. Information will be available online; rather than using paper, it will all be electronic. But for our planners, a lot of the same work is still going to have to happen. It may be done electronically, rather than on paper. There may be some things that are streamlined, so it may be that some things take less time, but we're really waiting to see. I actually think the first, at least, six months, it is going to be a lot more work to work through the system.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MCLEAN: But once it's underway, there...there could definitely be time savings on our staff's part. There will be efficiencies otherwise, but I don't know that they're going to be significant.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Okay.

MS. MCLEAN: For us, anyway.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you for answering that. I think it'll be huge, once we can get MAPPS rolled out and started. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, Member Molina...Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Thank you very much, Madam Chair, and thank you for giving us a second round on this. Ms. Ramos, I appreciate your responses to Member Paltin as it relates to the incentives and disincentives for various permit recovery costs and everything else. Because I...I was thinking along those lines...now, can you provide us an example of other counties that have this built in, I guess, incentives for various types of permits the County would encourage their citizens to get, along with increases for permits that the counties would discourage? You know...you know, for

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

example, like here, shoreline setback variances, that may be something our County really wouldn't like to encourage, but we could potentially, you know, raise the fees up. So say, if you want to go and get that, well, it's going to cost you more. You...do you have that information available about any counties that have these types of built-in incentives and disincentives as it relates to increases for permit fees that you can show us now?

MS. RAMOS: So some of that information is...it's not as easy to find. So one thing I'd like to be clear about is that when we talk about disincentivizing something, right, we're not actually talking about charging somebody more than the cost. We're talking about charging them like 100 percent cost recovery versus something we're trying to incentivize, where we're only charging, you know, 30 or 40 percent cost recovery. So I just...I just want to make that clear, that we don't get to overcharge somebody because we're trying to disincentivize. But one of the things that is kind of hard to see with this is...is that these...these types of examples aren't readily apparent to applicants, because they are policy decisions. So really, it's kind of going in and digging through policy documents, assuming that they exist, because sometimes...again, you know, this is why I tell you guys to document this stuff, is because a lot of times you go in and...and you ask well, why is it...you know, why have you been charging only 20 percent cost recovery? And they go I don't know, I think we've always done it this way, right? And so to really kind of move away from that, I...I can give examples of types of things that I've seen. So certainly if we want to incentivize, you know, mixed use, we want to get more kind of business as well as apartment, because I...I happen to live in California, housing is a big issue for us. So incentivizing housing developments is one of those things in a lot of areas, as well as trying to incentivize certain areas, we think some places overgrown. I know when we worked with the city of Austin, Texas, they had a huge issue. They needed to...they wanted to promote growth in other areas, so they actually had policies based on the different zone, the different district that you would be building in, that the fees would be discounted by a certain amount. So they went...they adopted everything at 100 percent cost recovery, and then depending on the zone or the district that you were building in, they would discount that fee, because they were trying to promote growth in some areas, and disincentivize growth in other areas. And again, it depended on whether it was residential versus commercial.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . Okay, all right. Thank you for those responses. And you're certainly right, when we have to make sure we have justification or prior history to justify the...the incentivizing or disincentivizing to avoid any potential legal challenges. So thank you.

MS. RAMOS: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Okay, anyone else wishing to have a second round question? All right. Good job, Ms. Ramos and Director, looks like you got all the questions. Director --

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

MS. MCLEAN: Chair, could I make one...can I make one comment? Just trying to get a sense of where the Council is on this issue. I just wanted to point out in our existing fee schedule in the budget, it lists all the different types of permits and all of their fees. And at the end, it says exceptions to fees. So it may be that we move toward, you know, these standard fees throughout, and then have exceptions for things that you might want to incentivize. So rather than each one having different levels and so forth, have a cleaner...you know, these are the fees for everything, and then exceptions for workforce housing, or...or whatever things the Council may want to incentivize. So I just wanted to plant that seed, that that might be a way to approach some of the things that I've been hearing Members bring up. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director. Member Paltin, third round?

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: I was...I didn't ask Director McLean, I asked Ms. Ramos, but I was wondering where can...what is the current after-the-fact? Is it the same as a before-the-fact permit? Is there like any kind of penalty for just scofflawing [sic] and not getting a permit and doing the work?

MS. MCLEAN: Right now, the budget calls for a minimum fee of \$1,000 in addition to the regular application fee, plus up to 50 percent of project valuation.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: \$1,000 plus the permit fee up to...and that's a Administrative discretionary decision, whether or not it's up to 50 percent or not, or it doesn't always go to 50 percent?

MS. MCLEAN: Correct. So it's always \$1,000 plus the regular fee. And then on top of that, we can levy up to 50 percent of the valuation.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Have you ever done that?

MS. MCLEAN: Not to my recollection.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Because most times it's just accidental?

MS. MCLEAN: Most times it's that the after-the-fact work is relatively minor, and we...we cite...you know, we'll cite them with a violation, and then there will be fees that go along with the violation. So we assess those fees, rather than the...assessing more for the after-the-fact.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: All right, okay. Even if it's like a person that we're having continual emails about, and things like that, we'll...

MS. MCLEAN: Well, also being mindful--and if Corp. Counsel's in the meeting, they would probably want me to say this--that we have to be consistent in how we do this, and if we start invoking that up to 50 percent, we need to have a basis for doing so, and

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

make sure that we apply that same basis to similar situations in the future. So it's a...discretion is a...is a slippery slope.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Got it. Okay, thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay. Now...now you've given me questions. Okay, I'm going to ask a few questions, and then we can take a recess. Okay. So regarding the after-the-fact permit, which sometimes...you know, on Moloka'i, there was one guy who removed a sand dune here because it would be cheaper to pay the \$1,000, than to get a before-the-fact permit. So how was that \$1,000 determined? Like, what Administrative cost or what was that?

MS. MCLEAN: Well, that...that's a that's a flat fee in the budget. There is no discretion over that. It says the after-the-fact fee is \$1,000 plus the permit fee.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Are there Administrative costs that would have been analyzed to determine, like, how much that cost, or...

MS. MCLEAN: No, that...that...again, that's just a flat fee in the budget. There's...we can't charge less. We can charge more, getting into that 50 percent, but it's...it's rare that we do.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. That was the...is there a reason that the after-the-fact permit wasn't included in the study? Sorry if you did answer that.

MS. RAMOS: Oh, I...I was just going to say that...so that's a...it's a penalty, and so the...the County has discretion to determine what those penalties are, because penalties are not based on cost, they're meant to disincentivize. So those types of permits, those types of penalties, were not...that...that wasn't included in it. So what we looked at was, if you pulled the permit, if you...if you did the right thing, and you went through the process the way it was meant to be...to be done, what would that cost be? Because like Michele said, the...the cost to...if you...if you...if you did it without getting the permit, not only would you have to pay the permit fee that you should have paid, but then you would pay at least the additional \$1,000. And I think that...I mean, that is certainly something that the...that the Council or the Commission could look at and say is \$1,000 too low now? I don't know when that...that penalty was determined, but you could always look at increasing what that...what that penalty is. Because that does not need to be cost based, because it's...again, it's meant to be a disincentive. It's not meant to recover staff time or staff costs, because that's...that's the actual permit that they are also going to pay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for the explanation. Okay. Member...Member Paltin, fourth round?

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: No, just a point of information. Page 57 on the Charter doesn't allow for penalties over \$1,000 per day, so that's probably about the \$1,000; Section 13-10.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

So we probably couldn't assess more than \$1,000 for the penalty, unless it's an illegal TVR, then it could be 20,000. But I heard --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Or it's --

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: *(Audio interference)* --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- multiple days. Unless it's multiple days.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, but then that would be...daily fines, I think, is up to the discretion of the Director. So that was just a point of information.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay. All right, any other questions? Fifth round, anyone? No takers? Okay. Director McLean, did you want to give any closing statements, or Ms. Ramos?

MS. MCLEAN: Courtney, do you have any closing statements?

MS. RAMOS: I...I do not, other than to say thank you all very much for...for this opportunity, and for all of the great questions that you asked.

MS. MCLEAN: And thank you, Courtney, for your...for your great work. I...I don't know what the Chair's intention is with this item, but I think our operating budgets were due to the Budget Office Monday, and...but I let them know that the Committee would be taking this item up, and that I wanted to gauge what the sense was. So I probably will submit to them, a revision to the fee structure, with some type of cost recovery. I need to decide what to include and what percentage to go for. And if the Committee meets again on this, of course, I'm happy to...to join, and to convey any changes that you might want to see, so that what you get from the Budget Office from the Mayor for FY'23, we'll include what you'd like to see. Certainly, you can make changes of your own at that time, but I'd like to try to make it easy, so that what you ultimately want to see, we...we get in there as soon as possible. And thanks again for scheduling this. I know it was a little bit of a crunch to get it in, but I wanted to try to get it incorporated into our budget.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director McLean. I'll be in touch with you, and we can try to schedule it as quickly as possible, so that we can make some policy decisions together to help with any potential amendments to share with the Mayor for the budget.

MS. MCLEAN: Great. Thank you so much.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, again, Ms. Ramos, for your work on this, and mahalo, Director McLean, aloha. Okay, Members, so we will defer BFED-105. Are there any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. It's 3:11. Ten minutes? How about 3:25? 3:25? Okay, so we'll return at 3:25. It's 3:12 on November 17th, and the Budget, Finance, and Economic Development Committee is now in recess. . . .(gavel). . .

RECESS: 3:12 p.m.

RECONVENE: 3:27 p.m.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: . . .(gavel). . . The Budget, Finance, and Economic Development Committee please return to order. It's 3:27 on November 17th.

ITEM 33: RESERVED RESIDENTIAL PARKING AND TOURIST PARKING FEES IN PUBLIC BEACH ACCESS PARKING AREAS (CC 21-174, CC 21-176)

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: The next item that we have on today's agenda is BFED-33, Reserved Residential Parking and Tourist Parking Fees in Public Beach Access Parking Areas. Okay, as we have heard in multiple public testimony periods, local residents often struggle to enjoy our County beaches because of a lack of available parking due to tourist traffic. The bill posted under this item today is one step toward addressing this issue. The other topic before us today is the possibility of charging tourists parking fees at County-owned beach access parking areas. We are joined by representatives from various County Departments, as well as the State Department of Land and Natural Resources. If there are no objections, I would like to designate Mr. Scott Fretz and Mr. Peter Landon of the Department of Land and Natural Resources as resource personnel in accordance with Rule 18(A) of the Rules of the Council. Are there any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Members. Okay. All right. So we have...aloha, Mr. Fretz and Mr. Landon. There we go.

MR. LANDON: Hello, everyone. Thanks for having me. I...I think Scott's out for this one, so it's just me.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Sorry about that. Thank you so much for joining us today. And then we also have the Department of Parks and Recreation, and the Department of Public Works. Director Karla Peters and Director Dagdag-Andaya?

MS. PETERS: Aloha, Chair. Good afternoon, Committee.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for joining us. And then do we have...okay, oh, there, yes.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

MS. DAGDAG-ANDAYA: Aloha, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Aloha. Okay, mahalo for joining us, Director Dagdag-Andaya and Director Peters. Teñe was our greeting from Estonia. It means hello. Okay. So the two bills that we have were introduced by myself, and I recognize that the Administration has been working on Park Maui, and perhaps they'll change their name, as Member King suggested, to be more indicative of what Park Maui is about. And so the two bills are to...so I have questions for Mr. Landon. I don't know if you reviewed the bill, but I know that where you are, you don't charge residents parking; is that correct?

MR. LANDON: Yeah, so we only charge nonresidents, but we don't have any reserved stalls for residents or anything like that. But our parking lot is pretty good sized.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. And the way that you waive the fee for residents is the machine is able to scan the driver's license?

MR. LANDON: No, it...it doesn't scan a driver's license. I...I think the newer version of the machine can do your magnetic stripe, kind of like, you know, when you go certain stores or whatever and they card you, they swipe it. Ours one does not, but the way our rules are written is that you have to have a Hawai'i State ID or driver's license. So for the most part, people are pretty honest about it. The only time I...I run into any issue whatsoever is the people that apparently own some sort of property, you know, even guys that have timeshare, stuff like that. And...and they say, well, we're residents. And I said, well, okay, well, do you have your ID? And they'd say, no, I don't have an ID, because of whatever reason, right? But then I...I stop them right now, I point them to the rule, which is, like I said, clearly written, that a resident...resident is determined by the, you know, ID, basically. So you could have a State ID, which is, I guess a little bit easier to get, I don't think so anymore, I think it's pretty much you got to show two forms of residency and things like that. But I think it used to be easier to get a State ID. I'm not sure, you know, I mean, if that works out for people that want to keep their...say, their Texas or their California driver's license, or that comes with a little bit of perks. But yeah, I...I don't really have any problems with it. You know, the other one that I tell them too, is that it's easy to scan the license plate of a vehicle. Law enforcement can do that. They can find out exactly who the vehicle's registered to. You know, obviously, if it's a rental car, it's registered to a business and things of that nature. And there's always an address for the...for the person on file, things like that. But we don't really ever have to go that far. I...I have not yet actually employed the use of enforcement to, you know, push the issue with anybody. So simply stating that, you know, the Hawai'i ID is your way to determine your residency, it seems to work for us. In recent months, we have gone one step further. We want everybody to get a pass, and we always tell, you know, nonresidents and residents alike, that they have to go to the machine, they have to get a pass. It's super easy for the resident to get a pass, they just walk up to the machine and simply select resident. But we're changing the rule as we speak, so that all vehicles must display a pass, or else you could be towed. So the residents that want

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

to kind of buck us and they're like, I don't need a pass, I'm a resident, right? Well, okay, now you need a pass, and if you don't get a pass, we'll tow your vehicle out of there. And you know, that gets a little bit of like kind of grumbles, but they...you know, I...I always return any...any negativity with, you know, like everybody wants the tourists to pay, right? So, like, when they see you go to the machine, they're not going to question it, right, because everybody's getting a pass, right? And they're like, oh, okay, yeah, yeah, well, it's still dumb. Okay, but thank you, right? So it...it...it's really not an issue. Like I said, we just...we say Hawai'i ID, but we don't really have a way to back it up, unless I go and ID you, basically, same thing with law enforcement. They can do that, but doesn't really need to get to that point, I guess. We might...if...if we really, you know, profile everybody and watch everybody like a hawk, I mean, we might make \$25 more in a day, on a day that we make, you know, \$3-, \$400, so it's...to me, it's not really worth the effort to be that strict either.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that feedback. Okay. And so you said that the parking area is large enough, so...so there really isn't a need to reserve residential, or resident parking?

MR. LANDON: No, we have 52 stalls. There's one exception to this rule. When the surf is heavy on the South Shore, Dumps is kind of a premier spot, so there's usually a little bit of confusion, right? Like, the first day or so of the swell, the...you know, the tourists, they don't really understand that it's not a good day to snorkel, and they'll kind of like all show up together. Like, you know, the surfers are there, then 9:00 hour rolls around, you get a lot of people coming in wanting to snorkel. Usually there's a Staff present to kind of field that and let people know, hey, it's not good to get in. But if you guys remember, we had that one, like, super swell in August. I...I had to just, like, literally stand on the beach and keep people from crossing from one end of the beach to the other, because they just really didn't understand, like, hey, you might walk over there, and then when you get halfway across, like here comes, you know, a 20-foot wave that's going to take you out on the inside. So that...that was a...a good kind of eye opener for a lot of people. But yeah, when the surf is up, we got a little bit of an issue, but I...I've just been real cordial with people and like, you know, let them park on the side, move cones around. You know, I even opened up our small compound during that event, just because there was so many people. But like I said, in the year and a half that we've been in operations, that was a one-time thing. So I can imagine where people would appreciate a resident spot, but at the same time, it...it...it hasn't been a real need for us.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo for that information. Last question, and I'll open the floor to the Members. Is there a time limit, or a maximum amount of time that the...the parking pass would allow?

MR. LANDON: No, it's...it's an all day, so it just has an expiration time on it, so it expires the day that you buy it at 7:30 p.m. And that...couple times I had to lock people in who didn't really pay attention to the...to the time, and they were nowhere to be found. Obviously, we didn't just like roll up and lock somebody in there, but we had to look around and couldn't figure out what...what was going on, nobody on the beach, so a

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

couple cars got locked in, but even that's a pretty rare event down there. I mean, it probably happened more often at, you know, some of the parks in South Maui than it would ever down there. But yeah, no...no expiration.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Landon. Okay, Members, do you have any questions for any of our resources? I forgot to mention that we also have Ms. Julie Dixon on. She's president of the Dixon Resources Unlimited. And I believe, and she can correct me if I get this wrong, is a consultant for Park Maui under the Department of Management. Okay, I see a question from Member Sugimura. And I'll put --

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- three minutes on the clock.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you. Nice seeing you here, Peter. And good job. Now, you've made an improvement on your...on your management of that parking area, so thank you. I actually wanted to just clarify that the...the item in the IT Committee is no longer called Park Maui because of Member King's comments. It's called Management of County-Owned Parking in High Access Areas, IT-71. So we made that change in my committee, but maybe not in other written areas. But Chair, I...I understand this, and I'll just wait for other questions to go by and discussions in...as it relates to the ordinance. I don't have a question for Mr. Landon or Ms. Dixon.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, and we also have Director Dagdag-Andaya, and Director Peters. Okay, mahalo, Member Sugimura. Member King.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, thank you, Chair. My...I'm not sure who...who to ask this question of, because I'm not sure if Peter would know the answer to this. I think one of the reasons for any kind of parking restrictions that we do on anything should be to try and encourage more mass transit. And so probably not to 'Ahihi Kina'u, but maybe...maybe either Director Dagdag-Andaya or Director Peters knows if...if there are shuttles available. There used to be shuttles available from the resort areas in South Maui that went...just went along South Kihei Road. So are...if we do something like this, what's being proposed, what...do you think that would encourage more tourists to take shuttles to get to the beach so they wouldn't need to park?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Director Dagdag-Andaya, you said?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Or...or well...or...or Director Peters, I'm not sure who would answer that.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, whoever is the most appropriate for this question.

MS. DAGDAG-ANDAYA: Chair, this is Rowena. I'm not aware of any requirements for hotels that...to offer shuttles, but I...I know...my understanding is, for certain resorts, they offer shuttles. I just don't know whether...where they take their...their guests. I know

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

they have shuttles to and from the shopping areas to...to restaurants. But for the Department of Public Works, we don't make any requirements of resorts to have shuttles or public transport --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, I know there's no requirements, but there used to be that Kā'anapali trolley that would go up and down from Kā'anapali to Lāhainā a while ago. And there was one in South Maui that used to take tourists to different stops along South Kihei Road. So I don't know. Do you know, Director Peters, if...if that's still happening, or if maybe if we do these parking restrictions, they...that would encourage the hotels to start doing shuttles again?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And Member King, Ms. Dixon did comment in the chat. So after Director Peters, perhaps she can also provide additional information.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Member King. So I'm not sure about the trolley or any type of organized transportation...mass transportation in the districts, but I would assume that if you...if we do have paid parking, they may want to utilize these systems more often. And Julie...I would defer to Julie. She's the expert in this area.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Maybe Julie can answer that question.

MS. DIXON: Yes, and I just was able to unmute. Can you hear me okay now?

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yes.

MS. DIXON: Okay, and I apologize for not being on camera. I'm actually in transit today. So again, thank you for having us today, and I appreciate the opportunity. So on the project, again, we are calling it Park Maui for right now, but it's really the holistic parking management opportunity for the County throughout basically the entire island. And we are actually working directly with the Department of Transportation, so that we can actually integrate as much of mass transit into the parking management solution, so that we can encourage access and accessibility for everyone. And I wanted to also let you all know that there's a significant resident piece in this solution. And a little bit different than Mr. Landon's location is that the Maui parking locations for the County will not necessarily be attended. And so we very much have to be mindful of the fact that we want to be sure that the solution will be as efficient and effective as possible for our community members and locals into that solution. And we're getting very, very close to being able to present, especially to County Staff and to the leadership, about that proposed approach. And I just wanted to be sure that you all knew that it really does incorporate our residents as the priority, to make sure that they're tied in to that solution.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. So is there any intent to...like if we do block off some space...spots for...oh, did the timer go off?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, I'm sorry. I couldn't hear it.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Second round.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Member King. Okay. Member Sinenci.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Thank you, Chair. And yeah, I just had a quick question for Mr. Landon. So for down in Makena, you guys don't have a reservation system. So what happens when you're at capacity, do you guys turn...turn away cars?

MR. LANDON: Yeah, kind of. Like, we...you know, like I said, the whole surfing crowd is a whole 'nother thing. But yeah, in general, if it was a...you know, a regular day, and we hit capacity, you know, once in a while, around 11:00-ish, you know, and then we'll...we'll let people know that they have to wait. I've never seen anybody wait more than 10 or 20 minutes. I mean, they literally, like, circle by, and by that time somebody's kind of coming out already, and they...you know, they get...they get their blinker on or whatever and maybe wait for them to put their gear away before they drive off. But yeah, aside from...you know, it's...it's real touch and go. Like I don't...I definitely don't ever want to offend any locals, and, you know, I mean, surfers are another one of those populations like hunters, like they just...they're...they don't care, right? Like they're not going to listen to a whole lot of like, oh, could you just wait a minute, or...you know what I mean? So like those guys, yeah, I...I...I've...I've just figured out solutions to make more room and not necessarily worry about the...them being in a stall. But yeah, in a regular situation, we'll...we will, you know, let people know, hey, you cannot park over here if they try to pull over in front of the gate or...there's a few places we have an area kind of striped off where we don't allow people to park because we're the only place down there where like a larger truck could turn around. So even if...even like the fire truck, right, like, he cannot turn around, except for if he goes all the way down to La Perouse, or he comes into our parking lot. But even construction vehicles and other types of service vehicles, we are the...the...the turnaround spot. So that's...that's one of the reasons why we don't just allow the random parking outside of the...the stalls. But yes, we do turn people away in normal...normal circumstances.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Mahalo. Thank you. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. Members, any additional questions? Questions from anyone else for round one? If not, I'm going to go back to Member King for round two.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. Thank you, Chair. So one of my questions was about enforcement, and whether...I don't know if Ms. Dixon or somebody else wants to...is there...do you anticipate...if we're just going to have these spots marked out for residents and, say, nonresidents are parking, would you anticipate having, like, meter maids that...that put notes on their car, or are they just going to be...is somebody going to periodically go through there and decide who has to be towed?

MS. DIXON: A great question, and if I could be unmuted again...can you hear me okay? Sorry. Okay, perfect. So in fact, part of the plan is a parking ambassador model, which will provide those resources that go out and monitor the Parks and Rec parking locations, as well as various town parking requirements, to ensure that there's compliance. It is intended to be customer service-centric so that we can ensure that we're putting out warning notices, because we do want folks to have a positive experience, but ultimately enforcing the policies as they're posted, including citations, ultimately potentially towing if there's safety or public safety risks. But yes, there is a parking ambassador model that will support the entire service.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I like that, parking ambassador. That sounds better than meter maid. Sounds less sexist too. And then the other question I had was about the bill itself, because there's reference to recreational use, but there...there's no differentiation between commercial recreational and residential recreational. So I'm assuming that we don't want people using those parking spots if they have a commercial operation pertinent to recreation at the beach, like, you know, someone's renting out surfboards can't park in those...those lots...those...those spaces for residents. That would be, I guess, a question for you, Chair. So maybe we need to differentiate that...that's all...because it just says if nonresidents are parked in designated stalls reserved for Maui County residents, and then it says it's...all parking access must reserve at least half a dozen named parking spots for Maui County residents, and it goes on to explain that they have to be for using the beach for recreation purposes. But I'm just worried that some of the commercial operations consider themselves recreational, that's all. I just --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, if it's...if, you know, we want to be more specific and, you know, explicitly saying recreational is not commercial, then...

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Right. Yeah, I think that would be a good idea. Because there's...there's a lot of people who go out there and rent stuff on their own, and probably illegally, but we don't want those kinds of people using those spots either. Or food trucks, or somebody attending to the recreational population. That's...that's all --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: I did see Director Peters' video pop on if she wanted to add any comment to Member King's question?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Member King. So in our CORA Admin rules, it does allow for only one parking stall per permit. So the car operator is only allowed

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

that one stall, and then all of their equipment needs to be hauled in, and any trailers . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . type needs to be removed.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: But they would be considered...they would be able to use the resident spots, or no?

MS. PETERS: The rules...they...it doesn't dictate in...our CORA rules does not dictate what stall they have. We don't have assigned stalls. They would have to find one within the beach park parking. So that's something that maybe we could look towards aligning, both this proposed legislation with our CORA Admin rules.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. All right. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member King. Member Molina. Oh, sorry --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- Pro Tem Kama, and then Member Molina. My apology.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: No worries.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Mr. Molina. So I...I wanted to hear more about the plan that Julie Dixon is talking about. Because I feel like I don't have my head wrapped around this whole parking thing. When I hear from Mr. DLNR, Mr. Landon, I'm...I'm...and I'm sure he's from the State side, but I'm kind of curious as to how many parks are we're talking about on the County side, and...and I do like the parking ambassador title. I think it's great too. I kind of like...like I need to know more about where we're at in all of this. I like the idea, though, about having our people not charged for parking. I like the idea that commercial enterprises have got to pay, but I'd like what we're doing...but I'd like to hear more, Chair, from Ms. Dixon.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Sure. You have specific questions for Ms. Dixon? You want to know how...how many parking --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I'd like to hear what her plan is regarding parking, Chair.

MS. DIXON: Chair, could you just repeat the last piece? I didn't hear...quite hear the...the plan for, and I couldn't quite hear what she said.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Yeah, so Pro Tem Kama, this isn't a...so the...today's meeting's purpose is related to the two bills that are on the agenda, and not a presentation on Park Maui. I...I think that's in Member Sugimura's IT Committee, where we're discussing their presentation. But if you have specific questions associated with the...with the bills, and so the --

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: I...I only got one bill, Chair, that was the one about the public beach access parking. But I don't...I couldn't find a second bill. So I just want you to

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

know that. So maybe I'm not...maybe I'm missing something that I should be looking at. And that's why I'm not almost on the same page.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Tem Kama. I misspoke. The tourist...whatever it's called...Tourist Parking Fees in Public Beach Access Parking Areas does not have a bill, it was a subject matter referral. My apologies.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Oh, okay, well --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: One bill.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: -- in preparation for...thank you. Okay. Okay. Okay. So thank you, Chair, for clarifying that for me. Thank you, Ms. Dixon.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Did you want to ask Ms. Dixon about how many parking lots there are?

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: If she has an answer, that would be good for me to know so I could wrap my head around what it is that we're...and how we...and what...we're going to make that budget next year too. So thank you. So yes, if you could, Ms. Dixon.

MS. DIXON: Yes.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Ms. Dixon --

MS. DIXON: Sure.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- for beach...beach parking lots. County-managed --

MS. DIXON: I will. Definitely, I would absolutely refer to the Director for Parks and Recreation. But the one thing, if I could add in regards to setting aside 50 percent of the inventory, that would be something that would not be part of a recommendation for the Park Maui approach. Because we want to be able to promote parking availability and access, and that that includes residents. And you would typically not set aside reserved parking spaces for that because we want to be able to provide that ease of ingress and egress. And so I just wanted to be sure to put that out there, as that part of the bill does somewhat contradict with what the intentions of Park Maui and the approach of...the support of some of the paid parking models. And you typically would not set aside that reservation or reserve spaces. It kind of goes against all the, say, parking industry methods and methodology, and especially because a lot of the locations will not be attended. And I just wanted to be sure to put that on everybody's radar.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Dixon. Director Peters?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. So we have 65 beach parks, all with various sizes of parking lots and parking stall counts. So we could provide that for you in writing if

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

need...if you would...if you would like that. Julie did help us look at the South Maui beach parks, so I have that readily available if need be. We haven't analyzed any of the other districts just yet, but I could provide the parking size...parking lot sizes and stalls if you would like.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Director Peters.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: *(Audio interference)*

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Pro Tem Kama. Okay, Member Molina, followed by Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. Just a quick question for Mr. Landon. You know, sounds like you're in a potentially risky business, yeah, because you get some unruly people that don't like rules. At the peak times, how many of you are on duty besides yourself?

MR. LANDON: Normally, we have one guy around the area every day for around...you know, in...in the core hours of about 9:00 to 2:00, then that was prior to COVID. Nowadays, you know, you could go down there three, four days a week, and maybe see no one. It just depends on...on the day of the week. But we kind of have taken a step back from really approaching people as...as they kind of get out of their vehicles and stuff. I mean, prior to COVID, we had a whole campaign where, you know, if you get out of the car and obviously you're on vacation, you know, we try to size you up and go and talk to you about sunscreen, about where to get in and out of the ocean. You know, the first kind of question out of our mouths is like, hey, how's it going? Have you ever been here before? Can I offer you any advice, tips, you know, sunscreen stuff. When I see people spraying chemical sunscreens, like we've talked about before, you know, I'll approach them with our sunscreen buyer's cards, you know, and ask them, you know, how they're doing and try to spread...the spread the information. But yeah, lately it's kind of hit or miss whether or not you're going to see somebody down there. But I will throw this out there. It's...it's a pretty interesting thing, but I can tell you that I don't have to be out there. All I got to do is park my car outside of the gate. And that alone is, like, enough for people to just not even think about, like, trotting by and going to look before they pay, and all these kinds of things. If there's nobody around, say, you know, like we haven't been there, and I show up around like noon or something and the parking lot's full, and I take a walk through and assess all the vehicles, I might find a handful of people that either didn't pay, or it appears that they got a resident tag instead of paying the 5 bucks for the nonresident. You know, but like I said, if I put my car out there and say, you know, I...I go in the trailer and eat lunch and, you know, and have a meeting or something, I can come out two, three hours later, and everybody's in full compliance. So there's...there's a lot of ways that you can get around, like just, you know, not being there, I think. I...I think just, you know, with the County especially, you have PD that's kind of roaming around all the time anyway. Like, I don't...I don't see an MPD unless I call them out there, right? Our DOCARE officers are around one to two patrols a day, but they kind of central...I mean, they

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

kind of concentrate their...their patrols in...in the morning hours or in the evening hours when, you know, we're not around, and fishing is...is...is better. But yeah --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay.

MR. LANDON: -- on a typical day, one guy, you know lately, maybe not one guy . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . but I think there are ways to get around the actual like having to patrol all the time.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Okay, thank you. I appreciate it, because I was going to ask you to if you ever had to call the police for any potential altercation, you know. Your safety too is very important, obviously. Yeah. So okay.

MR. LANDON: Yeah. No, I've never run into any confrontations like that or anything. You know, mostly, if you want me to stereotype, it's usually like, you know, women that want to argue about this, and I don't know why. But the husbands are, like, whipping out the wallets and they're like, you know, this is just ridiculous. . . . *(laughing)*. . . I don't know why, but it happens.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay. Okay, I better stop you right there, Mr. Landon. Okay, then. Thank you, Chair. I know I went over. But when you deem it appropriate, can...can we ask Director Dagdag-Andaya? Because I know Director Peters mentioned there's like 65 County parks, and I presume there's enough funding for paint and signage and whatnot. So whenever you deem it, you can ask that question on my behalf to the Director? Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Well, and we can have another round. The timer went off. So I'll come back for...for that response, Director. And Mr. Landon, that's one of the perks, or one of the good things about having a female Budget Chair, I guess, huh? And we'll advocate for hazardous pay on your behalf. Okay, Member Paltin, followed by Member Sugimura...yeah. Okay.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you, Chair. I think my question is for Ms. Dixon. And I know that Director Peters was saying she has, like, South Maui, but for West Maui, a lot of our beach parking, like, if we were to implement paid parking, we would need to do it, I think, in coordination with private property owners. Because I think that implementing paid parking would drive folks to the surrounding areas, and away from County parking. And so I just was wondering...I know I mentioned this with Ms. Wade before, and all the other times that we talked about it, I just was wondering if you had any input on that. Like, for example, D.T. Fleming's, we have like maybe 25 stalls, if you're lucky, on the County side, but the Kapalua Resort side has maybe double or triple of that.

MS. DIXON: Yes, ma'am, you've hit it on the head. It's actually one of the aspects of why the program hasn't been brought, I'll say, to the surface level yet. Because we have to anticipate, what you've described is called spillover parking. So that as we're looking at this comprehensively, we need to be sure that we're safeguarding and protecting our

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

neighborhoods, to ensure that just because there's policies at different locations, we don't want people to spill over into the nearby residential neighborhoods, or also onto private property locations. And so that's actually part of a comprehensive approach that we're actually taking as we speak, as we build the policies associated with the program.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Do you need us to, like, enact legislation to allow for the County to go into partnership with other private lots, so that, you know, it's standardized? Like, I know...I think Merriman's, the tennis garden area, they already charge like \$10 parking. And before valet starts, they charge over there. Like, do you need us to enact legislation for, like, say, you know, all the public beach access parking in Kā'anapali or something like that, in order to partner with these other entities that have the access parking? And like, you know, let us run and do it all together? Or can you just do that on your own?

MS. DIXON: No, you're hitting it on the head. So you're actually...we're...we're working on an entire County Code update specifically regarding parking, parking management Countywide. And that's one of the efforts, as it comes forward, that will be part of that process. So there's an aspect that we're working with County Counsel right now on the reviews of those Code updates and the proposed legislation. And that package will basically proceed forward then for leadership review. But that's absolutely part of that package. And what you're describing, we call it shared parking agreements, very . . . *(timer sounds)* . . . much kind of in the realm of public private partnerships. And that's absolutely the intent as we move forward.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, awesome. You guys got it covered. I'll let you write the legislation then. Perfect. Thanks.

MS. DIXON: Thank you so much.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Member Sugimura.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. So Tamara and I went to visit Peter Landon at 'Ahihi Nui, and saw him in action January of this year, and then I did go to where Five Palms is for a wedding, and saw the parking there by the hotel. And it was half empty because all of those are designated for the hotel, and the rest were jam packed with residents. And then there's a parking lot next door, and then now there's an agreement, I'm trying to get a EO...EO for Keawekapu. So this is my question. I saw the efficiency Peter Landon, or that operation, that has an actual parking...a payment structure there, right? And of course, he's there, he's like the concierge for that parking lot, really. And...and just listening to him and how he's got this wired, versus having an open parking lot at the Five Palms area, is...my question to the Parks Department is, are you considering doing a pilot project in maybe South Maui, West Maui, and setting up these paying structures so that people can do what Peter's talking about? Everybody, if you're a...if you're a resident or...or visitor, you go to the machine, you get the tag, you put it in, and you're not...if you're a visitor, then you pay \$5, I think was his charge, and everybody else is free. But you know, are you...are

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

you planning on implementing a system like that, or are you going to leave it just open parking for whoever, and honor system? I guess, what is the plan?

MS. PETERS: Thank you, Chair. Thank you, Member Sugimura. Right now, we are working with the Department of Management, and especially Julie, in coming up with that plan. I know that there is...there has been some discussion of doing eight pilots parking lots, and I'll defer to Julie on the actual implementation of a machine, and that type of equipment that is being looked at.

MS. DIXON: Yes, ma'am. Thank you. We're actually intending...it's going to be a combination of solutions that will include people can use their mobile devices to manage their parking experience, they can use a kiosk. A lot of it will depend upon the location, and also making sure that the proximity, also signal strength for communications, those are a lot of the details that we're having to assess right now. But one of the things that's really important is we need to make sure that whatever solution is put into place is that it's equitable and also accessible. Because not everybody has a cell phone, not everybody has a credit card. So we're really trying to incorporate that opportunity. So again, for resident access, that we'll be able to leverage...the hope is that they'll be able to register their license plates, and that's actually going to be one of the most efficient ways to manage . . . *(timer sounds)*. . . the program, so that you'll be able to register your license plate to qualify for the program. But more details on that for sure.

COUNCILMEMBER SUGIMURA: Thank you. Thank you very much.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sugimura. Okay, I have some questions. Okay. Mr. Landon, I know you're getting a new machine that would be able to scan licenses possibly. What do you think of the idea of--and maybe you...you already do something like this--having...okay, so if you have, like, one parking fee, like, let's say it's \$20. And then if you watch an educational video about the place that you're about to go and enjoy, then you get, like, half off and you get...like it...then parking is only \$10. And then that way, people will get to watch a safety video and, like, a cultural education video and...you know, get that kind of information. And it incentivizes them by getting a discount on parking.

MR. LANDON: I...I...I think that's a good idea. I mean, I...you know, I have young kids, and I see the same kind of model when you...you know, when you have an app, and you have to watch an ad to get like another coin to keep playing along and things like that. So I think people would kind of understand the idea real well. I think you'd have to employ that in some sort of digital format. I don't think you'll find a machine that will really do that. But yeah, if you have the pay by phone and, you know, it's like...or even when you watch your streaming service, right, it's like, oh, do you want to watch a thirty-minute ad where you got to push a button, or do you want to like watch three minutes' worth of ads, right? And I think that would be really good because, you know, the...the information could always be changed and, you know, adapted to whatever needs might...you might have at certain parks and what have you. I think it's a great idea.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Mr. Landon. Okay. And then I...I guess my question is for Ms. Dixon. The study that you're working on, does it incorporate and factor in quality of life for residents, or is it purely economic?

MS. DIXON: No, in fact, it's actually...this is the outcome of the parking action plan, which actually, quality of life was a big part of that. And the...when we did the parking action plan, it actually focused initially on the two towns, Wailuku and...as well as Lāhainā. And there was actually extensive resident outreach, and we had community members participating in a substantial number of community outreach meetings over that period of time. And now this is absolutely about the implementation of that parking action plan. And it really takes into account the needs and priorities of the residents. And that's why that I...I'll call it the protection of the neighborhoods and factors like that are so important. It's not just about pulling the trigger and making this program happen. It's really about making sure that we're looking at all those safeguards, and ensuring . . .*(timer sounds)*. . . again, that equitability and access is a priority.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Dixon. Okay, Members, any other questions? Member Paltin.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Ms. Dixon, would you mind sharing your email with us, so we can work on that legislation?

MS. DIXON: Absolutely. I'll put it in the chat and I'll...so you'll have it. And I also want to reference Erin Wade, who I know she had a personal challenge this evening, so she couldn't be here, and Erin is our direct point of contact as well. But I'll be sure to type it into the chat so you'll have it.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Awesome. So Erin Wade.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Okay, any other questions? I'm going to ask...okay. Okay, oh, Member Molina, you had your question? Okay.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Oh, oh, yeah. Could we get that response from Director Dagdag-Andaya?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Director Dagdag-Andaya?

MS. DAGDAG-ANDAYA: Chair, so just going back to the question, again, that relates to the...the installation of signage? I'm sorry, if you could repeat the question, I'd appreciate that.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Yeah. Oh, yeah. I just wanted to know, Madam Director, if you have enough funding for striping the stalls, paint, and for signage?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

MS. DAGDAG-ANDAYA: Okay, thank you, Chair. We would have to, again, budget for that and have...determine, you know, just the amount of paint required, the amount of signage required. Typically, you know, this sounds like a General Fund type of activity, not necessarily Highway Fund. And Highway Fund is what's used to fund our Highways Division operation. So it could likely be a...like, an interfund transfer or something that we work with...work it out with the Parks Department. So Parks Department could indicate, you know, the...the park areas that need to be addressed, we could put together a cost estimate, and then work with them on scheduling and labor, equipment, materials needed in order to do the necessary improvements.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, great. Thank you. Thank you, Madam Chair.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. And if I recall correctly, I think we did put some funding into this year's Budget, unless I pulled it. It was one of my priority items. It was for signage and paint, based on a roll out of...I think it was like ten parking lots to start. So there...there's some funding, if we didn't take it out. Okay. All right. Okay. I think...I don't see any more hands, and I'll save my questions for another time. Member King, you have questions? And then we'll go to the next item.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Oh, okay. Thank you. Yeah, I just wanted to ask Ms. Dixon, because it sounded like you had other ideas besides...besides marking off spaces for residents. So in your plan, is...is...is it...when you're looking at either doing something like this, or paid parking for tourists versus residents, or did you not have either of those in your plan?

MS. DIXON: The plan is actually to provide the residential park...sorry, residents get free parking at the paid parking locations, is the intention. And there could also be, if there are special events, severely discounted parking opportunities. And what we're trying to do, again, is leverage convenience, so that especially for the remote locations, they'll really be able to kind of come and go as they please. And rather setting aside 50 percent of the parking assets, you can actually allow the residents to, you know, park at free will wherever they want to park in the parking lot, and not limit it to 50 percent of the spaces. I think if the intention is to be sure that there's parking available for residents, I think we can incorporate that into the plan, so that we can try to tackle that. But I just wanted to set aside and recognize the fact that we want to be sure that there's ample parking available to the residents, and making sure that it is not at...not charged.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. And then you're planning...you...you are moving towards addressing the beach parking around the island?

MS. DIXON: Yes, and in fact...in fact, we've been working with the Parks and Recreation Group and the director there, and preparing for that deployment and roll out.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay. All right, thank you. Thank you, Chair.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

MS. DIXON: Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member King. Okay, since you asked those questions, I'll just ask two of my questions then. Ms. Dixon, so it...so it sounds like you are factoring into your analysis reserved residential parking?

MS. DIXON: So residential parking for...so the neighborhood, I want to make sure there's two terms. So there's resident parking, which basically means that if I'm a resident of Maui that I can park at, you know, the various, I'll call it soon-to-be potential paid parking locations, at no cost. And then there's also residential parking, which is basically making sure that we don't have spill over into the neighborhoods. So I want to be sure to distinguish the difference between those two. And having read this bill and hearing the feedback, understanding that we need to ensure that there's availability for resident parking at the different locations, we'll make sure that that's incorporated into the technology solution. I would just suggest that reserved parking is something that, as a parking industry, it's never recommended, because then you basically have potential of empty parking spaces. In some cases, half of the parking lot could sit empty in some cases. And so you always want to try to maximize the assets. And so hearing the prioritization of making sure that there is resident parking available, if you'll allow us the opportunity to come back to you all with recommendations associated with that, I would love...I...I'd love to be able to build that into the solution. I'm not prepared today to tell you how that would be done. I want to put pen to paper, and make sure that we're cognizant of that particular prioritization, so that we can figure out how that fits into the plan.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, great. And it could be some kind of a compromise, where we know that there won't be empty stalls, and that's definitely on the weekends when residents generally have time off, and more residents aren't working and would like to take their family to the beach. And so, you know, reserving 50 percent parking for residents for availability, I...I doubt there will be any empty stalls.

MS. DIXON: No, I appreciate that. And one of the things that we want to get the County into the position of is being able to leverage data to make data-based decisions. And so there's a lot of opportunities that I think we can tie in this request into that solution. So I'm very confident that we'll be able to find a solution that will work, and that will definitely satisfy the needs of the community. And we'll just...I'll just ask rather than giving you some off-the-cuff response, I'd love to be able to go back to the formula, and really come back to you with something that's really a good fit for Maui.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Dixon. And then the last question, how are you getting feedback from residents, or are residents able to give you feedback on this study?

MS. DIXON: Yeah, great question. Well, again, the first phase was the parking action plan. So that part of it was done, and that was done about two years ago. And so we're just about to...first of all, we have to come to all of you, I want to make that clear. And so making sure that we're communicating to County leadership is key. There's been a lot

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

of work with Staff at this point, preparing to report out to leadership, and then that's when the community outreach efforts begin. So I think that that's going to be...not think, I know that that's going to be a big part of going into 2022, is that messaging, that outreach, those community conversations, so that we can talk about how it can work and getting that feedback. And so there's going to be a very significant hands-on, socially distanced, of course, conversation that will be had, once we basically bring the messaging towards you all, getting your feedback, and then again going out to the community as well. Because it's very important, we want to have a very realistic solution that's going to work for the County as a whole, and that's a big part of making sure that the residents, you know, are very happy with it. And that's a big part of the feedback that we received in the parking action plan as well.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, wonderful. And then will you also explore, like, ideas on, like, having incentives for educational videos and safety videos into the technology?

MS. DIXON: We already took...we already took note of your comment, and we were already chatting amongst ourselves. My colleague is sitting next to me. We were on the side of the road listening to the meeting, and we're...we've already taken note of that. I think there are some really creative ways that we can bring that to the table. So absolutely.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Awesome. Okay. All right. So I'll thank Ms. Dixon, Mr. Landon, Director Peters, and Director Dagdag-Andaya so much for joining us today for our meeting. I thought this was very productive. Mahalo, everyone. Mahalo, Members. Okay, if there are no objections, we'll defer BFED-33?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS.

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Wonderful. Mahalo, Members.

ITEM 85: LEGISLATION AND DISCUSSION ON THE EFFECT OF THE CORONAVIRUS PANDEMIC, RULES, CARES ACT, AND RELATED ISSUES (CC 20-207, CC 20-275)

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay, the last item on today's agenda is BFED-85 Legislation and Discussion on the Effects of the Coronavirus Pandemic Rules, CARES Act, and Related Issues, which includes ARPA funds. We have with us Budget Director Michele Yoshimura, Managing Director Sandy Baz, for this item. So...so I'll invite Managing Director on...I didn't see his video pop up. Okay, we'll...we'll see if...okay. We'll invite Budget Director Yoshimura to provide opening comments.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Thank you, Chair. Good afternoon, Members. Okay, so we are just about winding down with our CARES Act money. I think we have just a couple more that we have to close out, and then we'll be done and we can file our final report. We did start

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

with the ARPA money. The ARPA money, we did through software, or we did with AmpliFund, and, you know, you would be able to put in your application there, and then it'll be available for viewing by the public. So to date, we haven't had anybody put anything in yet, so...but we have run some tests, and it should be up and running and ready to go. But as far as the...any questions that you folks may have, I can try to answer them. We did send in a response on November 5th to questions from the Committee, and if anybody needs elaboration on those, I can try to provide you with further information. So Chair, I'll just wait for questions from the Committee. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Budget Director. Okay, and then Members, you'll see on Granicus, Item 111 and 112 are responses from the Budget Director and the Finance Director regarding questions that we had the last time this was scheduled. And so they provided information and background on those questions that you asked. Super excited about the software launch, and I...I wanted to also share, during testimony, we...we heard the other counties had some kind of interface on...online. So Kaua'i County has had OpenGov for, I think, seven years now. And so we just got OpenGov, and so, you know, we're...we're working our way through that. Hawai'i State Government also has OpenGov, and so they...they were able...they already had, you know, that going. And so we're...we're getting there with AmpliFund. Okay. And...oh, I'm sorry, and then we do have Deputy Director May-Anne Alibin from the Department of Finance. Okay, so those were the updates that I wanted to...oh, aloha, Deputy Director.

MS. ALIBIN: Good afternoon, Chair and Members.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. So I...I just wanted to make sure that the Members were aware of the questions that you asked, being responded to. And I know we...we have six minutes left of this meeting so that was really, you know, the purpose of agendizing this item. Does anyone have any burning questions? I don't want to take you over 4:30. Okay, Member Sinenci, and then we'll just do one question each, so that I don't take anyone over time. Okay. Member Sinenci, followed by Member King.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Mahalo, Chair. And I just had a simple question for Yoshimura. For the tiny homes, were those purchases, or were those rentals of...of the tiny homes?

MS. YOSHIMURA: The tiny homes were purchases.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Oh, so we...they become County property that we can continue to use?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yeah. Right now, they're being used for the pandemic purposes, but after that, it would become County property. Oh, well, it is County property, but it would be...it could be used for something else.

COUNCILMEMBER SINENCI: Okay. Thank you.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Sinenci. And those were used for isolation? Yeah, okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yes. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo. Member King, followed by Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Thank you, Chair. So Ms. Yoshimura, do you have a timeline on when you think that you will have a dashboard up and available for how CARES money was...CARES Act money was spent? And we can use that also as, you know, ongoing for...to report to the public in real time how the ARPA money is going to be spent?

MS. YOSHIMURA: Councilmember King, I'll defer to Deputy Director Alibin. I know they're working on getting that set up with AmpliFund.

MS. ALIBIN: Hi, Chair. So in...with regards to the American Rescue Plan Act, so the AmpliFund software is a platform that we're intending to utilize for the application process, and also reporting requirements with the Department of Treasury. We had a discussion with AmpliFund regarding...public transparency. That is outside of the scope that...when we had procured it with them. But there are some sample reports that they had provided to us that we can work with, and...you know, work together with the Department of Management IT Section...or Division, to have something on our website that can be used, or you know, viewed by the public, to provide a little bit more detail on the expenditures for the American Rescue Plan Act. Because of the...the requirements by the Department of Treasury on the American Rescue Plan Act monies is very strict, they have actually pushed out the reporting requirements. They're supposed to be due October 31st, has been extended to January 31st, 2022. I believe what the...the Department of Treasury, with the requirement of public transparency, they're going to make the reports available that is provided by all recipients of the American Rescue Plan Act monies be also accessible to the public. So that's something that we're kind of waiting on. So...but we...again, with AmpliFund, we are...you know, we have...we already had that discussion with the vendor.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, you don't have a timeline, then? Because, you know, the other counties have one already. So that's what concerns me, is that we really don't have any excuse for not having that available to the public.

MS. ALIBIN: So Chair...so the one that you're...we're discussing about is on the CARES Act. So that...we don't have anything available with the CARES Act. Except for the --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: So you don't plan to?

MS. ALIBIN: -- what? I'm sorry?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

COUNCILMEMBER KING: I...I was asking about a timeline. So you don't plan to have anything available for the public to be able to see how we've spent the CARES Act funds?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Member King, I was going to let everyone have one question each, so we don't --

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Yeah, I just had...I know, I understand that Chair, but that was my question, and she hasn't answered it. So I'm just trying to explain to her what my question was, is there a timeline for having that dashboard available? But now I think what she's telling me is they don't plan to even do that dashboard; is that what you're telling me?

MS. ALIBIN: Chair, what I'm talking about is on the American Rescue Plan Act. We do have a plan on the dashboard, but as far as the CARES Act, because we didn't have any mechanism at that time when we had...you know, were given the money for the CARES Act. So it's kind of something that I think we...we need to, as...as the Department of Finance, would have to discuss with Department of Management, given that it already has happened. So, I mean, that's a discussion that we would have to taken [sic] place.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Deputy Director. And then, Member King, under this item, all of the expenditures are listed. And now that we hired our communications specialist in OCS, my plan was to have that uploaded to our OpenGov portal, which will be available for the public. And I did look at Kaua'i County's CARES Act tab, and it's basically what we have, which is a spreadsheet of all the expenditures listed out.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Okay, so the Council will do that, rather than...and the Administration won't do it. Okay. All right. Thank you. Thank you for doing that, Chair. I appreciate it. I wish it had come from the Administration months ago, though, I mean that's what people are asking about. But if we have to do it, I guess we have to do it. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member King. Member Molina.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Thank you, Madam Chair. I just want to get additional clarification on, I think, that question I asked about the expenditure for that \$570 camera. I'm looking at the response, and this is what it reads. And this is a Canon EOS, Rebel T7 DSLR camera bundle. The Department of Fire and Public Safety used the camera to capture footage related to training and distance-based learning. The use of the camera allowed the Department to facilitate compliance with the COVID-19-related public health measures, and support the employees who are dedicated to mitigating and responding to COVID-19-related emergencies. So am I to assume that this is...they're doing a video? Is this camera a video camera, or just one of those cameras that take snapshots?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Is Managing Director on?

MS. YOSHIMURA: I don't think --

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: And...and the reason I ask this, Madam Chair, because...I mean, when I think of using the COVID relief funds, it would be something more towards, you know, providing food or, you know, some type of other kinds of relief for business. So I just kind of...I'm still trying to figure out the understanding as to why this camera, this type of camera is used. And I don't know if it's maybe to make training videos, or this is a video camera. You know... you know what I'm saying? Because it may sound manini, but \$500 is \$500 dollars, and the public will question, yeah? So...

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Budget Director.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, I believe when the pandemic started, the Fire Department was in the middle of a recruit class, and they do have ongoing training throughout the year. And because of the distancing, and the requirements that were placed, the emergency rules that were placed, we had to pivot and try to find other ways of continuing our training...continuing the recruit classes. And one of them was to do videos. And I'm assuming, I...I can further check, but I'm assuming this is a video camera, because they did go out and do videos...training videos, so that the firefighters were able to continue the training that they needed. But I can, Member Molina, verify with the Chief on whether it's a still shot camera or a video camera.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: Okay, yeah --

MS. YOSHIMURA: Thank you, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: -- because I was thinking...I was questioning the need to have one camera to tell you stand, say, six feet apart or do a certain, you know, COVID-19 procedure. So I don't know, but --

MS. YOSHIMURA: Yes. Sorry, Chair.

COUNCILMEMBER MOLINA: -- whatever. The money's been spent, so anyway...that's okay, Budget Director, it's...you know, I'll just move on from it. But I...I feel...felt the need to kind of question the purchase. So anyway, thank you, Madam Chair. Thank you. Budget Director.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Molina. Member Paltin.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Thank you for my one question, I guess. I got two, but I got to choose, so I'm going to go with the Board of Ethics. We never got an answer to that one. Or is that for the Mayor?

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

MS. YOSHIMURA: But with the Board of Ethics, I think the question was about the task force, and whether or not we looked into who got grants?

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, I believe the breakdown was like six of the members on the task force, their organizations pulled in like 30 percent of the CARES funding, and there was some question in the community about, like, if there was a Board of Ethics review. Because it seems a little...you know, I mean, if it were me, I'd want to be cleared by the Board of Ethics before I'm taking 30 percent of the public's, \$66 million and making decisions...those types of decisions. Just, you know, for my own safety and so that people don't point fingers at me. So I just was wondering. That was my top question. I got a second question, if you don't have the answer for that one.

MS. YOSHIMURA: Chair, we...we'll be responding in writing to that, but just to give you a short answer, we did not seek any Board of Ethics opinion on those grants. We did those things to respond to the community's needs. And in the case of, like, Kapono'ai and Ekolu, to take advantage of respite for visitor traffic in the Hāna area. Nobody was paid for their participation in the task force meetings, and nobody had a financial...a personal financial gain from these grants. So we didn't seek any financial...any Board of Ethics. But if you want us to do that, we can go ahead and submit something to the Board of Ethics.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Yeah, because, I mean, I had to go before the Board of Ethics as a not-paid Executive Director, and I know some of these guys get paid, like, within the six figures as a Executive Director. So, I mean, financial interest is up...open to interpretation in that case. I mean, that's your livelihood right there. So it's...it's kind of questionable to me. I...I'd want to just, you know, get a ruling.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin. Ms. Milner, is Managing Director Baz on yet? Because I think this is more of an appropriate question for him. And if he's not on, we can, either, you know, defer until...

MS. MILNER: No, Chair, he's not on yet. We're still trying to reach him.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Ms. Milner. Okay.

MS. YOSHIMURA: We'll put a answer for it to you in writing. Thank you.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Budget Director. Okay. All right, it's 4:36. My apologies, Members. Okay, no more burning questions. Thank you so much for your indulgence, six minutes over time. Mahalo, Budget Director Yoshimura, Deputy Director Alibin, Director Teruya, for joining us for this item. And as I stated before, I'll have this scheduled again. I...I'm trying to do it at least once a month. I know it's...yeah, I'll try get it at least once a month so that we can at least go over some of the updates that we have, and how we're progressing for the public. Okay, so we'll defer BFED-85. Are there any objections?

COUNCILMEMBERS VOICED NO OBJECTIONS. (Excused: ALL)

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

ACTION: DEFER PENDING FURTHER DISCUSSION.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Okay. Mahalo, Members. That brings us to the end of the agenda. So tomorrow we have a PSLU Committee meeting at 9:00, and HCP Committee meeting at 1:30. Don't miss it.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Public hearing.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Oh, and the public hearing. Member Paltin, do you want to make a quick announcement for that? Good --

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: We have a public hearing --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: -- call, Member --

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: -- at 6:00 p.m. on the West Maui Community Plan, and the BlueJeans link is the same as our Council link, because Chair Lee will be the Chair of the public hearing. So got a lot of planning items tomorrow. There...there might be a twist and a turn in the dragon fruit farm, there might involve animals and farming. So that should be fun because, you know, animals and farming go together like peas in a pod, and animals do all sorts of things that humans also do. So lots of fun.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Wow, are we doing trailers or...or teasers for our meetings now?

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Only if you want to.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Do you want to do a teaser for your Committee meeting?

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Okay, I'll give you a hint. It has to do with alpaca. Alpaca. So should be a lot of fun.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Mahalo, Member Paltin.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Do you have a story? Are you going to tell us a naupaka story?

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: No, Alpaca.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: No, not naupaka, alpaca.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Oh, worse yet. Thank you.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: It might be related to, like, camels or something? I'm not sure. But you can Google...Google them --

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: Llamas.

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: -- and you'll be prepared.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: They're...I think they're related to llamas.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Yeah.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Oh, llamas.

COUNCILMEMBER KAMA: Llamas.

COUNCILMEMBER KING: Carries no hump.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: Llamas.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: All right.

VICE-CHAIR PALTIN: It should be a lot of fun.

CHAIR RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ: And you're going to end up with lots of people watching. Find out with that hanger. Okay. Hopefully it's not about eating the alpacas, because that would make me sad. Okay. Uh-oh. Okay, it's 4:40 on November 17th, and the Budget Finance and Economic Development Committee is now adjourned. . . .(gavel). . .

ADJOURN: 4:40 p.m.

APPROVED:



KEANI N.W. RAWLINS-FERNANDEZ, Chair
Budget, Finance, and Economic Development
Committee

bfed:min:211117:kr

Transcribed by: Kaliko Reed

BUDGET, FINANCE, AND ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT COMMITTEE MINUTES
Council of the County of Maui

November 17, 2021

CERTIFICATION

I, Kaliko Reed, hereby certify that pages 1 through 54 of the foregoing represents, to the best of my ability, a true and correct transcript of the proceedings. I further certify that I am not in any way concerned with the cause.

DATED the 6th day of January 2022, in Wailuku, Hawai'i



Kaliko Reed